



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth 30 Hydref 2001

Tuesday 30 October 2001

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Anerchiad gan y Prif Weinidog, y Gwir Anrhydeddus Tony Blair
Address by the Prime Minister, the Right Honourable Tony Blair
- 14 Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd
Election to the Economic Development Committee
- 17 Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru
Questions to the First Minister
- 36 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 38 Datganiad ar Rôl Cymru'n Creu
Statement on the Role of Cymru'n Creu
- 50 Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement
- 52 Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order
- 59 Diwygio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12
Revision of Standing Order No. 12
- 60 Diwygio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 15
Revision of Standing Order No. 15
- 64 Diwygio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 23
Revision of Standing Order No. 23
- 67 Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau o Ganlyniad i Ddiddymu'r Bwrdd Ymyrraeth Cynnyrch
Amaethyddol a Chreu'r Asiantaeth Taliadau Gwledig
*Transfer of Functions Resulting from the Dissolution of the Intervention Board for
Agricultural Produce and the Creation of the Rural Payment Agency*
- 70 Adroddiad Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru ar gyfer 2000-01
The Welsh Administration Ombudsman's Report of 2000-01
- 82 Adroddiad Ombwdsmon Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru ar gyfer 2000-01
The Health Service Ombudsman's Report of 2000-01

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.*

Anerchiad gan y Prif Weinidog, y Gwir Anrhydeddus Tony Blair
Address by the Prime Minister, the Right Honourable Tony Blair

Y Llywydd: Mae hi'n bleser arbennig gennyf groesawu Prif Weinidog y Deyrnas Unedig, Tony Blair. Croesawaf hefyd Brif Weinidog Senedd yr Alban, Henry McLeish, Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Senedd yr Alban, Jim Wallace, Sir Reg Empey, o Gynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon—a dymunwn y gorau iddynt yno ar hyn o bryd—a hefyd, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yr Alban, Helen Liddell, ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Gogledd Iwerddon, John Reid.

Prime Minister, I invite you to address the National Assembly for Wales.

The Prime Minister: Presiding Officer and Assembly Members, thank you for inviting me to be here today—the first British Prime Minister to address the National Assembly for Wales. Devolution is about harnessing the power of communities—the diverse community that is the United Kingdom and the national communities that, through devolution, can take their futures in their own hands.

Wales has a long history of innovation. It has been a great industrial exporter, from the coal and steel that powered the first industrial revolution to satellite components and computer circuit boards of today, when far more people work in electronics than in coal mining. You have always been exporters too of ideas and of reforming politicians, such as the pioneering socialist Robert Owen, David Lloyd George, Nye Bevan—the father of the NHS—and, of course, my own predecessors as leaders of the Labour Party, Neil Kinnock, Michael Foot and Jim Callaghan, in whose former constituency the Assembly is located. I believe, as I will explain later, that the National Assembly leads a newly confident Wales, giving a lead to the rest of the UK and often to Europe.

Presiding Officer, you will understand that, when I accepted this invitation some months ago, I obviously had in mind a different

The Presiding Officer: It is my particular pleasure to welcome the Prime Minister of the United Kingdom, Tony Blair. I also welcome the First Minister of the Scottish Parliament, Henry McLeish, the Deputy First Minister of the Scottish Parliament, Jim Wallace, Sir Reg Empey, of the Northern Ireland Assembly—and we wish them well at this time—and also the Secretary of State for Scotland, Helen Liddell, and the Secretary of State for Northern Ireland, John Reid.

Brif Weinidog, fe'ch gwahoddaf i annerch Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

Y Prif Weinidog: Lywydd ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad, diolch ichi am estyn gwahoddiad imi fod yma heddiw—y Prif Weinidog Prydeinig cyntaf i annerch Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Diben datganoli yw harneisio nerth cymunedau—cymuned amrywiol y Deyrnas Unedig a'r cymunedau cenedlaethol a all, drwy ddatganoli, lywio eu dyfodol eu hunain.

Mae gan Gymru draddodiad hir o arloesi. Bu'n allforiwr diwydiannol mawr, o'r glo a'r dur a fu'n gyrru'r chwyldro diwydiannol cyntaf i gydrannau lloerennau a byrddau cylched cyfrifiadurol a allforir heddiw, pan fo llawer mwy o bobl yn gweithio yn y sector electroneg nag yn y diwydiant glo. Bu ichi erioed allforio syniadau a gwleidyddion â'u bryd ar ddiwygio hefyd, megis y sosialydd arloesol Robert Owen, David Lloyd George, Nye Bevan—sylfaenydd yr NHS—ac, wrth gwrs, fy rhagflaenwyr fy hun fel arweinwyr y Blaid Lafur sef Neil Kinnock, Michael Foot a Jim Callaghan, y saif y Cynulliad yn ei gyn etholaeth ef. Credaf, fel yr egluraf yn nes ymlaen, fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn arwain Cymru ac iddi hyder newydd, gan roi arweiniad i weddill y DU ac, yn aml, i Ewrop.

Lywydd, deallwch, pan dderbyniais y gwahoddiad hwn rai misoedd yn ôl, fod gennyf araith wahanol iawn mewn golwg i'r

speech from the one I give today. I understand why some feel that I should not deal with the present crisis in my address to this Assembly. I am sorry that that is the case. However, if I were speaking today before any parliament in the world, I should feel obliged to talk about the issue that rightly preoccupies people. I hope that people here in Wales will treat that as a mark of respect and not of disrespect. We should never forget the contribution that Wales and the Welsh people make to our armed forces.

I said a few days ago that now would be the testing time. People want results. They want them as fast as possible. They realise the formidable challenges posed by any action in Afghanistan. They worry about civilian casualties. They are anxious about the refugee crisis as winter approaches. They wonder what comes after the conflict. All these concerns deserve to be answered. No one who raises doubts is an appeaser or a faint-heart. We are a democracy, strong enough to have doubts raised even at a time of war, and wise enough, I hope, to be able to respond to them.

But let us go back to why we are in this conflict. On 11 September, thousands of people were killed in cold blood in the worst terrorist attacks the world has ever seen. That is a fact. Those responsible were the Al-Qaeda network, headed by Osama Bin Laden. That fact is barely disputed any more. Incidentally, the intelligence evidence—a flow when I first drew attention to it on 3 October—is now a flood, confirming guilt. The Taleban regime in Afghanistan protects and helps Al-Qaeda. That is a fact. Indeed, according to the latest evidence we have, they are virtually a merged organisation today. The Taleban regime is cruel, dictatorial and oppressive, causing some 4.5 million refugees to be on the move before 11 September. That too is a fact. Osama Bin Laden and Al-Qaeda have said that they consider it their duty to commit further terrorist acts. We gave the Taleban an ultimatum to deliver them up. It refused.

araith y byddaf yn ei thraddodi heddiw. Deallaf pam bod rhai o'r farn na ddylwn drafod yr argyfwng presennol yn fy anerchiad i'r Cynulliad hwn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf am hynny. Fodd bynnag, pe bawn yn siarad heddiw gerbron unrhyw senedd yn y byd, byddwn yn teimlo bod dyletswydd arnaf i siarad am y mater sydd, yn naturiol, yn amlwg ym meddyliau pobl. Gobeithiaf y bydd pobl yma yng Nghymru yn ystyried hyn yn arwydd o barch, nid amarch. Ni ddylem byth anghofio'r cyfraniad y mae Cymru a phobl Cymru wedi ei wneud i'n lluoedd arfog.

Dywedais ychydig ddyddiau yn ôl ein bod bellach yn wynebu'r cyfnod mwyaf anodd. Mae pobl am weld canlyniadau. Maent am eu gweld mor fuan â phosibl. Maent yn sylweddoli'r heriau enbyd a ddaw yn sgîl unrhyw ymgyrch yn Afghanistan. Maent yn pryderu bod pobl gyffredin yn cael eu hanafu neu eu lladd. Maent yn pryderu am argyfwng y ffoaduriaid wrth i'r gaeaf nesáu. Maent yn dyfalu ynghylch yr hyn a ddigwydd ar ôl y frwydr. Mae pob un o'r pryderon hyn yn haeddu ateb. Nid oes neb sy'n codi amheuan yn ddyhuddgar nac yn wangalon. Yr ydym yn byw mewn democratiaeth, sy'n ddigon cryf i adael pobl i godi amheuan hyd yn oed adeg rhyfel, ac yn ddigon doeth, gobeithiaf, i allu ymateb iddynt.

Ond gadewch inni ystyried pam ein bod yn rhan o'r frwydr hon. Ar 11 Medi, lladdwyd miloedd o bobl yn filain yn yr ymosodiadau terfysgol gwaethaf a welodd y byd erioed. Mae hynny'n ffaith. Rhwydwaith yr Al-Qaeda, o dan arweiniad Osama Bin Laden, oedd yn gyfrifol. Prin yr amheuir y ffaith honno bellach. Gyda llaw, mae'r dystiolaeth a gawn o'r gudd-wybodaeth—a oedd yn llifo i mewn pan dynnais sylw ati am y tro cyntaf ar 3 Hydref—bellach wedi troi'n llanw, sy'n cadarnhau eu bod yn euog. Mae'r Taleban yn Afghanistan yn rhoi lloches i'r Al-Qaeda ac yn eu helpu. Mae hynny'n ffaith. Yn wir, yn ôl y dystiolaeth ddiweddaraf a ddaeth i law, erbyn hyn maent yn fwy neu lai wedi cyfuno yn un sefydliad. Mae rheolaeth y Taleban yn un greulon, gormesol a gorthrymus, ac, o ganlyniad, bu i ryw 4.5 miliwn o bobl ffoi rhagddi cyn 11 Medi. Mae hynny hefyd yn ffaith. Mae Osama Bin Laden a'r Al-Qaeda wedi dweud bod dyletswydd arnynt yn eu tyb

These are also facts, and they lead to one inescapable conclusion: if we do not act against Al-Quaeda and the Taleban, then Al-Quaeda will have perpetrated this atrocity, the Taleban will have sheltered it, and we will have done nothing. We will have done nothing, despite the fact, also inescapable, that it intends to commit further atrocities unless we yield to its demands, which include the eradication of Israel, the killing of all Jews and the setting up of fundamentalist states in all parts of the Arab and Muslim world.

So, we have a group of people in Afghanistan who are the sworn enemy of everything the civilised world stands for, who have killed once on a vast scale and will kill again unless stopped. They cannot be negotiated with. They refuse to yield to justice. And they have one hope: that we are somehow decadent, that we lack the moral fibre, will or courage to take them on; that we might begin but we will not finish; that we will start, then falter; that when the first setbacks occur, we will lose our nerve. They are wrong because we will not falter. We will not stop until our mission is complete, and we will not flinch from doing what is necessary to complete it. We will not fail. And we will do all of this because we believe in our values of justice, tolerance and respect for all, regardless of race, religion or creed, just as passionately as they believe in the fanatical hatred of Christians, Jews and indeed any Muslims who do not share their perverse view of Islam. They mistake our desire for a comfortable life, living in peace, benign towards people of different cultures and races, as decadence. It is not decadence; it is progress, and we will fight to maintain it.

Let us return to the questions that need answering. Our objectives are clear: to close down the Al-Quaeda network, to bring Bin Laden and his associates to justice and, because the Taleban regime has chosen to side with them, to remove the regime. The

hwy i gyflawni gweithredoedd terfysgol pellach. Rhoesom ein rhybudd olaf i'r Taleban y dylid eu hildio inni. Gwrthododd. Mae'r rheini'n ffeithiau hefyd, ac maent yn arwain at gasgliad anochel: oni chymerwn gamau yn erbyn yr Al-Quaeda a'r Taleban, bydd yr Al-Quaeda wedi cyflawni'r erchylltra hwn, bydd y Taleban wedi rhoi lloches iddo, a ninnau heb wneud dim amdano. Byddwn wedi gwneud dim, er gwaethaf y ffaith, sydd hefyd yn anochel, ei fod yn bwriadu cyflawni mwy o erchyllterau onid ildiw'n i'w ofynion, sy'n cynnwys diddymu Israel, lladd pob Iddew a sefydlu gwladwriaethau ffundamentalaid ym mhob rhan o'r byd Arabaidd a Moslemaidd.

Felly, ceir grŵp o bobl yn Afghanistan sy'n elynion noeth i bopeth y mae'r byd gwareiddiedig yn ei arddel, pobl sydd wedi lladd ar raddfa eang ac a fydd yn lladd eto oni chânt eu hatal. Ni ellir negodi gyda hwy. Maent yn gwrthod ildio i gyfiawnder. Ac un gobaith sydd ganddynt: ein bod yn llwgr rhywsut, nad ydym yn meddu ar y galon, yr ewyllys na'r dewder i'w gwrthsefyll; efallai y byddwn yn dechrau'r rhyfel, ond na fyddwn yn ei offen; y byddwn yn dechrau ac yna yn gwamalu; pan fo'r anawsterau cyntaf yn codi, y byddwn yn gwangalonni. Maent yn anghywir gan na fyddwn yn gwamalu. Ni rown y gorau i'r ymgyrch nes ein bod wedi cyflawni ein nod, ac nid ymatalwn rhag gwneud yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud i'w gyrraedd. Ni fyddwn yn methu. A gwnawn yr hyn oll am ein bod yn credu yn ein gwerthoedd, sef cyfiawnder, goddefgarwch a pharch at bawb, waeth beth fo eu hil, eu crefydd neu eu credo, yr un mor daer ag y credant hwy mewn atgasedd eithafol tuag at Gristnogion, Iddewon ac yn wir, unrhyw Foslemiaid nad ydynt yn arddel eu safbwynt gwrthnysig hwy o Islam. Maent yn camgymryd ein hawydd i fyw yn gyfforddus, ac yn heddychlun ac i ymddwyn yn rhadlon tuag at bobl o ddiwylliant a hil wahanol, fel natur lwgr. Nid rhywbeth llwgr mohono ond cynnydd, ac fe wnawn ymladd i'w gadw.

Dychwelwn at y cwestiynau y mae angen eu hateb. Mae ein hamcanion yn eglur: rhoi terfyn ar rwydwaith yr Al-Quaeda, dwyn Bin Laden a'i gydgyllwynwyr gerbron llys barn ac, am fod y Taleban wedi penderfynu ochri â hwy, dymchwel rheolaeth y Taleban.

means that we will use are air power, ground operations as and when necessary in furtherance of our aims, support to the Northern Alliance and other anti-Taleban regime elements and building up a strong political and diplomatic coalition against the present Taleban regime inside and outside Afghanistan.

We have destroyed the Taleban air force and put Taleban airfields and air defence systems out of action, destroyed all the main Al-Qaeda camps, profoundly damaged Taleban command-and-control facilities and dramatically reduced its capacity to communicate with its forces in the field. This is a steady process of fragmenting, undermining and eventually destroying the Taleban regime as a serious threat capable of inflicting more damage on its country or on the outside world.

I have two words of caution. This is not a conventional conflict. It is not a battle for territory per se or for the subjugation of Afghanistan. It is a battle to allow Afghans to retake control of their own country and, in doing so, to close down the threat posed by the present rulers. Political and diplomatic efforts go hand in hand with the military effort.

We cannot—and I hope people understand this—and should not disclose the exact nature of the ground operations we intend to undertake. I am afraid that there is a limit, in a situation like this, to what we can sensibly discuss in public. We do all we can to minimise civilian casualties, unlike Osama Bin Laden and Al-Qaeda, who did all they could to maximise civilian casualties. Tragically, there will be some casualties, although I ask people again to be deeply sceptical about Taleban claims.

While the military action continues, two other things are happening. We are establishing a huge humanitarian effort, and some \$700 million has already been pledged. We are determined to feed and shelter as

Defnyddiwn gyrchoedd awyr, cyrchoedd ar y tir, yn ôl yr angen, er mwyn hybu ein nodau, cymorth i'r Gynghrair Ogleddol a phobl eraill sy'n gwrthwynebu'r Taleban gan adeiladu cynghrair wleidyddol a diplomataidd gadarn yn erbyn rheolaeth bresennol y Taleban yn Afghanistan a'r tu allan iddi.

Yr ydym wedi dinistrio awyrlu'r Taleban ac wedi sicrhau nad yw ei feysydd awyr na'i systemau amddiffyn awyr yn weithredol, yr ydym wedi dinistrio pob un o brif wersylloedd yr Al-Qaeda ac wedi gwneud difrod sylweddol i gyfleusterau rheoli'r Taleban gan amharu'n sylweddol ar ei allu i gyfathrebu â'i luoedd yn y maes. Mae hon yn broses raddol o holli, tanseilio ac, yn y pen draw, dinistrio'r Taleban fel bygythiad difrifol â'r gallu i wneud mwy o niwed yn ei wlad ei hun neu yng ngweddill y byd.

Mae gennyf ddau air o rybudd. Nid brwydr gonfensiynol mo'r frwydr hon. Nid yw'n frwydr am diriogaeth fel y cyfryw na brwydr i drechu pobl Afghanistan. Mae'n frwydr i alluogi pobl Afghanistan i ail gymryd yr awenau yn eu gwlad eu hunain ac, wrth wneud hynny, i gael gwared â bygythiad y rhai sy'n llywodraethu drostynt ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r ymdrechion gwleidyddol a diplomataidd yn mynd law yn llaw â'r ymgyrch filwrol.

Ni allwn—a gobeithiaf y bydd pobl yn deall hyn—ac ni ddylem ddatgelu union natur yr ymgyrchoedd y bwriadwn ymgymryd â hwy ar y tir. Yn anffodus mae terfynau i'r hyn y gallwn ei drafod yn synhwyrol yn gyhoeddus mewn sefyllfa o'r fath. Gwnawn bopeth o fewn ein gallu i leihau i'r eithaf y nifer o bobl gyffredin sy'n cael eu hanafu neu eu lladd, yn wahanol i Osama Bin Laden a'r Al-Qaeda, a wnaeth bopeth o fewn eu gallu i sicrhau bod y nifer fwyaf bosibl o bobl yn cael eu hanafu neu eu lladd. Gwaetha'r modd, bydd rhai yn dioddef, er y gofynnaf i bobl unwaith eto bwyso a mesur honiadau'r Taleban yn ofalus dros ben.

Tra bod yr ymgyrch filwrol yn parhau, mae dau beth arall yn digwydd. Yr ydym yn trefnu ymgyrch ddyngarol enfawr, ac addunedwyd tua \$700 miliwn eisoes. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o roi bwyd a lloches i

many refugees as we can. However, we must contend with armed groups harassing UN food convoys and stealing their equipment or even the food itself.

Secondly, under the leadership of Mr Brahimi, the special UN envoy, the UN is convening as widely representative a group of Afghan opinion as possible, so that when the present Taleban regime falls, a broad-based successor regime can take its place. All the main countries in the region are being consulted on this.

Let me summarise. The end we desire is simply this: the Al-Qaeda terrorist network shut down in Afghanistan; the Taleban regime out; a new, broad-based regime in; and Afghan reconstruction under way.

Our military action is focused on Afghanistan, but, of course, terrorism is a wider problem, not limited to that country. We will take action as a world community on its financing, weapons capability and the movement of terrorists wherever we can, as with the recent European Union measures. This second stage of action will, of course, be subject to close consultation and deliberation with the global alliance against terrorism. That international coalition remains strong. I would like, in particular, to pay tribute to Arab and Muslim countries that have supported our action. I thank Saudi Arabia for its forthright condemnation of the terrorist attack and its supportive action. Bin Laden may be Saudi in origin, but he defames the good name of Saudi Arabia, which is a good and dependable friend to the civilised world.

Every part of this, Presiding Officer, is difficult. Every part requires courage, conviction and hard work. In every part, there may be setbacks from time to time. However, in every part, we have justice and right on our side, I believe, and a strategy to achieve our aim. It is important, therefore, that we never forget why we are doing this. We must never

gymaint o ffoaduriaid â phosibl. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ymgodymu â grwpiau arfog sy'n aflonyddu ar finteioedd y Cenhedloedd Unedig sy'n cludo bwyd gan ddwyn eu hoffer neu hyd yn oed y bwyd ei hun.

Yn ail, o dan arweiniad Mr Brahimi, cennad arbennig y Cenhedloedd Unedig, mae'r Cenhedloedd Unedig yn galw ynghyd grŵp mor eang â phosibl o gynrychiolwyr pobl Afghanistan, fel y gall llywodraeth olynol eang ei chwmpas gymryd lle'r Taleban pan ddaw ei rheolaeth bresennol i ben. Ymgynghorir â phob un o'r gwledydd mwyaf yn y rhanbarth ynglŷn â hyn.

I grynhoi, mae ein nod yn y pen draw yn syml: rhoi terfyn ar rwydwaith terfysol yr Al-Qaeda yn Afghanistan; cael gwared â'r Taleban; cyflwyno llywodraeth newydd, eang ei chwmpas; a bwrw ymlaen i ailadeiladu Afghanistan.

Canolbwyntia ein hymgyrch filwrol ar Afghanistan, ond, wrth gwrs, mae terfysgaeth yn broblem fwy cyffredin, nad yw wedi ei chyfyngu i'r wlad honno. Fel cymuned y byd, rhaid inni gymryd camau, lle bynnag y gallwn, yn erbyn y ffordd y caiff terfysgaeth ei hariannu, ei harfogi a'r ffordd y mae terfysgwyr yn symud o le i le, megis mesurau diweddar yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Bydd yr ail gam hwn o'r ymgyrch, wrth gwrs yn amodol ar ymgynghoriad a thrafodaeth fanwl â'r gynghrair fyd-eang yn erbyn terfysgaeth. Erys y gynghrair ryngwladol honno yn gryf. Hoffwn, yn benodol, dalu teyrnged i'r gwledydd Arabaidd a Moslemaidd sydd wedi cefnogi ein hymgyrch. Hoffwn ddiolch i Saudi Arabia am ei chondemniad diamwys o'r ymosodiad terfysgol ac am y camau cefnogol y mae wedi eu cymryd. Er mai un o Saudi Arabia yw Bin Laden, mae'n dwyn anfri ar enw da y wlad, sy'n gyfaill da a dibynadwy i'r byd gwareiddiedig.

Mae pob agwedd ar hyn, Lywydd, yn anodd. Mae pob agwedd yn gofyn am fod yn ddewr, yn argyhoeddedig ac yn ddiwyd. Ymhob agwedd, gall anawsterau godi o bryd i'w gilydd. Fodd bynnag, ym mhob agwedd, yr ydym yn ymddwyn yn gyfiawn ac yn gywir, fe gredaf, ac mae gennym strategaeth i gyflawni ein nod. Mae'n bwysig, felly nad

forget how we felt watching the planes fly into those twin towers; never forget those answering machine messages and how we felt imagining mothers telling their children that they were about to die. We should never forget the guts of the firefighters and police in New York who died trying to save others; never forget the menace of Osama Bin Laden in his propaganda video; never forget that too long a list of countries lost sons and daughters in those attacks. We should never forget that those who died were from all faiths and none. There were Christians, Jews and Muslims—many Muslims. It is not we who are at war with Islam; it is Al-Qaeda and the Taleban who are at war with anyone, whatever his or her faith, who does not share their maniacal and fanatical view of the world.

Osama Bin Laden did not just hijack planes; he has hijacked a country, from which he runs his terrorist activity. Now he would like to hijack a religion and hijack the Palestinian cause. We must not let him do that.

We are a principled nation and this is a principled conflict. The events of 11 September are no less appalling today than they were on that day. Our determination is no less resolute than it was on the day military action began. We have a job to do. It is being done and we will see it through to the end.

This is also a time for people of all races and all faiths in Britain to stand together. That is exactly what Muslim leaders in Wales and across Britain have done with their forthright condemnation of the atrocities of 11 September. I thank them for that. I also condemn utterly the attacks and abuse that some British Muslims have suffered since 11 September, some of them in Wales. I say to the 50,000 Muslims who live in Wales: 'We will defend your right to live free from the fear of racism and religious hatred.'

anhofiwn byth pam ein bod yn gwneud hyn. Nad anghofiwn byth ein teimladau wrth wyllo'r awyrennau yn hedfan i mewn i'r ddau dŵr hwnnw; nad anghofiwn byth y negeseuon hynny ar beiriannau ateb a'n teimladau wrth geisio dychmygu mamau yn dweud wrth eu plant eu bod ar fin marw. Ni ddylem byth anghofio dewrder y swyddogion tân a'r heddlu yn Efrog Newydd a fu farw tra'n ceisio achub bywydau pobl eraill; nad anghofiwn byth fygythiad Osama Bin Laden yn ei fideo propaganda; nad anghofiwn fod llawer gormod o wledydd wedi colli meibion a merched yn yr ymosodiadau hynny. Ni ddylem anghofio byth bod y bobl a fu farw yn arddel pob cred neu ddim cred o gwbl. Yn eu plith yr oedd Cristnogion, Iddewon a Moslemiaid—llawer o Foslemiaid. Nid nynt sy'n mynd i ryfel ar Islam; yr Al-Qaeda a'r Taleban sy'n mynd i ryfel ar bob un, waeth beth fo'u ffydd, nad ydynt yn cyd-weld â'u syniadau gwallgof ac eithafol am y byd.

Nid dim ond awyrennau a herwgipiodd Osama Bin Laden; herwgipiodd wlad, sydd bellach yn ganolfan i'w weithgaredd terfysgol. Erbyn hyn mae am herwgipio crefydd a herwgipio achos Palesteina. Rhaid inni ei atal rhag gwneud hynny.

Yr ydym yn genedl egwyddorol ac mae'r frwydr hon yn frwydr egwyddorol. Mae digwyddiadau 11 Medi yr un mor erchyll heddiw ag yr oeddent ar y diwrnod hwnnw. Yr ydym ninnau yr un mor benderfynol ag yr oeddem ar y diwrnod pan ddechreuodd yr ymgyrch filwrol. Mae gennym waith i'w wneud. Yr ydym wrthi'n ei wneud a pharhawn hyd nes y daw'r gwaith hwnnw i ben.

Mae hefyd yn amser i bobl o bob hil a chredo ym Mhrydain sefyll gyda'i gilydd. Dyna'r union beth y mae arweinwyr Moslemaidd yng Nghymru a ledled Prydain wedi ei wneud drwy eu condemniad diamwys o'r erchyllterau ar 11 Medi. Hoffwn ddiolch iddynt am wneud hynny. Yr wyf hefyd yn condemnio'n llwyr yr ymosodiadau a'r sarhad y mae Moslemiaid Prydain wedi eu dioddef ers 11 Medi, y mae rhywfaint ohono wedi digwydd yng Nghymru. Hoffwn ddweud wrth y 50,000 o Foslemiaid sy'n byw yng Nghymru: 'Fe wnawn amddiffyn eich hawl i fyw heb ofni hiliaeth ac atgasedd

crefyddol.’

Presiding Officer, partly as a result of the events of 11 September, we now face a more difficult economic time. However, in any event, as a result of globalisation we face constant challenges. The Corus job losses in here were a heavy blow. Sectors such as tourism, which were already struggling from the outbreak of foot and mouth disease, have been hit hard. However, the fundamentals of our economy, in Wales and in Britain, are the strongest they have been for a generation. Employment is rising, not falling. Unemployment in Wales is at its lowest level for over 25 years. Interest rates are at their lowest for nearly 40 years.

Lywydd, yn rhannol oherwydd y digwyddiadau ar 11 Medi, yr ydym bellach yn wynebu cyfnod anos yn economaidd. Sut bynnag, oherwydd ein bod yn cystadlu yn y farchnad fyd-eang yr ydym yn wynebu heriau yn rheolaidd. Bu diswyddiadau Corus yn ergyd drom. Mae sectorau megis twristiaeth, a oedd mewn trafferthion eisoes yn sgîl clwy'r traed a'r genau, o dan y lach hefyd. Fodd bynnag, mae hanfodion ein heconomi, yng Nghymru ac ym Mhrydain, ar eu cryfaf ers cenhedlaeth. Mae cyflogaeth yn cynyddu, nid yn gostwng. Mae diweithdra yng Nghymru ar ei isaf ers dros 25 mlynedd. Mae cyfraddau llog ar eu hisaf ers bron 40 mlynedd.

Among all the difficulties, there is also a constant stream of new jobs coming. There will be 200 new high-tech jobs at the £90 million BT Ignite development in Cardiff and almost 200 at Continental Teves and Desk Link in Blaenau Gwent—an area that was particularly hard hit by the Corus job losses. That is new investment that this Assembly helped to secure. This brings me to another point that I want to make: I have heard from business leaders here that the Assembly has given Wales a real business voice. That was one reason for creating an Assembly. Much of the pressure for regional government in England comes from the desire to emulate that strong voice.

Er gwaethaf yr holl anawsterau, mae llif o swyddi newydd yn cael eu creu. Caiff 200 o swyddi newydd ym maes uwch-dechnoleg eu creu fel rhan o ddatblygiad BT Ignite gwerth £90 miliwn yng Nghaerdydd a bron 200 yn Continental Teves a Desk Link ym Mlaenau Gwent—ardal yr effeithiwyd arni yn ddifrifol gan ddiswyddiadau Corus. Dyna fuddsoddiad newydd y mae'r Cynulliad hwn wedi helpu i'w sicrhau. Mae hynny yn fy arwain at bwynt arall yr hoffwn ei wneud: clywais gan arweinwyr busnes yma fod y Cynulliad wedi rhoi llais busnes gwirioneddol i Gymru. Dyna un o'r rhesymau dros greu Cynulliad. Mae llawer o'r pwysau dros gyflwyno llywodraeth ranbarthol yn Lloegr yn deillio o'r awydd i efelychu'r llais cryf hwnnw.

Those who said that devolution would lead to the break-up of Britain have been proved wrong. Earlier today, in the Joint Ministerial Committee, leaders from the UK, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland came together to discuss issues of common interest. Diversity does not necessarily mean division; indeed, it can mean the reverse. People are perfectly capable of thinking of themselves as Welsh and British at the same time.

Yr oedd y bobl a ddywedodd y byddai datganoli yn peri i Brydain ddaduno yn anghywir. Yn gynharach heddiw, yng Nghyd-Bwyllgor y Gweinidogion, daeth arweinwyr o'r DU, yr Alban, Cymru a Gogledd Iwerddon ynghyd i drafod materion sy'n gyffredin i bob un ohonynt. Nid yw amrywiaeth o reidrwydd yn golygu rhaniad; yn wir, gall fod i'r gwrthwyneb. Mae'n eithaf posibl i bobl ystyried eu bod yn Gymry ac yn Brydeinwyr ar yr un pryd.

Devolution to Wales is just one part of a much wider programme of constitutional reform designed to move us away from a centralised Britain to a more democratic, decentralised, plural state. The Scottish

Dim ond un rhan o raglen ehangach o ddiwygio cyfansoddiadol yw datganoli yng Nghymru. Nod y rhaglen yw sicrhau ein bod yn symud o Brydain ganolog i wladwriaeth mwy democrataidd, datganoledig a lluosryw.

Parliament has restored a parliament to Scotland after some 300 years and has meant a radical decline in the number of Scots wanting separation. In London there is now an elected Mayor and Assembly. In Northern Ireland—thanks to the efforts of the leaders there—we have, in a part of the UK riven by sectarian division, the chance, at least, of a new future. I am delighted that colleagues from all those devolved administrations are here in the Assembly today.

In each area, and here in Wales, of course, there are difficulties and tensions between parties and within parties. However, the result of devolution is that, instead of one centre of power focused on Whitehall and Westminster, there are several centres with the opportunity for power to be exercised more closely to the people it affects. The most remarkable thing is not the problems of devolution but the ease with which a process that amounts to a constitutional revolution has bedded down.

However, that devolution fits within a broader framework, rebalancing power between citizen and Government, and modernising Britain's constitution. We have incorporated the European convention on human rights into UK law. We have reformed the voting system here and in the European Parliament. We have begun the reform of the House of Lords, removing the vast bulk of hereditary peers. The Wakeham commission reported in favour of the next stage of reform, with a balance of elected, nominated and independent members. Later this month we will publish a White Paper setting out our proposals for it, based largely on the Wakeham report. There will be an elected element, to ensure proper regional representation. There will be a statutory appointments commission. There will continue to be independent members. There will be rules to determine fair political balance. We will consult on these proposals and then legislate so that we complete the work of the House of Lords reform begun in 1997.

Mae Senedd yr Alban wedi adfer senedd yno ar ôl 300 o flynyddoedd ac, yn sgîl hynny, mae nifer yr Albanwyr sydd o blaid ymwahaniaeth wedi gostwng yn sylweddol. Yn Llundain ceir Maer a Chynulliad etholedig erbyn hyn. Yng Ngogledd Iwerddon—diolch i ymdrechion yr arweinwyr yno—mae gennym gyfle, o leiaf, i lunio dyfodol newydd mewn rhan o'r DU lle y mae rhaniadau crefyddol mawr. Mae'n bleser gennyf nodi bod Aelodau o bob un o'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig hynny yma yn y Cynulliad heddiw.

Ym mhob rhanbarth, ac yma yng Nghymru, wrth gwrs, mae anawsterau a thensiynau rhwng pleidiau ac o fewn pleidiau. Fodd bynnag, yn sgîl datganoli, yn lle un ganolfan o bŵer yn Whitehall a San Steffan, ceir sawl canolfan sy'n rhoi cyfle inni arfer pŵer yn agosach at y bobl y mae'n effeithio arnynt. Nid y problemau yw'r peth mwyaf syfrdanol ynglŷn â datganoli ond pa mor hawdd yr ymsefydlodd proses sy'n gyfystyr â chwyldro cyfansoddiadol.

Fodd bynnag, mae datganoli o'r fath yn rhan o fframwaith ehangach, sy'n addasu'r cydbwysedd rhwng pŵer y dinasyddion a'r Llywodraeth, ac yn moderneiddio cyfansoddiad Prydain. Yr ydym wedi ymgorffori'r confensiwn Ewropeaidd ar hawliau dynol yng nghyfraith y DU. Yr ydym wedi diwygio'r system bleidleisio yma ac yn y Senedd Ewropeaidd. Yr ydym wedi dechrau ar y gwaith o ddiwygio Tŷ'r Arglwyddi, gan gael gwared â'r mwyafrif llethol o'r arglwyddi etifeddol. Yn ei adroddiad, nododd comisiwn Wakeham ei fod o blaid y cam nesaf yn y broses ddiwygio, gyda chydbwysedd rhwng aelodau etholedig, aelodau enwebedig ac aelodau annibynnol. Yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn, byddwn yn cyhoeddi Papur Gwyn sy'n nodi ein cynigion yn hyn o beth, wedi'u seilio ar adroddiad Wakeham i raddau helaeth. Bydd aelodau etholedig, er mwyn sicrhau cynrychiolaeth ranbarthol briodol. Bydd comisiwn penodiadau statudol. Bydd lle i aelodau annibynnol o hyd. Bydd rheolau sy'n pennu cydbwysedd gwleidyddol teg. Byddwn yn ymgynghori ar y cynigion hyn ac yna'n deddfu er mwyn inni gwblhau'r gwaith o ddiwygio Tŷ'r Arglwyddi a ddechreuwyd yn

1997.

However, constitutional reform and devolution can never be ends in themselves; they are means to an end. The end is to improve the lives of the people we serve. Two years on, we must ask ourselves how devolved institutions have measured up to that task. I believe that there are real achievements of which the Assembly and Wales can be proud.

On education, Wales has seen the best primary school results ever. Class sizes are smaller too.

On health, record investment is being matched with reform. I would say that the Assembly as a whole has confidently handled what amounted to a baptism of fire due to various issues such as the fuel crisis, last year's flooding, Corus, and foot and mouth. That is a credit to the Assembly and to you, Rhodri, for your leadership and commitment as First Minister.

Nearly half of the Assembly and a majority of the Cabinet are women—a level that puts virtually every other parliament in the world to shame. Pensioners and people with disabilities now enjoy concessionary bus travel. That policy was made in Wales and is now being extended to England. However, I think that you would be the first to accept that a huge task remains. There are major challenges above all in improving the delivery of public services—challenges that are just as great here in Wales as in the rest of Britain—in our schools, where we need to raise standards still higher, and in our hospitals, where people are still waiting too long for treatment.

The priority now must be to harness the full potential of the current devolution settlement to improve the lives of the people of Wales. Westminster too must play its part in that process. Devolution is about partnership, and partnership is a two-way street. That is a principle on which both Rhodri Morgan and Paul Murphy have led the way—that we

Fodd bynnag, nid nod ynddo'i hun yw diwygio cyfansoddiadol a datganoli wrth reswm; maent yn fodd i gyrraedd nod. Y nod hwnnw yw gwella bywydau'r bobl yr ydym yn eu gwasanaethu. Dwy flynedd yn ddiweddarach, rhaid inni ofyn i ba raddau y mae'r sefydliadau datganoledig wedi llwyddo yn y dasg honno. Credaf fod cyflawniadau gwirioneddol y gall y Cynulliad a Chymru ymfalchïo ynddynt.

Ym maes addysg, cafodd ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru eu canlyniadau gorau erioed. Mae maint dosbarthiadau yn llai hefyd.

Ym maes iechyd, yr ydym yn cyflwyno'r buddsoddiad mwyaf erioed ochr yn ochr â phroses ddiwygio. Yn fy marn i mae'r Cynulliad ar y cyfan wedi dod drwy'r hyn a oedd, i bob diben, yn fedydd tân, yn sgîl materion megis yr argyfwng tanwydd, llifogydd y llynedd, Corus a chlwy'r traed a'r genau, yn hyderus. Mae hynny'n dwyn clod i'r Cynulliad ac i chithau, Rhodri, am eich arweinyddiaeth a'ch ymroddiad fel Prif Weinidog Cymru.

Mae bron hanner Aelodau'r Cynulliad a mwyafrif y Cabinet yn ferched—lefel sy'n codi cywilydd ar bron pob senedd arall yn y byd. Mae pensiywyr a phobl anabl bellach yn teithio ar fsysys am bris gostyngol. Yng Nghymru y lluniwyd y polisi hwnnw ac erbyn hyn mae'n cael ei ymestyn i Loegr. Fodd bynnag, credaf mai chi fyddai'r cyntaf i dderbyn bod tasg enfawr o'ch blaen o hyd. Mae heriau mawr yn bennaf o ran gwella'r ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eu cyflwyno—heriau sydd yr un mor fawr yma yng Nghymru ag y maent yng ngweddill Prydain—yn ein hysgolion, lle y mae angen inni godi safonau eto, ac yn ein hysbytai, lle y mae pobl yn aros yn rhy hir o hyd i gael triniaeth.

Rhaid sicrhau mai'r flaenoriaeth yn awr yw manteisio i'r eithaf ar botensial lawn y setliad datganoli presennol er mwyn gwella bywydau pobl Cymru. Rhaid i San Steffan chwarae ei rhan hefyd yn y broses honno. Mae datganoli yn ymwneud â phartneriaeth, ac mae partneriaeth yn rhywbeth dwyffordd. Dyna'r egwyddor a fu'n sail i arweiniad

achieve more by working in partnership.

As you will know, the last spending review provides an extra £1.8 billion of investment in Welsh public services. Partnership means ensuring that Wales's voice is heard loud and clear in Westminster, and I do not believe that Wales could have a greater champion in that regard than Paul Murphy, the current Secretary of State. Partnership allows us then to act together on issues where Wales and Westminster need to come together: for example, legislation for a children's commissioner—the first post of its kind in Britain; reforms to the health service in Wales that were voted on here in this very chamber; Objective 1, where the funding is now in place to help deprived communities in west Wales and the Valleys; miners' compensation, which I know has not been getting quickly enough to those who need it and who are suffering, but where we are doing all we can to speed up the payments and ensure that the money gets to those who need it most—the oldest and the sickest miners and widows. Every week now we pay out about £1 million in Wales—over £100 million in total so far.

There is much that we need to do together, and I believe that devolution has left the UK stronger, not weaker. We are able to do as the UK what we need to do together. And in respect of issues such as public services we can do things differently. Such a constitutional partnership may be a revolution here, but it is commonplace elsewhere in Europe and in the wider world. It allows the energy and diversity of different parts of our country to breathe and develop. I know that devolution is in its infancy still, but there is already a healthy debate about how it can develop, which is taking root in the English regions too. However, there is a wider context. A development is taking place that is again obvious and is replicated worldwide. Throughout the world, nations are coming closer together, whether in the European Union, in the North American Free Trade Agreement, in Asia with the Association of South East Asian Nations or

Rhodri Morgan a Paul Murphy—sef ein bod yn cyflawni mwy drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth.

Fel y gwyddoch, yn yr adolygiad diwethaf o wariant darparwyd £1.8 biliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru. Ystyr partneriaeth yw sicrhau bod llais Cymru yn cael ei glywed yn uchel ac yn blaen yn San Steffan, a chredaf yn hyn o beth na allai Cymru gael gwell eiriolwr na Paul Murphy, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol presennol. Bydd partneriaeth wedyn yn fodd inni gydweithredu ar faterion lle y mae angen i Gymru a San Steffan ddod ynghyd: er enghraifft, deddfwriaeth ar gyfer comisiynydd plant—y swydd gyntaf o'i bath ym Mhrydain; diwygiadau i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, y pleidleisiwyd arnynt yn y Siambr hon; Amcan 1, lle y mae arian bellach yn barod i helpu cymunedau difreintiedig yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd; iawndal i lowyr, nad yw wedi bod yn cyrraedd yn ddigon cyflym at y rhai sydd ei angen ac sy'n dioddef, ond yr ydym yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i gyflymu'r broses o wneud taliadau a sicrhau bod yr arian yn cyrraedd y rhai sydd ei angen fwyaf—y glowyr mwyaf oedrannus a sâl a'r gweddwon. Erbyn hyn yr ydym yn talu tua £1 filiwn bob wythnos yng Nghymru—dros £100 miliwn hyd yma.

Mae llawer y mae angen inni ei wneud gyda'n gilydd, a chredaf fod y DU yn gryfach, nid yn wannach oherwydd datganoli. Gallwn gyflawni'r hyn y mae angen ei gyflawni gyda'n gilydd fel y DU. Ac o ran materion megis gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gallwn wneud pethau'n wahanol. Efallai bod partneriaeth gyfansoddiadol o'r fath yn chwyldroadol yma, ond mae'n beth cyffredin mewn gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop a ledled y byd. Mae'n fodd i egni a natur amrywiol y gwahanol rannau o'n gwlad anadlu a datblygu. Gwn mai megis cychwyn y mae datganoli, ond mae dadl iach ynghylch sut y gall ddatblygu eisoes yn mynd rhagddi, ac mae'r ddadl honno yn dechrau yn rhanbarthau Lloegr hefyd erbyn hyn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ystyried cyd-destun ehangach. Mae datblygiad ar droed sydd unwaith eto yn ddatblygiad amlwg ac yn un a welir drwy'r byd i gyd. Ledled y byd mae cenhedloedd yn dod yn nes at ei gilydd, boed hynny yn yr

in South America with MERCOSUR.

Increasingly, nations are having to recognise that challenges, interests and solutions are global—climate change, international finance or terrorism, for example. Yet coincidentally, at the very time nations collaborate on a bigger stage, there is within countries a greater desire to seize back control over local issues on a smaller stage. Politics is about finding different levels appropriate to different types of issue. I believe that political systems that fail to make sense of those developments will become either out of touch with people or ineffectual.

The purpose of modernising the British constitution is to try to avoid these pitfalls and to enable us to be a true partner in the European Union and globally, committed to devolution on the issues where devolution makes sense, yet proud to be Britain where we need to act as Britain, and proud also of devolution where that is the sensible way to make decisions.

I also believe that separation of the component parts of the UK is a cul-de-sac. It would make each part weaker. There is merit in the simple argument that when it comes to the economy, defence, foreign policy or social security, bigger is indeed stronger. We can then project that strength globally. But within that unity, diversity can flourish. That is why devolution is so important. It may be in its infancy, but it is here to stay. There have been huge changes in the UK over the past few years. However, I hope that with our new relationship with the rest of Europe, with the UK able to do the things that it has to do together, and with devolution allowing us, where possible, to take decision-making far closer to the people, we have created the right circumstances in which political decision-making can be seen as relevant and effective for the concerns of the people we represent.

Undeb Ewropeaidd, yng Nghytundeb Masnach Rydd Gogledd America, yn Asia drwy Gymdeithas Cenhedloedd De-ddwyrain Asia neu drwy MERCOSUR yn Ne America.

Yn fwyfwy, mae'r cenhedloedd yn gorfod cydnabod bod heriau, buddiannau ac atebion yn bethau byd-eang—newid hinsawdd, cyllid rhyngwladol neu derfysgaeth, er enghraifft. Ac eto, wrth i'r cenhedloedd ddechrau cydweithio ar lwyfan mwy, mae'r awydd o fewn gwledydd i gael gafael ar reolaeth dros faterion lleol ar lwyfan llai yn tyfu. Mae a wnelo gwleidyddiaeth â dod o hyd i lefelau gwahanol sy'n addas i fathau gwahanol o faterion. Credaf y bydd systemau gwleidyddol sy'n methu â dygymod â'r datblygiadau hynny naill ai'n colli cysylltiad â'r bobl neu'n dod yn aneffeithiol.

Diben moderneiddio cyfansoddiad Prydain yw ceisio osgoi'r peryglon hyn a'n galluogi i fod yn wir bartner yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ac yn fyd-eang, yn ymrwymedig i ddatganoli ar y materion lle y mae datganoli yn gwneud synnwyr, ond ar yr un pryd yn falch o fod yn rhan o Brydain lle y bo angen inni weithredu fel Prydain, ac yn falch hefyd o ddatganoli lle mai hynny yw'r ffordd synhwyrol o wneud penderfyniadau.

Credaf hefyd nad yw daduno rhannau cyfansoddol y DU yn cynnig dim. Ni fyddai ond yn gwneud pob rhan yn wannach. Mae rhinwedd yn y ddadl syml, o safbwynt yr economi, amddiffyn, polisi tramor neu nawdd cymdeithasol, mai mewn undod y mae nerth. Yna gallwn ddangos y nerth hwnnw yn fyd-eang. Ond yn yr undod hwnnw gall amrywiaeth ffynnu. Dyna pam bod datganoli mor bwysig. Er mai megis cychwyn y mae datganoli, goroesi a wna. Bu newidiadau enfawr yn y DU dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, fy ngobaith i yw, o ystyried ein perthynas newydd â gweddill Ewrop, yn y ffaith y gall y DU wneud y pethau y mae'n rhaid iddi eu gwneud gyda'i gilydd, yn y ffaith bod datganoli yn caniatáu inni wneud penderfyniadau yn llawer nes at y bobl lle bynnag ag y bo hynny'n bosibl, ein bod wedi creu yr amgylchiadau iawn lle y mae'r broses o wneud penderfyniadau gwleidyddol yn cael ei hystyried yn berthnasol ac yn effeithiol wrth ymdrin â phryderon y bobl yr ydym yn eu cynrychioli.

In the end, whatever our political party, whatever our political priority, we are all a part of public service, which is the desire to try to take the right decisions, according to our beliefs and convictions, for the people we serve. Yet, unless we do so within a system that makes sense, those decisions will be less likely to be accepted and relevant to the people we represent. The changes in the constitution of our country have been for a purpose that is to do not with constitutional change itself but with making politics more relevant and decisions better for the lives of the people we serve.

Yn y pen draw, beth bynnag fo ein plaid wleidyddol, beth bynnag fo ein blaenoriaeth wleidyddol, yr ydym oll yn rhan o wasanaeth cyhoeddus, sef yr awydd i geisio gwneud y penderfyniadau cywir, yn unol â'n hegwyddorion a'n hargyhoeddiadau, ar ran y bobl yr ydym yn eu gwasanaethu. Ac eto, oni wnawn hynny o fewn system sy'n synhwyrol, bydd y penderfyniadau hynny yn llai tebygol o gael eu derbyn ac yn llai tebygol o fod yn berthnasol i'r bobl yr ydym yn eu cynrychioli. Newidiwyd cyfansoddiad ein gwlad at ddiben nad yw a wnelo â newid cyfansoddiadol ei hun ond â sicrhau bod gwleidyddiaeth yn fwy perthnasol a bod penderfyniadau yn well ar gyfer bywydau y bobl yr ydym yn eu gwasanaethu.

I was proud to make the case for the Assembly some years ago. I was proud too that that case was accepted. I am deeply proud to come to the National Assembly for Wales and be the first British Prime Minister to address you. Of one thing I am certain: I will not be the last. [*Applause.*]

Yr oeddwn yn falch o gyflwyno'r ddadl o blaid y Cynulliad rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Yr oeddwn yn falch hefyd i'r ddadl honno gael ei derbyn. Yr wyf yn hynod o falch o fod yma yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru fel y Prif Weinidog Prydeinig cyntaf i'ch annerch. Un peth sy'n sicr: nid myfi fydd yr olaf. [*Cymeradwyo.*]

The Presiding Officer: On behalf of all colleagues, from my impartial position I thank you, Prime Minister, for visiting the Assembly and for addressing its Members.

Y Llywydd: Ar ran pob un o'm cyd-Aelodau, o'm sefyllfa ddiuedd, hoffwn ddiolch ichi, Brif Weinidog, am ymweld â'r Cynulliad ac am annerch ei Aelodau.

We will break for a minute to reset the stage.

Cawn seibiant byr er mwyn i'r llwyfan gael ei ailosod.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd Election to the Economic Development Committee

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly, acting under section 57(8) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 elects Mike German (Liberal Democrat) to its Economic Development Subject Committee. (NDM808)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 57(8) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn ethol Mike German (Democrat Rhyddfrydol) yn aelod o'i Bwyllgor Pwnc ar Ddatblygu Economaidd. (NDM808)

The Presiding Officer: I will permit brief contributions.

Y Llywydd: Byddaf yn caniatáu cyfraniadau byr.

Dafydd Wigley: Gofynnaf am air o eglurhad ar y pwynt hwn. Os enwebir Mike German ar gyfer ei ailethol i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd fel un o aelodau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar y Pwyllgor hwnnw, ni fydd yno yn rhinwedd y swydd y mae wedi ymddiswyddo ohoni dros dro, sef Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Os cynigir y cynnig yn awr, awgrymir nad ydym yn disgwyl iddo ddychwelyd i'r swydd honno. Os felly, a wnaiff y Llywodraeth ddweud wrthym pwy sydd am lenwi'r swydd fel y bydd gennym Weinidog llawn-amser yn fuan?

Alun Cairns: The Welsh Conservative Party supports the motion because we respect the right of parties to nominate their Committee members. However, I want the Minister for Assembly Business to address party balance in relation to this issue. Electing another member from the governing parties to the Economic Development Committee might comply with Standing Orders regarding overall representation from the parties, but it will strengthen the hand of the governing parties on contentious issues. Everyone will be aware that the national economic development strategy is having a difficult ride through the Committee, which has been vindicated in the longer term. I fear that an additional member of the governing parties on the Economic Development Committee will tip the balance in a way that would not be conducive to running the Welsh economy.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any contributions from other groups?

Andrew Davies: This is a classic case—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister for Assembly Business is exercising his right and obligation under Standing Order No. 8.6 to respond to the debate.

Andrew Davies: I realise that this is a classic case of bathos, of going from the sublime to the ridiculous. I understand why Dafydd Wigley and Alun Cairns want to make a political football of this. The Liberal Democrats, along with the other political parties, are entitled to representation on each

Dafydd Wigley: I would like clarification on this point. If Mike German is proposed for re-election to the Economic Development Committee as a Liberal Democrat member of that Committee, he will not be there by virtue of the post of Minister for Economic Development, from which he has resigned temporarily. If the motion is tabled now, that suggests that we do not expect him to return to that post. If so, will the Government tell us who will fill that post so that we have a full-time Minister soon?

Alun Cairns: Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig am ein bod yn parchu hawl pleidiau i enwebu aelodau i'r Pwyllgorau. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf i'r Trefnydd drafod cydbwysedd pleidiol yng nghyd-destun y mater hwn. Er bod ethol aelod arall o'r pleidiau llywodraethol i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn cydymffurfio â'r Rheolau Sefydlog o ran cynrychiolaeth gyffredinol y pleidiau, bydd o fantais i'r pleidiau llywodraethol ar faterion dadleuol. Gŵyr pawb y bu'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol o dan y lach yn y Pwyllgor, y gellid ei gyfiawnhau yn y tymor hwy. Ofnaf y byddai cyflwyno aelod arall o'r pleidiau llywodraethol ar y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn newid y cydbwysedd mewn ffordd na fyddai'n gydnaws â rhedeg economi Cymru.

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw gyfraniadau gan grwpiau eraill?

Andrew Davies: Mae hon yn enghraifft glasurol *[Torri ar draws]*—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r Trefnydd yn arfer ei hawl a'i ddyletswydd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.6 i ymateb i'r dadl.

Andrew Davies: Sylweddolaf fod hon yn enghraifft glasurol o affwysedd gan symud o'r arddunol i'r chwerthinllyd. Deallaf pam bod Dafydd Wigley ac Alun Cairns am wneud pwynt gwleidyddol. Mae hawl gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ynghyd â'r pleidiau gwleidyddol eraill, i gael eu

Subject Committee in line with their overall representation. I have tried to ensure this by tabling Mike German's election to the Economic Development Committee. I have listened to similar representations from the Conservative Party and Plaid Cymru on other occasions when they felt that the political balance was not reflected in each Committee.

cynrychioli ar bob Pwyllgor Pwnc yn unol â'u cynrychiolaeth gyffredinol. Yr wyf wedi ceisio sicrhau hyn drwy gynnig ethol Mike German i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Gwrandewais ar sylwadau tebyg gan y Blaid Geidwadol a Phlaid Cymru ar achlysuron eraill pan oeddent o'r farn nad oedd y cydbwysedd gwleidyddol wedi ei adlewyrchu ym mhob Pwyllgor.

Cynnig: O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru
Questions to the First Minister

Dyfodol Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yng Nghymru
The Future of Public Services in Wales

Q1 Janet Ryder: What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding the future of public services in Wales? (OAQ13186)

The First Minister: I meet regularly with the Secretary of State for Wales to discuss a wide range of Welsh and UK issues. I am sure that you will have noticed—as part of the discussions on the budget last week—an announcement that there would be a £23 million new community hospital in Rhondda, and a £10 million new community hospital in Porthmadog, both built entirely from public capital.

Janet Ryder: Your Ministers, Jane Hutt and Jane Davidson, gave a number of assurances during the summer, that there would be no privatisation of public services in Wales. Will you give us a categorical assurance that private finance initiative projects will not be used as the back door to privatising public services in Wales?

The First Minister: Yes, I can give you that assurance. I am sure that those Plaid Cymru-led local authorities that are by no means backward in coming forward with PFI projects would give the same guarantee to the people living in their areas.

Alun Pugh: Do you accept that railways are a key public service? Do you agree that the Secretary of State for Transport was right to step in following the financial collapse of Railtrack? Do you also agree that the north-south rail link is a key issue for concern? Will you take this up with the Secretary of State for Wales and the Strategic Rail Authority?

The First Minister: At present, Railtrack is

C1 Janet Ryder: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch dyfodol gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? (OAQ13186)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru i drafod ystod eang o faterion sy'n ymwneud â Chymru a'r DU. Byddwch wedi sylwi, mae'n siŵr—fel rhan o'r trafodaethau ar y gyllideb yr wythnos diwethaf—ar y cyhoeddiad y byddai ysbyty cymuned newydd gwerth £23 miliwn yn y Rhondda ac ysbyty cymuned newydd gwerth £10 miliwn ym Mhorthmadog, â'r ddau yn cael eu hadeiladu'n gyfan gwbl drwy arian cyhoeddus.

Janet Ryder: Rhoddodd eich Gweinidogion, Jane Hutt a Jane Davidson, sicrwydd dros yr haf na fyddai gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn cael eu preifateiddio yng Nghymru o gwbl. A wnewch chi roi sicrwydd diamwys inni na chaiff prosiectau sy'n fentrau cyllid preifat eu defnyddio fel ffordd o breifateiddio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru dan ysgwydd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gwnaf, gallaf roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw ichi. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r awdurdodau lleol hynny sydd o dan arweiniad Plaid Cymru nad ydynt yn amharod o bell ffordd i gyflwyno mentrau cyllid preifat yn rhoi'r un sicrwydd i'r bobl sy'n byw yn eu hardaloedd hwy.

Alun Pugh: A dderbyniwch fod y rheilffyrdd yn wasanaeth cyhoeddus allweddol? A gytunwch fod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth yn gywir i gamu i mewn yn dilyn cwmp ariannol Railtrack? A gytunwch hefyd fod y cyswllt rheilffordd rhwng y De a'r Gogledd yn achos pryder? A wnewch chi godi hyn gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ar hyn o bryd, mae

in the hands of the administrators for a further two months following the events that we have discussed several times before. When the new not-for-profit son or daughter of Railtrack emerges early in the new year, a huge raft of other changes will follow. We will ensure that Wales's voice is clearly heard, including on the issue of the north-south rail service, which you rightly mentioned.

David Melding: You will no doubt welcome the news, as I do, that the accident and emergency waiting times are slightly better in Wales than in England. However, we must remember that they have declined during a five-year period. Will you ensure that the Secretary of State for Wales is aware of this and that we have resources to reduce waiting times?

The First Minister: Yes. There is, to some extent, a spin-off between these two issues. If you are determined that there will be no trolley waits, it sometimes means that you have overflow and outliers from the medical emergency side of a hospital taking beds that would otherwise be used for people being prepared for, or just about to come back from, routine operations. I was pleased with the figures, as was Jane Hutt, who welcomed them, showing that Wales was pretty well top of the league in terms of not having accident and emergency patients presenting and having to wait more than an hour before getting a bed.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Given that New Labour, through Alan Milburn, the UK Secretary of State for Health, in particular, is seeking to destroy Aneurin Bevan's legacy in setting up the NHS, will you confirm that, as far as you are concerned, establishing the NHS was a lasting achievement by Aneurin Bevan? Whatever New Labour Ministers in London might think, we are determined to ensure that public services are valued here in Wales.

Railtrack yn nwylo'r gweinyddwyr am ddeufis arall yn dilyn y digwyddiadau yr ydym wedi eu trafod sawl gwaith o'r blaen. Pan sefydlir y cwmni olynol na fydd yn gwneud elw ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn newydd, daw llw o newidiadau eraill yn ei sgîl. Byddwn yn sicrhau y caiff llais Cymru ei glywed yn glir, gan gynnwys ar fater y gwasanaeth rheilffordd rhwng y De a'r Gogledd, ac yr oeddech yn iawn i grybwyll hynny.

David Melding: Yn ddiau byddwch chi, fel minnau, yn croesawu'r newyddion fod yr amseroedd aros ar gyfer adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys ychydig yn well yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag rhaid inni gofio iddynt ddirywio dros gyfnod o bum mlynedd. A wnewch chi sicrhau bod Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn ymwybodol o hyn a bod gennym adnoddau i leihau'r amseroedd aros?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gwnaf. Mae'r ddau fater hyn yn gorgyffwrdd i raddau. Os ydych yn benderfynol na fydd neb yn gorfod aros ar droli, weithiau mae'n golygu y bydd rhai sy'n cael eu derbyn i'r ysbyty fel achosion meddygol brys yn mynd â gwelyau yn y brif ran o'r ysbyty, gwelyau a fyddai fel arall yn cael eu defnyddio ar gyfer pobl sy'n cael eu paratoi ar gyfer llawdriniaethau cyffredin neu sydd ar fin dod yn ôl ar ôl bod dan lawdriniaeth. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld y ffigurau, fel yr oedd Jane Hutt, sydd wedi eu croesawu, sy'n dangos bod Cymru ar y brig fwy neu lai o safbwynt sicrhau nad oes rhaid i gleifion mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys aros fwy nag awr ar ôl nodi eu symptomau cyn cael gwely.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): O gofio bod Llafur Newydd, drwy Alan Milburn, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol y DU dros lechyd, yn arbennig, yn ceisio dinistrio'r hyn a gyflawnodd Aneurin Bevan wrth sefydlu'r NHS, a wnewch chi gadarnhau, o'ch rhan chi, mai camp barhaol oedd sefydlu'r NHS gan Aneurin Bevan? Beth bynnag fo barn Gweinidogion Llafur Newydd yn Llundain, yr ydym yn benderfynol o sicrhau bod gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn cael eu gwerthfawrogi yma yng Nghymru.

The First Minister: I do not have a problem with any of that, other than in the interpretation of what Alan Milburn said. You are looking at the spin rather than at the substance of his speech. I would not be second to anybody in my admiration for the establishment of the NHS as the most outstanding, lasting contribution to civilisation by any single politician, Welsh or otherwise. It was set up in legislation that was passed with huge courage by the post-war Labour Government, led by Aneurin Bevan. I have always been puzzled that other countries did not imitate Great Britain, but that is how it is. The NHS, of course, does not have to be exactly the same model as in 1947, when the legislation was passed. Nevertheless, I would hate to see us moving away from its fundamental principle—that care is free at the point of need.

2:10 p.m.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Now that we have established your credentials in support of public services, will you comment on Paul Murphy's remarks at the Labour conference? The Prime Minister hinted today—and he chose his words carefully—that we may have to do things differently in the public services in future. That is a euphemism for further privatisation of public services. Will Rhodri give a categorical assurance, if he believes fundamentally in the future of public services, that we will not have creeping privatisation in Wales?

The First Minister: You have erected a magnificent inverted pyramid, Ieuan, but the bearing was made of green cheese. There is no basis for your allegation that we are moving away from the public service principle: we are not. But that does not mean that we will never make use of private medicine; Aneurin Bevan's original proposal did not suggest that. Ieuan will remember that general practitioners were made independent contractors in the national health service structure. Private construction companies have always built hospitals and sold equipment to them. You must have a sensible, fluid and flexible line between where the private sector ends and where the

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid anghytunaf ag unrhyw beth a ddywedasoch, ac eithrio eich dehongliad o'r hyn a ddywedodd Alan Milburn. Yr ydych yn edrych ar sbin yn hytrach na sylwedd ei araith. Ni ildiwn i neb yn fy edmygedd mai sefydlu'r NHS oedd y cyfraniad mwyaf nodedig, parhaol a wnaeth unrhyw wleidydd o Gymru neu fel arall i wareiddiad. Fe'i sefydlwyd drwy ddeddfwriaeth a basiwyd yn ddewr iawn gan y Llywodraeth Lafur ar ôl y rhyfel, o dan arweiniad Aneurin Bevan. Bu'n syndod imi erioed nad efelychwyd Prydain Fawr gan wleidydd eraill ond dyna fel ag y mae. Wrth gwrs nid oes yn rhaid i'r NHS ddilyn yr un model ag yn 1947 pan basiwyd y ddeddfwriaeth. Eto i gyd, byddai'n gas gennyf pe baem yn symud o'i egwyddor sylfaenol—bod gofal am ddim lle y bo ei angen.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A ninnau wedi cael tystiolaeth o'ch cefnogaeth i wasanaethau cyhoeddus, a wnewch chi sylwadau ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Paul Murphy yng nghynhadledd y Blaid Lafur? Awgrymodd y Prif Weinidog heddiw—a dewisodd ei eiriau yn ofalus—efallai y bydd yn rhaid inni wneud pethau yn wahanol ym maes gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn y dyfodol. Dyna ledneisair am breifateiddio'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ymhellach. A wnaiff Rhodri roi sicrwydd diamwys, os cred yn daer yn nyfodol y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, na welwn broses breifateiddio raddol yng Nghymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Bu ichi godi gwych o byramid a'i wyneb i'r waered, Ieuan, ond yr oedd y sylfeini yn bwdr. Nid oes unrhyw sail i'ch honiad ein bod yn symud o egwyddor gwasanaeth cyhoeddus: nid yw hynny'n wir. Ond ni olyga hynny na fyddwn byth yn defnyddio meddygaeth breifat; nid awgrymodd cynnig gwreiddiol Aneurin Bevan hynny. Bydd Ieuan yn cofio i feddygon teulu fynd yn gontractwyr annibynnol o fewn strwythur y gwasanaeth ieched gwladol. Cwmnïau adeiladu preifat sydd wedi adeiladu ysbytai ac wedi gwerthu offer iddynt erioed. Rhaid ichi bennu ffin synhwyrol a hyblyg o ran terfynau'r sector preifat, sy'n addas at ddibenion yr NHS.

public sector begins, which suits the NHS's purposes. I believe that, under the leadership of this administration, we have that right for the circumstances in Wales.

Credaf o dan arweiniad y weinyddiaeth hon, ein bod wedi llwyddo i daro'r nod o ran amgylchiadau Cymru.

Cabinet y Cynulliad The Assembly Cabinet

Q2 William Graham: Has the First Minister given consideration to increasing the number of members in the Assembly Cabinet? (OAQ13212)

C2 William Graham: A yw Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi rhoi ystyriaeth i gynyddu nifer yr Aelodau yng Nghabinet y Cynulliad? (OAQ13212)

The First Minister: No. The maximum size of the Cabinet is set out in Standing Order No. 2.5 and I could not increase it even if I wanted to do so.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nac ydw. Nodir uchafswm maint y Cabinet yn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.5 ac ni allwn ei gynyddu hyd yn oed pe bawn yn dymuno gwneud hynny.

William Graham: My question relates specifically to your carrying out two important Cabinet functions. Do you not agree that that is beyond you? Many commentators say that it is about time you devolved that matter to another to ensure that economic impetus is maintained in Wales.

William Graham: Mae fy nghwestiwn yn ymwneud yn benodol â'r ffaith eich bod yn ymgymryd â dwy swyddogaeth bwysig yn y Cabinet. Oni chytunwch fod hynny y tu hwnt i chi? Mae nifer o sylwebyddion yn dweud ei bod yn hen bryd ichi ddatganoli'r mater hwnnw i rywun arall i sicrhau y cynhelir yr impetws economaidd yng Nghymru.

The First Minister: You should judge economic development on what we get out of it, rather than what we put into it. I direct you to look at the results. With the publication of the national economic development strategy last week and the advisory board on economic policy—another matter that will be subject to much debate in the Economic Development Committee meeting tomorrow, no doubt—a great deal of progress is being made. There is no sign of the delay that would possibly have provided a theoretical basis to your hypothetical question.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Dylech farnu datblygu economaidd ar yr hyn a gawn ohono, yn hytrach na'r hyn a roddwn i mewn iddo. Fe'ch cyfeirïaf i edrych ar y canlyniadau. Gyda chyhoeddi'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol yr wythnos diwethaf a'r bwrdd ymgynghorol ar bolisi economaidd—mater arall a fydd, heb os, yn destun cryn ddadlau yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yfory—gwneir llawer iawn o gynnydd. Nid oes arwydd o'r oedi a fyddai o bosibl wedi rhoi sail theoretig i'ch cwestiwn damcaniaethol.

Dafydd Wigley: Erfyniaf ar y Prif Weinidog, yn sgîl ffiasgo'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol eleni, a newyddion ddoe bod perygl inni orfod talu rhan o arian Amcan 1 yn ôl i Ewrop, i benodi Gweinidog llawn-amser dros yr economi. Os mynnwch wneud y gwaith eich hunan, pam na wnewch chi'r swydd honno yn llawn-amser a rhoi gorau i'r swydd arall?

Dafydd Wigley: I beg the First Minister, in light of this year's national economic development strategy fiasco, and the news yesterday that we are in danger of having to repay part of the Objective 1 money to Europe, to appoint a full-time Minister for the economy. If you insist on doing the work yourself, why do you not do that job full time and give up the other one?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid yw gweiddi neu godi llais yn gwneud dadl yn gryfach. O ran stori ddoe, byddai'n ddiddorol trafod y mater hwnnw ym Mrwsel. Mae'r academyddion

The First Minister: Shouting or raising your voice does not strengthen an argument. In terms of yesterday's story, it would be interesting to discuss that matter in Brussels.

Cymreig hyn wedi dewis gwneud astudiaeth o ddau ranbarth Amcan 1 yn Sweden. Gwyddant ein bod wedi gwario mwy o ganran o'r arian na'r rhanbarthau hynny a'n bod wedi ymrwymo i wario llai o ganran o gyfanswm yr arian. Pa ffaith y byddent am ei phwysleisio? Yr un a gaiff sylw ar dudalen flaen *The Western Mail*.

Mae'r wrthblaid yn manteisio ar stori yn *The Western Mail*. Ni fyddai'r stori ar y dudalen flaen pe byddai'n dweud bod y ddau ranbarth yn Sweden y tu ôl i Gymru o ran canran yr arian y maent wedi wario eisoes. Dyna'r hyn a ddywedwyd wrthym yn y Comisiwn ym Mrwsel ddoe: ni sydd ar y blaen. Am ryw reswm—mae'n rheol mewn gwleidyddiaeth, ac yn awr ymhlith academyddion—mae pobl am gael yr ochr mwy syfrdanol er mwyn rhoi stori well i *The Western Mail* ac er mwyn cyfiawnhau'r math o bwynt y ceisiwch chi ei wneud.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): First Minister, you would not be increasing the size of your Cabinet, so much as restoring it to its original size. It would be well within Standing Orders and the Government of Wales Act 1998 if you were to give up one of your two current jobs. When challenged about this in July, you said that over the recess you would not be as tied down with questions, Committees and Plenaries as when the Assembly is in session. What has changed between July and October? Why do you now feel that you can do both jobs?

The First Minister: Nothing has changed. I have nothing to add to what you raised. I have never claimed that it is an ideal situation, and I hope that it is brought to an end as soon as possible. Any point that I make about this matter could be construed as confining the time and space the police require to get on with their inquiries and bring them to a conclusion in their own way and in their own time.

Nick Bourne: With respect, on the contrary; if you surrendered the job to someone else it would do no such thing. That would not put

These Welsh academics have chosen to do a study of two Objective 1 regions in Sweden. They know that we have spent a greater percentage of money than those regions and that we have made a commitment to spend a lesser percentage of the total money. Which fact will they choose to emphasise? The one that will make the front page of *The Western Mail*.

The opposition is milking a story from *The Western Mail*. The story would not be on the front page if it stated that the two Swedish regions were behind Wales in terms of the percentage of money already spent. That is what we were told in the Commission in Brussels yesterday: we are ahead. For some reason—it is a rule in politics, and now among academics—people tend to highlight the more sensational aspect in order to make a better story for *The Western Mail* and to justify the kind of point you are trying to make.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Brif Weinidog, ni fydddech yn cynyddu maint eich Cabinet, yn gymaint â'i adfer i'w faint gwreiddiol. Byddai yn sicr o fewn y Rheolau Sefydlog a Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, pe bydddech yn ildio un o'ch dwy swydd bresennol. Pan gawsoch eich herio ynglŷn â hyn ym mis Gorffennaf, dywedaso'ch na fydddech wedi eich clymu gymaint gyda chwestiynau, Pwyllgorau a Chyfarfodydd Llawn yn ystod y toriad o gymharu â phryd y mae'r Cynulliad yn eistedd. Beth sydd wedi newid rhwng Gorffennaf a Hydref? Pam y credwch bellach y gallwch wneud y ddwy swydd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid oes dim wedi newid. Nid oes gennyf ddim i'w ychwanegu at yr hyn a godaso'ch. Ni honnais erioed ei bod yn sefyllfa ddelfrydol, a gobeithiaf y daw i ben cyn gynted â phosibl. Gallai unrhyw bwynt a wna'f ar y mater hwn gael ei ddehongli fel ymgais i gyfyngu ar yr amser a'r lle sydd ei angen ar yr heddlu i fwrw ymlaen gyda'u hymholiadau a dod i gasgliad yn eu ffordd eu hunain ac yn eu hamser eu hunain.

Nick Bourne: Gyda phob parch, i'r gwrthwyneb; pe bydddech yn ildio'r swydd i rywun arall ni fyddai'n gwneud y fath beth.

pressure on the police. I can understand that you do not want to give the job to the former Deputy First Minister. However, why do you think that you can do both jobs? Is it because you are superhuman or because he was so ineffective that you think that you are an adequate replacement?

The First Minister: Neither. You only have to look at the results: the £90 million BT Ignite development in Cardiff; the Continental Teves development in Blaenau Gwent; the national economic development strategy results; and the advisory board on economic development and research. It does not appear that there are problems in completing the economic development agenda to time and to budget. While that remains the case, there is no basis for your question.

Ni fyddai hynny yn rhoi pwysau ar yr heddlu. Gallaf ddeall nad ydych am roi'r swydd i gyn Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru. Fodd bynnag, pam y credwch y gallwch wneud y ddwy swydd? Ai oherwydd eich bod yn oruwchddynol neu oherwydd ei fod mor aneffeithiol fel eich bod yn credu eich bod yn ddigonol i gymryd ei le?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid y naill na'r llall. Nid oes rhaid ichi ond edrych ar y canlyniadau: datblygiad BT Ignite £90 miliwn yng Nghaerdydd; datblygiad Continental Teves ym Mlaenau Gwent; canlyniadau'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol; a'r bwrdd ymgynghorol ar ddatblygu economaidd ac ymchwil. Nid ymddengys fod problemau o ran cwblhau'r agenda datblygu economaidd mewn pryd ac yn ôl y gyllideb. Er bod hynny'n parhau i fod yn wir, nid oes sail i'ch cwestiwn.

Ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd European Union Enlargement

Q3 Richard Edwards: Will the First Minister make a statement on the relationship between Wales and the candidate countries for EU enlargement? (OAQ13188)

The First Minister: Wales has links, mostly developed through the private sector, with a number of the candidate countries. Local authorities also have links with counties or towns in the countries with which they are twinned. A working group, which I chair, and to which all party leaders and social and business partners belong, has been created. It will develop a Welsh strategy for engaging with the candidate countries, which will possibly lead to region-to-region or country-to-country twinning. It will be a workable strategy that will give us good value for money and a better political profile in the emerging new pattern of Europe. The group met for the first time on 8 October and its initial recommendations were reported to the Committee on European Affairs some two weeks ago.

Richard Edwards: I am sure you agree that the National Assembly should take a strong

C3 Richard Edwards: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y berthynas rhwng Cymru a'r gwledydd sy'n ymgeiswyr ar gyfer ehangu'r UE? (OAQ13188)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae gan Gymru gysylltiadau, wedi eu datblygu yn bennaf drwy'r sector preifat, gyda nifer o'r gwledydd sy'n ymgeiswyr. Mae gan awdurdodau lleol hefyd gysylltiadau â gwledydd neu drefi yn y gwledydd y maent wedi eu gefeillio â hwy. Mae gweithgor, yr wyf yn gadeirydd arno, ac y mae pob arweinydd plaid a phartneriaid cymdeithasol a busnes yn perthyn iddo, wedi ei greu. Bydd yn datblygu strategaeth yng Nghymru ar gyfer cysylltu â'r gwledydd sy'n ymgeiswyr, a fydd o bosibl yn arwain at efeillio rhanbarth wrth ranbarth neu wlad wrth wlad. Bydd yn strategaeth ymarferol a fydd yn rhoi gwerth da am arian inni a gwell proffil gwleidyddol ym mhattrwm newydd Ewrop. Cyfarfu'r grŵp am y tro cyntaf ar 8 Hydref a chyflwynwyd adroddiad ar ei argymhellion cychwynnol i'r Pwyllgor ar Faterion Ewropeaidd rhyw bythefnos yn ôl.

Richard Edwards: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

leadership role to ensure that Wales enjoys the maximum benefit possible from the positive opportunities that enlargement offers. Will the proposals that you have just outlined amount to a kind of Wales-European enlargement network of practitioners from the private and public sectors, universities and so on, so that this objective will be pursued?

The First Minister: Yes. That is the basis of the platform of private sector and consultancy activity that we have talked about. It should exist before you make your final choice as to whether you should be seeking to twin with Slovakia, Silesia, Slovenia or any other region or small country. We must ask whether there is a private sector basis to the network to which you referred. We have audited that network and it will be part of our calculations before we bring a recommendation to the Assembly. The basic principles were discussed on 8 October. They are that we should seek initially to twin with one region of a reasonably large country such as Poland, and with one region-sized independent country, such as one of the Baltic countries or Slovenia, which are smaller than Wales in terms of population, but are independent countries. One of those should be a coal or steel-producing region or country that has, like Wales, been through the fires of hell in terms of job losses. The other should perhaps have a more diverse or high technology-related economy.

Jonathan Morgan: In light of recent job losses in Wales, which have been attributed to the fact that labour in eastern Europe tends to be cheaper, and, given the fact that Europe enjoys considerable investment from multinational companies—much of which has come to Wales—what will you do as First Minister to ensure that Wales remains an attractive place in which to invest?

The First Minister: There is a threat as well as an opportunity. However, we must not see it only as a threat. It is true that, if wage levels in Poland are one sixth of what they are in Wales, the production of certain types of assembly-line products will be lost, as we saw with the relocation of Lucas SEI Wiring Systems Ltd, Ystradgynlais, to Poland some

gynnig arweiniad cryf i sicrhau bod Cymru yn mwynhau'r budd mwyaf posibl o'r cyfleoedd cadarnhaol y mae ehangu yn ei gynnig. A fydd y cynigion yr ydych newydd eu hamlinellu yn arwain at fath o rwydwaith ehangu Cymru-Ewrop o ymarferwyr o'r sectorau preifat a chyhoeddus, prifysgolion ac ati, er mwyn cyflawni'r amcan hwn?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Bydd. Dyna yw sail y llwyfan o weithgaredd sector preifat ac ymgynghori yr ydym wedi ei drafod. Dylai fodoli cyn i chi wneud eich penderfyniad terfynol o ran pa un a ddylech fod yn ceisio gefeillio â Slofacia, Silesia, Slofenia neu unrhyw ranbarth neu wlad fach arall. Rhaid inni ofyn p'un a oes sail sector preifat i'r rhwydwaith y gwnaethoch gyfeirio ato. Yr ydym wedi archwilio'r rhwydwaith hwnnw a bydd yn rhan o'n cyfrifon cyn inni ddod ag argymhelliad gerbron y Cynulliad. Trafodwyd yr egwyddorion sylfaenol ar 8 Hydref. Yr egwyddorion hynny yw y dylem geisio i ddechrau gefeillio ag un ranbarth o wlad gymharol fawr megis Gwlad Pŵyl, a chydag un wlad annibynnol o faint ranbarth, megis un o'r gwledydd Baltig neu Slofenia, sy'n llai na Chymru o ran poblogaeth, ond sy'n wledydd annibynnol. Dylai un o'r rheini fod yn ranbarth cynhyrchu glo neu haearn sydd, fel Cymru, wedi bod drwy uffern dân yn nhermau colli swyddi. Efallai y dylai'r llall gael economi fwy amrywiol neu un sy'n gysylltiedig â'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf.

Jonathan Morgan: Yn ngoleuni'r swyddi a gollwyd yn ddiweddar yng Nghymru, sydd wedi eu priodoli i'r ffaith bod llafur yn nwyrain Ewrop yn tueddu i fod yn rhatach, ac, yn sgîl y ffaith bod Ewrop yn mwynhau buddsoddiad sylweddol o gwmnïau amlwladol—y daeth daeth llawer ohono i Gymru—beth fyddwch chi fel Prif Weinidog Cymru yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod Cymru yn parhau'n lle deniadol i fuddsoddi ynddo?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae bygythiad yn ogystal â chyfle. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem ei weld fel bygythiad yn unig. Mae'n wir, os yw lefelau cyflogau yng Ngwlad Pŵyl yn un rhan o chwech o'r hyn y maent yng Nghymru, bydd cynhyrchu rhai mathau o gynnyrch rhes gydosod yn cael ei gollu, fel y gwelsom gydag adleoliad Lucas SEI Wiring

two and a half years ago. That can happen, but we must not only see it as a threat. There have been recent examples of multinationals, with bases in Wales and eastern Europe, awarding work to Welsh plants as a result of reorganisation and higher productivity overcoming the lower labour costs of eastern Europe. I was pleased to hear of two such examples in the past month.

Systems Ltd, Ystradgynlais, i Wlad Pŵyl rhyw ddwy flynedd a hanner yn ôl. Gall hynny ddigwydd, ond ni ddylem ei weld fel bygythiad yn unig. Bu enghreifftiau diweddar o gwmnïau amlwladol, gyda safleoedd yng Nghymru a dwyrain Ewrop, yn rhoi gwaith i weithfeydd yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i ad-drefnu a chynhyrchiant uwch yn gorchfygu costau gweithio is yn nwyrain Ewrop. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed am ddwy enghraifft o'r fath yn ystod y mis diwethaf.

2:20 p.m.

The Presiding Officer: Question 4 (OAQ13187) has been withdrawn.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd Cwestiwn 4 (OAQ13187) yn ôl.

Ymosodiadau Diweddar ar yr UDA Recent Attacks on the USA

Q5 John Griffiths: Will the First Minister make a statement on the consequences for Wales of the recent attacks on the USA? (OAQ13190)

C5 John Griffiths: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y canlyniadau i Gymru yn sgîl yr ymosodiadau diweddar ar yr UDA? (OAQ13190)

The First Minister: We debated this last week, therefore I do not intend to make a statement to the Assembly. However, I will keep the Assembly informed of any significant developments that impact upon Wales.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cynhaliwyd dadl ar hyn yr wythnos diwethaf, felly nid wyf yn bwriadu gwneud datganiad i'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn hysbysu'r Cynulliad am unrhyw ddatblygiadau o bwys sy'n effeithio ar Gymru.

The consequences of the attacks on New York and Washington are still felt across Wales. I am pleased to say that there is less anecdotal evidence of attacks on ethnic and religious minority groups. The Welsh tourism industry has been severely affected, albeit less than that in London. Our aerospace industry has also been affected. Our emergency and other services are involved in the contingency preparations for further disruptions or knock-on effects. I am monitoring the consequences and will ensure that the Assembly is kept informed of the latest position.

Mae canlyniadau'r ymosodiadau ar Efrog Newydd a Washington i'w teimlo ledled Cymru o hyd. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod llai o dystiolaeth anecdotaidd o ymosodiadau ar grwpiau lleiafrifoedd ethnig a chrefyddol. Effeithiwyd ar y diwydiant twristiaeth yng Nghymru yn ddifrifol, er i raddau llai nag yn Llundain. Effeithiwyd ar ein diwydiant awyrofod hefyd. Mae ein gwasanaethau argyfwng a'n gwasanaethau eraill yn rhan o'r paratodau wrth gefn ar gyfer tarfu pellach neu sgîl effeithiau. Yr wyf yn monitro'r canlyniadau a byddaf yn sicrhau yr hysbysir y Cynulliad am y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf.

John Griffiths: Do you agree that because of the current international climate, countries are ever more interdependent, and that the Assembly has played a valuable role post-devolution in fostering greater understanding and co-operation between nations? That role will, hopefully, continue to develop. For example, the Assembly's branch of the

John Griffiths: A gytunwch, oherwydd yr hinsawdd rhyngwladol presennol, fod gwledydd hyd yn oed yn fwy cyd-ddibynnol, a bod y Cynulliad wedi chwarae rôl werthfawr ar ôl datganoli wrth feithrin gwell dealltwriaeth a chydweithrediad rhwng y cenhedloedd? Bydd y rôl honno, gobeithio, yn parhau i ddatblygu. Er enghraifft, mae

Commonwealth Parliamentary Association is one of 163 national, state, provincial and territorial parliament branches. I believe that we have played a full role to date. Would you like to see us continuing in that vein?

The First Minister: That was a pretty good plug, John. I do not think that I could add to it. On the wider point of conveying the message to ethnic and religious minority communities that we will not tolerate using the 11 September massacres as justification for any attacks on, or isolation of those communities, it is important that that message is understood. The establishment of a permanent standing conference comprised of representatives of Wales's different religions is currently being arranged, so that it can meet us. A permanent inter-faith forum is being created, which we hope will hold its first meeting early in 2002.

On trade relations with Muslim countries, last week I was pleased to meet the returnees from Wales Trade International's Gulf trade mission. Not one Welsh company pulled out, and the group went to the Gulf in mid-October. They received a warm reception and signed many orders. At least £2 million-worth of orders seem to have been signed already, as a result of that trade mission.

Janet Davies: You spoke of what I think you called a standing conference of various ethnic groups, but there is a real problem there. How will you explain to Muslims in Wales that they are full citizens when you continue to support bombing people of their religion?

The First Minister: The actual phrase that I used was 'inter-faith forum', but I meant it to be a permanent body, rather than a one-off meeting.

I cannot answer your question on the Welsh Muslim community's response to the bombing campaign, as the Assembly is not responsible for it. My only observation is that the last time we were engaged in such a crisis was in Kosovo, where Christians committed

cangen y Cynulliad o Gymdeithas Seneddol y Gymanwlad yn un o'r 163 o ganghennau seneddol cenedlaethol, gwladol, taleithiol a thiriogaethol. Yr wyf yn credu ein bod wedi chwarae rôl lawn hyd yma. A ydych am ein gweld yn parhau yn y cywair hwnnw?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr oedd hwnnw yn hysbyseb eithaf da, John. Ni chredaf y gallwn ychwanegu ato. Ar y pwynt ehangach o gyfleu'r neges i gymunedau lleiafrifoedd ethnig a chrefyddol, sef na fyddwn yn goddef defnyddio cyflafan 11 Medi fel cyfiawnhad dros unrhyw ymosodiadau ar y cymunedau hynny neu dros eu hynysu, mae'n bwysig y deallir y neges honno. Mae'r broses o sefydlu cynhadledd sefydlog barhaol yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr crefyddau gwahanol Cymru yn mynd rhagddi ar hyn o bryd, fel y gall gyfarfod â ni. Mae fforwm rhyng-grefyddol yn cael ei greu, a gobeithiwn y bydd yn cynnal ei gyfarfod cyntaf yn gynnar yn 2002.

O ran cysylltiadau masnach â gwledydd Moslemaidd, yr wythnos diwethaf yr oeddwn yn falch o gyfarfod â'r dychweledigion o genhadaeth fasnach Masnach Cymru Rhyngwladol yn y Gwlff. Ni thynnodd yr un cwmni o Gymru yn ôl, ac aeth y grŵp i'r Gwlff yng nghanol mis Hydref. Cawsant groeso cynnes ac arwyddasant nifer o archebion. Mae o leiaf gwerth £2 filiwn o archebion wedi eu harwyddo yn barod, o ganlyniad i'r genhadaeth fasnach honno.

Janet Davies: Bu ichi sôn am yr hyn y credaf ichi ei alw yn gynhadledd sefydlog o wahanol grwpiau ethnig, ond mae problem go iawn yno. Sut y byddwch yn esbonio wrth Foslemiaid yng Nghymru eu bod yn ddinasyddion llawn pan fyddwch yn parhau i gefnogi bomio pobl o'u crefydd hwy?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr union ymadrodd a ddefnyddiais oedd 'fforwm rhyng-grefyddol', ond bwriadais iddo fod yn gorff parhaol, yn hytrach nag un cyfarfod ar ei ben ei hun.

Ni allaf ateb eich cwestiwn ar ymateb y gymuned Foslemaidd yng Nghymru i'r ymgyrch fomio, gan nad y Cynulliad sy'n gyfrifol amdano. Fy unig sylw yw y tro diwethaf yr oeddem yn rhan o argyfwng o'r fath oedd yn Kosovo, lle y cyflawnodd

atrocities against the Muslim population. The purpose of that bombing was to defend the Muslim population of Albanian origin in Kosovo. Roughly the same alliance perpetrated that bombing campaign, but on behalf of Muslims. Muslims had been subject to atrocities in their own country by people purporting to represent the Christian side of the 'great divide', which has existed since the crusades. It is not all one-way. It must never be assumed that the USA and the UK would not help Muslims under attack because they are only a minority. Both countries plainly did so in Kosovo, two or three years ago.

Cristnogion erchyllterau yn erbyn y boblogaeth Foslemaidd. Pwrpas y bomio hwnnw oedd amddiffyn y boblogaeth Foslemaidd o linach Albaniaidd yn Kosovo. Yr un gynghrair fwy neu lai a gyflawnodd yr ymgyrch fomio honno, ond ar ran y Moslemaid. Bu Moslemaid yn dioddef erchyllterau yn eu gwlad eu hunain gan bobl a oedd yn honni eu bod yn cynrychioli'r ochr Gristnogol o'r 'rhaniad mawr', sydd wedi bodoli ers y croesgadau. Nid yw popeth un ffordd. Ni ddylid byth tybio na fyddai'r UDA a'r DU yn peidio â helpu Moslemaid dan ymosodiad dim ond am mai lleiafrif ydynt. Cawsom enghraifft glir o'r ddwy wlad yn gwneud hyn yn Kosovo, ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl.

Disodli Railtrack Replacing Railtrack

C6 Eleanor Burnham: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y trafodaethau y mae wedi eu cael â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Rhanbarthau ynghylch yr effaith ar y Cynulliad a'i bwerau yn sgîl disodli Railtrack gan gorff nad yw'n gwneud elw? (OAQ13177)

Q6 Eleanor Burnham: Will the First Minister make a statement on the discussions that he has had with the Secretary of State for Transport, Local Government and the Regions regarding the effects on the Assembly and its powers of Railtrack being replaced by a non-profit body? (OAQ13177)

C7 Rhodri Glyn Thomas A gaiff Cabinet y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei gynrychioli ar y corff a fydd yn olynu Railtrack? (OAQ13180)

Q7 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will the National Assembly Cabinet be represented on the body that will succeed Railtrack? (OAQ13180)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Trafodais y sefyllfa hon gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Rhanbarthau oriau cyn i'w gyfreithwyr fynd i'r Uchel Lys o dan Ddeddf Rheilffyrdd 1993, sydd yn rhoi'r pŵer iddo i dynnu rheolaeth Railtrack yn ôl i'r Llywodraeth. Credaf fod y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Sue Essex, wedi dweud wrth y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ar 17 Hydref y byddwn yn sicrhau yr adlewyrchir buddiannau Cymru mewn unrhyw newidiadau deddfwriaethol ac wrth sefydlu'r cyrff newydd i ddilyn Railtrack erbyn diwedd y cyfnod o dri mis ym mis Ionawr.

The First Minister: I discussed this situation with the Secretary of State for Transport Local Government and the Regions hours before his lawyers went to the High Court under the Railways Act 1993, which gives him the power to put Railtrack into administration. I believe that the Minister for Environment, Sue Essex, told the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee on 17 October that we will ensure that Wales's interests are reflected in any legislative changes and in the establishment of the new bodies that will succeed Railtrack at the end of the three month period in January.

Eleanor Burnham: A allwch gadarnhau y bydd y rheilffyrdd a'r trenau rhwng Caerdydd a'r Gogledd yn gwella er mwyn i'r defnydd o

Eleanor Burnham: Can you confirm that the railways and the trains between Cardiff and north Wales will improve, so that using

drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus ddod yn llai o her, ac yn llai o straen? Yr wythnos diwethaf, er enghraifft, yr oedd mwy o bobl yn defnyddio trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, gan fod y plant ar eu gwyliau hanner-tymor, ond yr oedd llai o drenau, diffyg darpariaeth bwyd a diod arnynt, ac nid oedd y toiledau'n gweithio, ac yn y blaen.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Y mae gennyf sawl swydd, ond nid yw gyrru trenau o'r Gogledd i'r De yn eu plith, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny. Ail-strwythuro'r diwydiant rheilffyrdd yw'r mater mwyaf sydd wedi'i godi ers preifateiddio yn 1993. Daw newidiadau enfawr oherwydd i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol fynd i'r Uchel Lys. Ceisiwn sicrhau y daw lles i Gymru o'r newidiadau a'r ail-strwythuro. Beth bynnag, ni chredaf fy mod yn barod ar hyn o bryd i siarad am fanylion o'r math y cyfeiriasoch atynt.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio, gan fod y cwestiynau wedi eu cyfuno, y byddech wedi ateb y cwestiwn a gyflwynwyd gennyf. Mae fy nghwestiwn atodol yn ehangach. A dderbyniwch, yng ngoleuni argyfwng Railtrack a'r fffiasgo trist a ddatblygodd, fod rhai elfennau o wasanaethau sylfaenol na ddylid eu preifateiddio, oherwydd y byddai'n arwain at sefyllfa debyg mewn addysg, iechyd, a'r gwasanaethau sylfaenol eraill y mae gan bobl hawl iddynt?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Y mae pawb wedi dysgu gwers lem wedi methiant Railtrack fel cwmni. Byddwn yn ailsefydlu Railtrack—neu sefydlu mab neu ferch i Railtrack—fel cwmni nad yw'n seiliedig ar elw. Bydd hynny'n sicrhau na fydd effaith ar y cyfleusterau a'r gwasanaethau i bobl Cymru sydd yn defnyddio, ac a ddylai ddefnyddio'r gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd, ac, o bosibl, ceir gwelliant. Mae'r gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd wedi bod yn wael, yn enwedig o dde Cymru i Paddington, a hwn yw'r gwasanaeth sydd wedi cymryd yr amser hwyaf i'w wella ar ôl y llanastr a gafwyd o ganlyniad i'r ddamwain yn Hatfield ym mis Medi y llynedd.

Alun Pugh: Will you ask your officials to examine the matter of the Kinmel Bay sea wall, which is currently owned by Railtrack,

public transport becomes less trying, and less of a strain? Last week, for example, more people used public transport, as the children were on their half-term holidays, yet there were fewer trains, lack of food and drink available, and the toilets were not working, and so on.

The First Minister: I have several jobs, but driving trains from north Wales to south Wales is not one of them, and I am grateful for that. The restructuring of the railway industry is the biggest issue to have risen as a result of privatisation in 1993. There will be huge changes as a result of the Secretary of State's decision to go to the High Court. We are trying to ensure that Wales will benefit from the changes and restructuring. However, at present, I am not ready to talk about details such as those to which you have referred.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I had hoped that, as the questions were grouped, you would have answered the question I had tabled. My supplementary question is broader. Do you accept that, in the light of the Railtrack crisis, and the sad fiasco that developed, some elements of essential services should not be privatised, as it would lead to a similar situation in education, health, and other essential services to which people are entitled?

The First Minister: Everyone has learnt a harsh lesson from the failure of Railtrack as a company. We will re-establish Railtrack—or establish the successor to Railtrack—as a not-for-profit company. That will ensure that facilities and services for the people of Wales who are using, and who should use, the rail service are not affected and may possibly improve. The rail service has been poor, especially from south Wales to Paddington, and it is this service that has taken the longest time to improve after the disruption caused by the Hatfield railcrash in September last year.

Alun Pugh: A ofynnwch i'ch swyddogion ystyried morglawdd Bae Cinnel, sydd dan berchenogaeth Railtrack ar hyn o bryd, gan ei

as it is of concern to the local town council?

fod o bryder i gyngor lleol y dref?

The First Minister: I shall refer the matter to Sue Essex, and I am sure that Sue will be keen to write to you about it.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cyfeiriaf y mater at Sue Essex, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Sue yn awyddus i ysgrifennu atoch yn ei gylch.

David Davies: Is it not the case that Railtrack collapsed as a result of the Government's decision to drive a coach and horses through it by withholding funding from a deal that had been agreed last April? As a result of the Government reneging on this deal, Railtrack collapsed, passenger confidence in the railways collapsed, and thousands of shareholders—many of them small shareholders—lost their life savings.

David Davies: Onid yw'n wir bod Railtrack wedi dymchwel o ganlyniad i benderfyniad y Llywodraeth i'w ddifodi'n llwyr drwy gadw arian yn ôl y cytunwyd arno fis Ebrill diwethaf? O ganlyniad i'r ffaith nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi anrhydeddu'r addewid hon, dymchwelwyd Railtrack, dymchwelwyd hyder teithwyr yn y rheilffyrdd, a cholodd miloedd o gyfranddeiliaid—llawer ohonynt yn gyfranddeiliaid bach—eu cynilion bywyd.

The First Minister: Undoubtedly some did, and they are the casualties of this changeover. However, the basis of your question accepts that Railtrack was on a life support machine, permanently receiving blood transfusions because it could not generate enough capital. Once the long-term effects of the Paddington and Hatfield rail crashes were felt, the public inquiries that followed demanded that Railtrack spend more on rail safety, and it did not have the share capital to pay for it. I am for a not-for-profit body. As we have learnt from Glas Cymru, a not-for-profit alternative does not have to pay shareholders dividends. In general, by borrowing on the basis of bonds rather than on equity capital, which requires dividends, you can spend more on the capital investment required. That is Railtrack's first priority now. That is why I entirely support the bond, not-for-profit son or daughter of Railtrack as the right way forward.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yn ddiau mae rhai ar eu colled, a hwy sydd wedi dioddef yn sgîl y newid hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae sail eich cwestiwn yn derbyn bod Railtrack megis ar beiriant cynnal bywyd, gan dderbyn trallwysïadau gwaed yn barhaus am na allai gynhyrchu digon o gyfalaf. Unwaith y teimlwyd effeithiau tymor hir damweiniau rheilffordd Paddington a Hatfield, mynnodd ymchwiliadau cyhoeddus a ddilynodd fod Railtrack yn gwario mwy ar ddiogelwch rheilffyrdd, ac nid oedd ganddo'r cyfalaf cyfranddaliadau i dalu amdano. Yr wyf o blaid corff nad yw'n gwneud elw. Fel y dysgwyd gan Glas Cymru, nid oes rhaid i gorff nad yw'n gwneud elw dalu rhandaliadau i gyfranddeiliaid. Yn gyffredinol, drwy fenthylg ar sail bondiau yn hytrach nag ar gyfalaf ecwiti, sy'n galw am randaliadau, gallwch wario mwy ar y buddsoddiad cyfalaf sy'n ofynnol. Dyna flaenoriaeth gyntaf Railtrack yn awr. Dyna pam y cefnogaf yn llwyr fab neu ferch fond Railtrack, nad yw'n gwneud elw, fel y ffordd iawn ymlaen.

2:30 p.m.

Dylanwadu ar Ddatblygu Polisiâu Influencing Policy Development

Q8 Jocelyn Davies: Will the First Minister make a brief statement on the way in which Assembly Members other than Ministers are able to influence policy development? (OAQ13181)

C8 Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad byr ar y ffordd y mae Aelodau'r Cynulliad, heblaw'r Gweinidogion, yn gallu dylanwadu ar ddatblygu polisiâu? (OAQ13181)

The First Minister: To be as brief as

Prif Weinidog Cymru: I fod cyn fyrred â

possible—through the Subject Committees.

Jocelyn Davies: A great deal has been made of the policy development role of the Subject Committees, especially through their Committee reports, which allow backbenchers to influence policy proposals. The Ministers are, of course, free to ignore them. Will your Cabinet consider formally responding to Committee recommendations so that there may be some transparency in the policy development role?

The First Minister: I am always happy to stand here and defend the role in policy making shared between the Minister and the Cabinet, and the relevant Subject Committee. We have seen it work time and again. It is not the same as a Subject Committee passing a motion on a majority vote and that motion being mandatory for the relevant Minister. It does not work like that; it is a matter of share and share alike. Provided that Subject Committees feel that they are getting a reasonable crack of the whip, and that 50 per cent of their suggestions—or 50 per cent of the major package of suggestions—are accepted as policy, I do not think that they have anything to complain about. They have probably more power over policy development than any subject committees in any other parliament I can think of.

Mick Bates: There is also another route, First Minister. I was able, by gaining sufficient support for a statement of opinion on free school milk, for example, to get that policy implemented. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’]

The Presiding Officer: Order. Mick Bates is about to ask a relevant supplementary question.

Mick Bates: Does the First Minister agree that if Plaid Cymru Members could find better policies than independence, they might have more influence over policy?

The Presiding Officer: Order. That is not relevant to the original question.

Jonathan Morgan: Will the Government consider publishing a full progress report,

phosibl—drwy’r Pwyllgorau Pwnc.

Jocelyn Davies: Bu cryn sôn am rôl datblygu polisiau’r Pwyllgorau Pwnc, yn arbennig drwy eu hadroddiadau Pwyllgor, sy’n caniatáu i aelodau’r meinciau cefn ddylanwadu ar gynigion polisiau. Wrth gwrs, mae’r Gweinidogion yn rhydd i’w hanwybyddu. A wnaiff eich Cabinet ystyried ymateb yn ffurfiol i argymhellion y Pwyllgorau er mwyn sicrhau rhywfaint o eglurder yn y rôl o ddatblygu polisiau?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn fodlon bob amser sefyll yma ac amddiffyn y rôl o lunio polisiau a rennir gan y Gweinidog a’r Cabinet, a’r Pwyllgor Pwnc perthnasol. Fe’i gwelsom yn gweithio dro ar ôl tro. Nid yw’r un fath â phan fydd Pwyllgor Pwnc yn derbyn cynnig ar bleidlais fwyafrifol a bod y cynnig hwnnw yn orfodol ar gyfer y Gweinidog perthnasol. Nid felly y mae’n gweithio; mater ydyw o sicrhau cyfran deg i bawb. Cyn belled â bod y Pwyllgorau Pwnc yn teimlo y gwrandewir ar eu llais o fewn rheswm, ac y derbynnir 50 y cant o’u hawgrymiadau—neu 50 y cant o’r prif becyn o awgrymiadau—fel polisi, ni chredaf fod ganddynt ddim i gwyno yn ei gylch. Fwy na thebyg mae ganddynt fwy o bŵer ar y broses o ddatblygu polisiau na’r un pwyllgor pwnc mewn unrhyw senedd arall y gallaf feddwl amdani.

Mick Bates: Mae llwybr arall, Brif Weinidog. Bu’n bosibl imi, drwy ennill digon o gefnogaeth i ddatganiad barn ar laeth am ddim mewn ysgolion, er enghraifft, sicrhau bod y polisi hwnnw’n cael ei weithredu. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL Y CYNULLIAD: ‘O.’]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae Mick Bates ar fin gofyn cwestiwn atodol perthnasol.

Mick Bates: A gytuna Prif Weinidog Cymru pe gallai Aelodau Plaid Cymru ddod o hyd i bolisiau gwell nag annibyniaeth, y gallent ddylanwadu’n fwy ar bolisiau?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw hynny’n berthnasol i’r cwestiwn gwreiddiol.

Jonathan Morgan: A ystyria’r Llywodraeth gyhoeddi adroddiad llawn ar gynnydd, gan

indicating which policy ideas from each of the Subject Committee review reports have been implemented and which have not, and outlining the reasons why?

The First Minister: That might be time consuming, Jonathan. Subject to time constraints, I would be willing to entertain the idea. It would prove what I said in answer to the earlier question, that the Assembly's Subject Committees are not just listened to. Although they do not have the power to make action mandatory for Ministers, their views form 50 per cent of how policies are turned into action. Sometimes they may form 100 per cent, but you cannot guarantee that. However, I do not think that any Committee recommendation has been completely turned down flat by a Minister as yet.

nodi pa syniadau polisi o bob un o adroddiadau adolygu'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc a weithredwyd a pha rai nas gweithredwyd, a chan amlinellu'r rhesymau pam?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gallai hynny gymryd llawer o amser, Jonathan. O fewn cyfyngiadau amser, byddwn yn fodlon ystyried y peth. Byddai'n profi'r hyn a ddywedais wrth ateb y cwestiwn cynharach, nad dim ond mynegi barn a wna Pwyllgorau Pwnc y Cynulliad. Er nad oes ganddynt y pŵer i orfodi Gweinidogion i gymryd camau, eu barn hwy sy'n cyfrif am 50 y cant o'r ffordd y caiff polisiâu eu rhoi ar waith. Weithiau gallant gyfrif am 100 y cant, ond ni ellir gwarantu hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf i un argymhelliad gan Bwyllgor gael ei wrthod yn llwyr gan Weinidog hyd yma.

Gwella Cysylltiadau Hiliol yng Nghymru Improving Race Relations in Wales

Q9 Nick Bourne: What discussions has the First Minister had with the UK Government about improving race relations in Wales, particularly in light of the recent heightened tensions caused by the events of 11 September? (OAQ13211)

The First Minister: That is an important question. It formed a major part of the debate that we had on the international situation and its impact on Wales in Plenary last week. The discussions that I have weekly with the Secretary of State—and, informally, more frequently than that—continue to focus on the impact of the situation on Wales. You, Nick, Mike German, Ieuan and I, as the party leaders, met the leaders of ethnic and religious minority communities. We are trying to set up an inter-faith forum with a view to its holding its first meeting in January, and also planning to meet with media editors to discuss whether there is insensitivity to these issues at a time of heightened tension. I hope that that meeting will take place well before the end of this Assembly term.

Nick Bourne: I endorse what you said about the inter-faith forum, but will you comment

C9 Nick Bourne: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch gwella cysylltiadau hiliol yng Nghymru, yn enwedig yng ngoleuni'r tensiynau dwys diweddar a achoswyd gan y digwyddiadau ar 11 Medi? (OAQ13211)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hynny'n gwestiwn pwysig. Dyna oedd testun y rhan fwyaf o'r ddadl a gawsom ar y sefyllfa ryngwladol a'i heffaith ar Gymru yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae'r trafodaethau wythnosol a gaf gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol—ac, yn anffurfiol, yn amlach na hynny—yn parhau i ganolbwyntio ar effaith y sefyllfa ar Gymru. Cyfarfuoch chi, Nick, Mike German, Ieuan a finnau, fel arweinwyr y pleidiau, ag arweinwyr cymunedau lleiafrifol ethnig a chrefyddol. Yr ydym yn ceisio sefydlu fforwm rhyng-grefyddol gyda'r bwriad o gynnal ei gyfarfod cyntaf ym mis Ionawr, ac yn bwriadu hefyd gyfarfod â golygyddion yn y cyfryngau er mwyn trafod a oes ansensitifrwydd i'r materion hyn ar adeg o densiwn dwys. Gobeithiaf y cynhelir y cyfarfod hwnnw ymhell cyn diwedd tymor presennol y Cynulliad.

Nick Bourne: Cymeradwyaf yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennych am y fforwm rhyng-

on the asylum proposals announced by the UK Government yesterday? The Welsh Conservatives are pleased about the proposed accommodation centres, which seem to be our reception centres by another name. What impact will they have on the asylum seekers who are currently held, immorally, in Cardiff prison?

The First Minister: We are now into bragging rights. Mick Bates claimed his right to brag about free school milk and you are claiming the right to brag about accommodation centres for asylum seekers. Everyone will have a different view on that. The proposed package, which will get rid of the voucher system—on which strong views were expressed across the four parties in the Assembly—will be generally welcomed. The removal of asylum seekers from the remand wings of Cardiff and other prisons, even though there is some spare capacity there, will also be widely welcomed. On the exact detail of how these accommodation centres will be constituted, I have not yet read the press coverage of yesterday's announcements by David Blunkett. I will do so and will write to you, Nick, on that subject.

John Griffiths: It seems that many of the problems currently encountered by Muslims and others in Wales as a result of the world situation go unreported. There is strong anecdotal evidence to suggest that crimes ranging from arson to assault, as well as intimidation, are not reported. Will you look into this and see what can be done to encourage the reporting of such crimes?

The First Minister: You will be aware of the new guidance that has been issued to schools on this topic, which came up at our meeting with the 50 ethnic and religious minority group leaders. That guidance has gone out this week. I am pleased about that. One key area of unreported crime is bullying, or remarks that teachers find it difficult to know what to do with, or whether they are serious enough to bring in the police. Where it falls just below that salient, Muslim, Sikh and other ethnic minority mothers frequently have to deal with tearful children who have never had that kind of experience before.

grefyddol, ond a soniwch am y cynigion ym maes lloches a gyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y DU ddoe? Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn falch o nodi'r cynnig am y canolfannau llety arfaethedig, sef ein canolfannau derbyn i bob diben. Pa effaith a gânt ar y ceiswyr lloches a gedwir ar hyn o bryd yng ngharchar Caerdydd, yn anfoesol felly?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydym wrthi'n arfer hawl i frolio yn awr. Broliodd Mick Bates am laeth am ddim mewn ysgolion ac yr ydych chi'n brolio am ganolfannau llety i geiswyr lloches. Bydd gan bawb safbwynt gwahanol ar hynny. Caiff y pecyn arfaethedig, a fydd yn cael gwared ar y system dalebau—y mynegwyd barn gref arno ar draws y pedair plaid yn y Cynulliad—ei groesawu yn gyffredinol. Caiff y bwriad i symud ceiswyr lloches o adain remand carchar Caerdydd a charchardai eraill, er bod rhywfaint o le gwag yno, hefyd ei groesawu'n eang. O ran union fanylion sefydlu'r canolfannau llety hyn, nid wyf eto wedi darllen sylwadau'r wasg am gyhoeddiadau David Blunkett ddoe. Gwnaf hynny ac ysgrifennaf atoch, Nick, ar y pwnc hwnnw.

John Griffiths: Ymddengys i mi na hysbysir yr awdurdodau am lawer o'r problemau a ddaw i ran Moslemiaid ac eraill yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd o ganlyniad i'r sefyllfa ledled y byd. Mae tystiolaeth anecdotaidd gref i awgrymu na hysbysir yr awdurdodau am droseddau sy'n amrywio o losgi bwriadol i ymosodiadau, yn ogystal â bygwith. A wnewch chi ymchwilio i hyn a gweld beth y gellir ei wneud i annog pobl i roi gwybod am droseddau o'r fath?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r canllawiau newydd a gyhoeddwyd i ysgolion ar y pwnc hwn, a gododd yn ein cyfarfod gyda'r 50 o arweinwyr grwpiau lleiafrifol ethnig a chrefyddol. Dosbarthwyd y canllawiau hynny yr wythnos hon. Yr wyf yn falch o hynny. Un math allweddol o drosedd na hysbysir yr awdurdodau yn ei gylch yw bwlio, neu sylwadau y caiff athrawon hi'n anodd gwybod beth y dylid ei wneud ynglŷn â hwy, neu pa un a ydynt yn ddigon difrifol i gysylltu â'r heddlu ynglŷn â hwy. Lle nad ydynt mor amlwg, mae'n rhaid i famau

From anecdotal evidence, I understand that the situation is not as bad as it was immediately after 11 September. During our meeting with chief constables or their representatives, the chief constable of Gwent Police Authority took a strong stance, you will be glad to know, John. He told his colleagues to tell members of their ethnic or religious minority communities, 'If in doubt, report it. Do not hold back. Report it to the police, and we will take action.' They gave us lists and the numbers of people who have been arrested and, in some cases, convicted for bullying, name-calling and other incidents likely to cause public disorder.

Moslemaidd, Sicaidd ac o leiafrifoedd ethnig eraill ddelio'n aml â phlant yn eu dagrau na chawsant erioed y math hwnnw o brofiad o'r blaen. O dystiolaeth anecdotaidd, deallaf nad yw'r sefyllfa mor ddrwg ag yr oedd yn union ar ôl 11 Medi. Yn ystod ein cyfarfod â'r prif gwnstabiliaid neu eu cynrychiolwyr, cymerodd prif gwnstabl Awdurdod Heddlu Gwent safiad cryf, byddwch yn falch o wybod, John. Dywedodd wrth ei gydweithwyr am ddweud wrth bobl yn eu cymunedau lleiafrifol ethnig neu grefyddol, 'Os ydych yn amau hiliaeth, dywedwch wrth yr heddlu. Peidiwch â phetruso. Dywedwch wrth yr heddlu, a byddwn yn gweithredu.' Rhoesant restrau inni a nifer y bobl a arestiwyd ac, mewn rhai achosion, a gafwyd yn euog o fwlio, galw enwau ac achosion eraill sy'n debygol o achosi anhrefn cyhoeddus.

Llywodraeth Agored Open Government

Q10 Glyn Davies: What progress has been made towards open government within the National Assembly for Wales? (OAQ13172)

C10 Glyn Davies: Pa gynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud tuag at lywodraeth agored o fewn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru? (OAQ13172)

The First Minister: This is a matter in which I might fall into the trap of establishing bragging rights, pioneered this afternoon by Mick Bates and Nick Bourne, but I will not. On 8 May 2001, the Assembly adopted its revised Code of Practice on Public Access to Information. The revised code sets out and reinforces the principles that underpin my commitment to the promotion of open government.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hwn yn fater lle y gallwn innau syrthio i'r fagl o hawlio'r clod, sef arfer a arloeswyd y prynhawn yma gan Mick Bates a Nick Bourne, ond ni wnaf hynny. Ar 8 Mai 2001, mabwysiadodd y Cynulliad ei God Ymarfer diwygiedig ar Ganiatáu i'r Cyhoedd Weld Gwybodaeth. Mae'r cod diwygiedig yn nodi ac yn atgyfnerthu'r egwyddorion sy'n sail i'm hymrwymiad i hyrwyddo llywodraeth agored.

Glyn Davies: Open government requires openness on your part about important issues. There is no issue more important than the new Assembly building. We do not know what your attitude is on this. The media keeps implying that you may be against this project. In this Chamber, you allow the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities to take all the flak, while you cower under the desk. The time has come for you to tell us where you stand. You have got away with it for long enough.

Glyn Davies: Mae llywodraeth agored yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i chi fod yn agored am faterion pwysig. Nid oes mater pwysicaf nag adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Ni wyddom beth yw eich agwedd ar hyn. Awgryma'r cyfryngau yn rheolaidd eich bod o bosibl yn erbyn y prosiect hwn. Yn y Siambr hon, yr ydych yn gadadel i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau wynebu'r feirniadaeth, tra eich bod chi'n cyrcydu gan ofn o dan y ddesg. Mae'n bryd i chi ddweud wrthym ble yr ydych yn sefyll. Llwyddasoch i osgoi hynny yn ddigon hir.

The First Minister: Edwina has given the Cabinet's view. I strongly support the view that has been given to the Assembly, as well as the supplementary information that Edwina has given in writing. I am aware of the problems with the Richard Rogers Partnership design. It was difficult to have a buildable version of the huge overhanging roof in that design. Much as I believe in open government, the idea of having an Assembly building without a roof is going a bit too far.

Christine Chapman: Do you not agree that our principle of open government is permeating all policy making in Wales, and that such an open, transparent and inclusive approach is contributing to the success of Objective 1? Some 366 projects are already beginning to give west Wales and the Valleys a far brighter future, which is desperately needed after years of neglect by successive Conservative Governments.

The First Minister: Yes, I agree. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

The Presiding Officer: Order. The First Minister will now answer the supplementary question.

The First Minister: It is clear that the Conservatives have no bragging rights over Objective 1, since they failed to secure it last time around in 1993. Insofar as we secured it—and I pay tribute to Ron Davies for his efforts in this—there are many milestones on the road to the successful implementation of Objective 1. The next major milestone is the launch of Finance Wales in about a week's time. That will answer the demands of the business community for a user-friendly merchant bank suitable for small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales.

2:40 p.m.

Geraint Davies: Pan ffurfiwyd y bartneriaeth Llafur/Rhyddfrydol yn y Cynulliad, disgrifiodd y Prif Weinidog gynigion heb ddyddiad trafod fel '*the lowest form of life*'. A wnaiff esbonio pam y trafodir cymaint o fusnes y Siambr drwy gyfrwng cynigion o'r fath? A yw'r '*lowest form of life*' yn ddull

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae Edwina wedi rhoi barn y Cabinet. Yr wyf yn cefnogi'r farn a roddwyd i'r Cynulliad yn gryf, yn ogystal â'r wybodaeth atodol a roddwyd gan Edwina yn ysgrifenedig. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r problemau gyda chynllun Partneriaeth Richard Rogers. Byddai'n anodd adeiladu'r to bargodol enfawr yn y cynllun hwnnw. Er cryfed fy nghred mewn llywodraeth agored, mae'r syniad o gael adeilad heb do i'r Cynulliad yn mynd ychydig yn rhy bell.

Christine Chapman: Oni chytunwch fod ein hegwyddor o lywodraeth agored yn treiddio i bob polisi a lunnir yng Nghymru, a bod ymagwedd mor agored, eglur a chynhwysol yn cyfrannu at lwyddiant Amcan 1? Mae tua 366 o brosiectau yn dechrau creu dyfodol llawer disgleiriach i'r Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd eisoes, y mae ei ddirfawr angen ar ôl blynyddoedd o gael eu hesgeuluso gan un Llywodraeth Geidwadol ar ôl y llall.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ydwyf, yr wyf yn cytuno. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL Y CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r Prif Weinidog am ateb y cwestiwn atodol yn awr.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'n amlwg nad oes gan y Ceidwadwyr unrhyw hawl i frolio ynglŷn ag Amcan 1, gan iddynt fethu â'i sicrhau y tro diwethaf yn 1993. I'r graddau yr ydym wedi'i sicrhau—a thalaf deyrnged i Ron Davies am ei ymdrechion yn hyn o beth—mae llawer o gerrig milltir ar y ffordd i weithredu Amcan 1 yn llwyddiannus. Y garreg filltir fawr nesaf yw lansio Cyllid Cymru ymhen tua wythnos. Bydd hynny yn ateb gofynion y gymuned fusnes am fanc masnachol hawdd ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru.

Geraint Davies: When the Labour/Liberal partnership was created in the Assembly, the First Minister described no named day motions as the 'lowest form of life'. Will he explain why so much Chamber business is conducted using such motions? Is the 'lowest form of life' now an acceptable means of

derbyniol o lywodraethu Cymru erbyn hyn? governing Wales?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nac ydyw. Dylai Geraint ysgrifennu ataf os yw ef neu grŵp Plaid Cymru yn gwrthwynebu'r defnydd o'r weithdrefn ddeddfwriaethol honno, er mwyn inni gael trafod y mater. Nid wyf yn ei wrthwynebu. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ystyried at ba bwrpas yr ydym yn ei defnyddio ac a ydyw'n cyfateb i weithdrefnau megis dadleuon yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

The First Minister: No. Geraint should write to me if he or the Plaid Cymru group object to the use of that legislative procedure, so that we can discuss the matter. I do not object to it. However, we must consider for what reason we use it and whether it corresponds to procedures such as debates in Plenary.

Trafodaethau ynghylch Afghanistan Discussions regarding Afghanistan

Q11 Dafydd Wigley: What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding the latest situation in Afghanistan? (OAQ13182)

C11 Dafydd Wigley: Pa drafodaethau a gafodd Prif Weinidog Cymru gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf yn Afghanistan? (OAQ13182)

The First Minister: A full debate was held in the Assembly on this issue last week. My discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales, including one this morning, continue to focus on the impact of the situation on Wales. We maintain a constant exchange of information and are working jointly on contingency planning initiatives at the United Kingdom and Welsh level. That is done mainly through the Civil Contingencies Committee, of which the Secretary of State for Wales and I are currently members.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cynhaliwyd dadlawn yn y Cynulliad ar y mater hwn yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae fy nhrafodaethau ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, gan gynnwys trafodaeth y bore yma, yn parhau i ganolbwyntio ar effaith y sefyllfa ar Gymru. Yr ydym yn parhau i gyfnewid gwybodaeth yn gyson ac yn cydweithio ar gynllunio wrth gefn ar lefel y Deyrnas Unedig a Chymru. Gwneir hynny drwy'r Pwyllgor Paratoadau Sifil yn bennaf, y mae Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a minnau yn aelodau ohono ar hyn o bryd.

Dafydd Wigley: Will the First Minister draw the Secretary of State for Wales's attention to Paul Starling's excellent open letter—and I never thought that I would say that—in the *Welsh Mirror* today and commend Paul Starling's comments? Will he press, through the Secretary of State, for the Government to take note of its old policy of being tough on crime and on the causes of crime and on terrorism and the causes of terrorism? Will he also ensure that additional resources will be available for the NHS in Wales and to safeguard public buildings in Wales, so that the people of Wales are protected as much as possible?

Dafydd Wigley: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog dynnu sylw Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru at lythyr agored ardderchog Paul Starling—ac ni feddyliais erioed y dywedwn hynny—yn y *Welsh Mirror* heddiw a chymeradwyo sylwadau Paul Starling? A rydd bwysau, drwy'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, ar y Llywodraeth i ystyried ei hen bolisi o fod yn llym gyda throseddwr a'r hyn sy'n achosi troseddau a chyda therfysgaeth a'r hyn sy'n achosi terfysgaeth? A sicrha hefyd y bydd adnoddau ychwanegol ar gael ar gyfer yr NHS yng Nghymru ac i amddiffyn adeiladau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, er mwyn i bobl Cymru gael eu diogelu cymaint â phosibl?

The First Minister: What would Plaid Cymru's senior figures do if they did not read the papers every morning? Ieuan quoted from *The Western Mail* earlier and now Dafydd is

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Beth wnâi aelodau amlycaf Plaid Cymru pe na ddarllenent y papurau bob bore? Dyfynnodd Ieuan o *The Western Mail* yn gynharach ac yn awr mae

quoting from the *Welsh Mirror*. Do you not have researchers to do this work? I am sorry that I have not read Paul Starling's open letter. I do not doubt that there is much to commend in it. I will ensure that someone studies the letter and draws its pertinent points to my attention.

Richard Edwards: If Wales is a part of the civilised world, as I trust it is, do you share the view that the brutal and repressive Saudi Arabian regime is a good and dependable friend?

The First Minister: Saudi Arabia is an unusual country. Its incredible oil reserves make it an important strategic partner to the western world. Without its partnership, the price of petrol would be four or five times higher than it is. One reason why Saddam Hussein wanted to drive right through Kuwait and Saudi Arabia 10 years ago was to collar their oil reserves. Had he succeeded, he would have had control of about 50 per cent of the world's oil reserves. Fortunately, that did not happen. There are aspects of the Saudi Arabian regime that would not sit well with the principles on which the Assembly relies. However, that is to be expected, as it is 4,000 miles away and has an entirely different culture.

David Melding: If he has not done so already, will the First Minister ensure that the Assembly's thoughts and good wishes are extended to all Welsh servicemen and servicewomen through the Secretary of State for Wales?

The First Minister: Yes. However, that responsibility falls not to me but to the Prime Minister and his counterparts in the USA and the other countries that are part of the coalition. When deciding whether to send men and women to battle, you must consider whether you could look the parents of a serviceman or servicewoman who had fallen in battle straight in the eye and tell them that their son or daughter died for a good cause. Unless you can be sure of that, you do not want to send people into battle. It is prime ministers and presidents, such as Tony Blair and President Bush, who must go through that agony. It does not fall to me. That is the test that they must pass. I am sure that they

Dafydd yn dyfynnu o'r *Welsh Mirror*. Onid oes gennych ymchwilyr i wneud y gwaith hwn? Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad wyf wedi darllen llythyr agored Paul Starling. Nid amheuaf fod llawer i'w gymeradwyo ynddo. Sicrhaf y gwnaiff rhywun astudio'r llythyr a thynnu'r pwyntiau perthnasol i'm sylw.

Richard Edwards: Os yw Cymru yn rhan o'r byd gwareiddiedig, fel yr hyderaf ei bod, a rennwch y farn bod trefn giaidd a gormesol Saudi Arabia yn gyfaill da a dibynadwy?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae Saudi Arabia yn wlad anarferol. Mae ei chronfeydd olew anhygoel yn ei gwneud yn bartner strategol pwysig i'r byd gorllewinol. Heb ei phartneriaeth, byddai pris petrol bedair neu bum gwaith yn uwch nag y mae. Un o'r rhesymau yr oedd Saddam Hussein am groesi Kuwait a Saudi Arabia 10 mlynedd yn ôl oedd ei fod am feddiannu eu cronfeydd olew. Pe bai wedi llwyddo, byddai'n rheoli tua 50 y cant o gronfeydd olew'r byd. Yn ffodus, ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Mae agweddau ar drefn Saudi Arabia na fyddai'n cydweddu â'r egwyddorion y mae'r Cynulliad yn dibynnu arnynt. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny i'w ddisgwyl, gan ei bod 4,000 o filltiroedd i ffwrdd mewn diwylliant cwbl wahanol.

David Melding: Oni wnaeth hynny eisoes, a wnaiff y Prif Weinidog sicrhau yr estynnir dymuniadau da'r Cynulliad i bawb o Gymru sy'n gwasanaethu yn y lluoedd arfog drwy Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gwnaf. Fodd bynnag, nid fi sy'n gyfrifol am hynny ond Prif Weinidog y Deyrnas Unedig a'i gymheiriaid yn UDA a'r gwledydd eraill sy'n rhan o'r gynghrair. Wrth benderfynu a ddylid anfon dynion a merched i ryfel, rhaid ystyried a ellid edrych ym myw llygaid rhieni mab neu ferch a laddwyd mewn brwydr a dweud wrthynt i'w mab neu eu merch farw dros achos da. Oni allwch fod yn siŵr o hynny, ni ddylech anfon pobl i frwydr. Prif weinidogion ac arlywyddion, fel Tony Blair a'r Arlywydd Bush, sy'n gorfod mynd drwy'r gwewyr hwnnw. Nid fy nghyfrifoldeb i ydyw. Dyna'r prawf y mae'n rhaid iddynt ei basio. Yr wyf yn siŵr eu bod yn ymwybodol

are conscious of it and wake up in the early hours of the morning in a cold sweat thinking about it.

ohono a'u bod yn deffro yn oriau mân y bore mewn chwys oer yn meddwl am y peth.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf y pwynt hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.11 ar ateb cwestiynau. Cafodd fy nghwestiwn 7 ei grwpio gyda chwestiwn 6 Eleanor Burnham. Yn fy nghwestiwn, gofynnais a fyddai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cael ei gynrychioli ar y corff a fydd yn olynu Railtrack. Osgôdd y Prif Weinidog ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw yn gyfan gwbl. Dyma'r ail wythnos y mae ef wedi osgoi ateb cwestiwn gennyf. Yr wyf yn dechrau teimlo ei fod yn ceisio osgoi ateb fy nghwestiynau'n gyfan gwbl.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6.11 on answering questions. My question 7 was grouped with Eleanor Burnham's question 6. In my question, I asked whether the National Assembly for Wales would be represented on the body that will succeed Railtrack. The First Minister avoided answering that question completely. This is the second week that he has avoided answering one of my questions. I am beginning to feel that he is trying to avoid answering my questions completely.

Yr oedd fy nghwestiwn yn benodol. Derbyniaf, Lywydd, yr hyn a ddywedwch, nad yw cynnwys atebion yn fater i chi. Fodd bynnag, mae ateb, neu o leiaf wynebu cwestiwn, yn fater i chi.

My question was specific. I accept, Llywydd, that the content of answers is not a matter for you. However, answering, or at least facing up to a question, is a matter for you.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, mae dryswch ynglŷn â hyn. Os wyf wedi chwarae rhan yn y dryswch hwnnw neu'n gyfrifol amdano, ymddiheuraf. Cymerais yn ganiataol y bu i Rhodri Glyn dynnu'r cwestiwn yn ôl. Ni ofynnodd y cwestiwn, oni bai fy mod wedi camglywed. Ymddiheuraf os bu i mi gamglywed. Fodd bynnag, ni chlywais ef yn gofyn y cwestiwn fel y'i cyflwynwyd.

The First Minister: Further to that point of order, there is some confusion here. If I have played a part in that confusion or am responsible for it, I apologise. I took it for granted that Rhodri Glyn had withdrawn the question. He did not ask the question, unless I misheard. I apologise if I did so. However, I did not hear him ask the question as it was tabled.

Y Llywydd: Pan gaiff cwestiynau eu grwpio, cymerwn fod yr ateb yn cael ei gynnig i'r holl gwestiynau. Os yw Aelodau'n teimlo y dylem ddiwygio'r weithdrefn honno, byddwn yn fodlon ystyried hynny.

The Presiding Officer: When questions are grouped together, we assume that the answer encompasses all the questions. If Members feel that we should revise that procedure, I would be happy to consider that.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Byddwn yn hapus â'r weithdrefn, pe bai'r Prif Weinidog yn ateb y cwestiynau pan maent wedi eu grwpio.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I would be content with the procedure, if the First Minister answered the questions when they have been grouped.

Y Llywydd: Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi cwmpo ar ei fai yn anrhyddedus—os oes bai arno.

The Presiding Officer: The First Minister has honourably admitted his fault—if he is at fault.

David Davies: Point of order.

David Davies: Pwynt o drefn.

The Presiding Officer: Does your point of order arise from questions to the First Minister?

Y Llywydd: A yw eich pwynt o drefn yn deillio o gwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog?

David Davies: Yes. I raise it under Standing Order No. 7.8(iii), on raising matters

David Davies: Ydyw. Fe'i codaf o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.8(iii), ar godi materion

'outside the scope of the debate or motion',

'y tu hwnt i gwmpas y ddatl neu'r cynnig',

although I appreciate that it was a question in this case. However, Standing Order No. 7.8(iv) on discourteous conduct is also relevant. My point relates to the Assembly Member for Preseli Pembrokeshire, Richard Edwards, whose language about Saudi Arabia I found unacceptable at a time when that country is standing shoulder to shoulder with us. I also felt—

er fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi mai cwestiwn ydoedd yn yr achos hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.8(iv) ar ymddygiad anghwrtais hefyd yn berthnasol. Mae fy mhwynt yn ymwneud ag Aelod Preseli Sir Benfro yn y Cynulliad, Richard Edwards, y cefais ei ieithwedd ynghylch Saudi Arabia yn annerbyniol ar adeg pan fo'r wlad honno yn sefyll ysgwydd wrth ysgwydd â ni. Yr oeddwn hefyd yn teimlo—

The Presiding Officer: Order. That is not a point of order for me. Nothing that Richard Edwards said in that question was out of order or I would have intervened at the time.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw hynny'n bwynt o drefn i mi. Ni ddywedodd Richard Edwards ddim yn y cwestiwn hwnnw a oedd yn annerbyniol o gwbl neu byddwn wedi ymyrryd ar y pryd.

David Davies: May I—

David Davies: A gaf—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I require no assistance in this matter.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid oes angen cymorth arnaf yn y mater hwn.

David Davies: May I raise another point of order?

David Davies: A gaf i godi pwynt arall o drefn?

The Presiding Officer: Does it arise out of questions to the First Minister?

Y Llywydd: A yw'n deillio o gwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog?

David Davies: No.

David Davies: Nac ydyw.

The Presiding Officer: In that case, I will deal with it later when I deal with points of order of which I have had prior notice.

Y Llywydd: Os felly, ymdriniaf â'r pwynt yn ddiweddarach wrth ymdrin â phwyntiau o drefn yr wyf wedi cael rhybudd ymlaen llaw amdanynt.

Nick Bourne: I have given you advance notice of a point of order.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf innau wedi eich rhaghysbysu am bwynt o drefn.

The Presiding Officer: Indeed. I have taken points of order arising out of questions. I will take further points of order, of which I have had prior notice, after the business statement, as is my practice, in order to progress business.

Y Llywydd: Ydych, yn wir. Yr wyf wedi gwrandawr ar bwyntiau o drefn sy'n deillio o'r cwestiynau. Gwrandawaf ar ragor o bwyntiau o drefn, y cefais rybudd amdanynt, ar ôl y datganiad busnes, fel arfer, er mwyn symud at y materion busnes.

Datganiad ar Rôl Cymru'n Creu **Statement on the Role of Cymru'n Creu**

The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): The purpose of my statement today is to update Members on the progress of the establishment of Cymru'n Creu. The Post-16 Education and Training Committee's report, 'A Culture in Common', stated that policies and priorities for the arts and culture should be implemented on the basis of partnership and collaboration between the relevant publicly-funded bodies. The report articulated, for the first time, a policy for the arts with a much broader cultural base. It recommended that a cultural consortium, Cymru'n Creu, be established which embraced all the relevant Assembly sponsored public bodies, including the Wales Tourist Board, the Welsh Development Agency, Education and Learning Wales, the Arts Council of Wales, the Sports Council for Wales, broadcasters, the Welsh Local Government Association and a representative of the umbrella bodies. The consortium would also cover the interests of the voluntary sector and the creative industries more broadly.

Cymru'n Creu was therefore established in February 2001, as a high level group consisting of either chairs or chief executives of Assembly sponsored public bodies, the broadcasters, the British Council, the Welsh Local Government Association and others. The consortium provides an opportunity for each body to examine the scope for aligning its forward plans with the plans of others in the group to achieve stronger synergy in support of the key priorities: lifelong learning, cultural development, inward investment, export promotion and the development of tourism, to name but a few.

2:50 p.m.

For example, Cymru'n Creu has had an important role in the development of my culture strategy. It provided the ideal audience to consider the draft strategy in depth and give honest views. The document

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): Diben fy natganiad heddiw yw rhoi'r newyddion diweddaraf i'r Aelodau ar y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd o ran sefydlu Cymru'n Creu. Nododd adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, 'Diwylliant Cytûn', y dylid gweithredu polisiau a blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y celfyddydau a diwylliant ar sail partneriaeth a chydweithredu rhwng y cyrff perthnasol a gaiff arian cyhoeddus. Yr oedd yr adroddiad yn diffinio, am y tro cyntaf, bolisi ar gyfer y celfyddydau ag iddo sail ddiwylliannol lawer ehangach. Yr oedd yn argymhell y dylid sefydlu consortiwm diwylliannol, sef Cymru'n Creu, a oedd yn cynnwys pob un o'r cyrff cyhoeddus perthnasol a noddir gan y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, ELWa, Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, darlledwyr, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac un o gynrychiolwyr y cyrff ambarél. Byddai'r consortiwm hefyd yn cwmpasu buddiannau'r sector gwirfoddol a'r diwydiannau creadigol yn fwy cyffredinol.

Sefydlwyd Cymru'n Creu felly ym mis Chwefror 2001, fel grŵp lefel uchel yn cynnwys naill ai gadeiryddion neu brif weithredwyr cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, y darlledwyr, y Cyngor Prydeinig, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac eraill. Mae'r consortiwm yn rhoi cyfle i bob corff ystyried i ba raddau y gellid cyd-drefnu ei flaengynlluniau â chynlluniau eraill yn y grŵp er mwyn sicrhau synergedd cryfach i gefnogi'r blaenoriaethau allweddol: sef dysgu gydol oes, datblygu diwylliannol, mewnfuddsoddi, hyrwyddo'r diwydiant dramor a datblygu twristiaeth, i enwi ond ychydig.

Er enghraifft, bu gan Cymru'n Creu rôl bwysig wrth ddatblygu fy strategaeth ddiwylliant. Bu'n fodd i dynnu ynghyd y gynulleidfa ddelfrydol i ystyried y strategaeth ddrafft yn fanwl a rhoi barn onest. Mae'r

that I will take back to the Culture Committee on 21 November has benefited greatly from Cymru'n Creu's input. Its role will continue once the strategy is finalised. I will discuss further with its members their active role in taking some of the action points forward and in assisting with the implementation of others.

Another key issue is the provision of information. It is important that we have up-to-date credible and useful data on and for the creative industries. I am pleased that a Cymru'n Creu sub-group, led by the Welsh Development Agency and Professor Steve Hill from the University of Glamorgan, is progressing that. I look forward to seeing the outcome. For the purpose of that exercise, our definition of culture is as given in 'A Culture in Common', namely that culture

'consists of all distinctive spiritual and material, as given in intellectual and emotional features which characterise a society or group.'

Another aim of Cymru'n Creu is to ensure that the new technologies are used to better effect in joint planning, joint marketing and sales promotion and that the important role that new technologies can play in communicating Welsh culture is acknowledged. An information and communications technology sub-group, under the leadership of Andrew Green of the National Library of Wales, is looking to develop ICT collaborative initiatives. I am pleased that the draft budget contains excellent news for Cymru'n Creu and ICT in that extra resources are identified for Cymru Ar-lein. That will allow the sub-group to proceed with the work that it was planning. The draft provision is for almost £2 million over the next two years. In addition, the consortium hopes to be able to assist in accelerating the input of the creative industries to partnership initiatives under Objective 1 and the European regional development fund. The Arts Council of Wales and the WDA have agreed to lead a sub-group to look at improving access to European structural funds for the creative industries.

ddogfen a ailgyflwynaf i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant ar 21 Tachwedd wedi elwa'n fawr ar fewnbwn Cymru'n Creu. Bydd ei rôl yn parhau unwaith y bydd y strategaeth wedi'i chwblhau'n derfynol. Trafodaf ymhellach â'i haelodau eu rôl weithredol wrth ddatblygu rhai o'r pwyntiau gweithredu ac wrth gynorthwyo â'r broses o weithredu rhai eraill.

Mae darparu gwybodaeth yn fater allweddol arall. Mae'n bwysig bod gennym ddata diweddar credadwy a defnyddiol ar y diwydiannau creadigol ac ar eu cyfer. Yr wyf yn falch bod is-grŵp i Cymru'n Creu, dan arweiniad Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a'r Athro Steve Hill o Brifysgol Morgannwg, yn datblygu hynny. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y canlyniad. At ddiben yr ymarfer hwnnw, mae ein diffiniad o ddiwylliant yn unol â diffiniad 'Diwylliant Cytûn', sef bod diwylliant

'yn cynnwys yr holl nodweddion ysbrydol a materol, deallusol ac emosiynol penodol sydd yn nodweddu cymdeithas neu grŵp.'

Un o nodau eraill Cymru'n Creu yw sicrhau y caiff y technolegau newydd eu defnyddio'n fwy effeithiol ym maes cynllunio ar y cyd, marchnata ar y cyd a hyrwyddo gwerthiant ac y cydnabyddir y rôl bwysig y gall technolegau newydd eu chwarae wrth hyrwyddo diwylliant Cymru. Mae is-grŵp technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, dan arweiniad Andrew Green o Lyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru, yn ceisio datblygu mentrau cydweithredol TGCh. Yr wyf yn falch fod y gyllideb ddrafft yn cynnwys newyddion ardderchog i Cymru'n Creu a TGCh sef bod adnoddau ychwanegol wedi'u nodi ar gyfer Cymru Ar-lein. Bydd hynny'n galluogi'r is-grŵp i fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith yr oedd yn ei gynllunio. Mae'r ddarpariaeth ddrafft ar gyfer £2 filiwn bron dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf. Yn ogystal, mae'r consortiwm yn gobeithio y bydd yn gallu cynorthwyo'r broses o gyflymu mewnbwn y diwydiannau creadigol i fentrau partneriaeth o dan Amcan 1 a'r gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd. Mae Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru a'r WDA wedi cytuno i arwain is-grŵp i geisio gwella mynediad i gronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd ar gyfer y diwydiannau creadigol.

From the outset, it was important for me to set out my priorities for Cymru'n Creu. I wanted to encourage cultural industries, including tourism, the film industry, publishing, community development, festivals, language and sport, to work by proactive co-operation rather than leaving matters to one particular body to organise. Since then, the group has been concentrating on how to work together efficiently and how to take forward the key themes. There have been key inputs from the National Library of Wales on culture online in Wales. The Wales Tourist Board has led on event-led and cultural tourism. The Welsh Books Council has proposed a task and finish group to consider how the various organisations represented on Cymru'n Creu, which have an interest in books, literature and the broadcasting media, could develop closer links. The Arts Council of Wales has also provided input on promoting the arts abroad. There are many benefits to that, including raising the profile of Wales, developing artists and broader economic considerations. The Arts Council of Wales has developed a partnership with the British Council called Wales Arts International—an agency that exports arts and artists from Wales and encourages venues and promoters in Wales to receive international tours. In addition, ELWa has outlined its emerging strategies and the National Museums and Galleries of Wales has outlined their role in underpinning cultural identity and tourism.

Finally, I am encouraged by the commitment, enthusiasm and energy of all the members of Cymru'n Creu and by the promising future emerging from its work and from my culture strategy for Wales. The draft budget provides resources for key elements of its work and, vitally, for the work of the Arts Council of Wales in partnership with other cultural bodies. It will also allow us to move forward on key partnership agreement commitments, for example, the construction of an arts database for Wales that can work in synergy with the ICT group and the Wales Tourist Board's destination management system. You will find further information on my arrangements for Cymru'n Creu attached to

O'r dechrau, yr oedd yn bwysig imi nodi fy mlaenoriaethau ar gyfer Cymru'n Creu. Yr oeddwn am annog diwydiannau diwylliannol, gan gynnwys twristiaeth, y diwydiant ffilm, cyhoeddi, datblygu cymunedol, gwyliau, iaith a chwaraeon, i gydweithredu yn hytrach na gadael pethau i un corff penodol i'w trefnu. Ers hynny, bu'r grŵp yn canolbwyntio ar sut i gydweithio'n effeithlon a sut i ddatblygu'r themâu allweddol. Cafwyd mewnbwn allweddol gan Lyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru ar ddiwylliant ar y we yng Nghymru. Mae Bwrdd Croeso Cymru wedi arwain ym maes twristiaeth sy'n ymwneud â digwyddiadau a diwylliant. Mae Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru wedi awgrymu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen i ystyried sut y gallai'r sefydliadau amrywiol a gynrychiolir ar Cymru'n Creu, sy'n ymddiddori mewn llyfrau, llenyddiaeth a'r cyfryngau darlledu, ddatblygu cysylltiadau agosach. Mae Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru hefyd wedi rhoi mewnbwn ar hyrwyddo'r celfyddydau dramor. Mae llawer o fanteision i hynny, gan gynnwys codi proffil Cymru, datblygu artistiaid ac ystyriaethau economaidd ehangach. Mae Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru wedi datblygu partneriaeth gyda'r Cyngor Prydeinig o'r enw Celfyddydau Cymru yn Rhyngwladol—sef asiantaeth sy'n allforio celfyddydau ac artistiaid o Gymru ac yn annog lleoliadau a hyrwyddwyr yng Nghymru i groesawu teithiau rhyngwladol. Yn ogystal, mae ELWa wedi amlinellu'r strategaethau y mae'n eu datblygu ac mae Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru wedi amlinellu ei rôl o fod yn sail i hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol a thwristiaeth.

Yn olaf, fe'm calonogir gan ymrwymiad, brwdfrydedd ac egni holl aelodau Cymru'n Creu a chan y dyfodol addawol sy'n deillio o'i waith ac o'm strategaeth ddiwylliant ar gyfer Cymru. Mae'r gyllideb ddrafft yn darparu adnoddau ar gyfer elfennau allweddol o'i waith ac, yn hollbwysig, ar gyfer gwaith Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru mewn partneriaeth â chyrrff diwylliannol eraill. Bydd hefyd yn fodd inni symud ymlaen ar ymrwymadau allweddol yn y cytundeb partneriaeth, er enghraifft, adeiladu cronfa ddata i'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru a all weithio mewn synergedd â'r grŵp TGCh a system trefnu cyrchfannau Bwrdd Croeso Cymru. Atodir gwybodaeth bellach ar fy

the statement that has been e-mailed to you in the Chamber. Enclosed is more detail on the range and depth of work involved.

Owen John Thomas: I am sure that you will agree that Cymru'n Creu is a concept that, if properly implemented, would give a huge boost to the culture and economy of Wales. The consortium's function is to fulfil the aims of 'Cymru'n Creu', thereby realising its great potential. However, the document that outlines the vision of Cymru'n Creu refers to many key matters not mentioned in your report. Those exclusions stem from the fact that the consortium has been denied the opportunity of considering fully the original document 'Cymru'n Creu', which, after all, is the body's *raison d'être*. It seems bizarre, rather like opening a church and not providing bibles.

I am naturally pleased that Cymru'n Creu has been set up and is carrying out some fruitful work, but if the consortium is to have a sense of direction and purpose, its members must be allowed to share in the full vision. Cymru'n Creu currently depends on the goodwill of the consortium's members, who represent public bodies, to carry out its various tasks, even though it was envisaged that the body would act as a think tank, and would be funded to provide a full-time secretariat, including a director, research and development team and a small, clerical staff with skills in communication and cultural issues. Furthermore, in order to provide the capacity to commission expert advice and oversee taskforces in specific sectors and to discover and emulate good practice from other countries, the consortium's strategic role and overview was expected to relieve the Arts Council of Wales and prevent it from overstressing its resources and skills. Thus it would afford an opportunity to slim down the council's expensive administration, encourage devolution and be more responsive to the grassroots. Three members of the visual arts team resigned because they did not have confidence in the arts council. Cymru'n Creu sought to address such problems. Will the Minister assure us that she will take the earliest opportunity to allow the consortium to address fully the aims, principles and other considerations laid out in the original

nhrefniadau ar gyfer Cymru'n Creu i'r datganiad a e-bostiwyd atoch yn y Siambr. Amgaeir mwy o fanylion ar amrywiaeth a graddau'r gwaith angenrheidiol.

Owen John Thomas: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod Cymru'n Creu yn gysyniad a fyddai, o'i weithredu'n gywir, yn rhoi hwb aruthrol i ddiwylliant ac economi Cymru. Swyddogaeth y consortiwm yw cyflawni nodau Cymru'n Creu, a thrwy hynny wireddu ei botensial mawr. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddogfen sy'n amlinellu gweledigaeth Cymru'n Creu yn cyfeirio at lawer o faterion allweddol nas crybwyllwyd yn eich adroddiad. Mae'r eithriadau hynny yn deillio o'r ffaith na chafodd y consortiwm y cyfle i ystyried yn llawn y ddogfen wreiddiol 'Cymru'n Creu', sef *raison d'être* y corff, wedi'r cwbl. Ymddengys yn rhyfedd, bron cystal ag agor eglwys heb ddarparu beiblau.

Yn naturiol, yr wyf yn falch bod Cymru'n Creu wedi'i sefydlu ac yn cyflawni gwaith buddiol, ond er mwyn i'r consortiwm feddu ar gyfeiriad a phwrpas, rhaid caniatáu i'w aelodau rannu'r weledigaeth lawn. Ar hyn o bryd dibynna Cymru'n Creu ar ewyllys da aelodau'r consortiwm, sy'n cynrychioli cyrff cyhoeddus, i gyflawni ei dasgau amrywiol, er mai'r hyn a ragwelwyd oedd y byddai'r corff yn ymddwyn fel seiat ddoethion, ac y câi arian i dalu ysgrifenyddiaeth lawn amser, gan gynnwys cyfarwyddwr, tîm ymchwil a datblygu a staff gweinyddol bach â sgiliau ym maes cyfathrebu a diwylliant. At hynny, er mwyn sicrhau'r gallu i gomisiynu cyngor arbenigol a goruchwylio tasgluoedd mewn sectorau penodol a dod o hyd i arfer da o wledydd eraill a'i efelychu, disgwyliad y byddai trosolwg a rôl strategol y consortiwm yn ysgafnhau baich Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ac yn ei gadw rhag gorymestyn ei adnoddau a'i sgiliau. O ganlyniad byddai'n rhoi cyfle i gwtogi ar weinyddiaeth gostus y cyngor, hybu datganoli ac ymateb yn fwy i'r bobl sy'n ymwneud â'r celfyddydau ar lawr gwlad. Ymddiswyddodd tri aelod o'r tîm celfyddydau gweledol am nad oedd ganddynt hyder yn y cyngor celfyddydau. Un o nodau Cymru'n Creu oedd ymdrin â phroblemau o'r fath. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd inni y bydd yn manteisio ar y cyfle cyntaf i ganiatáu i'r consortiwm ymdrin yn llawn â'r nodau, yr egwyddorion a'r ystyriaethau eraill

document, 'Cymru'n Creu'?

a nodwyd yn y ddogfen wreiddiol, 'Cymru'n Creu'?

Jenny Randerson: I sometimes wonder where Owen John gets his information from—it is not from the people at Cymru'n Creu. I assure you that the members of Cymru'n Creu have not been denied the right to discuss anything at anytime. Its remit was considered in depth and at length at its first meeting, and it was amended to include what the members wished. You are right to say that it is an organisation that operates to a large extent on goodwill. It is intended to operate on the basis of goodwill, which is evident. For that reason, it sets the agenda, which it pursues at its pace. It does operate as a think tank and is successful as such. You would not expect an organisation that has only been operating for nine months to deal with every possible problem, but it has a list of issues that it wishes to tackle in the future.

Jenny Randerson: Ni wn weithiau o ble y caiff Owen John ei wybodaeth—nis caiff gan bobl Cymru'n Creu. Fe'ch sicrhaf na warafunwyd i aelodau Cymru'n Creu yr hawl i drafod unrhyw beth ar unrhyw adeg. Ystyriwyd ei gylch gwaith yn fanwl ac yn hir yn ei gyfarfod cyntaf, ac fe'i diwygiwyd i gynnwys yr hyn a ddymunai'r aelodau. Yr ydych yn iawn pan ddywedwch ei fod yn sefydliad sy'n gweithredu i raddau helaeth ar ewyllys da. Y bwriad yw ei fod yn gweithredu ar ewyllys da, sy'n amlwg. Am y rheswm hwnnw, Cymru'n Creu sy'n gosod yr agenda, ac yn ei dilyn wrth ei bwysau. Mae'n gweithredu fel seiat ddoethion ac mae'n llwyddiannus yn hynny o beth. Ni ddisgwyliech i sefydliad a fu'n gweithredu am naw mis yn unig ymdrin â phob problem bosibl, ond mae ganddo restr o faterion y mae am fynd i'r afael â hwy yn y dyfodol.

On funding Cymru'n Creu, there would be strong views in this Chamber on the establishment of yet another quango and a further drain on our resources. We are operating it on a needs basis and providing the resources that are required. It is astonishing that various Assembly sponsored public bodies and broadcasters, over which we have no direct control, have been keen to offer all the resources that we have needed to do an effective job. Finally, an internal staffing matter at the Arts Council of Wales is not relevant to this debate.

O ran ariannu Cymru'n Creu, byddai teimladau cryf yn y Siambr hon ar sefydlu cwango arall gan ddihysbyddu ein hadnoddau ymhellach. Fe'i gweithredwn ar sail angen gan roi'r adnoddau sy'n ofynnol. Mae'n rhyfeddol bod cyrff cyhoeddus amrywiol a noddir gan y Cynulliad a darlledwyr, nad ydym yn eu rheoli'n uniongyrchol o gwbl, wedi bod yn awyddus i gynnig yr holl adnoddau y bu eu hangen arnom i wneud y gwaith yn effeithiol. Yn olaf, nid yw mater staffio mewnol yng Nghyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn berthnasol i'r ddadl hon.

3:00 p.m.

Eleanor Burnham: Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog a theimlaf yn hyderus y bydd gwaith aelodau Cymru'n Creu o fudd i'r broses o adnewyddu ein bywyd diwylliannol cenedlaethol drwy sicrhau y bydd cyfanswm eu hymdrechion yn fwy na'u cyfraniadau unigol.

Eleanor Burnham: I welcome the Minister's statement and am confident that the work of members of Cymru'n Creu will benefit the process of rejuvenating the cultural life of the nation by ensuring that the sum of their efforts will be greater than their individual parts.

Dylem groesawu partneriaeth Cymru'n Creu, gan ei bod yn galluogi cydweithio rhwng y cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a sefydliadau eraill—er enghraifft llywodraeth leol a darlledwyr, fel y soniodd Jenny yn gynharach. Er nad yw cylch gwaith y

We should welcome the Cymru'n Creu partnership, as it enables co-operation between Assembly sponsored public bodies and other organisations—for example local government and broadcasters, as Jenny mentioned earlier. Although the Assembly

sefydliadau eraill wedi'i bennu gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, mae ganddynt rôl holl bwysig i sicrhau y caiff polisi diwylliannol ei weithredu'n llwyddiannus yng Nghymru. Dylid cymeradwyo Jenny am weithio mewn partneriaeth er mwyn ennyn diddordeb y sefydliadau hyn.

Yr oeddwn hefyd yn falch o glywed cyfeiriad at yr angen i gefnogi diwydiannau a mentrau creadigol. Bydd y trawsgroesi rhwng datblygiad economaidd a diwylliant yn hanfodol i sicrhau twf economaidd a gwell delwedd ryngwladol i Gymru. Credaf hefyd y bydd datblygiadau diwylliannol a chymunedol, heb anghofio adfywio cymunedol, yn golygu y bydd cydweithio cynhyrchiol rhwng Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, llywodraeth leol a sefydliadau diwylliannol.

I look forward to the publication of the cultural strategy in November. Given that the culture brief is broad, I am sure that the strategy will contain priorities that I have already mentioned, such as culture and communities and cultural enterprises, as well as broader support for the arts and artists in Wales.

It is good to see that the additional resources that the Minister has gained for her portfolio in the course of the budget process are complemented by moves to co-ordinate the organisations that will be expected to spend those additional resources. That is further evidence of my colleague's success in her role as Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language. *Llongyfarchiadau; congratulations.*

Jenny Randerson: I will address the issue of the co-operation between Assembly sponsored public bodies and other organisations. That is significant, given, for example, that different Ministers are responsible for the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board. Those two organisations would not usually meet each other often nor work in co-operation. It is clear, from the meetings held so far, that they do much of the same work separately. They will now come together and do that work jointly, thus saving money. Rather than

Government is not responsible for the remit of the other organisations, they have a crucial role in ensuring that cultural policy is successfully implemented in Wales. Jenny should be applauded for working in partnership to generate the interest of these organisations.

I was also pleased to hear a reference to the need to support creative industries and enterprises. The crossover between economic development and culture will be crucial in ensuring economic growth and an improved international profile for Wales. I also believe that cultural and community developments—not forgetting community regeneration—will mean that there will be productive joint working between Education and Learning Wales, the Welsh Development Agency, local government and cultural organisations.

Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y strategaeth ddiwylliannol yn cael ei chyhoeddi ym mis Tachwedd. O gofio bod y briff diwylliant yn un eang, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y strategaeth yn cynnwys blaenoriaethau a nodwyd eisoes gennyf, fel diwylliant a chymunedau a mentrau diwylliannol, yn ogystal â chefnogaeth ehangach i'r celfyddydau ac artistiaid yng Nghymru.

Mae'n braf gweld bod yr adnoddau ychwanegol a sicrhodd y Gweinidog ar gyfer ei phortffolio yn ystod proses y gyllideb wedi'u hategu drwy gamau i gyd-drefnu'r sefydliadau y disgwylir iddynt wario'r adnoddau ychwanegol hynny. Mae hynny'n dystiolaeth bellach o lwyddiant fy nghyd-Aelod yn ei rôl fel Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg. *Llongyfarchiadau.*

Jenny Randerson: Ymdriniaf â'r mater o gydweithredu rhwng cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a sefydliadau eraill. Mae hynny'n arwyddocaol, o gofio, er enghraifft, bod Gweinidogion gwahanol yn gyfrifol am Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru. Ni fyddai'r ddau sefydliad hynny yn cyfarfod â'i gilydd yn aml fel arfer nac yn cydweithredu. Mae'n amlwg, o'r cyfarfodydd a gynhaliwyd hyd yma, eu bod yn gwneud llawer o'r un gwaith ar wahân. Dônt ynghyd yn awr gan wneud y gwaith hwnnw ar y cyd, a thrwy hynny arbed

waste money on secretariats, they will work together. All organisations work to their own remit and have their own responsibilities. However, by facilitating co-operation, we can generate value.

The link with local government is important. In recent years, the support of local government for cultural activity has, in many but not in all cases, declined. That is understandable. It has been under financial pressure and, in some cases, it has been easy to draw back from cultural activity. It is important that the Welsh Local Government Association is an active and enthusiastic member of this group. We can, therefore, move forward by working in co-operation.

Jonathan Morgan: I welcome the Minister's statement, as it is a sign of progress. It is a privilege to see that the policy recommendations of Subject Committees' reports are being implemented. The Welsh Conservatives do not share the doom and gloom outlined by Owen John Thomas. Listening to Owen was like sitting through an audition for the part of Private Fraser in *Dad's Army*. I did not know that the show was in town. Owen probably succeeded in getting the part.

I have a few concerns. I am encouraged that we can, at last, ensure that Assembly sponsored public bodies and other public bodies meet in this kind of forum to discuss arts and culture in Wales. I hope that those discussions will feed into policy development and act as a sounding board for Jenny and the Assembly in general. I hope that it does not turn into a forum for conversation and coffee. It must have a purpose and it must deliver results for Wales and the Minister.

At times, ASPBs have a tendency to promote self-interest and self-preservation. Their concern must be the work, the role and the input of arts practitioners and cultural bodies across Wales. These are the people whom we must take into account. In the future, I hope that we will be able to ensure that arts

arian. Yn hytrach na gwastraffu arian ar ysgrifenyddiaethau, byddant yn cydweithio. Mae pob sefydliad yn gweithio i'w gylch gwaith ei hun ac mae gan bob un ei gyfrifoldebau ei hun. Fodd bynnag, drwy hwyluso'r broses o gydweithredu, gallwn sicrhau gwerth am arian.

Mae'r cysylltiad â llywodraeth leol yn bwysig. Yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae cefnogaeth llywodraeth leol i weithgarwch diwylliannol wedi dirywio, mewn sawl achos ond nid pob un. Mae hynny'n ddealladwy. Bu o dan bwysau ariannol ac, mewn rhai achosion, bu'n hawdd tynnu'n ôl o weithgarwch diwylliannol. Mae'n bwysig bod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn aelod gweithredol a brwdfrydig o'r grŵp hwn. Gallwn, felly, symud ymlaen drwy gydweithredu.

Jonathan Morgan: Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog, gan ei fod yn arwydd o gynnydd. Mae'n fraint gweld bod argymhellion polisi adroddiadau'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc yn cael eu gweithredu. Nid yw Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn rhannu'r agwedd negyddol a amlinellwyd gan Owen John Thomas. Yr oedd gwranddo ar Owen fel eistedd drwy glyweliad am ran Preifat Fraser yn *Dad's Army*. Ni wyddwn fod y sioe wedi dod i'r dref. Mae'n debyg bod Owen wedi cael y rhan.

Mae gennyf rai pryderon. Fe'm calonogir y gallwn, o'r diwedd, sicrhau bod cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a chyrff cyhoeddus eraill gyfarfod yn y math hwn o fforwm i drafod y celfyddydau a diwylliant yng Nghymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd y trafodaethau hynny yn bwydo i mewn i'r broses o ddatblygu polisi ac yn gweithredu fel seinfwrdd i Jenny a'r Cynulliad yn gyffredinol. Gobeithiaf na thry'n fforwm sgwrsio ac yfed coffi. Rhaid bod iddo ddiben a rhaid iddo sicrhau canlyniadau i Gymru a'r Gweinidog.

Ar adegau, mae cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad yn tueddu i hyrwyddo hunan-les a hunangadwraeth. Rhaid iddynt ganolbwyntio ar waith, rôl a mewnbwn pobl sy'n ymwneud â'r celfyddydau a chyrff diwylliannol ledled Cymru. Dyma'r bobl y mae'n rhaid inni eu hystyried. Yn y dyfodol,

practitioners feed into policy development. It is all very well listening to public bodies—and we welcome that—but we must be able to listen to arts practitioners because we expect them to develop and deliver the vast cultural diversity that exists in Wales. Having said that, we would like to see this forum developed a great deal further. It has a great deal to offer and we look forward to contributing to the arts strategy now and in the future.

Jenny Randerson: I believe in implementing reports. You will recall that ‘A Culture in Common’ contained many recommendations. I gave a formal response to Committee because I greatly value its input in the process of policy development. Cymru’n Creu has a policy development role. That is why I mentioned it in relation to my culture strategy. I share your view that it must be a think tank but not a talking shop. When we first considered establishing a forum, I was concerned that if a large number of the great and the good were on it, conversation would be quite anodyne and people would end up defending their own points of view. To avoid that happening, I set up this forum in a particular way and it has not been like that at all. It has been completely different. However, to get it off to a good start, I decided that it should carry out its work through small groups. Its work is done through small working parties, such as that on information and communications technology, and that on creative industries, which includes the Welsh Development Agency and the Arts Council of Wales. They have made tremendous progress and they meet far more often than the full organisation. The full organisation consists of reporting back and considering new ideas for action and where it wants to go next. All the cultural organisations are benefiting from the spreading of good practice through Cymru’n Creu. They tell each other what they are doing well and pick up others’ good ideas. That is important.

Tom Middlehurst: I thank the Minister for her statement and I welcome the development

gobeithiaf y bydd yn bosibl inni sicrhau bod pobl sy’n ymwneud â’r celfyddydau yn cyfrannu at y broses o ddatblygu polisi. Mae’n hawdd gwranddo ar gyrff cyhoeddus—a chroesawn hynny—ond rhaid inni allu gwranddo ar y rhai ym maes y celfyddydau oherwydd disgwyliwn iddynt ddatblygu a chyflwyno’r amrywiaeth diwylliannol eang sy’n bodoli yng Nghymru. Wedi dweud hynny, hoffem weld y fforwm hwn yn cael ei ddatblygu ymhellach o lawer. Mae llawer ganddo i’w gynnig ac edrychwn ymlaen at gyfrannu at y strategaeth ar y celfyddydau yn awr ac yn y dyfodol.

Jenny Randerson: Credaf mewn gweithredu adroddiadau. Byddwch yn cofio bod ‘Diwylliant Cytûn’ yn cynnwys llawer o argymhellion. Rhoddais ymateb ffurfiol i’r Pwyllgor am fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi’n fawr ei fewnbwn i’r broses o ddatblygu polisi. Mae gan Cymru’n Creu rôl o ddatblygu polisi. Dyna pam y’i nodais mewn perthynas â’r strategaeth ddiwylliant. Rhannaf eich barn bod yn rhaid iddo fod yn seiat ddoethion, nid siop siarad. Pan ystyriwyd sefydlu fforwm gyntaf, yr oeddwn yn bryderus, pe bai nifer fawr o’r mawrion a’r doethion arno, y byddai’r sgwrsio braidd yn ddiddrwg-ddidda ac y ceid pobl yn amddiffyn eu safbwyntiau eu hunain. Er mwyn osgoi hynny, sefydlais y fforwm hwn mewn ffordd benodol ac ni fu felly o gwbl. Bu’n hollol wahanol. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn iddo ddechrau’n dda, penderfynais y dylai gyflawni ei waith drwy grwpiau bach. Gwneir ei waith drwy weithgorau bach, fel y gweithgor ar dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, a’r gweithgor ar ddiwydiannau creadigol, sy’n cynnwys Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Maent wedi gwneud cynnydd aruthrol a chyfarfyddant yn llawer amlach na’r sefydliad llawn. Gwaith y sefydliad llawn adrodd yn ôl i’r Cynulliad ac ystyried syniadau newydd ar gyfer gweithredu ac i ba gyfeiriad y mae am fynd iddo nesaf. Mae pob sefydliad diwylliannol yn elwa ar ledaenu arfer da drwy Cymru’n Creu. Dywedant wrth ei gilydd yr hyn a wnânt yn dda a chânt syniadau da gan bobl eraill. Mae hynny’n bwysig.

Tom Middlehurst: Diolchaf i’r Gweinidog am ei datganiad a chroesawaf ddatblygiad

of Cymru'n Creu. Its operation is consistent with many of the former Post-16 Education and Training Committee's views and opinions on how it should proceed and what its role on behalf of the people of Wales should be. It was never envisaged—other than in some people's wildest dreams—that it would have any executive function. I welcome that. It would be wrong to think of allowing an organisation like this to assume the responsibilities of properly established statutory bodies in Wales for example. Sadly, Owen John Thomas targeted the Arts Council of Wales once again. Cymru'n Creu's present role is appropriate for such an organisation.

I am greatly encouraged when I look at those who have agreed to join Cymru'n Creu. We have a commitment at the highest level from many people who want to work towards the common interest of the people of Wales and who wish to consider arts and culture in a range of contexts, whether in education, economic development, marketing Wales and so on. An army of people is involved at the highest level in different facets of Welsh life. However, they recognise that by coming together under this umbrella, they can contribute towards the whole range of arts and culture in Wales. I welcome the statement and look forward to the early results of the forum's work. However, it is important that it should be encouraged to adopt a clear role and function and that it should recognise the important contribution that it can make. I look forward to the organisation informing your policy decisions in the future.

Jenny Randerson: I and the Committee acknowledge your role in developing the report that led to this. As you know from its establishment, the Committee's report clarified the organisation's role. It is clear that there is no place in the modern democracy of Wales for the establishment of a sort of 'superquango' that would impose itself between the Assembly and the ASPBs that are carrying out our policy wishes. Given the high level of representation, there are good ideas coming forward. However, the members know exactly why they are there and are anxious to contribute on those terms. A good sign that it is working is that organisations that were not included have

Cymru'n Creu. Mae ei ddull gweithredu yn gyson â llawer o safbwyntiau'r hen Bwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 o ran sut y dylai fynd rhagddo a beth ddylai ei rôl fod ar ran pobl Cymru. Ni ragwelwyd erioed—ac eithrio yn nychymyg rhai—y byddai iddo swyddogaeth weithredol. Croesawaf hynny. Byddai'n anghywir ystyried caniatáu i sefydliad fel hwn ymgymryd â chyfrifoldebau cyrff statudol wedi'u sefydlu'n briodol yng Nghymru er enghraifft. Yn anffodus, targedodd Owen John Thomas Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru unwaith eto. Mae rôl bresennol Cymru'n Creu yn briodol ar gyfer sefydliad o'r fath.

Fe'm calonogir yn fawr wrth edrych ar y rhai a gytunodd i ymuno â Cymru'n Creu. Mae gennym ymrwymiad ar y lefel uchaf gan lawer sydd am weithio er budd cyffredin pobl Cymru ac sydd am ystyried y celfyddydau a diwylliant mewn amrywiaeth o gyd-destunau, boed hynny mewn addysg, datblygu economaidd, marchnata Cymru ac ati. Mae llw o bobl yn cymryd rhan ar y lefel uchaf mewn gwahanol agweddau ar fywyd Cymru. Fodd bynnag, maent yn cydnabod y gallant, drwy ddod ynghyd o dan yr ambarél hwn, gyfrannu at ystod gyfan y celfyddydau a diwylliant yng Nghymru. Croesawaf y datganiad ac edrychaf ymlaen at ganlyniadau cynnar gwaith y fforwm. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig ei annog i fabwysiadu rôl a swyddogaeth glir a'i fod yn cydnabod y cyfraniad pwysig y gall ei wneud. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y sefydliad yn llywio eich penderfyniadau polisi yn y dyfodol.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf i a'r Pwyllgor yn cydnabod eich rôl wrth ddatblygu'r adroddiad a arweiniodd at hyn. Fel y gwyddoch yn ôl y ffordd y cafodd ei sefydlu, eglurodd adroddiad y Pwyllgor rôl y sefydliad. Mae'n amlwg nad oes lle yn nemocratiaeth fodern Cymru i sefydlu math o 'archgwango' a fyddai'n gwthio ei hun rhwng y Cynulliad a'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir ganddo i gyflawni ein polisiau. O gofio lefel uchel y gynrychiolaeth, mae syniadau da yn dod i'r fei. Fodd bynnag, gŵyr yr aelodau yn union pam y maent yno ac maent yn awyddus i gyfrannu ar y telerau hynny. Mae sefydliadau nas cynhwyswyd yn wreiddiol wedi gofyn a gânt anfon

asked whether they can send a representative. I do not think that they would ask for that if they did not consider it to be worthwhile.

3:10 p.m.

Cynog Dafis: Derbyniat bwynt y Gweinidog nad sefydlu cwango arall oedd y syniad wrth argymhell sefydlu Cymru'n Creu. Yr oedd y corff i fod yn rhyw fath o bwerdy ar gyfer polisi diwylliannol gyda chylch gwaith ehangach na Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, sydd yn ymdrin â'r celfyddydau yn unig. Cafwyd awgrym cryf y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cadeirio Cymru'n Creu er mwyn sicrhau bod gyriant egniol y tu ôl i'w weithgareddau. Ystyriwyd sicrhau adnoddau ar gyfer Cymru'n Creu naill ai drwy secondiadau a defnyddio cyfleusterau'r cyrff sy'n aelodau, neu, pe bai hynny'n methu, fod cyllid yn cael ei frigidori i greu ysgrifenyddiaeth gwirioneddol effeithiol. Pa fath o adnoddau sydd ar gael ar gyfer Cymru'n Creu a sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn sicrhau eu bod yn ddigonol i gyflawni'r weledigaeth wreiddiol o bwerdy ar gyfer strategaeth ddiwylliannol i Gymru?

Jenny Randerson: I realise that, as Chair of the former Post-16 Education and Training Committee, you also have a wide knowledge of the original proposal. In terms of a powerhouse for cultural policy, the members of Cymru'n Creu have made a significant contribution to the cultural strategy. I reassure you that it is much wider than the Arts Council of Wales. The arts council is only one member. It does not have a special status or a special remit. I also reassure you that I do chair Cymru'n Creu; it is my group.

There are, effectively, secondments. However, they are not official secondments. Through the working parties established, ASPBs and other organisations have devoted resources to those parties and their work programme. It is not as formal as you had perhaps imagined, but staff time is being put in. The secretariat is provided by my officials, which seemed to be by far the most straightforward way of co-ordinating the group. A large number of the ASPBs and organisations concerned are, in turn, providing resources for different aspects of

cynrychiolydd, sy'n arwydd da ei fod yn gweithio. Ni chredaf y gofynnent am hynny onis ystyrient hynny'n werth chweil.

Cynog Dafis: I take the Minister's point that in recommending the establishment of Cymru'n Creu the idea was not to establish another quango. Cymru'n Creu was supposed to be a kind of powerhouse for cultural policy with a wider remit than the Arts Council of Wales, which only deals with the arts. There was a strong suggestion that the Minister would chair Cymru'n Creu in order to ensure an energetic driving force behind its activities. Consideration was given to resource Cymru'n Creu either through secondments or the use of member-organisations' facilities, or, were that to fail, top-slicing funding in order to create a truly effective secretariat. What type of resources are available for Cymru'n Creu and how will the Minister ensure that they will be sufficient to realise the original vision of a powerhouse for a cultural strategy for Wales?

Jenny Randerson: Sylweddolaf fod gennych, fel Cadeirydd yr hen Bwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, wybodaeth eang am y cynllun gwreiddiol. Yn nhermau pwerdy ar gyfer polisi diwylliannol, mae aelodau Cymru'n Creu wedi gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol at y strategaeth ddiwylliannol. Fe'ch sicrhaf ei fod yn llawer ehangach na Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Dim ond un aelod yw cyngor y celfyddydau. Nid oes statws arbennig iddo na chylch gwaith arbennig. Fe'ch sicrhaf hefyd fy mod yn cadeirio Cymru'n Creu; fy ngrŵp i ydyw.

I bob pwrpas, ceir secondiadau. Fodd bynnag, nid ydynt yn secondiadau swyddogol. Drwy'r gweithgorau a sefydlwyd, mae cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a sefydliadau eraill wedi neilltuo adnoddau i'r gweithgorau hynny a'u rhaglen waith. Nid yw mor ffurfiol ag yr oeddech wedi'i ddychmygu efallai, ond mae amser y staff yn cael ei neilltuo iddo. Fy swyddogion i sy'n gwneud gwaith ysgrifenyddiaeth, gan mai dyna oedd y ffordd symlaf o bell ffordd o gyd-drefnu'r grŵp, yn ôl pob golwg. Mae nifer fawr o'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y

the programme in order to make it work. It is better for an organisation such as this to grow naturally from an energetic start, than to set up a vast edifice that fails.

Lorraine Barrett: I welcome this statement and share many of the views expressed by Members, particularly those of Jonathan Morgan. I draw attention to the paragraph that refers to the ICT sub-group. I do not know whether you can refer today—perhaps we will have an opportunity to discuss it in Committee, as we will no doubt have a presentation from Cymru'n Creu—to what it might develop in the ICT sector. I was struck by the importance of not duplicating what has already been done in the National Assembly. For example, the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee has done a lot of work on ICT. Even though that may be in the educational context, it cuts across cultural issues. Will you consider a way for Cymru'n Creu to look at what has already been done, perhaps by using the report on ICT, in order to avoid duplication? When you consider local authorities, which have a responsibility for leisure centres, libraries and so on, I presume that, because the WLGA is involved with the consortium, there will be an opportunity to share good practice and to ensure that we are not reinventing the wheel, as well as to share some of the resources.

Would there be merit in the consortium considering each of the Assembly's policy sectors to ensure that they are sharing this work? Jonathan mentioned the arts practitioners' work feeding into other policy development areas. I refer to information and communication technology. The Agriculture and Rural Development Committee is considering how ICT can help rural businesses. Many rural businesses must be based on the craft industry. Craft in the Bay, in Cardiff Bay, within the craft industry in Wales, has set up its own website. Many things are going on. I know that you cannot deal with all these issues.

The Presiding Officer: Order. You have already asked many questions.

Cynulliad a'r sefydliadau dan sylw, yn eu tro, yn darparu adnoddau ar gyfer agweddau gwahanol ar y rhaglen er mwyn sicrhau ei bod yn gweithio. Mae'n well i sefydliad fel hwn dyfu'n naturiol o ddechrau egniol, na sefydlu adeiladwaith helaeth sy'n methu.

Lorraine Barrett: Croesawaf y datganiad hwn a rhannaf lawer o'r safbwyntiau a fynegwyd gan yr Aelodau, yn arbennig Jonathan Morgan. Tynnaf sylw at y paragraff sy'n cyfeirio at yr is-grŵp TGCh. Ni wn a allwch gyfeirio heddiw—efallai y cawn gyfle i'w drafod yn y Pwyllgor, gan y bydd cyflwyniad gan Cymru'n Creu mae'n siŵr— at yr hyn y gallai ei ddatblygu yn y sector TGCh. Fe'm trawyd gan bwysigrwydd peidio â dyblygu'r hyn sydd eisoes wedi'i wneud yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Er enghraifft, mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wedi gwneud llawer o waith ar TGCh. Er bod hynny efallai yng nghyd-destun addysg, mae'n torri ar draws materion diwylliannol. A ystyriwch sut y gall Cymru'n Creu ystyried yr hyn a wnaethpwyd eisoes, efallai drwy ddefnyddio'r adroddiad ar TGCh, er mwyn osgoi dyblygu? Pan ystyriwch awdurdodau lleol, sy'n gyfrifol am ganolfannau hamdden, llyfrgelloedd ac ati, yr wyf yn cymryd yn ganiataol, am fod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn aelod o'r consortiwm, y bydd cyfle i rannu arfer da ac i sicrhau nad dechrau o'r newydd yr ydym, yn ogystal â rhannu rhai o'r adnoddau.

A fyddai'n werth i'r consortiwm ystyried pob un o sectorau polisi'r Cynulliad i sicrhau eu bod yn rhannu'r gwaith hwn? Nododd Jonathan fod gwaith pobl ym maes y celfyddydau yn cyfrannu at feysydd datblygu polisi eraill. Cyfeiriaf at dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Mae'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig wrthi'n ystyried sut y gall TGCh helpu busnesau gwledig. Rhaid i lawer o fusnesau gwledig fod yn seiliedig ar y diwydiant crefftau. Mae Crefft yn y Bae, ym Mae Caerdydd, o fewn y diwydiant crefftau yng Nghymru, wedi sefydlu ei wefan ei hun. Mae llawer yn digwydd. Gwn na allwch ymdrin â'r holl faterion hyn.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydych eisoes wedi gofyn llawer o gwestiynau.

Lorraine Barrett: I am sorry, I thought that you wanted me to carry on a bit longer.

Lorraine Barrett: Mae'n flin gennyf, yr oeddwn yn meddwl eich bod am imi gario ymlaen ychydig yn hirach.

The Presiding Officer: We have another three minutes for this.

Y Llywydd: Mae gennym dair munud arall ar gyfer hyn.

Lorraine Barrett: I think that you get the gist of the questions I would like you to answer, Minister.

Lorraine Barrett: Credaf y gwelwch gyfeiriad cyffredinol y cwestiynau yr hoffwn ichi eu hateb, Weinidog.

Jenny Randerson: You have raised some interesting questions. I hope that my answer will show that we have been trying to address the issues that rightly concern you. You will be aware that in England there has been a proposal to establish culture online. It would be a major financial step for us to become a part of that. When I say 'England', I mean the UK, but it has been decided that its remit will be England. We need to be a part of that process, because otherwise Wales will become isolated from the overall situation. We therefore decided that there should be an equivalent culture Cymru online. The ICT group is considering that. Andrew Green, the national librarian of the National Library of Wales, chairs that group. You will be relieved to hear that he is also a member of Andrew Davies's co-ordinating committee. As a member, he is fully aware of all the other actions that we are taking. We have raised the issue of duplication and reinventing the wheel, and so on, a few times in our discussions, and I believe that we have covered the issues that concern you. We are sure that we have our feelers out so that we do not repeat what is being done elsewhere.

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydych wedi codi cwestiynau diddorol. Gobeithio y dengys fy ateb ein bod wedi bod yn ceisio ymdrin â'r materion sydd o bryder ichi, a hynny'n gwbl deg. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod bwriad yn Lloegr i sefydlu diwylliant ar-lein. Byddai'n gam ariannol mawr inni ddod yn rhan o hynny. Pan ddywedaf 'Lloegr', yr hyn a olygaf yw'r DU, ond penderfynwyd mai Lloegr fydd ei gylch gorchwyl. Mae angen inni fod yn rhan o'r broses honno, oherwydd fel arall caiff Cymru ei hynysu oddi wrth y sefyllfa gyffredinol. Felly penderfynwyd y dylid cael diwylliant ar-lein cyfatebol i Gymru. Mae'r grŵp TGCh wrthi'n ystyried hynny. Mae Andrew Green, llyfrgellydd cenedlaethol Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru, yn cadeirio'r grŵp hwnnw. Bydd yn rhyddhad ichi glywed ei fod ef hefyd yn aelod o bwyllgor cyd-drefnu Andrew Davies. Fel aelod, mae'n gwbl ymwybodol o'r holl gamau eraill yr ydym yn eu cymryd. Yr ydym wedi codi mater dyblygu a dechrau o'r newydd, ac ati, sawl gwaith yn ein trafodaethau, a chredaf ein bod wedi cwmpasu'r materion sydd o bryder ichi. Yr ydym yn hyderus ein bod yn ymchwilio i sicrhau na fyddwn yn dyblygu'r hyn a wneir mewn manau eraill.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych yn haeddu cryn ganmoliaeth am eich ymateb gwirfoddol i adroddiad y cyn-Bwyllgor Addysg Ôl-16 a etifeddwyd gan y Pwyllgor Diwylliant. Bydd cyfle i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant holi cwestiynau manwl ar Cymru'n Creu yn y Pwyllgor pan gyhoeddir yr adroddiad y mis nesaf.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You are to be commended for your voluntary response to the former Post-16 Education Committee's report, which was inherited by the Culture Committee. There will be an opportunity for members of the Culture Committee to ask detailed questions on Cymru'n Creu when the report is published next month.

Mae un cwestiwn gennyf. Yn ôl 'Diwylliant Cytûn', un o amcanion Cymru'n Creu oedd sicrhau bod y diwydiannau creadigol yn gallu cael mewnbwn i fentrau o dan Amcan 1. Mae Cymru'n Creu wedi bod mewn bodolaeth

I have one question. According to 'A Culture in Common' one of the objectives of Cymru'n Creu was to ensure that the creative industries could have an input into Objective 1 initiatives. Cymru'n Creu has been in

bellach ers rhai misoedd. A oes unrhyw dystiolaeth, neu enghreifftiau, o un o'r diwydiannau creadigol yn cael y mynediad hwnnw drwy gyfrwng Cymru'n Creu?

Jenny Randerson: Because creative industries issues that have been raised have concerned people—and the intention that these should be addressed as part of the initiative—we set up a meeting on the creative industries, which was organised by the Welsh Development Agency and the Arts Council of Wales. I believe that you were at that meeting in Aberystwyth, Rhodri. I hope that that will be the beginning of an initiative to practically assist the creative industries to participate in, and to benefit from, Objective 1 funding. That is particularly difficult, because the size of the average company in the creative industries is much smaller than it is in many other sectors of industry. Therefore, there are particular problems, and particular assistance is needed.

3:20 p.m.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): Before I turn to the business statement for the next three weeks, I wish to inform Members of changes to this week's business. Today's business is as planned. However, on Thursday, the Assembly Cabinet will make three statements. I will make a statement on broadband, the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language will make a statement on mountain climbing safety—in response to a request from Alun Pugh—and my ministerial colleague, Jane Hutt, will make a statement on the consultation on the learning disabilities advisory group report.

The motion to approve the Prescribed Waste (Wales) (No.2) Regulations 2001 has been withdrawn and Owen John Thomas has withdrawn his no named day motion to instruct the Minister for Environment to bring forward subordinate legislation under Standing Order No. 29. I understand that he has done so because my ministerial

existence for some months now. Is there any evidence, or examples, of one of the creative industries securing that access through Cymru'n Creu?

Jenny Randerson: Oherwydd bod materion a godwyd sy'n ymwneud â diwydiannau creadigol wedi peri pryder i bobl—a'r bwriad i ymdrin â'r rhain fel rhan o'r fenter—cynhaliwyd cyfarfod ar y diwydiannau creadigol, a drefnwyd gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Credaf eich bod yn y cyfarfod hwnnw yn Aberystwyth, Rhodri. Gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n ddechrau ar fenter i gynorthwyo'r diwydiannau creadigol yn ymarferol i fod yn rhan o arian Amcan 1, ac elwa arno. Mae hynny'n arbennig o anodd, am fod maint cwmni cyffredin yn y diwydiannau creadigol dipyn yn llai na mewn sawl diwydiant arall. Felly, mae problemau arbennig, ac mae angen cymorth arbennig.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cyn imi droi at y datganiad busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf, hoffwn hysbysu'r Aelodau am newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Nid yw busnes heddiw wedi newid. Fodd bynnag, ddydd Iau, bydd Cabinet y Cynulliad yn gwneud tri datganiad. Byddaf yn gwneud datganiad ar dechnoleg band llydan, bydd y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg yn gwneud datganiad ar ddiogelwch wrth ddringo mynyddoedd—mewn ymateb i gais gan Alun Pugh—a bydd fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Hutt, yn gwneud datganiad ar y broses ymgynghori ar adroddiad grŵp ymgynghorol anabledau dysgu.

Tynnwyd yn ôl y cynnig i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gwastraff Rhagnodedig (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2001 a thynnodd Owen John Thomas yn ôl ei gynnig heb ddyddiad trafod i gyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd i ddwyn ymlaen is-ddeddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29. Deallaf iddo wneud hyn gan fod fy nghyd-

colleague, Sue Essex, has agreed to incorporate the issues that he raised in future planning guidance.

In this morning's meeting, the Business Committee agreed the business for the next three weeks as shown on your Chamberweb under supporting documents. Members will also wish to be aware that in the Business Committee meeting, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined, under Standing Order No. 22.5, that the following Orders need not be referred to a Subject Committee: the Meat (Hygiene and Inspection) (Charges) (Amendment) (No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001—I am sorry, Presiding Officer, I have mislaid the other Order. I will inform Members of that in due course.

As usual, I will post a copy of my business statement to the intranet and the internet.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? Any comments?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: We had an opportunity earlier to listen to Tony Blair, the Prime Minister of the United Kingdom, make a wide-ranging speech that touched upon many issues—the situation in Afghanistan in particular. You know that there are differences of opinion in this Assembly about the approach to that matter and that Plaid Cymru has called for a halt to the bombing. He also made wide-ranging comments on devolution, which we found interesting. Will there be an opportunity in the next few weeks to have a wide-ranging debate on the Assembly's response to the Prime Minister's contribution? Would it not also be appropriate for us to consider how the Assembly can respond when speeches of that kind are made in future?

William Graham: On a different point, will the Minister for Assembly Business consider scheduling a debate on the new Assembly building? We are tired of varying attempts from the Minister concerned and from the Richard Rogers Partnership to discuss it via e-mail. It is getting boring so can we now have a proper debate?

Weinidog, Sue Essex, wedi cytuno i ymgorffori'r materion a gododd mewn canllawiau cynllunio yn y dyfodol.

Yn y cyfarfod y bore hwn, cytunodd y Pwyllgor Busnes ar y busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y nodir ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Bydd yr Aelodau hefyd am wybod bod y Dirprwy Lywydd wedi dyfarnu, yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r Gorchmynion canlynol i Bwyllgor Pwnc: Rheoliadau Cig (Hylendid ac Archwilio) (Taliadau) (Rhif 2) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Lywydd, ond yr wyf wedi colli'r Gorchmyn arall. Byddaf yn hysbysu'r Aelodau am hwnnw maes o law.

Fel arfer, byddaf yn rhoi copi o'm datganiad busnes ar y fewnrwyd a'r rhyngrwyd.

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Unrhyw sylwadau?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Cawsom gyfle i wrando ar Tony Blair, Prif Weinidog y Deyrnas Unedig yn gynharach, yn traddodi araith eang ei chwmpas a grybwyllodd lawer o faterion—y sefyllfa yn Afghanistan yn benodol. Gwyddoch fod safbwyntiau gwahanol yn y Cynulliad hwn am yr ymagwedd tuag at y mater hwnnw a bod Plaid Cymru wedi galw am derfyn ar y bomio. Gwnaeth ef sylwadau eang eu cwmpas ar ddatganoli hefyd, a oedd yn ddiddorol. A fydd cyfle yn yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf i gynnal dadl eang ei chwmpas ar ymateb y Cynulliad i gyfraniad y Prif Weinidog? Oni fyddai'n briodol inni ystyried hefyd sut y dylai'r Cynulliad ymateb pan wneir areithiau o'r fath yn y dyfodol?

William Graham: Ar bwynt gwahanol, a fydd y Trefnydd yn ystyried trefnu dadl ar adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi blino ar y ceisiadau gwahanol gan y Gweinidog perthnasol a Phartneriaeth Richard Rogers i drafod y mater drwy negeseuon e-bost. Yr ydym wedi hen ddiflasu ar hyn ac felly, a allwn yn awr gael dadl briodol?

The Presiding Officer: Is there a speaker from another group? I see that there is not. I call the Minister to reply.

Andrew Davies: I will discuss a response to the Prime Minister's speech with the First Minister and Cabinet colleagues. However, it is for the Presiding Officer to decide on the procedure for such a debate in Plenary.

In answer to William Graham's point, I refute any allegation that Edwina Hart, my ministerial colleague, has been less than open and candid in dealing with the new building. As always, she has come to this Assembly with a full report and updated Members via e-mail, as we have a commitment to use ICT. She has also provided information through statements and in answering questions in this Chamber. I will discuss with her whether we should hold a debate or respond by means of a statement. I will report back to the Assembly on that in a future business statement and to the Business Committee, as I always do.

Y Llywydd: A oes rhywun o grŵp arall am siarad? Gwelaf nad oes. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ateb.

Andrew Davies: Byddaf yn trafod ymateb i araith y Prif Weinidog â Phrif Weinidog Cymru a'm cyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet. Fodd bynnag, y Llywydd ddylai benderfynu ar y weithdrefn ar gyfer dadl o'r fath mewn Cyfarfod Llawn.

I ateb pwynt William Graham, gwrthodaf unrhyw honiadau na fu Edwina Hart, fy nghyd-Weinidog, yn agored ac yn onest wrth ddelio â'r adeilad newydd. Fel y gwna bob amser, mae wedi dod i'r Cynulliad hwn gydag adroddiad llawn ac wedi rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Aelodau drwy negeseuon e-bost, gan ein bod wedi ymrwmo i ddefnyddio TGCh. Mae hefyd wedi rhoi gwybodaeth inni drwy ddatganiadau ac wrth ateb cwestiynau yn y Siambr hon hefyd. Byddaf yn trafod â hi a ddylem gynnal dadl neu ymateb drwy wneud datganiad. Byddaf yn rhoi sylwadau ar hynny i'r Cynulliad mewn datganiad busnes yn y dyfodol ac i'r Pwyllgor Busnes, fel y gwnaf bob amser.

Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

Nick Bourne: Point of order. I hope that the First Minister has received notice of this point of order. My office has been in touch with him about it. It relates to an issue that I raised sometime ago with the Minister for Environment regarding the Cefn Croes windfarm development, which was passed to the First Minister, who has responsibility for energy issues. It relates to the Assembly's role as a consultee and Standing Order No. 5 on Assembly business. I understand that the Assembly should be consulted on this issue. I quote the First Minister's reply:

'I understand that officials are currently finalising a full Assembly response.'

It concerns me if this is being done at official level, without any ministerial involvement. I also hope that there will be an opportunity for Members to contribute to this debate, as it requires a full Assembly response. It should

Nick Bourne: Pwynt o drefn. Gobeithiaf fod Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi cael rhybudd o'r pwynt hwn o drefn. Mae fy swyddfa wedi cysylltu ag ef amdano. Mae'n ymwneud â mater a godais beth amser yn ôl gyda'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ynglŷn â datblygu fferm wynt Cefn Croes, a drosglwyddwyd i Brif Weinidog Cymru, sy'n gyfrifol am faterion ynni. Mae'n ymwneud â rôl y Cynulliad i roi cyngor a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 5 ar fusnes y Cynulliad. Deallaf y dylid ymgynghori â'r Cynulliad ar y mater hwn. Dyfynnaf ateb Prif Weinidog Cymru:

'Deallaf fod swyddogion wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn cwblhau ateb llawn gan y Cynulliad.'

Mae'r peri pryder imi os yw hyn yn cael ei wneud gan swyddogion, heb unrhyw gyfraniad gan y Gweinidogion. Gobeithiaf hefyd y bydd cyfle i'r Aelodau gyfrannu at y ddadl hon, gan fod angen ymateb y Cynulliad

either be discussed in the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee or it should be discussed in Plenary. I realise that there are different opinions on this, but it is an important issue and we are involved in giving advice to the Department of Trade and Industry on this matter. I gave the First Minister notice of this, but he might not have received the e-mail.

The First Minister: I have not had notice of this point of order. However, that is not a problem, because this is an issue that has been raised with me on several occasions, as it has with Sue Essex. She has a major input into it, even though it is an energy issue and, therefore, an economic development matter. I can go halfway to reassure you, Nick, that, although the use of the word 'official' means that civil servants are still finalising the response, it is a ministerial responsibility to make that response. Therefore, the response will not be sent out until I have seen it, signed it, changed it and am happy with it. I will also consult Sue to ensure that she is happy with the response. I cannot comfort you on the other issue, namely that it should be discussed by the Assembly corporately or in the Subject Committee. It is the Executive's decision and, therefore, the responsibility of the Minister to determine the response. However, I am happy to listen to the points that you may have made already. If you want to convert them into a formal letter saying why, legally, you think the Assembly, rather than the Minister, should make that decision, I will take that into account before finalising the letter to the DTI.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, First Minister. As the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives appreciates, this is not a matter for me directly, although I have a great concern and delight in all planning matters in a personal capacity.

Andrew Davies: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 7.16, about the conduct of the public in the public gallery. As Members know, we have a commitment to be

llawn. Dylai'r mater gael ei drafod ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth neu dylid ei drafod mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Sylweddolaf fod safbwyntiau gwahanol gan bobl ar hyn, ond mae'n fater pwysig ac yr ydym wrthi'n rhoi cyngor i'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ar y mater hwn. Rhoddais rybudd am hyn i Brif Weinidog Cymru, ond efallai na chafodd yr e-bost.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni chefais rybudd am y pwynt hwn o drefn. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n achosi problem, gan fod hwn yn fater a dynnwyd i'm sylw sawl tro, ac a dynnwyd i sylw Sue Essex. Mae hi'n chwarae rhan bwysig yn y mater, er mai mater yn ymwneud ag ynni ydyw, ac felly mae'n fater datblygu economaidd. Gallaf dawelu eich meddwl i ryw raddau, Nick, drwy ddweud mai Gweinidog a fydd yn gyfrifol am ymateb, er bod defnyddio'r gair 'swyddogion' yn golygu bod gweision sifil yn parhau i gwblhau'r ymateb hwnnw. Felly, ni chaiff yr ymateb ei anfon hyd nes y byddaf wedi ei ddarllen, ei lofnodi, ei newid ac y byddaf yn fodlon arno. Byddaf yn ymgynghori â Sue hefyd i sicrhau ei bod yn fodlon ar yr ymateb. Ni allaf dawelu eich meddwl o ran y mater arall, sef y dylai'r mater gael ei drafod gan y Cynulliad mewn Cyfarfod Llawn neu yn y Pwyllgor Pwnc. Penderfyniad y Weithrediaeth ac, felly, cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog, yw penderfynu ar yr ymateb. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn barod i wrando ar y pwyntiau a wnaethoch eisoes. Os byddwch am eu rhoi mewn llythyr ffurfiol gan nodi pam, yn ôl y gyfraith, yr ydych o'r farn y dylai'r Cynulliad wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw, yn hytrach na'r Gweinidog, byddaf yn ystyried hynny cyn cwblhau'r llythyr i'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant.

Y Llywydd: Diolch, Brif Weinidog. Fel y mae Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn ei werthfawrogi, nid mater i mi yn uniongyrchol yw hwn, er fy mod yn ymddiddori ac yn ymhyfrydu ym mhob mater cynllunio yn bersonol.

Andrew Davies: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf y pwynt hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.16, ynglŷn ag ymddygiad y cyhoedd yn yr oriel gyhoeddus. Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, yr ydym

open and accessible at all times, whether that be electronically or in reality. However, there is a balance to be struck and I have received strong representations from my own party group about the behaviour of certain members of the public in the public gallery during last Tuesday's Plenary.

I am aware that, as politicians, we can often sound pompous when talking about our rights and duties, but as elected representatives, we are sent here to represent the views of our constituents. If, in raising points, Members feel intimidated either verbally or physically by behaviour in the public gallery, which would be a major constraint on our activities as legitimately elected representatives. Members must feel safe in their seats and be able to contribute meaningfully to debates. I urge you to consider this matter urgently and ensure that last week's incident is not repeated.

The Presiding Officer: Following the tragic events in a Swiss sister institution earlier this year, the Clerk, the Deputy Presiding Officer and I considered matters of public access to the Assembly Chamber and the public gallery. We discussed it with those who advise us on security, namely the police. I would be happy to discuss it again. Our Standing Orders Nos. 7.15 and 7.16 give powers of removal and perhaps we should consider these issues again. However, if, while the Deputy Presiding Officer or myself are presiding, Members feel at any stage that their ability to contribute has been affected by activity in the public gallery, I urge them to raise that as a point of order immediately. That is a real point of order, because it relates to order in the Assembly building and in our Chamber. We will ensure that it is dealt with rapidly. I assure you that we will discuss this further. We might also take further advice on it urgently, as you suggest.

Peter Rogers: Further to that point of order, I think the Record of Proceedings will show that an Assembly Member raised a point of

wedi ymrwymo i fod yn agored ac yn hygyrch ar bob adeg, boed yn electronig neu'n gorfforol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid sicrhau cydbwysedd ac yr wyf wedi cael sylwadau cryf gan grŵp fy mhlaidd fy hun am ymddygiad rhai aelodau o'r cyhoedd yn yr oriel gyhoeddus yn ystod y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mawrth diwethaf.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol y gallwn, fel gwleidyddion, ymddangos yn rhwysgffawr wrth drafod ein hawliau a'n dyletswyddau ond, fel cynrychiolwyr etholedig, fe'n hanfonir yma i gynrychioli barn ein hetholwyr. Os bydd ymddygiad pobl ar lafar neu'n gorfforol yn yr oriel gyhoeddus yn gwneud i'r Aelodau deimlo'n anesmwyth wrth iddynt godi pwyntiau, byddai hynny'n rhwystro llawer ar ein gweithgareddau fel cynrychiolwyr a etholwyd yn gyfreithlon. Rhaid i'r Aelodau deimlo'n ddiogel yn eu seddi a rhaid iddynt allu cyfrannu at ddadleuon mewn ffordd ystyrlon. Fe'ch anogaf i ystyried y mater hwn ar frys ac i sicrhau na fydd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yr wythnos diwethaf yn digwydd eto.

Y Llywydd: Yn dilyn y digwyddiadau trist mewn sefydliad tebyg yn y Swistir yn gynharach eleni, ystyriodd y Clerc, y Dirprwy Lywydd a minnau faterion o ran mynediad y cyhoedd i Siambr y Cynulliad a'r oriel gyhoeddus. Fe'u trafodwyd â'r rheini sy'n ein cynghori o ran diogelwch, sef yr heddlu. Byddwn yn barod i'w trafod eto. Rhydd ein Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 7.15 a 7.16 bwerau symud inni ac efallai y dylem ailystyried y materion hyn. Fodd bynnag, os bydd yr Aelodau yn teimlo ar unrhyw adeg bod eu gallu i gyfrannu wedi'i effeithio gan rywbeth yn yr oriel gyhoeddus, tra bod y Dirprwy Lywydd neu minnau yn llywyddu, fe'u hanogaf i godi hynny fel pwynt o drefn yn syth. Pwynt gwirioneddol o drefn yw hwnnw, gan ei fod yn ymwneud â threfn yn adeilad y Cynulliad ac yn ein Siambr. Byddwn yn sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â hyn yn gyflym. Rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi y byddwn yn trafod hyn ymhellach. Efallai y byddwn hefyd yn gofyn am gyngor ar y mater ar frys, fel yr awgrymwch.

Peter Rogers: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, credaf y bydd Cofnod y Trafodion yn dangos i Aelod y Cynulliad godi pwynt o

order last week about behaviour in the public gallery and applause prior to the incident.

The Presiding Officer: I do not think that it was about applause. I do not regard applause from the public gallery as disorderly. However, if Members feel that it should be considered disorderly—and it is in Westminster—then we will look at it. In my opinion, there is a difference between applauding from a public gallery and barracking and intervening in the proceedings. However, this is a matter for review.

3:30 p.m.

Lorraine Barrett: Further to that point of order, I raised this matter as a point of order during the debate because, as my seat is near the public gallery, I sensed that the noise was building up. There was much applause, but it was only for particular speakers. That could have made other Members feel intimidated; they would have known that they would get mutterings from the gallery, as happened when the Minister for Assembly Business spoke. Someone in the gallery muttered something like ‘Oh, get on with it’ or ‘Be quiet’. They obviously supported a particular party. That is democracy, but the applause occurred every time a Member of a particular party spoke. I am concerned that, if we allow applause, it builds up and leads to other interruptions. I am concerned from a public safety perspective.

The Presiding Officer: I hear what you say. It is clearly wrong if Members are intimidated by anything that occurs in the public gallery. We must prevent that.

David Melding: Further to that point of order, the Conservative group has written to you and the Deputy Presiding Officer directly on this matter. We were particularly concerned by the level of applause throughout the debate on the international situation and subsequently in the debate on the waste strategy, during which the behaviour of several people in the gallery—and one person in particular—deteriorated. It

drefn yr wythnos diwethaf am ymddygiad yn yr oriel gyhoeddus a chymeradwyaeth cyn y digwyddiad dan sylw.

Y Llywydd: Ni chredaf fod hynny'n ymwneud â chymeradwyaeth. Nid ystyriaif fod cymeradwyaeth o'r oriel gyhoeddus yn ymddygiad sy'n groes i'r drefn. Fodd bynnag, os yw'r Aelodau o'r farn y dylid ei ystyried yn ymddygiad sy'n groes i'r drefn—fel y mae yn San Steffan—yna byddwn yn ystyried y mater. Yn fy marn i, mae gwahaniaeth rhwng cymeradwyaeth o oriel gyhoeddus a gweiddi ac ymyrryd yn y trafodion. Fodd bynnag, mater i'w adolygu yw hwn.

Lorraine Barrett: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, codais y mater hwn fel pwynt o drefn yn ystod y ddadl gan fy mod yn teimlo bod y sŵn yn codi, am fy mod yn eistedd yn agos at yr oriel gyhoeddus. Bu llawer o gymeradwyaeth, ond dim ond ar gyfer rhai siaradwyr. Gallai hynny fod wedi bygwth Aelodau eraill; byddent wedi gwybod y byddai pobl yn yr oriel yn siarad dan eu gwynt, fel y digwyddodd pan siaradodd y Trefnydd. Dywedodd rhywun yn yr oriel rywbeth fel ‘O! ewch ymlaen’ neu ‘Caewch eich ceg’. Yr oedd yn amlwg eu bod yn cefnogi plaid benodol. Dyna ddemocratiaeth, ond bu cymeradwyaeth bob tro y siaradodd Aelod o blaid benodol. Pryderaf y bydd hyn yn gwaethygu ac yn arwain at ymyriadau eraill, os caniatawn gymeradwyaeth. Pryderaf o safbwynt diogelwch y cyhoedd.

Y Llywydd: Deallaf yr hyn a ddywedwch. Mae'n amlwg na ddylai unrhyw beth sy'n digwydd yn yr oriel gyhoeddus fygwth yr Aelodau. Rhaid inni rwystro hynny rhag digwydd.

David Melding: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, mae grŵp y Ceidwadwyr wedi ysgrifennu atoch ac at y Dirprwy Lywydd yn uniongyrchol ar y mater hwn. Yr oeddem yn pryderu yn arbennig am lefel y gymeradwyaeth drwy'r ddadl ar y sefyllfa ryngwladol ac wedyn yn y ddadl ar y strategaeth wastraff, pan waethygodd ymddygiad nifer o bobl yn yr oriel—ac un person yn benodol. Ni all byth fod yn briodol

cannot ever be appropriate for applause to be permitted, because its volume, frequency and partiality indicates a level of pressure that does not represent the people of Wales as a whole. We represent the people of Wales as a whole, because we were elected. We ask those in the Chair to be forceful in implementing policy. I have never heard systematic applause in this Chamber before, and I was shocked that it was permitted on that day.

The Presiding Officer: I have heard applause from the public gallery on a number of occasions and have not sought to prevent it. However, if Members wish us to resort to the practices of other legislatures, I will ensure that that is done. However, I will consult on this matter.

Rod Richards: Further to that point of order, I was in the Chamber when the disturbance took place last week. In your deliberations on how you and the Deputy Presiding Officer should respond, will you consider that anyone causing a disturbance in the gallery be taken from his seat, brought into this Chamber and forced to sit with the Liberal Democrats? Some Members may feel that that would be draconian, but the punishment must fit the crime. [*Laughter.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. It is also out of order under Standing Order No. 7.16.

Helen Mary Jones: Further to that point of order, I wholeheartedly endorse what Rod Richards said; it would be an entirely appropriate punishment. More seriously, in reflecting on the extent to which we allow the public to respond to what goes on in the Chamber, it would be a mistake for a decision to be taken in the light of one incident. I urge caution. We pride ourselves on being more open than has been the case in other democratic institutions. Obviously, that needs to be balanced against the need of all Members to be heard. I would regret a decision not to allow any response from the public gallery. I sit closer to it than most Members and I have heard applause and comments on other occasions. I would like to provide some balance in this discussion, and ask for reflection rather than a response to

inni ganiatáu cymeradwyaeth, gan fod ei sŵn, ei hamlder a'i hunochredd yn nodi lefel o bwysau nad yw'n cynrychioli pobl Cymru gyfan. Cynrychiolwn bobl Cymru gyfan, oherwydd inni gael ein hethol. Gofynnwn i'r Cadeiryddion weithredu polisiau'n llym. Ni chlywais erioed yn y gorffennol gymeradwyaeth systematig yn y Siambr hon, ac fe'm syfrdanwyd iddi gael ei chaniatáu y diwrnod hwnnw.

Y Llywydd: Clywais gymeradwyaeth o'r oriel gyhoeddus ar nifer o achlysuron ac nid wyf wedi ceisio ei hatal. Fodd bynnag, os bydd yr Aelodau am inni ddefnyddio arferion deddfwrfeydd eraill, byddaf yn sicrhau y gwneir hynny. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn ymgynghori ar y mater.

Rod Richards: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, yr oeddwn yn y Siambr pan ddigwyddodd yr helynt yr wythnos diwethaf. Wrth i chi a'r Dirprwy Lywydd benderfynu ar sut y dylech ymateb, a fyddwch yn ystyried y posibilrwydd o symud y rhai sy'n creu helynt yn yr oriel, dod â hwy i'r Siambr a'u gorfodi i eistedd gyda'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? Efallai fod rhai o'r Aelodau yn teimlo y byddai hynny'n llym iawn, ond rhaid pennu cosb addas i'r trosedd. [*Chwerthin.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae allan o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.16 hefyd.

Helen Mary Jones: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, cymeradwyaf yn frwd yr hyn a ddywedodd Rod Richards; byddai'n gosb briodol iawn. I ymddifrifoli, wrth feddwl am y graddau y caniatawn i'r cyhoedd ymateb i'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y Siambr, camgymeriad fyddai dod i benderfyniad yng ngoleuni un digwyddiad. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus. Ymfalchïwn yn y ffaith ein bod yn fwy agored na sefydliadau democrataidd eraill. Mae'n amlwg bod angen sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng hynny a'r angen i bob Aelod gael ei glywed. Byddwn yn gresynu at benderfyniad i beidio â chaniatáu unrhyw ymateb o'r oriel gyhoeddus. Yr wyf yn eistedd yn agosach ati na'r rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau ac yr wyf wedi clywed cymeradwyaeth a sylwadau ar adegau eraill. Hoffwn sicrhau bod rhywfaint o gydbwysedd yn y drafodaeth hon, a gofynnaf

one incident.

inni ystyried y mater yn hytrach nag ymateb i un digwyddiad.

The Presiding Officer: Every decision taken in the Presiding Office is taken on reflection.

Y Llywydd: Rhoddir ystyriaeth i bob penderfyniad a gymerir yn Swyddfa'r Llywydd.

David Davies: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 7.8(v) on disorderly, discriminatory and offensive language. It relates to comments made in the Chamber by a Member, last week. I will quote three of those comments: first, that our leaders:

David Davies: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf y pwynt hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.8(v) ar iaith sy'n groes i'r drefn, yn camwahaniaethu neu'n peri tramgwydd. Mae'n ymwneud â sylwadau a wnaeth un o'r Aelodau yn y Siambr yr wythnos diwethaf. Byddaf yn dyfynnu tri o'r sylwadau hynny: yn gyntaf, bod ein harweinwyr:

'are in the pockets of—this is certainly true of the US President, who is practically owned by them—multinational corporations, which profit from third world exploitation.'

'ym mhocedi corfforaethau amlwladol—mae hyn yn arbennig o wir am Arlywydd yr UD, sy'n cael ei reoli ganddynt bron—sy'n elwa ar ecsbloetio'r trydydd byd.'

Secondly, that our governments and, by inference, our own Government:

Yn ail, bod ein llywodraethau ni a, thrwy hynny, ein Llywodraeth ni ein hunain yn:

'deny freedom, democracy and human rights to people in the third world.'

'gwadu rhyddid, democratiaeth a hawliau dynol i bobl y trydydd byd.'

Finally, and most damning, that:

Yn olaf, ac yn fwyaf damniol, bod:

'modern western democracy is buttressed by a rotten clientele of despots and oligarchies'.

'democratiaeth fodern y gorllewin yn cael ei chynnal gan griw llygredig o unbeniaid ac oligarchiaethau.'

British and American governments have a proud record of trying to bring the benefits of democracy to people across the world and trying to raise living standards. That applies to governments—[*Interruption.*]

Mae Llywodraeth Prydain a Llywodraeth America yn ymfalchïo yn y ffaith eu bod wedi ceisio sicrhau manteision democratiaeth i bobl ledled y byd a chodi safonau byw. Mae hynny'n berthnasol i lywodraethau—[*Torri ar draws.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. David Davies is raising a point of order and I wish to hear it.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae David Davies yn codi pwynt o drefn a hoffwn ei glywed.

David Davies: Democracy may not be a perfect tool in all instances, but it is infinitely better than fascism, communism, dictatorship or religious fundamentalism.

David Davies: Efallai nad yw democratiaeth yn berffaith ym mhob achos, ond mae'n well o lawer na ffasciaeth, comiwnyddiaeth, unbennaeth neu ffwndamentalïaeth grefyddol.

At a time when families are still mourning loved ones who died on 11 September, when allied forces prepare to risk their own lives in defence of our freedoms and when so many continue to suffer under the Taleban regime

Ar adeg pan fo teuluoedd yn parhau i alaru am anwyliaid a fu farw ar 11 Medi, pan fo lluoedd y cynghreiriaid yn paratoi i fentro pob dim er mwyn amddiffyn ein rhyddid a phan fo cymaint o bobl yn parhau i ddioddef

in Afghanistan, it is wholly unacceptable for Members to use their democratic rights in this Chamber to undermine the whole system of democracy and smear democratic politicians, including—by implication—the British Prime Minister. I may not agree with the Prime Minister in all matters, Llywydd, but I do not believe that he is responsible for poverty in the third world. I ask you to rule that, first, those comments were beyond contempt and, secondly, that under our Standing Orders, they were out of order.

Richard Edwards: Further to that point of order, we were discussing ridding the world of terrorism. My comments were entirely apposite. David Davies has just demonstrated his commitment to democratic debate. No wonder he likes Saudi Arabia so much—if I were living there I would be stoned in public.

The Presiding Officer: David Davies has failed to show how the remarks that he quoted from the Record were out of order under our Standing Orders. That is the only matter upon which I can rule. We do not have a Standing Order that states—

Nick Bourne *rose*—

The Presiding Officer: Order. Are you seeking to assist? If so, I will hear you on this point of order.

Nick Bourne: Further to that point of order, perhaps you were unaware that the language is offensive. You have the power under Standing Orders to determine that it is offensive.

The Presiding Officer: We have a clear definition, through custom and practice, of what is offensive language. This was clearly robust debate and opinion, but it was not a discriminatory statement or offensive under our Standing Orders. I am advised in these matters by the Clerk to the Assembly and by my legal advisor. However, I am grateful to David Davies for raising the issue and I will ensure at all times that, during discussion on emotive international issues—such as last week's debate and the Prime Minister's speech today—those matters are dealt with in

o dan gyfundrefn y Taleban yn Afghanistan, mae'n hollol annerbyniol i'r Aelodau ddefnyddio eu hawliau democrataidd yn y Siambr hon i danseilio system gyfan democratiaeth ac i bardduo gwleidyddion democrataidd, gan gynnwys—drwy oblygiad—Prif Weinidog Prydain. Efallai nad wyf yn cytuno â'r Prif Weinidog ar bopeth, Lywydd, ond ni chredaf ei fod yn gyfrifol am dlodi yn y trydydd byd. Gofynnaf ichi ddyfarnu, yn gyntaf, fod y sylwadau hynny'n warthus ac, yn ail, eu bod allan o drefn, o dan ein Rheolau Sefydlog.

Richard Edwards: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, yr oeddem yn trafod dileu terfysgaeth o'r byd. Yr oedd fy sylwadau yn hollol briodol. Mae David Davies newydd ddangos ei ymrwymiad i ddadl ddemocrataidd. Nid oes rhyfedd ei fod mor hoff o Saudi Arabia—pe bawn yn byw yno, byddwn yn cael fy llabyddio'n gyhoeddus.

Y Llywydd: Nid yw David Davies wedi dangos ym mha ffordd yr oedd y sylwadau a ddyfynnodd o'r Cofnod allan o drefn o dan ein Rheolau Sefydlog. Dyna'r unig fater y gallaf ddyfarnu arno. Nid oes gennym Reol Sefydlog sy'n nodi—

Nick Bourne *a gododd*—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A ydych yn ceisio bod o gymorth? Os felly, byddaf yn clywed eich sylwadau ar y pwynt hwn o drefn.

Nick Bourne: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, efallai nad oeddech yn ymwybodol bod yr iaith yn peri tramgwydd. Mae'r pŵer gennych o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog i ddyfarnu ei bod yn peri tramgwydd.

Y Llywydd: Mae diffiniad clir gennym, drwy ddefod ac arfer, o iaith sy'n peri tramgwydd. Mae'n amlwg mai dadl a barn gadarn ydoedd, ond nid oedd yn ddatganiad a oedd yn camwahaniaethu na'n peri tramgwydd o dan ein Rheolau Sefydlog. Fe'm cynghorir yn y materion hyn gan y Clerc i'r Cynulliad a chan fy nghynghorwr cyfreithiol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i David Davies am godi'r mater a byddaf yn sicrhau ar bob adeg wrth drafod materion rhyngwladol cynyrfiadol—megis y ddadl a gynhaliwyd yr wythnos diwethaf ac

a calm, orderly and inoffensive manner.

araith Prif Weinidog y Deyrnas Unedig heddiw—yr ymdrinnir â'r materion hynny mewn ffordd dawel, drefnus heb beri tramgwydd.

Andrew Davies: Point of order. I inadvertently made an error in making the business statement. I said that two Orders were subject to determination by the Deputy Presiding Officer. In fact, there was only one Order. The Business Committee did consider two, but one of those was a joint Order made by Whitehall, which is therefore not subject to determination by the Deputy Presiding Officer.

Andrew Davies: Pwynt o drefn. Gwneuthum wall ar ddamwain wrth wneud y datganiad busnes. Dywedais fod dau Orchymyn yn destun dyfarniad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd. Dim ond un Gorchymyn oedd, mewn gwirionedd. Ystyriwyd dau Orchymyn gan y Pwyllgor Busnes, ond yr oedd un ohonynt yn Orchymyn ar y cyd a wnaethpwyd gan Whitehall, ac felly nad yw'n destun dyfarniad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to the Minister for Assembly Business for expanding on the business statement.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Trefnydd am ymhelaethu ar y datganiad busnes.

Diwygio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12 Revision of Standing Order No. 12

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 34:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34:

(i) considers the report of the Business Committee laid in the Table Office on 22 October 2001 and,

(i) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Hydref 2001;

(ii) approves the following revision to Standing Order No. 12.5:

(ii) yn cymeradwyo'r diwygiad canlynol i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 12.5:

at the beginning of the second sentence of Standing Order No. 12.5 delete the words 'within one month' and insert the words 'within 30 working days'. (NDM805)

ar ddechrau ail frawddeg Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.5 dileu'r geiriau 'cyn pen mis' gan roi'r geiriau 'cyn pen 30 diwrnod gwaith' yn eu lle. (NDM805)

Y Llywydd: Gwelaf nad oes siaradwyr ar y mater hwn. Galwaf felly am bleidlais ar y cynnig. Bydd angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i'r cynnig gael ei dderbyn.

The Presiding Officer: I see that there no speakers on this matter. I therefore call for a vote on the motion. A two-thirds majority is needed for the motion to be carried.

*Cynnig: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Diwygio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 15 Revision of Standing Order No. 15

The Minister for Assembly Business Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod
(Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 34:

(i) considers the report of the Business Committee laid in the Table Office on 22 October 2001;

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34:

(i) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Hydref 2001;

(ii) *approves the following revisions to the Standing Orders;*

(iii) *resolves that the revisions shall take effect immediately:*

1. *in paragraph 15.1 delete 'Committee on European Affairs' and insert 'Committee on European and External Affairs';*

2. *at the end of paragraph 15.1 add '(iv) the Assembly's relations with nations external to the European Union.'*

3. *for the first sentence of paragraph 15.3 there shall be substituted the following sentence: 'The Committee shall avoid duplicating the work of subject committees, but may draw particular issues to the attention of relevant subject committees and, with the agreement of the relevant subject committee, may consider any matter falling within paragraphs 15.1 or 15.2 which is otherwise wholly within the remit of that subject committee.'* (NDM806)

Phil Williams: I welcome the way in which the Government has accepted many of the recommendations that Plaid Cymru made on changes to the Committee on European Affairs. The extension of its terms of reference to include countries external to the European Union is welcome. You will understand, I see this as the first step towards a full foreign affairs committee. However, we can all recognise the importance of raising Wales's profile worldwide.

Wearing both of my hats, as politician and scientist, I have had official business in 31 different countries over the last few years and have worked for a significant amount of time in 10. I have a deep concern that Wales is so little known. I regularly visit the tourist section of bookshops. To my dismay I often find no books on Wales at all. Raising our profile is a high priority. I am glad that we have a Committee that will be responsible for that. I am also pleased that we have an increased budget, as well as the general agreement that, rather than spread the resources too widely, we will focus on a number of key countries—rich and poor, east and west. During the recent Commonwealth

(ii) *yn cymeradwyo'r diwygiadau canlynol i'r Rheolau Sefydlog;*

(iii) *yn penderfynu bod y diwygiadau yn dod i rym ar unwaith:*

1. *ym mharagraff 15.1 dileu 'Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd' gan roi'r 'Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol' yn eu lle.*

2. *ar ddiwedd paragraff 15.1 ychwanegu: '(iv) perthynas y Cynulliad â chenedloedd y tu allan i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd.'*

3. *mae'r frawddeg ganlynol i'w rhoi yn lle brawddeg gyntaf paragraff 15.3: 'Bydd y Pwyllgor yn osgoi dyblygu gwaith pwyllgorau pwnc, ond caiff dynnu sylw pwyllgorau pwnc perthnasol at faterion penodol, ac os yw'r pwyllgor pwnc perthnasol yn cytuno, caiff ystyried unrhyw fater sy'n dod o fewn paragraffau 15.1 neu 15.2 sydd fel arall yn gyfan gwbl o fewn cylch gwaith y pwyllgor pwnc hwnnw.'* (NDM806)

Phil Williams: Croesawaf y ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi derbyn llawer o'r argymhellion a wnaeth Plaid Cymru ar y newidiadau i'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd. Croesawaf y cynnig i ehangu ei gylch gorchwyl i gynnwys gwledydd y tu allan i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Dylech ddeall fy mod yn ystyried mai hwn yw'r cam cyntaf tuag at bwyllgor materion tramor llawn. Fodd bynnag, gall pob un ohonom gydnabod pwysigrwydd codi proffil Cymru ledled y byd.

Yn rhinwedd fy swyddogaethau fel gwleidydd a gwyddonydd, yr wyf wedi ymgymryd â busnes swyddogol mewn 31 o wledydd gwahanol yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf ac yr wyf wedi gweithio am gyfnod hir mewn 10 ohonynt. Pryderaf fod cymaint o bobl heb glywed am Gymru. Ymwelaf ag adran dwristiaeth siopau llyfrau yn rheolaidd. Er gofid imi, yn aml, ni welaf ddim llyfrau o gwbl ar Gymru. Mae codi ein proffil yn flaenoriaeth gennym. Mae'n dda gennyf fod gennym Bwyllgor a fydd yn gyfrifol am hynny. Mae'n dda gennyf hefyd fod ein cyllideb wedi cynyddu a'n bod hefyd wedi cytuno yn gyffredinol y byddwn yn canolbwyntio ar nifer o wledydd

Parliamentary Association conference, Wales enjoyed a high profile as a result of our motion on gender balance.

3:40 p.m.

We must debate the second change in the Standing Orders, although it is welcome. We often hear the phrase, 'joined-up thinking'. The most serious barrier to joined-up thinking in the Assembly is the watertight separation that there sometimes is between Committees. On another occasion, I would like to argue the case for closer joint working between the Economic Development Committee and the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee on the training element of our economic strategy. The most serious effect of this silo mentality was the way it inhibited the work of the Committee on European Affairs. You can imagine how frustrating it was for me to sit on that Committee and be forbidden to discuss Objective 1 and other European structural funds because those issues had been covered by Subject Committees. One example in terms of policy formation is that the different aspects of European support for rural development were debated separately by the Economic Development Committee, under priority 5 of Objective 1, and by the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee, as part of rural development. No joint Committee meetings were held. An overarching Committee such as the Committee on European Affairs should have been able to supervise sensible co-ordination.

The Committee on European and External Affairs should also have a scrutiny role on Wales's overall performance in using European funds, compared to other countries. Responsible scrutiny in Committee would be much better than the matter being used as a political football in the media. Eighteen months ago, we were told in the Chamber that Wales was ahead of other European regions in winning approval for our Objective 1 single programming document. Our research staff compiled a long list of regions whose documents were approved ahead of

allweddol—gwledydd cyfoethog a thlawd, yn y dwyrain a'r gorllewin—yn hytrach na lledaenu ein hadnoddau yn rhy denau. Yn ystod cynhadledd ddiweddar Cymdeithas Seneddau'r Gymanwlad, cafodd Cymru broffil uchel o ganlyniad i'n cynnig ar gydbwysedd rhwng dynion a merched.

Rhaid inni drafod yr ail newid i'r Rheolau Sefydlog, er y dylem ei groesawu. Clywn yn aml yr ymadrodd 'meddwl yn gydgysylltiedig'. Y rhwystr mwyaf i feddwl yn gydgysylltiedig yn y Cynulliad yw'r bwch diddos a geir rhwng y Pwyllgorau weithiau. Ar achlysur arall, hoffwn ddadlau o blaid cydweithio agosach rhwng y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar yr elfen hyfforddiant o'n strategaeth economaidd. Effaith fwyaf difrifol y meddylfryd seilo hwn oedd y ffordd yr oedd yn rhwystro gwaith y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd. Gallwch ddychmygu pa mor rhwystredig yr oeddwn yn y Pwyllgor hwnnw lle na chaniatawyd imi drafod Amcan 1 a chronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop gan fod y materion hynny wedi'u trafod gan y Pwyllgorau Pwnc. Un enghraifft o hyn o ran llunio polisiau yw'r ffordd y cafodd agweddau gwahanol ar gymorth Ewropeaidd ar gyfer datblygu gwledig eu trafod ar wahân gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, o dan flaenoriaeth 5 Amcan 1, a chan y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, fel rhan o ddatblygu gwledig. Ni chynhaliwyd unrhyw gyfarfodydd ar y cyd. Dylai fod wedi bod yn bosibl i Bwyllgor cyffredin megis y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd oruchwylio proses synhwyrol o gydgysylltu.

Yn ogystal, dylai rôl y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol gynnwys craffu ar berfformiad cyffredinol Cymru wrth ddefnyddio cronfeydd Ewrop, o'i gymharu â pherfformiad gwledydd eraill. Byddai proses graffu gyfrifol gan y Pwyllgor yn llawer gwell na'r sefyllfa bresennol lle y defnyddir y mater fel pêl-droed wleidyddol gan y cyfryngau. Ddeunaw mis yn ôl, dywedwyd wrthym yn y Siambr bod Cymru ar y blaen o'i chymharu ag ardaloedd eraill o Ewrop o ran sicrhau bod ein dogfen raglennu sengl Amcan 1 yn cael ei chymeradwyo. Lluniodd

ours. That kind of rigorous, factual scrutiny is lacking in our official scrutiny of European funds. We need a similar objective, factual Committee scrutiny of expenditure on Objective 1 and other European structural programmes. We hear on the one hand that it is a disaster. I know that that is not true. On the other, I hear people say that we are well ahead of Cornwall and Liverpool. As Pauline Jarman said, it is no good being top of the third division.

Since the summer, our research staff has been working on an in-depth analysis of the profile of allocation and expenditure of European funds in different regions, especially in Scandinavia, East Germany and Austria. We will not publish the results until we are certain of our data. We must understand systems in different countries. For once, we have been pipped at the post by *The Western Mail*. However, there is no doubt that we are falling behind in the allocation of funds and, as is extremely likely, in expenditure. As this is one of the most critical sections of the Government's overall policy for economic and social regeneration, it is important that any failure should be exposed by responsible scrutiny in Committee. I welcome the change in Standing Orders that will, at least, permit the Committee on European and External Affairs to perform this important overall role.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I am always grateful to receive the support of a member of the Plaid Cymru group. I assume that Phil supports the motion; I am glad that he did not speak against it. On the basis of not looking a gift horse in the mouth, I accept his comments.

ein staff ymchwil restr hir o'r ardaloedd lle y cymeradwywyd eu dogfennau cyn ein rhai ni. Wrth inni graffu ar gronfeydd Ewropeaidd yn swyddogol, nid ydym yn craffu arnynt yn y modd manwl a thrwyadl hwnnw. Mae angen i'r Pwyllgor fabwysiadu proses debyg o graffu ar wariant ar Amcan 1 a rhaglenni strwythurol Ewropeaidd eraill mewn modd trwyadl a manwl. Clywn ar yr un llaw ei fod yn fethiant llwyr. Gwn nad yw hynny'n wir. Ar y llaw arall, clywaf bobl yn dweud ein bod ymhell ar y blaen o gymharu â Chernyw a Lerpwl. Fel y dywedodd Pauline Jarman, nid oes diben bod ar frig y drydedd gynghrair.

Ers yr haf, bu ein staff ymchwil yn llunio dadansoddiad manwl o'r ffordd y dyrennir ac y gwerir cronfeydd Ewropeaidd mewn ardaloedd gwahanol, yn enwedig Sgandinafia, Dwyrain yr Almaen ac Awstria. Ni fyddwn yn cyhoeddi'r canlyniadau nes ein bod yn siŵr bod y data yn gywir. Rhaid inni ddeall systemau gwledydd gwahanol. Am unwaith, mae *The Western Mail* wedi achub y blaen arnom. Fodd bynnag, nid oes amheuaeth ein bod ar eu hôl hi wrth ddyrannu cronfeydd ac, fel sy'n debygol iawn, o ran gwariant. Gan mai hon yw un o'r adrannau pwysicaf o bolisi cyffredinol y Llywodraeth ar adfywio economaidd a chymdeithasol, mae'n bwysig y dylai gwaith craffu cyfrifol y Pwyllgor ddatgelu unrhyw fethiant. Croesawaf y newid i'r rheolau Sefydlog a fydd, o leiaf, yn caniatáu i'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol gyflawni'r rôl gyffredinol bwysig hon.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Yr wyf bob amser yn ddiolchgar am gefnogaeth gan aelod o grŵp Plaid Cymru. Tybiaf fod Phil yn cefnogi'r cynnig; mae'n dda gennyf na siaradodd yn ei erbyn. Am nad wyf byth am wrthod rhodd o'r fath, derbyniaf ei sylwadau.

*Cynnig: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor

Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hancock, Brian
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Diwygio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 23 Revision of Standing Order No. 23

The Minister for Assembly Business Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod
(Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 34: y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34:

(i) considers the report of the Business Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 October 2001; (i) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Hydref 2001;

(ii) approves the following revision of Standing Orders: (ii) yn cymeradwyo'r diwygiad canlynol i Reolau Sefydlog:

1. At the start of paragraph 23.9 insert: 'Subject to paragraphs 23.11A to 23.11E,'; 1. Ar ddechrau paragraff 23.9 ychwanegu, 'Yn amodol ar baragraffau 23.11A i 23.11E,';

2. After paragraph 23.11 insert:

'23.11A. Subject to paragraph 23.11E, the Assembly Cabinet may determine that, in the particular circumstances, it is not reasonably practicable for a draft to be laid before the Assembly under paragraph 23.9 and in that case paragraphs 23.11B to 23.11D shall apply.

23.11B. The draft shall be signed on behalf of the Assembly in accordance with paragraph 22.26(iii).

23.11C. The relevant Assembly Secretary shall as soon as reasonably practicable after the draft has been signed under paragraph 23.11B lay before the Assembly a memorandum notifying the Assembly that the subordinate legislation has been signed on behalf of the Assembly and explaining its intended effect and likely financial implications.

23.11D. Whenever a memorandum is laid before the Assembly under paragraph 23.11C, a Member may, within the period of 40 working days beginning with the date on which the memorandum is laid, table a motion instructing the relevant Assembly Secretary:

(a) to consider the possibility of the subordinate legislation being revoked in relation to Wales; and

(b) to lay before the Assembly as soon as possible a report stating what action the Assembly Secretary has taken or proposes to take in that respect.

23.11E. Paragraphs 23.11A to 23.11E and, in paragraph 23.9, the words 'Subject to paragraphs 23.11A to 23.11E,' shall cease to have effect on 18 January 2002.'

3. For paragraph 23.12 substitute:

'23.12. Where subordinate legislation to which this section applies would, if the legislation were made by the Assembly alone, fall within section 1 or section 2 of this standing order, the provisions of that section

2. Ar ôl paragraff 23.11 ychwanegu,

'23.11A. Yn amodol ar baragraff 23.11E, caiff Cabinet y Cynulliad benderfynu, o dan yr amgylchiadau penodol, nad yw'n rhesymol ymarferol i ddrafft gael ei osod gerbron y Cynulliad o dan baragraff 23.9 ac yn yr achos hwnnw bydd paragraffau 23.11B i 23.11D yn gymwys.

23.11B. Bydd y drafft yn cael ei lofnodi ar ran y Cynulliad yn unol â pharagraff 22.26(iii).

23.11C. Cyn gynted ag y bo'n rhesymol ymarferol ar ôl i'r drafft gael ei lofnodi o dan baragraff 23.11B bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad perthnasol yn gosod memorandwm gerbron y Cynulliad yn hysbysu'r Cynulliad fod yr is-ddeddfwriaeth wedi'i llofnodi ar ran y Cynulliad ac yn esbonio ei heffaith arfaethedig a'r goblygiadau ariannol tebygol.

23.11D. Pryd bynnag y bydd memorandwm yn cael ei osod gerbron y Cynulliad o dan baragraff 23.11C, caiff Aelod, o fewn y cyfnod o 40 diwrnod gwaith gan ddechrau ar y dyddiad y gosodir y memorandwm gerbron y Cynulliad, gyflwyno cynnig yn cyfarwyddo'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad perthnasol:

(a) i ystyried y posibilrwydd o ddiddymu'r is-ddeddfwriaeth mewn perthynas â Chymru; ac

(b) i osod gerbron y Cynulliad cyn gynted â phosibl adroddiad yn datgan pa gamau y mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad wedi eu cymryd neu yn bwriadu eu cymryd yn y cyswllt hwnnw.'

23.11E. Bydd effaith paragraffau 23.11A i 23.11E ac, ym mharagraff 23.9, effaith y geiriau 'Yn amodol ar baragraffau 23.11A i 23.11E,' yn peidio ar 18 Ionawr 2002.

3. Yn lle paragraff 23.12 rhoi:

'23.12. Pan fyddai is-ddeddfwriaeth y mae'r adran hon yn gymwys iddi, pe câi'r ddeddfwriaeth ei gwneud gan y Cynulliad yn unig, yn dod o fewn adran 1 neu adran 2 o'r rheol sefydlog hon, bydd darpariaethau'r

or those sections shall also apply to it except that: *adran honno neu'r adrannau hynny yn gymwys iddi hefyd ac eithrio:*

(a) the reference in paragraphs 23.1 and 23.5 to the provisions of paragraphs 22.2 to 22.30 shall be replaced by references to paragraphs 23.9 to 23.11E; and *(a) y bydd y cyfeiriad ym mharagraffau 23.1 a 23.5 at ddarpariaethau paragraffau 22.2 i 22.30 yn cael eu disodli gan gyfeiriadau at baragraffau 23.9 i 23.11E; a*

(b) in a case to which paragraphs 23.11A to 23.11E apply, paragraph 23.2 shall have effect as if for 'after the Assembly has been notified' there were substituted 'after that Assembly Secretary has been notified'. *(b) mewn achos lle y mae paragraffau 23.11A i 23.11E yn gymwys, bydd paragraff 23.2 yn cael effaith fel pe bai 'ar ôl i'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad gael ei hysbysu' yn cael ei roi yno yn lle 'ar ôl i'r Cynulliad gael ei hysbysu'.*

Provided that, on and after the 18 January 2002, for sub-paragraphs (a) and (b) of paragraph 23.12, substitute: *Ar yr amod, ar neu ar ôl 18 Ionawr 2002, yn lle is-baragraffau (a) a (b) o baragraff 23.12, y rhoddir yn eu lle:*

'the references in paragraphs 23.1 and 23.5 to the provisions of paragraphs 22.2 to 22.30 shall be replaced by references to paragraphs 23.9 to 23.11.' (NDM807) *'y bydd y cyfeiriadau ym mharagraffau 23.1 a 23.5 at ddarpariaethau paragraffau 22.2 i 22.30 yn cael eu disodli gan gyfeiriadau at baragraffau 23.9 i 23.11.'* (NDM807)

*Cynnig: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.47 p.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.47 p.m.*

**Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau o Ganlyniad i Ddiddymu'r Bwrdd Ymyrraeth
 Cynnyrch Amaethyddol a chreu'r Asiantaeth Taliadau Gwledig
 Transfer of Functions Resulting from the Dissolution of the Intervention Board
 for Agricultural Produce and the creation of the Rural Payment Agency**

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate to the First Minister all the functions of the National Assembly in or under:

(a) the Intervention Board for Agricultural Produce (Abolition) Regulations 2001 which, subject to the approval of the UK Parliament, is proposed to be made by the Secretary of State for the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs; and

(b) the National Assembly for Wales (Transfer of Functions) Order 2001, which subject to the approval of the UK Parliament, is proposed to be made by Her Majesty in Council, save those functions which by law cannot be so delegated.

Nothing in this motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of the Assembly Committees in the exercise of the above functions.

A copy of the draft of the Intervention Board for Agricultural Produce (Abolition) Regulations 2001 was laid in the Table Office on 22 October 2001.

A copy of the draft of the National Assembly

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan adran 62(1)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo i Brif Weinidog Cymru holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn neu o dan:

(a) the Intervention Board for Agricultural Produce (Abolition) Regulations 2001, y bwriedir, yn amodol ar gymeradwyaeth Senedd y DU, eu gwneud gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig; ac

(b) Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau) 2001, y bwriedir, yn amodol ar gymeradwyaeth Senedd y DU, ei wneud gan Ei Mawrhydi yn y Cyfrin Gyngor, ac eithrio'r swyddogaethau hynny na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo.

Ni fydd dim yn y cynnig hwn yn lleihau goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn, nac yn lleihau swyddogaeth Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad wrth arfer y swyddogaethau uchod.

Gosodwyd copi drafft o the Intervention Board for Agricultural Produce (Abolition) Regulations 2001 yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Hydref 2001.

Gosodwyd copi drafft o Orchymyn Cynulliad

for Wales (Transfer of Functions) Order 2001 was laid in the Table Office on 22 October 2001. (NDM802)

Cenedlaethol Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau) 2001 yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Hydref 2001. (NDM802)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: As there is a lot of business left for this afternoon and as several Members wish to speak, I ask them to be brief. I call on Janet Davies.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gan fod llawer o fusnes ar ôl ar gyfer y prynhawn yma a chan fod sawl Aelod am siarad, gofynnaf iddynt fod yn fyr. Galwaf ar Janet Davies.

Janet Davies: I think that there has been a mix-up. I am supposed to speak on the Welsh Administration Ombudsman's report.

Janet Davies: Credaf fod dryswch wedi bod. Yr wyf i fod i siarad am adroddiad Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call on Peter Rogers to speak.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf ar Peter Rogers i siarad.

Peter Rogers: The Conservative group will vote in favour of this motion. I know that the Minister will be sad to see the passing of the intervention board. It was always his first port of call when he was in buck-passing mode during the foot and mouth disease crisis. Will the Minister seek to influence the new agency's decisions more than he did those of the intervention board? For example, in June 1999, Welsh Office officials told the intervention board not to pay someone who was claiming under a selective cull scheme for a pedigree cow called Fidler's Van Blush, which was worth £4,500. The board ignored this and paid the wrong owner. Fortunately, 18 months later, I became involved and, by using milk records, was able to prove that the man who had been paid did not own the cow. This resulted in the owner, who is a constituent of mine, finally getting paid for her cow, 18 months later. However, the Minister refused to press for interest to be paid on money that she had had to wait 18 months to receive. He has continually refused to press the intervention board to recover the money paid to the wrong owner. This means that there was no reason to pay the first £4,500.

Peter Rogers: Bydd grŵp y Ceidwadwyr yn pleidleisio o blaid y cynnig hwn. Gwn y bydd y Gweinidog yn drist i weld y bwrdd ymyrraeth yn cael ei ddiddymu. Pan oedd yn taflu'r baich yn ystod argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, y bwrdd oedd ei ddewis cyntaf bob tro. A fydd y Gweinidog yn ceisio dylanwadu ar benderfyniadau'r asiantaeth newydd yn fwy nag y dylanwadodd ar benderfyniadau'r bwrdd ymyrraeth? Er enghraifft, ym Mehefin 1999, dywedodd swyddogion y Swyddfa Gymreig wrth y bwrdd ymyrraeth i beidio â thalu rhywun a oedd yn gwneud cais o dan gynllun difa dewisol am fuwch bedigrî o'r enw Fidler's Van Blush, a oedd yn werth £4,500. Anwybyddwyd y cyngor hwn gan y bwrdd a thalwyd y perchennog anghywir. Wrth lwc, 18 mis yn ddiweddarach, deuthum yn gysylltiedig â'r achos a, chan ddefnyddio'r cofnodion llaeth, llwyddais i brofi nad y dyn a gafodd ei dalu oedd biau'r fuwch. O ganlyniad i hyn, talwyd y perchennog, sef un o'm hetholwyr i, yn y diwedd, 18 mis yn ddiweddarach, am ei buwch. Fodd bynnag, gwrthododd y Gweinidog bwysu ar y bwrdd i dalu llog am yr arian yr oedd yn rhaid iddi aros 18 mis i'w gael. Mae wedi parhau i wrthod pwysu ar y bwrdd ymyrraeth i adennill yr arian a dalwyd i'r perchennog anghywir. Golyga hyn nad oedd rheswm dros dalu £4,500 yn yr achos cyntaf.

I hope that this will be a fresh start for the Minister and that he will keep a close eye on the agency's work so that we can influence events for the benefit of farmers in Wales and finally start to support the agriculture industry.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn dechrau o'r newydd yn sgîl hyn ac y bydd yn goruchwylio gwaith yr asiantaeth yn ofalus fel y gallwn ddylanwadu ar ddigwyddiadau er budd ffermwyr yng Nghymru gan ddechrau cefnogi'r diwydiant amaethyddiaeth o'r

diwedd.

Mick Bates: The Liberal Democrats welcome this motion. Given that the National Assembly has responsibility for agriculture, it is only right that these powers be transferred to the Assembly. In line with some of the Minister's recent statements, I hope that this will be a precedent for the transfer of animal health functions to the Assembly. I share Peter's view of the intervention board's actions, as there have been numerous cases of what appeared to be severe injustices for people who have come up against the board's bureaucracy. The Assembly proved, during the foot and mouth disease crisis, that it is more than capable of handling such matters. I am sure that the new payment agency will be run effectively.

Transferring these powers should ensure that there are fewer chiefs in the decision-making process. This should lead to a smoother and more straightforward process. I would like to hear the Minister's comments on whether it will be more effective. All in all, I hope that this will be of benefit to the farmers of Wales. I am sure that the experience of foot and mouth disease will mean that it most certainly will be.

Carwyn Jones: Passing these regulations will give us a greater say in how the rural payment agency is run. We were represented on the intervention board but had no control over its day-to-day running. That is similar in structure to a police authority, where, despite it being an authority, the day-to-day running is a matter for the chief constable. We are moving to rectify the matter. We will have some more control over how the system is organised. On Peter Rogers's point, the matter was originally brought to the attention of the Welsh Office in June 1999. I cannot comment on an individual matter. Sometimes when Peter asks me to act I can help, but sometimes what he asks me to do is illegal, and I am unable to act.

3:50 p.m.

Mick Bates: Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu'r cynnig hwn. O ystyried bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gyfrifol am amaethyddiaeth, nid yw ond yn briodol y dylai'r pwerau hyn gael eu trosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad. Yn unol â rhai o ddatganiadau diweddar y Gweinidog, gobeithiaf mai cynsail fydd hyn i drosglwyddo swyddogaethau iechyd anifeiliaid i'r Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â barn Peter am weithredoedd y bwrdd ymyrraeth, oherwydd bu nifer o achosion o anghyfiawnder difrifol yn ôl pob tebyg i bobl a wynebodd fiwrocraatiaeth y bwrdd. Profodd y Cynulliad, yn ystod argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, ei fod yn gallu trin materion o'r fath. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr asiantaeth taliadau newydd yn gweithredu'n effeithiol.

Dylai trosglwyddo'r pwerau hyn sicrhau bod llai o benaethiaid yn ymwneud â'r broses gwneud penderfyniadau. Dylai hyn arwain at broses llyfnach a symlach. Hoffwn glywed sylwadau'r Gweinidog ar pa un a fydd yn fwy effeithiol. At ei gilydd, gobeithiaf y bydd hyn o fudd i ffermwyr Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd profiad clwy'r traed a'r genau yn golygu y bydd o fudd iddynt yn bendant.

Carwyn Jones: Os caiff y rheoliadau hyn eu pasio, bydd yn rhoi mwy o reolaeth inni dros y ffordd y gweithredir yr asiantaeth taliadau gwledig. Cawsom ein cynrychioli ar y bwrdd ymyrraeth ond nid oedd rheolaeth gennym dros y gwaith o'i redeg o ddydd i ddydd. Mae'r strwythur hwnnw'n debyg i awdurdod yr heddlu, lle, er gwaethaf y ffaith mai awdurdod ydyw, y prif gwnstabl sy'n gyfrifol am ei redeg o ddydd i ddydd. Cymerwn gamau i unioni'r sefyllfa. Bydd gennym ryw faint yn fwy o reolaeth dros y ffordd y caiff y system ei threfnu. O ran pwynt Roger, tynnwyd y mater at sylw'r Swyddfa Gymreig yn gyntaf ym Mehefin 1999. Ni allaf ddweud dim am fater unigol. Weithiau, pan ofynna Peter imi weithredu, gallaf helpu, ond weithiau mae'n gofyn imi wneud rhywbeth anghyfreithlon ac ni allaf weithredu.

Cynnig: O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 34, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Adroddiad Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru ar gyfer 2000-01
The Welsh Administration Ombudsman's Report of 2000-01

The Minister for Assembly Business Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigaf fod
(**Andrew Davies**): I propose that

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.5, notes the report of the Welsh Administration Ombudsman for 2000-01, laid in the Table Office on 9 October 2001, with personal copies provided to Assembly Members. (NDM803)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.5, yn nodi adroddiad Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru ar gyfer 2000-01, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Hydref 2001, gan ddarparu copiâu personol ar gyfer Aelodau'r Cynulliad. (NDM803)

I am sure that Members wish to join me in welcoming the second annual report of the Welsh Administration Ombudsman. As you can see from the personal copies that you

Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yr Aelodau yn awyddus i ymuno â mi i groesawu ail adroddiad blynyddol Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru. Fe welwch o'r copiâu

received earlier this month, the 2000-01 annual report is a joint one on the performance of the functions of the office of the Welsh Administration Ombudsman and of the Health Service Commissioner for Wales. Mr Buckley was appointed as the first Welsh Administration Ombudsman and has brought from his other office as the Parliamentary Ombudsman and Health Service Commissioner for England and Scotland—a wealth of experience, which I know we all value, in the investigation of complaints, not only about the Assembly's administrative actions but also about refusal to disclose information under our Code of Practice on Public Access to Information.

In last year's report, Mr Buckley recognised how important it was that the Welsh Administration Ombudsman should not simply follow the practices established by the Public Sector Ombudsman in England, that the office of the Welsh Administration Ombudsman should, over time, develop its own best practices to best meet the needs and circumstances of Wales. With that in mind, and to gain experience of the devolved administration, the ombudsman lowered the evidential hurdle that needs to be overcome by the public before a decision is made on whether to investigate a complaint.

In closing last year's debate, I said that I looked forward to developments, albeit with some nervousness, as I envisaged that this bias towards investigation might lead to an increase in the number of complaints being taken up for investigation. I am pleasantly surprised that, not only has there been a drop in the number of complaints made to the ombudsman, but even fewer complaints have been taken up for investigation. I am sure that that reflects improvements in the Assembly's delivery of services and the improved handling and resolution of complaints received.

Dafydd Wigley: Can we be confident that that interpretation is correct—that there has been a reduction in the number of cases which need to be investigated rather than a loss of confidence in going to the ombudsman because people feel that they are

personol a gawsoch yn gynharach y mis hwn mai adroddiad ar y cyd ar berfformiad swyddogaethau swydd Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru a Chomisiynydd y Gwasanaeth Iechyd ar gyfer Cymru yw adroddiad blynyddol 2000-01. Penodwyd Mr Buckley fel Ombwdsmon cyntaf Gweinyddiaeth Cymru a daeth â chyfoeth o brofiad i'r swydd hon yn sgîl ei swydd arall fel yr Ombwdsmon Seneddol a Chomisiynydd y Gwasanaeth Iechyd ar gyfer Lloegr a'r Alban—ac yr ydym oll yn gwerthfawrogi hynny, wrth iddo ymchwilio i gwynion, nid yn unig ar gamau gweinyddol y Cynulliad ond hefyd ynghylch gwrthod datgelu gwybodaeth o dan ein Cod Ymarfer ar Fynediad Cyhoeddus i Wybodaeth.

Yn adroddiad y llynedd, cydnabu Mr Buckley bwysigrwydd y ffaith y dylai Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru wneud mwy na dilyn yr arferion a sefydlwyd gan Ombwdsmon y Sector Cyhoeddus yn Lloegr, ac y dylai swydd Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru ddatblygu, dros amser, ei arferion gorau ei hun i fodloni anghenion ac amgylchiadau Cymru yn y ffordd orau. Gyda hynny mewn cof, ac er mwyn meithrin profiad yn y weinyddiaeth ddatganoledig, lleihaodd yr ombwdsmon y rhwystr tystiolaethol y mae angen i'r cyhoedd ei oresgyn cyn gwneud penderfyniad ar p'un a ddylid ymchwilio i gwyn.

Wrth gloi'r ddadl y llynedd, dywedais fy mod yn edrych ymlaen i'r datblygiadau, er gyda pheth ansicrwydd, am fy mod wedi rhagweld y gallai'r duedd hon tuag at ymchwiliad arwain at gynnydd yn nifer y cwynion yr ymchwilir iddynt. Cefais fy siomi ar yr ochr orau nid yn unig o weld gostyngiad yn nifer y cwynion a wnaethpwyd i'r ombwdsmon ond hefyd o weld yr ymchwiliwyd i lai o gwynion. Yr wyf yn sicr bod hynny'n adlewyrchu gwelliannau yn null y Cynulliad o gyflwyno gwasanaethau a'r gwelliannau a wnaethpwyd i'r dull o ddelio â chwynion a dderbyniwyd a'u datrys.

Dafydd Wigley: A allwn fod yn sicr bod y dehongliad hwnnw'n gywir—y gwelwyd gostyngiad yn nifer yr achosion y mae angen ymchwilio iddynt yn hytrach na cholli hyder mewn cysylltu â'r ombwdsmon am fod pobl o'r farn nad ydynt yn cael y canlyniadau yr

not getting the results they want? I have no evidence of that, but the question needs to be asked.

Andrew Davies: I have no evidence either, but given that it was essentially the same system—although we reduced the evidential hurdle that needed to be overcome—it seems that the reduction in the number of complaints reflects the fact that there are fewer to be made and that the system is working. Clearly, we will need to review the matter in the future to see if the system is indeed working and to ensure that people have faith in it. If they do not trust the system, it is clearly not working.

It is also important to remember that the Welsh Administration Ombudsman is much more accessible to members of the public than is the ombudsman in England. In Wales, members of the public can complain directly to the Welsh Administration Ombudsman without having to enlist the support of an elected Assembly Member. I am proud that Wales has taken the lead in having a fully accessible ombudsman service in place. I am pleased that other administrations are now following our lead. In July of this year, England announced that it would also be removing the need for members of the public to go through a Member of Parliament.

In last year's report, Mr Buckley emphasised the high number of complaints and investigations relating to agriculture matters. In this year's report, while agriculture still accounts for a large proportion of the complaints made against the Assembly—and you will see that in the report—Mr Buckley noted that they only accounted for 17 per cent of his workload compared with 37 per cent last year. While the number of agriculture complaints is still too high, we must acknowledge that work practices are already changing for the better and that is reflected in the 20 per cent reduction in agriculture cases that are being dealt with.

As part of our agriculture department's JIGSAW initiative—and members of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee will be aware of this—an

oeddent am eu cael? Nid oes gennyf dystiolaeth o hynny, ond mae angen gofyn y cwestiwn.

Andrew Davies: Nid oes gennyf innau dystiolaeth ychwaith, ond o ystyried mai'r un system ydoedd yn ei hanfod—er ein bod wedi lleihau'r rhwystr tystiolaethol yr oedd angen ei oresgyn—ymddengys fod y gostyngiad yn nifer y cwynion yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith bod llai o gwynion i'w gwneud a bod y system yn llwyddo. Yn amlwg, bydd angen inni adolygu'r mater yn y dyfodol i weld a yw'r system yn llwyddo ac er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn ymddiried ynddi. Os nad ydynt yn ymddiried yn y system, mae'n amlwg nad yw'n llwyddo.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig cofio bod Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru yn llawer mwy hygyrch i'r cyhoedd, o'i gymharu â'r ombwdsmon yn Lloegr. Yng Nghymru, gall y cyhoedd gwyno'n uniongyrchol i Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru heb orfod sicrhau cefnogaeth Aelod etholedig o'r Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn falch bod Cymru wedi arloesi wrth roi gwasanaeth ombwdsmon hygyrch ar waith. Mae'n bleser gweld bod gweinyddiaethau eraill bellach yn dilyn ein hesiampl. Ym mis Gorffennaf eleni, cyhoeddodd Lloegr y byddai hithau hefyd yn diddymu'r angen i'r cyhoedd orfod gweithredu drwy Aelod Seneddol.

Yn adroddiad y llynedd, pwysleisiodd Mr Buckley y nifer fawr o gwynion ac ymchwiliadau a oedd yn gysylltiedig â materion amaethyddol. Yn adroddiad eleni, er bod amaethyddiaeth yn cynrychioli cyfran fawr o'r cwynion a wnaethpwyd yn erbyn y Cynulliad—ac fe welwch hynny yn yr adroddiad—dywedodd Mr Buckley mai dim ond 17 y cant o'i faich gwaith yr oeddent yn ei gynrychioli o'i gymharu â 37 y cant y llynedd. Er bod nifer y cwynion amaethyddol yn parhau i fod yn ormod, rhaid inni gydnabod bod arferion gwaith eisoes yn newid er gwell ac adlewyrchir hynny yn y gostyngiad o 20 y cant yn yr achosion amaethyddol yr ymdrinnir â hwy.

Fel rhan o fenter JIGSAW ein hadran amaethyddiaeth—a bydd aelodau'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yn ymwybodol o hynny—bydd gweithdrefn

independent appeals procedure for Welsh farmers to appeal against decisions made on subsidy claims will be in place from 31 October. Once again, I am sure that you will agree that this is another positive step forward in the Assembly's commitment to deal more effectively with appeals and complaints from our customers.

This year's report draws on three main themes. First, the impact of the National Assembly's code of practice on complaints. Secondly, the review of the public sector ombudsmen services in Wales and, thirdly, developing policy relating to vexatious and unreasonably persistent complaints. I begin with the impact of the Assembly's code of practice on complaints. The Welsh Administration Ombudsman reports that he only received 49 complaints this year, which is fewer than the previous year. He goes on to say that while the reason for the decline in numbers is not known, he acknowledges that the National Assembly for Wales issued its code of practice on complaints in 2000 and 2001 and that complaints are possibly being better handled by the Assembly as a result. Obviously, mistakes can and do happen. However, it is essential that we learn from these mistakes and ensure that they are not repeated. I am pleased that the Welsh Administration Ombudsman's report indicates that we are doing this and I am sure that the policies that we have put in place to improve the handling of complaints has contributed to that.

Secondly, the review of the public sector ombudsman in Wales. In last year's report, the ombudsman referred to the review of the public sector ombudsman in England and the publication of the Collcutt report. I am pleased to say that on 20 March this year the Secretary of State for Wales and the National Assembly for Wales announced that we will be jointly undertaking a similar review of ombudsman services in Wales. The Welsh Administration Ombudsman and the Assembly look forward to the outcome of that review and working together to take forward any result of recommendations for the future of these services in Wales.

apelio annibynnol a fydd yn galluogi ffermwyr Cymru i apelio yn erbyn penderfyniadau a wnaethpwyd ar geisiadau am gymorthdaliadau mewn grym o 31 Hydref. Unwaith eto, yr wyf yn sicr y cytunwch fod hyn yn gam cadarnhaol ymlaen o ran ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i ddelio ag apeliadau a chwynion gan ein cwsmeriaid yn fwy effeithiol.

Mae adroddiad eleni yn tynnu ar dair prif thema. Yn gyntaf, effaith côd ymarfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar gwynion. Yn ail, adolygiad o wasanaethau ombwdsmon y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ac, yn drydydd, datblygu polisi sy'n ymwneud â chwynion sy'n bla ac yn cael eu hailadrodd yn afresymol o aml. Dechreuaf gydag effaith côd ymarfer y Cynulliad ar gwynion. Dywed Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru mai dim ond 49 o gwynion a dderbyniodd eleni, sy'n llai na'r nifer a gafodd y llynedd. Dywed hefyd er nad yw'n hysbys beth yw'r rheswm dros y gostyngiad yn y niferoedd, ei fod yn cydnabod i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gyhoeddi ei gôd ymarfer ar gwynion yn 2000 ac 2001 a bod y Cynulliad o bosibl yn ymdrin â chwynion yn well o ganlyniad. Yn amlwg, gall camgymeriadau ddigwydd ac maent yn digwydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn dysgu o'r camgymeriadau hynny ac yn sicrhau nad ydynt yn digwydd eto. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod adroddiad Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru yn nodi ein bod yn gwneud hyn ac yr wyf yn sicr bod y polisiau sydd gennym ar waith i wella'r broses o ymdrin â chwynion wedi cyfrannu at hynny.

Yn ail, yr adolygiad o ombwdsmon y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Yn adroddiad y llynedd, cyfeiriodd yr ombwdsmon at adolygiad ombwdsmon y sector cyhoeddus yn Lloegr a chyhoeddi adroddiad Collcutt. Mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gyhoeddi ar 20 Mawrth eleni y byddwn yn cynnal adolygiad tebyg ar y cyd o wasanaethau'r ombwdsmon yng Nghymru. Mae Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru a'r Cynulliad yn edrych ymlaen at weld canlyniad yr adolygiad hwnnw a'r cydweithio hwnnw er mwyn datblygu unrhyw argymhellion a fydd yn deillio o hynny ar gyfer dyfodol y gwasanaethau hyn

yng Nghymru.

Thirdly, vexatious and unreasonably persistent complainants—and I am not drawing attention to any of my Assembly colleagues in this matter—I am pleased that the Welsh Administration Ombudsman has recognised that while most complainants behave entirely reasonably, a few do not. A time may come, even with a complaint presented in a reasonable and courteous manner, when it must be accepted that no purpose will be served by further exchanges. The Welsh Administration Ombudsman, as I am sure we are all aware, is conscious of the fact that his office and all organisations need to be mindful that they have responsibilities to their staff and to others who use those services as well as to the complainants themselves. He welcomes the fact that a growing number of organisations are devising policies for managing such situations. However, he notes that it is desirable that any restriction placed on complainants should be the result of fair and consistent policy and a complainant should only be regarded as vexatious or unreasonably persistent if there are good reasons for doing so and not just because they are forceful or determined. We will give serious consideration to developing a policy on handling these types of complaints as part of the review of our code of practice and complaints later this year.

I began by welcoming the report. Some might say that to welcome a report that deals with complaints about the Assembly, whether justified or not, is an unusual thing to do. However, I prefer to look at the ombudsman's work in a positive light. I know that my Cabinet colleagues and the Permanent Secretary share that view. I also know that the Permanent Secretary takes the Welsh Administration Ombudsman's inquiries and criticisms seriously and will continue to do everything that he can to ensure that the Assembly learns from its mistakes and improves areas of weakness.

Naturally, we would have preferred if the Welsh Administration Ombudsman had felt unable to uphold any of the complaints, but I

Yn drydydd, cwynion sy'n bla ac yn cael eu hailadrodd yn afresymol o aml —ac nid wyf yn tynnu sylw at unrhyw rai o'm cyd-Aelodau yn y Cynulliad yn y mater hwn—yr wyf yn falch o weld bod Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru wedi cydnabod, er bod y rhan fwyaf o achwynwyr yn ymddwyn yn gwbl rhesymol, fod nifer fach ohonynt nad ydynt. Efallai y daw cyfnod, hyd yn oed pan gyflwynir cwyn mewn modd rhesymol a chwrtais, pan fo'n rhaid derbyn na fydd unrhyw bwrpas trafod ymhellach. Mae Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru, fel y gŵyr pob un ohonom, yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod angen i'w swyddfa a'r holl sefydliadau fod yn ymwybodol o'u cyfrifoldebau i'w staff ac i eraill sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau hynny yn ogystal â chyfrifoldebau i'r achwynwyr eu hunain. Mae'n croesawu'r ffaith bod nifer cynyddol o sefydliadau yn dyfeisio polisiau ar gyfer rheoli sefyllfaoedd o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, dywed y dylai unrhyw gyfyngiad a roddir ar achwynwyr ddeillio o bolisi teg a chyson a dim ond os oes rhesymau da dros wneud felly y dylid ystyried bod ymddygiad achwynnydd yn flinderus neu'n afresymol o daer, nid dim ond am eu bod yn ymddwyn yn egniol neu benderfynol. Byddwn yn rhoi ystyriaeth ddwys i ddatblygu polisi ar ddelio â'r mathau hyn o gwynion fel rhan o'r broses o adolygu ein cod ymarfer a chwynion yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Dechreuais drwy groesawu'r adroddiad. Byddai rhai'n dweud bod croesawu adroddiad sy'n delio â chwynion am y Cynulliad, ai teg ai peidio, yn beth anarferol i'w wneud. Fodd bynnag, mae'n well gennyf edrych ar waith yr ombwdsman o safbwynt cadarnhaol. Gwn fod fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet a'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol o'r un farn. Gwn hefyd fod yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol yn ystyried ymholiadau a beirniadaethau Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru o ddifrif ac y bydd yn parhau i wneud popeth o fewn ei allu i sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn dysgu o'i gamgymeriadau ac yn gwella meysydd lle ceir gwendid.

Yn naturiol, byddai'n well gennym pe na bai Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru wedi gallu cadarnhau unrhyw rai o'r cwynion, ond

do not consider our record in the last year to be a bad one.

4:00 p.m.

Janet Davies: In noting the report, Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales appreciates the better standard of work that has been achieved by amalgamating the offices of the Welsh Administration Ombudsman and the Health Service Ombudsman for Wales. We note that agriculture is still the biggest single area of complaint, which perhaps is not surprising as it involves grants that are administered by complex rules. I recognised in this report the case that my colleague, Peter Rogers, raised about the cow with the memorable name—which I am afraid I have forgotten. The rules are complex and difficult to administer. The staff are conscientious and do their best. When I was a member of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee we visited some of the Assembly's regional offices and saw that the staff were dedicated to their jobs. It is difficult to check on livestock, particularly sheep that roam freely on the mountains.

I am pleased that the complaints about central Government have been dropped. However—to take on board Dafydd Wigley's point—we must ensure that people have confidence in the system. The concept of maladministration is not easily understood, which is a problem. It gets mixed up with questions about policy and rules. People might not like the rules but if they do not, that is not maladministration. There is also confusion regarding which bodies deal with different complaints. For example, the office of the Local Government Ombudsman for Wales is separate. I am not sure whether a one-stop shop would be a better option, because that could give the impression that we have a monolithic bureaucracy. It may be worth considering that option, but I have no definite views on that at the moment.

More clear information is needed. Stronger efforts must also be made to ensure that people do not misunderstand the thrust of letters. One of my constituents received from the Local Government Ombudsman a letter

nid wyf o'r farn bod ein record y llynedd yn wael.

Janet Davies: Wrth nodi'r adroddiad, mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn gwerthfawrogi'r safonau gwaith gwell a gyflawnwyd drwy gyfuno swyddfeydd Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru ac Ombwdsmon y Gwasanaeth Iechyd dros Gymru. Nodwn mai amaethyddiaeth yw'r maes unigol lle ceir y mwyaf o gwynion o hyd ac efallai nad yw hynny'n syndod am ei fod yn ymwneud â grantiau a weinyddir drwy reolau cymhleth. Gwelais yn yr adroddiad hwn yr achos a gododd fy nghyd-Aelod, Peter Rogers, yngylch y fuwch â'r enw cofiadwy—na allaf ei gofio yn anffodus. Mae'r rheolau yn gymhleth ac yn anodd i'w gweinyddu. Mae'r staff yn gydwybodol ac yn gwneud eu gorau. Pan oeddwn yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ymwelaisom â rhai o swyddfeydd rhanbarthol y Cynulliad a gwelsom fod y staff yn ymrwymedig i'w swyddi. Mae'n anodd cadw golwg ar dda byw, yn arbennig defaid sy'n crwydro'r mynyddoedd.

Yr wyf yn falch y cafodd y cwynion ynghylch y Llywodraeth ganolog eu tynnu yn ôl. Fodd bynnag—gan drafod pwynt Dafydd Wigley—rhaid inni sicrhau bod gan bobl hyder yn y system. Nid yw'r cysyniad o gamweinyddu yn hawdd i'w ddeall, sy'n broblem. Mae pobl yn ei ddrysu â chwestiynau ar bolisi a rheolau. Efallai nad yw pobl yn hoffi'r rheolau ond os nad ydynt yn eu hoffi, nid camweinyddiaeth mo hynny. Ceir dryswch hefyd ynghylch pa gyrff sy'n delio â gwahanol gwynion. Er enghraifft, mae swyddfa Ombwdsmon Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn gorff ar wahân. Nid wyf yn siŵr a fyddai cael siop un-stop yn opsiwn gwell, oherwydd gallai hynny greu'r argraff bod gennym fiwrocratiaeth unffurf. Hwyrach y byddai'n werth ystyried yr opsiwn hwnnw, ond nid oes gennyf safbwynt pendant ar hynny ar hyn o bryd.

Mae angen mwy o wybodaeth glir. Hefyd rhaid gwneud mwy o ymdrech i sicrhau nad yw pobl yn camddeall byrdwn llythyron. Derbyniodd un o'm hetholwyr lythyr gan Ombwdsmon Llywodraeth Leol yn nodi nad

stating that he did not think he could pursue her complaint but would consider it should anything further arise. My constituent felt so put down by that reply that she did not pursue her complaint. However, in my opinion she had a case.

Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales welcomes the guidelines on vexatious complaints. We recognise the problems. However, it is good that guidelines are in place to ensure that all complaints are considered properly, even new ones about issues considered previously or ones from frequent or aggressive complainers. It is important that all complaints be dealt with professionally and with consideration.

Any system can be improved. I fully acknowledge the efforts that are being made. However, a high percentage of complaints are not being investigated, for simple reasons such as complainants approaching the wrong bodies or not complaining about administrative actions. Efforts must continue to create a clear, simple and accessible system. That would not only help the complainers, but also the ombudsman's office, because it would reduce the feelings of grievance that can sometimes occur when complaints cannot be dealt with.

Peter Black: I welcome this report. The ombudsman's role in ensuring that people get treated fairly by public bodies is important. It is a shame that this important debate is not of interest to the majority of Members, who have left the Chamber for legitimate reasons. The National Assembly is dedicated to ensuring that people receive the services that they pay for. The Welsh Administration Ombudsman ensures that those services are delivered in a fair and consistent way and are administered properly. That is what makes this report important.

As Members, we have all come across consistent complainers. In many instances, many of those complainers have valid cases, but it is difficult to resolve them, either because of how complaints have been dealt with in the past or because it is too late and not possible to go back and undo what has

oedd yn credu y gallai weithredu ar ei chwyn ond y byddai'n ei hystyried pe byddai unrhyw beth pellach yn codi. Yr oedd fy etholwr wedi'i siomi cymaint â'r ateb fel nad oedd am weithredu ar ei chwyn. Fodd bynnag, yn fy marn i, yr oedd ganddi achos.

Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn croesawu'r canllawiau ar gwynion sy'n flinderus. Yr ydym yn cydnabod y problemau. Fodd bynnag, mae'n dda bod canllawiau ar waith i sicrhau y rhoddir ystyriaeth briodol i gwynion, hyd yn oed rhai newydd ynglŷn â materion a ystyriwyd o'r blaen neu gwynion gan achwynwyr sy'n cwyno'n aml neu'n ffyrnig. Mae'n bwysig y caiff pob cwyn ei thrin yn broffesiynol a chydag ystyriaeth deg.

Gellir gwella ar unrhyw system. Yr wyf yn cydnabod yn llwyr yr ymdrechion a wneir. Fodd bynnag, nid ymchwilir i gyfran uchel o gwynion, am resymau syml megis achwynwyr yn cysylltu â'r cyrff anghywir neu beidio â chwyno am gamau gweinyddol. Rhaid parhau â'r ymdrechion i greu system glir, syml a hygyrch. Byddai hynny nid yn unig yn fanteisiol i'r achwynwyr, ond hefyd i swyddfa'r ombwdsmon, gan y byddai'n lleihau'r ymdeimlad o feirniadaeth a all godi weithiau pan na ellir delio â chwynion.

Peter Black: Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn. Mae rôl yr ombwdsmon wrth geisio sicrhau bod cyrff cyhoeddus yn trin pobl yn deg yn un bwysig. Gresynnaf nad yw'r ddadl bwysig hon o ddifrif i fwyafrif yr Aelodau, sydd wedi gadael y Siambr am resymau cyfiawn. Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau bod pobl yn derbyn y gwasanaethau y maent yn talu amdanynt. Mae Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru yn sicrhau y caiff y gwasanaethau hynny eu cyflwyno mewn ffordd deg a chyson ac y cânt eu gweinyddu'n briodol. Dyna sy'n gwneud yr adroddiad hwn yn bwysig.

Fel Aelodau, yr ydym oll wedi dod ar draws achwynwyr sy'n cwyno'n gyson. Mae gan nifer o'r achwynwyr hyn achosion dilys ar sawl achlysur, ond mae'n anodd eu datrys, naill ai oherwydd y ffordd yr ymdriniwyd â chwynion yn y gorffennol neu am ei bod yn rhy hwyr ac nid yw'n bosibl dadwneud yr

already been done. Many of those persistent complainers have taken their cases to the ombudsman and have found that that route is also blocked, often for the same reasons. The ombudsman may consider the case to be outside his jurisdiction; the complainers may not have followed the correct route or, perhaps, the case cannot be resolved. I support Janet's comments on clear information. Bodies such as the independent appeals panel, which is being established for agriculture by this Government, are important as they seek to reconcile disputes before they reach the stage of being referred to the ombudsman. If we can establish a pattern in the complaints the ombudsman has rejected, we may find other ways of resolving those complaints so that the ombudsman does not reject as many, for whatever reason, in future.

William Graham: The Welsh Conservative group welcomes the Welsh Administration Ombudsman's report. It outlines the nature of casework during the past year, and the changes that are being made to revise the organisation and its procedures in order to improve efficiency. We praise the integration policy that allows for staff in the Cardiff office to be trained to deal with complaints to the Health Service Ombudsman for Wales and the Welsh Administration Ombudsman. We welcome this sensibly applied integration and support the reasoning behind it. It is in stark contrast to the First Minister's efforts in juggling all his official and acquired positions.

We support the sentiment expressed by the ombudsman that it is inevitable that his investigations will disclose shortcomings and that:

'it is relatively uncommon that such shortcomings are the fault of individual members of staff: much more often, they are the result of deficiencies in systems or shortage of resources'.

We also recognise the fact that the majority of the staff employed by the bodies within his jurisdiction, and throughout the Assembly's

hyn a wnaethpwyd eisoes. Mae nifer o'r achwynwyr cyson hyn wedi cyflwyno eu hachosion i'r ombwdsmon ac wedi canfod y rhwystr ar y llwybr hwnnw hefyd, am yr un rhesymau'n aml. Gall yr ombwdsmon ystyried bod yr achos y tu hwnt i'w awdurdodaeth; efallai na fydd yr achwynwyr wedi dilyn y llwybr cywir neu, efallai na ellir datrys yr achos. Cefnogaf sylwadau Janet ar wybodaeth glir. Mae cyrff fel y panel apeliadau annibynnol, sy'n cael ei sefydlu ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth gan y Llywodraeth hon, yn bwysig am eu bod yn ceisio datrys anghydfodau cyn iddynt gyrraedd y pwynt o gael eu cyfeirio at yr ombwdsmon. Os gallwn sefydlu patrwm yn y cwynion a wrthodwyd gan yr ombwdsmon, efallai y canfyddwn ffyrdd eraill o ddatrys y cwynion hynny er mwyn i'r ombwdsmon beidio â gwrthod cymaint ohonynt, am ba bynnag reswm, yn y dyfodol.

William Graham: Mae grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n croesawu adroddiad Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru. Mae'n amlinellu natur y gwaith achos yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, a'r newidiadau sy'n cael eu gwneud i ddiwygio'r sefydliad a'i weithdrefnau er mwyn gwella effeithlonrwydd. Canmolwn y polisi integreiddio sy'n caniatáu i staff yn swyddfa Caerdydd gael eu hyfforddi i ddelio â chwynion i Ombwdsmon y Gwasanaeth Iechyd i Gymru ac Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru. Croesawn y broses integreiddio hon a gyflwynwyd yn synhwyrol a chefnogwn y rhesymeg y tu ôl iddi. Mae hyn yn cyferbynnu'n llwyr ag ymdrechion Prif Weinidog Cymru i geisio ymdopi â'i swyddogaethau swyddogol a chaffaeledig.

Cefnogwn y farn a fynegwyd gan yr ombwdsmon sef ei bod yn anochel y bydd ei ymchwiliadau'n datgelu diffygion a'i bod:

'mae'n weddol anghyffredin mai bai aelodau unigol o staff fydd diffygion o'r fath: yn llawer mwy aml, maent o ganlyniad i ddiffygion mewn systemau neu brinder adnoddau'.

Yr ydym hefyd yn cydnabod y ffaith bod mwyafrif y staff a gyflogir gan y cyrff o fewn ei awdurdodaeth, a thrwy holl swyddfeydd y

offices, are devoted public servants, who do their jobs extremely well.

We note the procedures that have been introduced to allow for a wider range of responses to complaints, matching outcomes to the circumstances of the case. We note in particular that further inquiries can be made to the Assembly, or the agencies concerned, as an alternative to starting a statutory investigation. That often results in an appropriate outcome for the complainant, and complainants and the bodies which are complained about evidently appreciate the benefits of that approach.

We also share the ombudsman's hopes that, as a result of the National Assembly's Code of Practice on Complaints issued last year, complaints are being resolved without being referred to the ombudsman. That will be particularly welcome in regard to complaints about the non-payment of agricultural subsidies.

To give an example that departs from my previous remark slightly, in Newport—and I declare an interest as a member of Newport County Borough Council—the number of cases cited in the press increased by 81 per cent. In reality, that meant that there were 22 more cases. Of the total of 40 cases, only 32 were investigated, due to lack of evidence in the other cases.

We fully support the ombudsman's desire to continue to increase awareness about his office's functions and activities. We hope that during this year, he will extend his initiative of publishing newsletters on his work as Health Service Ombudsman for Wales to cover his activities as Welsh Administration Ombudsman.

More investigation should be carried out into local authority practices on housing and planning. The ombudsman has no jurisdiction over some important aspects about which complaints have been made, including prefabricated reinforced concrete homes. I am grateful to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities for her interest in that earlier this year and the

Cynulliad, yn weision cyhoeddus ymrwymedig, sy'n gwneud eu swyddi'n hynod dda.

Nodwn y gweithdrefnau a gyflwynwyd i ganiatáu amrywiaeth ehangach o ymatebion i gwynion, gan gyd-weddu canlyniadau ag amgylchiadau'r achos. Nodwn yn arbennig y gellir gwneud ymholiadau pellach i'r Cynulliad, neu i'r asiantaethau dan sylw, fel dewis amgen i ddechrau ymchwiliad statudol. Mae hynny yn aml yn arwain at ganlyniad priodol i'r achwynydd ac ymddengys fod yr achwynwyr a'r cyrff y gwneir cwyn amdanynt yn gwerthfawrogi manteision yr ymagwedd honno.

Yr ydym hefyd yn rhannu gobeithion yr ombwdsmon y caiff cwynion eu datrys heb gael eu cyfeirio iddo, o ganlyniad i Gôd Ymarfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar Gwynion a gyhoeddwyd y llynedd. Bydd hynny'n arbennig o fanteisiol o ran cwynion ynglŷn â chymorthdaliadau amaethyddol nas telir.

I roi enghraifft sy'n gwyro rhywfaint oddi wrth fy sylw blaenorol, yng Nghasnewydd—a datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Casnewydd—cynyddodd nifer yr achosion a nodwyd gan y wasg o 81 y cant. Mewn gwirionedd, golygodd hynny fod 22 o achosion ychwanegol. O'r cyfanswm o 40 achos, ymchwiliwyd i ddim ond 32 ohonynt, oherwydd diffyg tystiolaeth yn yr achosion eraill.

Cefnogwn yn llwyr ddymuniad yr ombwdsmon i barhau i godi ymwybyddiaeth ynglŷn â swyddogaethau a gweithgareddau ei swyddfa. Gobeithiwn y bydd yn datblygu ei fenter o gyhoeddi cylchlythyrau ar ei waith fel Ombwdsmon y Gwasanaeth Iechyd dros Gymru eleni i gynnwys ei weithgareddau fel Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru.

Dylid cynnal mwy o ymchwiliadau i arferion awdurdodau lleol ym meysydd tai a chynllunio. Nid oes gan yr ombwdsmon unrhyw awdurdodaeth dros rai agweddau pwysig y gwneir cwynion yn eu cylch, gan gynnwys tai parod concriid a atgyfnerthwyd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau am fynegi diddordeb yn hynny'n gynharach eleni

remedial action that she took on that issue.

ac am y camau unioni a gymerodd ar y mater hwnnw.

One way of increasing awareness about the work of the ombudsman's office would be to increase the influence of his considerations by allowing him to penalise those found at fault in a way that reflects the level of maladministration. The Assembly must consider introducing, at the first opportunity, legislation that will give powers to the Welsh Administration Ombudsman to impose penalties to ensure that organisations respond to the statutory investigations' findings. A letter of apology and a cheque for £150 is no compensation for the mental anguish and strain that can result from pursuing a grievance to its bitter end. The ombudsman must have the power to penalise organisations effectively whenever a complaint against them is upheld. Only when the ombudsman can force an organisation to adhere to his recommendations, or impose penalties that really bite on those organisations found to be at fault, will we have an ombudsman with the ability to effectively oversee a reduction in maladministration in public bodies in Wales.

Un ffordd o gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth ynglŷn â gwaith swyddfa'r ombwdsmon fyddai cynyddu dylanwad ei ystyriaethau drwy ganiatáu iddo gosbi'r rhai y canfyddir eu bod ar fai mewn ffordd sy'n adlewyrchu lefel y camweinyddu. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad ystyried cyflwyno deddfwriaeth ar y cyfle cyntaf posibl a fydd yn rhoi pwerau i Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru i bennu cosbau er mwyn sicrhau bod sefydliadau yn ymateb i gasgliadau'r ymchwiliadau statudol. Nid yw llythyr yn ymddiheuro a siec am £150 yn iawndal am y poen meddwl a'r straen y gall dilyn cwyn i'w diwedd ei achosi. Rhaid i'r ombwdsmon feddu ar y pŵer i gosbi sefydliadau'n effeithiol pan gadarnheir cwyn yn eu herbyn. Dim ond pan all yr ombwdsmon orfodi sefydliad i ddilyn ei argymhellion, neu pan all bennu cosbau sy'n cael effaith wirioneddol ar y sefydliadau hynny y canfyddir eu bod ar fai, y bydd gennym ombwdsmon sy'n meddu ar y gallu i oruchwylio proses o leihau camweinyddiaeth mewn cyrff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn effeithiol.

4:10 p.m.

Alison Halford: I, too, welcome Michael Buckley's report, although not as positively as some of my colleagues. The ombudsman, as we all know, plays a key role in maintaining standards. The Assembly's departments and its sponsored public bodies have a duty to be open, accountable and transparent, and any failure in that must be swiftly tackled. I will limit my comments to what I believe is the way forward for the ombudsman. I may be critical in parts, but I only wish to flag up these issues so that improvements can be made in order to serve the public better.

Alison Halford: Yr wyf innau hefyd yn croesawu adroddiad Michael Buckley, er nid yr un mor frwdfrydig â rhai o'm cyd-Aelodau. Mae'r ombwdsmon, fel y gwyddom, yn chwarae rôl allweddol o ran cynnal safonau. Mae dyletswydd ar adrannau'r Cynulliad a'i gyrff cyhoeddus i fod yn agored, yn atebol ac yn dryloyw, a dylid mynd i'r afael ag unrhyw fethiant yn hynny o beth yn gyflym. Cyfyngaf fy sylwadau i'r hyn y credaf yw'r ffordd ymlaen i'r ombwdsmon. Efallai y byddaf yn feirniadol mewn manau, ond dim ond amlygu'r materion hyn a wnaif fel y gellir gwneud gwelliannau er mwyn gwasanaethu'r cyhoedd yn well.

Many Members have already touched on the fact that last year many complaints were not investigated because they fell outside Mr Buckley's jurisdiction. The year before, it was even worse. That backs up my long-held belief that the public is confused by exactly who does what. Mr Buckley's considerable

Mae sawl Aelod eisoes wedi crybwyll y ffaith nad ymchwiliwyd i nifer o gwynion y llynedd am eu bod y tu allan i awdurdodaeth Mr Buckley. Y flwyddyn flaenorol, yr oedd y sefyllfa'n waeth byth. Mae hynny'n ategu yr hyn yr wyf wedi ei gredu ers tro, sef na wŷr y cyhoedd beth yn union a wneir gan bwy. Nid

number of titles does not help matters. I remind you of them: Welsh Administration Ombudsman, Health Service Ombudsman for Wales, Parliamentary Commissioner for Administration, Scottish Parliamentary Ombudsman, Health Service Ombudsman for England, and Scottish Health Service Ombudsman. To the novice, the titles would appear to belong to different people, but they all in fact belong to just one person. No-one should worry about having more than one job—but six? Sceptics may mutter that Mr Buckley is a one-person quango.

There is no evidence to suggest that he is not managing to do all these jobs well. That concerns me, because he should not be able to do six jobs so well. The fact that he can, points to a lack of demand. In my experience, this stems from perceived barriers to change, combined with a lack of knowledge about his functions. The result is, as Members have mentioned, that the public do not know who to go to with their complaint. Many constituents have turned to me for help, and I have had limited success. Many complaints appear to fall between the gaps or cut across boundaries. That results in considerable confusion and frustration. Some people have been failed by the system and are left stranded, with no-one to turn to. This leads me to believe that Wales has a large percentage of unrecorded complaints that are invisible to us today.

I welcome the decision last March by the First Secretary and the Secretary of State to conduct an overhaul of our present system. I would be grateful if the Minister could share the progress on this with the Assembly. I look to England with a little shame and see a consultation document already completed, a report already submitted, and recommendations already accepted. I understand the limitations of a UK/Assembly joint venture, and the inevitable senior role that Westminster will take. However, I fear that not taking steps to begin the review in earnest will result in Wales being left behind and having to accept the Colcutt recommendations, slightly tweaked to fit Welsh needs.

yw teitlau niferus Mr Buckley'n helpu'r sefyllfa. Hoffwn eich atgoffa ohonynt: Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru, Ombwdsmon y Gwasanaeth Iechyd dros Gymru, Comisiynydd Gweinyddol Seneddol, Ombwdsmon Seneddol yr Alban, Ombwdsmon y Gwasanaeth Iechyd dros Lloegr ac Ombwdsmon Gwasanaeth Iechyd yr Alban. Byddai nofydd yn credu bod y teitlau'n perthyn i wahanol bobl, ond teitlau un person yn unig ydynt. Ni ddylai unrhyw un boeni am gael mwy nag un swydd—ond chwech? Gallai amheuwyr rwgnach bod Mr Buckley yn gwango un person.

Nid oes tystiolaeth i awgrymu nad yw'n llwyddo i wneud yr holl swyddi hyn yn dda. Mae hynny'n fy mhoeni, oherwydd ni ddylai allu gwneud chwe swydd cystal. Mae'r ffaith y gall yn awgrymu diffyg galw. Yn fy mhrofiad i, mae hynny'n deillio o rwystrau tybiedig rhag newid, ynghyd â diffyg gwybodaeth am ei swyddogaethau. Y canlyniad yw, fel y soniodd yr Aelodau, nad yw'r cyhoedd yn gwybod at bwy y dylent fynd â'u cwyn. Mae llawer etholwr wedi troi ataf am help, heb lawer o lwyddiant. Ymddengys fod llawer o gwynion yn disgyn rhwng y bylchau neu'n torri ar draws ffiniau. Canlyniad hynny yw cryn ddrwsych a rhwystredigaeth. Mae'r system wedi siomi rhai pobl a'u gadael yn ddiymgeledd, heb neb i droi ato. Mae hynny'n fy arwain i gredu bod gan Gymru ganran uchel o gwynion nas cofnodwyd sy'n anweladwy inni heddiw.

Croesawaf y penderfyniad a wnaethpwyd fis Mawrth diwethaf gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol i gynnal archwiliad o'n system bresennol. Buaswn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog rannu'r cynnydd a wnaethpwyd ar hyn gyda'r Cynulliad. Mae gweld bod dogfen ymgynghorol eisoes wedi'i chwblhau, bod adroddiad eisoes wedi'i gyflwyno ac argymhellion eisoes wedi'u derbyn yn Lloegr yn codi peth cywilydd arnaf. Deallaf gyfyngiadau cyd-fenter Llywodraeth y DU/y Cynulliad, a'r rôl uwch a fydd gan San Steffan yn anochel. Fodd bynnag, ofnaf y byddai peidio cymryd camau i ddechrau adolygiad gwirioneddol yn golygu y bydd Cymru ar ei hôl hi ac yn gorfod derbyn argymhellion Colcutt, wedi'u haddasu rhywfaint i gydweddu ag anghenion Cymru.

In this report, Mr Buckley sees no problem in implementing the Colcutt recommendations in Wales. I cannot agree. I have had reason to write to several ombudsmen, but the complaint is either outside the ombudsman's jurisdiction, or there is, allegedly, insufficient evidence. These complaints, to my mind, have deserved a thorough investigation, and I am sad that they have failed to get that. A school report on the ombudsman would state 'has done well, but could do better'.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I am grateful for colleagues' comments, many of which boil down to the same point, namely that greater clarity in the process is needed. Janet is right that people must have confidence in the complaints system. If they do not, as Dafydd Wigley noted, they will not use it and it will fall into disrepute.

We are reviewing these procedures and processes, and Members may wish to make their views known to the administration, or to the reviewers. The system needs to be accessible and understandable, which is the basis of the points that were made. The ombudsman is aware of that, as he is embarking upon an awareness-raising publicity campaign to ensure that it is more accessible and understood. I am sure that we are all committed to that.

As I stated earlier, we are aware of areas for improvement and we will work on them. Next year, should I still hold this position, I hope that when I open this debate, we will either have fewer complaints or more people will be aware of the service.

Yn yr adroddiad hwn, ni wêl Mr Buckley unrhyw broblem o ran gweithredu argymhellion Colcutt yng Nghymru. Anghytunaf â hynny. Bu rheswm gennyf dros ysgrifennu at sawl ombwdsmon, ond bu'r gŵyn naill ai y tu hwnt i awdurdodaeth yr ombwdsmon, neu, fe honnir nad oes digon o dystiolaeth. Mae'r cwynion hyn, yn fy marn i, wedi haeddu ymchwiliad trylwyr, ac fe'm siomwyd na ddigwyddodd hynny. Byddai adroddiad ysgol ar yr ombwdsmon yn dweud 'nid da lle gellir gwell.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'm cyd-Aelodau am eu sylwadau. Mae llawer ohonynt yn pwysleisio'r un peth, sef bod angen mwy o eglurder yn y broses. Yr oedd sylw Janet, bod yn rhaid i bobl gael mwy o hyder yn y system gwyno, yn gywir. Os nad oes ganddynt hyder, fel y soniodd Dafydd Wigley, ni fyddant yn ei defnyddio a bydd yn colli ei henw da.

Yr ydym yn adolygu'r gweithdrefnau a'r prosesau hyn, ac efallai y bydd yr Aelodau am fynegi eu barn i'r weinyddiaeth, neu i'r adolygwyr. Mae angen i'r system fod yn hygyrch a dealladwy, sef sail y pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd. Mae'r ombwdsmon yn ymwybodol o hynny, am ei fod yn dechrau ar ymgyrch gyhoeddusrwydd i godi ymwybyddiaeth er mwyn sicrhau ei bod yn fwy hygyrch a hawdd i'w deall. Yr wyf yn sicr ein bod oll yn ymrwymedig i hynny.

Fel y nodais yn gynharach, yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r meysydd y mae angen eu gwella a byddwn yn gweithio arnynt. Y flwyddyn nesaf, os byddaf yn y swydd hon o hyd, pan agoraf y ddadl hon, gobeithiaf y bydd gennym lai o gwynion neu y bydd mwy o bobl yn ymwybodol o'r gwasanaeth.

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David

Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Elin
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Adroddiad Ombwdsmon Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru ar gyfer 2000-01 The Health Service Ombudsman for Wales's Report of 2000-01

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.5, notes the report of the Health Service Ombudsman for 2000-01, laid in the Table Office on 9 October 2001, with personal copies provided to Assembly Members. (NDM804)

This report, made under the Health Service Commissioners Act 1993, as amended by the Government of Wales Act 1998, outlines the work of the Health Service Ombudsman in Wales in 2000-01.

This year, the annual report of the Health Service Ombudsman for Wales has been published jointly with that of the Welsh Administration Ombudsman, the subject of the earlier debate. The joint report is useful in many ways, because it affords a wider perspective on the ombudsman's work in both those roles and points to issues and lessons to be learned through the public service.

The purpose of the Health Service

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.5, yn nodi adroddiad Ombwdsmon Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru ar gyfer 2000-01, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Hydref 2001, gan ddarparu copiâu personol ar gyfer Aelodau'r Cynulliad. (NDM804)

Mae'r adroddiad hwn, a wnaethpwyd o dan Ddeddf Comisiynwyr y Gwasanaeth Iechyd 1993, fel y'i diwygiwyd gan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn amlinellu gwaith Ombwdsmon Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru yn 2000-01.

Eleni, cyhoeddwyd adroddiad blynyddol Ombwdsmon Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru ar y cyd ag adroddiad blynyddol Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru, sef pwnc y ddadl gynharach. Mae'r adroddiad ar y cyd yn ddefnyddiol mewn sawl ffordd, am ei fod yn rhoi darlun ehangach o waith yr ombwdsmon yn y rolau hynny ac yn cyfeirio at faterion a gwersi i'w dysgu drwy'r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus.

Pwrpas adroddiad blynyddol Ombwdsmon

Ombudsman's annual report is to keep Members and others with an interest in health services informed of his work. It is also a valuable teaching aid for the national health service and for all staff involved in patient care and the handling of complaints. The report also demonstrates the independence of the Health Service Ombudsman's office. The objective assessments in the report of how health services are provided, encourages the NHS to work towards improving services and responsiveness to patients' needs.

The report concentrates on complaints received by the Health Service Ombudsman about care and treatment provided by the NHS in Wales, and highlights his particular concerns about three issues: communication with patients; medical care; and nursing care.

On communication with patients, training in communication skills is included in the training of all healthcare professionals. Standards are set and monitored by the regulatory and professional bodies. It is also recognised that different professionals can learn about this together to develop effective skills in communicating with patients and the other professionals with whom they work.

On medical care, the ombudsman has investigated many cases concerning the actions of both hospital and general practice doctors. The professional standards of doctors and GPs in this country are among the highest in the world. On the professional regulatory front, the General Medical Council provides guidance for doctors on providing a good standard of practice and care to patients.

4:20 p.m.

The first concern of the overwhelming majority of doctors is the care of their patients. A component of clinical governance is the introduction of consultant appraisals and, soon, GP appraisals. In Wales, we are piloting GP appraisals ahead of the agreement being negotiated with the British Medical Association.

Gwasanaeth Iechyd yw rhoi gwybod i Aelodau ac eraill sydd â diddordeb yn y gwasanaethau iechyd am ei waith. Mae hefyd yn offeryn dysgu gwerthfawr i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ac i'r holl staff sy'n gysylltiedig â gofalu am gleifion a delio â chwynion. Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn dangos annibyniaeth swyddfa Ombwdsmon y Gwasanaeth Iechyd. Mae'r asesiadau amcanion yn yr adroddiad o ran sut y darperir gwasanaethau iechyd, yn annog yr NHS i weithio tuag at wella gwasanaethau a sut y mae'n ymateb i anghenion cleifion.

Mae'r adroddiad yn canolbwyntio ar gwynion a dderbyniwyd gan Ombwdsmon y Gwasanaeth Iechyd ar y gofal a'r driniaeth a ddarperir gan yr NHS yng Nghymru, ac mae'n amlygu'r pryderon penodol sydd ganddo am dri mater: cyfathrebu â chleifion; gofal meddygol; a gofal nyrsio.

O ran cyfathrebu â chleifion, caiff hyfforddiant mewn sgiliau cyfathrebu ei gynnwys yn yr hyfforddiant a roddir i bob person proffesiynol ym maes gofal iechyd. Y cyrff rheoleiddio a phroffesiynol sy'n pennu ac yn monitro safonau. Cydnabyddir hefyd y gall pobl broffesiynol gwahanol ddysgu am hyn gyda'i gilydd i ddatblygu sgiliau cyfathrebu effeithiol gyda chleifion a phobl broffesiynol y maent yn gweithio â hwy.

O ran gofal meddygol, mae'r ombwdsmon wedi ymchwilio i lawer o achosion yn ymwneud â gweithredoedd ysbytai a meddygon teulu. Mae safonau proffesiynol meddygon a meddygon teulu yn y wlad hon ymhlith yr uchaf yn y byd. O ran rheoleiddio proffesiynol, mae'r Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol yn darparu arweiniad i feddygon ar ddarparu safon dda o arfer a gofal i gleifion.

Prif bryder y mwyafrif llethol o feddygon yw gofal eu cleifion. Un elfen o reolaeth glinigol yw cyflwyno gwerthusiadau o feddygon ymgynghorol ac, yn fuan, gwerthusiadau o feddygon teulu. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn cynnal cynllun peilot o werthusiadau meddygon teulu cyn trafod cytundeb gyda'r Gymdeithas Feddygol Brydeinig.

It is also important that when things go wrong, we learn from the situation. In September 2001, I launched 'Clinical Governance—Developing a Strategic Approach'. That document will help guide NHS organisations on how to develop a strategic approach to implementing clinical governance, including how to learn lessons from complaints, how to support continuous professional development and how to monitor practice. Over the next four years the Commission for Health Improvement will carry out a regular programme of clinical governance reviews at every health authority, trust and local health group in England and Wales. It will also lead, review and assist the NHS on best practice and disseminate its findings publicly and throughout the NHS.

On nursing care, as the report states, patients' contact with nurses during their care is often greater than with any other member of the healthcare team. Nurses do a tremendous job, as do all health professionals, sometimes under difficult conditions and great pressure. It is a credit to their dedication that the vast majority of patients feel that they have been given top-quality care. There are times, however, when patients have cause for complaint, often about the most fundamental aspects of care. For that reason, I have founded a group to consider these issues over the next 18 months, and to make recommendations on improving standards on important matters, such as dignity, eating and drinking, and communication. The aim is to produce an easy-to-use document, accessible to patients and healthcare workers. The Patients Association and the Welsh community health councils have welcomed that work, and are contributing towards the development of the standards.

The ombudsman's report also touches upon complaints handling and good practice in this matter. We are currently consulting on a UK-wide evaluation of the NHS complaints procedure, and await the comments of interested parties with interest. I will ensure that the outcome of the review is a robust and clearly independent complaints process, which has the confidence of patients and NHS staff.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig ein bod yn dysgu o sefyllfa pan aiff pethau o'u lle. Yn Medi 2001, lansiais 'Rheolaeth Glinigol—Datblygu Ymagwedd Strategol'. Bydd y ddogfen honno yn helpu sefydliadau'r NHS i ddatblygu ymagwedd strategol tuag at gyflwyno rheolaeth glinigol, yn cynnwys sut i ddysgu gwersi o gwynion, sut i gynnal datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus a sut i fonitro arfer. Yn ystod y pedair blynedd nesaf bydd y Comisiwn Gwella Iechyd yn cynnal rhaglen adolygu rheolaeth glinigol reolaidd ym mhob awdurdod lleol, ymddiriedolaeth a grŵp iechyd lleol yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Bydd hefyd yn arwain, adolygu ac yn cynorthwyo'r NHS ar arfer gorau ac yn dosbarthu ei ganfyddiadau yn gyhoeddus drwy'r NHS cyfan.

O ran gofal nyrsio, fel y noda'r adroddiad, mae cyswllt cleifion gyda nyrsys yn ystod eu gofal yn aml yn fwy nag unrhyw gyswllt gydag aelod arall o'r tîm gofal iechyd. Mae nyrsys yn gwneud gwaith aruthrol, fel y gwna pob person proffesiynol ym maes gofal iechyd, weithiau o dan amgylchiadau anodd ac o dan bwysau mawr. Mae'r ffaith bod y mwyafrif llethol o gleifion yn credu eu bod wedi derbyn gofal o'r radd flaenaf yn glod i'w hymrwymiad. Fodd bynnag, mae adegau pan fo cleifion wedi cael achos i gwyno, yn aml am agweddau mwyaf sylfaenol y gofal. Am y rheswm hwnnw, yr wyf wedi sefydlu grŵp a fydd yn ystyried y materion hyn dros y 18 mis nesaf, ac i wneud argymhellion ar sut i wella safonau ar faterion pwysig, fel urddas, bwyta ac yfed a chyfathrebu. Y nod yw cynhyrchu dogfen hawdd i'w defnyddio, y gall cleifion a gweithwyr gofal iechyd ei defnyddio. Mae Cymdeithas y Cleifion a chynghorau iechyd cymuned Cymru wedi croesawu'r gwaith hwnnw ac maent yn cyfrannu tuag at y broses o ddatblygu'r safonau.

Mae adroddiad yr ombudsmon hefyd yn crybwyll y broses o ddelio â chwynion ac arfer da yn hyn o beth. Yr ydym yn ymgynghori ar hyn o bryd ar werthusiad eang ar lefel y DU gyfan o weithdrefn gwyno'r NHS, ac yr ydym yn aros i glywed sylwadau partiön sydd â diddordeb. Byddaf yn sicrhau bod canlyniad yr adolygiad yn broses gwyno gadarn a chwbl annibynnol, sy'n ennyn hyder cleifion a staff yr NHS.

In conclusion, this report provides Members with an overview of the work of the Health Service Ombudsman's office during 2000-01. The complaints highlighted in the reports have been resolved and remedial action has been taken, where appropriate. I am grateful for the work of the ombudsman's office and the help that it gives to ensure that complaints are resolved.

David Lloyd: Yn ôl fy arfer, datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu adroddiad Ombwdsmon y Gwasanaeth Iechyd. Ni wnafl olrhain y pwyntiau a nododd Jane eisoes, ond mae'n bwysig nodi prif themâu y cwynion. Un prif gasgliad yw'r angen am gyfathrebu gwell, ac ailadroddir hyn yn aml yn yr adroddiad. Cyfathrebu—hynny yw, gwranddo. Mae angen gwella'r gwranddo a'r cyfathrebu rhwng y meddyg a'r claf, a'r nyrs a'r claf, i sicrhau bod pawb yn deall beth sy'n digwydd.

Fodd bynnag, ceir goblygiadau i hynny, gan fod gwranddo yn astud ac yn effeithiol yn cymryd tipyn o amser. Fel rhywun sydd yn dal i weithio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pwysau amser sydd ar y gwasanaeth. Pan fo rhywun o dan bwysau mawr, mae'r amser i esbonio'r hyn sydd yn digwydd ac i wrando ar yr hyn sydd gan y claf i'w ddweud yn brin, ac felly yn llai o flaenoriaeth

Pan oeddwn yn feddyg teulu llawn-amser, fel pob meddyg teulu llawn-amser arall, gwelais 50 claf bob dydd, sef 250 claf bob wythnos a 10,000 y flwyddyn. Dyna fesur gwaith y meddyg teulu cyffredin. Mae'n rhaid ichi gofio fy mod yn sôn am un meddyg teulu yn gweld 10,000 o gleifion bob blwyddyn.

Mae 1,800 o feddygon teulu yng Nghymru. Mae nifer fawr o arbenigwyr a meddygon iau yn ein hysbytai a nifer fwy o nyrsys yn ein hysbytai ac yn y gymuned. Fodd bynnag, derbyniwyd 162 o gwynion yn unig ynghylch ansawdd gwaith y bobl hynny i gyd. Felly, mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod safon aruthrol y gwaith sydd yn cael ei wneud gan staff y gwasanaeth iechyd cenedlaethol. Serch hynny, mae 162 o gwynion yn 162 yn ormod.

I gloi, mae'r adroddiad hwn yn darparu trosolwg i'r Aelodau o waith swyddfa Ombwdsmon y Gwasanaeth Iechyd yn ystod 2000-01. Mae'r cwynion a amlygwyd yn yr adroddiadau wedi'u datrys a chymerwyd camau unioni, lle y bo'n briodol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i swyddfa'r ombwdsmon am eu gwaith a'r cymorth a rydd i sicrhau y caiff cwynion eu datrys.

David Lloyd: As usual, I declare an interest as a general practitioner. I also welcome the Health Service Ombudsman's report. I will not recap Jane's points, but it is important to note the main themes of the complaints. One main conclusion is the need for better communication, which is often repeated in the report. Communication—that is, listening. The quality of the listening and communication between doctor and patient, and nurse and patient must be improved, to ensure that everybody understands what is happening.

However, there are implications to that, as listening attentively and effectively takes time. As someone who still works in the health service, I am aware of the time pressures on the service. When someone is under great pressure, the time to explain what is happening and to listen to what the patient has to say is scarce, and is therefore less of a priority.

When I was a full-time general practitioner, like all other full-time GPs, I saw 50 patients a day, which is 250 patients a week and 10,000 a year. That is the volume of the average GP's work. You must bear in mind that I am talking about one GP seeing 10,000 patients every year.

There are 1,800 GPs in Wales. There are a large number of specialists and junior doctors in our hospitals and a greater number of nurses in our hospitals and communities. However, only 162 complaints were received regarding the quality of all those people's work. Therefore, we must acknowledge the exceptional standard of work that is carried out by national health service staff. Nevertheless, 162 complaints are 162 complaints too many.

Mae'n rhaid inni geisio gwneud rhywbeth, yn arbennig i wella ansawdd cyfathrebu. Mae'n rhaid inni ganiatáu amser i esbonio i gleifion yr hyn sydd yn digwydd. Daw hyn yn ôl i'r ddadl oesol ynghylch yr angen am fwy o staff i ddarparu gwasanaeth, fel y gall meddygon a nyrsys gael mwy o amser i ddelio â'u cleifion. Dyna pam y mae Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain ac eraill wedi dadlau mor frwd o blaid cynyddu'r amser a roddir ar gyfer pob ymgynghoriad.

Mae nifer o Aelodau wedi sôn eisoes am y system gwyno. Mae'n system hirwyntog a chymhleth, fel y clywsom eisoes, ac, fel y dywedodd Alison Halford, yn ddrwslyd. Mae'n anodd i rywun sydd â chwyn go iawn i fynd i'r afael â'r system. Mae pobl yn tueddu i gredu bod y system yn eu herbyn. Maent yn tueddu i gredu eu bod yn brwydro yn erbyn elfen gref broffesiynol, yn arbennig os ydynt yn cwyno am feddyg.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol, fel y soniodd Jane, fod yr arolwg o'r system gwyno ar waith. Credaf yn gryf y dylai'r system gwyno fod yn annibynnol. Mae'r ffaith nad ydyw'n annibynnol ar hyn o bryd yn wendid. Yn hyn o beth, mae rôl newydd ac allweddol i'n cynghorau iechyd cymuned a'u swyddogion cefnogi cleifion. Bydd hyn yn rôl allweddol i helpu'r claf drwy broses hir a chymhleth o ddod â chwyn gerbron.

Mae Plaid Cymru yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn. Mae gwaith i'w wneud ac mae sialens sylweddol yn wynebu staff y gwasanaeth iechyd cenedlaethol. Mae sialens sylweddol hefyd yn wynebu'r gwleidyddion y mae'n rhaid iddynt ddarparu'r adnoddau i alluogi ein staff i weithredu i'r safonau uchaf posibl.

Peter Black: Dai has far greater hands-on experience than many of us here. He was right that we must keep the report in perspective in terms of the number of complaints received compared with the number of patients treated by the national health service in Wales. Health issues are emotive and people feel strongly about perceived injustices. Therefore, the number of complaints comes as no surprise. Since

We must try to do something, particularly to improve the quality of communication. We must allow time to explain to patients what is happening. This comes back to the age-old argument about the need for more staff to provide a service, so that doctors and nurses can spend more time with their patients. That is why the British Medical Association and others have argued so vehemently in favour of increasing the time allocated to every consultation.

A number of Members have already mentioned the complaints procedure. It is long-winded and complex, as we have already heard, and, as Alison Halford said, confusing. It is difficult for someone with a genuine complaint to tackle the system. People tend to believe that the system is against them. They tend to believe that they are battling against a strong professional element, especially if they complain about a doctor.

I am aware, as Jane mentioned, that the review of the complaints procedure is underway. I firmly believe that the complaints procedure should be independent. The fact that it is not independent at present is a weakness. To that end, there is a new key role for our community health councils and their patient support officers. It will be a crucial role in assisting the patient through the lengthy and complex process of lodging a complaint.

Plaid Cymru welcomes this report. There is work to be done and a considerable challenge faces national health service staff. A considerable challenge also faces the politicians who must provide the resources to enable our staff to work to the highest possible standards.

Peter Black: Mae gan Dai lawer mwy o brofiad uniongyrchol na llawer ohonom yma. Yr oedd yn iawn i ddweud y dylem gadw'r adroddiad mewn persbectif yn nhermau nifer y cwynion a dderbynnir o'i gymharu â nifer y cleifion sy'n cael triniaeth gan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru. Mae materion iechyd yn rhai emosiynol ac mae gan bobl farn gryf am anghyfiawnderau honedig. Felly, nid yw nifer y cwynion yn peri syndod.

becoming an Assembly Member, I have received many complaints about the health service. Neither is it a surprise that there has been an increase in the number of complaints, although it is a bit shocking that there has been an 11 per cent increase in Wales compared with smaller increases in England and Scotland. I am not sure if I can put my finger on the reason for that. I do not know if the Minister will be able to either, but the increase in complaints is a cause for concern.

Over half the complaints, however, were considered to be outside the ombudsman's jurisdiction. This underlines the point made in a previous debate about people understanding the competencies of the ombudsman; what he can and cannot consider and how best to carry forward their complaints. In dealing with correspondence from people who have grievances about healthcare, it seems to me that they often do not understand the complaints procedure or how to carry a complaint forward. Sometimes they only have the option of going to the ombudsman or taking their complaints forward through the courts. Often they opt for the ombudsman as the most affordable option. I suspect that it is in such cases that the ombudsman decides that he does not have jurisdiction, and that the matter has to go to some other body, probably the courts, or back to the proper complaints procedure.

4:30 p.m.

That underlines the ombudsman's point that poor communication among staff and between staff and patients is central to many of the complaints that he received. We saw in the Audit Committee's report, as well as in other evidence, that the level of compensation paid by the national health service is rising substantially. That is worrying, not only because that money could be spent on services, but also because it indicates that some matters are not right. Now we have evidence in the ombudsman's report that reinforces that there is an increasing trend of complaints about outcomes in the national health service. On the whole, the problem does not seem to be in the quality of the treatment, although that is a factor. There is agreement that we have a dedicated and hard-working staff in the

Ers dod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad, yr wyf wedi derbyn sawl cwyn am y gwasanaeth iechyd. Nid yw'r ffaith y gwelwyd cynnydd yn nifer y cwynion yn peri syndod ychwaith, er ei bod yn eithaf brawychus gweld cynnydd o 11 y cant yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â chynnydd llai yn Lloegr a'r Alban. Nid wyf yn siŵr o'r rheswm dros hynny. Ni wn a yw'r Gweinidog yn siŵr ychwaith, ond mae'r cynnydd yn nifer y cwynion yn peri pryder.

Fodd bynnag, ystyriwyd bod hanner y cwynion y tu hwnt i awdurdodaeth yr ombwdsmon. Mae hyn yn tanlinellu'r pwynt a wnaethpwyd mewn dadl flaenorol ynglŷn â phobl yn deall cymwyseddau'r ombwdsmon; yr hyn y gall ei ystyried a'r hyn na all ei ystyried o ran y ffordd orau o ddelio â'u cwynion. Wrth ddelio â gohebiaeth gan bobl sydd â chwynion ynglŷn â gofal iechyd, ymddengys i mi nad ydynt yn aml yn deall y weithdrefn gwyno na sut i gyflwyno cwyn. Weithiau yr unig opsiwn sydd ar gael iddynt yw mynd at yr ombwdsmon neu gyflwyno eu cwynion drwy'r llysoedd. Yn aml maent yn dewis yr ombwdsmon fel yr opsiwn y gallant ei fforddio. Yr wyf yn amau mai mewn achosion o'r fath y bydd yr ombwdsmon yn penderfynu nad oes ganddo awdurdodaeth, a bod yn rhaid i'r mater gael ei gyfeirio at gorff arall, y llysoedd fwy na thebyg, neu yn ôl i'r weithdrefn gwyno briodol.

Mae hynny'n tanlinellu pwynt yr ombwdsmon mai cyfathrebu gwael ymhlith staff a rhwng staff a chleifion sydd wrth wraidd nifer o'r cwynion a dderbyniodd. Gwelsom yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio, ac mewn tystiolaeth arall, bod lefel yr iawndal a delir gan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn codi'n sylweddol. Mae hynny'n peri pryder, nid yn unig am y gellid gwario'r arian hwn ar wasanaethau, ond hefyd am fod hynny'n awgrymu bod problemau ynghlwm â rhai materion. Nawr mae gennym dystiolaeth yn adroddiad yr ombwdsmon sy'n atgyfnerthu'r ffaith bod yna batrwm cynyddol o gwynion ynghylch canlyniadau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Ar y cyfan, ymddengys nad ansawdd y driniaeth sy'n peri'r broblem, er fod hynny'n ffactor. Ceir cytundeb bod gennym staff

national health service in Wales. However, there are failures in communication, which the ombudsman has highlighted in the report as a main reason for complaints.

If we can deal with that communication issue, the number of complaints may fall. We may also be able to resolve other issues that cause problems for the national health service. We also need to ensure that patients are more familiar with the national health service's complaints procedures, so that issues can be dealt with more quickly. That would reduce the time dedicated to resolving disputes, but also ensure a swifter resolution for patients and their families, who are often distressed, and allow them to move on. Perhaps an early apology and admission of error, when appropriate, would significantly reduce the number of formal complaints. I acknowledge the work that the Minister has done on this already. I hope that that work will affect the ombudsman's future reports and lead to fewer complaints and fewer complaints being misdirected to his office.

David Melding: On behalf of the Welsh Conservative group I welcome the publication of the ombudsman's report. I find it instructive and I agree with its contents. We need to learn lessons from it. I shall not repeat those lessons, as the Minister and other speakers have made those points ably. There are issues concerning communication, medical and nursing staff that we must note and act upon.

I shall say a few words about the complaints process. The National Assembly needs to put itself in the place of the patient and those who have sought the ombudsman's services. They went to him as a last resort, having not had their case dealt with to their satisfaction. About half of them will have their cases taken up and investigated, and about 30 per cent of those cases will be upheld. The vast majority of the patients who refer their cases to the ombudsman will not get satisfaction and will leave the complaints process in a bitter frame of mind. We must do something about that. It is not a healthy situation and

ymrwymedig a gweithgar iawn yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, ceir methiannau o ran cyfathrebu, a amlygwyd gan yr ombwdsmon yn yr adroddiad fel y prif reswm dros gyflwyno cwynion.

Os gallwn ddelio â'r broblem gyfathrebu, efallai y bydd nifer y cwynion yn gostwng. Efallai y gallwn hefyd ddatrys y materion eraill sy'n achosi problemau i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Mae angen inni hefyd sicrhau bod cleifion yn fwy cyfarwydd â gweithdrefnau cwyno'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, er mwyn sicrhau y gellir delio â materion yn gyflymach. Byddai hyn yn lleihau'r amser a neilltuir ar gyfer datrys anghydfodau, a gallai hefyd sicrhau ateb cyflymach i gleifion a'u teuluoedd, sy'n aml yn drallodus, a galluogi iddynt symud ymlaen. Efallai y byddai ymddiheuriad cynnar a chyfaddef camgymeriad, lle y bo'n briodol, yn lleihau nifer y cwynion ffurfiol a wneir yn sylweddol. Cydnabyddaf y gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan y Gweinidog eisoes ar y mater hwn. Fy ngobaith yw y bydd y gwaith yn dylanwadu ar adroddiadau yn y dyfodol ac yn arwain at lai o gwynion yn cael eu camgyfeirio i'w swyddfa.

David Melding: Ar ran grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru croesawaf gyhoeddi adroddiad yr ombwdsmon. Mae'n addysgiadol a chytunaf â'i gynnwys. Mae angen inni ddysgu gwersi ohono. Nid wyf am ailadrodd y gwersi hynny, am fod y Gweinidog a'r siaradwyr eraill wedi gwneud y pwyntiau hynny'n effeithiol. Mae yna faterion sy'n ymwneud â chyfathrebu, staff meddygol a staff nyrsio y dylem eu nodi a gweithredu arnynt.

Hoffwn ddweud ychydig eiriau am y broses gwyno. Mae angen i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol roi ei hun yn sefyllfa'r claf a'r rhai sydd wedi defnyddio gwasanaethau'r ombwdsmon. Aethant ato fel y dewis olaf, am nad oeddent yn fodlon â'r ffordd yr ymdriniwyd â'u hachos. Rhoddir sylw ac ymchwilir i achosion tua hanner ohonynt, a chaiff tua 30 y cant o'r achosion hynny eu cadarnhau. Ni fydd y mwyafrif llethol o gleifion sy'n cyfeirio eu hachosion i'r ombwdsmon yn cael boddhad a fydd yn eu gadael gyda theimladau chwerw tuag at y broses gwyno. Nid yw'n sefyllfa iach ac

must be tackled.

The fact that the ombudsman is dealing with a sharply increasing level of cases also indicates that the standard and effectiveness of the current complaints process in the NHS is not fit for purpose. I welcome the Minister's initiatives in trying to establish a better system that will be more effective for patients and act as a voice for them. Patients will not always have their cases upheld, but the process may leave patients feeling that at least the situation has been explained to them, so that they feel happier about their treatment. In other cases it will deal with a real complaint at a much earlier stage, which means that the morale of the health service workforce will not be undermined by long, protracted, difficult cases.

We face crucial decisions about the new complaints process. The first of those is whether the patient participation officers—or whatever we end up calling the voice of the patient in NHS establishments of any size—will be employed by the trust, or whether we want them to be seen to be independent and therefore, probably employed by community health councils. I warn the Minister that if these new patient participation officers are employed by NHS establishments directly, we will not reduce the level of cases being referred to the ombudsman. More people will feel that they have not had an independent hearing from someone who is unquestionably on their side in taking cases forward. They will feel that a bureaucratic system is still not giving them a fair hearing. Community health councils should employ these new participation officers. It will be a challenge for those councils, especially if they also have the role of providing specialist advocacy services. However, we must have the maximum level of independence in the system so that patients are in no doubt that the officers taking cases forward on their behalf are not directly employed by NHS establishments.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I thank my colleagues for their helpful contributions. We are here to note the report from the Health Service

mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hi.

Mae'r ffaith bod yr ombwdsmon yn delio â chynnydd sylweddol yn lefel yr achosion hefyd yn nodi nad yw safon ac effeithiolrwydd y broses gwyno bresennol yn yr NHS yn addas at y pwrpas. Croesawaf fentrau'r Gweinidog o ran ceisio sefydlu system well a fydd yn fwy effeithiol i gleifion ac a fydd yn gweithredu fel llais ar eu rhan. Ni chaiff achosion cleifion eu cadarnhau bob tro, ond gall cleifion adael y broses yn teimlo bod rhywun wedi esbonio'r sefyllfa iddynt o leiaf, er mwyn iddynt deimlo'n fwy bodlon â'r driniaeth a gawsant. Mewn achosion eraill bydd yn delio â chwyn wirioneddol yn llawer cynharach, sy'n golygu na fydd achosion anodd sy'n faith ac estynedig yn tanseilio morâl gweithlu'r gwasanaeth iechyd.

Yr ydym yn wynebu penderfyniadau hollbwysig ynglŷn â'r broses gwyno newydd. Y penderfyniad cyntaf yw pa un a gaiff y swyddogion cyfranogiad cleifion—neu pa bynnag enw y byddwn yn galw llais y claf yn y sefydliadau hynny o bob maint yn yr NHS—eu cyflogi gan yr ymddiriedolaeth, neu a ydym am iddynt gael eu hystyried yn annibynnol ac felly, eu cyflogi gan gynghorau iechyd cymuned. Rhybuddiaf y Gweinidog os caiff y swyddogion cyfranogiad cleifion hyn eu cyflogi'n uniongyrchol gan sefydliadau'r NHS, na fydd hynny'n lleihau nifer yr achosion y cyfeirir at yr ombwdsmon. Bydd mwy o bobl yn credu na chawsant wrandawriad annibynnol gan rywun sy'n bendant o'u plaid o ran cyflwyno eu hachosion. Byddant yn credu nad yw'r system fiwrocratiaeth yn rhoi gwrandawriad teg iddynt o hyd. Dylai cynghorau iechyd cymuned gyflogi'r swyddogion cyfranogiad newydd hyn. Bydd yn her i'r cynghorau hynny, yn arbennig os oes ganddynt rôl yn y broses o ddarparu gwasanaethau eiriolaeth arbenigol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid sicrhau'r lefel uchaf o annibyniaeth yn y system fel nad oes gan y cleifion unrhyw amheuaeth nad yw'r swyddogion sy'n cyflwyno eu hachosion ar eu rhan wedi'u cyflogi'n uniongyrchol gan sefydliadau'r NHS.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Hoffwn ddiolch i'm cydweithwyr am eu cyfraniadau defnyddiol. Yr ydym yma i nodi'r adroddiad

Ombudsman and to comment on lessons learned and conclusions that both the ombudsman and Members can draw. Dai Lloyd, Peter Black and David Melding talked about communication. That is vital, particularly when you are vulnerable. Listening is key, but the quality of listening, as Dai said, is important. That has a bearing on the pressures on staff at all levels. We must learn from this report in terms of its policy implications, whether at the sharp end of primary care or in the time-pressured secondary and acute sector. It has to inform our learning and understanding, particularly as we consider and proceed with our human resources strategy for NHS staff.

It is important that the ombudsman has drawn attention to the improvements that can be made in the complaints system. I welcome the fact that Annex A draws upon the extensive work with health organisations in identifying good practice relating to communication—not just management and resources—and how organisations work with people and NHS staff. I urge people to consider the UK review of the complaints system—to which Peter Black and David Melding drew attention—which is out to consultation at the moment. The main conclusions of that review are that, generally, complainants feel that their complaints are not handled well, take too long to resolve and do not lead to satisfactory outcomes. NHS staff feel that the independent review stage should be more independent, timescales more realistic and that mechanisms are needed to ensure that lessons are learned from complaints and services improve as a consequence. There should be a clear link between the complaints, how they are dealt with and the lessons learned from them in terms of policy. Generally, those complained against felt that most complaints had been handled well, but they did not feel that they were sufficiently informed throughout the process. We must remember all those engaged in the process, both the complainants and those complained against. I urge you to consider the suggestions for changes and how to make NHS organisations more accountable for their performance in handling complaints.

gan Ombwdsmon y Gwasanaeth Iechyd ac i roi sylwadau ar y gwersi a ddysgwyd a'r casgliadau y gall yr ombwdsmon a'r Aelodau eu llunio. Siaradodd Dai Lloyd, Peter Lloyd a David Melding ynglŷn â chyfathrebu. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig, yn arbennig pan ydych yn ddiamddiffyn. Mae gwranddo'n allweddol, ond mae ansawdd y gwranddo, fel y dywedodd Dai, yn bwysig. Mae hynny'n dylanwadu ar y pwysau sydd ar staff ar bob lefel. Rhaid inni ddysgu o'r adroddiad hwn yn nhermau ei oblygiadau polisi pa un ai yn rheng flaen gofal sylfaenol neu yn y sector eilaidd ac aciwt sydd â phwysau amser. Rhaid iddo lywio ein proses o ddysgu a deall, yn arbennig wrth inni ystyried a datblygu ein strategaeth adnoddau dynol ar gyfer staff yr NHS.

Mae'n bwysig bod yr ombwdsmon wedi amlygu'r gwelliannau y gellir eu gwneud i'r system gwyno. Croesawaf y ffaith bod Atodiad A yn tynnu ar y gwaith helaeth a wnaethpwyd gyda'r sefydliadau iechyd o ran nodi arfer da mewn cysylltiad â chyfathrebu—nid dim ond rheoli ac adnoddau—a sut mae sefydliadau'n gweithio gyda phobl a staff yr NHS. Yr wyf yn annog pobl i ystyried adolygiad y DU o'r system gwyno—y soniodd Peter Black a David Melding amdano—sy'n destun ymgynghoriad ar hyn o bryd. Prif gasgliadau'r adolygiad hwnnw yw bod achwynwyr, ar y cyfan, o'r farn nad ymdriniwyd â'u cwyn yn dda, cymerwyd gormod o amser i'w datrys ac nid yw'n arwain at ganlyniadau boddhaol. Mae staff yr NHS o'r farn y dylai'r cam adolygiad annibynnol fod yn fwy annibynnol, dylai'r amserlenni fod yn fwy realistig ac mae angen dulliau i sicrhau y caiff gwersi eu dysgu o'r cwynion ac y caiff gwasanaethau eu gwella yn sgîl hynny. Dylid cael cyswllt clir rhwng y cwynion a sut yr ymdrinnir â hwy a'r gwersi a ddysgwyd ganddynt yn nhermau polisi. Ar y cyfan, yr oedd y rhai y gwnaethpwyd cwyn yn eu herbyn o'r farn yr ymdriniwyd â'r rhan fwyaf o gwynion yn dda, ond nad oeddent yn credu eu bod yn derbyn gwybodaeth ddigonol drwy'r broses gyfan. Rhaid inni gofio pawb sy'n cymryd rhan yn y broses, yr achwynydd a'r rhai y gwnaethpwyd cwyn yn eu herbyn. Galwaf arnoch i ystyried yr awgrymiadau ar gyfer newidiadau a sut i sicrhau bod sefydliadau'r NHS yn fwy atebol am eu

perfformiad o ran delio â chwynion.

I am grateful to Dai Lloyd and David Melding for their comments on the steps that we are taking. We in Wales have decided to keep our community health councils. The key motivation behind that decision was the independence of community health councils, which we in this Chamber acknowledge as being important. We are piloting several schemes to employ patient support officers in the community and in hospitals. That is part of our 'Improving Health in Wales' plan. The independent aspect needs to be piloted, and we are doing that. Community health councils will be piloting employing and managing some of those officers. We must ensure that that is taken seriously by the leadership of trusts and the chief executive. We must ensure that the leaders are held to account. I value the Committee's views on how to take this forward. We must monitor the situation carefully to find the right way forward.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Dai Lloyd a David Melding am eu sylwadau ar y camau yr ydym yn eu cymryd. Yr ydym ni yng Nghymru wedi penderfynu cadw ein cynghorau iechyd cymuned. Y prif gymhellant y tu ôl i'r penderfyniad hwnnw oedd annibyniaeth y cynghorau iechyd cymuned, ac yr ydym ni yn y Siambr hon yn cydnabod fod hynny'n bwysig. Yr ydym yn cyflwyno sawl cynllun peilot i gyflogi swyddogion cynnal i gleifion yn y gymuned ac mewn ysbytai. Mae hynny'n rhan o'n cynllun 'Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru'. Mae angen cyflwyno'r agwedd annibynnol ar ffurf peilot, ac yr ydym eisoes yn gwneud hynny. Bydd cynghorau iechyd cymunedol yn cyflogi ac yn rheoli rhai o'r swyddogion hynny ar gynllun peilot. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod arweinwyr ymddiriedolaethau a'r prif weithredwr yn cymryd hyn o ddifrif. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr arweinwyr yn atebol. Gwerthfawrogaf safbwyntiau'r Pwyllgor ar sut i ddatblygu'r gwaith hwn. Rhaid inni fonitro'r sefyllfa yn ofalus a chanfod y ffordd briodol o ddatblygu'r sefyllfa.

4:40 p.m.

Peter mentioned the increase in complaints. We must also recognise the increase in pressure on the service and the increase in expectations. I value that increase in expectations; people must be able to feel that they can come forward. We must ensure that there are facilities to resolve complaints quickly, so that when they are made, they do not have to go right through the system and end up on the ombudsman's table. As Peter said, the ombudsman often does not have the powers to investigate the complaint further. I was glad that the ombudsman felt able to comment and give advice on improvement, even though he did not pursue some complaints to the investigation stage. Members know that many people are desperate. Sometimes, an apology and a recognition of the situation in which people and their families find themselves can be key.

Soniodd Peter am y cynnydd yn nifer y cwynion. Rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod y cynnydd mewn pwysau ar y gwasanaeth a'r cynnydd hwnnw o ran disgwyliadau. Gwerthfawrogaf y cynnydd mewn disgwyliadau; rhaid i bobl deimlo y gallant weithredu. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod yna gyfleusterau ar gael i ddatrys cwynion yn gyflym, er mwyn sicrhau, pan gânt eu gwneud, nad oes rhaid iddynt fynd drwy'r system a diweddu gerbron yr ombwdsmon. Fel y dywedodd Peter, nid oes gan yr ombwdsmon y pwerau yn aml i ymchwilio ymhellach i gŵyn. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld bod yr ombwdsmon yn teimlo y gallai roi sylwadau a chynghor ar sut i sicrhau gwelliannau, er nad oedd yn dilyn rhai cwynion i'r cam ymchwilio. Gŵyr yr Aelodau fod pobl yn aml wedi cyrraedd pen eu tennyn. Weithiau, gall ymddiheuriad a chydabyddiaeth o'r sefyllfa y mae pobl a'u teuluoedd yn canfod eu hunain ynddi fod yn hollbwysig.

We have much to learn from this report. We

Mae gennym lawer i'w ddysgu o'r adroddiad

will publish a complaints newsletter shortly, which will consider the review of the NHS complaints procedure and training issues for staff involved in the handling of complaints. It will also draw attention to the health service ombudsman's annual report, so that we can learn those lessons outside the Chamber. I am grateful for colleagues' support for this report and that we can now take forward its outcomes in making policy.

hwn. Byddwn yn cyhoeddi cylchlythyr ar gwynion yn y man, a fydd yn ystyried yr adolygiad o weithdrefnau cwyno'r NHS a'r materion hyfforddiant i staff sy'n delio â chwynion. Bydd hefyd yn rhoi sylw i adroddiad blynyddol ombwdsmon y gwasanaeth iechyd, fel y gallwn ddysgu'r gwersi hynny y tu allan i'r Siambr. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'm cyd-Aelodau am fynegi eu cefnogaeth i'r adroddiad hwn ac y gallwn bellach ddatblygu ei ganlyniadau wrth lunio polisi.

Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.43 p.m.
The session ended at 4.43 p.m.