



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 23 Mai 2000**

**Tuesday 23 May 2000**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Etholiadau i Fwrdd Canolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru  
*Elections to the Wales European Centre Board*
- 7 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd  
*Questions to the First Secretary*
- 22 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
*Points of Order*
- 27 Datganiad Busnes  
*Business Statement*
- 32 Rhaglen Amcan 2  
*Objective 2 Programme*
- 61 Rhaglen Weithredol Amcan 3  
*Objective 3 Operational Programme*
- 87 Cadarnhau Newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 19, 22.12 a 27  
*Ratification of Changes to Standing Order Nos. 19, 22.12 and 27*
- 95 Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig  
*Revised Business Statement*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Etholiadau i Fwrdd Canolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru Elections to the Wales European Centre Board**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Ieuan Wyn Jones.  
**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Ieuan Wyn Jones.

**The Business Secretary (Andrew Davies):** I propose that  
**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn*

*1. Notes that its application for membership of the Wales European Centre submitted by the First Secretary pursuant to the resolution agreed in Plenary on 29 February 2000, has been accepted;*

*1. Nodi bod ei gais i ddod yn aelod o Ganolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru, a gyflwynwyd gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn unol â'r penderfyniad a wnaethpwyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 29 Chwefror 2000, wedi'i dderbyn;*

*2. Appoints the following Assembly Members as Directors to the Board of the Wales European Centre:*

*2. Penodi'r Aelodau canlynol o'r Cynulliad yn Gyfarwyddwyr ar Fwrdd Canolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru:*

*Full Members: (i) Rhodri Morgan, (ii) Ieuan Wyn Jones, (iii) Nick Bourne.*

*Aelodau Llawn: (i) Rhodri Morgan, (ii) Ieuan Wyn Jones, (iii) Nick Bourne.*

*3. Requires that any Director who proposes to exercise his or her powers under the company's Articles of Association to appoint an alternate Director, does so only by appointing the appropriate Assembly Member as indicated below:*

*3. Mynnu nad yw unrhyw Gyfarwyddwr sydd yn bwriadu arfer ei bwerau o dan Erthyglau Cymdeithiad y cwmni i benodi Cyfarwyddwr yn ei le, ond yn gwneud hynny drwy benodi'r Aelod priodol o'r Cynulliad fel y nodir isod :*

*Full Member: Appropriate Alternate:  
Rhodri Morgan—Val Feld  
Ieuan Wyn Jones—Elin Jones  
Nick Bourne—Mick Bates.*

*Aelod Llawn: Aelod Priodol Arall yn ei Le:  
Rhodri Morgan—Val Feld  
Ieuan Wyn Jones—Elin Jones  
Nick Bourne—Mick Bates.*

*4. Appoints the following Assembly Member to exercise the Assembly's vote if necessary at any General Meeting of the Wales European Centre, having regard to the views of parties in the Assembly insofar as these can be ascertained before the vote is to be cast:*

*4. Penodi'r Aelodau canlynol o'r Cynulliad i fwrw pleidlais y Cynulliad, os bydd angen, mewn unrhyw Gyfarfod Cyffredinol o Ganolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru, gan roi sylw i farn y pleidiau yn y Cynulliad, cyhyd ag y gellir cadarnhau'r farn honno, cyn bwrw'r bleidlais:*

*Rhodri Morgan or, in his absence, Val Feld.*

*Rhodri Morgan neu, os nad yw ef yn bresennol, Val Feld.*

The motion nominates the Members who will represent the Assembly on the board of the Wales European Centre, following the Assembly's admission to the partnership that is responsible for the centre. Members will

Mae'r cynnig yn enwebu'r Aelodau a fydd yn cynrychioli'r Cynulliad ar fwrdd Canolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru, wedi i'r Cynulliad gael ei dderbyn i'r bartneriaeth sydd yn gyfrifol am y ganolfan. Bydd yr Aelodau'n cofio bod

recall that the Assembly is entitled to choose three members of the WEC board. Nominations were invited from the three largest parties in the Assembly. The motion reflects those nominations. Each member of the board can propose a substitute or alternate member to act on his or her behalf at board meetings. The motion identifies the appropriate alternate members who can be nominated for this purpose. The names of the appropriate alternates were suggested by the respective political parties. The alternate for the Conservative Party representative is a nominee of the Liberal Democrat Party. The reasons for this were explained in our debate on 29 February. As I said at the time, it was impossible for all four parties to have a board member. However, the smallest party should at least be entitled to an alternate place.

As a member of the partnership, the Assembly is entitled to one vote in general meetings of the company. Apart from the annual general meetings required by company law, general meetings are likely to be called when it is necessary to adjust the articles of association to accommodate new members of the partnership. In principle, general meetings could be called on any company matter. The resolution proposes that the First Secretary or, in his absence, Val Feld, should cast the Assembly vote. The motion states that the First Secretary is to cast the Assembly vote, having regard to the views of parties in the Assembly. That means that the First Secretary has an obligation, wherever possible, to seek to obtain those views before the general meeting. I assure the Assembly that as an administration, we will always seek to do that.

However, the motion recognises the possibility that, in particular circumstances, the First Secretary would be unable to ascertain the views of the parties before the vote is cast at general meetings. The motion ensures that the Assembly vote could still be cast under those circumstances. Ieuan Wyn Jones's amendment would delete that part of the motion. This would not be advisable because circumstances may arise, such as the occurrence of a general meeting during the summer recess, when it would not be practicable for the First Secretary to obtain the views of each political party in advance.

hawl gan y Cynulliad i ddewis tri aelod o fwrdd Canolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru. Gwahodddwyd enwebiadau gan y tair plaid fwyaf yn y Cynulliad. Mae'r cynnig yn adlewyrchu'r enwebiadau hynny. Caiff pob aelod o'r bwrdd gynnig dirprwy neu aelod arall i weithredu ar ei ran ef neu hi mewn cyfarfodydd bwrdd. Mae'r cynnig yn enwi'r aelodau priodol eraill y gellir eu henwebu i'r diben hwn. Awgrymwyd enwau'r aelodau priodol eraill gan y pleidiau priodol. Mae'r aelod arall ar gyfer cynrychiolydd y Blaid Geidwadol wedi'i enwebu gan Blaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Eglurwyd y rhesymau am hyn yn ein dadl ar 29 Chwefror. Fel y dywedais ar y pryd, yr oedd yn amhosibl i bob un o'r pedair plaid gael aelod ar y bwrdd. Fodd bynnag, dylai'r blaid leiaf gael hawl i le aelod priodol arall o leiaf.

Fel aelod o'r bartneriaeth, mae gan y Cynulliad hawl i un bleidlais yng nghyfarfodydd cyffredinol y cwmni. Ar wahân i'r cyfarfodydd cyffredinol blynyddol sydd yn ofynnol yn ôl cyfraith cwmnïau, mae cyfarfodydd cyffredinol yn debygol o gael eu galw pan fo angen addasu'r erthyglau cymdeithasiad i gynnwys aelodau newydd o'r bartneriaeth. Mewn egwyddor, gellid galw cyfarfodydd cyffredinol ar unrhyw fater cwmni. Mae'r cynnig yn awgrymu mai'r Prif Ysgrifennydd neu, os nad yw'n bresennol, Val Feld, a ddylai fwrw pleidlais y Cynulliad. Dywed y cynnig fod y Prif Ysgrifennydd i fwrw pleidlais y Cynulliad gan roi sylw i farn y pleidiau yn y Cynulliad. Golyga hynny fod rhwymedigaeth ar y Prif Ysgrifennydd, lle bynnag y bo modd, i geisio'r farn honno cyn y cyfarfod cyffredinol. Rhoddaf sicrwydd i'r Cynulliad y byddwn fel gweinyddiaeth bob amser yn ceisio gwneud hynny.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynnig yn cydnabod y posibilïad na fyddai'r Prif Ysgrifennydd, mewn amgylchiadau penodol, yn gallu canfod barn y pleidiau cyn bwrw'r bleidlais mewn cyfarfodydd cyffredinol. Mae'r cynnig yn sicrhau y byddai modd o hyd i fwrw pleidlais y Cynulliad o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny. Byddai gwelliant Ieuan Wyn Jones yn dileu'r rhan honno o'r cynnig. Ni fyddai hyn yn ddoeth oherwydd gallai amgylchiadau godi, fel cyfarfod cyffredinol a ddigwyddai yn ystod toriad yr haf, pan na fyddai'n ymarferol i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd gaanfod barn pob plaid ymlaen llaw. Effaith gwelliant Ieuan fyddai

The effect of Ieuan's amendment would be that the Assembly could not vote in such circumstances. That would in turn have a blocking effect on the general meeting of the WEC board because, under the terms of our admission to the partnership, passing a resolution in general meetings is not just a matter of securing a simple majority. The Assembly must also have voted in favour of that motion. Ieuan's amendment might have unfortunate consequences, which I am sure he would not want. It could prevent the passing of a motion to which all the partners are agreed, simply because the Assembly representative could not cast a vote in favour. We should avoid the possibility that a motion could not be carried as a result.

I propose the motion be adopted as originally submitted. I have given an assurance today of our intent. I have also assured Ieuan privately that we will consult wherever possible before general meetings, which should be sufficient to ease his concerns that the Assembly vote properly reflects the broad views of the Assembly as a whole. I hope that in the light of that assurance, Ieuan will feel able to withdraw the amendment.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 1. Yn y frawddeg olaf dileer

*cyhyd ag y gellir cadarnhau'r farn honno, cyn bwrw'r bleidlais.*

Pan geir cais fel hyn gan y Trefnydd, yr ydych yn gwrando'n ofalus i weld a oes modd derbyn ei sylwadau. Yn anffodus, dan yr amgylchiadau ni allwn dderbyn ei sylwadau oherwydd ceir bwriad yn y cynnig i benodi cynrychiolwyr o bob plaid i fwrdd Canolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru. Ni fyddwn ar unrhyw gyfrif yn dymuno i bleidlais gael ei bwrw heb ystyried barn y pleidiau eraill yn gyntaf. Ofnaf fod Andrew yn rhygnu ar y pwynt ynghylch amgylchiadau pan na fyddai modd clywed llais y pleidiau eraill. Gan y bydd cynrychiolaeth o bob plaid ar y bwrdd, ni allaf ragweld y fath amgylchiadau. Er mwyn diogelu gwleidyddiaeth gynhwysol y Cynulliad, mae'n bwysig bod llais y pleidiau eraill yn glywadwy a dyna paham fod angen pleidleisio ar y gwelliant.

na allai'r Cynulliad bleidleisio mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath. Câi hynny effaith rhwystro yn ei dro ar gyfarfod cyffredinol bwrdd Canolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru oherwydd, o dan y telerau wrth ein derbyn i'r bartneriaeth, fod derbyn cynnig mewn cyfarfodydd cyffredinol yn fwy na mater o sicrhau mwyafrif syml. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad hefyd fod wedi pleidleisio o blaid y cynnig hwnnw. Gallai gwelliant Ieuan arwain at ganlyniadau anffodus, ac yr wyf yn sicr na ddymunai hynny. Gallai atal derbyn cynnig y mae'r holl bartneriaid wedi cytuno arno, dim ond am na allai cynrychiolydd y Cynulliad fwrw pleidlais o'i blaid. Dylem osgoi'r posibilid na allai cynnig gael ei dderbyn o ganlyniad.

Cynigiau fod y cynnig yn cael ei dderbyn fel y'i cyflwynwyd yn wreiddiol. Yr wyf wedi rhoi sicrwydd heddiw ynghylch ein bwriad. Yr wyf hefyd wedi rhoi sicrwydd i Ieuan yn breifat y byddwn yn ymgynghori lle bynnag y bo modd cyn cyfarfodydd cyffredinol, a dylai hynny fod yn ddigon i leddfu ei bryderon y dylai pleidlais y Cynulliad adlewyrchu'n briodol farn gyffredinol y Cynulliad fel cyfangorff. Gobeithiaf y bydd Ieuan, yng ngoleuni'r sicrwydd hwnnw, yn teimlo ei fod yn gallu tynnu'n ôl y gwelliant.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I propose amendment 1. In the last sentence delete

*insofar as these can be ascertained before the vote is to be cast.*

When the Business Secretary makes this kind of request, you listen carefully to see if you can accept his remarks. Unfortunately, under the circumstances we cannot accept his remarks because the motion's intention is to appoint representatives of all parties for the board of the Wales European Centre. I would not wish under any circumstances for a vote to be cast without the opinions of the other parties first being considered. I am afraid that Andrew is labouring the point about circumstances that would not allow the voices of the other parties to be heard. As the board will include representation from all parties, I cannot foresee any such circumstances. In order to safeguard the Assembly's inclusive politics, it is important that the voice of the other parties can be heard, and that is why the amendment should be put to a vote.

2:07 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Ymddengys nad oes neb arall yn dymuno siarad o blaid y cynnig.

**The Presiding Officer:** It seems that no one else wishes to speak in favour of the motion.

Andrew, do you want to respond to Ieuan, before the vote on the amendment?

Andrew, a ddymunwch ymateb i Ieuan, cyn y bleidlais ar y gwelliant?

**Andrew Davies:** There is obviously a difference of opinion and therefore it should be put to a vote.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'n amlwg bod gwahaniaeth barn ac felly dylid ei roi i bleidlais.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 20, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 1: For 20, Abstain 1, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
German, Michael  
Hancock, Brian  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Jones, Ann  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Rogers, Peter  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:  
The following Member abstained:

Richards, Rod

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 47, Abstain 1, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick

Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:  
The following Member abstained:

Richards, Rod

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd Questions to the First Secretary**

### **Pwerdai sydd yn Llosgi Nwy Gas-fired Power Stations**

**Q1 Ann Jones:** What discussions has the First Secretary had with the Department of Trade and Industry about the impact in north Wales of the decision to lift the moratorium on new gas-fired power stations? (OAQ5213)

**C1 Ann Jones:** Pa drafodaethau a gafodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd â'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ynghylch yr effaith ar ogledd Cymru o'r penderfyniad i godi'r moratoriwm ar bwerdai newydd sydd yn llosgi nwy? (OAQ5213)

**The First Secretary (Rhodri Morgan):** I spoke to Stephen Byers, the Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, about the stricter consents policy shortly before he announced his decision to lift the moratorium. I would not claim that my phone call led directly to that lifting because any moratorium is short term. I explained to Stephen Byers the importance of having a secure, reasonably priced electricity supply on Anglesey, and the impact that it would have on the island's economic regeneration, particularly the northern side, which is one of the weakest economic areas in Wales. You will have a particular interest, Ann, in the gas reserves—and the impact of their exploitation—off the north Wales coast close to your constituency, if a gas-fired power station at Rhos-goch is established as we would hope and anticipate, and if any additional exploitation of those reserves were to happen.

**Ann Jones:** The lifting of the moratorium is good news for north Wales and for the whole of Wales. The Irish Sea's potential for further extraction of natural gases remains considerable. Will you ensure that our strategies for encouraging development and job creation across north Wales take account of this possibility? Can you also assure me that such projects will receive the full co-operation and assistance of Assembly and Department of Trade and Industry officials so that potential investors do not waste considerable amounts of money on applications that might be rejected?

**The First Secretary:** The Rhos-goch issue has been complicated by the fact that there were three applicants, namely Canataxx, Egni Biomass Ltd and Burlington Resources (Irish Sea) Ltd. However, the Isle of Anglesey County Council has now given a preference to Burlington Resources (Irish Sea) Ltd, to see if it can make the best use of the site in connection with the former oil pipeline, which can be reused as a gas pipeline, to exploit the north Wales coast gas reserves. That can be used to establish an efficient 560 megawatt combined cycle gas-fired power station, which would also be a catalyst for alleviating the economic problems of the northern half of Ynys Môn.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd (Rhodri Morgan):** Siaredais â Stephen Byers, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Fasnach a Diwydiant, ynghylch y polisi caniatâd caethach ychydig cyn iddo gyhoeddi ei benderfyniad i godi'r moratoriwm. Ni honnwn fod fy ngalwad ffôn wedi arwain yn uniongyrchol at y codi hwnnw oherwydd mai mesur tymor byr yw pob moratoriwm. Eglurais i Stephen Byers mor bwysig yw cael cyflenwad trydan sicr ar bris rhesymol yn Ynys Môn, a'r effaith a gâi ar adfywiad economaidd yr ynys, yn enwedig yr ochr ogleddol, sydd yn un o'r ardaloedd economaidd gwannaf yng Nghymru. Bydd gennych ddiddordeb arbennig, Ann, yn y cronfeydd nwy—a'r effaith o'u defnyddio—oddi ar arfordir gogledd Cymru yn agos i'ch etholaeth, os sefydlir pwerdy sydd yn llosgi nwy yn Rhos-goch fel y gobeithiwn ac y disgwyliwn, ac os ceir defnydd ychwanegol o'r cronfeydd hynny.

**Ann Jones:** Mae codi'r moratoriwm yn newyddion da i ogledd Cymru ac i Gymru gyfan. Mae potensial sylweddol o hyd ym Môr Iwerddon i dynnu ychwaneg o nwyon naturiol. A wnewch sicrhau bod ein strategaethau ar gyfer hybu datblygu a chreu swyddi ledled gogledd Cymru yn ystyried y posibilid hwn? A allwch hefyd roi sicrwydd imi y bydd prosiectau o'r fath yn cael cydweithrediad a chymorth llawn swyddogion y Cynulliad a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant fel nad yw buddsoddwyr posibl yn gwastraffu symiau sylweddol o arian ar geisiadau a allai gael eu gwrthod yn y dyfodol?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Cymhlethwyd mater Rhos-goch gan y ffaith bod tri ymgeisydd, sef Canataxx, Egni Biomass Cyfyngedig a Burlington Resources (Irish Sea) Cyfyngedig. Fodd bynnag, mae Cyngor Sir Ynys Môn bellach wedi rhoi ffafriaeth i Burlington Resources (Irish Sea) Cyfyngedig, er mwyn canfod a oes modd iddo wneud y defnydd gorau o'r safle mewn cysylltiad â'r biblinell olew flaenorol, y gellir ei haildefnyddio fel piblinell nwy, er mwyn defnyddio cronfeydd nwy arfordir gogledd Cymru. Gellir defnyddio hynny i sefydlu pwerdy effeithlon 560 megawat sydd yn llosgi nwy drwy gylchred cyfunol, a fyddai hefyd yn gatalydd i liniaru problemau economaidd hanner gogleddol Ynys Môn.



**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I thank Rhodri for that reply and for his positive statement about Rhos-goch. Will you assure me that you will keep an eagle eye on those developments as they affect Anglesey, in terms of the application in respect of the Rhos-goch site, which will bring much needed investment to that area? Will you also assure me that your officials will contact the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions regarding the combined heat and power components of that development, and the important link that it will establish with Anglesey Aluminium Metals Limited to secure the long-term future of that plant?

**The First Secretary:** Yes. In November 1999, the people of Anglesey were disappointed when Helen Liddell, the Minister for Energy, did not give Rhos-goch the go ahead during the period of the moratorium on new gas-fired power stations. She did not exempt it from the general moratorium because, although the scheme would have made significant heat supplies available, they were not sufficient to demonstrate the kind of efficiency levels for combined heat and power set out in the October 1998 White Paper. Those levels were hurdles to cross to overcome the moratorium. They required thermal efficiency levels of around 70 per cent and the station offered around 60 per cent.

As the moratorium comes to an end at the end of this year, we expect that station to proceed. We also expect that to prolong the life of the Anglesey Aluminium smelter plant. It may also attract other industries that are looking for an energy park environment and that can use the steam or the energy. We hope that Rhos-goch will develop in a similar way to Baglan Energy Park in Port Talbot.

**Peter Rogers:** I realise that you appreciate the effect of lifting this moratorium on deprived parts of north Wales. However, will you assure us that future economic regeneration of that area, resulting from the lifting of the moratorium, will not be stifled by adverse planning decisions taken in far-away Cardiff through misunderstandings? That heaps misery on local people, as we witnessed with the call-in of the proposed Beaumaris Marina by the Assembly's Planning Inspectorate.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolchaf i Rhodri am yr ateb hwnnw ac am ei ddatganiad cadarnhaol ar Ros-goch. A wnewch fy sicrhau y byddwch yn cadw llygad barcut ar y datblygiadau hynny fel yr effeithiant ar Ynys Môn, o ran y cais ar gyfer safle Rhos-goch, a ddaw â buddsoddi mawr ei angen i'r ardal honno? A wnewch hefyd fy sicrhau y bydd eich swyddogion yn cysylltu ag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau ynglŷn â'r elfennau gwres a phŵer cyfunol yn y datblygiad hwnnw, a'r cyswllt pwysig a sefydla ag Anglesey Aluminium Metals Cyfyngedig er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol tymor hir y gwaith hwnnw?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Gwnaf. Yn Nhachwedd 1999, siomwyd pobl Ynys Môn pan na roddodd Helen Liddell, y Gweinidog dros Ynni, rwydd hynt i Ros-goch yn ystod cyfnod y moratoriwm ar bwerau newydd sydd yn llosgi nwy. Nid eithriodd hi o'r moratoriwm cyffredinol oherwydd, er y byddai'r cynllun wedi darparu cyflenwadau gwres sylweddol, nad oeddent yn ddigon i ddangos y math o lefelau effeithlonrwydd ar gyfer gwres a phŵer cyfunol a bennwyd yn y Papur Gwyn yn Hydref 1998. Yr oedd y lefelau hynny'n glwydi i'w neidio er mwyn goresgyn y moratoriwm. Yr oeddent yn gofyn am lefelau effeithlonrwydd thermol o tua 70 y cant ac yr oedd y pwerdy'n cynnig tua 60 y cant.

Gan fod y moratoriwm yn dod i ben ddiwedd y flwyddyn hon, disgwyliwn i'r pwerdy hwnnw fynd rhagddo. Disgwyliwn hefyd i hynny ymestyn oes gwaith smeltio Anglesey Aluminium. Gallai hefyd ddenu diwydiannau eraill sydd yn chwilio am amgylchedd parc ynni ac sydd yn gallu defnyddio'r ager neu'r ynni. Gobeithiwn y bydd Rhos-goch yn datblygu mewn modd debyg i Barc Ynni Baglan yn Port Talbot.

**Peter Rogers:** Sylweddolaf eich bod yn deall effaith codi'r moratoriwm hwn ar rannau difreintiedig o ogledd Cymru. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch roi sicrwydd i ni na chaiff datblygiad economaidd yr ardal honno ei ffigu yn y dyfodol gan benderfyniadau cynllunio andwyol a wneir yng Nghaerdydd bell drwy gamddealltwriaeth? Mae hynny'n peri adfyd i bobl leol, fel y gwelsom pan alwyd i mewn y marina arfaethedig ym Miwmares gan Arolygiaeth Gynllunio'r Cynulliad.

**The First Secretary:** One of Wales's geographical curiosities is that Holyhead is two hours from Dublin and six hours from Cardiff. However, Welsh geography is beyond our control. It is not a matter of whether Cardiff is far away, but of the quality of the representation provided by north Wales Members to ensure that the case is presented. I am sure that Peter does not believe that the quality of representation in north Wales is insufficient to enable the case to be made for this development, or in Beaumaris to have their full planning procedure rights. However, you cannot exempt developments from the normal planning procedure, regardless of whether they are next door to the Assembly building or far away from here and nearer to a capital of another member state of the European Community. The same rules must apply to every development that comes before us. If it raises issues of more than local significance, the usual call-in procedure or a public inquiry must be considered. You cannot ask for an exemption for developments because of some rule about mileage from Cardiff.

**Christine Humphreys:** Although I welcome the lifting of the moratorium as an answer to Ynys Môn's power supply problems and the impact that it will have on Ynys Môn's economic problems, it cannot be regarded as a long-term solution. The Irish Sea gas reserve could run out within the next 20 years. Will you give a commitment that you will begin an examination of the use of renewable energy supplies, such as harnessing tidal power, in the future, in view of the Assembly's commitment to sustainable development?

2:17 p.m.

**The First Secretary:** It behoves us all to think about what happens after gas reserves run out. I might differ from Christine by 10 years and say that it will be more like 30 than 20 years. Much will depend on the point I made earlier in response to Ann Jones, that this may stimulate further exploration activity for more gas reserves off the north Wales coast. They may find some; they may not—that is in the lap of the gods or in the lap of the skills of the people engaged in the exploration activity. However, at some point there will have to be a switch to renewable

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Un o hynodion daearyddol Cymru yw bod Caergybi'n ddwy awr o Ddilyn ac yn chwe awr o Gaerdydd. Fodd bynnag, mae daearyddiaeth Cymru y tu hwnt i'n rheolaeth. Nid cwestiwn ydyw a yw Caerdydd yn bell i ffwrdd ai peidio, ond ansawdd y gynrychiolaeth a ddarperir gan Aelodau gogledd Cymru er mwyn sicrhau cyflwyno'r achos. Yr wyf yn sicr nad yw Peter yn credu bod ansawdd y gynrychiolaeth yng ngogledd Cymru'n annigonol i allu cyflwyno'r achos dros y datblygiad hwn, neu ym Miwmares iddynt gael ei holl hawliau cynllunio. Fodd bynnag, ni allwch eithrio datblygiadau o'r weithdrefn gynllunio arferol, boed hwy y drws nesaf i adeilad y Cynulliad neu ymhell oddi yma ac yn agosach i brifddinas aelod wladwriaeth arall o'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd. Rhaid cymhwyso'r un rheolau i bob datblygiad a ddaw ger ein bron. Os yw'n codi materion sydd o bwys ehangach na rhai lleol, rhaid ystyried y weithdrefn galw i mewn arferol neu ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Ni allwch ofyn am eithriad i ddatblygiadau oherwydd rhyw reol ynghylch milltired o Gaerdydd.

**Christine Humphreys:** Er fy mod yn croesawu codi'r moratoriwm fel ateb i broblemau cyflenwad pŵer Ynys Môn a'r effaith a gaiff hynny ar broblemau economaidd Ynys Môn, ni ellir ei ystyried yn ateb tymor hir. Gallai cronfa nwy Môr Iwerddon ddod i ben o fewn yr 20 mlynedd nesaf. A wnewch roi ymrwymiad y byddwch yn dechrau archwiliad o'r defnydd o gyflenwadau ynni adnewyddadwy, fel harneisio pŵer y llanw, yn y dyfodol, yng ngolwg ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Dylem oll feddwl am yr hyn a ddigwydd ar ôl i'r cronfeydd nwy ddod i ben. Gallwn anghytuno â Christine o 10 mlynedd a dweud y bydd yn debycach i 30 na 20 mlynedd. Bydd llawer yn dibynnu ar yr hyn a ddywedais yn gynharach mewn ymateb i Ann Jones: y gallai hyn symbylu gwaith archwilio pellach am fwy o gronfeydd nwy oddi ar arfordir gogledd Cymru. Efallai y byddant yn dod o hyd i ryw faint; efallai na fyddant—mae hynny yn nwylo'r duwiau neu yn nwylo medrau'r bobl sydd yn ymwneud â'r gwaith archwilio. Fodd bynnag, ar ryw

forms of energy. Ynys Môn is extremely rich in this respect on account of the strength of the sea currents and the availability of wind resources. Off-shore and on-shore wind farms could be established there as well as tidal current power stations. In 30 years' time we will not be running short of energy, although its cost might be different from that of the gas-fired power station that we are now talking about. However, a combined cycle gas-fired power station—if it manages to sell all its bare heat, in other words, the steam—is also a very energy efficient method of generating power and finding a use for the waste heat. Even after the combined cycle has taken some of the heat, you still have spare steam. If you can find good industrial or agricultural use for that, you have a very high level of energy efficiency.

adeq bydd rhaid troi at ffurfiau ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae Ynys Môn yn gyfoethog iawn yn hyn o beth ar gyfrif cryfder ceryntau'r môr ac argaeledd adnoddau gwynt. Gellid sefydlu ffermydd gwynt yno ar yr arfordir ac oddi arno yn ogystal â phwerdai ceryntau'r llanw. Ymhen 30 mlynedd ni fyddwn yn brin o ynni, er y gallai ei gost fod yn wahanol i'r pwerdy sydd yn llosgi nwy yr ydym yn ei drafod. Fodd bynnag, mae pwerdy sydd yn llosgi nwy drwy gylchred cyfunol—os llwydda i werthu'r cwbl o'i wres noeth, hynny yw, yr ager—hefyd yn ddull ynni-effeithlon iawn o gynhyrchu pŵer ac o ganfod defnydd i'r gwres gwastraff. Hyd yn oed ar ôl i'r cylchred cyfunol gymryd rhywfaint o'r gwres, mae gennych ager dros ben o hyd. Os gallwch ganfod defnydd diwydiannol neu amaethyddol da i hynny, mae gennych lefel uchel iawn o effeithlonrwydd ynni.

### **Polisi Iechyd y Cynulliad** **The Assembly's Health Policy**

**C2 Geraint Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Ysgrifennydd ddatganiad ar ddatblygiad cyffredinol polisi iechyd y Cynulliad? (OAQ5232)

**Q2 Geraint Davies:** Will the First Secretary make a statement on the overall development of the Assembly's health policy? (OAQ5232)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae sicrhau gwell iechyd a lles i bobl Cymru yn un o'n blaenoriaethau pennaf yn y Cynulliad. Cynhwysir elfennau o'n polisi iechyd i Gymru yn y cynllun strategol, sydd yn cydnabod yr angen i wynebu ac i ddatrys problemau sylfaenol afiechyd yng Nghymru ar yr un pryd â cheisio gwella safon a pherfformiad y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru. Yn ogystal, mae ceisio lleihau anghydraddoldeb yn ein cymdeithas yn allweddol i symud ymlaen yn y maes hwn.

**The First Secretary:** Securing better health and welfare for the people of Wales is one of our main priorities in the Assembly. Elements of our health policy for Wales are included in the strategic plan, which acknowledges the need to address and resolve the fundamental problems of ill health in Wales at the same time as endeavouring to improve the standard and the performance of the national health service in Wales. In addition, trying to reduce inequalities in our society is crucial in order to progress in this area.

**Geraint Davies:** Diolch am yr ateb. Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch fod angen arweiniad clir i gyflawni polisiâu iechyd sydd yn gallu datrys problemau megis amserau aros, prinder staff a gwelyau, a'r gagendor iechyd? Yn ogystal, a gytunwch mai'r hyn a welwn, yn y de, er enghraifft, yw oedi ar y penderfyniad i gael ysbyty newydd yn y Rhondda, sydd yn ardal hynod o ddifreintiedig? Yn y gogledd, bwriedir cau adnoddau gwerthfawr megis ysbytai Dobshill, Meadowslea a Threfalun. A ydych yn methu yn eich cyfrifoldeb i bobl Cymru

**Geraint Davies:** Thank you for the reply. However, do you agree that clear guidance is needed to deliver health policies that can resolve problems such as waiting times, the shortage of staff and beds, and the health divide? In addition, do you agree that we what we see in the south, for example is a delay on the decision for a new hospital in the Rhondda, which is a very deprived area? In the north, there are proposals to close vital resources such as Dobshill, Meadowslea and Trevalyn hospitals. Are you failing in your responsibility to the people of Wales in

ynglŷn ag iechyd?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Nac wyf. Mae egwyddor ein gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn golygu bod angen arweiniad. Yn ogystal, mae penderfyniadau yn cael eu datganoli i'r awdurdodau a'r ymddiriedolaethau iechyd a hwy sydd yn gorfod rhoi'r ceisiadau busnes ger ein bron. Yr ydym ni yn penderfynu pa brosiect sydd yn gweddu gorau i'r blaenoriaethau sydd yn y cynllun strategol y flwyddyn hon neu'r flwyddyn nesaf. Mae'r trafodaethau yn parhau rhwng swyddogion Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf, ein swyddogion yn y Cynulliad ac Ymddiriedolaeth NHS Pontypridd a'r Rhondda ynglŷn â'r prosiect i gael ysbyty newydd yng ngwaelod cwm Rhondda. Yn dilyn y trafodaethau hynny, byddant yn ystyried prynu safle i'r ysbyty newydd a pharatoi cais busnes er mwyn ei roi ger ein bron fel prosiect cyfalaf.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Yr oeddwn i'n ffodus i gael triniaeth ar gyfer fy nghalon o fewn ychydig ddyddiau. Fodd bynnag, mae cannoedd o bobl yng Nghymru yn gorfod aros am gyfnodau afresymol o hir i gael triniaeth anghenrheidiol. Yn ôl astudiaeth ddiweddar, yr oedd 4,273 o bobl yn disgwyl dros 18 mis yng Nghymru am gael llawdriniaeth tra bod y ffigur cyfatebol yn Lloegr yn ddim ond saith mis. Pryd y bydd y ffigur hwn yn lleihau yng Nghymru, ac y cawn y gwasanaeth hanfodol ar gyfer y rhai sydd yn dioddef?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae Dafydd wedi codi pwynt rhesymol, ar un lefel, ond credaf y byddai'n derbyn bod dwy ffordd i wasanaeth iechyd genedlaethol drefnu ei flaenoriaethau. Gellir rhoi blaenoriaeth gref i'r bobl sydd yn dost iawn, sydd yn golygu bod y rhai sydd yn dost—ond heb fod yn ddifrifol dost—yn tueddu i aros yn afresymol o hir, ddwy neu dair blynedd efallai, oherwydd bod arnynt eisiau llawdriniaeth ar ryw beth fel chwyddau neu gyrn ar draed.

Credaf fod y rhan fwyaf o bobl wrthrychol yn dweud ei bod yn well byw yng Nghymru os ydych yn ddifrifol dost. Os ydych yn dost, ond heb fod yn ddifrifol dost, byddai'n well i chi fyw yn Lloegr.

**David Melding:** Your administration is now 18,000 adrift of the in-patient waiting list target that your party set in the last general election. Will you ever achieve the target that

regard to health?

**The First Secretary:** No. The principle of our national health service means that there is a need for guidance. In addition, decisions are being devolved to the health authorities and trusts and they have to submit their business cases to us. We decide which project best fits the priorities in the strategic plan this year or next year. Discussions are continuing between officials of Bro Taf Health Authority, our officials in the Assembly and Pontypridd and Rhondda NHS Trust concerning the project to have a new hospital in the lower Rhondda valley. Following those discussions, they will consider buying a site for the new hospital and preparing a business case to submit it to us as a capital project.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I was fortunate to have treatment for a cardiac complaint within a few days. However, hundreds of people in Wales have to wait for unreasonably long lengths of time for necessary treatment. According to a recent study, there were 4,273 people waiting for over 18 months in Wales for surgery while the corresponding figure in England was only seven months. When will this figure decrease in Wales, and when will we have the essential service for those who are suffering?

**The First Secretary:** Dafydd has raised a reasonable point, on one level, but I think that he would accept that there are two ways for a national health service to organise its priorities. One can give a very high priority to those who are very ill, which means that those who are ill—but not seriously ill—will tend to wait unreasonably long, two or three years perhaps, because they need surgery for something like bunions or corns.

I believe that the majority of objective people would say that if you are seriously ill, it is better to live in Wales. If you are ill, but not seriously ill, it would be better to live in England.

**David Melding:** Mae'ch gweinyddiaeth yn 18,000 ar gyfeiliorn bellach o'r targed rhestrau aros cleifion mewnol a osododd eich plaid yn yr etholiad cyffredinol diwethaf. A

was promised?

**The First Secretary:** Yes. With the major additional injection of funding announced by Chancellor of the Exchequer in the March budget for this year, next year and the year after. There is no reason why those objectives for waiting list reductions should not be achievable.

**Kirsty Williams:** Would you agree that we will never solve the waiting list and waiting time problem until we tackle the issue of medical emergency capacity in Wales? The money that you mentioned will never solve that problem if it ploughed into the health service in short-term waiting list initiatives. Those do nothing but distort clinical priorities and, while they deliver short-term political gain, in the long term they will not deliver better healthcare for Wales.

**The First Secretary:** The questions that you and David have put to me illustrate the fact that any responsible minister—whether a First Secretary or a Health Secretary—is never in a win-win situation. If you say that you will concentrate on waiting lists, you will receive the criticism that you have just made, that it distorts clinical priorities. If, however, you say you will adhere to clinical priorities, you will be attacked for failing to tackle the problem of people who have to wait for two years or more to have their bunions or their corns fixed by surgery, and who may be in considerable pain while they are waiting.

I concur with Kirsty's view that clinical priorities are more important than the political objectives of saving ministers' skins in London or secretaries' skins in the Assembly. It is not about headlines, but about trying to spend public money most wisely. A consequence of that, frequently, will be the kind of attack that was contained in Dafydd Wigley's question: that far more people wait for longer periods in Wales than in England. That is because we have chosen to spend the money differently by treating people who are more seriously ill earlier. That means that there is a tail of long waiting which is unfortunately difficult to combat. It is

fyddwch yn cyrraedd y targed a addawyd byth?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Byddwn. Gyda'r chwistrelliad ychwanegol mawr o gyllid a gyhoeddwyd gan Ganghellor y Trysorlys yn y gyllideb ym Mawrth ar gyfer eleni, y flwyddyn nesaf a'r flwyddyn wedyn, Nid oes rheswm pam na ddylai fod modd cyrraedd yr amcanion hynny ar gyfer lleihau rhestrau aros.

**Kirsty Williams:** A gytunech na fyddwn byth yn datrys y broblem rhestrau aros ac amseroedd aros hyd nes yr awn i'r afael â mater nifer y gwelyau argyfwng meddygol yng Nghymru? Ni fydd yr arian y soniasoch amdano byth yn datrys y broblem honno os caiff ei gladdu yn y gwasanaeth iechyd ar ffurf mentrau rhestrau aros tymor byr. Nid yw'r rheini ond yn ystumio blaenoriaethau clinigol ac, er eu bod yn dod ag enillion gwleidyddol tymor byr, yn y tymor hir ni ddeuant â gofal iechyd gwell i Gymru.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae'r cwestiynau yr ydych chi a David wedi eu gofyn i mi'n dangos nad yw unrhyw weinidog cyfrifol—un ai'n Brif Ysgrifennydd neu'n Ysgrifennydd Iechyd—byth mewn sefyllfa lle y mae'n sicr o ennill. Os dywedwch y byddwch yn canolbwyntio ar restrau aros, cewch y feirniadaeth yr ydych newydd ei mynegi, sef ei fod yn ystumio blaenoriaethau clinigol. Fodd bynnag, os dywedwch y byddwch yn glynu wrth flaenoriaethau clinigol, ymosodir arnoch am fethu ag ymdrin â phroblem pobl sydd yn gorfod aros ddwy flynedd a mwy i gael gwella eu chwyddau neu eu cyn drwy lawdriniaeth, a gallent fod mewn cryn boen wrth ddisgwyl.

Cytunaf â barn Kirsty bod blaenoriaethau clinigol yn bwysicach na'r amcanion gwleidyddol o achub crwyn gweinidogion yn Llundain neu grwyn ysgrifenyddion yn y Cynulliad. Nid yw'n ymwneud â phenawdau, ond â cheisio gwario arian cyhoeddus yn y modd doethaf. Un canlyniad i hynny, yn aml, fydd y math o ymosodiad a gafwyd yng nghwestiwn Dafydd Wigley: bod llawer mwy o bobl yn disgwyl am gyfnodau hwy yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Mae hynny am ein bod wedi penderfynu gwario'r arian yn wahanol drwy drin pobl sydd yn fwy difrifol wael yn gynharach. Golyga hyn fod rhes o aros hir sydd yn anodd ei gwrthweithio,

difficult to deflect the criticism because those waiting long periods are also in pain. There needs to be a 'back stop' for those waiting a long time, even though they are not as seriously ill as those who get treated earlier and better in Wales than in England because our priorities are different.

gwaetha'r modd. Mae hefyd yn anodd bwrw'r feirmiadaeth oherwydd bod y rhai sydd yn disgwyl cyfnodau hir hefyd mewn poen. Mae angen 'stop ôl' ar gyfer y rhai sydd yn aros yn hir, er nad ydynt mor ddifrifol wael â'r rhai a gaiff eu trin yn gynt ac yn well yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr am fod ein blaenoriaethau'n wahanol.

### **Cynrychioli Cymru ar Weithgorau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd Representing Wales on the European Union Working Groups**

**C3 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A gafodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Faterion Tramor a Chymanwlad ynglŷn â chynrychiolaeth Cymru ar weithgorau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd? (OAQ5242)

**Q3 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Has the First Secretary had discussions with the Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs with regard to the representation of Wales on the working groups of the European Union? (OAQ5242)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Naddo. Nid wyf wedi trafod â'r Ysgrifennydd Tramor ynglŷn â'r mater hwn, ond mae'n flaenoriaeth i mi ar gyfer ail flwyddyn y Cynulliad.

**The First Secretary:** No. I have not had discussions with the Foreign Secretary concerning this matter, but it is a priority for me for the Assembly's second year.

O dan dermau'r Concordat ar Gydlyn Materion Polisiâu'r UE, mae'r Cynulliad yn gallu cydweithio â'r adrannau perthnasol yn Whitehall i anfon swyddogion i'r gweithgorau materion Ewropeaidd fel rhan o ddirprwyaeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae hyn yn egwyddor ac felly nid oes eisiau trafod yr egwyddor hon â'r Ysgrifennydd Tramor. Er hynny, mae'n bwysig bod gennym gynrychiolaeth gryfach oherwydd dim ond un tro y digwyddodd hyn yn ein blwyddyn gyntaf. Mae'n flaenoriaeth gennyf weithio ar y mater hwn yn ail flwyddyn y Cynulliad.

Under the terms of the Concordat on Co-ordination of EU Policy Issues, the Assembly can co-operate with the relevant Whitehall departments to send officials to working groups as part of the United Kingdom delegation. This is a principle and so there is no need to discuss this principle with the Foreign Secretary. It is important, however, that we have a stronger representation because this only happened once in our first year. It is a priority for me to work on this matter in the Assembly's second year.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolch i chi am ymateb mor gadarnhaol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cael ein cynrychioli gan gymaint o bobl o Gymru ag sydd yn bosibl ar y gweithgorau hyn. Mae hynny oherwydd bod angen inni ddylanwadu ar ddatblygiadau yn Ewrop cyn i benderfyniadau gael eu gwneud yn hytrach nag wedyn. Yn sgîl datganoli yr ydym eisiau gweld bod gan Gymru ddylanwad yn Ewrop, yn hytrach na gorfod derbyn yr hyn a gytunir yn Whitehall o hyd.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Thank you for responding so positively. It is important that we are represented by as many people from Wales as possible on these working groups. That is because we need to influence developments in Europe before decisions are made rather than afterwards. In the wake of devolution, we want to see that Wales has influence in Europe rather than always having to accept what is agreed in Whitehall.

2:27 p.m.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Derbyniaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym am edrych am gyfleoedd mewn modd artiffisial er mwyn cael cynrychiolaeth ar ddirprwyaethau o'r

**The First Secretary:** I accept that. However, we do not want to artificially seek opportunities to get representation on delegations from this country to the Council

wlad hon i Gyngor y Gweinidogion. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig yw beth yw'ch blaenoriaeth ar y pryd. Ym mlwyddyn gyntaf y Cynulliad, rhoddwyd blaenoriaeth i'r cronfeydd strwythurol. Mae ein swyddogion wedi bod yn gweithio'n galed iawn ym Mrwsel, fel rhan o ddirprwyaethau ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny yr un peth â chael cynrychiolaeth ar Gyngor y Gweinidogion neu fod eich swyddogion yn cael eich cynrycholi ar y gweithgorau. Felly, mae hynny hefyd yn flaenoriaeth.

Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhesymol ein bod wedi rhoi cymaint o bwyslais ar y cronfeydd strwythurol yn ystod ein blwyddyn gyntaf. Dyna'r hyn yr oedd pobl Cymru yn disgwyl inni ei wneud.

**Nick Bourne:** Will the First Secretary accept that he could represent Wales, both at home and outside Wales, far better if he were not trying to do two full-time jobs as First Secretary and as Secretary for Economic Development?

**The First Secretary:** That is an example of Nick's somewhat narrow-minded, knee-jerk view of life. There are people with similar roles to mine. You will recall Bob Carr, who addressed this Assembly on behalf of the Parliament of New South Wales. He also holds other posts. As well as being Premier of New South Wales, he is its Minister for the Arts and its Minister for Citizenship. Nick may also recall that William Ewart Gladstone was Chancellor of the Exchequer as well as Prime Minister of this country for some 11 years. I agree that conditions were different then, but relative to what my predecessor Alun Michael did, I have divested myself of many of the duties that Alun took on in order to give myself time to carry out the economic development role. Co-ordinating these two roles has not posed problems either for myself or for those involved in economic development.

**Mick Bates:** What discussions has the First Secretary had with the Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs on the impact that any future entry into the euro may have on the Welsh economy and its importance for European Union working groups' efficiency?

of Ministers. What is important is what your priority is at the time. In the Assembly's first year, priority has been given to the structural funds. Our officials have been working very hard in Brussels, as part of delegations and so on. However, that is not the same as having representation on the Council of Ministers or as your officials being able to represent you on the working groups. Therefore, that is also a priority.

However, it is reasonable that we have placed so much emphasis on the structural funds during our first year. That is what the people of Wales expected us to do.

**Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Prif Ysgrifennydd dderbyn y gallai gynrychioli Cymru'n well o lawer, gartref a'r tu allan i Gymru, pe na cheisiai wneud dwy swydd lawn-amser fel Prif Ysgrifennydd ac Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Dyna enghraifft o'r olwg gul, difeddwl braidd ar fywyd sydd gan Nick. Mae pobl sydd â rolau tebyg i'm rhai i. Byddwch yn cofio Bob Carr, a anerchodd y Cynulliad hwn ar ran Senedd De Cymru Newydd. Mae'n dal swyddi eraill hefyd. Yn ogystal â bod yn Brif Weinidog De Cymru Newydd, ef yw ei Weinidog dros y Celfyddydau a'i Weinidog dros Ddinasyddiaeth. Efallai y bydd Nick hefyd yn cofio bod William Ewart Gladstone yn Ganghellor y Trysorlys yn ogystal â bod yn Brif Weinidog y wlad hon am oddeutu 11 mlynedd. Cytunaf fod yr amgylchiadau'n wahanol bryd hynny, ond o'i gymharu â'r hyn a wnâi fy rhagflaenydd Alun Michael, yr wyf wedi ymddihatu o lawer o'r dyletswyddau yr ymgwyrodd Alun â hwy er mwyn cael amser i gyflawni'r rôl datblygu economaidd. Nid yw cydlynw'r ddwy rôl hynny wedi creu problemau i mi nac i'r rhai sydd yn ymwneud â datblygu economaidd.

**Mick Bates:** Pa drafodaethau a gafodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Faterion Tramor a Chymanwlad am yr effaith a gâi ymuno â'r ewro yn y dyfodol ar economi Cymru a'i bwysigrwydd ar gyfer effeithlonrwydd gweithgorau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd?

**The First Secretary:** Although I have not discussed that matter with the Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs, it is true that areas with a high dependency on heavy industry, manufacturing industry, agriculture and so on, tend to be discomfited by turbulence such as that we have seen in the four years since 1996, when the pound started to shoot up against the deutschmark and then the euro. That happened under the previous administration initially and has continued under this one, with a particularly difficult twist of the screw since January. It undoubtedly poses great difficulties for farmers, steel exporters, car exporters and producers of components for the car industry. The west Midlands and Wales are probably the parts of the United Kingdom most affected by that. It is not a secret that we have indicated those views strongly.

However, this is a devolved matter. It is not devolved to us, but to the Bank of England's Monetary Policy Committee. As far as I know, Mick Bates's party has endorsed that policy. How, therefore, the Bank of England's Monetary Policy Committee sets interests rates and what impact that has on market sentiment for the euro and the pound is beyond even the Nobel prize-winning intellects that we have in plenty in this Assembly. However, we still cannot work out what needs to be done to strengthen the euro or to bring down the pound.

#### **Datblygu Polisiâu ar gyfer Cyflogau Athrawon Developing Policies for Teachers' Pay**

**Q4 Pauline Jarman:** Has the First Secretary had any discussions with the Secretary of State for Education and Employment regarding the development of policies for teachers' pay? (OAQ5233)

**The First Secretary:** Shortly after I became First Secretary I talked to David Blunkett about this. He made it clear that as far as he was concerned this—that is, all aspects of teachers' pay—was a matter reserved in toto to central Government. He also made the point that performance-related pay should not be regarded as examination-linked pay because only about 5 per cent of the determination of performance-related pay is linked to examination performance. There are

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Er na thrafodais y mater hwnnw â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Faterion Tramor a Chymanwlad, mae'n wir bod tuedd i ardaloedd sydd yn dibynnu llawer ar ddiwydiant trwm, diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu, amaethyddiaeth ac yn y blaen, gael eu hannifyrru gan aflonyddwch fel yr hyn a welsom yn y pedair blynedd ers 1996, pan ddechreuodd y bunt godi i'r entrychion yn erbyn y deutschmark ac wedyn yr ewro. Digwyddodd hynny o dan y weinyddiaeth flaenorol i ddechrau a pharhaodd o dan yr un bresennol, gyda thro arbennig o anodd ers Ionawr. Nid oes dwywaith ei fod yn peri anawsterau mawr i ffermwyr, allforwyr dur, allforwyr ceir a chynhyrchwyr cydrannau i'r diwydiant ceir. Mae'n debyg mai gorllewin canolbarth Lloegr a Chymru yw'r rhannau o'r Deyrnas Unedig a effeithir fwyaf gan hynny. Nid yw'n gyfrinach ein bod wedi nodi'r farn honno'n gryf.

Fodd bynnag, mater a ddatganolwyd yw hwn. Nis datganolwyd i ni, ond i Bwyllgor Polisi Arianyddol Banc Lloegr. Hyd y gwn i, mae plaid Mick Bates wedi cefnogi'r polisi hwnnw. Felly, mae'r modd y mae Pwyllgor Polisi Arianyddol Banc Lloegr yn pennu cyfraddau llog a'r effaith a gaiff hynny ar deimlad y farchnad at yr ewro a'r bunt y tu hwnt i hyd yn oed y llu o feddyliau yn y Cynulliad hwn a allai ennill gwobr Nobel. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn dal i fethu datrys yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud i gryfhau'r ewro neu ddod â'r bunt i lawr.

**C4 Pauline Jarman:** A gafodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd unrhyw drafodaethau â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth ynghylch datblygu polisiâu ar gyfer tâl athrawon? (OAQ5233)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yn fuan wedi imi ddod yn Brif Ysgrifennydd siaredais â David Blunkett am hyn. Rhoddodd ar ddeall bod hyn—hynny yw, pob agwedd ar dâl athrawon—o'i ran ef, yn fater a gadwyd yn gyfan gwbl gan y Llywodraeth ganolog. Gwnaeth y pwynt hefyd na ddylai tâl ar sail perfformiad gael ei ystyried yn dâl ar sail arholiadau oherwydd dim ond tua 5 y cant o bennu'r tâl ar sail perfformiad sydd ar sail perfformiad arholiadau. Mae cynifer o



so many school years in which there are no examinations and there are many other factors involved. Only 5 per cent of it is linked to examinations; the remaining 95 per cent has nothing to do with them. This simplistic view that performance-related pay is linked to how well your kids have done in exams is wide off the mark, because 95 per cent of it is not examination related.

**Pauline Jarman:** Last March, the Assembly passed a motion stating that we did not want teachers' pay linked to pupil results in Wales. The Pre-16 Education Committee has received legal advice that the Secretary of State for Education and Employment can deliver this. We understand that the final decision must come from Westminster, but as First Secretary of the National Assembly for Wales, can you assure us that you will do all in your power, yet again, to persuade your counterpart in London not to introduce this unpopular policy in Wales? This is a golden opportunity to show that devolution can work.

**The First Secretary:** I am not sure what it shows. It shows that one or two teachers' unions want pay and conditions to be settled centrally, as a matter for the Department for Education and Employment, but that the one aspect of the policy which they do not like should be devolved. I am not sure that you can do that logically. Either it is all devolved—which would involve us employing at least 100 additional civil servants to negotiate pay and conditions, and I am not sure if that is what Pauline wants—or you must accept that the question is for central Government to determine. You cannot have the National Union of Teachers or other bodies saying, 'Well, yes we accept that pay and conditions are a central matter, but we do not like this one aspect, therefore that ought to be devolved.' It is one thing or the other. Either is it reserved or is it devolved to us. If it is devolved to us, we must pay for an additional 100 civil servants to determine pay and conditions on a Wales level, as they do in Northern Ireland. I am not sure whether or not Pauline wants that. I am not sure if the people of Rhondda Cynon Taff want that. The important point is that only 5 per cent of pay is related to examination performance.

flynyddoedd ysgol lle nad oes arholiadau ac mae llawer o ffactorau eraill yn gysylltiedig. Dim ond 5 y cant ohono sydd yn gysylltiedig ag arholiadau; nid oes a wnelo'r 95 y cant sydd yn weddill ddim â hwy. Mae'r farn orsyml hon bod tâl yn gysylltiedig â pherfformiad yn gysylltiedig â pha mor dda y gwnaeth eich plant mewn arholiadau ymhell ohoni, oherwydd bod 95 y cant ohono heb gysylltiad ag arholiadau.

**Pauline Jarman:** Fis Mawrth diwethaf, derbyniwyd cynnig gan y Cynulliad a ddatganodd na ddymunem i dâl athrawon gael ei gysylltu â chanlyniadau disgyblion yng Nghymru. Mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 wedi derbyn cyngor cyfreithiol bod modd i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth gyflawni hynny. Deallwn fod rhaid i'r penderfyniad terfynol ddod o San Steffan, ond fel Prif Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, a allwch roi sicrwydd i ni y gwnewch bopeth yn eich gallu, unwaith eto, i ddwyn perswâd ar yr un sydd yn cyfateb i chi yn Llundain i beidio â chyflwyno'r polisi amhoblogaidd hwn yng Nghymru? Dyma gyfle euraidd i ddangos y gall datganoli weithio.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Nid wyf yn sicr beth y mae'n ei ddangos. Dengys fod un neu ddau o undebau'r athrawon yn dymuno i dâl ac amodau athrawon gael eu cytuno'n ganolog, fel mater i'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth, ond y dylai'r un agwedd ar y polisi na hoffant gael ei datganoli. Nid wyf yn sicr y gallwch wneud hynny'n rhesymegol. Un ai mae'r cwbl wedi ei ddatganoli—a olygai y byddem yn cyflogi o leiaf 100 o weision sifil ychwanegol i negodi tâl ac amodau, ac nid wyf yn sicr ai hynny y mae Pauline yn ei ddymuno—neu raid ichi dderbyn bod y cwestiwn yn un i'w benderfynu gan Lywodraeth ganolog. Ni ellir Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Athrawon neu gyrff eraill dweud, 'Wel, ie, derbyniwn fod tâl ac amodau'n fater canolog, ond ni hoffwn yr un agwedd hon, felly dylid ei datganoli.' Mae'n un peth neu'r llall. Un ai mae wedi ei gadw neu fe'i datganolir i ni. Os datganolir ef i ni, rhaid inni dalu am 100 o weision sifil ychwanegol i bennu tâl ac amodau ar lefel Cymru, fel y gwnânt yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. Nid wyf yn sicr a yw Pauline yn dymuno hynny ai peidio. Nid wyf yn sicr a yw pobl Rhondda Cynon Taf yn dymuno hynny. Y pwynt pwysig yw mai ond 5 y cant

Therefore, payment by results, in the sense of examination results, is a minuscule component and not the main part, as is sometimes believed.

**David Davies:** Does the First Secretary agree that, while teachers' pay is important, trainee teachers' pay is also important? Does he regret the situation that has been allowed to develop where trainee teachers in England receive £6,000 a year for training as primary school teachers, while trainee primary school teachers in Wales receive nothing? Does it not worry him that, as a result, the brightest and best trainee primary school teachers could be encouraged to leave Wales and study in England?

**The First Secretary:** This decision was carefully considered on the basis that where there is a shortage, a premium is paid to solve the problem and it is done for that purpose. You do not pretend that there is a shortage where there is not, as with the recruitment of primary school teachers, and pay a premium to solve a shortage that does not exist. Resources should be concentrated on solving a recruitment problem where it exists. There is a recruitment problem in secondary school teaching, especially in certain areas of teaching. That is why the premium was applied to the shortage areas. What is the point of throwing money at a non-existent problem? This is a new version of old Conservatism coming from the lips of David Davies.

**Jenny Randerson:** Do you accept that your reply could be seen as inconsistent? In your previous answer, you said that pay and conditions for teachers should not be devolved to Wales. However, now you say that Wales should take a decision, which effectively means that the pay and conditions of trainee teachers in Wales will not only be different, but non-existent in terms of pay. There may not currently be a shortage but I assure you from my postbag that a shortage is rapidly developing because people are changing their minds and going to England. Do you accept that that is likely to happen?

**The First Secretary:** Jenny uses the word 'effectively' in an interesting way to change

o dâl sydd yn gysylltiedig â pherfformiad arholiadau. Felly, mae tâl yn ôl canlyniadau, yn ystyr canlyniadau arholiadau, yn elfen fach iawn ac nid y brif ran, fel y credir weithiau.

**David Davies:** A yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn cytuno, er bod tâl athrawon yn bwysig, fod tâl athrawon dan hyfforddiant hefyd yn bwysig? A yw'n ofid iddo fod sefyllfa wedi cael datblygu lle y mae athrawon dan hyfforddiant yn Lloegr yn derbyn £6,000 y flwyddyn am hyfforddi'n athrawon ysgol gynradd, tra nad yw athrawon ysgol gynradd dan hyfforddiant yng Nghymru'n derbyn dim? Onid yw'n peri pryder iddo y gallai'r darpar athrawon ysgol gynradd gorau a disgleiriaf, o ganlyniad i hynny, gael eu cymell i adael Cymru ac astudio yn Lloegr?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Ystyriwyd y penderfyniad hwn yn ofalus ar y sail y caiff premiwm ei dalu, lle y mae prinder, i ddatrys y broblem ac y gwneir hynny i'r diben hwnnw. Nid ydych yn cymryd arnoch bod prinder lle nad oes un, fel yn achos recriwtio athrawon ysgol gynradd, ac yn talu premiwm i ddatrys prinder nad yw'n bod. Dylid canolbwyntio adnoddau ar ddatrys problem recriwtio lle y mae'n bod. Mae problem recriwtio mewn dysgu mewn ysgolion uwchradd, yn enwedig mewn rhai meysydd dysgu. Dyna pam y cymhwyswyd y premiwm at y meysydd lle'r oedd prinder. Beth yw diben taflu arian at broblem nad yw'n bod? Dyma fersiwn newydd ar hen Geidwadaeth yn dod o enau David Davies.

**Jenny Randerson:** A ydych yn derbyn y gellid ystyried eich ymateb yn un anghyson? Yn eich ateb blaenorol, dywedasoch na ddylid datganoli tâl ac amodau athrawon i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, dywedwch yn awr y dylai Cymru wneud penderfyniad, sydd i bob pwrpas yn golygu y bydd tâl ac amodau athrawon dan hyfforddiant yng Nghymru nid yn unig yn wahanol, ond heb fod o gwbl o ran tâl. Efallai nad oes prinder ar hyn o bryd ond fe'ch sicrhaf o'm bag llythyrau fod prinder yn datblygu'n gyflym am fod pobl yn newid eu meddwl ac yn mynd i Loegr. A dderbyniwch fod hynny'n debygol o ddigwydd?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae Jenny yn defnyddio'r geiriau 'i bob pwrpas' mewn

the meaning of her question. An issue either falls into the category of pay and conditions or it does not. She accepts that this is not about pay and conditions; it is about a training premium. By using the word 'effectively', she is saying, 'Well, it is sort of pay and conditions, is it not?' Of course, it is not. She knows and I know that it is not. Everybody knows that it is not. This is about a training premium to help recruit people to areas of shortage in our teacher training colleges and education departments that run postgraduate certificate of education courses in universities. We have applied the premium where there is a shortage. We have not applied it in the same way as in England. That is what devolution is all about.

modd diddorol i newid ystyr ei chwestiwn. Mae mater un ai'n perthyn i ddosbarth tâl ac amodau ai peidio. Mae'n derbyn nad yw hyn yn ymwneud â thâl ac amodau; mae'n ymwneud â phremiwm hyfforddi. Drwy ddefnyddio'r geiriau 'i bob pwrpas', mae'n dweud, 'Wel, mae'n dâl ac amodau o ryw fath, onid yw?' Wrth gwrs, nid ydyw. Gŵyr hi a gwn i nad ydyw. Gŵyr pawb nad ydyw. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â phremiwm hyfforddi i helpu i recriwtio pobl i feysydd lle y mae prinder yn ein colegau hyfforddi athrawon a'n hadrannau addysg sydd yn rhedeg cyrsiau tystysgrif addysg ôl-raddedig mewn prifysgolion. Defnyddiasom y premiwm lle y mae prinder. Nis defnyddiasom yn yr un modd ag yn Lloegr. Dyna holl bwrpas datganoli.

2:37 p.m.

### **Y Siarter Ewropeidd ar gyfer Ieithoedd Rhanbarthol neu Leiafrifol The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages**

**C5 Elin Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Ysgrifennydd wedi eu cael ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynglŷn â'r Siarter Ewropeidd ar gyfer Ieithoedd Rhanbarthol neu Leiafrifol? (OAQ5224)

**Q5 Elin Jones:** What discussions has the First Secretary had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages? (OAQ5224)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Nid wyf wedi trafod ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod Elin a minnau yn rhannu'r pleser i'r Swyddfa Dramor gyhoeddi ar 2 Mawrth fod y Deyrnas Unedig wedi llofnodi'r siarter. Nid yw'r siarter wedi'i chadarnhau eto, ond bydd hynny'n digwydd yn ddiweddarach eleni. Mae Tom Middlehurst wedi anfon papur manwl i'r cyrff perthnasol ar sut y bydd y siarter yn effeithiol i'r iaith Gymraeg, ac anfonwyd y papur hefyd at holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 ar 12 Ebrill.

**The First Secretary:** I have not discussed this with the Secretary of State for Wales. However, I believe that Elin and I are both pleased that the Foreign Office announced on 2 March that the United Kingdom has signed the charter. The charter has not been ratified yet, but that will happen later this year. Tom Middlehurst has sent a detailed paper to the relevant bodies on how the charter will be effective for the Welsh language, and the paper was also sent to every member of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee on 12 April.

**Elin Jones:** Yr wyf yn hynod anfodlon i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 dderbyn ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r siarter drwy bapur Tom Middlehurst fel *fait accompli*. Mae dogfen yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 ar y siarter yn ein hymrwymo yng Nghymru i gymalau pendant ar ddarpariaeth addysg a darlledu yn y Gymraeg ac ar y defnydd o Gymraeg yn y llysoedd. Er hyn, ni fu trafodaeth yn y Cynulliad nac yn y Pwyllgor ar y ddogfen a'r dewis o ymrwymadau. A yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn barod i osod amser ar

**Elin Jones:** I am extremely dissatisfied that the members of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee received the Government's response to the charter by means of Tom Middlehurst's paper as a *fait accompli*. The Secretary for Post-16 Education and Training's document on the charter commits us in Wales to specific clauses on the provision of education and broadcasting in Welsh and on the use of Welsh in the courts. Despite this, there has been no discussion in the Assembly or in the Committee of the document and the choice of

agenda'r Cynulliad i drafod y siarter bwysig hon i'r iaith Gymraeg?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mater i'r Trefnydd yw cwestiwn olaf Elin. Os y bu prinder cyhoedduswydd ynghylch llofnodi a chadarnhau'r siarter, nid ydyw oherwydd na cheisiasom gyhoedduswydd. Gwnaeth Tom ddatganiad i'r wasg ar 2 Mawrth ac yr oedd ateb ysgrifenedig gerbron y Senedd yr un diwrnod. Yr oedd hefyd ddatganiad gerbron Senedd yr Alban pan fu dadl yno ar Aeleg yr Alban yr un diwrnod. Yr ydym wedi bod yn ymgeisio'n galed i gael mwy o gyhoedduswydd ynghylch y cam pwysig hwn.

Gwnaethpwyd y penderfyniad gwreiddiol yn ystod yr Uwch-gynhadledd Ewropeaidd yng Nghaerdydd yn ystod haf 1998, yn dilyn pwysau gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar y pryd, Ron Davies. Yr ydym oll yn ddiolchgar iddo am ei ran allweddol wrth sicrhau bod Llywodraeth y DU yn fodlon llofnodi'r siarter. Yr ydym yn ymgeisio'n galed i gael cyhoedduswydd, ond os na chewch ymateb gan y wasg, ni allwch wneud dim.

**Glyn Davies:** Gan ein bod yn trafod ieithoedd lleiaffrifol Ewropeaidd, a yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd a'r Trefnydd yn cytuno â mi ei bod yn hen bryd i'r Cynulliad gynnal dadl lawn ar ddyfodol yr iaith Gymraeg?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed barn Glyn Davies ar y mater hwn. Gall y Trefnydd drafod y mater yn y Pwyllgor Busnes gyda chynrychiolwyr y pleidiau eraill, ac mae'n siŵr y bydd cynrychiolydd y Blaid Doriaidd wedi clywed sylwadau Glyn. Os yw'r grŵp Ceidwadol yn unedig ar y mater, bydd ei gynrychiolydd yn codi ei law dros gael dadl gerbron y Cynulliad. Nid oes gennyf wrthwynebiad i gael dadl lawn ar ddyfodol yr iaith Gymraeg.

O ran cadarnhau'r siarter, deallwn fod Llywodraeth y DU am ddweud wrth Gyngor Ewrop y bydd 52 paragraff o drydedd ran y siarter yn effeithiol ar gyfer yr iaith Gymraeg. Mae hynny'n llawer uwch na'r lleiafswm o 35 paragraff, sydd yn golygu y gallwch roi'ch

commitments. Is the First Secretary willing to allocate time on the Assembly's agenda to discuss this important charter for the Welsh language?

**The First Secretary:** Elin's last question is a matter for the Business Secretary. If there has been a lack of publicity regarding the signing and ratification of the charter, it is not because we did not seek publicity. Tom made a press statement on 2 March and there was a written answer before Parliament on the same day. There was also a statement before the Scottish Parliament when a debate on Scots Gaelic was held there on the same day. We have been trying hard to get more publicity for this important step.

The original decision was made during the European Summit in Cardiff during the summer of 1998, following pressure by the then Secretary of State for Wales, Ron Davies. We are all grateful to him for his key role in ensuring that the UK Government was willing to sign the charter. We are trying hard to get publicity, but if you do not get a response from the press, you cannot do anything.

**Glyn Davies:** As we are discussing European minority languages, does the First Secretary and the Business Secretary agree with me that it is high time that the Assembly had a full debate on the future of the Welsh language?

**The First Secretary:** I am glad to hear Glyn Davies's view on this matter. The Business Secretary can discuss this matter in the Business Committee with the representatives of the other parties, and the Tory Party representative will surely have heard Glyn's comments. If the Conservative group is united on the matter, its representative will raise his hand for having a debate before the Assembly. I do not have an objection to having a full debate on the future of the Welsh language.

On ratifying the charter, we understand that the UK Government will tell the European Council that 52 paragraphs of the third part of the charter will be effective for the Welsh language. That is much higher than the minimum of 35 paragraphs, which means that

enw i'r siarter. Gall y Deyrnas Unedig danysgrifio i'r nifer hwn o baragraffau oherwydd y nifer o fesurau sydd eisoes yn effeithiol cyn belled ag y mae'r Gymraeg yn y cwestiwn.

**Michael German:** It is difficult to use European money and mainstream funding for the Welsh language. However, an excellent set of curriculum resources for key stage 3 in history and geography have been produced in Catalan and in Welsh by the swift-footed work of the Catalans who overcame the regulations. Are you prepared to find common cause with other minority languages so that excellent work of this kind ensures that European resources are utilised for the Welsh language and such work continues across the curriculum?

**The First Secretary:** I cannot answer directly on such a detailed point. The Catalan Government, the former Welsh Office and now the Assembly are probably ahead of any other government in the European Community in promoting their minority language, if you want to call it that—Catalan and Welsh. The National Assembly for Wales and the Catalan Government give an example to other parts of Europe where there are minority languages. Mike raised the issue of spending European money. There is not a total exclusion on the use of some of the structural funds on the development of the Welsh language in certain economic contexts. Everybody recognises that culture has an impact on jobs and that culture, language, jobs, brand image, the development of tourism and training courses, which could involve the Welsh language in one way or another, could be funded by structural funds. This will not be in a mainstream sense, but in a fairly minor way.

you can put your name to the charter. The UK can subscribe to this number of paragraphs because of the number of measures that are already effective as far as the Welsh language is concerned.

**Michael German:** Mae'n anodd defnyddio arian Ewropeaidd a chyllid y prif ffrwd ar gyfer yr iaith Gymraeg. Fodd bynnag, cynhyrchwyd set ragorol o adnoddau cwricwlwm ar gyfer cyfnod allweddol 3 hanes a daearyddiaeth yn y Gatalaneg ac yn y Gymraeg drwy waith deheuig y Catalaniaid a oresgynodd y rheoliadau. A ydych yn barod i ymuno â ieithoedd lleiafrifol eraill fel bod gwaith rhagorol o'r math hwn yn sicrhau y caiff adnoddau Ewropeaidd eu defnyddio er mwyn yr iaith Gymraeg ac y bydd gwaith o'r fath yn parhau ar draws y cwricwlwm?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Ni allaf ateb yn syth ar bwynt mor fanwl. Mae'n debyg bod Llywodraeth Catalonia, y gyn Swyddfa Gymreig ac yn awr y Cynulliad ar y blaen i unrhyw lywodraeth arall yn y Gymuned Ewropeaidd wrth hybu eu hiaith leiafrifol, os ydych am ei diffinio felly—y Gatalaneg a'r Gymraeg. Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Llywodraeth Catalonia yn gosod esiampl i rannau eraill o Ewrop lle y mae ieithoedd lleiafrifol. Cododd Mike y mater o wario arian Ewropeaidd. Nid oes gwaharddiad llwyr ar ddefnyddio rhai o'r cronfeydd strwythurol ar ddatblygu'r iaith Gymraeg mewn rhai cyd-destunau economaidd. Mae pawb yn cydnabod bod diwylliant yn effeithio ar swyddi ac y gellid ariannu diwylliant, iaith, swyddi, delwedd brand, datblygu twristiaeth a chysiau hyfforddi, a allai gynnwys yr iaith Gymraeg rywsut neu'i gilydd, drwy gronfeydd strwythurol. Ni fydd hynny yn y prif ffrwd, ond mewn modd eithaf bach.

### Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Ynglŷn â'r sylwadau â wnaed gan yr Ysgrifennydd Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig am y diffyg gwybodaeth y mae'n honni iddi ei dderbyn gan weision sifil Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau yn Whitehall, yr wyf yn awyddus inni wybod beth yw'r canllawiau ynglŷn â'r berthynas rhwng Ysgrifenyddion y Cynulliad a

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Point of order. In relation to the Secretary for Agriculture and Rural Development's comments regarding the lack of information she claims to have received from civil servants in the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions in Whitehall, I am eager that we should know what the guidelines are as regards the relationship between Assembly Secretaries

gweision sifil. Mae protocol amlwg ynglŷn â'r berthynas rhwng Aelodau, Aelodau Cabinet a gweision sifil y Cynulliad. Ymddengys nad oes protocol pendant ynglŷn â pherthynas Aelodau'r Cynulliad â gweision sifil Whitehall. Yr wyf yn bryderus y gall datblygiad o'r fath arwain at sylwadau gan Weinidogion yn Llundain, er enghraifft, am weision sifil y Cynulliad. Mae'n bwysig inni wybod beth yw'r canllawiau. Ymddengys nad oes canllawiau ond mae'r concordat rhwng y Cynulliad ac Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau yn dangos bod ffordd o osgoi helynt cyhoeddus fel hyn drwy ddefnyddio'r hyn a elwir yn Gydbwyllgor y Gweinidogion. Pan fo anghydfod rhwng dwy lywodraeth byddai modd ymdrin â'r mater yn y ffordd hon. Hoffwn glywed eich sylwadau ar yr angen i'r Cynulliad edrych ar y protocol hwn i sicrhau nad yw Aelodau etholedig yn beirniadu gweision sifil nad ydynt, fel arfer, yn medru ymateb.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch i Ieuan am dynnu sylw at y ffaith bod perthynas Aelodau'r Cynulliad â swyddogion sydd yn cydweithio â ni yn cael ei reoli gan brotocol yn y Cynulliad hwn. Mae'r memorandwm cyd-ddealltwriaeth rhwng Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, Gweinidogion yr Alban a Chabinet Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gosod fframwaith clir i hyrwyddo cyd-ddealltwriaeth, yn enwedig yng nghymal 4 ar gyfathrebu ac ymgynghori lle mae pwyslais bod yr holl weinyddiaethau,

'yn ymrwymedig i egwyddor cyfathrebu da rhwng y naill a'r llall, yn enwedig lle gall gwaith un weinyddiaeth gyffwrdd â chyfrifoldebau gweinyddiaeth arall. Yn hytrach na chyfyngu ar ddisgresiwn y gweinyddiaethau, y prif nod yw caniatáu iddynt gyflwyno sylwadau i'w gilydd mewn da bryd iddynt allu cael eu hystyried yn llawn.'

2:47 p.m.

Felly, credaf fod protocol perthnasol ar waith ar gyfer y sefyllfa honno. Nid mater i mi yw a ddilynwyd y protocol hwn yn llawn gan unrhyw adran o'r Deyrnas Unedig neu'r Cynulliad mewn unrhyw achos arbennig, ond

and civil servants. There is a clear protocol regarding the relationship between the Assembly's Members, Cabinet Members and civil servants. It appears that there is no definite protocol as regards the relationship between Assembly Members and Whitehall civil servants. I am concerned that such a development could lead to comments from Ministers in London, for example, about the Assembly's civil servants. It is important that we know what the guidelines are. It appears that there are no guidelines but the concordat between the Assembly and the DETR shows that there is a way of avoiding such a public row by using what is called the Joint Ministerial Committee. When there is a dispute between two governments it would be possible to deal with the matter in this way. I would like to hear your comments on the need for the Assembly to examine this protocol to ensure that elected Members do not criticise civil servants who, usually, are not able to respond.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank Ieuan for drawing attention to the fact that the relationship between Assembly Members and officials who collaborate with us is controlled by a protocol in this Assembly. The memorandum of understanding between the UK Government, Scotland's Ministers and the Cabinet of the National Assembly for Wales lays down a clear framework to promote mutual understanding, particularly in clause 4 on communication and consultation where there is an emphasis that all the administrations,

'are committed to the principle of good communication with each other, and especially where one administration's work may have some bearing upon the responsibilities of another administration. The primary aim is not to constrain the discretion of any administration but to allow administrations to make representations to each other in sufficient time for those representations to be fully considered.'

Therefore, I believe that there is a relevant protocol in place for that situation. The matter of whether this protocol was followed in full by any department of the United Kingdom or Assembly in any particular case

gobeithiaf y byddai hynny yn digwydd. O'm dealltwriaeth i o'r Mesur pan oedd yn mynd drwy ail dŷ'r Senedd, dim ond yn y pen draw eithaf y byddai Cydbwyllgor y Gweinidogion yn cael ei ddefnyddio. Mae'n amlwg ei fod ar gael fel modd o gyflafareddu pe byddai hynny'n angenrheidiol. Mae'r pwyslais ar weithredu busnes drwy sianeli normal gweinyddu, boed hynny ar lefelau swyddogol neu weinidogol. Gobeithiaf y gallwn fagu diwylliant o gyd-ddealltwriaeth rhwng y gwahanol lywodraethau o fewn y Deyrnas Unedig.

**The Secretary for Agriculture and Rural Development (Christine Gwyther):** On Ieuan's point of order and my conduct in this Chamber, I have never criticised Whitehall officials in this Chamber. Last week, I spoke out about the Whitehall machine in general because I was extremely frustrated by not being kept informed of matters of immediate interest to me and the Assembly. If people thought that that was aimed solely at civil servants, I will apologise but I clarify that my remarks were not aimed solely at them. I am pleased that the Presiding Officer explained that ministers and officials have a duty to recognise the reality of devolution and to act accordingly. That goes both ways. For the most part, Whitehall carries out that duty fully, but when it does not—and I stress this point—I and my colleagues on the front bench have a parallel duty to protect the Assembly's interests robustly. We will continue to do so and I do not need to apologise for that. Again, I assure you that my remark last week was not aimed solely at civil servants.

**Mick Bates:** In view of that reply, when I asked Christine whether the protocol had been broken last week, why did she say that it had? Given that we have this memorandum of understanding, what is happening to protect our interests if the protocol was broken? What action is being taken to protect our interests?

**The Presiding Officer:** This is a point of order. If the Assembly wishes to debate this matter of principle, as we have debated our protocols and those relating to the United Kingdom governments on previous

is not to do with me, but I hope that that would happen. From my understanding of the Bill when it went through the second house of Parliament, the Joint Ministerial Council would only be used in extremis. Obviously, it is available to offer some kind of arbitration if required. The emphasis is on executing business through the normal channels of administration, whether they are on official or ministerial levels. I hope that we can nurture a culture of collaboration between the various governments in the United Kingdom.

**Yr Ysgrifennydd Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig (Christine Gwyther):** Ar bwynt o drefn Ieuan a'm hymddygiad yn y Siambr hon, nid wyf erioed wedi beirniadu swyddogion Whitehall yn y Siambr hon. Yr wythnos diwethaf, codais fy llais ynghylch peiriant Whitehall yn gyffredinol gan fy mod yn rhwystredig iawn o beidio â chael fy hysbysu'n gyson am faterion o ddiddordeb uniongyrchol i mi a'r Cynulliad. Os oedd rhai'n credu bod hynny wedi ei gyfeirio at weision sifil yn unig, byddaf yn ymddiheuro ond egluraf nad oedd fy sylwadau wedi eu cyfeirio atynt hwy'n unig. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Llywydd wedi egluro bod dyletswydd ar weinidogion a swyddogion gydnabod realiti datganoli a gweithredu'n unol â hynny. Mae hynny'n gweithio'r ddwy ffordd. Ar y cyfan, mae Whitehall yn cyflawni'r ddyletswydd honno'n drwyadl, ond pan na wnaiff hynny—a phwysleisiaf y pwynt hwn—mae dyletswydd gyfochrog arnaf fi a'm cyd-Aelodau ar y fainc flaen i warchod buddiannau'r Cynulliad yn gadarn. Parhawn i wneud hynny ac nid oes angen ymddiheuro am hynny. Unwaith eto, rhoddaf sicrwydd i chi na chyfeiriwyd fy sylw yr wythnos diwethaf at weision sifil yn unig.

**Mick Bates:** Yng sgîl yr ateb hwnnw, pan ofynnais i Christine a oedd y protocol wedi ei dorri'r wythnos diwethaf, pam y dywedodd ei fod? O ystyried bod y memorandwm o gyd-ddealltwriaeth hwn gennym, beth sydd yn digwydd i warchod ein buddiannau os torrwyd y protocol? Pa gamau a gymerir i warchod ein buddiannau?

**Y Llywydd:** Pwynt o drefn yw hwn. Os dymuna'r Cynulliad drafod y mater o egwyddor hwn, fel y trafodasom ein protocolau ni a'r rhai sydd yn ymwneud â llywodraethau'r Deyrnas Unedig ar

occasions, we can do so again. It is a matter for the Business Committee and party groups to request such a debate. I cannot take this further, but as Presiding Officer, I can indicate my clear agreement with the sentiments already expressed that the Assembly's constitution and role must at all times be protected, which is what our Ministers are here to do. I am certain that they do so as well as they can in relation to any difficulties with the UK Government on these matters.

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. It relates to Standing Order No. 6.8, which refers to statements by Assembly Secretaries. Some time ago, when the First Secretary made a statement relating to refusal of assistance to Broughton, it was released in the name of the National Assembly. That was raised here subsequently and I understood that, henceforth, statements made by the administration would go out in the administration's name rather than that of the Assembly. However, last week a statement from the Secretary for Health and Social Services was released—I realise that she is not in the Chamber at the moment, but it is a general point because other Secretaries have been doing the same—on the safety of mobile phone masts, announcing an Assembly response to the recommendations: 'The Assembly accepts...' and so on. That is not something that would come to the Assembly in full session or in Committee and yet the approach is not uniform. In the same week, when she announced extra funding, it was made in her personal name. She said that she was welcoming the funding and introducing it to the Health and Social Services Committee. It is a serious issue. Will the First Secretary give a further undertaking that when announcements are made by the administration, that they are made in the name of the administration, not in the name of the Assembly unless they have been debated and accepted as Assembly policy?

**The First Secretary:** I can give that assurance. If he can give me chapter and verse for this tendency—in his opinion—for favourable announcements to be claimed as the personal responsibility of Secretaries, and unfavourable ones as corporately those of the Assembly—which I believe is behind his

achlysuron blaenorol, gallwn wneud hynny eto. Mater i'r Pwyllgor Busnes a grwpiau'r pleidiau yw gofyn am ddatl o'r fath. Ni allaf fynd â hyn ymhellach, ond fel Llywydd, gallaf nodi fy nghytundeb pendant â'r farn a fynegwyd eisoes bod yn rhaid gwarchod cyfansoddiad a rôl y Cynulliad bob amser, sef yr hyn y mae ein Gweinidogion yma i'w wneud. Yr wyf yn sicr eu bod yn gwneud hynny gystal ag y gallant o ran unrhyw anawsterau â Llywodraeth y DU ar y materion hyn.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae'n ymwneud â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.8, sydd yn cyfeirio at ddatganiadau gan Ysgrifenyddion y Cynulliad. Beth amser yn ôl, pan wnaeth y Prif Ysgrifennydd ddatganiad ynghylch gwrthod cymorth i Frychdyn, fe'i rhyddhawyd yn enw'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Codwyd hynny yma wedyn a deallais y byddai datganiadau a wneir gan y weinyddiaeth, o hynny ymlaen, yn mynd allan yn enw'r weinyddiaeth yn hytrach nag yn enw'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, yr wythnos diwethaf rhyddhawyd datganiad gan yr Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol—sylweddolaf nad yw yn y Siambwr ar hyn o bryd, ond mae'n bwynt cyffredinol oherwydd gwnaeth Ysgrifenyddion eraill yr un modd—ar ddiogelwch mastiau ffonau symudol, gan gyhoeddi ymateb y Cynulliad i'r argymhellion: 'Mae'r Cynulliad yn derbyn...' ac yn y blaen. Nid yw hynny'n rhywbeth a ddeuai i'r Cynulliad mewn Cyfarfod Llawn neu mewn Pwyllgor ac eto ni cheir dull gweithredu cyson. Yn yr un wythnos, pan gyhoeddodd arian ychwanegol, gwnaethpwyd hynny yn ei henw hi ei hun. Dywedodd mai hi oedd yn croesawu'r arian ac yn ei gyflwyno i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae'n fater difrifol. A wnaiff y Prif Ysgrifennydd ein sicrhau eto, pan wneir cyhoeddiadau gan y weinyddiaeth, y'u gwneir yn enw'r weinyddiaeth, nid yn enw'r Cynulliad oni bai eu bod wedi eu trafod a'u derbyn fel polisi'r Cynulliad?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Gallaf roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw. Os gall roi imi bennod ac i'r duedd hon—yn ei dyb ef—i gyhoeddiadau ffafriol gael eu hawlio fel cyfifoldeb personol Ysgrifenyddion, ac i rai anffafriol fod yn rhai'r Cynulliad cyfan—sef yr hyn y credaf sydd y tu ôl i'w feirniadaeth—rhoddaf



criticism—I assure him that we will attempt to ensure that that does not happen. It is not intended to happen, it is not policy, and the assurance that I gave him is one that I want our Press Office and others to follow at all times. I believe that they have, but if he has evidence to the contrary, I will consider it.

**Nick Bourne:** I was not only suggesting that unfavourable news is made in the name of the Assembly—the telephone masts may be good news—but that it had not been debated and accepted by the Assembly. It is a wider issue than whether it is favourable or unfavourable news.

**Rod Richards:** In light of the Secretary for Agriculture and Rural Development's earlier remarks, I believe that it came as a surprise to most Members that she was not solely criticising Whitehall officials. As we all seem to have misunderstood her comments last week, is it now in order for the Secretary for Agriculture and Rural Development to tell us precisely who she was criticising other than Whitehall civil servants?

**The Presiding Officer:** As you well know, Rod, that is not precisely in order at present. You refer to an earlier point of order, of which I thought we had disposed. I recognise that I failed to call you as an independent Member on that statement—I should have done so. I am sure that there will be plenty of opportunities in the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee and in Plenary session for us to hear the Secretary for Agriculture and Rural Development's views on this matter. We look forward to that.

**Glyn Davies:** Point of order. It concerns the integrity of answers to Assembly Members' oral and written questions, the accuracy of which we all depend on. Last week, I received an answer to a question that resulted in Assembly Members, the media, and the people of Wales being misled. I asked what were the latest cost projections of the proposed new Assembly debating chamber. The second part of the answer stated

'If decisions are made to enhance the present specification and unexpected risks materialise, they estimate that a likely maximum cost would be of the order of £32

sicrwydd iddo y ceisiaf sicrhau na ddigwydd hynny. Ni fwriedir i hynny ddigwydd, nid yw'n bolisi, ac mae'r sicrwydd a roddaf iddo'n un y dymunaf i Swyddfa'r Wasg ac eraill ei ddilyn bob amser. Credaf iddynt wneud hynny, ond os oes ganddo dystiolaeth i'r gwrthwyneb, fe'i hystyriaf.

**Nick Bourne:** Nid oeddwn yn unig yn awgrymu bod newyddion anffafriol yn cael eu rhoi yn enw'r Cynulliad—gallai'r mastiau teleffon fod yn newyddion da—ond hefyd nid oedd wedi ei drafod a'i dderbyn gan y Cynulliad. Mae'n gwestiwn ehangach nag a ydyw'n newydd ffafriol neu anffafriol.

**Rod Richards:** Yng ngoleuni sylwadau cynharach yr Ysgrifennydd Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, credaf ei fod yn syndod i'r rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau nad oedd yn beirniadu swyddogion Whitehall yn unig. Gan yr ymddengys inni i gyd gamddeall ei sylwadau'r wythnos diwethaf, a yw bellach mewn trefn i'r Ysgrifennydd Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ddweud wrthym pwy yn union yr oedd yn ei feirniadu heblaw am weision sifil Whitehall?

**Y Llywydd:** Fel y gwyddoch yn dda, Rod, nid yw hynny'n gwbl mewn trefn ar hyn o bryd. Cyfeiriwch at bwynt o drefn cynharach, y credwn ein bod wedi ymdrin ag ef. Cydnabyddaf imi fethu â galw arnoch fel Aelod annibynnol ar y datganiad hwnnw—dylaswn fod wedi gwneud. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd digon o gyfleoedd yn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ac yn y Cyfarfod Llawn inni glywed barn yr Ysgrifennydd Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ar y mater hwn. Edrychwn ymlaen at hynny.

**Glyn Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae'n ymwneud ag uniondeb atebion i gwestiynau llafar ac ysgrifenedig Aelodau'r Cynulliad, y dibynnwn oll ar eu cywirdeb. Yr wythnos diwethaf, cefais ateb i gwestiwn a arweiniodd at gamarwain Aelodau'r Cynulliad, y cyfryngau, a phobl Cymru. Gofynnais beth oedd rhagamcanion cost diweddaraf siambr ddadlau newydd arfaethedig y Cynulliad. Yn ail ran yr ateb dywedwyd

'Os penderfynir ychwanegu at y fanyldeb fel y mae ar hyn o bryd a bod risgiau annisgwyl yn dod i'r amlwg, maent yn amcangyfrif y gallai'r gost uchaf fod oddeutu £32 miliwn.'

million.’

My researcher and I can find no references to enhancement of the present specifications in the project review that was being discussed. On an important issue such as this with which the public is fully engaged, it is vital that Government statements are full and accurate. Could you rule on whether that answer was acceptable?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Further to that point of order, do you feel, Llywydd, that it is in order for Members to raise points on this issue, when a full debate is scheduled on it fairly soon? In the view of the Plaid Cymru-The Party of Wales group, the sooner that we can make up our minds on this matter and get on with discussing important issues, such as Objectives 2 and 3, the better, and we would be better viewed in the eyes of the people of Wales.

**Andrew Davies:** As the answer went out in my name, I will consider the matter, but I take Helen Mary’s point into account. When preparing answers to questions, we always give full and accurate responses with all the information that we have at our disposal. When we come to debating this issue, I am sure that we will consider it in the round.

**The Presiding Officer:** As you know, Glyn, the content of answers is not a matter for me—it is a matter for the Executive. However, the accuracy of information is a matter for all of us, because within our code of conduct in this Chamber, the provision of precise and accurate information between officials and Members is vital to our activity. I have seen a full copy of the relevant information and I am aware that the figures you quoted occur in that document. I cannot confirm from this position whether they are in the context that you set out, but Andrew has assured us that—and I see the Finance Secretary nodding—that will be re-visited.

2:57 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** Point of order. Under Standing Order No. 7.3, at the start of a debate you may set a time for the length of individual contributions. If you do not set a limit then a standard five minutes per speaker will be allowed. Do you intend to enforce that particular Standing Order more

Ni all fy ymchwilydd na minnau ganfod unrhyw gyfeiriadau at wella’r manylebau presennol yn yr adolygiad o’r prosiect a oedd yn cael ei drafod. Ar fater pwysig fel hyn sydd yn denu holl sylw’r cyhoedd, mae’n holl bwysig bod datganiadau’r Llywodraeth yn llawn ac yn gywir. A allwch ddyfarnu a oedd yr ateb hwnnw’n dderbyniol?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ymhellach i’r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, a gredwch, Lywydd, ei bod mewn trefn i Aelodau godi pwyntiau ar y mater hwn, a dadl lawn wedi ei hamserlennu arno yn eithaf buan? Ym marn grŵp Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, gorau po gyntaf inni benderfynu ar y mater hwn a mynd ymlaen i drafod materion pwysig, fel Amcanion 2 a 3, a byddem yn ymddangos yn well yng ngolwg pobl Cymru.

**Andrew Davies:** Gan i’r ateb fynd allan yn fy enw i, ystyriaf y mater, ond cymeraf bwynt Helen Mary i ystyriaeth. Wrth baratoi atebion i gwestiynau, byddwn bob amser yn rhoi ymatebion llawn a chywir gyda’r holl wybodaeth sydd ar gael i ni. Pan ddeuwn i drafod y mater hwn, yr wyf yn sicr y byddwn yn ei ystyried yn ei gyfanrwydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Fel y gwyddoch, Glyn, nid yw cynnwys atebion yn fater i mi—mae’n fater i’r Weithrediaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae cywirdeb gwybodaeth yn fater i bob un ohonom, oherwydd yn ein cod ymddygiad yn y Siambr hon, mae darparu gwybodaeth fanwl a chywir rhwng y swyddogion a’r Aelodau’n holl bwysig i’n gweithgaredd. Gwelais gopi llawn o’r wybodaeth berthnasol ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y ffigurau a ddyfynnwch i’w cael yn y ddogfen honno. Ni allaf gadarnhau o’r fan hon a ydynt yn y cyddestun a nodwyd gennych, ond mae Andrew wedi’n sicrhau—a gwelaf yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid yn nodio—yr ailystyrir hynny.

**Brian Gibbons:** Pwynt o drefn. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.3, ar ddechrau dadl gallwch bennu amser ar gyfer hyd cyfraniadau unigol. Os na phennwch derfyn caniateir pum munud safonol i bob siaradwr. A ydych yn bwriadu gorfodi’r Rheol Sefydlog honno’n fwy egnïol yn y dyfodol?

vigorously in the future?

**The Presiding Officer:** I am pleased to say that I do, as I indicated last week. I have been seeking mechanical means of assistance in this matter. The use of a sports stopwatch on this desk was not sufficient. Therefore, four stop clocks have been ordered, which will show the time of day and the time of speaking. This instrument can happily be set to work both ways, it can count down or up. It is important that we visit the whole question of length of speeches. There is always a problem about the flow of debate, particularly with the spokesman on behalf of party groups. I must always ensure balance between party groups. Therefore, if, hypothetically, a Cabinet member made a long opening speech, I would be in difficulty if I did not allow the equivalent time to a spokesman from the Party of Wales—I do not look at anyone in particular—or from any other party. Once this clock is in use and we have had a trial period, where we impose the time clearly and mechanically in full view of all, I would welcome a review of its operation. We may be able to decide on a more stringent time limit, which could also apply to question time. It might be three minutes for questions and supplementary questions and five minutes for speeches, possibly more for opening and closing debates. There are many wonderful forms of control that will be exercisable once these clocks are in operation.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud fy mod, fel y nodais yr wythnos diwethaf. Bùm yn ceisio dull mecanyddol i'm cynorthwyo yn y mater hwn. Nid digon oedd defnyddio stopwatsh chwaraeon ar y ddesg hon. Felly, archebwyd pedwar stopgloc, a fydd yn dangos yr awr o'r dydd a'r amser siarad. Gellir gosod yr offeryn yn rhwydd i weithio'r ddwy ffordd, gall gyfrif i lawr neu i fyny. Mae'n bwysig inni ystyried holl gwestiwn hyd areithiau. Mae problem bob amser ynghylch llif y ddadl, yn enwedig gyda'r llefarydd ar ran grwpiau'r pleidiau. Rhaid imi sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng grwpiau'r pleidiau. Felly, yn ddamcaniaethol, pe bai aelod o'r Cabinet yn gwneud araith agoriadol hir, byddwn mewn trafferth pe na chaniatawn yr un amser i lefarydd o Blaid Cymru—nid wyf yn edrych ar neb yn arbennig—neu o unrhyw blaid arall. Ar ôl dechrau defnyddio'r cloc hwn ac ar ôl cyfnod prawf, pan orfodwn yr amser yn eglur ac yn fecanyddol yng ngolwg pawb, croesawn adolygiad o'i weithrediad. Efallai y gallwn benderfynu ar derfyn amser mwy caeth, y gellid ei gymhwyso hefyd i'r sesiwn cwestiynau. Gallai fod yn dri munud ar gyfer cwestiynau a chwestiynau atodol a phum munud ar gyfer areithiau, mwy efallai ar gyfer agor a chau dadleuon. Bydd llawer o ffyrdd rhyfeddol ar reoli y gellir eu harfer pan fydd y clociau hyn ar waith.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Secretary (Andrew Davies):** This is the next three weeks Plenary business statement. The Assembly will be in recess over the Whitsun holiday between 29 May and 2 June. Business on 6 and 7 June is as I reported last week. Business on Tuesday 13 June will also include a statement on the Assembly's timetable for the next three months. This will include an outline timetable of Plenary meetings, times available for Subject Committee meetings and other committee meetings, meetings of political groups and recesses.

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Dyma ddatganiad busnes y Cyfarfod Llawn ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf. Bydd y Cynulliad ar gau dros wyliau'r Sulgwyn rhwng 29 Mai a 2 Mehefin. Mae'r busnes ar 6 a 7 Mehefin fel yr adroddais yr wythnos diwethaf. Bydd busnes dydd Mawrth 13 Mehefin hefyd yn cynnwys datganiad ar amserlen y Cynulliad ar gyfer y tri mis nesaf. Bydd hyn yn cynnwys amserlen fras o'r Cyfarfodydd Llawn, yr amseroedd sydd ar gael i gyfarfodydd Pwyllgorau Pwnc a chyfarfodydd pwyllgorau eraill, cyfarfodydd grwpiau gwleidyddol a thoriadau.

Business on 14 June is as I reported last week. On Tuesday 20 June, there will be debates on the national housing strategy, a

Mae'r busnes ar 14 Mehefin fel yr adroddais yr wythnos diwethaf. Ddydd Mawrth 20 Mehefin, bydd dadleuon ar y strategaeth dai

motion to approve the Colours in Food (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2000 and a Liberal Democrat minority party debate is also scheduled for that day.

Business on Wednesday 21 June will also include a debate on the report of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee and, as I indicated in Plenary last week, the debate on the new Assembly building will also take place on 21 June.

I was surprised to hear the issue of the debate on the future of the Welsh language raised again. As I reported to Business Committee and in previous business statements this will be tabled and is likely to take place on 28 June.

Arrangements will be made to post a copy of this statement to the intranet and internet later today.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are. Is this an objection or a comment?

**Michael German:** I am minded to object.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are you objecting?

**Michael German:** I must object, but I may withdraw my objection in a moment. I object to the business statement because it does not contain room for a statement from the First Secretary on BAE Systems. BAE Systems circulated letters to the political parties here and a response is not contained in the business statement that is before us.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 5.4, I must ask whether there are 10 objections to the business statement, before hearing your case for objection. Are there 10 objections? I see that there are. Therefore, I call the Business Secretary to propose the business statement. I will then allow one Member from each group to respond, although the Liberal Democrats have done so to some extent. I will allow the Business Secretary to reply before calling a vote. We do not use this procedure often, so it is worth rehearsing it.

genedlaethol, cynnig i gymeradwyo'r Rheoliadau Lliwiau mewn Bwyd (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000 ac amserlennwyd dadl plaid leiafrifol gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hefyd ar gyfer y diwrnod hwnnw.

Bydd busnes dydd Mercher 21 Mehefin hefyd yn cynnwys dadl ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 ac, fel y nodais yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf, bydd y ddadl ar adeilad newydd y Cynulliad hefyd yn digwydd ar 21 Mehefin.

Synnais o glywed codi mater y ddadl ar ddyfodol yr iaith Gymraeg eto. Fel yr adroddais i'r Pwyllgor Busnes ac mewn datganiadau busnes blaenorol, cyflwynir hyn ac mae'n debygol o ddigwydd ar 28 Mehefin.

Gwneir trefniadau i osod copi o'r datganiad hwn ar y fewnwyd a'r rhyngwyd yn ddiweddarach heddiw.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod. Ai gwrthwynebiad yw hyn ynteu sylw?

**Michael German:** Yr wyf â'm bryd ar wrthwynebu.

**Y Llywydd:** A ydych yn gwrthwynebu?

**Michael German:** Rhaid imi wrthwynebu, ond efallai y tynnaf yn ôl fy ngwrthwynebiad mewn eiliad. Gwrthwynebaf y datganiad busnes am nad oes lle ynddo i ddatganiad gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd ar BAE Systems. Mae BAE Systems wedi cylchredeg llythyrau i'r pleidiau yma ac ni cheir ymateb yn y datganiad busnes sydd o'n blaen.

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4, rhaid imi ofyn a oes 10 gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes, cyn gwrando'ch achos dros wrthwynebu. A oes 10 gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, galwaf ar y Trefnydd i gynnig y datganiad busnes. Byddaf wedyn yn caniatáu ymateb gan un Aelod o bob grŵp, er bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi gwneud hynny i ryw raddau. Byddaf yn caniatáu i'r Trefnydd ymateb cyn galw pleidlais. Ni ddefnyddiwn y weithdrefn hon yn aml, felly mae'n werth ei hailadrodd.

**Andrew Davies:** I propose

*that the Assembly adopts the business statement.*

**Michael German:** Grant aid to BAE Systems is of major importance to Wales, given the number of jobs, not only in north Wales but across the whole of Wales, which would be lost if production of the new A3XX airbus wings did not take place in Broughton. The company has told us that the new arrangements for the airbus will take place shortly and that the new company, Airbus Integrated Company, will be formed soon. Upon formation, BAE Systems' British veto will be lost. That means that the opportunity to make the wings will be lost and BAE Systems' 20 per cent shareholding could be easily outvoted by the other 80 per cent—40 per cent of which is in Germany—that would dearly love to have this production opportunity.

At last week's Economic Development Committee meeting, the First Secretary informed us that he had received a letter and a submission from BAE Systems. Subject to his response, that would have led to a new application for grant aid. As the timescale is crucial to ensure that BAE Systems can make its case against a predatory bid from Germany, the First Secretary should make a statement to the Assembly on the nature of his discussions with BAE Systems. He should tell us whether the resubmission is the basis for a firm submission for further grant aid and whether that grant aid is likely to be awarded to BAE Systems. The importance of these job losses cannot be underestimated.

There is no question of the seriousness or urgency of this matter. That is why I am concerned that it does not appear in the business statement. The business statement should reflect the fact that the First Secretary should bring a matter of such grave importance to Wales before the Assembly.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Cefnogaf gais a gwrthwynebiad Mike German. Mae hwn yn fater o frys ac o bwys. Mae o frys oherwydd y penderfyniadau y mae'r cwmni am eu gwneud a'r ffaith y bydd y Cynulliad yn torri heb fod datganiad clir wedi ei wneud.

**Andrew Davies:** Cynigiau

*fod y Cynulliad yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**Michael German:** Mae cymorth grant i BAE Systems o bwys mawr i Gymru, o ystyried nifer y swyddi a gollid, nid yn unig yng ngogledd Cymru ond ledled Cymru gyfan, pe na chynhyrchid adenydd y bws awyr A3XX newydd ym Mrychdyn. Dywedodd y cwmni wrthym y bydd y trefniadau newydd ar gyfer y bws awyr yn digwydd cyn hir ac y caiff y cwmni newydd, Airbus Integrated Company, ei ffurfio cyn hir. Ar ôl ei ffurfio, collir pleidlais atal Brydeinig BAE Systems. Golyga hynny y collir y cyfle i wneud yr adenydd ac y gellid yn rhwydd drechu cyfranddaliad 20 y cant BAE Systems drwy bleidlais gan y 80 y cant arall—y mae 40 y cant ohono yn yr Almaen—a fyddai wrth ei fodd o gael y cyfle cynhyrchu hwn.

Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yr wythnos diwethaf, hysbysodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd ni ei fod wedi cael llythyr a chyflwyniad oddi wrth BAE Systems. Yn amodol ar ei ymateb, byddai hynny wedi arwain at gais newydd am gymorth grant. Gan fod yr amserlen yn holl bwysig er mwyn sicrhau y gall BAE Systems ddadlau ei achos yn erbyn cynnig anrheithgar o'r Almaen, dylai'r Prif Ysgrifennydd wneud datganiad i'r Cynulliad ar natur ei drafodaethau â BAE Systems. Dylai ddweud wrthym a yw'r ailgyflwyniad yn sail ar gyfer cyflwyniad cadarn am gymorth grant pellach ac a yw cymorth grant yn debygol o gael ei ddyfarnu i BAE Systems. Ni ellir bychanu pwysigrwydd y colledion swyddi hyn.

Nid oes amheuaeth am ddifrifoldeb neu frys y mater hwn. Dyna pam yr wyf yn bryderus nad yw'n ymddangos yn y datganiad busnes. Dylai'r datganiad busnes adlewyrchu'r ffaith y dylai'r Prif Ysgrifennydd ddod â mater sydd mor ddifrifol bwysig i Gymru gerbron y Cynulliad.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I support Mike German's request and objection. This is a matter of urgency and import. It is a matter of urgency because of the decisions that the company will take and the fact that the Assembly will recess without a clear statement having been made.

Byddai mwyafrif yn y Cynulliad yn cefnogi talu £25 miliwn pe bai 1,400 o swyddi yn dod i unrhyw ran o Gymru. Dylem gefnogi cais fel hwn ar gyfer gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru. Dylem gofio, pan ddatganodd Rhodri Morgan nad oedd am roi'r arian, dehonglwyd hynny fel y Cynulliad yn gwrthod rhoi'r arian. Nid y Cynulliad oedd yn gwrthod rhoi arian, ond y Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n bwysig inni gael dadl ar hyn a chael penderfyniad buan fel bod pobl Brychdyn yn gwybod ble y maent yn sefyll.

**Nick Bourne:** It is pleasing to hear the leader of Plaid Cymru arguing for jobs in BAE Systems. We welcome that conversion.

It is vital, on an issue of jobs and prestige for Wales and as we are about to go into recess, that the National Assembly is aware of the position with regard to safeguarding those jobs and keeping this prestigious project in Wales. The Welsh Conservatives have raised this many times. Peter Rogers has raised it, as a Member for North Wales, and Alun Cairns has raised it in the Economic Development Committee. We are united in believing that those jobs must remain in Wales. We would like the First Secretary to tell the Assembly what is necessary to keep those jobs in Wales, safeguard them and ensure that this prestigious project will remain in Wales. This becomes even more crucial with a recess impending and with the uncertainty in Broughton and in north Wales. I expected the business statement to refer to this, given that the First Secretary did not make a statement. We had anticipated that he would do so.

3:07 p.m.

**The First Secretary:** In response to the points objecting to the business statement, I assure the Assembly that the approach made by British Aerospace seeking a revised application for regional selective assistance was received by officials eight days ago, and by me seven days ago. It is being considered by officials to see whether it is the basis for a potential resubmission, which would then go with a recommendation to the Welsh Industrial Development Advisory Board. The

A majority in the Assembly would support paying £25 million if 1,400 jobs were to come to any part of Wales. We should support a bid such as this for north-east Wales. We should remember that, when Rhodri Morgan stated that he would not give the money, that was interpreted as the Assembly refusing to give the money. It was not the Assembly, but the Labour Government in the Assembly refusing to give the money. It is important that we have a debate on this and that we get a decision swiftly so that the people of Broughton know where they stand.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'n braf clywed arweinydd Plaid Cymru yn dadlau dros swyddi yn BAE Systems. Croesawn y dröedigaeth honno.

Mae'n holl bwysig, ar fater o swyddi a bri i Gymru a chan ein bod ar fin torri, fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa o ran diogelu'r swyddi hynny a chadw'r prosiect llawn bri hwn yng Nghymru. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig wedi codi hyn lawer gwaith. Mae Peter Rogers wedi ei godi, fel Aelod dros Ogledd Cymru, ac Alun Cairns wedi ei godi yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Yr ydym yn unol yn ein barn bod yn rhaid i'r swyddi hynny aros yng Nghymru. Dymunwn i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd ddweud wrth y Cynulliad beth sydd yn angenrheidiol er mwyn cadw'r swyddi hynny yng Nghymru, eu diogelu a sicrhau y bydd y prosiect llawn bri hwn yn aros yng Nghymru. Daw hyn yn fwyfwy holl bwysig a thoriad yn nesáu a chyda'r ansicrwydd ym Mrychdyn ac yng ngogledd Cymru. Yr oeddwn yn disgwyl i'r datganiad busnes gyfeirio at hyn, o ystyried na wnaeth y Prif Ysgrifennydd ddatganiad. Yr oeddem wedi disgwyl iddo wneud hynny.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mewn ymateb i'r pwyntiau yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes, rhoddaf sicrwydd i'r Cynulliad bod y cynnig a wnaethpwyd gan British Aerospace yn ceisio gwneud cais diwygiedig am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol wedi cyrraedd y swyddogion wyth diwrnod yn ôl, a chennyf fi saith niwrnod yn ôl. Mae o dan ystyriaeth gan y swyddogion er mwyn gweld a yw'n sail ar gyfer ailgyflwyniad posibl, a âi wedyn gydag argymhelliad at Fwrdd Ymgynghorol

company had placed great emphasis on a 'deadline' of 26 May, because that was the day on which the Airbus Integrated Company, sometimes known as AIS, was to be formed. Unexpectedly at the end of last week the German interest, Dassau, pulled the plug on Friday's meeting so the meeting will not take place this Friday. No new date has yet been set. If you want to regard 26 May as a deadline, there is no such deadline at the moment. Officials are continuing to discuss with the company to see whether this contains the basis for a successful, possible resubmission for regional selective assistance.

**Andrew Davies:** The First Secretary has given a full explanation of the situation and our position remains unchanged.

Datblygu Diwydiannol Cymru. Yr oedd y cwmni wedi rhoi pwys mawr ar 'derfyn amser' o 26 Mai, oherwydd dyna oedd y diwrnod pan oedd yr Airbus Integrated Company, a elwir weithiau'n AIS, i'w ffurfio. Yn annisgwyl, ddiwedd yr wythnos diwethaf, ataliodd y garfan Almaenig, Dassau, gyfarfod dydd Gwener felly ni fydd y cyfarfod yn digwydd y dydd Gwener yma. Ni phennwyd dyddiad newydd eto. Os dymunwch ystyried 26 Mai yn derfyn amser, nid oes terfyn amser o'r fath ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r swyddogion yn parhau i drafod â'r cwmni i weld a yw hyn yn cynnwys sail ar gyfer ailgyflwyniad llwyddiannus, posibl ar gyfer cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r Prif Ysgrifennydd wedi rhoi eglurhad llawn o'r sefyllfa ac mae ein safbwynt yn aros fel yr oedd.

*Cynnig: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Motion: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Jones, Carwyn  
Marek, John  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion rejected.*

**Andrew Davies:** I will make a revised Business statement in due course.

**Andrew Davies:** Byddaf yn llunio datganiad busnes diwygiedig maes o law.

## Rhaglen Amcan 2 Objective 2 Programme

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 4 and 5 in the name of Phil Williams, amendment 3 in the name of David Melding and amendment 6 in the name of Michael German.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 4 a 5 yn enw Phil Williams, gwelliant 3 yn enw David Melding a gwelliant 6 yn enw Michael German.

**The First Secretary:** I propose that the National Assembly

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Cynigiau fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn

*i. notes with approval the draft single programming document for the Objective 2 and transitional programme areas in east Wales, laid in the Table Office on 16 May 2000; and*

*i. rhoi sêl ei fendith ar y ddogfen raglennu sengl ddrafft ar gyfer ardaloedd Amcan 2 ac ardaloedd y rhaglen drosiannol yn nwyrain Cymru, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mai 2000; a*

*ii. authorises the First Secretary to arrange for its submission to the European Commission, with such amendments as may strictly be necessary to meet the Commission's technical requirements, as soon as possible.*

*ii. yn awdurdodi'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i drefnu ei chyflwyno i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, gan gynnwys unrhyw newidiadau a fydd yn gwbl angenrheidiol er mwyn bodloni gofynion technegol y Comisiwn, a hynny cyn gynted ag y bo modd.*

The draft single programming document for Objective 2 before you today is the product of considerable effort by the East Wales Partnership in co-operation with Assembly officials. It constitutes the starting point for a five-month negotiating period with the European Commission and follows on from a consultation document issued in February this year.

Mae'r ddogfen raglennu sengl ar gyfer Amcan 2 sydd ger eich bron heddiw yn ganlyniad i gryn ymdrech gan Bartneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru mewn cydweithrediad â swyddogion y Cynulliad. Mae'n fan cychwyn i gyfnod negodi o bum mis â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ac yn dilyn dogfen ymgynghorol a gyhoeddwyd fis Chwefror eleni.

This document is remarkable because the many organisations which make up the East Wales Partnership have put in a great deal of time and effort in drawing up this document and have found a remarkable degree of agreement between those who come from or represent the Powys area and those who come from or represent the more industrial areas which are involved in the Objective 2 area. Co-operation and joint ownership between the contrasting originating areas have been the key elements in bringing together this draft. I pay tribute to all those involved.

Mae'r ddogfen hon yn hynod oherwydd bod y lluo o gyrff sydd yn rhan o Bartneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru wedi cyfrannu llawer iawn o amser ac ymdrech wrth lunio'r ddogfen hon ac wedi canfod mesur rhyfeddol o gyntdeb rhwng y rhai sydd yn cynrychioli neu'n dod o ardal Powys a'r rhai sydd yn cynrychioli neu'n dod o'r ardaloedd mwy diwydiannol sydd yn gysylltiedig ag ardal Amcan 2. Cydweithredu a chydberchnogaeth rhwng yr ardaloedd cychwynnol gwrthgyberbyniol fu'r elfennau allweddol wrth ddod â'r drafft hwn at ei gilydd. Talaf deyrnged i bawb a oedd yn gysylltiedig.

Although on a smaller scale, it has been a remarkably successful exercise involving a great deal less dispute, disagreement and controversy than the preparation of the Objective 1 document. I recognise that a great deal more hangs on the Objective 1 document. If we can continue that spirit of

Er ei fod ar raddfa lai, bu'n ymarfer hynod o lwyddiannus a olygodd lai o lawer o anghydfod, anghytundeb a dadlau na pharatoi'r ddogfen Amcan 1. Sylweddolaf fod llawer mwy yn dibynnu ar y ddogfen Amcan 1. Os gallwn barhau'r ysbryd hwnnw o gydweithrediad rhwng yr ardaloedd



co-operation between the rural and urban areas in the Objective 2 area it is going to follow through into a successful Objective 2 programme. Likewise, not just the Objective 2 areas but the transitional areas which will be losing their Objective 2 status and that those areas are also covered by this Objective 2 and transitional programme. The responses to the consultation document were positive and indicate a high degree of support for the proposed strategy, its priorities and measures.

Members of the Economic Development Committee and those who attended its meeting last Thursday will agree that prominent members of the East Wales Partnership gave an informative presentation. It was well received by the Committee and I have little doubt that the presentations to the Mid Wales Regional Committee in June and the South East Wales Regional Committee in July will be equally well regarded.

At this stage, we must accept that not all of Wales will be included in the Objective 1 and 2 maps. That is inevitably disappointing for the areas outside them. There will be some transitional protection for the areas that lose Objective 2 or 5b status. Few areas will not receive anything from Objective 1, 2 or transitional protection programmes. The white areas of the maps, which will not receive transitional protection, make up about 1 per cent of the Welsh population. Even those areas will receive Objective 3 funding and are also eligible to apply for funding under the community initiatives. However, we must accept that not all the areas of Wales that are not covered by Objective 1 will be covered by Objective 2. The population limit that the European Commission set us meant that some areas would still be left outside the maps. It is difficult in an area such as Wales, which has a population of three million and a new Assembly. If you are not in an Objective 1 area, which covers two thirds of Wales, or an Objective 2 area, you will naturally wonder what is wrong with your area. The larger the Objective 1 or 2 areas, the harder it is for excluded areas to feel that they have benefited. I accept that. It is part of the process of politics. However, when you are not dealing with the luxury of opposition, but with the responsibility of Government, you must be able to explain to both the excluded and included areas why they are so.

gwledig a threfol yn ardal Amcan 2 bydd yn arwain at raglen Amcan 2 lwyddiannus. Yn yr un modd, nid yn unig ardaloedd Amcan 2 ond yr ardaloedd trosiannol a fydd yn colli eu statws Amcan 2 ac mae'r ardaloedd hynny hefyd wedi eu cynnwys yn y rhaglen Amcan 2 a throsiannol hon. Yr oedd yr ymatebion i'r ddogfen ymgynghorol yn gadarnhaol ac yn dangos cefnogaeth helaeth i'r strategaeth arfaethedig, ei blaenoriaethau a'i mesurau.

Bydd aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'r rhai a oedd yn bresennol yn ei gyfarfod ddydd Iau diwethaf yn cytuno bod aelodau amlwg o Bartneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru wedi rhoi cyflwyniad llawn gwybodaeth. Cafodd groeso gan y Pwyllgor ac nid wyf yn amau na fydd yr un parch i'r cyflwyniadau i Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y Canolbarth ym Mehefin ac i Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y De-Ddwyrain yng Ngorffennaf.

Erbyn hyn, rhaid inni dderbyn na chaiff Cymru gyfan ei chynnwys yn y mapiau Amcan 1 a 2. Mae'n anorfod bod hynny'n peri siom i'r ardaloedd sydd y tu allan iddynt. Bydd rhywfaint o ddiogelwch trosiannol i'r ardaloedd sydd yn colli statws Amcan 2 neu 5b. Prin yw'r ardaloedd na dderbyniant ddim o raglenni Amcan 1, 2 neu ddiogelwch trosiannol. Mae'r ardaloedd gwyn ar y mapiau, na dderbyniant ddiogelwch trosiannol, yn cynnwys tua 1 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru. Bydd hyd yn oed yr ardaloedd hynny'n derbyn arian Amcan 3 ac maent hefyd yn gymwys i ymgeisio am arian o dan y mentrau cymunedol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni dderbyn na fydd yr holl ardaloedd o Gymru nas cynhwysir gan Amcan 1 wedi eu cynnwys gan Amcan 2. Yr oedd y terfyn poblogaeth a osododd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i ni yn golygu y byddai rhai ardaloedd y tu allan i'r mapiau o hyd. Mae'n anodd mewn ardal fel Cymru, sydd â phoblogaeth o dair miliwn a Chynulliad newydd. Os nad ydych mewn ardal Amcan 1, sydd yn cynnwys dwy ran o dair o Gymru, neu mewn ardal Amcan 2, byddwch yn naturiol yn meddwl tybed beth sydd o'i le ar eich ardal chi. Po fwyaf yw'r ardaloedd Amcan 1 neu 2, mwyaf anodd ydyw i'r ardaloedd a eithriwyd deimlo eu bod wedi elwa. Derbyniaf hynny. Mae'n rhan o broses gwleidyddiaeth. Fodd bynnag, pan nad ydych yn delio â'r moethusrwydd o fod yn yr wrthblaid, ond â chyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth,

rhaid ichi allu egluro i ardaloedd a eithriwyd a'r rhai a gynhwyswyd pam y maent felly.

The Objective 2 and transitional programme is designed to support the economic and social conversion of areas facing structural difficulties. Therefore, the programme has two distinct themes in Wales: the decline of rural areas and the difficulties they face in diversifying away from over-dependence on agriculture and other staples, and likewise for urban areas in difficulty. Some problems are common to both, but the programme strategy has been developed with a bi-focal approach to the urban and rural reconversion difficulties of the East Wales Partnership area.

The programme's main objectives are to increase employment growth, promote diversification and develop sustainable communities. The first priority of developing sustainable and competitive small and medium-sized enterprises is generic throughout the East Wales Partnership area. Even a five-year-old could see that the other priorities—sustainable rural development and urban community regeneration—are targeted at the two different kinds of areas. With the limited funds available, the draft has been written with an obvious focus on the specific interventions required to maximise the use of Objective 2 or transitional funding to solve the problems of the East Wales Partnership area. The money cannot be spread too widely, or it will disappear like butter spread across the whole area and nobody will notice any effect. That would be a complete waste and abuse of European assistance.

The members of the partnership agreed the indicative financial tables in this document, based on a maximum intervention rate of 50 per cent, although that is subject to further negotiation. The aim has been to make the best possible use of the limited resources available. Therefore, we are focusing on a few key activities rather than spreading the small sum of money too thinly. As with the Objective 1 programme, the funding implications are being considered as part of the Government's spending review. We hope that the draft document will go to the European Commission by the end of this month and negotiations can begin, provided it

Dyfeisiwyd y rhaglen Amcan 2 a throsiannol i gefnogi trawsnewid economaidd a chymdeithasol mewn ardaloedd sydd yn wynebu anawsterau strwythurol. Felly, mae dwy thema wahanol i'r rhaglen yng Nghymru: dirywiad ardaloedd gwledig a'r anawsterau a wynebant wrth arallgyfeirio o orddibynnu ar amaethyddiaeth a phrif ddiwydiannau eraill, a'r un modd i ardaloedd trefol sydd mewn anhawster. Mae rhai problemau'n gyffredin i'r ddau, ond datblygwyd strategaeth y rhaglen gydag ymagwedd ddeuffocol at drafferthion ailadfer trefol a gwledig yn ardal Partneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru.

Prif amcanion y rhaglen yw cynyddu twf cyflogaeth, hybu arallgyfeirio a datblygu cymunedau cynaliadwy. Mae'r flaenoriaeth gyntaf, sef datblygu busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint cynaliadwy a chystadleuol, yn gyffredin i bob rhan o ardal Partneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru. Gallai hyd yn oed plentyn pumlywydd weld bod y blaenoriaethau eraill—datblygu gwledig cynaliadwy ac adfywio cymunedol trefol—wedi eu targedu at y ddau fath gwahanol o ardaloedd. Gyda'r arian cyfyngedig sydd ar gael, ysgrifennwyd y drafft gan ganolbwyntio'n amlwg ar yr ymyriadau penodol y mae eu hangen er mwyn defnyddio arian Amcan 2 neu arian trosiannol i'r eithaf i ddatrys problemau ardal Partneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru. Ni ellir taenu'r arian yn rhy eang, neu bydd yn diflannu fel menyn a daenwyd dros yr ardal gyfan ac ni wêl neb unrhyw effaith. Byddai hynny'n wastraff ac yn gamddefnydd llwyr o gymorth Ewropeaidd.

Cytunodd aelodau'r bartneriaeth ar y tablau ariannol dangosol yn y ddogfen hon ar sail cyfradd ymyrryd uchaf o 50 y cant, er bod hynny'n agored i negodi pellach. Y nod oedd gwneud y defnydd gorau posibl o'r adnoddau cyfyngedig a oedd ar gael. Felly, yr ydym yn canolbwyntio ar ychydig o weithgareddau allweddol yn hytrach nag ar daenu'r swm bach o arian yn rhy denau. Yn yr un modd â rhaglen Amcan 1, mae'r goblygiadau ariannu'n cael eu hystyried fel rhan o arolwg gwariant y Llywodraeth. Gobeithiwn y bydd y ddogfen ddrafft yn mynd i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd erbyn diwedd y mis hwn ac y gall y negodiadau ddechrau, ar yr amod ei

is acceptable. Therefore, this programme is well behind the Objective 1 and 3 programmes. During the negotiations, the shadow programme monitoring committee will be formed. There is already such a committee for Objective 1, which has had a couple of meetings and the shadow programme monitoring committee for Objective 3 is being formed, but Objective 2 is well behind. It is not behind the timetable; it was never intended to be up and running at the same time as the other two programmes. Before the debate begins in general across the Assembly, I will indicate how I suggest the Assembly responds to the amendments laid before it today.

3:17 p.m.

I hope that Phil Williams will agree to withdraw his amendment 1, subject to my comments on his other amendments. We are not happy with the wording 'subject to reassurance'. We are happy with his other two amendments, 2 and 4. Amendment 2 builds on the valuable points that were made in the Economic Development Committee meeting last Thursday and we agree with it.

We do not agree with David Melding's amendment 3, which regrets the exclusion of wards in Barry from the Objective 2 area. That is fine in the luxury of opposition: you do not have to say which areas of Wales you would take out so that Barry could be included against a fixed population ceiling. He ought to have been responsible enough to state which needy areas of Cardiff, Newport or Powys would have to come out. I accept that there is an intellectual case for Barry, though not as strong as for the other cases within the criteria that we have to face.

We are happy with Phil Williams's amendment 4 as we accept that the European Commission has a degree of hostility to infrastructure expenditure. We managed to find ways around that with Objective 1. The programme will certainly offer a clear scope for increasing the prominence of measures such as applying cleaner technologies and better waste recycling. I support the principle behind this amendment but I would ask Phil to remain aware of the limitations of a programme on the modest scale that

bod yn dderbyniol. Felly, mae'r rhaglen hon ymhell ar ôl rhaglenni Amcan 1 a 3. Yn ystod y negodiadau, ffurfir pwyllgor monitro rhaglen cysgodol. Mae pwyllgor o'r fath eisoes ar gyfer Amcan 1, a gafodd un neu ddau o gyfarfodydd ac mae'r pwyllgor monitro rhaglen cysgodol ar gyfer Amcan 3 yn cael ei ffurfio, ond mae Amcan 2 ymhell ar ôl. Nid yw ar ôl yr amserlen; nid oedd erioed fwriad iddo gychwyn yr un pryd â'r ddwy raglen arall. Cyn i'r ddatl ddechrau'n gyffredinol ar draws y Cynulliad, nodaf sut yr awgrymaf y dylai'r Cynulliad ymateb i'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd iddo heddiw.

Gobeithiaf y bydd Phil Williams yn cytuno i dynnu'n ôl gwelliant 1 o'i eiddo, yn amodol ar fy sylwadau ar ei welliannau eraill. Nid ydym yn fodlon â'r geiriad 'o gael yr addewidion priodol'. Yr ydym yn fodlon â'i ddau welliant arall, 2 a 4. Mae gwelliant 2 yn adeiladu ar y pwyntiau gwerthfawr a wnaethpwyd yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ddydd Iau diwethaf a chytunwn ag ef.

Nid ydym yn cytuno â gwelliant 3 David Melding, sydd yn gresynu at eithrio wardiau yn y Barri o ardal Amcan 2. Mae hynny'n burion ym moethusrwydd yr wrthblaid: nid oes rhaid ichi ddweud pa ardaloedd o Gymru a dynnech allan fel y gellid cynnwys y Barri yn erbyn uchafrif poblogaeth penodol. Dylasai fod yn ddigon cyfrifol i nodi pa ardaloedd anghenus o Gaerdydd, Casnewydd neu Bowys a fyddai'n gorfod dod allan. Derbyniaf fod dadl ddeallusol dros y Barri, er nad yw mor gryf â'r un dros yr achosion eraill oddi mewn i'r meini prawf yr ydym yn gorfod eu hwynebu.

Yr ydym yn fodlon â gwelliant 4 Phil Williams gan ein bod yn derbyn bod mesur o elyniaeth gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd at wariant ar seilwaith. Llwyddasom i ddod o hyd i ddulliau o osgoi hynny gydag Amcan 1. Mae'n sicr y bydd y rhaglen yn cynnig cyfle pendant i gynyddu amlygrwydd mesurau fel cymhwyso technolegau glanach ac ailgylchu gwastraff yn well. Cefnogaf yr egwyddor y tu ôl i'r gwelliant hwn ond gofynnaf i Phil fod yn ymwybodol o hyd o gyfyngiadau rhaglen ar y raddfa gymharol fach a ddarpara Amcan

Objective 2 provides.

Again we are happy with Phil Williams's amendment 5. We hope that we can secure adequate funding: that is the principle on which this debate is based.

We recommend accepting the final amendment 6 put forward by Mike German. We need to ensure synergy between all the structural funds expenditure: Objectives 1, 2 and 3, the transitional funding and the various other programmes, such as the urban programme. That is the purpose of the Welsh European Funding Office. The different monitoring committees will need to work closely to achieve co-ordination between the different documents as they come into being, covering the next six or seven years. While there will be different personnel on each monitoring committee, WEFO will provide the secretariat for them all. A different Assembly Member will chair each committee, which will ensure the integration that amendment 6 proposes. We are happy to support that.

I commend this document to the Assembly.

**Phil Williams:** I propose amendment 1. In line 1 after *'that'* insert

*subject to reassurance.*

I propose amendment 2. Add the following new clause ii and renumber existing clause ii as iii.

*ii. recognises that the Objective 2 area includes those areas of Wales with the highest percentage of non-white residents and emphasises the special responsibility of the Objective 2 programme to ensure the full participation of ethnic minorities in the economic and social life of Wales.*

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new clause:

*iv. expresses concern that the overall programme may—by its own admission—make a negative contribution to certain elements of environmental sustainability and therefore advises the First Secretary to give greater prominence in the amended document to the application of clean*

2.

Unwaith eto, yr ydym yn fodlon â gwelliant 5 Phil Williams. Gobeithiwn y gallwn sicrhau arian digonol: ar yr egwyddor honno y seilir y ddadl hon.

Yr ydym yn argymhell derbyn y gwelliant olaf, gwelliant 6, a gyflwynwyd gan Mike German. Mae angen inni sicrhau synergedd rhwng holl wariant y cronfeydd strwythurol: Amcanion 1, 2 a 3, yr arian trosiannol a'r amryfal raglenni eraill, fel y rhaglen drefol. Dyna ddiben Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru. Bydd angen i'r gwahanol bwyllgorau monitro weithio'n agos er mwyn sicrhau cydlynw rhwng y gwahanol ddogfennau wrth iddynt ddod i fodolaeth, a fydd yn cynnwys y chwech neu saith mlynedd nesaf. Er y bydd personél gwahanol ar bob pwyllgor monitro, bydd Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru yn darparu'r ysgrifenyddiaeth i bob un ohonynt. Bydd Aelod Cynulliad gwahanol yn cadeirio pob pwyllgor, a fydd yn sicrhau'r integreiddio a awgrymir yng ngwelliant 6. Yr ydym yn fodlon cefnogi hynny.

Cymeradwyaf y ddogfen hon i'r Cynulliad.

**Phil Williams:** Cynigïaf welliant 1. Yn llinell 1 ar ôl *'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol'* ychwaneger

*o gael yr addewidion priodol.*

Cynigïaf welliant 2. Ychwaneger y cymal ii newydd a ganlyn ac ailrifo'r cymal ii presennol yn iii.

*ii. cydnabod bod ardal Amcan 2 yn cynnwys yr ardaloedd hynny o Gymru sydd â'r ganran uchaf o breswylwyr sydd heb fod yn wyn eu croen ac yn pwysleisio bod gan raglen Amcan 2 gyfrifoldeb arbennig i sicrhau bod lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn cymryd rhan lawn ym mywyd economaidd a chymdeithasol Cymru.*

Cynigïaf welliant 4. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd:

*iv. mynegi pryder y gall y rhaglen gyffredinol—yn ôl ei chyfaddefiad ei hun—wneud cyfraniad negyddol i rai agweddau ar gynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol ac felly y mae'n cynghori'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i roi mwy o sylw yn y ddogfen newydd i gymhwyso technoleg lân, darparu cynlluniau ynni*

*technologies, the provision of local renewable energy schemes, improved access to public transport in urban as well as rural areas and a more sustainable strategy for waste disposal, and*

*adnewyddadwy lleol, gwella mynediad i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus mewn ardaloedd trefol a gwledig a gweithredu strategaeth fwy cynaliadwy ar gyfer gwaredu gwastraff, a*

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new clause:

Cynigïaf welliant 5. Ychwaneger fel cymal newydd:

*v. instructs the First Secretary to negotiate with the Treasury to secure adequate funding additional to the Barnett block to cover the full ERDF structural fund allocation to Wales in the Objective 2 programme and the necessary public component of match funding.*

*v. cyfarwyddo'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i negodi â'r Trysorlys i sicrhau bod digon o arian, yn ychwanegol at y bloc Barnett, ar gael fel arian cyfatebol i ddyraniad arian strwythurol llawn y gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd ar gyfer rhaglen Amcan 2 yng Nghymru, ac i'r elfen o'r arian cyfatebol a ddaw o goffrau cyhoeddus.*

You will be glad to know that I want to start and continue on a positive note. The Objective 2 single programming document is a well-written account of a coherent and realistic programme. It appears genuinely to have been written by the partnership: from the bottom up rather than from the top down. Bottom up exercises can lead to incoherence. In this case the different inputs have been well integrated. You can sit down and read this document. On each page you know where you are and where you are going.

Byddwch yn falch o wybod fy mod am ddechrau a pharhau ar nodyn cadarnhaol. Mae dogfen raglennu sengl Amcan 2 yn adroddiad a ysgrifennwyd yn dda am raglen gydlynol ac ymarferol. Ymddengys o ddifrif ei bod wedi ei hysgrifennu gan y bartneriaeth: o'r gwaelod i fyny yn hytrach nag o'r top i lawr. Gall ymarferion o'r gwaelod i fyny arwain at anghydlynedd. Yn yr achos hwn mae'r gwahanol fewnbynnau wedi eu hintegreiddio'n dda. Gallwch eistedd a darllen y ddogfen hon. Ar bob tudalen gwyddoch ym mha le yr ydych ac i ble yr ydych yn mynd.

Having heaped praise on the draft Objective 2 SPD, I come to the amendments. As the Government fully agreed with amendments 2 and 4, and the spirit of those amendments, Plaid Cymru will withdraw amendment 1.

Ar ôl canmol dogfen raglennu sengl ddrafft Amcan 2 i'r cymylau, deuaif at y gwelliannau. Gan fod y Llywodraeth yn llwyr gytuno â gwelliannau 2 a 4, ac yn ysbryd y gwelliannau hynny, bydd Plaid Cymru yn tynnu gwelliant 1 yn ôl.

Amendment 2 aims to reinforce the principle of social inclusivity with special concern for the different ethnic minorities in Wales. You will see, at table 12 in the SPD, a list of 20 wards in Wales where the non-white population is greater than 5 per cent. Seven of those include university halls of residence where the figures indicate a student population from overseas. Of the remaining 13—where the non-white population are long-term residents, with some families going back many generations—11 of those are in the Objective 2 area.

Mae gwelliant 2 yn ceisio ategu egwyddor cynhwysiant cymdeithasol gyda gofal arbennig am y gwahanol leiafrifoedd ethnig yng Nghymru. Gwelwch, yn nhabl 12 yn y ddogfen raglennu sengl, restr o 20 o wardiau yng Nghymru lle y mae'r boblogaeth o rai nad ydynt yn wyn eu croen yn fwy na 5 y cant. Mae saith o'r rheini'n cynnwys neuaddau preswyl prifysgolion lle y mae'r ffigurau'n dangos poblogaeth myfyrwyr o dramor. O'r 13 sydd yn weddill—lle y mae'r boblogaeth o rai nad ydynt yn wyn eu croen yn breswylwyr tymor hir, a rhai teuluoedd yn mynd yn ôl genedlaethau lawer—mae 11 o'r rheini yn ardal Amcan 2.

**Jenny Randerson:** You have just referred to

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr ydych newydd

the impact of students' presence in some wards on the statistics. Do you acknowledge the concern about the impact of large numbers of students on other aspects of the statistics on which these decisions are based? My constituency, although it is one of the poorer constituencies in Wales, only has one ward in the Objective 2 area. That ward is Adamsdown. Two other wards in my constituency are Cathays and Plasnewydd. Cathays has a student population of 50 per cent and in Plasnewydd 25 per cent of the electorate are students. These are inner city wards, but they never appear in the official statistics as being in particular need of measures such as this. That is because students do not appear in statistics on income support for example, because students are not eligible for it, nor in statistics on the numbers of households with children with no earner, because by definition most of them do not have children, although a few might. They do not appear in unemployment statistics, because they are not registered as unemployed. All these wards are therefore artificially judged to be much richer than the indigenous long-term population would suggest. Do you agree that it is time that we examined how the statistics are collected and take action on this? It affects not just Objective 2 but all manner of other issues.

**Phil Williams:** Thank you for that. When reading the document, I immediately became aware that when drawing up statistics on a ward basis you must have local knowledge. I recognised that Cathays, Plasnewydd, Llanbadarn, Aberystwyth North and two of the Bangor wards were special and had special and different problems. That must be taken into account.

At the same time, however, it is fair to say that if the 11 wards that I mentioned in Objective 2 areas have long-term resident non-white populations, then we have a special responsibility and opportunity to bring the people of those areas into full social and economic life. It is no coincidence that those same wards have disturbingly high indices of deprivation. In six of the wards, over 25 per cent of the households with children have no earner and 25 per cent of the population claim income support. It is a

gyfeirio at effaith presenoldeb myfyrwyr mewn rhai wardiau ar yr ystadegau. A dderbyniwch fod pryder ynghylch effaith niferoedd mawr o fyfyrwyr ar agweddau eraill ar yr ystadegau y seilir y penderfyniadau hyn arnynt? Nid oes gan fy etholaeth i, er ei bod yn un o'r etholaethau tlotaf yng Nghymru, ond un ward yn ardal Amcan 2. Y ward honno yw Adamsdown. Dwy ward arall yn fy etholaeth i yw Cathays a Phlasnewydd. Mae 50 y cant o boblogaeth Cathays yn fyfyrwyr ac ym Mhlasnewydd mae 25 y cant o'r etholwyr yn fyfyrwyr. Wardiau canol dinas yw'r rhain, ond ni fyddant byth yn ymddangos yn yr ystadegau swyddogol fel rhai y mae arnynt angen arbennig am fesurau fel hyn. Mae hynny am nad yw myfyrwyr yn ymddangos mewn ystadegau ar gymhorthdal incwm, er enghraifft, am nad oes gan fyfyrwyr hawl i'w dderbyn, nac mewn ystadegau ar y nifer o deuluoedd â phlant sydd heb enillydd cyflog, oherwydd drwy ddiffiniad nid oes plant gan y rhan fwyaf ohonynt, er ei bod yn bosibl bod blant gan rai. Nid ymddangosant mewn ystadegau diweithdra, am na chofrestrir hwy'n ddi-waith. Felly mae'r holl wardiau hyn wedi eu dyfarnu'n artiffisial yn rhai llawer cyfoethocach nag yr awgrymai'r boblogaeth dymor hir frodorol. A gytunwch ei bod yn bryd inni edrych ar y modd y cesglir ystadegau a chymryd camau ar hynny? Mae'n effeithio ar bob math o faterion eraill heblaw am Amcan 2.

**Phil Williams:** Diolch i chi am hynny. Wrth ddarllen y ddogfen, deuthum yn ymwybodol yn syth bod yn rhaid ichi gael gwybodaeth leol wrth lunio ystadegau ar sail wardiau. Gwelais fod Cathays, Plasnewydd, Llanbadarn, Gogledd Aberystwyth a dwy o wardiau Bangor yn arbennig a bod ganddynt broblemau arbennig a gwahanol. Rhaid cymryd hynny i ystyriaeth.

Ar yr un pryd, fodd bynnag, teg yw dweud, os oes gan yr 11 ward a grybwyllais yn ardaloedd Amcan 2 boblogaethau preswyl tymor hir o rai nad ydynt yn wyn eu croen, yna mae gennym gyfrifoldeb a chyfle arbennig i gynnwys bobl yn yr ardaloedd hynny mewn bywyd cymdeithasol ac economaidd llawn. Nid cyd-ddigwyddiad mohono bod mynegeion gofidus o uchel o amddifadedd yn yr un wardiau. Mewn chwech o'r wardiau, mae dros 25 y cant o'r teuluoedd â phlant heb enillydd cyflog ac

salutary reminder to those of us who now live and work in Cardiff Bay, that we do so in one of the most impoverished wards in Wales. However, we also have the privilege of living near to a vibrant community with a strong cultural identity.

Plaid Cymru has always defined a nation as a community of communities. Let us not forget that a significant part of the economic and cultural heritage of Wales is to be found in the dockland communities of Cardiff, Newport and Barry. For consistency, therefore, we support David Melding's amendment 3. However, I propose amendment 2 because it is a little disappointing that among the 76 organisations listed in 5.66 as forming the official partnership, there does not appear to be any organisation representing ethnic minorities. I ask the Government to bear this in mind when setting up the monitoring committee and in giving it guidelines.

To turn quickly to amendment 4, this identifies and deals with one limitation in the proposed programme. Even so, I pay tribute to the authors of the programme for their honesty in identifying a fundamental difficulty that arises when we consider the potential conflict between economic sustainability and environmental sustainability. Thus, in 7.65, the authors warn that if their target growth in gross domestic product per head and in the number of jobs created is achieved, then

'the measures to develop the SME base are likely to have a net negative effect ... both on carbon dioxide emissions and on air quality'.

The next paragraph, 7.66, on promoting communications and accessibility, hopes for 'a positive contribution to the integrated transport objective', but fears

'strenuous efforts will be needed within all of the other measures, if the programme is not to contribute to increased traffic congestion, as a result of both greater use of private cars and increased road freight traffic.'

It is true that there is always a potential conflict between unplanned economic growth and environmental sustainability. We may be forced to choose. Politics is the language of priorities. However, the art of politics is to avoid such a conflict as far as possible. The

mae 25 y cant o'r boblogaeth yn hawlio cymhorthdal incwm. Mae'n llesol i'r rhai ohonom sydd bellach yn byw ac yn gweithio ym Mae Caerdydd gofio ein bod yn gwneud hynny yn un o'r wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym y fraint hefyd o fyw ger cymuned fywiog sydd â hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol gryf.

Y diffiniad o genedl a fu gan Blaid Cymru erioed yw cymuned o gymunedau. Na foed inni anghofio bod rhan bwysig o dreftadaeth economaidd a diwylliannol Cymru i'w chael yng nghymunedau ardaloedd y dociau yng Nghaerdydd, Casnewydd a'r Barri. Er mwyn cysondeb, felly, cefnogwn welliant 3 David Melding. Fodd bynnag, cynigaf welliant 2 oherwydd ei bod braidd yn siomedig nad oes o blith y 76 o fudiadau a restrir yn 5.66 fel y rhai sydd yn ffurfio'r bartneriaeth swyddogol, yr un mudiad sydd yn cynrychioli lleiafrifoedd ethnig, i bob golwg. Gofynnaf i'r Llywodraeth gofio hyn wrth sefydlu'r pwyllgor monitro ac wrth roi canllawiau iddo.

A throi'n gyflym at welliant 4, mae hyn yn dynodi ac yn ymdrin ag un cyfyngiad yn y rhaglen arfaethedig. Er hynny, talaf deyrnged i awduron y rhaglen am eu gonestrwydd wrth ddynodi anhawster sylfaenol sydd yn codi pan ystyriwn y gwrthdaro posibl rhwng cynaliadwyedd economaidd a chynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol. Felly, yn 7.65, mae'r awduron yn rhybuddio, os cyflawnir eu targed am dwf mewn cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen a nifer y swyddi a greir, yna

Mae'r paragraff nesaf, 7.66, ar hybu cyfathrebu a hygyrchedd, yn hyderu y ceir 'a positive contribution to the integrated transport objective', ond yn ofni

Mae'n wir bod gwrthdaro posibl bob amser rhwng twf economaidd anghynlluniedig a chynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol. Efallai y byddwn yn gorfod dewis. Iaith blaenoriaethau yw gwleidyddiaeth. Fodd bynnag, celfyddyd gwleidyddiaeth yw osgoi

ingredients already exist in this document to find the largest possible common ground between economic and environmental sustainability.

gwrthdaro o'r fath hyd y gellir. Mae'r cynhwysion eisoes yn y ddogfen hon i ganfod y tir cyffredin ehangaf posibl rhwng cynaliadwyedd economaidd ac amgylcheddol.

3:27 p.m.

It will be of no surprise to you if I welcome the mention of renewable energy. The planned development of wind, hydro and biomass resources will reduce carbon dioxide emissions, bring extra income to farmers, aid diversification and generate manufacturing jobs with a large export potential.

Ni fyddwch yn synnu os croesawaf y sôn am ynni adnewyddadwy. Bydd y datblygu cynlluniedig o adnoddau gwynt, dŵr a biomàs yn lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid, yn dod ag incwm ychwanegol i ffermwyr, yn cynorthwyo amrywiaethu ac yn creu swyddi gweithgynhyrchu gyda photensial allforio mawr.

The proper development of information and communications technology could dramatically cut the need for car journeys while bringing expanded employment opportunities. A similar virtuous combination applies to waste disposal. It is claimed that we have the worst record in western Europe, although I do not know whether that is true. Landfill disposal of waste is wasteful of energy and resources and also creates methane, a pernicious greenhouse gas. Repairing and recycling, properly audited, can reduce our demands for energy and resource and create new jobs.

Drwy ddatblygu technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu'n briodol gellir cwtogi'n drawiadol ar yr angen am deithiau ceir gan ddod â chyfleoedd cyflogaeth ehangach. Mae cyfuniad rhinweddol tebyg yn gysylltiedig â gwaredu gwastraff. Honnir mai gennym ni y mae'r record waethaf yng ngorllewin Ewrop, er na wn a yw hynny'n wir. Mae gwaredu gwastraff drwy dirlenwi yn gwastraffu ynni ac adnoddau a hefyd yn creu methan, sydd yn nwy tŷ gwydr andwyol. Mae atgyweirio ac ailgylchu, o'u harchwilio'n briodol, yn gallu lleihau ein galw am ynni ac adnoddau a chreu swyddi newydd.

I am not asking for a rewrite of the document as it already contains the ingredients. A re-emphasis is needed that exploits the potential for a virtuous combination of economic and environmental sustainability and makes it one of the guidelines for the programme. Finally, I have added amendment 5, which is similar to one that was accepted unanimously by the Assembly in October.

Nid wyf yn gofyn am ailysgrifennu'r ddogfen gan fod y cynhwysion ynddi eisoes. Mae angen ailbwyslais sydd yn manteisio ar y potensial ar gyfer cyfuniad rhinweddol o gynaliadwyedd economaidd ac amgylcheddol ac yn ei wneud yn un o'r canllawiau i'r rhaglen. Yn olaf, ychwanegais welliant 5, sydd yn debyg i'r un a dderbyniwyd yn unfrydol gan y Cynulliad ym mis Hydref.

With the draft Objectives 1, 2 and 3 documents and some indications of the likely allocations in the INTERREG, LEADER, URBAN and EQUAL initiatives, we can put together all the financial tables to derive the overall sum that must be the basis of the Government's input to the comprehensive spending review. I am assuming an exchange rate of 1 euro to 60p. If the euro rises to a realistic and sustainable parity, the total budget in pounds will increase in proportion and I hope that that is included with guarantees in the comprehensive spending review. The EU contribution to Objectives 1, 2 and 3, plus the anticipated contributions to

Gyda dogfennau drafft Amcanion 1, 2 a 3 rhai arwyddion o'r dyraniadau tebygol yn y mentrau INTERREG, LEADER, URBAN ac EQUAL, gallwn lunio'r holl dablau ariannol i gael y swm cyffredinol a fydd yn gorfod bod yn sail i fewnbwn y Llywodraeth i'r arolwg cynhwysfawr o wariant. Rhagdybiaf gyfradd gyfnewid o 1 ewro i 60c. Os bydd yr ewro'n codi i baredd realistig a chynaliadwy, bydd cyfanswm y gyllideb mewn punnoedd yn cynyddu mewn cyfrannedd a hyderaf fod hynny wedi ei gynnwys gyda gwarantau yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Mae cyfraniad yr UE i Amcanion 1, 2 a 3, ynghyd â'r cyfraniadau disgwylidig i'r mentrau



the small initiatives, when averaged over seven years, totals about £190 million a year. Of this, £65 million is in the European structural funds contributions channelled at present by the Department for Education and Employment. Assuming that the negotiations to transfer funding are successful, it is appropriate to give the overall total.

It is also possible to calculate the total public sector contribution to match funding that is necessary to ensure the 100 per cent take-up of EU funds. Over seven years, it averages about £150 million a year. Plaid Cymru has never claimed that every last penny of match funding should be provided by the Treasury in addition to the block. However, the present budget is stretched to the limit. There is not any spare money in health, education, local government or economic development. Therefore, if we are to make full use of the greatly increased structural funds available, we must secure the corresponding extra match funding above the level paid by the public sector over the 1997-2000 period.

We estimate that the funding paid from the public sector over this period was about £80 to £90 million a year. If that is correct, the extra match funding will be about £60 million, although officials can give the correct figure. The principle is that we should take the actual expenditure in 1997-2000 as the starting point from where we can legitimately claim that the budget was close to breaking point and that any extra demands must be met.

In conclusion, to make full use of the present marvellous opportunity, we need a total allocation to cover Objectives 1, 2 and 3 and the initiatives of at least £250 million a year outside the Barnett block. That is the implication of the principles that we accept. All parties in the Assembly agree on this as we recognise what can be done. The Objective 2 document is a wonderful illustration.

I hope that, with unanimous support, Rhodri Morgan and Edwina Hart will be successful in their negotiations with the Treasury. I hope that, in the spirit of the amendments, for which the Government has voiced support,

bach, o'u cyfartaleddu dros saith mlynedd, yn dod i gyfanswm o tua £190 miliwn y flwyddyn. O hynny, mae £65 miliwn yng nghyfraniadau'r cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd a sianelir ar hyn o bryd gan yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth. Gan gymryd y bydd y negodiadau i drosglwyddo arian yn llwyddiannus, mae'n briodol rhoi'r cyfanswm cyffredinol.

Mae hefyd yn bosibl cyfrifo cyfanswm y cyfraniad gan y sector cyhoeddus i arian cyfatebol sydd yn angenrheidiol er mwyn sicrhau y derbynnir 100 y cant o arian yr UE. Dros saith mlynedd, daw i gyfartaledd o tua £150 miliwn y flwyddyn. Nid yw Plaid Cymru erioed wedi honni y dylai pob un geiniog o arian cyfatebol gael ei darparu gan y Trysorlys ar ben y bloc. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gyllideb bresennol wedi ei hymestyn i'r eithaf. Nid oes arian sbâr mewn iechyd, addysg, llywodraeth leol neu ddatblygu economaidd. Felly, os ydym i ddefnyddio'r cwbl o'r arian strwythurol mwy o lawer sydd ar gael, rhaid inni sicrhau'r arian cyfatebol ychwanegol yn unol â hynny uwchlaw'r lefel a dalwyd gan y sector cyhoeddus dros y cyfnod 1997-2000.

Amcangyfrifwn fod yr arian a dalwyd o'r sector cyhoeddus dros y cyfnod hwn tua £80 i £90 miliwn y flwyddyn. Os yw hynny'n gywir, bydd yr arian cyfatebol ychwanegol tua £60 miliwn, er y gall swyddogion roi'r ffigur cywir. Yr egwyddor yw y dylem gymryd y gwir wariant yn 1997-2000 yn fan cychwyn lle y gallwn honni'n gyfiawn bod y gyllideb ar fin torri a bod yn rhaid ateb unrhyw ofynion ychwanegol.

I derfynu, er mwyn defnyddio'r cyfle ardderchog hwn i'r eithaf, mae arnom angen cyfanswm dyraniad i gynnwys Amcanion 1, 2 a 3 a'r mentrau sydd o leiaf £250 miliwn y flwyddyn y tu allan i floc Barnett. Dyna oblygiad yr egwyddorion a dderbyniwn. Mae'r holl bleidiau yn y Cynulliad yn cytuno ar hyn gan y gwelwn yr hyn y gellir ei wneud. Mae'r ddogfen Amcan 2 yn enghraifft wych.

Gobeithiaf y bydd Rhodri Morgan ac Edwina Hart, gyda chefnogaeth unfrydol, yn llwyddiannus yn eu negodiadau â'r Trysorlys. Gobeithiaf, yn ysbryd y gwelliannau y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi datgan ei chefnogaeth

we can have a unanimous voice in endorsing this programme with great enthusiasm.

**Alun Cairns:** I propose amendment 3 in the name of David Melding. Add new clause ii, as below, and reorder subsequent clauses:

*ii. regrets the administration's decision to exclude deprived wards in Barry from the Objective 2 area; and*

It is a pleasure to be so positive this afternoon. This document also receives united support from the Welsh Conservative Party. As Rhodri said, it was pleasing to be at the last Economic Development Committee meeting when, for once, we were all united about the document and the presentation that was given by the partners that had written the document.

There is a natural link between the problems of the economy and the priorities that have been set. The aim of priority 1 to improve competitiveness by supporting SMEs through knowledge, new technology and the provision of services is absolutely right for the economy at this time. This is to be achieved by a range of business support mechanisms from sites and premises to innovation and research and development support and it is to be commended under current economic conditions. However, with the extra burdens that are placed on manufacturing industries, we must be aware of changing economic circumstances that could lead to much higher levels of unemployment over the programming period. Therefore, flexibility is essential.

This document is aimed at satisfying the needs of the Commission, but it must also play a pivotal role in empowering and embracing each sector of the economy to play its part. On many occasions, I have highlighted my concern and regret that the SME sector has not played as full a part as I would have liked in structural fund programmes in the past. Criticisms have been made of different organisations with differing responsibilities. However, establishing the Welsh European Funding Office was aimed at answering many of those concerns. I am pleased to recognise under priority 4 of technical assistance that facilitators are to be

iddynt, y gallwn gael llais unfryd wrth gadarnhau'r rhaglen hon gyda brwdfrydedd mawr.

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigiau welliant 3 yn enw David Melding. Ychwaneger cymal ii newydd, fel y mae isod, ac ailrefner y cymalau sydd yn dilyn:

*ii. gresynu at benderfyniad y weinyddiaeth i eithrio wardiau difreintiedig yn y Barri o ardal Amcan 2; a*

Pleser yw bod mor gadarnhaol y prynhawn yma. Mae'r ddogfen hon yn derbyn cefnogaeth unol Plaid Geidwadol Cymru hefyd. Fel y dywedodd Rhodri, yr oedd yn braf bod yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd pan oedd pawb ohonom, am unwaith, yn unol ynghylch y ddogfen a'r cyflwyniad a roddwyd gan y partneriaid a ysgrifennodd y ddogfen.

Mae cysylltiad naturiol rhwng problemau'r economi a'r blaenoriaethau a osodwyd. Mae nod blaenoriaeth 1 o wella'r gallu i gystadlu drwy gynorthwyo busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint drwy wybodaeth, technoleg newydd a darparu gwasanaethau'n gwbl briodol i'r economi ar hyn o bryd. Mae hyn i'w gyflawni drwy amrediad o ddulliau cefnogi busnesau o safleoedd ac adeiladau i gymorth arloesi ac ymchwil a datblygu ac mae hyn i'w ganmol o dan yr amodau economaidd presennol. Fodd bynnag, gyda'r beichiau ychwanegol a roddir ar ddiwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu, rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o amgylchiadau economaidd newidiol a allai arwain at lefelau uwch o lawer o ddiweithdra dros y cyfnod rhaglennu. Felly, mae hyblygrwydd yn holl bwysig.

Mae'r ddogfen hon yn ceisio bodloni gofynion y Comisiwn, ond rhaid iddi chwarae rôl ganolog wrth alluogi a chynnwys pob sector o'r economi fel ei fod yn chwarae ei ran. Ar lawer achlysur, tynnais sylw at fy mhryder a'm gofid nad yw sector y busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint wedi chwarae rhan gyn lawn ag yr hoffwn mewn rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol yn y gorffennol. Cafwyd beirniadaeth ar wahanol gyrff sydd â gwahanol gyfrifoldebau. Fodd bynnag, y nod wrth sefydlu Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru oedd ateb llawer o'r pryderon hynny. Yr wyf yn falch o gydnabod o dan flaenoriaeth 4, sef cymorth technol fod

established. Although these have been used in the past in relation to INTERREG, it is essential that they now embrace the whole programme. I encourage the establishment of similar facilitators for the Objective 1 programme.

I am concerned about our capacity to follow through all structural fund programmes. Match funding is a well-rehearsed debate, which I do not want to repeat. Our ability to fulfil the objectives of the documents bothers me. I am not convinced that the Welsh European Funding Office has the necessary guidance from the Assembly. In addition to administering projects to ensure that they meet the criteria involved, there was a clear intention from the Economic Development Committee that the implementing body should be pro-active. My interpretation of pro-active is to promote, advertise and suggest the types of projects that could and would not gain, and releasing the SME sector to capitalise on wealth creating opportunities in which we can all take part.

I was interested to note that of the 100 staff that will be employed in the Welsh European Funding Office, 88 of them will originate from the former Welsh European Programme Executive or the civil service. This offers the benefit of experience in structural funds administration, but the role of promotion is very different. Therefore, the inclusion of the facilitators is a critical factor. John Clarke faces a serious challenge to ensure that the obligations that we have set ourselves in the objectives in the document and the Welsh economy are fulfilled.

The purpose of this amendment is to recognise the deprived condition of Barry in comparison with some of the areas that are excluded from the Objective 2 map. We are happy to support the other amendments. We had considered abstaining on amendment 2 because the equal opportunity principle is included in the four pillars of the Treaty of Amsterdam in which the document was drafted. In the interest of co-operation, we are happy to support it.

3:37 p.m.

**Michael German:** I propose amendment 6. **Michael German:** Cynigiad welliant 6.

hwyluswyr i'w sefydlu. Er i'r rhain gael eu defnyddio yn y gorffennol ynglŷn ag INTERREG, mae'n holl bwysig eu bod yn awr yn cynnwys y rhaglen gyfan. Anogaf sefydlu hwyluswyr tebyg ar gyfer rhaglen Amcan 1.

Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch ein gallu i fwrw ymlaen â holl raglenni'r cronfeydd strwythurol. Mae ariannu cyfatebol yn destun dadl ers tro, ac ni ddymunaf ei hailadrodd. Mae ein gallu i gyflawni amcanion y dogfennau'n fy mhoeni. Nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig bod Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru wedi derbyn y cyfarwyddyd angenrheidiol gan y Cynulliad. Yn ogystal â gweinyddu prosiectau i sicrhau eu bod yn cyflawni'r meini prawf dan sylw, yr oedd bwriad clir gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd y dylai'r corff gweithredu fod yn rhagweithiol. Fy nehongliad i o ragweithiol yw hyrwyddo, hysbysebu ac awgrymu mathau o brosiectau a allai ac na allai fod ar eu hennill, a galluogi sector y busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint i elwa ar gyfleoedd i greu cyfoeth y gallwn oll gymryd rhan ynddynt.

Yr oedd yn ddifyr imi sylwi y bydd 88 o blith y 100 o staff a gyflogir gan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru yn dod o gyn Weithrediaeth Rhaglen Ewropeaidd Cymru neu o'r gwasanaeth sifil. Mae hyn yn cynnig y fantais o brofiad o weinyddu cronfeydd strwythurol, ond mae rôl hyrwyddo'n wahanol iawn. Felly, mae cynnwys yr hwyluswyr yn ffactor holl bwysig. Mae John Clarke yn wynebu her ddifrifol er mwyn sicrhau y cyflawnir y rhwymedigaethau a osodasom arnom ein hunain yn yr amcanion yn y ddogfen ac yn economi Cymru.

Pwrpas y gwelliant hwn yw cydnabod cyflwr difreintiedig y Barri o'i gymharu â rhai o'r ardaloedd a eithriwyd o fap Amcan 2. Yr ydym yn falch o gefnogi'r gwelliannau eraill. Yr oeddem wedi ystyried ymatal ar welliant 2 am fod egwyddor cyfle cyfartal wedi ei chynnwys ym mhedair colofn Cytundeb Amsterdam y drafftwyd y ddogfen oddi mewn iddo. Er mwyn cydweithrediad, yr ydym yn falch o'i gefnogi.

Add at the end of the motion:

*This Assembly further requires the Assembly Secretary for Economic Development to bring forward proposals for ensuring synergy between projects undertaken in the Objective 2 area and in other areas of Wales receiving European structural funding, and in particular for ensuring that successful projects in one area can be replicated in other areas.*

I am sure the First Secretary will be pleased to learn that we will support all that he said at the beginning of the debate, and all the amendments. That reflects the fact that this is a good partnership and a well-written document. I pay tribute to all those who have drawn up this document. It will touch the one in five of the Welsh population who will receive support under this programme. My only regret is that this programme will not become available throughout Wales until January 2001 at the earliest.

I welcome the clear line drawn between Objective 2 programmes, which will deal only with the European regional development fund, and Objective 3 programmes, which will deal with the European social fund. That is a clear way for applicants to know what they are looking for and where the money is coming from. Amendment 6 is about joined-up thinking and being able to consider Objective 1, 2 and 3 programmes as a whole, along with the community initiatives. Those initiatives are missing from this package and are dealt with in other documents. It is also about the connection between those programmes and the Assembly's national economic development strategy. It seems obvious to us that if you are proposing a national economic development strategy, all of these programmes, wherever they occur in Wales, should fit within it.

Where there are good programmes, they should be carried forward regardless of Objective area boundaries. For example, a good business development project in Ceredigion could be carried over into Powys. Training for management skills in Newport should be carried over to and implemented in Cardiff. When you consider our overall objectives, the differences between the

Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*Mae'r Cynulliad hwn yn gofyn ymhellach i'r Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd gyflwyno cynigion i sicrhau bod prosiectau a roddir ar waith yn ardal Amcan 2 a'r rheini mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru sydd yn derbyn arian strwythurol o Ewrop yn cydategu'i gilydd, ac i sicrhau yn enwedig bod modd i brosiectau llwyddiannus mewn un ardal gael eu dyblygu mewn ardaloedd eraill.*

Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn falch o gael gwybod y byddwn yn cefnogi popeth a ddywedodd ar ddechrau'r ddadl, a'r holl welliannau. Mae hynny'n adlewyrchu'r ffaith bod hon yn bartneriaeth dda ac yn ddogfen a ysgrifennwyd yn dda. Talaf deyrnged i bawb a luniodd y ddogfen hon. Bydd yn effeithio ar un ym mhob pump o boblogaeth Cymru a fydd yn derbyn cymorth o dan y rhaglen hon. Yr unig ofid sydd gennyf yw na fydd y rhaglen hon ar gael ledled Cymru tan Ionawr 2001 ar y cynharaf.

Croesawaf y llinell eglur a dynnwyd rhwng rhaglenni Amcan 2, a fydd yn delio â'r gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd yn unig, a rhaglenni Amcan 3, a fydd yn delio â chronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop. Mae hynny'n ffordd eglur o ymgeiswyr wybod am beth y maent yn chwilio ac o ble y daw'r arian. Mae gwelliant 6 yn ymwneud â meddwl cydgysylltiedig a'r gallu i ystyried rhaglenni Amcan 1, 2 a 3 yn eu cyfanrwydd, ochr yn ochr â'r mentrau cymunedol. Mae'r mentrau hynny'n absennol o'r pecyn hwn ac ymdrinnir â hwy mewn dogfennau eraill. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â'r cysylltiad rhwng y rhaglenni hynny a strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol y Cynulliad. Ymddengys yn amlwg i ni, os ydych yn cynnig strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, y dylai'r holl raglenni hyn, lle bynnag y digwyddant yng Nghymru, gael eu cynnwys ynddi.

Lle y mae rhaglenni da, dylid bwrw ymlaen â hwy heb ystyried i ffiniau ardaloedd Amcan. Er enghraifft, gellid ymestyn prosiect datblygu busnes da yng Ngheredigion i Bowys. Dylai hyfforddiant ar gyfer medrau rheoli yng Nghasnewydd gael ei ymestyn i Gaerdydd a'i roi ar waith yno. Pan ystyriwch ein hamcanion cyffredinol, mae'r gwahaniaethau rhwng yr ardaloedd Amcan

Objective areas are somewhat artificial. I would hope that there would be an even roll-out of programmes across Wales under the different Objectives.

I welcome Phil's amendments and his decision to withdraw amendment 1. This document is well worth endorsing. There are five months to go. The document must be sent to the Commission and there will undoubtedly be negotiation between ourselves, the Commission and the partnership during that period. The document will have to come back to us. However, the sooner we can send it off sooner the implementation can take place.

On the relationship between Objectives 1, 2 and 3, nothing more visual comes to mind than Queen Street station in Cardiff. We previously had a discussion about integrated transport and the problems of the Valley lines that run into Cardiff. The problem lies in Queen Street station. If Queen Street station lies in an Objective 2 area, or certainly in a transitional Objective 2 area, then a rationale exists for the Objective 1 areas of Caerphilly, Merthyr and Rhondda Cynon Taff being able to work with the Objective 2 partnership in Cardiff to create the change that we need. I hope that such integration, which relates to the Assembly's overall objectives, and such crossing of Objective boundaries will occur.

I share with Phil his concern over the problem of match funding. The problem that he did not mention is the overhang of match funding from previous years. We are finishing off old programmes and between £250 million and £300 million of match funding is still to be found before the end of December 2001. That money will have to come out of the budgets currently before the various public organisations which provide it. It should also be recognised that although we talk about the European social fund having a role in London and so on, the match funding for ESF has always come from within the Barnett block grant, with few exceptions. We seek the public expenditure survey cover above Barnett and the match funding above Barnett, and we will measure our First Secretary's strength and ability to bat for Wales on whether he will secure that for us.

braidd yn ffug. Byddwn yn gobeithio y câi'r rhaglenni eu hymestyn yn gyfartal ledled Cymru o dan y gwahanol Amcanion.

Croesawaf welliannau Phil a'i benderfyniad i dynnu'n ôl gwelliant 1. Mae'r ddogfen hon yn werth ei chefnogi. Mae pum mis i fynd. Rhaid anfon y ddogfen at y Comisiwn ac mae'n sicr y bydd negodi rhyngom ni, y Comisiwn a'r bartneriaeth yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Bydd yn rhaid i'r ddogfen hon ddod yn ôl atom. Fodd bynnag, gorau po gyntaf inni ei hanfon yn y buander er mwyn ei rhoi ar waith.

Ynghylch y berthynas rhwng Amcanion 1, 2 a 3, ni ddaw dim mwy gweledol i'r meddwl na gorsaf Stryd y Frenhines yng Nghaerdydd. Cawsom drafodaeth o'r blaen am integreiddio trafniadaeth a phroblemau rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd sydd yn rhedeg i Gaerdydd. Mae'r broblem i'w chael yng ngorsaf Stryd y Frenhines. Os yw gorsaf Stryd y Frenhines yn sefyll mewn ardal Amcan 2, neu'n sicr mewn ardal Amcan 2 drosiannol, yna mae sail resymegol i ardaloedd Amcan 1 Caerffili, Merthyr Tudful a Rhondda Cynon Taf allu gweithio gyda'r bartneriaeth Amcan 2 yng Nghaerdydd i greu'r newid y mae arnom ei angen. Gobeithiaf y ceir integreiddio o'r fath, sydd yn ymwneud ag amcanion cyffredinol y Cynulliad, a chroesi ffiniau Amcan yn y modd hwn.

Rhannaf bryder Phil ynghylch problem arian cyfatebol. Y broblem na soniodd amdani yw bargodiad arian cyfatebol o flynyddoedd blaenorol. Yr ydym yn gorffen hen raglenni ac mae angen canfod rhwng £250 miliwn a £300 miliwn o arian cyfatebol o hyd cyn diwedd Rhagfyr 2001. Bydd yn rhaid i'r arian hwnnw ddod o'r cyllidebau sydd yn awr gerbron y gwahanol gyrff cyhoeddus sydd yn ei ddarparu. Dylid cydnabod hefyd, er ein bod yn sôn am y rôl sydd i gronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop yn Llundain ac yn y blaen, bod yr arian cyfatebol ar gyfer cronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop yn dod erioed o grant bloc Barnett, gydag ychydig o eithriadau. Ceisiwn arian o'r arolwg gwariant cyhoeddus ar ben bloc Barnett a'r arian cyfatebol ar ben bloc Barnett, a byddwn yn mesur cryfder a gallu ein Prif Ysgrifennydd i fatio dros Gymru yn ôl ei allu i sicrhau hynny i ni. Yr

We are facing an era where we require double the amount of match funding that we previously required. I will discuss that further in the debate on the Objective 3 document.

I would like Rhodri to answer this question when he replies to the debate. The partnership told us that it viewed the way forward for Objective 2 only in terms of local plans. In other words, everything will be done locally. Is there also a role for co-ordination across the area to take on board collaboration with Objective 1 areas? I mentioned one incident earlier and I hope that others will follow on from it, but the way the programme is implemented may need to be revisited to see if there are ways of drawing together and having synergy between different areas in Wales. Perhaps only having local plans to spend the money is not the best way of doing it, but that is a matter for the future.

I agree with David Melding—who did not speak on behalf of Barry, but I understand the rationale behind his comments—about the map imperfections. However, there is a big imperfection in the Objective 2 map apart from Barry, and that is Wrexham and Flintshire. Wrexham and Flintshire are the white dots on the map. The map that shows which areas of Wales receive European money also shows big white holes for Wrexham and Flintshire. These areas do not have Objective 2 or 1 status and have very little regional selective assistance. They are the hole in the middle of the sandwich between east and west—

**Karen Sinclair:** We must not forget that a review of this situation is pending and that, hopefully, there will be a reasonable outcome.

**Michael German:** I hope that the Objective 2 map and regional selective assistance will be reviewed. If you have had an assurance from the First Secretary, I am pleased, and Tom Middlehurst looks pleased that there will be a review of regional selective assistance in north-east Wales. It will be encouraging to hear the First Secretary's response to that. However, I wait with bated breath.

It is wise for the Assembly to endorse,

ydyd yn wynebu cyfnod lle y bydd arnom angen dwywaith swm yr arian cyfatebol yr oedd arnom ei angen cynt. Byddaf yn trafod hynny ymhellach yn y ddadl ar ddogfen Amcan 3.

Dymunaf i Rhodri ateb y cwestiwn hwn pan fydd yn ymateb i'r ddadl. Dywedodd y bartneriaeth wrthym ei bod yn gweld y ffordd ymlaen i Amcan 2 yn nhermau cynlluniau lleol yn unig. Mewn geiriau eraill, gwneir popeth yn lleol. A oes rôl hefyd i gydlynw ledled yr ardal er mwyn cynnwys cydweithredu ag ardaloedd Amcan 1? Crybwyllais un digwyddiad yn gynharach a gobeithiaf y bydd eraill yn dilyn hynny, ond efallai y bydd angen ailystyried y modd y rhoddir y rhaglen ar waith er mwyn canfod a oes dulliau o dynnu ynghyd a chael synergedd rhwng gwahanol ardaloedd yng Nghymru. Efallai nad cael cynlluniau lleol yn unig i wario'r arian yw'r ffordd orau o wneud hyn, ond mae hynny'n fater i'r dyfodol.

Cytunaf â David Melding—na siaradodd ar ran y Barri, ond deallaf y sail resymegol i'w sylwadau—am ddiffygion y map. Fodd bynnag, mae diffyg mawr yn y map Amcan 2 heblaw am y Barri, sef Wrecsam a Sir y Fflint. Wrecsam a Sir y Fflint yw'r smotiau gwyn ar y map. Mae'r map sydd yn dangos pa ardaloedd o Gymru a gaiff arian Ewropeaidd hefyd yn dangos tyllau mawr gwyn ar gyfer Wrecsam a Sir y Fflint. Nid oes gan yr ardaloedd hyn statws Amcan 2 nac 1 ac ychydig iawn o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol sydd ganddynt. Hwy yw'r twll yng nghanol y frechdan rhwng y dwyrain a'r gorllewin—

**Karen Sinclair:** Rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio bod adolygiad o'r sefyllfa hon ar fin digwydd ac y bydd canlyniad rhesymol, gobeithio.

**Michael German:** Gobeithiaf yr adolygir map Amcan 2 a chymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Os cawsoch sicrwydd gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd, yr wyf yn falch, ac mae Tom Middlehurst yn ymddangos yn falch y bydd adolygiad o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru. Bydd yn galonogol clywed ymateb y Prif Ysgrifennydd i hynny. Fodd bynnag, arhosaf gan ddal fy anadl.

Mae'n ddoeth bod Cynulliad yn cadarnhau,

commend and pass on the document. We must also thank its authors for the enormous effort that they have put into this project during the last two years and the partnership they have brought together.

**Janet Ryder:** As someone who is not usually involved in the Economic Development Committee, I welcome the opportunity to have an input into this debate. To be fair, there has been little opportunity for Members to contribute to the development of these draft Objective 2 single programming documents. The draft was presented to the Committee only last Thursday, therefore, Members have had no input into the document's content and could only comment on the draft. Neither did they have an input into the designation of areas to be included on the revised UK Objective 2 map, which was sent to Brussels in March. While some Members have sought to include Barry, there are other areas, particularly in north Wales, which are not included on the map. For example, Wrexham will only receive transitional funding, so it is important that full use is made of that, particularly in the light of recent decisions that have affected north Wales: the reduction of regional selective assistance areas which excluded Wrexham, decisions relating to Broughton and cuts in the WDA's budget. All these decisions mean that transitional funding that is available in that area must be used to its full extent to help it, particularly as it is sandwiched between two Objective 1 areas.

However, as Phil said, I welcome the split in this document between the rural and urban projects. That is an improvement on the Objective 1 document. It is also an improvement that it was developed by three working groups: one urban, one rural and one statistical with a co-ordinating group to bring everything together. Plaid Cymru hopes that this structure will continue and that the same thing happens with the Objective 1 process.

Plaid Cymru feels that the environmental sections must be improved. The European Union is keen on sustainable development and it is a statutory duty for the Assembly to ensure that this principle is adhered to. We would like to see the development of clean technology, the use of renewable energy, an energy strategy and the development of green

cymeradwyo a throsglwyddo'r ddogfen. Rhaid inni hefyd d+diolch i'w hawduron am yr ymdrech aruthrol a roesant i'r prosiect hwn yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf a'r bartneriaeth a gynullasant.

**Janet Ryder:** Fel un nad yw'n ymwneud fel arfer â'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, croesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon. A bod yn deg, prin fu'r cyfle i Aelodau gyfrannu i ddatblygu'r dogfennau rhaglennu sengl Amcan 2 drafft hyn. Ond ddydd Iau diwethaf y cyflwynwyd y drafft i'r Pwyllgor, felly nid yw'r Aelodau wedi cyfrannu o gwbl i gynnwys y ddogfen ac ni allent ond gwneud sylwadau ar y drafft. Ni allent gyfrannu ychwaith at ddynodi'r ardaloedd a oedd i'w cynnwys ar fap Amcan 2 diwygiedig y DU, a anfonwyd i Frwsel ym Mawrth. Er bod rhai Aelodau wedi ceisio cynnwys y Barri, mae ardaloedd eraill, yn enwedig yng ngogledd Cymru, nas cynhwysir ar y map. Er enghraifft, ni fydd Wrecsam ond yn derbyn arian trosiannol, felly mae'n bwysig defnyddio hynny'n llawn, yn enwedig yng ngoleuni penderfyniadau diweddar a effeithiodd ar ogledd Cymru: lleihau ardaloedd cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol gan hepgor Wrecsam, penderfyniadau ynghylch Brychdyn a thoriadau yng nghyllideb WDA. Mae'r holl benderfyniadau hyn yn golygu bod yn rhaid i arian trosiannol sydd ar gael yn yr ardal honno gael ei ddefnyddio i'r eithaf i'w helpu, yn enwedig gan ei bod wedi ei gwasgu rhwng dwy ardal Amcan 1.

Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd Phil, croesawaf y rhaniad yn y ddogfen hon rhwng y prosiectau gwledig a'r rhai trefol. Mae hynny'n welliant ar y ddogfen Amcan 1. Mae hefyd yn welliant ei bod wedi ei datblygu gan dri gweithgor: un trefol, un gwledig ac un ystadegol gyda grŵp cydlynu i ddod â phob dim at ei gilydd. Mae Plaid Cymru'n gobeithio y bydd y strwythur hwn yn parhau ac y bydd yr un peth yn digwydd ym mhroses Amcan 1.

Mae Plaid Cymru'n teimlo bod yn rhaid gwella'r adrannau amgylcheddol. Mae'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn frwd dros ddatblygu cynaliadwy ac mae'n ddyletswydd statudol ar y Cynulliad i sicrhau y glynir wrth yr egwyddor hon. Hoffem weld datblygu technoleg lân, defnyddio ynni adnewyddadwy, strategaeth ynni a datblygu

and sustainable businesses through this programme.

3:47 p.m.

The outstanding issues at the UK level have largely been resolved. However, there are still some differences of opinion between Assembly officials and members of the partnership. Within the partnership, the Objective 2 programme should be implemented through the local partnerships and local action plans. For example, a local partnership in Cardiff has already been set up. The integration of minority groups could be secured at that level. There was a feeling that the emphasis on local delivery was perhaps not shared with Assembly officials. We seek an assurance that delivery is mainly through local partnerships. Those partnerships should develop throughout Wales for the delivery of this programme in the Objective 2 areas.

**David Melding:** Presiding Officer, I am grateful to have caught your eye. Despite the fact that I agree with the positive things that have been said about this document, I want to concentrate on the case for Barry. Barry was in the previous Objective 2 area. The people of Barry, including the business people and job hunters, have a right to know why the situation is changing. The Vale of Glamorgan is one of only three councils in the UK to lose out completely in the new Objective 2 map. In many of its wards, Barry is one of the most deprived areas in Wales. It is difficult, with any sub-criteria in the document, to say that Barry does not qualify for serious consideration. At present there are projects in Barry that could, if not founder, not reach a full and successful conclusion. The transformation of the waterfront in Barry is tremendous. We often talk exclusively about what has happened in Cardiff, which is magnificent. However, there is a remarkable revival in Barry, which I do not want to be endangered.

The First Secretary knows that the views within the Vale of Glamorgan Council have been cross-party. All parties that are represented on the Council have agreed unanimously that the case for Barry has not

busnesau gwyrdd a chynaliadwy drwy'r rhaglen hon.

Mae'r materion ar lefel y DU nas penderfynwyd wedi eu datrys i raddau helaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai gwahaniaethau barn o hyd rhwng swyddogion y Cynulliad ac aelodau'r bartneriaeth. O fewn y bartneriaeth, dylid rhoi rhaglen Amcan 2 ar waith drwy'rartneriaethau lleol a'r cynlluniau gweithredu lleol. Er enghraifft, mae partneriaeth leol yng Nghaerdydd eisoes wedi ei sefydlu. Gellid sicrhau integreiddio grwpiau lleiafrifol ar y lefel honno. Yr oedd teimlad nad oedd y pwyslais ar gyflenwi lleol wedi ei rannu efallai gan swyddogion y Cynulliad. Gofynnwn am sicrwydd mai drwy bartneriaethau lleol yn bennaf y bydd y cyflenwi. Dylid datblygu'r partneriaethau hynny ledled Cymru er mwyn cyflenwi'r rhaglen hon yn ardaloedd Amcan 2.

**David Melding:** Lywydd, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar imi ddal eich llygad. Er gwaethaf y ffaith fy mod yn cytuno â'r pethau cadarnhaol a ddywedwyd am y ddogfen hon, dymunaf ganolbwyntio ar y ddatl dros y Barri. Yr oedd y Barri yn yr ardal Amcan 2 flaenorol. Mae gan bobl y Barri, gan gynnwys y bobl busnes a'r rhai sydd yn chwilio am swydd, hawl i wybod pam y mae'r sefyllfa'n newid. Mae Bro Morgannwg yn un o blith dim ond tri chyngor yn y DU sydd ar eu colled yn llwyr yn y map Amcan 2 newydd. Mewn llawer o'i wardiau, mae'r Barri'n un o'r ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru. Mae'n anodd dweud, gan ddilyn unrhyw is-feini prawf yn y ddogfen, nad yw'r Barri'n gymwys i'w ystyried o ddifrif. Ar hyn o bryd mae prosiectau yn y Barri a allai, os nad methu, peidio â chael eu cwblhau'n llawn ac yn llwyddiannus. Mae'r trawsnewid ar lan y dŵr yn y Barri'n aruthrol. Yr ydym yn sôn yn aml am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yng Nghaerdydd, sydd yn ardderchog. Fodd bynnag, mae adfywiad rhyfeddol yn y Barri, nad wyf am iddo gael ei beryglu.

Gŵyr y Prif Ysgrifennydd y bu'r farn yng Nghyngor Bro Morgannwg fod yn drawsbleidiol. Mae'r holl bleidiau a gynrychiolir ar y Cyngor wedi cytuno'n unfrydol nad yw'r ddatl dros y Barri wedi



been listened to as attentively as it should have been. They are dismayed by the outcome of the decision to exclude Barry from the map. Local businesses have been here to lobby Assembly Members and Secretaries. In fairness, although Jane Hutt is not here this afternoon, she and I co-hosted a successful event for 'Pride in Barry', which looked at the issue broadly instead of simply concentrating on this unfortunate decision. It was naturally one of the main concerns of the people there.

In fairness to the First Secretary, he does not mince his words. He uses the phrase, 'Barry has been excluded', and he gives reasons for that. His predecessor used to say that Barry was not being included, which caused a lot of anger. It is not a funny point. At least the First Secretary uses direct language. However, he told me that it is easy to make promises when you can use the luxury of opposition. Opposition is about scrutiny and holding the Government to account, which is why I am here. The First Secretary is here to lead his Administration with his Cabinet colleagues, to make decisions and to be questioned on them. I make no apology for my status as an opposition Member. Everyone agrees that in an ideal situation Barry would be in the Objective 2 area. The First Secretary said that he recognised the intellectual case. Barry has been excluded. It is right that we ask why.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I will speak about exit strategies, using Cardiff Bay Development Corporation as a good example of how not to make an exit. Many groups, particularly in Butetown and Grangetown, were supported and funded by CBDC. They felt badly let down when that funding stopped when CBDC went into its demise. They were left feeling isolated and unwanted. There is nothing more demoralising than building up people's expectations and not supporting them all the way through. Like other Assembly Members, I have been contacted by various groups. The South Glamorgan Women's Workshop contacted me today—although South Glamorgan no longer exists. The workshop is based in Cardiff and its members are concerned about the transitional period. Many such groups currently rely on an element of European funding. With the

cael gwrandawriad mor astud ag y dylai. Maent wedi eu digalonni gan ganlyniad y penderfyniad i eithrio'r Barri o'r map. Bu busnesau lleol yma i lobio Aelodau ac Ysgrifenyddion y Cynulliad. Er tegwch, er nad yw Jane Hutt yma y prynhawn yma, cydlywyddodd hi a minnau ddigwyddiad llwyddiannus ar ran 'Pride in Barry', a fwriaddd olwg eang ar y mater yn lle canolbwyntio ar y penderfyniad anffodus hwn yn unig. Yr oedd, wrth gwrs, yn un o brif bryderon y rhai a oedd yno.

Er tegwch i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd, nid yw'n hel dail. Defnyddia'r ymadrodd, 'Eithriwyd y Barri', ac mae'n rhoi rhesymau am hynny. Arferai ei ragflaenydd ddweud nad oedd y Barri'n cael ei gynnwys, a achosai lawer o ddieter. Nid yw'n bwynt doniol. Mae'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn defnyddio iaith uniongyrchol o leiaf. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd wrthyf ei bod yn hawdd gwneud addewidion pan allwch fanteisio ar foethusrwydd yr wrthblaid. Mae'r wrthblaid yn ymwneud ag archwilio a galw'r Llywodraeth i gyfrif, a dyna pam yr wyf yma. Mae'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yma i arwain ei weinyddiaeth gyda'i gyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet, i wneud penderfyniadau a chael ei holi yn eu cylch. Nid ymddiheuraf am fy statws fel Aelod o wrthblaid. Mae pawb yn cytuno y byddai'r Barri mewn sefyllfa ddelfrydol yn yr ardal Amcan 2. Dywedodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd ei fod yn cydnabod y ddadl ddeallusol. Eithriwyd y Barri. Mae'n iawn inni ofyn pam.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr wyf am siarad am strategaethau mynd allan, gan ddefnyddio Corfforaeth Datblygu BAE Caerdydd yn enghraifft dda o sut i beidio â mynd allan. Yr oedd llawer o grwpiau, yn enwedig yn Butetown a Grangetown, yn cael eu cefnogi a'u hariannu gan Gorfforaeth Datblygu BAE Caerdydd. Teimlent eu bod wedi eu siomi pan ddaeth yr arian hwnnw i ben pan aeth CDBC i'w thranc. Fe'u gadawyd yn teimlo'n unig ac yn wrthodedig. Nid oes dim sydd yn digalonni mwy na chodi gobeithion pobl a pheidio â'u cynnal ar hyd y daith. Mae amryw o grwpiau wedi cysylltu â mi, ac ag Aelodau Cynulliad eraill. Cysylltodd Gweithdy Menywod De Morgannwg â mi heddiw—er nad yw De Morgannwg yn bod bellach. Mae'r gweithdy â'i ganolfan yng Nghaerdydd ac mae ei aelodau'n bryderus ynghylch y cyfnod trosiannol. Mae llawer o

reorganisation of the new Objective 2 and 3 programmes, there is a need to plan properly for this transition. The problem of a possible transitional funding gap must be addressed. In this case, there could be a six to seven month gap. I want the First Secretary's assurance on that, as many of these groups are voluntary groups. They must be helped through this uncertain period in order to survive.

**Mick Bates:** I am pleased to hear so much positiveness about the way this single programming document has been prepared. Powys has played a part in it and we all know that Powys is the font of much wisdom. We were disappointed to be excluded from the Objective 1 area. However, we look forward to the future.

I support David Melding in his eloquently expressed view about the exclusion of places like Barry. In south Powys, we have wards that have been excluded, which is unjust. We have not heard a coherent reason yet why wards like Talgarth have been excluded. However, I want to draw the First Secretary's attention to the implementation of this excellent SPD. We are concerned that the good work that has been done in terms of community regeneration through, for example, the work of the LEADER groups, could be lost. I would like to hear the First Secretary's views on how the interface will work between the communities, the managers and the funding bodies of Objective 2.

I support Phil Williams's amendment 4 on renewable energy. I would also like to bring home to the First Secretary the fact that the Assembly does not yet have a coherent strategy for renewables throughout Wales. We must produce a coherent strategy urgently for the rural development plan, which includes renewables, as well as Objective 1 and 2. I heard last week that farmers, through growing timber for biomass projects, will become the new ayatollahs of the energy industry. You may laugh but I am looking forward to that in a few years time.

**Glyn Davies:** Am I to interpret your comments about biomass in Wales as a

grwpiau o'r fath yn dibynnu ar hyn o bryd ar elfen o ariannu Ewropeaidd. Gydag aildrefnu'r rhaglenni Amcan 2 a 3 newydd, mae angen cynllunio'n iawn ar gyfer y trawsnewid hwn. Rhaid rhoi sylw i broblem y bwlbwlch posibl mewn ariannu trosiannol. Yn yr achos hwn, mae'n bosibl y bydd bwlbwlch o chwech i saith mis. Dymunaf gael sicrwydd gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd ar hynny, gan fod llawer o'r grwpiau hyn yn grwpiau gwirfoddol. Rhaid eu helpu drwy'r cyfnod ansicr hwn er mwyn iddynt barhau.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed cymaint sydd yn gadarnhaol ynghylch y modd y paratowyd y ddogfen raglennu sengl hon. Mae Powys wedi chwarae rhan ynddi a gwyddom oll fod Powys yn ffynhonnell i lawer o ddoethineb. Yr oeddem yn siomedig o gael ein heithrio o ardal Amcan 1. Fodd bynnag, edrychwn ymlaen at y dyfodol.

Cefnogaf David Melding yn y farn a fynegwyd yn huawdl ganddo am eithrio lleoedd fel y Barri. Yn ne Powys, mae gennym wardiau a eithriwyd, sydd yn anghyfiawn. Ni chlywsom eto reswm dealladwy pam y mae wardiau fel Talgarth wedi eu heithrio. Fodd bynnag, dymunaf dynnu sylw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd at weithredu'r ddogfen raglennu sengl ragorol hon. Yr ydym yn bryderus y gellid colli'r gwaith da a wnaethpwyd o ran adfywio cymunedol drwy waith y grwpiau LEADER, er enghraifft. Hoffwn glywed barn y Prif Ysgrifennydd ar y modd y bydd y rhyngwyneb yn gweithio rhwng y cymunedau, y rheolwyr a chyrff ariannu Amcan 2.

Cefnogaf welliant 4 Phil Williams ar ynni adnewyddadwy. Hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd hefyd at y ffaith nad oes gan y Cynulliad strategaeth gydlynol eto ar gyfer dulliau adnewyddadwy ledled Cymru. Rhaid inni gynhyrchu strategaeth gydlynol ar frys ar gyfer y cynllun datblygu gwledig, a fydd yn cynnwys dulliau adnewyddadwy, yn ogystal ag Amcan 1 a 2. Clywais yr wythnos diwethaf mai ffermwyr fydd aiatolas newydd y diwydiant ynni, drwy dyfu pren ar gyfer prosiectau biomàs. Gallech chwerthin ond edrychaf ymlaen at hynny ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd.

**Glyn Davies:** A ydwyf i ddehongli'ch sylwadau ynghylch biomàs yng Nghymru fel

declaration of your full support for the proposed project at Newbridge? Is that Liberal Democrat policy?

datganiad o'ch cefnogaeth lwyr i'r prosiect arfaethedig yn y Bontnewydd ar Wy? Ai hynny yw polisi'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol?

**Mick Bates:** Our policy on renewables is well expressed. As you are aware, Glyn, the planning application and information about the environmental impact have not yet been received. I will stand by the local authority's decision on this, as I am sure you would.

**Mick Bates:** Mae ein polisi ar ddulliau adnewyddadwy wedi ei fynegi'n eglur. Fel y gwyddoch, Glyn, ni chafwyd y cais cynllunio a'r wybodaeth am yr effaith amgylcheddol eto. Cefnogaf benderfyniad yr awdurdod lleol ar hyn, fel y gwnaech chi yr wyf yn siŵr.

Returning to the theme of biomass, I am sure that Glyn is looking to be an ayatollah as well.

A dychwelyd at thema biomàs, yr wyf yn sicr bod Glyn am fod yn aiatola hefyd.

**Alun Cairns:** What sort of an answer is that?

**Alun Cairns:** Pa fath o ateb yw hynny?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Mick Bates:** Saved by the bell. I am concerned that the major source of funding through the rural development plan is the European agricultural guidance and guarantee fund, which will be available across Objective 1 areas as well. Since the rate of the EAGGF grant has not yet been announced, consideration should be given to making the rate in east Wales more favourable. This would promote our aims better, otherwise the Objective 2 area could be an overall loser to the Objective 1 area.

**Mick Bates:** Fe'm hachubwyd mewn pryd. Yr wyf yn bryderus mai'r brif ffynhonnell ariannu drwy'r cynllun datblygu gwledig yw cronfa cyfarwyddo a gwarantu amaethyddiaeth Ewrop, a fydd ar gael ledled ardaloedd Amcan 1 hefyd. Gan nad yw cyfradd grant cronfa cyfarwyddo a gwarantu amaethyddiaeth Ewrop wedi ei chyhoeddi eto, dylid ystyried gwneud y gyfradd yn nwyrain Cymru'n fwy ffafriol. Byddai hynny'n hybu ein nodau'n well, neu fel arall gallai ardal Amcan 2 fod ar ei cholled yn gyffredinol i ardal Amcan 1.

**Karen Sinclair:** We were all very disappointed about Wrexham but we are hopeful that our appeal will be heard. As my constituency includes Objective 1, 2 and 3 areas, I think that clarity is important so that the public understands what is available. I would like Rhodri to pick up on this one. I would like an assurance that full information will be available at every level, especially in areas where they are closely linked within a constituency.

**Karen Sinclair:** Yr oeddem oll yn siomedig iawn ynghylch Wrecsam ond yr ydym yn obeithiol y clywir ein hapêl. Gan fod fy etholaeth yn cynnwys ardaloedd Amcan 1, 2 a 3, credaf fod eglurder yn bwysig fel bod y cyhoedd yn deall beth sydd ar gael. Hoffwn i Rhodri ddilyn hyn. Hoffwn gael sicrwydd y bydd yr holl wybodaeth ar gael ar bob lefel, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd sydd â chysylltiad agos o fewn etholaeth.

3:57 p.m.

**The First Secretary:** This debate has probably been the most pleasing, for a well-deserved reason, that we have had during the 12 months of the Assembly's existence. We gave well-deserved approval to a well-written document. I make no apologies for that. If the public expect punch-ups in every Plenary session they will no doubt have been disappointed today. They may have thought

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae'n debyg mai'r ddadl hon yw'r un fwyaf pleserus, am reswm haeddiannol, a gawsom yn ystod y 12 mis o fodolaeth y Cynulliad. Rhoesom gymeradwyaeth haeddiannol i ddogfen a ysgrifennwyd yn dda. Nid ymddiheuraf am hynny o gwbl. Os yw'r cyhoedd yn disgwyl ysgarmes ym mhob Cyfarfod Llawn mae'n sicr y bydd yn siomedig heddiw. Efallai

that the administration put Prozac in the canteen tea this morning, in the same way as the army used to be accused of putting bromide in the naafi's tea. The reason for the degree of agreement today was not any conspiracy of that sort. It was recognition of the remarkable efforts made by two disparate areas like Powys and the relevant urban areas in Wales that were in the Objective 2 area into overcoming that potential chasm that might have resulted, perhaps understandably so, in a divided document. They have managed to weave a good deal of unity within the Objective 2 East Wales Partnership area. We have battened on to that degree of unity, resulting in the excellence of the writing and drafting and the coherence of thought that has gone into this in spite of the difficulties that could have arisen.

I will go through some of the points that have been raised during the debate. We may then go through some of the votes. I am grateful for Phil's remarks. Some of his points about how we implement through local partnerships have cropped up as constant themes in many of the contributions this afternoon. There will be a great deal of local implementation. The Welsh European Funding Office people will have to have regard to how you ensure coherence that the local partnerships do not start to go off in different directions, given that the document itself is remarkably good at finding common ground between the problems of Powys, Cardiff or wherever. The issue of where ethnic minorities will need to be brought in through these local partnerships will be a matter for detailed consideration when we come to the implementation stage. That is a key issue for the partnership and WEFO to work on over the next six months. We hope that there will be a commencement of real action on Objective 2 early in 2001.

Alun Cairns's speech was the first of his that I have enjoyed. I hope he will accept this in the spirit in which it is intended. There is provision for facilitators in the Objective 1 and 3 programmes as well. They can be paid for under technical assistance in Objective 1, 3 and 2. There is no difference.

The issue of co-ordination was important in Mike German's comments. I approve of his remark that trying to retain co-ordination

idddynt feddwl bod y weinyddiaeth wedi rhoi Prozac yn y te yn y ffreutur y bore yma, yn yr un modd ag yr arferid cyhuddo'r fyddin o roi bromid yn nhe'r naafi. Nid rhyw gynllwyn o'r math hwnnw yw'r rheswm am y graddau o gytundeb heddiw. Yr oedd yn gydnabyddiaeth i'r ymdrechion rhyfeddol a wnaethpwyd gan ddwy ardal gwbl wahanol fel Powys a'r ardaloedd trefol perthnasol yng Nghymru a oedd yn ardal Amcan 2 er mwyn goresgyn y bwlch posibl hwnnw a allai fod wedi arwain, yn ddealladwy efallai, at ddogfen ranedig. Llwyddasant i wau llawer iawn o undod o fewn ardal Amcan 2 Partneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru. Yr ydym wedi pesgi ar y graddau hynny o undod, gan arwain at ragoriaeth yr ysgrifennu a'r drafftio a chysondeb y meddwl a aeth i hyn er gwaethaf y gwahaniaethau a allai fod wedi codi.

Yr wyf am fynd drwy rai o'r pwyntiau a godwyd yn ystod y ddaol. Gallem wedyn fynd drwy rai o'r pleidleisiau. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am sylwadau Phil. Mae rhai o'i bwyntiau am y modd y dylem weithredu drwy bartneriaethau lleol wedi codi fel themâu cyson mewn llawer o'r cyfraniadau y prynhawn yma. Bydd llawer iawn o weithredu lleol. Bydd yn rhaid i bobl Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru roi sylw i'r modd y sicrhewch gydlynad fel na fydd y partneriaethau lleol yn cychwyn i gyfeiriadau gwahanol, o ystyried bod y ddogfen ei hun yn hynod o dda wrth ganfod tir cyffredin rhwng problemau Powys, Caerdydd neu ble bynnag. Bydd y cwestiwn o ble y bydd angen dod â lleiafrifoedd ethnig i mewn i'r partneriaethau lleol hyn yn fater i'w ystyried yn fanwl pan ddeuwn at y cyfnod gweithredu. Mae hynny'n fater allweddol i'r bartneriaeth a Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru weithio arno dros y chwe mis nesaf. Gobeithiwn y dechreuir gweithredu'n wirioneddol ar Amcan 2 yn gynnar yn 2001.

Araith Alun Cairns oedd y gyntaf o'i eiddo imi ei mwynhau. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn derbyn hyn yn yr ysbryd y'i bwriadwyd. Mae darpariaeth ar gyfer hwyluswyr yn rhaglenni Amcan 1 a 3 hefyd. Gellir talu amdanynt o dan gymorth technegol yn Amcan 1, 3 a 2. Nid oes gwahaniaeth.

Yr oedd mater cydlynu'n bwysig yn sylwadau Mike German. Cymeradwyaf ei sylw mai her fawr fydd ceisio cadw

within Objective 2 and between Objective 2 programmes and the other programmes will be a great challenge. It is a challenge for the Assembly to keep an eye on and for WEFO as the body of officials that would be also doing it.

The Objective 2 map is not negotiable. It has been accepted by the Commission and cannot be amended now. We should stop having any views on that. It is going to be difficult to change regional selective assistance, but it could in theory happen. But not Objective 2. That is closed, finished and done with. That, to some extent, answers the issues in relation to Barry.

My use of the word 'excluded' does not represent a change of view. I was repeating the phrasing of the amendment. The point made by Janet Ryder, Mike German and Karen Sinclair about the difficulties of the so-called white area around Wrexham and parts of Flinshire is something that we all recognise given that Merseyside is on the other side in England and the big Objective 1 area in Wales. The problem is trying to do something about it because everybody can see the ward boundary figures. The same applies to Barry. If you look at the map of wards that are most dependent on social security, for example, none of the wards in Barry are in the top twelve, but wards in Cardiff and Newport are invariably in the top twelve. Some of the other areas report long-term illness, including wards in Powys in the former industrial areas around Ystradgynlais and Cardiff and Newport but those areas do not include wards in Barry and Wrexham. Sometimes that results from the fact that the wards are bigger, but we work within those limitations. The wards are the building blocks and there was little that we could do to try to change things. Therefore, you may think that it is tough on Gibbonsdown, Castleland and Court wards, but they are not in the top twelve in terms of deprivation, if you measure deprivation by dependency on social security of the population. We do not want to argue against the statistics; they are there for everybody to see.

I do not want to introduce any notes of controversy. This is not a huge programme. It is only £70 million in terms of European funding over six years, which is not very big,

cydlyniad o fewn Amcan 2 a rhwng rhaglenni Amcan 2 a'r rhaglenni eraill. Mae'n her i'r Cynulliad gadw golwg arni ac i Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru fel y corff o swyddogion a fyddai hefyd yn gwneud hynny.

Nid yw map Amcan 2 yn agored i'w drafod. Fe'i derbyniwyd gan y Comisiwn ac ni ellir ei newid yn awr. Dylem roi'r gorau i goleddu unrhyw farn ar hynny. Bydd yn anodd newid cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, ond gallai ddigwydd mewn damcaniaeth. Ond nid Amcan 2. Mae hynny wedi ei orffen yn derfynol. Mae hynny, i ryw raddau, yn ateb y cwestiynau ynghylch y Barri.

Nid yw'r defnydd gennyf o'r gair 'eithriwyd' yn golygu newid barn. Yr oeddwn yn ailadrodd geiriad y gwelliant. Mae'r pwynt a wnaethpwyd gan Janet Ryder, Mike German a Karen Sinclair ynghylch anawsterau'r ardal wen, fel y'i gelwir, o gwmpas Wrecsam a rhannau o Sir y Fflint yn rhywbeth yr ydym oll yn ei gydnabod o wybod bod Glannau Mersi ar un ochr yn Lloegr a'r ardal Amcan 1 fawr yng Nghymru. Y broblem yw ceisio gwneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch oherwydd gall pawb weld ffigurau ffiniau'r wardiau. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y Barri. Os edrychwch ar fap y wardiau sydd yn fwyaf dibynnol ar nawdd cymdeithasol, er enghraifft, nid oes yr un o'r wardiau yn y Barri yn y 12 uchaf, ond mae wardiau yng Nghaerdydd a Chasnewydd yn y 12 uchaf yn ddiethriad. Mae rhai o'r ardaloedd eraill yn adrodd am salwch tymor hir, gan gynnwys wardiau ym Mhowys yn yr ardaloedd cyn-ddiwydiannol o gwmpas Ystradgynlais a Chaerdydd a Chasnewydd ond nid yw'r ardaloedd hynny'n cynnwys wardiau yn y Barri a Wrecsam. Weithiau mae hynny'n ganlyniad i'r ffaith bod y wardiau yn fwy, ond gweithiwn o fewn y cyfyngiadau hynny. Y wardiau yw'r blociau adeiladu ac ychydig y gallem ei wneud i geisio newid pethau. Felly, gallech feddwl ei bod yn galed ar wardiau Gibbonsdown, Castleland a Court, ond nid ydynt yn y 12 uchaf o ran amddifadedd, os mesurwch amddifadedd yn ôl dibyniaeth ar nawdd cymdeithasol yn y boblogaeth. Ni ddymunwn ddadlau yn erbyn yr ystadegau; maent yno i bawb eu gweld.

Ni ddymunaf gyflwyno unrhyw nodau dadleuol. Nid yw hon yn rhaglen anferth. Nid yw ond yn £70 miliwn yn nhermau arian Ewropeaidd dros chwe blynedd, nad yw'n

but transitional funding would add another £50 million. If you divide that by six years, it is clear that we are not talking about big sums of money, but that money will be a useful extra in trying to get community regeneration going. Lorraine Barrett is right. When there is a sudden withdrawal of substantial funding, such as from Cardiff Bay, there may be a two or three-year period when it is difficult for capacity building efforts in deprived communities or those with multi-cultural elements. That, in turn, makes it difficult for them to become a part of mainstream Welsh society in a way that they would wish. I hope that we can use what is a modest sum of money creatively and accept that we cannot do so by allocating a few pennies to every ward. The money must be spent in a way that will make a difference, otherwise there is no point having the small sum of money that is in the Objective 2 and transitional programme. If used creatively, I believe that this Assembly will be strongly behind this programme. There has been some unity reflected in the quality of thought that has gone into the programme. There was also unity in the East Wales Partnership area, which is why we have achieved this remarkable degree of support from all four parties in considering the Objective 2 amendments.

fawr iawn, ond byddai arian trosiannol yn ychwanegu £50 miliwn arall. Os rhannwch hynny rhwng chwe blynedd, mae'n amlwg nad ydym yn sôn am symiau mawr o arian, ond bydd yr arian hwnnw'n ychwanegiad defnyddiol wrth geisio rhoi hwb i adfywio cymunedol. Mae Lorraine Barrett yn llygad ei lle. Pan dynnir arian sylweddol yn ôl yn sydyn, fel yn achos Bae Caerdydd, gellir bod cyfnod o ddwy neu dair blynedd pan yw'n anodd i ymdrechion creu gallu mewn cymunedau difreintiedig neu'r rhai ag elfennau amlddiwylliannol. Mae hynny, yn ei dro, yn ei gwneud yn anodd iddynt ddod yn rhan o brif ffrwd y gymdeithas yng Nghymru yn y modd a ddymunent. Gobeithiaf y gallwn ddefnyddio'r hyn, sydd yn swm cymedrol o arian, yn greadigol a derbyn na allwn wneud hynny drwy ddyrannu ychydig o geiniogau i bob ward. Rhaid gwario'r arian mewn modd a fydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth, neu fel arall nid oes diben cael y swm bach o arian sydd yn y rhaglen Amcan 2 a throsiannol. Os defnyddir ef yn greadigol, credaf y bydd y Cynulliad hwn yn gadarn y tu ôl i'r rhaglen hon. Adlewyrchwyd rhyw undod yn ansawdd y meddwl a aeth i'r rhaglen. Yr oedd undod hefyd yn ardal Partneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru, a dyna pam yr ydym wedi sicrhau'r fath gefnogaeth hynod gan bob un o'r pedair plaid wrth ystyried y gwelliannau i Amcan 2.

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 49, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 2: For 49, Abstain 1, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison

Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr aelod canlynol:  
 The following member abstained:

Richards, Rod

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 23.  
 Amendment 3: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 23.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Marek, John  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 4: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 5: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:



The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amendment 6: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun

Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment adopted.*

4:07 p.m.

Amended motion:

*The National Assembly*

*i. notes with approval the draft single programming document for the Objective 2 and transitional programme areas in east Wales, laid in the Table Office on 16 May 2000;*

*ii. regrets the administration's decision to exclude deprived wards in Barry from the Objective 2 area;*

*iii. recognises that the Objective 2 area*

Y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn*

*i. rhoi sêl ei fendith ar y ddogfen raglennu sengl ddrafft ar gyfer ardaloedd Amcan 2 ac ardaloedd y rhaglen drosiannol yn nwyrain Cymru, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mai 2000;*

*ii. gresynu at benderfyniad y weinyddiaeth i eithrio wardiau difreintiedig yn y Barri o ardal Amcan 2;*

*iii. cydnabod bod ardal Amcan 2 yn cynnwys*

*includes those areas of Wales with the highest percentage of non-white residents and emphasises the special responsibility of the Objective 2 programme to ensure the full participation of ethnic minorities in the economic and social life of Wales;*

*iv. expresses concern that the overall programme may—by its own admission—make a negative contribution to certain elements of environmental sustainability and therefore advises the First Secretary to give greater prominence in the amended document to the application of clean technologies, the provision of local renewable energy schemes, improved access to public transport in urban as well as rural areas and a more sustainable strategy for waste disposal;*

*v. instructs the First Secretary to negotiate with the Treasury to secure adequate funding additional to the Barnett block to cover the full ERDF structural fund allocation to Wales in the Objective 2 programme and the necessary public component of match funding; and*

*vi. authorises the First Secretary to arrange for its submission to the European Commission, with such amendments as may strictly be necessary to meet the Commission's technical requirements, as soon as possible;*

*vii. this Assembly further requires the Secretary for Economic Development to bring forward proposals for ensuring synergy between projects undertaken in the Objective 2 area and in other areas of Wales receiving European structural funding, and in particular for ensuring that successful projects in one area can be replicated in other areas.*

*yr ardaloedd hynny o Gymru sydd â'r ganran uchaf o breswylwyr sydd heb fod yn wyn eu croen ac yn pwysleisio bod gan raglen Amcan 2 gyfrifoldeb arbennig i sicrhau bod lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn cymryd rhan lawn ym mywyd economaidd a chymdeithasol Cymru;*

*iv. mynegi pryder y gall y rhaglen gyffredinol—yn ôl ei chyfaddefiad ei hun—wneud cyfraniad negyddol i rai agweddau ar gynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol ac felly y mae'n cynghori'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i roi mwy o sylw yn y ddogfen newydd i gymhwyso technoleg lân, darparu cynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy lleol, gwella mynediad i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus mewn ardaloedd trefol a gwledig a gweithredu strategaeth fwy cynaliadwy ar gyfer gwaredu gwastraff;*

*v. cyfarwyddo'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i negodi â'r Trysorlys i sicrhau bod digon o arian, yn ychwanegol at y bloc Barnett, ar gael fel arian cyfatebol i ddyraniad arian strwythurol llawn y gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd ar gyfer rhaglen Amcan 2 yng Nghymru, ac i'r elfen o'r arian cyfatebol a ddaw o goffrau cyhoeddus; ac*

*vi. yn awdurdodi'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i drefnu ei chyflwyno i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, gan gynnwys unrhyw newidiadau a fydd yn gwbl angenrheidiol er mwyn bodloni gofynion technegol y Comisiwn, a hynny cyn gynted ag y bo modd;*

*vii. mae'r Cynulliad hwn yn gofyn ymhellach i'r Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd gyflwyno cynigion i sicrhau bod prosiectau a roddir ar waith yn ardal Amcan 2 a'r rheini mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru sydd yn derbyn arian strwythurol o Ewrop yn cydategu'i gilydd, ac i sicrhau yn enwedig bod modd i brosiectau llwyddiannus mewn un ardal gael eu dyblygu mewn ardaloedd eraill.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun

Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
 Amended motion adopted.*

### **Rhaglen Weithredol Amcan 3 Objective 3 Operational Programme**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Elin Jones and amendment 6 in the name of Michael German.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Elin Jones a gwelliant 6 yn enw Michael German.

**The First Secretary:** I propose that

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*endorses the East Wales Partnership's proposals for the strategy, priorities and indicative measures for Objective 3 contained in the draft operational*

*yn cymeradwyo cynigion Partneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru ar gyfer y strategaeth, y blaenoriaethau a'r mesurau dangosol ar gyfer Amcan 3 sydd i'w gweld yn nogfen*

*programme document laid in the Table Office on 16 May 2000;*

*ddrafft y rhaglen weithredol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mai 2000;*

*adopts the draft operational programme document and requests the First Secretary, consulting as necessary with other political parties, to finalise the text in discussion with the European Commission and ensure a favourable Commission decision as soon as possible; and*

*yn mabwysiadu dogfen ddrafft y rhaglen weithredol ac yn gofyn i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd, gan ymgynghori fel y bo angen â'r pleidiau gwleidyddol eraill, lunio fersiwn terfynol gan drafod â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a sicrhau penderfyniad ffafriol gan y Comisiwn cyn gynted ag y bo modd; ac*

*invites the First Secretary to agree the necessary arrangements with the partnership so that the launch of the Objective 3 programme can take place before the end of July 2000.*

*yn gwahodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd i gytuno ar y trefniadau angenrheidiol gyda'r bartneriaeth fel y bo modd lansio rhaglen Amcan 3 cyn diwedd mis Gorffennaf 2000*

I hope that there will be an even greater level of unity over Objective 3 than Objective 2 because in this case there are no excluded areas. Objective 3 funding is intended to be spent in the areas that are not eligible for Objective 1 funding regardless of whether or not they are also eligible for Objective 2 funding. Objective 3 is not a huge programme with £81 million to be spent in Wales over seven years, which does not include what we might be able to spend in terms of match funding and anticipated contributions from the private sector. Overall, we would expect the fund to provide £200 million of additional expenditure over the seven years, which is around £30 million every year. That could be a significant investment to develop the skills of people in east Wales with particular emphasis on helping those who are out of work back into employment and on supporting the development of new businesses and helping existing ones to become more competitive.

Gobeithiaf y bydd mwy fyth o undod ynghylch Amcan 3 nag Amcan 2 oherwydd yn yr achos hwn nid oes ardaloedd a eithriwyd. Bwriedir i arian Amcan 3 gael ei wario yn yr ardaloedd nad ydynt yn gymwys i dderbyn arian Amcan 1, boed y rheini'n gymwys i dderbyn arian Amcan 2 ai peidio. Nid yw Amcan 3 yn rhaglen anferth gyda £81 miliwn i'w wario yng Nghymru dros saith mlynedd, a hynny heb gynnwys yr hyn y gallem ei wario o ran arian cyfatebol a'r cyfraniadau a ddisgwylir oddi wrth y sector preifat. At ei gilydd, byddem yn disgwyl i'r gronfa ddarparu £200 miliwn o wariant ychwanegol dros y saith mlynedd, sef tua £30 miliwn bob blwyddyn. Gallai hynny fod yn fuddsoddiad sylweddol i ddatblygu medrau pobl yn nwyrain Cymru gyda phwyslais arbennig ar helpu'r rhai sydd heb waith i gael swydd ac ar gefnogi datblygiad busnesau newydd a helpu'r rhai sydd yn bod eisoes i ddod yn fwy cystadleuol.

That gives the lie to David Melding's or Alun Cairns's comment that Barry will get nothing. That is not the case because Barry will be covered by Objective 3. It does not pay any of us to wind up our local areas by implying that they are left out totally when they are not because they will receive either transitional funding from Objective 2 or funding from Objective 3. Thirty million pounds a year including match funding and private sector contributions to the Objective 3 programme will be available for a range of special training programmes, which will help to build social inclusion and help those who are currently out of work back into employment. As I said earlier, they will also

Mae hynny'n gwrthbrofi sylw David Melding neu Alun Cairns na fydd y Barri'n cael dim. Nid yw hynny'n wir oherwydd bydd y Barri wedi ei gynnwys gan Amcan 3. Ni thycia i'r un ohonom gynhyrfu'n hardaloedd lleol drwy awgrymu eu bod wedi eu heithrio'n llwyr pan nad ydynt oherwydd byddant yn derbyn un ai arian trosiannol o Amcan 2 neu arian o Amcan 3. Bydd £30 miliwn y flwyddyn gan gynnwys arian cyfatebol a chyfraniadau'r sector preifat at raglen Amcan 3 ar gael i amrediad o raglenni hyfforddi arbennig, a fydd yn helpu i gynyddu cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a helpu'r rhai sydd heb waith ar hyn o bryd i gael swydd. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, byddant hefyd yn cefnogi

support the development of new businesses and help existing ones to become more competitive.

Why is east Wales an Objective 3 area? Although east Wales has a record, by Welsh standards, of reasonably healthy economic performance—otherwise it would be eligible for Objective 1—problems inevitably remain in pockets of high, long-term unemployment. There are deprived communities in east Wales and islands of deprivation in what are otherwise prosperous areas by Welsh standards. Levels of economic activity are higher than in the Welsh average but remain low relative to the UK particularly among women and middle-aged men. Objective 3, therefore, addresses those problems. What do you do to raise activity rates for women and middle-aged men? Many people have low levels of basic skills and overall levels of vocational skills, well below the UK average.

Many people have low levels of basic skills The region also has—comparatively by UK standards—lower levels of self-employment and business start up. Business is characterised by low levels of innovation and the use of ICT and there is inequality in the labour market. The Objective 3 programme has been designed to address those problems by developing a more competitive economy, including a higher proportion of knowledge based businesses, and provide people who are currently unable to participate in the labour market with the skills to fulfil their potential.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Plaid Cymru welcomes the emphasis in the document on promoting social inclusion and equality. However, we have an ongoing concern about the mechanisms to monitor this and to turn it into reality. You will be aware that I raised some concerns about equality in the previous European programmes: all the fine words were there but it was impossible to monitor. How confident is the First Secretary that we will be able to ensure that schemes are adequately monitored and that those who apply get proper advice about the kind of equality and input into their schemes that we would expect? That is not only relevant in the

datblygiad busnesau newydd ac yn helpu'r rhai sydd yn bod eisoes i ddod yn fwy cystadleuol.

Pam y mae dwyrain Cymru'n ardal Amcan 3? Er bod gan ddwyrain Cymru, yn ôl safonau Cymru, hanes o berfformiad economaidd cymharol iach—fel arall byddai'n gymwys ar gyfer Amcan 1—mae'n anochel bod problemau'n aros mewn mannau lle y ceir diweithdra tymor hir, uchel. Mae cymunedau difreintiedig yn nwyrain Cymru ac ynnysoedd o amddifadedd mewn ardaloedd sydd fel arall yn ffyniannus yn ôl safonau Cymru. Mae'r lefelau o weithgaredd economaidd yn uwch na'r cyfartaledd Cymreig ond yn parhau'n isel o'u cymharu â'r DU, yn enwedig ymysg benywod a dynion canol oed. Mae Amcan 3, felly, yn ymdrin â'r problemau hynny. Beth a wnewch i godi cyfraddau gweithgaredd ymysg benywod a dynion canol oed? Mae gan lawer o bobl lefelau isel o fedrau sylfaenol a lefelau cyffredinol o fedrau galwedigaethol, ymhell islaw cyfartaledd y DU.

Mae gan lawer o bobl lefelau isel o fedrau sylfaenol. Mae gan y rhanbarth hefyd—o'u cymharu â safonau'r DU—lefelau is o hunangyflogaeth ac o ddechrau busnesau. Nodweddur busnes gan lefelau isel o arloesi ac o ddefnydd o dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu ac mae anghydraddoldeb yn y farchnad lafur. Dyfeisiwyd rhaglen Amcan 3 er mwyn ymdrin â'r problemau hynny drwy ddatblygu economi mwy cystadleuol, gan gynnwys cyfran uwch o fusnesau sydd yn seiliedig ar wybodaeth, ac er mwyn darparu'r medrau i'r rhai na allant gymryd rhan yn y farchnad lafur ar hyn o bryd fel y gallant gyflawni eu potensial.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae Plaid Cymru yn croesawu'r pwyslais yn y ddogfen ar hybu cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a chydaddoldeb. Fodd bynnag, pryderwn o hyd ynghylch y dulliau i fonitro hyn a'i droi'n ffaith. Byddwch yn ymwybodol imi godi rhai pryderon ynghylch cydraddoldeb yn y rhaglenni Ewropeaidd blaenorol: yr oedd yr holl eiriau teg yno ond yr oedd yn amhosibl ei fonitro. Pa mor ffyddiog y mae'r Prif Ysgrifennydd y byddwn yn gallu sicrhau y caiff cynlluniau eu monitro'n ddigonol ac y bydd y rhai sydd yn ymgeisio'n cael cyngor priodol ynghylch y math o gydraddoldeb a mewnbyn i'w cynlluniau a ddisgwyliem?

context of Objective 3 but it has implications for all structural funds.

**The First Secretary:** I am grateful that Helen Mary Jones has raised that issue because gender equality is one of the five key priorities. Although it is fifth on the list it is not regarded as the fifth in importance. It is merely accidental that the first on the list is active labour market policies to help unemployed people back to work; second is social inclusion focusing on disabled people and ethnic minorities; third is lifelong learning; fourth is adaptability and entrepreneurship to assist businesses to become more competitive; and fifth is gender equality to ensure equal access to learning and employment opportunities and to address gender segregation in the labour market. Gender segregation is still a dominant characteristic of the Welsh labour market. We have come a long way in the past 30 years from the Welsh labour market dependency on traditional male occupations such as mining, steel works and slate quarrying. However, we have a long way to go. I assure Helen Mary Jones that it will be regarded as a failure if gender equality is not established as a part of the programme. An obvious example—although it is not necessarily one that would be addressed under Objective 3—is the small proportion of modern apprenticeships taken up by women. That kind of gender segregation still exists, deep in the psychology of the Welsh population and the Welsh labour market.

We are close to agreement with the European Commission. Objective 3 is ahead of Objective 2 and is slightly behind Objective 1. We have nearly reached agreement on the final text. Subject to the Assembly's endorsement of the proposals this afternoon, we expect to have a formal decision approving the programme by the end of June. The themes that support the five key priorities will ensure that activities under the programme support equal opportunities, sustainable development, and the information society. The programme sets out challenging targets for people, communities, and businesses in east Wales that are consistent with the draft economic development strategy

Mae hynny'n berthnasol nid yn unig yng nghyd-destun Amcan 3 ond mae iddo oblygiadau i bob cronfa strwythurol.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod Helen Mary Jones wedi codi'r mater hwnnw oherwydd mae cydraddoldeb y rhywiau'n un o'r pum blaenoriaeth allweddol. Er ei fod yn bumed ar y rhestr nis ystyrir yn bumed o ran pwysigrwydd. Damweiniol yn unig yw mai'r cyntaf ar y rhestr yw polisiau marchnad lafur egniol i helpu pobl ddi-waith i gael swydd; mai'r ail yw cynhwysiant cymdeithasol gan ganolbwyntio ar bobl anabl a lleiafrifoedd ethnig; mai'r trydydd yw dysgu gydol oes; mai'r pedwerydd yw addasadwyedd a mentergarwch i gynorthwyo busnesau i ddod yn fwy cystadleuol; ac mai'r pumed yw cydraddoldeb y rhywiau er mwyn sicrhau mynediad cyfartal i gyfleoedd dysgu a gwaith ac ymdrin â gwahanu rhwng y rhywiau yn y farchnad lafur. Mae gwahanu rhwng y rhywiau yn nodwedd drechol yn y farchnad lafur Gymreig o hyd. Daethom yn bell yn y 30 mlynedd diwethaf o ddibyniaeth y farchnad lafur yng Nghymru ar alwedigaethau gwrywaidd traddodiaol fel cloddio am lo, y gweithfeydd dur a'r chwarielli llechi. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym ffordd bell o'n blaen. Rhoddaf sicrwydd i Helen Mary Jones y'i hystyrir yn fethiant os na sefydlir cydraddoldeb y rhywiau yn rhan o'r rhaglen. Enghraifft amlwg—er nad yw'n un a gâi sylw o reidrwydd o dan Amcan 3—yw'r gyfran fach o brentisiaethau modern yr ymgymeryd â hwy gan fenywod. Mae'r math hwnnw o wahanu rhwng y rhywiau'n bod o hyd, yn ddwfn yn seicoleg pobl Cymru a'r farchnad lafur Gymreig.

Yr ydym yn agos at gytundeb â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Mae Amcan 3 ar y blaen i Amcan 2 ac ychydig y tu ôl i Amcan 1. Yr ydym bron â chael cytundeb ar y fersiwn terfynol. Ar yr amod y bydd y Cynulliad yn cadarnhau'r cynigion y prynhawn yma, disgwyliwn gael penderfyniad ffurfiol yn cymeradwyo'r rhaglen erbyn diwedd Mehefin. Bydd y themâu sydd yn ategu'r pum blaenoriaeth allweddol yn sicrhau y bydd y gweithgareddau o dan y rhaglen yn cefnogi cyfle cyfartal, datblygu cynaliadwy, a'r gymdeithas wybodaeth. Mae'r rhaglen yn cyflwyno targedau ymestynnol ar gyfer pobl, cymunedau a busnesau yn nwyrain Cymru sydd yn gyson â strategaeth datblygu

of the Assembly and will support the achievements of our national educational and training targets. Some of our young people are disaffected and this manifests itself in unacceptable levels of truancy and school exclusions in parts of east Wales, particularly in deprived areas of Cardiff and Newport. The European Commission has agreed that we can use Objective 3 funding to support initiatives aimed at addressing the needs of these young people in certain circumstances even down to the age of 11.

Raising basic skill levels is an important challenge because without them you cannot compete effectively in today's labour market. Therefore, the Objective 3 programme will focus on this and raising skill levels among low paid, low skilled workers and people without jobs. As part of this, we want to ensure wider access to ICT skills training. Businesses need to become more competitive. The programme will help to raise the skills of the workforce, including a higher skills level in technology and innovation. About a quarter of the total resources available will be used to help businesses and their employees. The programme will also support modernisation of work organisation. There is an important challenge for the social partners to work together to put forward creative and innovative proposals.

4:17 p.m.

The programme will complement the strategy in the entrepreneurship action plan for the development of new and existing businesses and strengthening the range and quality of support services. We must work towards greater equality in the labour market, and that is why there are challenging targets for improving the position of women and addressing the barriers to learning and employment faced by many groups, including those with disabilities, older workers and people from ethnic minority communities.

We all recognise the importance of developing Wales as a learning country. That is not simply an image or a snappy catchphrase. It must penetrate through to people throughout Wales, regardless of a previous absence of access to education.

economiaidd ddrafft y Cynulliad ac a fydd yn gymorth i gyflawni ein targedau cenedlaethol mewn addysg a hyfforddiant. Mae rhai o'n pobl ifanc wedi eu dieithrio a gwelir hyn mewn lefelau annerbyniol o driwantiaeth a gwaharddiadau o ysgolion yn nwyrain Cymru, yn enwedig yn ardaloedd difreintiedig Caerdydd a Chasnewydd. Mae'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd wedi cytuno y gallwn ddefnyddio arian Amcan 3 i gynnal mentrau sydd yn ceisio ymdrin ag anghenion y bobl ifanc hyn mewn rhai amgylchiadau hyd yn oed cyn ised ag 11 oed.

Mae codi lefelau medrau sylfaenol yn her bwysig oherwydd hebddynt ni allwch gystadlu'n effeithiol yn y farchnad lafur gyfoes. Felly, bydd rhaglen Amcan 3 yn canolbwyntio ar hyn ac ar godi lefelau medrau ymysg gweithwyr sydd â thâl a medrau isel a rhai sydd heb swyddi. Fel rhan o hynny, dymunwn sicrhau mynediad ehangach i hyfforddiant mewn medrau technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Mae angen i fusnesau ddod yn fwy cystadleuol. Bydd y rhaglen yn helpu i hybu medrau'r gweithlu, gan gynnwys lefel medrau uwch mewn technoleg ac arloesi. Defnyddir tua chwarter o'r holl adnoddau sydd ar gael i helpu busnesau a'u gweithwyr. Bydd y rhaglen hefyd yn cynorthwyo moderneiddio trefniadaeth gwaith. Mae her bwysig hefyd i'r partneriaid cymdeithasol weithio gyda'i gilydd i gyflwyno cynigion creadigol ac arloesol.

Bydd y rhaglen yn cyflenwi'r strategaeth yn y cynllun gweithredu mentergarwch ar gyfer datblygu busnesau newydd a rhai sydd yn bod eisoes a chryfhau amrediad ac ansawdd y gwasanaethau cefnogi. Rhaid inni ymdrechu i gael mwy o gydraddoldeb yn y farchnad lafur, a dyna pam y mae heriau ymestynnol i wella safle benywod ac ymdrin â'r rhwystrau rhag dysgu a chyflogaeth a wynebier gan lawer o grwpiau, gan gynnwys rhai ag anableddau, gweithwyr hŷn a phobl o gymunedau lleiafrifoedd ethnig.

Yr ydym oll yn cydnabod mor bwysig yw datblygu Cymru'n wlad sydd yn dysgu. Nid delwedd neu ddywediad bachog yn unig yw hynny. Rhaid iddo gyrraedd pobl ledled Cymru, beth bynnag am ddiffyg mynediad blaenorol i addysg. Rhaid i bobl gredu y



People must believe that they can be part of the learning country philosophy. I was pleased to be present at an award ceremony for adult learners earlier this week when prizes were awarded to some remarkable people from a background where you would not have expected them to be able to come through via adult education. If we could get hundreds, if not thousands, of people to adopt the philosophy that was shown by the dozen or so people who received prizes in the City Hall from the National Institute for Adult and Continuing Education (Cymru) earlier this week, we would be making Wales a learning country and we could lead Europe in that field.

**Christine Chapman:** Do you agree that, rather than re-inventing the wheel, we must start to look at some of the positive role models that we already have and build on success. You mentioned entrepreneurialism, and I wanted to remind you of the Wales Fast Growth 50 initiative, Chwarae Teg and Menter a Busnes. We must look to build on the good, innovative ideas that we have and develop more of them.

**The First Secretary:** There is a base there and I would never say that Wales is a country without entrepreneurs. At a dinner last night with the forum of the Federation of the Electronic Industry at the Celtic Manor, the people with the funds—the bankers and the venture capitalists—were meeting the people who had the ideas but not the funds. This was an attempt to provide a marketplace for people with degrees, PhDs and so on to meet the bankers who may have £5 million or £10 million to invest in high technology businesses. However, this also applies to entrepreneurship without the glamour of involving people who invent electronic commerce and the latest technology. It can involve window cleaners and people opening their own shops as well as those who may be developing a large business idea in silicone valley style. We need all of that and we need it to develop quickly in east Wales if we are to achieve critical mass in terms of having more home-grown industries. We would then be less dependent on being able to attract inward investment in an increasingly competitive market.

The Objective 3 monitoring committee will be appointed soon under the chairmanship of

gallant fod yn rhan o athroniaeth y wlad sydd yn dysgu. Yr oeddwn yn falch o fod yn bresennol mewn seremoni gwobrwyo i ddysgwyr mewn oed yn gynharach yr wythnos hon pan gyflwynwyd gwobrau i rai pobl ryfeddol o gefndir lle na fuasech wedi disgwyl iddynt allu dod drwodd drwy addysg oedolion. Os gallem gael cannoedd, os nad miloedd, o bobl i fabwysiadu'r athroniaeth a amlygwyd gan y dwsin fwy neu lai o bobl a dderbyniodd wobrau yn Neuadd y Ddinas gan y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Addysg Barhaus Oedolion (Cymru) yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, byddem yn gwneud Cymru'n wlad sydd yn dysgu a gallem arwain Ewrop yn y maes hwnnw.

**Christine Chapman:** A gytunwch, yn hytrach nag ailddyfeisio'r olwyn, fod yn rhaid inni ddechrau edrych ar rai o'r modelau rôl sydd gennym eisoes ac adeiladu ar lwyddiant. Soniasoch am fentergarwch, ac yr oeddwn am eich atgoffa am y fenter Wales Fast Growth 50, Chwarae Teg a Menter a Busnes. Rhaid inni geisio adeiladu ar y syniadau da, arloesol a gawsom a datblygu mwy ohonynt.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae sylfaen yno ac ni ddywedwn fyth fod Cymru'n wlad heb fentrwyr. Mewn cinio neithiwr gyda fforwm Ffederasiwn y Diwydiant Electronig yn y Celtic Manor, yr oedd y bobl â'r arian—y bancwyr a'r cyfalafwyr menter—yn cyfarfod â'r bobl â'r syniadau ond nid yr arian. Yr oedd hyn yn ymgais i ddarparu marchnadfa i rai â graddau, doethuriaethau ac yn y blaen gyfarfod â'r bancwyr a allai fod â £5 miliwn neu £10 miliwn i'w fuddsoddi mewn busnesau uwchdechnoleg. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn berthnasol hefyd i fentergarwch heb swyn y cysylltiad â phobl sydd yn dyfeisio masnach electronig a'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf. Gall gynnwys glanhawyr ffenestri a'r rheini sydd yn agor eu siopau eu hunain yn ogystal â phobl a allai fod yn datblygu syniad busnes mawr yn null dyffryn silicôn. Mae arnom angen hynny i gyd ac mae arnom angen iddo ddatblygu'n gyflym yn nwyrain Cymru os ydym i gyrraedd màs critigol o ran cael mwy o ddiwydiannau cynhenid. Byddem yn llai dibynnol wedyn ar allu denu mewnfuddsoddi mewn marchnad fwyfwy cystadleuol.

Penodir pwyllgor monitro Amcan 3 cyn hir o dan gadeiryddiaeth Mike German. Siaradaf ar

Mike German. I speak on Mike's behalf in saying that it will be getting down to work straight away. I wish Mike and his fellow committee members every success in ensuring that the Objective 3 programme is a great success. Although modest, it will play a key part in the revitalisation of Wales.

I wish to amend a comment with which I may have inadvertently misled the Assembly, regarding the date on which we received the submission from BAE Systems. It was two Mondays ago, rather than one Monday ago. I had forgotten that I was in Lyon last week. I thought that I should take an early opportunity to put that right.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Rhodri. That will be placed on record.

**Elin Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 1. Yng nghymal i, llinell 1 ar ôl 'cymeradwyo' rhodder 'er gyda pheth amheumon'.

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ar ddiwedd cymal ii, dileer 'a' ac ar ddiwedd cymal iii dileer y collnod llawn ac ychwaneger '; a'.

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Yng nghymal iii, dileer 'gwahodd y' a rhodder 'awdurdodi'r' yn ei le.

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwaneger y cymal canlynol:

*iv. nodi ei bod yn hanfodol o safbwynt adfywiad economaidd, cymdeithasol a diwylliannol ein bod yn cadw pobl ifanc cymwys a chreffftus o fewn gweithlu Cymru ac yn penderfynu y dylai hyn fod yn ddangosydd allweddol i asesu llwyddiant y rhaglen, a hefyd rhaglen Amcan 1.*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwaneger y cymal canlynol:

*v. cyfarwyddo'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i negodi â'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth a'r Trysorlys i sicrhau bod y cyfrifoldeb llawn am arian y gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd yn cael ei drosglwyddo o'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a bod digon o arian, yn ychwanegol at y bloc Barnett, ar gael fel arian cyfatebol i'r dyraniad o'r gronfa gymdeithasol*

ran Mike wrth ddweud y bydd yn mynd at ei waith yn syth. Dymunaf bob llwyddiant i Mike a'i gyd-aelodau pwyllgor wrth sicrhau bod rhaglen Amcan 3 yn llwyddiant mawr. Er ei bod yn gymharol fach, bydd yn chwarae rhan allweddol yn adfywiad Cymru.

Dymunaf newid sylw y gallwn fod wedi camarwain y Cynulliad ag ef drwy amryfusedd, ynghylch y dyddiad pan dderbyniasom y cyflwyniad gan BAE Systems. Yr oedd yn ddau ddydd Llun yn ôl, yn hytrach nag un dydd Llun yn ôl. Anghofiaswn fy mod yn Lyon yr wythnos diwethaf. Credais y dylwn achub ar gyfle buan i gywiro hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch, Rhodri. Cofnodir hynny.

**Elin Jones:** I propose amendment 1. In clause i, line 1 after 'endorses' insert 'with reservations'.

I propose amendment 2. At the end of clause ii delete 'and' and at the end of clause iii delete the full stop and insert '; and'.

I propose amendment 3. In clause iii, delete 'invites' and replace with 'authorises'.

I propose amendment 4. Add the following clause:

*iv. notes that the retention of qualified and skilled young people within the Welsh workforce is essential for economic, social and cultural regeneration and resolves that the extent to which this is achieved should be a key indicator of the success of the programme, and also the Objective 1 programme.*

I propose amendment 5. Add the following clause:

*v. instructs the First Secretary to negotiate with the DfEE and the Treasury to ensure the transfer of full responsibility for the ESF funds from DfEE to the National Assembly for Wales and adequate funding additional to the Barnett block to cover the ESF allocation for projects in Wales and the necessary public component of match funding.*

*Ewropeaidd i Gymru ac i'r elfen o'r arian cyfatebol a ddaw o goffrau cyhoeddus.*

Dechreuaf drwy drafod rôl y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 yn y broses o lunio'r ddogfen Amcan 3. Mae cynnwys y ddogfen yn gwbl berthnasol i drafodaethau'r Pwyllgor dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, gan gynnwys trafodaethau ar y cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant, y Fargen Newydd a dysgu gydol oes. Mae'n gwbl annigonol mai dim ond un drafodaeth fer a gafwyd yn y Pwyllgor ar Amcan 3, a hynny'n gynnar ym mywyd Amcan 3. Wedi'r cwbl, nid y ffaith mai o gronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd y daw cyllid Amcan 3 yw'r ffactor pwysicaf i sicrhau ei lwyddiant ond, yn hytrach, yr angen i weithredu Amcan 3 yn effeithiol. Nid gwahanu rheolaeth Amcan 3 o brif ffrwd addysg a hyfforddiant y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 yw'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o sicrhau llwyddiant Amcan 3. Mae hyn, o bosibl, yn wir hefyd am agweddau adnoddau dynol o fewn Amcan 1.

I will begin by discussing the Post-16 Education and Training Committee's role in the process of drawing up the Objective 3 document. The document's contents is entirely relevant to the Committee's discussions over the last year, including discussions on the education and training action plan, the New Deal and lifelong learning. It is completely insufficient that we only had one short discussion on Objective 3 in the Committee, and that was early in the days of Objective 3. After all, the fact that Objective 3 funding comes from European structural funds is not the most important factor to ensure its success but, rather, the need to operate Objective 3 effectively. Dividing the management of Objective 3 from the mainstream of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee is not the most effective way of ensuring the success of Objective 3. That may also be true about aspects of human resources within Objective 1.

Byddwn yn falch o glywed ymateb y Prif Ysgrifennydd i'r pwyntiau hyn—yn benodol y posibilrwydd o drosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb Amcan 3 i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16. Un ymateb y gallai'r Prif Ysgrifennydd ei ystyried yw dilyn model Yr Alban ac uno'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 mewn unrhyw ail-strwythuro pwyllgorau a ddigwydd yn ystod y misoedd nesaf.

I would be glad to hear the First Secretary's response to these points—specifically the possibility of transferring the responsibility for Objective 3 to the Post-16 Education and Training Committee. One response that the First Secretary could consider is to follow Scotland's model and unite the Economic Development Committee and the Post-16 Education and Training Committee in any restructuring of committees that might happen during the next few months.

Dywedodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn ei gyflwyniad iddo benodi Mike German yn gadeirydd pwyllgor monitro Amcan 3 fel cynrhychiolydd o'r blaidd leiaf yn y Cynulliad. Ar ba sail y penodwyd Mike German i'r swydd hon, ac a roddodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd unrhyw ystyriaeth i gydbwysedd rhyw ymysg cadeiryddion pwyllgorau monitro cronfeydd strwythurol? Fe'i atgoffaf o'i ymateb i ymyriad Helen Mary pan ddywedodd fod '*gender equality*' yn '*top priority*'. Sut, felly, y bwriada'r Prif Ysgrifennydd benderfynu ar gadeirydd pwyllgor monitro Amcan 2?

The First Secretary said in his introduction that he appointed Mike German as chair of the Objective 3 monitoring committee as a representative of the smallest party in the Assembly. On what basis was Mike German appointed to this post and did the First Secretary give any consideration to gender balance among the chairs of structural funds monitoring committees? I remind him of his response to Helen Mary's intervention when he said that gender equality was a top priority. How, therefore, does the First Secretary intend to decide on the chair of the Objective 2 monitoring committee?

O'r gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd y daw holl arian Amcan 3 yn ogystal â thraean arian Amcan 1. Un o'r cwestiynau cyntaf a holais

All Objective 3 money comes from the European social fund as does a third of Objective 1 money. One of the first questions

yn y Siambr hon fis Gorffennaf diwethaf oedd cwestiwn i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd ar y pryd ynglŷn â throsglwyddo cyfrifoldeb llawn am y gronfa gymdeithasol o'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn Llundain i'r Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn siomedig na soniodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd am hyn ac am ei bwysigrwydd yn ei gyflwyniad i Amcan 3 heddiw. Mae'n rhaid i'r trosglwyddiad hwn gael ei gwblhau cyn dechrau gweithredu Amcan 1 a 3 yn ein barn ni. Heb hyn, wynebwn broblemau enfawr wrth geisio gweithredu'r rhaglenni hynny.

Ar hyn o bryd, deallaf mai un swyddog yn unig sydd yn gweithio o fewn yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth gyda chyfrifoldeb am y gronfa gymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Un swyddog a fydd yn gyfrifol am tua £450 miliwn o grantiau y gronfa gymdeithasol dros y chwe blynedd nesaf. Un swyddog i gadarnhau a thalu pob grant. Bydd yn amhosibl cynnal hyn yn y dyfodol. Mae'r system yn siŵr o dagu a bydd trafferthion gweithredu sylweddol i raglenni Amcan 1 a 3.

Yr ateb a dderbyniais i'm cwestiwn ym mis Gorffennaf y llynedd oddi wrth y Prif Ysgrifennydd ar y pryd oedd bod y trafodaethau ar y trosglwyddiad o'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth i'r Cynulliad yn parhau. Hyd y gwn i, bu trafodaethau ar y mater hwn ers o leiaf dair blynedd. Mae'n gwbl annerbyniol, a ninnau ar fin cychwyn cyfnod newydd o gronfeydd strwythurol, y cyfnod pwysicaf o gronfeydd strwythurol yng Nghymru, na chwblhawyd y trafodaethau hyn.

**The Finance Secretary (Edwina Hart):** Does Elin accept that the most important issue arising in our negotiations and discussions with DfEE is that we have the correct transfer value in terms of our responsibility?

**Elin Jones:** Cydnabyddaf fod angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn cael yr adnoddau wedi eu trosglwyddo gyda'r cyfrifoldeb i'r Cynulliad, ond methaf â deall pam ei bod yn cymryd tair blynedd i'r math hwn o drafodaethau gael ei gwblhau. Byddwn wedi gobeithio y gellid bod wedi cael cyhoeddiad ar hyn heddiw.

Yn fy ngwelliant 1, yr amheuan y cyfeiriwn atynt yw'r perygl i weithredu Amcan 3 yn

that I asked in this Chamber last July was a question to the then First Secretary about transferring full responsibility for ESF from the Department for Education and Employment in London to the Assembly. I am disappointed that the First Secretary has not referred to this and its importance in his introduction to Objective 3 today. This transfer must be completed before we start operating Objectives 1 and 3 in our opinion. Without this, we face serious problems in attempting to operate these programmes.

At present, I understand that only one official working within DfEE has responsibility for ESF in Wales. One official will be responsible for about £450 million of ESF grants over the next six years. One official to approve and pay all grants. It will be impossible to maintain this in future. The system is bound to clog up and there will be substantial operational difficulties for Objectives 1 and 3 programmes.

The answer that I received to my question in July last year from the then First Secretary was that the discussions regarding the transfer from DfEE to the Assembly were ongoing. As far as I know, there have been discussions on this matter for at least three years. It is completely unacceptable, as we are about to start a new period of structural funds, the most important period of structural funds for Wales, that these discussions have not been completed.

**Yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** A yw Elin yn derbyn mai'r mater pwysicaf sydd yn codi yn ein negodiadau a'n trafodaethau â'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth yw bod y gwerth trosglwyddo cywir gennym o ran ein cyfrifoldeb?

**Elin Jones:** I recognise that we need to ensure that we have the resources transferred with the responsibility to the Assembly, but I cannot understand why it takes three years for this type of discussions to be completed. I would have hoped that we could have had to have a statement on this today.

In my amendment 1, the reservation to which we refer is the danger to operating Objective

effeithiol oherwydd bod yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn parhau i reoli'r gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd. Pe baem yn cael cyhoeddiad y caiff honno ei throsglwyddo i'r Cynulliad, byddwn yn tynnu'r gwelliant yn ôl. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliant yn enw Mike German.

4:27 p.m.

Croesawn egwyddorion a blaenoriaethau'r ddogfen Amcan 3 ar y cyfan. Fodd bynnag, mae'n cyfeirio'n barhaus at ddefnyddio arian Amcan 3 i ychwanegu at raglenni presennol y Llywodraeth yn y sector addysg a hyfforddiant. Mae'r mwyafrif o'r rhaglenni hynny yn cael eu cynllunio a'u rhedeg ar draws y Deyrnas Gyfunol, megis y Fargen Newydd, Ceiswyr Sgiliau, y Brifysgol i Ddiwydiant ac ati. Mae'r ddogfen yn nodi'r rhaglenni.

Nid yw rhai o'r cynlluniau hynny, fel y Fargen Newydd, wedi ein darbwyllo eu bod yn effeithiol wrth fynd i'r afael â phroblemau megis darparu cyfleon sgiliau a gwaith i'r di-waith tymor hir, yn enwedig rhai o leiafrifoedd ethnig. Nid yw cynlluniau eraill, fel y Brifysgol i Ddiwydiant, wedi eu gwreiddio yng Nghymru. Mae'n bosibl eu bod yn torri ar draws elfennau o'r ailstrwythuro sydd yn digwydd mewn addysg a hyfforddiant yn sgîl trafodaethau'r Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Hoffwn gael sicrwydd gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd y bydd prif ffrwd gwaith Amcan 3 yn deillio o gynlluniau sydd yn tarddu o gymunedau dwyrain Cymru ac yn cwrdd ag anghenion y cymunedau hynny. Fodd bynnag, derbynïaf fod angen cydlynu'r holl raglenni sgiliau a hyfforddi, beth bynnag fo'r ffynhonnell ariannol.

Mae'n ddogfen Amcan 3 yn dangos bod siaradwyr Cymraeg yn cael eu tangynrychioli ymysg rhai sydd yn sefydlu busnesau. Mae'n bwysig, felly, fod Amcan 3 yn sicrhau bod adnoddau yn cael eu targedu tuag at gyrsiau sydd yn hybu mentergarwch ymysg siaradwyr Cymraeg. Cyfeiriodd Christine Chapman at waith da Menter a Busnes yn y maes hwn. Mae'n bwysig inni adeiladu ar y gwaith hwnnw o fewn Amcan 3 ac Amcan 1.

I gloi, edrychaf ymlaen at ymateb y Prif Ysgrifennydd i rai o'r pwyntiau yr wyf wedi eu codi.

3 effectively because the Department for Education and Employment continues to manage the European social fund. If we were given a statement that that will be transferred to the Assembly, I would withdraw the amendment. We will support the amendment in Mike German's name.

We welcome the Objective 3 document's principles and priorities on the whole. However, it refers continuously to using Objective 3 money to add to the Government's present programmes in the education and training sector. The majority of those programmes are planned and run across the United Kingdom, such as the New Deal, Skill Seekers, University for Industry and so on. The document notes the programmes.

Some of those schemes, such as the New Deal, have not convinced us that they are effective in dealing with problems such as providing skill and work opportunities to the long-term unemployed, especially those from ethnic minorities. Other schemes, such as the University for Industry, have not been rooted in Wales. It is possible that they cut across elements of the restructuring of education and training as a result of the Education and Training Action Group's discussions. I would like to receive an assurance from the First Secretary that the main work of Objective 3 will arise from schemes that come from the communities of east Wales and meet the needs of those communities. However, I accept that all skills and training programmes must be co-ordinated, whatever the source of funding.

The Objective 3 document shows that Welsh speakers are under-represented among those who establish businesses. Therefore, it is important that Objective 3 ensures that resources are targeted towards courses that promote entrepreneurship among Welsh speakers. Christine Chapman referred to Menter a Busnes's good work in this field. It is important that we build upon that work within Objectives 3 and 1.

In closing, I look forward to the First Secretary's response to some of the points that I have raised.

**Michael German:** I propose amendment 6. Add fourth and fifth clauses:

*iv. requires the Assembly Secretary for Economic Development to bring forward proposals for ensuring synergy between projects undertaken in the Objective 3 area and in other areas of Wales receiving European structural funding, and in particular for ensuring that successful projects in one area can be replicated in other areas.*

*v. urges that all possible efforts be made to publicise this programme in the Objective 3 area, and that particular efforts be made to encourage involvement from groups and organisations which have not previously participated in European-funded programmes.*

I welcome the amendments in Elin's name. This programme will touch one person in three in Wales. Therefore, it is a significant programme even if the money is not as much as Objective 1. Its main focus is human resources. We must find a series of Welsh solutions, particularly the extension of the work that has been done by the Digital College in Wales, which can lead to an extensively expanded open learning programme that will help us all.

The other part of the project that is often missed is the tailor-made programmes for companies. Wales has been notoriously bad at that. I hope that this programme will make a substantive effort in ensuring that we deliver the right training to companies when and how they want it.

More than anything else, my amendment looks at the process of joined-up thinking. I think that that was behind Elin's comments. Whatever happens in Objective 3, as in Objectives 2 and 1, we must ensure that these activities are embedded in the Assembly's national economic development strategy and priorities. That is why an over-arching view is important. I hope that we will be able to do that in the forthcoming programme.

On transferring the management of the ESF from the DfEE to Wales, I agree with

**Michael German:** Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwaneger pedwerydd a phumed cymal:

*iv. gofyn i'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad dros Ddatblygu Economaidd gyflwyno cynigion i sicrhau bod prosiectau a roddir ar waith yn ardal Amcan 3 a'r rheini mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru sydd yn derbyn arian strwythurol o Ewrop yn cydategu'i gilydd, ac i sicrhau yn enwedig bod modd i brosiectau llwyddiannus mewn un ardal gael eu dyblygu mewn ardaloedd eraill.*

*v. annog y dylid gwneud pob ymdrech i roi cyhoeddusrwydd i'r rhaglen hon yn ardal Amcan 3, ac y dylid gwneud ymdrech arbennig i annog grwpiau a sefydliadau nad ydynt eisoes wedi cymryd rhan mewn rhaglenni a ariennir gan Ewrop i gymryd rhan.*

Croesawaf y gwelliannau sydd yn enw Elin. Bydd y rhaglen hon yn effeithio ar un ym mhob tri o bobl Cymru. Felly, mae'n rhaglen bwysig hyd yn oed os nad yw'r arian gymaint ag Amcan 1. Canolbwyntia'n bennaf ar adnoddau dynol. Rhaid inni ganfod cyfres o atebion Cymreig, yn enwedig ymestyn y gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan y Coleg Digidol yng Nghymru, a all arwain at raglen dysgu agored ehangach o lawer a fydd o gymorth i bob un ohonom.

Y rhan arall o'r prosiect a anghofir yn aml yw'r rhaglenni pwrpasol ar gyfer cwmnïau. Bu enw drwg gan Gymru ar hynny. Gobeithiaf y bydd y rhaglen hon yn gwneud ymdrech sylweddol wrth sicrhau y darparwn yr hyfforddiant priodol i gwmnïau ar yr amser ac yn y modd a ddymunant.

Yn fwy na dim arall, mae fy ngwelliant yn edrych ar y broses o feddwl cydgysylltiedig. Credaf mai hynny a oedd y tu ôl i sylwadau Elin. Beth bynnag sydd yn digwydd yn Amcan 3, fel yn Amcanion 2 ac 1, rhaid inni sicrhau bod y gweithgareddau hyn wedi eu gwreiddio yn strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol a blaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad. Dyna pam y mae golwg cyffredinol yn bwysig. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gallu gwneud hynny yn y rhaglen sydd i ddod.

Ynghylch trosglwyddo rheolaeth ar gronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop o'r Adran Addysg a

Edwina. I do not believe that that presents a problem. However, the Government is not prepared to transfer the money that goes with it. That is a Treasury problem. We want the money. The Assembly would be wrong to accept responsibility for a programme without the money that goes with it. That argument is replicated by the Treasury on match funding and so on.

The operational programme before you is Wales-driven. Much of the strategy is in the single programming document, which was drawn up in the UK, but I doubt whether it would have been very different if we had had total control over this document ourselves. What is included in this Objective 3 document is broad enough to categorise the range of activities that Wales wants.

The match funding is essential to the transfer. We continually have to remind people that the European social fund matched funding has always come out of the Welsh block. If you are running a course at a further education college, that money has come from the Further Education Funding Council for Wales, which comes from the Welsh block.

We have ignored the problems that that causes. If you are in a college of further education, there is no line in your budget which says 'Matched Funding', because the FEFCW produces the money according to a strict code. It is impossible for colleges and universities in Wales to shelve one project and work on another one. They have to shave off the margins, which is an extremely difficult job.

The former chief executive of the FEFCW thought that the only way of having clarity in this matter would be to have a separate matched-funding pot for FE. That would provide a clear additionality line. We are talking about twice as much matched funding than we have had before, and that will affect FE particularly, as well as higher education.

I hope that we can resolve this matter as quickly as possible because Objective 3 will be the first one off the blocks: it now seems as though it will beat Objective 1 and therefore the first of the new programmes

Chyflogaeth i Gymru, cytunaf ag Edwina. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n peri problem. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r Llywodraeth yn barod i drosglwyddo'r arian sydd ynglŷn â hynny. Mae hynny'n broblem ynghylch y Trysorlys. Dymunwn gael yr arian. Ni fyddai'n iawn i'r Cynulliad dderbyn cyfrifoldeb am raglen heb yr arian a ddaw gyda hi. Ailadroddir y ddadl honno gan y Trysorlys ar arian cyfatebol ac yn y blaen.

Mae'r rhaglen weithredu sydd o'ch blaen wedi ei gyrru gan Gymru. Mae llawer o'r strategaeth yn y ddogfen raglennu sengl, a luniwyd yn y DU, ond amheuf a fyddai'n wahanol iawn pe bai gennym reolaeth lwyr dros y ddogfen hon ein hunain. Mae'r hyn a geir yn y ddogfen Amcan 3 hon yn ddigon eang i gategoreiddio'r amrediad o weithgareddau y mae ar Gymru ei angen.

Mae'r arian cyfatebol yn hanfodol i'r trosglwyddo. Rhaid inni atgoffa pobl o hyd bod yr arian cyfatebol ar gyfer cronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop wedi dod erioed o'r bloc Cymreig. Os ydych yn rhedeg cwrs mewn coleg addysg bellach, daeth yr arian hwnnw o Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru, a ddaw o'r bloc Cymreig.

Anwybyddasom y problemau y mae hynny'n eu hachosi. Os ydych mewn coleg addysg bellach, nid oes llinell yn eich cyllideb sydd yn dweud 'Arian Cyfatebol', oherwydd mae Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru yn cyflwyno'r arian yn ôl cod caeth. Nid yw'n bosibl i golegau a phrifysgolion yng Nghymru roi un prosiect o'r neilltu a gweithio ar un arall. Rhaid iddynt blaenio'r ymylon, sydd yn waith anodd iawn.

Yr oedd cyn brif weithredwr Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru o'r farn mai'r unig ffordd o gael eglurder yn y mater hwn fyddai cael pot o arian cyfatebol ar wahân ar gyfer addysg bellach. Byddai hynny'n rhoi llinell ychwanegedd bendant. Yr ydym yn sôn am ddwywaith y swm o arian cyfatebol ag a gawsom o'r blaen, a bydd hynny'n effeithio ar addysg bellach yn enwedig, yn ogystal ag addysg uwch.

Gobeithiaf y gallwn ddatrys y mater hwn gynted ag y bo modd oherwydd Amcan 3 fydd y cyntaf i gychwyn: ymddengys bellach y bydd ar y blaen i Amcan 1 ac felly bydd y gyntaf o'r rhaglenni newydd a fydd i'w cael

available in Wales will be available soon to east Wales. Therefore we want to ensure that we can give people assurance that they will be able to use the matched funding. The overhang from the previous years' programmes is a blot on the horizon in that matter.

I welcome the EC's decision to allow ESF spending down to the age of 11, but there is a problem if schools will have to match the ESF they receive. Where will school governors find that match funding? The largest section of budget available to them is for staffing: if they look at staff time, they look at teachers in the classroom. We must address this matter of the mechanism; it is a serious problem. Schools have had little experience of ESF, although some local authorities have acted on their behalf. As budgets are devolved to schools, and new activities are provided, how do governing bodies and schools find that matched funding from their own budgets? We need an answer quickly, and I hope the First Secretary will consider this matter.

My penultimate point is about publicity. Although this is a well-written document that includes a broad partnership, it is a case of 'the usual suspects'. If you understand European funding, you will be the first off the blocks and the first to get the money. We must ensure that these programmes reach out further and give this opportunity to people who have never touched European programmes before: those in the voluntary sector, the community-regeneration sector, and the private sector. We must have a programme of education, publicity and development that will allow the project to develop beyond the usual suspects.

Finally, I welcome the opportunity to help steer this programme's development in the coming years. I hope it will be a significant contributor to the overarching ambitions and priorities of the Assembly.

**Cynog Dafis:** Hoffwn wneud dau bwynt ynglŷn â'r ddogfen Amcan 3. Mae'n ddogfen

yng Nghymru ar gael cyn hir i ddwyrain Cymru. Felly dymunwn sicrhau y gallwn roi sicrwydd i bobl y byddant yn gallu defnyddio'r arian cyfatebol. Mae'r bargodiad o raglenni'r blynyddoedd blaenorol yn flotyn ar y gorwel yn y mater hwnnw.

Croesawaf benderfyniad y Gymuned Ewropeaidd i ganiatáu gwariant o gronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop i lawr hyd at 11 oed, ond mae problem os bydd ysgolion yn gorfod rhoi arian cyfatebol ar gyfer yr hyn a dderbyniant o gronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop. Ym mhle y caiff llywodraethwyr ysgol yr arian cyfatebol hwnnw? Mae'r gyfran fwyaf o'r gyllideb sydd ar gael iddynt ar gyfer staffio: os edrychant ar amser y staff, edrychant ar athrawon yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Rhaid inni ymdrin â'r mater hwn o'r mecanwaith: mae'n broblem ddifrifol. Prin yw'r profiad a gafodd ysgolion o gronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop, er bod rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi gweithredu ar eu rhan. Gan fod cyllidebau wedi eu datganoli i ysgolion, a gweithgareddau newydd wedi eu darparu, sut y mae cyrff llywodraethol ac ysgolion yn canfod yr arian cyfatebol hwnnw o'u cyllidebau eu hunain? Mae arnom angen ateb yn gyflym, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn ystyried y mater hwn.

Mae'r pwynt olaf ond un sydd gennyf yn ymwneud â chyhoeddusrwydd. Er bod hon yn ddogfen a ysgrifennwyd yn dda sydd yn cynnwys partneriaeth eang, mae'n enghraifft o'r 'drwgdybiedigion arferol'. Os deallwch arian Ewropeaidd, chi fydd y cyntaf i gychwyn a'r cyntaf i gael yr arian. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y rhaglenni hyn yn cyrraedd ymhellach ac yn rhoi'r cyfle hwn i bobl nad ydynt erioed wedi cyffwrdd mewn rhaglenni Ewropeaidd o'r blaen: rhai yn y sector gwirfoddol, y sector adfywio cymunedol, a'r sector preifat. Rhaid inni gael rhaglen o addysg, cyhoeddusrwydd a datblygu a fydd yn caniatáu i'r prosiect ddatblygu ymhellach na'r drwgdybiedigion arferol.

Yn olaf, croesawaf y cyfle i helpu i lywio datblygiad y rhaglen hon yn y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn gyfrannwr o bwys i uchelgeisiau a blaenoriaethau cyffredinol y Cynulliad.

**Cynog Dafis:** I would like to make two points about the Objective 3 document. It is



ragorol sydd yn dangos ôl gwaith manwl a phroffesiynol.

Mae'r pwynt cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r cyswllt rhwng rhaglen Amcan 3 a'r gyfundrefn newydd a fydd yn cael ei chreu ar sail adroddiad y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant a gwaith y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16. Mae angen sicrhau bod y cyfle ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant yn hygyrch i bobl mewn ardaloedd gwledig, er enghraifft, ac hefyd i bobl sydd yn swil i gymryd at ddysgu mewn lleoliad ffurfiol.

4:37 p.m.

Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, yr oeddwn mewn digwyddiad a drefnwyd gan Fudiad Addysg y Gweithwyr yng ngogledd Cymru. Yr oedd y lleoliad yn hynod—y ganolfan byw'n annibynnol ym Mhorthmadog, sydd yn helpu pobl fethedig i fyw'n annibynnol. Yr oedd Mudiad Addysg y Gweithwyr wedi trefnu i bobl o dair ardal—Wrecsam, sydd yn ardal Amcan 3, Pentrefoelas, Porthmadog a Phenrhyndeudraeth—i ddod ynghyd i gyfarfod â'i gilydd ac â mi. Menywod oedd y rhan fwyaf ond yr oedd ystod ddiddorol. Yr oedd rhai yn drigolion tai cyngor ac eraill yn wragedd fferm, er enghraifft, ac yr oeddynt i gyd wedi mentro yn ôl i fyd addysg ac wedyn i fyd gwaith drwy weithgarwch Mudiad Addysg y Gweithwyr. Yr oedd ffactorau allweddol a'u galluogodd i wneud hynny: yr oedd y ddarpariaeth yn agos i'w cartrefi—yn yr ysgol gynradd ym Mhentrefoelas, yn y ganolfan ar stad cyngor yn Wrecsam ac yn y ganolfan yng nghanol y dref ym Mhorthmadog; yr oedd meithrinfa ar gael i blant bach; ac yr oedd y cyrsiau yn gymysgedd o'r galwedigaethol a'r analwedigaethol—hanes lleol, er enghraifft, ar y naill law ac astudiaethau busnes ac astudiaethau cyfrifiadurol ar y llaw arall. Nid oeddent yn gyrsiau a oedd yn gosod gormod o her yn y lle cyntaf. Dywedodd llawer wrthyf na fyddent wedi dechrau'r broses a agorodd ddrysau yn eu bywydau petaent wedi gorfod teithio i sefydliad, megis coleg addysg bellach. Byddai ofn arnynt groesi trothwy sefydliad ffurfiol o'r fath. Yr oeddent i gyd yn sôn am fagu hyder i ddysgu mwy, mentro i waith, ac, i rai, i redeg eu busnes eu hunain. Dylai arian Amcan 3 hyrwyddo'r pethau hyn.

Rhaid sicrhau nad yw darpariaeth o'r fath yn cael ei cholli yn y system newydd sydd yn

an excellent document, which shows evidence of detailed and professional work.

The first point concerns the link between the Objective 3 programme and the new system that will be created on the basis of the Education and Training Action Group report and the work of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee. There is a need to ensure that the opportunity for education and training is accessible to people in rural areas, for example, and also to people who are shy of taking up learning in a formal setting.

Last Friday, I attended an event organised by the Workers Educational Association in north Wales. The venue was quite unique—the independent living centre in Porthmadog, which helps the infirm to live independently. The WEA had arranged for people from three areas—Wrexham, which is an Objective 3 area, Pentrefoelas, Porthmadog and Penrhyndeudraeth—to come together to meet with each other and myself. The majority of them were women, but the range was interesting. Some were council house residents and others were farm wives, for example and all of them had ventured back into education and then into work through WEA activities. There were key factors that enabled them to do this: the provision was near their homes—at the primary school in Pentrefoelas, at the centre on a council estate in Wrexham and at the centre in the middle of the town in Porthmadog; a nursery was available for infants; and the courses were a mix of the vocational and non-vocational—local history, for example, on the one hand and business studies and computer studies on the other. They were not courses that posed too much of a challenge in the first instance. Many stated that they would not have started the process that has opened doors in their lives if they had to travel to an establishment such as a further education college. They would be frightened to venture into such a formal establishment. They all talked about mustering confidence to learn more, going into work and, for some, to run their own business. Objective 3 funding should promote these things.

We must ensure that such a provision is not lost within the new system, which is being

cael ei chreu drwy'r broses ETAG a'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16. Mae perygl y bydd y darparwyr gwirfoddol cymdeithasol hyn—nad yw Mudiad Addysg y Gweithwyr ond yn un o'r rheini—yn cael eu hymyleiddio gan y sefydliadau pwerus yn y consortia lleol a'u hanghofio. Byddai hynny'n golled fawr. Credaf y gellir osgoi hynny. Bydd yn rhaid i'r cyngor cenedlaethol newydd roi cyfarwyddyd am rôl allweddol sefydliadau o'r fath.

Mae fy ail bwynt yn ymwneud â gwelliant 4, sydd yn gwbl anffoddhaol. Mae'r ffaith nad oes cyfeiriad gwerth sôn amdano yn nogfen Amcan 3 na dogfennau Amcan 1 a 2 i'r cwestiwn holl bwysig o allfudiad yr ifanc o'r rhanbarth ac o Gymru yn fater arwyddocaol. Yr wyf i ac eraill wedi tynnu sylw at hyn dro ar ôl tro mewn trafodaethau ar gronfeydd strwythurol ond, i bob golwg, yn ddibwrpas. Mae ymateb y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 i'r dogfennau i'w weld yng nghofnodion ei gyfarfod ar 6 Hydref 1999:

'Bydd addysg a hyfforddiant ar ôl 16 oed yn derbyn rhan sylweddol o'r cyllid posibl a ddaw yn sgil Amcan 1, a dylid gallu mesur llwyddiant Amcan 1 yn ôl nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n aros o fewn yr ardal Amcan 1. Mae yna berygl y gallai buddsoddiad mawr mewn addysg a hyfforddiant, oni fydd wedi'i gysylltu'n ofalus â datblygiad economaidd a chyfleoedd cyflogi o fewn rhanbarth Amcan 1, ddargyfeirio manteision y buddsoddiad hwnnw i ranbarthau eraill, weithiau y tu allan i Gymru.'

Mae hyn yn hollol gywir. Fe'i ceir yng nghofnodion y Pwyllgor. Mae'n cyfeirio at Amcan 1 ond mae yr un mor berthnasol i Amcan 2 a 3.

Cafodd yr argymhelliad penodol hwn ei anwybyddu. Ni wnaed hyn yn ddamweiniol. Nid yw hynny'n bosibl gan ei fod yng nghofnodion y Pwyllgor. Cafodd ei anwybyddu'n fwriadol naill ai gan awduron y ddogfen neu gan eu meistri politicaidd. Cafodd ei anwybyddu am nad oedd yr awduron yn ei ystyried yn fater pwysig.

Yn y ddogfen mae'r dadansoddiad ystadegol yn hynod o drwyadl a phroffesiynol. Mae hynny'n ddiddorol dros ben. Nid oes dadansoddiad ystadegol o batrymau

created through the ETAG and the Post-16 Education and Training Committee process. There is a danger that these voluntary social providers—the WEA is only one of those—will be marginalised by the powerful establishments in the local consortia and be forgotten. That would be a great loss. I am sure that that could be averted. The new national council will need to provide guidance about the important role of such establishments.

My second point relates to amendment 4, which is totally unsatisfactory. The fact that there is no reference worth mentioning in the Objective 3 nor the Objective 1 and 2 documents to the important question of the outward migration of young people from the region and from Wales is a significant matter. I and others have highlighted the issue on numerous occasions in debates on structural funds but, it seems, to no avail. The Post-16 Committee's response to the document is seen in the minutes of its meeting on 6 October 1999:

'Post-16 education and training represents a significant component of potential Objective 1 funding and the degree of retention of young people within the Objective 1 region should be a key indicator of its success. There is a danger that major investment in education and training, unless linked carefully to economic development and employment opportunities within the Objective 1 region, could divert the advantages of that investment to other regions, sometimes outside Wales.'

This is absolutely true. It is in the Committee's minutes. It refers to Objective 1 but it is just as relevant to Objective 2 and 3.

This specific recommendation was ignored. This was not done accidentally. That is not possible as it appears in the minutes of the Committee. It was intentionally ignored either by the authors of the document or their political masters. It was ignored because the authors did not consider it to be an important matter.

In the document the statistical analysis is thorough and highly professional. That is extremely interesting. There is no statistical analysis of migration patterns, which is

ymfudiad, sydd yn fater hollol dyngedfennol i ddyfodol economaidd, cymdeithasol a diwylliannol Cymru. Mae'r ystadegau a gasglwyd a sut y'u dadansodwyd yn dangos beth a ystyrir yn bwysig. Mae'r mater hwn yn holl bwysig.

Mae pawb yn cytuno bod addysg a hyfforddiant yn bwysig i lwyddiant economaidd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig sylweddoli nad yw'r berthynas yn un syml. Yn ôl ystadegau'r ddogfen, mae Powys ar frig y gynghrair o ran llwyddiant addysgol, gyda 57 y cant yn cael o leiaf pum gradd A i C mewn arholiadau TGAU. Fodd bynnag, 79 y cant yn unig o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen y Deyrnas Gyfunol sydd gan Bowys. Mae 46 y cant yn cael graddau A i C mewn TGAU yn Sir Fflint a Wrecsam ac mae CMC y pen yn 108 y cant o'r cyfartaledd Prydeinig. Pe bai pob man yn gwneud cystal â Sir Fflint a Wrecsam, ni fyddai gennym broblem economaidd yng Nghymru.

Nid yw addysg a hyfforddiant ar eu pennau eu hunain yn gwneud y tric. Yr hyn a allai weithio fyddai cyfuniad o hynny, strategaeth datblygu economaidd a chynghori gyrfaol effeithiol. Mae'n bwysig fod pobl ifanc yn cael gwybodaeth am gyfleoedd gyrfaol yng Nghymru. Mae modd inni adeiladu ar brosiectau megis prosiect Llwybrau Menter a Busnes, er enghraifft, i fynd â'r peth ymhellach.

Mae eisiau cywiro'r diffyg difrifol yn y ddogfen ac yr wyf yn hyderus nad yw'n rhy hwyr i wneud hynny. Ar dudalen 113, mae rhestr o 12 o ddangosyddion a dywedir y bydd y Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglen efallai yn dewis ychwanegu at y dangosyddion hynny.

Gobeithiaf y bydd Mike German ac aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor yn gofalu am hyn. Mae angen i Blaid Cymru bwysu arnynt i wneud hynny. Os na chaiff hynny ei wneud ac os na fydd prosiectau a phenderfyniadau ar wariant yn adlewyrchu hynny, mae perygl y bydd rhan fawr o bwrpas y rhaglen wedi'i cholli cyn belled ag y mae Cymru yn y cwestiwn. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd wedi'i cholli cyn belled ag y mae Lloegr yn y cwestiwn. I awduron y ddogfen hon, efallai mai hynny sydd yn bwysig.

**Alun Cairns:** On behalf of the Welsh Conservative Party, I want to support the

inextricably linked to the economic, social and cultural future of Wales. The statistics collated and how they are analysed show what is considered to be important. This is a crucially important issue.

Everyone agrees that education and training are important for economic success. However, it is important to realise that the relationship is not a simple one. According to the statistics in the document, Powys is at the top of the league in terms of educational achievement, with 57 per cent obtaining at least five A to C grades in GCSE examinations. However, Powys has only 79 per cent of the United Kingdom's GDP per capita. In the counties of Flint and Wrexham, 46 per cent obtain A to C grades at GCSE and GDP per capita is 108 per cent of the British average. If everywhere did as well as the counties of Flint and Wrexham, we would not have an economic problem in Wales.

Education and training on their own do not do the trick. What could work would be a combination of that, an economic development strategy and effective career advice. It is important that young people are given information on career opportunities in Wales. We could build on projects such as the Pathways project by Menter a Busnes, for example, to develop things further.

The serious flaw in the document needs to be rectified and I am confident that it is not too late to do that. On page 113, there is a list of 12 indicators and it is stated that the Programme Monitoring Committee may choose to add to those indicators.

I hope that Mike German and other members of the Committee will take care of this. Plaid Cymru needs to press them to do so. If that is not done and if projects and decisions on expenditure do not reflect this, there is a danger that a large part of the purpose of the programme will have been lost as far as Wales is concerned. However, it will not have been lost as far as England is concerned. Perhaps, that is what is important to the authors of this document.

**Alun Cairns:** Ar ran Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, dymunaf gefnogi nodau rhaglen

aims of the Objective 3 operational programme. The strategic aim of the programme is to contribute to a competitive and knowledge-based economy with an efficient, flexible labour market. I note the comments made by the First Secretary in his opening remarks when he sought to reflect on the exclusion of places such as Barry from the Objective 2 map and highlight that they would be included in the Objective 3 area. Every area that is not included in Objective 1 is included in the Objective 3 region. He also said that only £81 million was available over the seven-year period and, of course, you cannot have it both ways. We accept that the area is included, but the wider the geographical area, the less money is available in those parts in relation to the Objective 3 operational programme.

The knowledge-driven economy is a key theme that runs through the whole programme. However, I must be clear in defining a knowledge-driven economy. No one would question that we need to attract and generate higher-level added value jobs to Wales and, in this instance, to the south-east region. My definition of the workforce of a knowledge-driven economy is one that holds at least the required skills demanded by employers at the present time, but also the skills required for their expansion plans in the medium term.

The economy of the region lacks the skills that are demanded by existing employers, and the re-organisation of the TECs into the Council for Education and Training Wales will have a major role in moving this forward. I do not want to repeat those well-rehearsed arguments, but the abolition of the TECs will significantly slow down our ability to meet our skills targets. It will take time for the new body to gain the necessary influence even if the structural issues are resolved to satisfy the business community.

The document revealed many alarming statistics. I was concerned to read that only 47 per cent of beneficiaries gained formal qualifications from previous programmes. Formal qualifications are not the only factor in delivering a knowledge-driven economy, but they should be used as an indicator of our

weithredol Amcan 3. Nod strategol y rhaglen yw cyfrannu at economi sydd yn gystadleuol ac yn seiliedig ar wybodaeth gyda marchnad lafur effeithlon, hyblyg. Nodaf y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn ei sylwadau agoriadol pan geisiodd ystyried yr eithrio o leoedd fel y Barri o fap Amcan 2 a phwysleisio y caent eu cynnwys yn yr ardal Amcan 3. Mae pob ardal nas cynhwyswyd yn Amcan 1 wedi ei chynnwys yn rhanbarth Amcan 3. Dywedodd hefyd mai ond £81 miliwn a oedd ar gael dros y cyfnod o saith mlynedd ac, wrth gwrs, ni allwch mo'i chael bob ffordd. Derbyniwn fod yr ardal wedi ei chynnwys, ond po ehangaf yr ardal ddaearyddol, lleiaf fydd yr arian sydd ar gael yn y rhannau hynny mewn perthynas â rhaglen weithredol Amcan 3.

Mae'r economi a yrrir gan wybodaeth yn thema allweddol sydd yn rhedeg drwy'r rhaglen gyfan. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi fod yn eglur wrth ddiffinio economi a yrrir gan wybodaeth. Ni fyddai neb yn amau nad oes arnom angen denu a chreu swyddi ar lefel uwch â gwerth ychwanegol i Gymru ac, yn yr achos hwn, i ranbarth y de-ddwyrain. Mae'r diffiniad sydd gennyf o weithlu economi a yrrir gan wybodaeth yn un sydd yn cynnwys o leiaf y medrau angenrheidiol y mae'r cyflogwyr yn galw amdanynt ar hyn o bryd, ond hefyd y medrau sydd yn angenrheidiol ar gyfer eu cynlluniau ehangu yn y tymor canolig.

Mae economi'r ardal yn brin o'r medrau y mae'r cyflogwyr presennol yn galw amdanynt, a bydd rôl bwysig i'r ad-drefnu o'r CHMau yn Gyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru wrth symud hyn ymlaen. Ni ddymunaf ailadrodd y dadleuon tra ymarferedig hynny, ond bydd diddymu'r CHMau yn arafu'n sylweddol ein gallu i gyrraedd ein targedau medrau. Bydd y corff newydd yn cymryd amser i ennill y dylanwad angenrheidiol hyd yn oed os caiff y materion strwythurol eu datrys er mwyn bodloni'r gymuned fusnes.

Mae'r ddogfen wedi datgelu llawer o ystadegau brawychus. Yr oedd yn ofid imi ddarllen mai ond 47 y cant o'r rhai a fanteisiodd a enillodd gymwysterau ffurfiol mewn rhaglenni blaenorol. Nid cymwysterau ffurfiol yw'r unig ffactor wrth wireddu economi a yrrir gan wybodaeth, ond dylid eu

progress. That statistic is unacceptable. Therefore, I was concerned that that target is set at only 50 per cent in the document. Given that there are so many vocational qualifications these days, it is important to accept that that figure should be higher.

4:47 p.m.

I was pleased that the relevant programmes and policies were included within each priority and in the measures. That means that people can appreciate what fits within each priority and what I meant when talking about the Objective 2 programme earlier. It also means that they can understand the facilitators' role—which I acknowledge is included in this document—to empower and to reach out to other sectors of the economy, as Mike German highlighted. Having said that, I am concerned that the New Deal programme qualifies within a number of priorities despite its questionable success in Wales. I am not necessarily speaking against the New Deal programme, but it is as an example of the vehicles through which we can deliver the Objective 3 programme. It is important, therefore, that whichever scheme is used, it is improved or built on from the standing start that we might find ourselves in.

My final point relates to the European social fund. In the Economic Development Committee meeting last week Phil Williams mentioned that William Hague announced that there was an agreement that the ESF should be devolved to the Welsh Office in 1997. It is three years since the last General Election and since William Hague was the Secretary of State for Wales. Unfortunately, Edwina Hart is not here at the moment to hear this, but to respond to the comments that she made earlier during Elin's speech, I agree that the transfer needs to be right, but I would have thought three years ample time for the necessary considerations.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Diolch i bawb sydd wedi cymryd rhan yn y ddatl y prynhawn yma. Dechreuaf gyda chyfraniad Elin Jones, gan mai hi a gynigiodd welliannau 1, 2, 3, 4 a 5 ar ran Plaid Cymru. Cefnogwn bob

defnyddio fel dangosydd o'n cynnydd. Mae'r ystadegyn hwnnw'n annerbyniol. Felly, yr oedd yn bryder i mi fod y targed hwnnw wedi ei osod ar ddim ond 50 y cant yn y ddogfen. O ystyried bod cynifer o gymwysterau galwedigaethol y dyddiau hyn, mae'n bwysig derbyn y dylai'r ffigur hwnnw fod yn uwch.

Yr oeddwn yn falch bod y rhaglenni a'r polisiau perthnasol wedi eu cynnwys oddi mewn i bob blaenoriaeth ac yn y mesurau. Golyga hynny y gall pobl sylweddoli beth sydd yn ffitio oddi mewn i bob blaenoriaeth a hynny a olygais wrth siarad am raglen Amcan 2 yn gynharach. Golyga hefyd y gallant ddeall rôl yr hwyluswyr—y cydnabyddaf ei bod wedi ei chynnwys yn y ddogfen hon—er mwyn galluogi ac ymestyn at sectorau eraill yn yr economi, fel y pwysleisiodd Mike German. Wedi dweud hynny, pryderaf fod rhaglen y Fargen Newydd yn gymwys oddi mewn i nifer o flaenoriaethau er gwaethaf yr amheuaeth ynghylch ei llwyddiant yng Nghymru. Nid wyf o reidrwydd yn siarad yn erbyn rhaglen y Fargen Newydd, ond mae'n enghraifft o'r cyfryngau y gallwn gyflenwi rhaglen Amcan 3 drwyddynt. Mae'n bwysig, felly, y bydd pa bynnag gynllun a ddefnyddir yn cael ei wella a'i ddatblygu o'r cychwyn stond y gallem ein cael ein hun ynddo.

Mae'r pwynt olaf sydd gennyf yn ymwneud â chronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop. Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yr wythnos diwethaf dywedodd Phil Williams fod William Hague wedi cyhoeddi bod cytundeb y dylid datganoli cronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop i'r Swyddfa Gymreig yn 1997. Aeth tair blynedd heibio ers yr Etholiad Cyffredinol diwethaf ac ers i William Hague fod yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Gwaetha'r modd, nid yw Edwina Hart yma ar hyn o bryd i glywed hyn, ond er mwyn ymateb i'r sylwadau a wnaeth yn gynharach yn ystod araith Elin, cytunaf fod angen i'r trosglwyddo fod yn iawn, ond tybiaswn y byddai tair blynedd yn ddigon o amser ar gyfer yr ystyriaethau angenrheidiol.

**The First Secretary:** I thank everyone who has taken part in the debate this afternoon. I will begin with Elin Jones's contribution, as she proposed amendments 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 on behalf of Plaid Cymru. We will support all

gwelliant. Nid ydym yn hollol hapus ynglŷn â gwelliant 1, wrth ystyried y cyfeiriad at 'amheuon'. Mae'n dangos elfen o dynnu'n ôl. Credaf fod pawb i raddau helaeth yn derbyn bod yr ysbryd a fynegwyd yn y Cynulliad y prynhawn yma yn gefnogol i gael y cynllun Amcan 3 trwy'r Cynulliad a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ac i ddechrau'r gwaith cyn gynted â phosibl.

Mae'r mater o drosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb am y gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd oddi wrth yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn Llundain i'r Cynulliad wedi codi sawl gwaith yn ystod y ddadl hon. Mae hyn wedi bod yn llusgo ymlaen am flynyddoedd, fel y dywedodd Alun Cairns. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi cael y drafodaeth hon o'r blaen. Mae pawb o blaid yr egwyddor o dderbyn y cyfrifoldeb o gynllunio gwariant y gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd a chydgynllunio gyda chronfeydd strwythurol eraill, ond dim ond ar yr amod bod y cyllid yn cael ei drosglwyddo hefyd. Wrth hynny, golygaf gyllid y llinell sylfaen oddi wrth yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth. Os na throsglwyddir yr arian hwnnw i'n llinell sylfaen, nid yw'n fargen oherwydd byddai'n rhaid i ni sybideiddio gwariant y gronfa gymdeithasol o'n cyllid.

Gallaf ddweud wrth y Cynulliad fod trafodaethau yn parhau. Gwn fod rhai yn meddwl bod hynny'n annigonol a dylid bod wedi cytuno ar y mater cyn hyn. Yr wyf yn hyderus y digwydd hynny cyn diwedd yr arolwg gwariant cyhoeddus ymhenn dau fis. Hoffwn pe bawn yn gallu dweud wrth y Cynulliad heddiw fod y mater wedi ei setlo a bod yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth wedi cytuno i drosglwyddo'r holl arian o'u llinell sylfaen nhw i'n llinell sylfaen ni. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaeth hynny ac mae anghytundeb yn parhau. Mae trafodaethau, sydd yn cynnwys Edwina Hart, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Andrew Smith, Penysgrifennydd y Trysorlys, a minnau, yn parhau. Ni allaf ddweud mwy na hynny ac ni allaf ddweud yr hyn a hoffwn, sef ein bod wedi dod i gytundeb.

**Alun Cairns:** A ydych yn dweud bod gwahaniaethau difrifol rhwng y Cynulliad a'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn yr ymgynghoriadau hyn?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Maent yn ddigon difrifol i'm rhwystro rhag cyhoeddi cytundeb

the amendments. We are not completely happy about amendment 1, given the reference to 'reservations'. That shows an element of withdrawal. I think that to a great extent we all accept that the spirit expressed in the Assembly this afternoon is supportive of getting the Objective 3 plan through the Assembly and the European Commission and starting work as soon as possible.

The matter of transferring responsibility for the European social fund from the Department for Education and Employment to the Assembly has arisen several times during this debate. This has been dragging on for years, as Alun Cairns said. However, we have had this discussion before. Everyone is in favour of accepting the responsibility of planning European social fund spending and jointly planning with other structural funds, but only on the condition that the budget is also transferred. By that, I mean the baseline budget from the Department for Education and Employment. If that money is not transferred to our baseline, there is no deal, because we would have to subsidise social fund spending from our budget.

I can tell the Assembly that discussions are ongoing. I know that some think that that is not good enough and that the matter should have been resolved before now. I am confident that that will happen before the public expenditure survey comes to an end in two months' time. I would like to be able to tell the Assembly today that the matter has been resolved and that DfEE has agreed to transfer all of the money from its baseline to our baseline. However, it did not do that and there is continuing disagreement. The discussions, which include Edwina Hart, the Secretary of State for Wales, Andrew Smith, the Chief Secretary to the Treasury, and myself, are ongoing. I cannot say more than that, and I cannot say what I would like to, which is that we have reached an agreement.

**Alun Cairns:** Are you saying that there are serious differences between the Assembly and DfEE in these consultations?

**The First Secretary:** They are serious enough to prevent me from announcing an

heddiw. Dyna'r broblem. Pe bawn yn siarad am ychydig geiniogau o wahaniaeth byddwn yn fodlon derbyn na fyddai hyn yn arwain at lawer o wahaniaeth yn y pen draw. Nid ydym eisiau cweryla dros werth ceiniog o refi, fel y dywedid ym marchnad Llanelli. Fodd bynnag, wrth drafod swm mawr o arian, ystyriwn ei fod yn ddigon pwysig i barhau â'r trafodaethau er mwyn sicrhau llwyddiant yn y pen draw.

Nid wyf eisiau ymdrin y prynhawn yma â'r trosglwyddiad y cyfeiriodd Elin Jones ato, sef y trosglwyddiad cyfrifoldeb o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16. Mae hynny'n gwestiwn i'r Pwyllgorau ymdrin ag ef, o ran portffolios y Cabinet. Yr wyf yn falch i glywed syniadau Elin ond nid wyf yn cytuno â hi.

Soniodd Elin Jones hefyd am gyfartaledd cadeiryddion gwrywaidd a benywaidd pwyllgorau monitro y cronfeydd strwythurol. Mae hyn yn fater pwysig ond nid oes gennyf ateb ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf i yn gadeirydd pwyllgor monitro Amcan 1 a Mike German yn gadeirydd pwyllgor monitro Amcan 3. Nid wyf yn barod i ddweud heddiw mai menyw fydd cadeirydd pwyllgor monitro Amcan 2. Yr wyf wedi nodi'r pwynt pwysig a diddorol hwn a dylid ei ystyried ymhellach. Ar hyn o bryd mae gennym ddau ddyn yn gadeiryddion. Nid yw'r pwyllgor monitro arall yn barod i ddewis cadeirydd, boed yn ddyn neu'n fenyw, eto.

Mater pwysig arall a godwyd yn y ddadl yw bod yn rhaid i'r awgrymiadau ynglŷn â phwy fydd yn dewis y blaenoriaethau ddod oddi wrth gymdeithas yn hytrach na chael eu pennu gan y bobl bwysig, neu'r '*usual suspects*' fel y'u gelwir gan Mike German. Dylai agwedd o'r gwaelod i fyny yn hytrach nag o'r pen i lawr fod yn sylfaen i'r modd yr ydym yn delio ag Amcan 3. Yr wyf yn derbyn hynny, ac yr wyf yn sicr bod Mike German yn ei dderbyn hefyd. Dylai hynny hefyd fod yn sail i'r modd yr ydym yn gweithio, gan ein bod yn trafod syniadau ar sut i gynyddu mynediad i fyd gwaith i'r bobl hynny a adawyd allan o bosibl o'r byd hwnnw yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Gwnaeth Elin Jones bwynt perthnasol ynglŷn â'r Fargen Newydd gan ofyn a fyddem yn camddefnyddio arian Amcan 3 drwy ei wario ar y Fargen Newydd yn hytrach na chreu

agreement this afternoon. That is the problem. If we were talking about a few pennies of difference I would be willing to accept that that would not lead to a great difference in the long run. We do not want to fight over a pennyworth of gravy, as they used to say in Llanelli market. However, when discussing a large sum of money, we consider it important enough to continue with the discussions to ensure success in the end.

I do not want to deal this afternoon with the other transfer to which Elin Jones referred, which is the transfer of responsibility from the Economic Development Committee to the Post-16 Education and Training Committee. That is a question for the Committees to deal with, in terms of Cabinet portfolios. I am pleased to hear Elin's ideas but I do not agree with her.

Elin Jones also spoke about the proportion of male and female chairs of the structural funds monitoring committees. This is an important matter but I do not have an answer this afternoon. I chair the Objective 1 monitoring committee and Mike German chairs the Objective 3 monitoring committee. I am not prepared to say today that a woman will chair the Objective 2 monitoring committee. I have noted this important and interesting point and it should be considered further. At the moment we have two male chairs. The other monitoring committee is not yet ready to choose a chair, male or female.

Another important matter raised in the debate is that the suggestions about who should choose the priorities must come from society rather than being decided by the important people, or the '*usual suspects*', as Mike German calls them. A bottom up rather than top down approach should be a basis to how we deal with Objective 3. I accept that, as I am sure that Mike German does. That should also be a basis to how we work because we are discussing ideas on how to increase access to work for those people who have perhaps been left out during the past five years. Elin Jones made a relevant point about the New Deal by asking whether we would misuse Objective 3 money by spending it on the New Deal instead of creating different things for that scheme. Perhaps we complain about the New Deal because it has not been sufficient as regards opportunities for women

pethau gwahanol ar ei chyfer. Efallai mai achos ein cwyno ynghylch y Fargen Newydd yw ei hannigonoldeb o ran cyfleoedd i fenywod neu'r ffaith nad yw'n ddigon cryf. Credwn y dylai'r Fargen Newydd barhau fel ag y mae, ond gallem gyfrannu rhagor o arian ac ymestyn ei chyfleoedd drwy Amcan 3. Ni fyddai hynny'n disodli'r arian sydd yn cael ei wario. Mae'r addewid ynglŷn â sut y bydd y Fargen Newydd yn asio gydag Amcan 3 yn un y gallaf ei rhoi heddiw—ymestyniad, nid annewidiad.

Mike German raised a point about schools and match funding. The Youth Access Initiative and the Grants for Education Support and Training programme would be available as match funding, we believe. They can widen the range of support in schools for anti-truancy programmes beyond what is already available as Youth Access Initiative and GEST funding. That area will be of interest to people in the education world.

In answer to Helen Mary—she has disappeared behind the pillar at the moment as she sometimes does—

**Tom Middlehurst:** We need a new building.

4:57 p.m

**The First Secretary:** I know the point. On the question of gender mainstreaming, the Welsh European Funding Office will have an equality unit and gender mainstreaming is eligible for support under technical assistance from WEFO. That is an important point. It will not be difficult to achieve. There will be every public support for ensuring gender mainstreaming. As we have seen in the New Deal, for example, some things are heavily female-orientated. Women take up 96 per cent of the lone parent initiative. Men take up 75 per cent of the New Deal for young people and men represent 85 per cent of the long-term unemployed. There is much gender difference in the way different employment programmes work due to many traditional patterns in the labour market.

and because it is not strong enough. We believe that it should proceed as it is, but we could provide more funding and expand its opportunities through Objective 3. That would not replace the money that is being spent. The promise about how the New Deal will fit in with Objective 3 is one that I can give this afternoon—it will be expansion rather than replacement.

Cododd Mike German bwynt ynghylch ysgolion ac arian cyfatebol. Byddai'r Fenter Mynediad Ieuenctid a'r rhaglen Grantiau Cynnal Addysg a Hyfforddiant ar gael fel arian cyfatebol, yr ydym yn credu. Gallant ehangu'r amrediad o gymorth mewn ysgolion ar gyfer rhaglenni gwrth-driwantiaeth y tu hwnt i'r hyn sydd ar gael eisoes fel arian y Fenter Mynediad Ieuenctid a'r Grantiau Cynnal Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Bydd y maes hwnnw o ddiddordeb i bobl ym myd addysg.

Mewn ymateb i Helen Mary—mae wedi diflannu y tu ôl i biler ar y funud fel y mae'n gwneud weithiau—

**Tom Middlehurst:** Mae arnom angen adeilad newydd.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r pwynt. Ynghylch y mater o roi cydraddoldeb y rhywiau yn y brif ffrwd, bydd uned cydraddoldeb gan Swyddfa Ariannu Ewropeaidd Cymru ac mae rhoi cydraddoldeb y rhywiau yn y brif ffrwd yn gymwys i'w gynorthwyo o dan gymorth technegol o Swyddfa Ariannu Ewropeaidd Cymru. Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig. Ni fydd yn anodd ei gyflawni. Bydd pob cefnogaeth gan y cyhoedd i roi cydraddoldeb y rhywiau yn y brif ffrwd. Fel y gwelsom yn y Fargen Newydd, er enghraifft, mae gogwydd benywaidd cryf mewn rhai pethau. Benywod sydd yn derbyn 96 y cant o'r fenter rhieni unigol. Dynion sydd yn derbyn 75 y cant o'r Fargen Newydd ar gyfer pobl ifanc ac mae dynion yn cynrychioli 85 y cant o'r rhai di-waith tymor hir. Mae llawer o wahaniaeth rhwng y rhywiau yn y modd y bydd gwahanol raglenni'n gweithio oherwydd llawer o batrymau traddodiadol yn y farchnad lafur.



There is not much more I can say about the debate. There is general backing for the Objective 3 programme to be pushed forward as soon as possible. That is why we accept all the amendments. I invite the Assembly not only to accept the motion but also to accept all the amendments and to endorse the East Wales Partnership' proposals for Objective 3.

Nid oes llawer mwy y gallaf ei ddweud am y ddatl. Mae cefnogaeth gyffredinol i wthio rhaglen Amcan 3 yn ei blaen cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Dyna pam y derbyniwn yr holl welliannau. Gwahoddaf y Cynulliad nid yn unig i dderbyn y cynnig ond i dderbyn yr holl welliannau hefyd ac i gadarnhau cynigion Partneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru ar gyfer Amcan 3.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 6.  
Amendment 1: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
German, Michael  
Humphreys, Christine  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 4 a 2: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 4 and 2: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliannau.  
Amendments adopted.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 3: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew

Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 5: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 6: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment adopted.*

Amended motion:

*The National Assembly:*

*i. endorses with reservations the East Wales Partnership's proposals for the strategy, priorities and indicative measures for Objective 3 contained in the draft operational programme document laid in the Table Office on 16 May 2000;*

*ii. adopts the draft operational programme document and requests the First Secretary, consulting as necessary with other political parties, to finalise the text in discussion with the European Commission and ensure a favourable Commission decision as soon as possible;*

*iii. authorises the First Secretary to agree the necessary arrangements with the partnership so that the launch of the Objective 3 programme can take place before the end of July 2000;*

*iv. notes that the retention of qualified and skilled young people within the Welsh workforce is essential for economic, social and cultural regeneration and resolves that the extent to which this is achieved should be a key indicator of the success of the programme, and also the Objective 1 programme;*

*v. instructs the First Secretary to negotiate with the DfEE and the Treasury to ensure the transfer of full responsibility for the ESF funds from DfEE to the National Assembly*

Y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn:*

*i. cymeradwyo er gyda pheth amheuon gynigion Partneriaeth Dwyrain Cymru ar gyfer y strategaeth, y blaenoriaethau a'r mesurau dangosol ar gyfer Amcan 3 sydd i'w gweld yn nogfen ddrافت y rhaglen weithredol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mai 2000;*

*ii. yn mabwysiadu dogfen ddrافت y rhaglen weithredu ac yn gofyn i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd, gan ymgynghori fel y bo angen â'r pleidiau gwleidyddol eraill, lunio fersiwn terfynol gan drafod â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a sicrhau penderfyniad ffafriol gan y Comisiwn cyn gynted ag y bo modd;*

*yn awdurdodi'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i gytuno ar y trefniadau angenrheidiol gyda'r bartneriaeth fel y bo modd lansio rhaglen Amcan 3 cyn diwedd mis Gorffennaf 2000;*

*iv. nodi ei bod yn hanfodol o safbwynt adfywiad economaidd, cymdeithasol a diwylliannol ein bod yn cadw pobl ifanc cymwys a chrefftus o fewn gweithlu Cymru ac yn penderfynu y dylai hyn fod yn ddangosydd allweddol i asesu llwyddiant y rhaglen, a hefyd rhaglen Amcan 1;*

*v. cyfarwyddo'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i negodi â'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth a'r Trysorlys i sicrhau bod y cyfrifoldeb llawn am arian y gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd*

*for Wales and adequate funding additional to the Barnett block to cover the ESF allocation for projects in Wales and the necessary public component of match funding;*

*yn cael ei drosglwyddo o'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a bod digon o arian, yn ychwanegol at y bloc Barnett, ar gael fel arian cyfatebol i'r dyraniad o gronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop i Gymru ac i'r elfen o'r arian cyfatebol a ddaw o goffrau cyhoeddus;*

*vi. requires the Assembly Secretary for Economic Development to bring forward proposals for ensuring synergy between projects undertaken in the Objective 3 area and in other areas of Wales receiving European structural funding, and in particular for ensuring that successful projects in one area can be replicated in other areas; and*

*vi. gofyn i'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad dros Ddatblygu Economaidd gyflwyno cynigion i sicrhau bod prosiectau a roddir ar waith yn ardal Amcan 3 a'r rheini mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru sydd yn derbyn arian strwythurol o Ewrop yn cydategu'i gilydd, ac i sicrhau yn enwedig bod modd i brosiectau llwyddiannus mewn un ardal gael eu dyblygu mewn ardaloedd eraill; a*

*vii. urges that all possible efforts be made to publicise this programme in the Objective 3 area, and that particular efforts be made to encourage involvement from groups and organisations which have not previously participated in European-funded programmes.*

*vii. annog y dylid gwneud pob ymdrech i roi cyhoeddusrwydd i'r rhaglen hon yn ardal Amcan 3, ac y dylid gwneud ymdrech arbennig i annog grwpiau a sefydliadau nad ydynt eisoes wedi cymryd rhan mewn rhaglenni a ariennir gan Ewrop i gymryd rhan.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion adopted*

**Cadarnhau Newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 19, 22.12 a 27  
Ratification of Changes to Standing Orders Nos. 19, 22.12 and 27**

**Andrew Davies:** I propose

**Andrew Davies:** Cynigiaf fod

*that the National Assembly for Wales, acting Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan*

*under Section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 26*

*weithredu o dan Adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 26, yn*

*i) approves the following revisions to the Standing Orders;*

*i) cymeradwyo'r diwygiadau canlynol i'r Rheolau Sefydlog;*

*ii) resolves that all revisions shall take effect immediately:*

*ii) penderfynu bod yr holl ddiwygiadau yn dod i rym ar unwaith:*

#### **Revision 1**

*Replace paragraphs 19.1 to 19.12 with the following and renumber paragraphs 19.13 to 19.23 as 19.11 to 19.21:*

#### **Diwygiad 1**

*Rhodder y canlynol yn lle paragraffau 19.1 i 19.12 ac ailrifo paragraffau 19.13 i 19.23 yn 19.11 i 19.21:*

#### **Determination of Assembly Budget**

*19.1 In each financial year the Assembly Secretary for Finance shall invite Subject Committees to submit, normally by a date at least eight weeks from the date of the invitation and no later than 31 July, their views on priorities for the Assembly's expenditure in the following three financial years, or for a period which the Assembly Secretary for Finance considers appropriate.*

#### **Penderfynu Cyllideb y Cynulliad**

*19.1 Yn ystod pob blwyddyn ariannol, bydd Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad yn gwahodd Pwyllgorau Pwnc i gyflwyno sylwadau, fel rheol erbyn dyddiad o leiaf wyth wythnos ar ôl dyddiad y gwahoddiad ac erbyn 31 Gorffennaf fan bellaf, ar flaenoriaethau gwariant y Cynulliad yn ystod y tair blynedd ariannol dilynol, neu am gyfnod y mae Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad yn barnu ei fod yn briodol.*

*19.2 Normally in October in any year, and in any event not later than 15 November, the Assembly Secretary for Finance shall table a draft budget. The Assembly Secretary for Finance shall at the same time table a motion that the Assembly take note of the draft budget. The draft budget shall set out the proposed allocation of the Assembly's resources for the following financial year and the provisional allocations for the subsequent two years, or for a period which the Assembly Secretary for Finance considers appropriate. As soon as practicable after the Assembly has taken note of the draft budget each Assembly Secretary who is a member of a Subject Committee shall seek its views on the draft budget and convey them to the Assembly Secretary for Finance.*

*19.2 Fel rheol, ym mis Hydref mewn unrhyw flwyddyn, a, sut bynnag, erbyn 15 Tachwedd fan bellaf, bydd Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno cyllideb ddrafft. Ar yr un pryd, bydd Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno cynnig bod y Cynulliad yn nodi'r gyllideb ddrafft. Bydd y gyllideb ddrafft yn nodi dyraniad arfaethedig adnoddau'r Cynulliad ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol ddilynol a'r dyraniadau dros dro ar gyfer y ddwy flynedd wedi hynny, neu am gyfnod y mae Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad yn barnu ei fod yn briodol. Cyn gynted ag y bo'n ymarferol ar ôl i'r Cynulliad nodi'r gyllideb ddrafft, bydd pob Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad sydd yn aelod o Bwyllgor Pwnc yn gwahodd ei sylwadau ar y gyllideb ddrafft ac yn eu trosglwyddo i Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad.*

*19.3 Normally in November, and in any event not later than 10 December, the Assembly Secretary for Finance shall table a final budget which shall be for the same period as the draft budget under paragraph 19.2. The Assembly Secretary for Finance shall at the same time table a motion that the final budget be adopted. The motion that the final budget be adopted shall not be subject to amendment.*

*19.3 Fel rheol, y mis Tachwedd hwnnw, a, sut bynnag, erbyn 10 Rhagfyr fan bellaf, bydd Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno cyllideb derfynol a fydd ar gyfer yr un cyfnod â'r gyllideb ddrafft o dan baragraff 19.2. Ar yr un pryd, bydd Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno cynnig bod y gyllideb derfynol yn cael ei mabwysiadu. Ni fydd modd cynnig gwelliant i gynnig bod y gyllideb derfynol yn cael ei*



*mabwysiadu.*

*19.4 After the final budget has been adopted, but before the following 1 April, the Assembly Secretary for Finance may table a supplementary budget setting out changes to that final budget arising from changes in the UK Government's expenditure plans or other technical changes of a budgetary nature. The Assembly Secretary for Finance shall at the same time table a motion that the supplementary budget be adopted. A motion that a supplementary budget be adopted shall not be subject to amendment.*

#### ***In-Year Adjustments of Assembly Budget***

*19.5 Except in cases of urgency, any change, in the course of a financial year, in the level of resources allocated to a main expenditure group in the final budget or a supplementary budget adopted under paragraph 19.3 or, as the case may be, 19.4, including the establishment of a new main expenditure group, shall only be made on a motion proposed by the Assembly Secretary for Finance. Any such motion shall not be subject to amendment. In cases of urgency, the Assembly Secretary for Finance may change the level of resources allocated to any main expenditure group, or establish a new main expenditure group, but in any such case the Assembly Secretary for Finance shall inform the Assembly as soon as reasonably practicable of the action taken.*

*19.6 In the course of a financial year an Assembly Secretary may with the agreement of the Assembly Secretary for Finance approve the transfer of resources within a main expenditure group between and within financial allocations for areas for which that Assembly Secretary is responsible. Where the proposed transfer would alter the allocations in the final budget or a supplementary budget adopted under paragraph 19.3 or, as the case may be, 19.4, the Assembly Secretary shall, except in cases of urgency, consult the relevant Subject Committee about it; failing such consultation the Assembly Secretary shall inform the committee as soon as reasonably practicable of the action taken.*

*19.4 Ar ôl i'r gyllideb derfynol gael ei mabwysiadu, ond cyn 1 Ebrill yn y flwyddyn ddilynol, caiff Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad gyflwyno cyllideb atodol sydd yn nodi newidiadau i'r gyllideb derfynol honno sydd yn deillio o newidiadau i gynlluniau gwariant Llywodraeth y DU neu newidiadau technegol eraill sydd yn ymwneud â'r gyllideb. Ar yr un pryd, bydd Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno cynnig bod y gyllideb atodol yn cael ei mabwysiadu. Ni fydd modd cynnig gwelliant i gynnig bod cyllideb atodol yn cael ei mabwysiadu.*

#### ***Addasiadau i Gyllideb y Cynulliad yn ystod y Flwyddyn***

*19.5 Ac eithrio mewn achosion brys, ni fydd unrhyw newid, yn ystod blwyddyn ariannol, i lefel yr adnoddau a ddyrennir i brif grŵp gwariant yn y gyllideb derfynol neu mewn cyllideb atodol a fabwysiedir o dan baragraff 19.3 neu, yn ôl y galw, 19.4, gan gynnwys sefydlu prif grŵp gwariant newydd, ond yn cael ei wneud drwy gynnig a gyflwynir gan Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad. Ni fydd modd cynnig gwelliant i unrhyw gynnig o'r fath. Mewn achosion brys, caiff Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad newid lefel yr adnoddau a ddyrennir i unrhyw brif grŵp gwariant, neu sefydlu prif grŵp gwariant newydd, ond, mewn unrhyw achos o'r fath, bydd Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad yn gadael i'r Cynulliad wybod, cyn gynted ag y bo'n rhesymol ymarferol, am y camau a gymerwyd.*

*19.6 Yn ystod blwyddyn ariannol, caiff Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad, gyda chytundeb Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad, gymeradwyo trosglwyddo adnoddau o fewn prif grŵp gwariant rhwng ac o fewn dyraniadau ariannol ar gyfer meysydd y mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad hwnnw'n gyfrifol amdanynt. Lle y byddai'r trosglwyddo arfaethedig yn newid y dyraniadau yn y gyllideb derfynol neu mewn cyllideb atodol a fabwysiedir o dan baragraff 19.3 neu, yn ôl y galw, 19.4, bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad yn ymgynghori â'r Pwyllgor Pwnc perthnasol yn ei gylch, ac eithrio mewn achosion brys; os na fydd modd ymgynghori, bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad yn gadael i'r pwyllgor wybod, cyn gynted ag y bo'n rhesymol ymarferol, am y camau a gymerwyd.*

19.7 In the course of the financial year the Assembly Secretary for Finance may approve the transfer of resources within a main expenditure group and between financial allocations for areas for which different Assembly Secretaries are responsible. Where the proposed transfer would alter the allocations in the final budget, or a supplementary budget, adopted under paragraph 19.3 or, as the case may be, 19.4, the relevant Assembly Secretary shall, except in cases of urgency, consult the relevant subject committees on the proposed transfer; failing such consultation, they shall inform the committees as soon as reasonable practicable of the action taken.

### **Local Government Finance Reports**

19.8 The reports mentioned in this paragraph shall be made by being approved by resolution of the Assembly:

- i. a local government finance report under Section 78A of the Local Government Finance Act 1988 ('the 1988 Act');
- ii. an amending report under Section 84A of, or paragraph 13 of Schedule 8 to, the 1988 Act;
- iii. an additional grant report under Section 85 of the 1988 Act;
- iv. a special grant report under Section 88B of the 1988 Act.

19.9 Whenever a draft budget is tabled under paragraph 19.2, the Assembly Secretary with responsibility for local government finance shall at the same time or as soon as reasonably practicable thereafter table a draft local government finance report for the next financial year. The Assembly Secretary with responsibility for local government finance shall table the report in final form before the Assembly not later than 15 February in any year and shall at the same time table a motion that the report be approved.

19.10 A motion that any of the reports referred to in paragraph 19.8 be approved shall not be subject to amendment.

19.7 Yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol, caiff Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad gymeradwyo trosglwyddo adnoddau o fewn prif grŵp gwariant a rhwng dyraniadau ariannol ar gyfer meysydd y mae gwahanol Ysgrifenyddion Cynulliad yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Lle y byddai'r trosglwyddo arfaethedig yn newid y dyraniadau yn y gyllideb derfynol, neu mewn cyllideb atodol a fabwysiedir o dan baragraff 19.3 neu, yn ôl y galw, 19.4, bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad priodol yn ymgynghori â'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc perthnasol ar y trosglwyddo arfaethedig, ac eithrio mewn achosion brys; os na fydd modd ymgynghori, byddant yn gadael i'r pwyllgorau wybod cyn gynted ag y bo'n rhesymol ymarferol am y camau a gymerwyd.

### **Adroddiadau Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol**

19.8 Caiff yr adroddiadau y sonnir amdanynt yn y paragraff hwn eu gwneud drwy gael eu cymeradwyo drwy benderfyniad gan y Cynulliad:

- i. adroddiad cyllid llywodraeth leol o dan Adran 78A o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988 ('Deddf 1988');
- ii. adroddiad diwygiol o dan Adran 84A o Ddeddf 1988, neu o dan baragraff 13 o Atodlen 8 i'r Ddeddf honno;
- iii. adroddiad grant ychwanegol o dan Adran 85 o Ddeddf 1988;
- iv. adroddiad grant arbennig o dan Adran 88B o Ddeddf 1988.

19.9 Pryd bynnag y caiff cyllideb ddrafft ei chyflwyno o dan baragraff 19.2, bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad sydd yn gyfrifol am gyllid llywodraeth leol, ar yr un pryd neu cyn gynted ag y bo'n rhesymol ymarferol wedi hynny, yn cyflwyno drafft o adroddiad cyllid llywodraeth leol ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol ddilynol. Bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad sydd yn gyfrifol am gyllid llywodraeth leol yn cyflwyno'r adroddiad ar ei ffurf derfynol gerbron y Cynulliad erbyn 15 Chwefror fan bellaf mewn unrhyw flwyddyn a bydd ar yr un pryd yn cyflwyno cynnig bod yr adroddiad yn cael ei gymeradwyo.

19.10 Ni fydd modd cynnig gwelliant i gynnig bod unrhyw adroddiad y cyfeirir ato ym mharagraff 19.8 yn cael ei gymeradwyo.

**Revision 2**

*New paragraph 22.12A*

*(i) Where a draft Order (including an amended draft Order) which has been laid before the Assembly contains typographical or grammatical errors, or minor drafting errors which have been identified by the Legislation Committee as appropriate for correction under this provision, the Assembly Secretary who laid the draft Order may, not later than the tabling of the motion seeking the Assembly's approval of the draft, lay before the Assembly a Memorandum of Corrections setting out the amendments necessary to correct the errors.*

*When such a Memorandum has been laid, that fact shall be referred to in the motion seeking approval of the draft and, subject to sub-paragraph (ii) the draft, if approved, shall be taken to have been approved as amended by the Memorandum of Corrections except to the extent that any amendment is superseded by an amendment to the draft agreed by the Assembly in Plenary.*

*(ii) If it appears to the Presiding Officer that a Memorandum of Corrections includes an amendment other than one necessary to correct typographical, grammatical or minor drafting errors, the Presiding Officer shall rule that amendment out of order and the draft, if approved, shall not be taken to have been amended by it.*

**Revision 3**

*In Standing Order No. 27.9*

*Add*

*'(iv) paragraph 8.25A'*

All parties have previously agreed to these non-contentious changes, which have also been agreed in Business Committee. I will briefly explain the implications of the changes.

Revision 1 refers to the Assembly's budgeting procedures. Members will no doubt agree that the existing arrangements enabled the Finance Secretary, Edwina Hart, to formulate an inclusive first budget, which reflected the priorities of all parties in the National Assembly. Following this process, a number of omissions in Standing Order No. 19 became apparent.

**Diwygiad 2**

*Paragraff newydd 22.12A*

*(i) Lle bo Gorchymyn drafft (gan gynnwys Gorchymyn drafft wedi'i ddiwygio) a osodwyd gerbron y Cynulliad yn cynnwys gwallau teipio neu ramadegol, neu fân wallau drafftio a nodwyd gan y Pwyllgor Deddfau fel rhai sydd yn briodol eu cywiro o dan y ddarpariaeth hon, gall yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad a osododd y Gorchymyn drafft osod Memorandwm Cywiriadau gerbron y Cynulliad yn nodi'r newidiadau angenrheidiol i gywiro'r gwallau, gan wneud hynny cyn cyflwyno'r cynnig yn ceisio cymeradwyaeth y Cynulliad i'r drafft.*

*Pan fo Memorandwm o'r fath wedi'i osod gerbron, cyfeirir at hynny yn y cynnig i geisio cymeradwyaeth i'r drafft, ac os caiff ei gymeradwyo, a hynny'n amodol ar is-baragraff (ii), cymerir iddo gael ei gymeradwyo a'i ddiwygio gan y Memorandwm Cywiriadau oni bai fod unrhyw welliant yn cael ei ddisodli gan welliant i'r drafft y cytunwyd arno gan y Cynulliad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.*

*(ii) Os ymddengys i'r Llywydd fod Memorandwm Cywiriadau yn cynnwys gwelliant ar wahân i un sydd yn angenrheidiol er mwyn cywiro gwallau teipio neu ramadegol neu fân wallau drafftio, bydd y Llywydd yn dyfarnu bod y gwelliant hwnnw yn annerbyniol, ac os cymeradwyir y drafft, ni chymerir iddo gael ei ddiwygio ganddo.*

**Diwygiad 3**

*Yn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.9*

*Ychwaneger*

*'(iv) paragraff 8.25A'*

Mae'r holl bleidiau wedi cytuno'n flaenorol ar y newidiadau annadleuol hyn, y cytunwyd arnynt hefyd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes. Egluraf oblygiadau'r newidiadau'n fyr.

Mae diwygiad 1 yn cyfeirio at weithdrefnau gosod cyllideb y Cynulliad. Mae'n sicr y bydd yr Aelodau'n cytuno bod y trefniadau presennol wedi galluogi'r Ysgrifennydd Cyllid, Edwina Hart, i lunio cyllideb gyntaf gynhwysol, a oedd yn adlewyrchu blaenoriaethau'r holl bleidiau yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. O ganlyniad i'r broses hon, daeth nifer o ddiffygion i'r amlwg yn Rheol

## Sefydlog Rhif 19.

The amendment to Standing Order No. 19.1 effects two main changes. First, it will allow Members and Committees more time to consider the draft budget and it will result in the draft budget being tabled earlier.

Secondly, it will allow the Finance Secretary greater flexibility in setting the Assembly's budget period. The period is currently three years, with a detailed budget for the following year and provisional allocations for the following two years. This pattern does not necessarily correspond with the budget periods under the UK Government's spending reviews and could leave a second and third year of an Assembly budget with no baseline. Building flexibility into the period of provisional allocations will eradicate this anomaly.

The amendments to Standing Orders Nos. 19.2 and 19.3 will clarify and streamline the various stages of the budget planning round. The amendments will replace the current three stage approach with a simpler, two stage approach. Stage one will begin with a Plenary debate of a draft budget, which will normally occur in November. Assembly Secretaries will then have time to consult their Committees on the draft budget and convey the Committees' views to the Finance Secretary. In the second stage, the Finance Secretary will table a motion, asking the Assembly to approve the budget in late November or early December. This motion would not be subject to amendment. The major advantage of this two stage approach will be to give organisations such as health authorities, local authorities and voluntary bodies greater certainty of their budget allocations before Christmas, which is earlier than under the current arrangement.

The amendment to Standing Order No. 19.4 makes provision for a supplementary budget to be tabled by the Finance Secretary after adoption of the final budget and after 1 April the following year. This amendment would be restricted to two uses. First, the amendment could be used to take account of changes in the UK Government's expenditure

Mae'r diwygiad i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 19.1 yn cyflawni dau brif newid. Yn gyntaf, bydd yn caniatáu mwy o amser i'r Aelodau a'r Pwyllgorau ystyried y gyllideb ddrafft a bydd yn arwain at gyflwyno'r gyllideb ddrafft yn gynharach.

Yn ail, bydd yn caniatáu mwy o hyblygrwydd i'r Ysgrifennydd Cyllid wrth bennu cyfnod cyllideb y Cynulliad. Y cyfnod ar hyn o bryd yw tair blynedd, gyda chyllideb fanwl ar gyfer y flwyddyn ganlynol a dyraniadau dros dro ar gyfer y ddwy flynedd wedi hynny. Nid yw'r patrwm yn cyfateb o reidrwydd i'r cyfnodau cyllideb o dan arolygon gwariant Llywodraeth y DU a gallai adael ail a thrydedd flwyddyn o gyllideb Cynulliad heb linell waelod. Bydd cynnwys hyblygrwydd yng nghyfnod y dyraniadau dros dro yn dileu'r anghysondeb hwn.

Mae'r diwygiadau i Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 19.2 a 19.3 yn rhoi gwedd eglurach ar wahanol gamau cylch cynllunio'r gyllideb ac yn eu symleiddio. Bydd y diwygiadau'n rhoi dull gweithredu dau gam, symlach yn lle'r dull gweithredu tri cham presennol. Bydd cam un yn dechrau â dadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar gyllideb ddrafft, a fydd yn digwydd fel arfer yn Nhachwedd. Wedyn bydd amser gan yr Ysgrifennyddion Cynulliad i ymgynghori â'u Pwyllgorau ar y gyllideb ddrafft a chyfleu barn y Pwyllgorau i'r Ysgrifennydd Cyllid. Yn yr ail gam, bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid yn cyflwyno cynnig, yn gofyn i'r Cynulliad gymeradwyo'r gyllideb yn hwyr ym mis Tachwedd neu'n gynnar ym mis Rhagfyr. Ni fyddai'r cynnig hwn yn agored i welliannau. Prif fantais y dull gweithredu dau gam hwn yw y bydd yn rhoi mwy o sicrwydd i gyrff fel awdurdodau iechyd, awdurdodau lleol a mudiadau gwirfoddol o'u dyraniadau cyllideb cyn y Nadolig, sydd yn gynharach nag o dan y trefniant presennol.

Mae'r diwygiad i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 19.4 yn darparu ar gyfer cyflwyno cyllideb atodol gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid ar ôl mabwysiadu'r gyllideb derfynol ac ar ôl 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn ganlynol. Byddai'r diwygiad hwn wedi ei gyfyngu i ddau ddefnydd. Yn gyntaf, gellid defnyddio'r diwygiad er mwyn rhoi ystyriaeth i

plans, which were not foreseen at the time of the Assembly's December budget. Secondly, it could be used to take account of technical changes that need to be introduced.

The amendment to Standing Order No. 19.5 aims to bring in-year allocations of Assembly expenditure into line with the forward allocations by allowing changes to the main expenditure groups. Only transfers between main expenditure groups are currently permissible. Standing Orders Nos. 19.6, 19.7 and 19.10 contain only minor consequential drafting changes. The amendments to Standing Orders Nos. 19.8 and 19.9 will correct the anomaly of the Assembly's Finance Secretary having to table the local government finance reports. In future, these will be tabled by the Secretary for Local Government and Housing. The report should be tabled in final form no later than 15 February, along with a motion to approve the report.

5:07 p.m.

I turn to revision 2, which relates to the correction of minor errors in the drafting of secondary legislation. The amendment to Standing Order No. 22 creates a new paragraph 22.12A, which provides for a Memorandum of Corrections to correct typographical or grammatical errors in previously laid draft Orders which have been identified by the Legislation Committee as appropriate for correction. The Memorandum of Corrections will be laid in the Table Office prior to the motion seeking the Assembly's approval of the draft Order. The Presiding Officer will be able to rule out of order any amendment within the Memorandum of Corrections which he believes is something other than an attempt to correct typographical or grammatical errors. That amendment will not be held to have taken effect if the draft Order is approved.

The final revision is to Standing Order No. 27.9 and will allow the planning decision committees to be recalled during recess. On 5 April this year, Members approved a revision to Standing Order No. 8.25A, which allows certain committees to be recalled during

newidiadau yng nghynlluniau gwariant Llywodraeth y DU, nas rhagwelwyd ar adeg cyllideb y Cynulliad ym mis Rhagfyr. Yn ail, gellid ei ddefnyddio i roi ystyriaeth i newidiadau technegol y mae angen eu cyflwyno.

Mae'r diwygiad i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 19.5 yn ceisio cysoni'r dyraniadau o wariant y Cyllideb o fewn y flwyddyn â'r blaenddyraniadau drwy ganiatáu newidiadau yn y prif grwpiau gwariant. Dim ond trosglwyddiadau rhwng y prif grwpiau gwariant y gellir eu caniatáu ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 19.6, 19.7 a 19.10 ond yn cynnwys mân newidiadau drafftio canlyniadol. Mae'r diwygiadau i Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 19.8 a 19.9 yn cywiro'r anghysondeb sydd yn golygu bod Ysgrifennydd Cyllid y Cynulliad yn gorfod cyflwyno'r adroddiadau cyllid llywodraeth leol. Yn y dyfodol, cyflwynir y rhain gan yr Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol a Thai. Dylai'r adroddiad gael ei gyflwyno ar ei ffurf derfynol erbyn 15 Chwefror fan bellaf, ynghyd â chynnig i gymeradwyo'r adroddiad.

Trof at ddiwygiad 2, sydd yn ymwneud â chywiro mân wallau wrth ddrafftio deddfwriaeth eilaidd. Mae'r diwygiad i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22 yn creu paragraff newydd 22.12A, sydd yn darparu ar gyfer Memorandwm Cywiriadau i gywiro gwallau teipio neu ramadegol mewn Gorchmynion drafft a osodwyd cynt a ddynodwyd gan y Pwyllgor Deddfau yn rhai y mae'n briodol eu cywiro. Gosodir y Memorandwm Cywiriadau yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno cyn y cynnig sydd yn ceisio cymeradwyaeth y Cynulliad i'r Gorchmyn drafft. Bydd y Llywydd yn gallu dyfarnu'n annerbyniol unrhyw ddiwygiad o fewn y Memorandwm Cywiriadau y mae o'r farn ei fod yn rhywbeth amgenach nag ymgais i gywiro gwallau teipio neu ramadegol. Nid ystyrir bod y diwygiad hwnnw wedi dod i rym os cymeradwyir y Gorchmyn drafft.

Mae'r diwygiad olaf yn un i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 27.9 a bydd yn caniatáu galw yn ôl y pwyllgorau penderfyniadau cynllunio yn ystod toriad. Ar 5 Ebrill eleni, cymeradwyodd yr Aelodau ddiwygiad i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.25A, sydd yn caniatáu galw

recess. We omitted to include the planning decision committees set up under Standing Order No. 27 in the list of committees. This amendment simply corrects that omission.

yn ôl rhai pwyllgorau yn ystod toriad. Pallasom gynnwys y pwyllgorau penderfyniadau cynllunio a sefydlwyd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 27 yn y rhestr o bwyllgorau. Y cwbl a wnaiff y diwygiad hwn yw cywiro'r diffyg hwnnw.

The amendments to Standing Order Nos. 19, 22 and 27 are non-controversial and have been approved by all members of the Business Committee. I therefore ask you to support the motion.

Mae'r diwygiadau i Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 19, 22 a 27 yn annadleuol ac fe'u cymeradwywyd gan holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor Busnes. Felly gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r cynnig.

**The Presiding Officer:** There are no speakers for or against the motion.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes siaradwyr o blaid nac yn erbyn y cynnig.

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**The Presiding Officer:** The Business Secretary lost some business earlier today, namely the Business statement, and I invite him to make a revised Business statement.

**Y Llywydd:** Collodd y Trefnydd rywfaint o fusnes yn gynharach heddiw, sef y datganiad busnes, ac fe'i gwahoddaf i wneud datganiad busnes diwygiedig.

### **Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig Revised Business Statement**

**Andrew Davies:** I hope that losing my Business statement was not a sign of carelessness on my part. I will table a statement by the First Secretary on the Broughton issue and the First Secretary will make a statement in Plenary tomorrow. On that basis, I hope that my revised Business statement will be adopted.

**Andrew Davies:** Gobeithiaf nad oedd colli fy natganiad busnes yn arwydd o ddiotalwch ar fy rhan. Byddaf yn cyflwyno datganiad gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd ar fater Brychdyn a bydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn gwneud datganiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yfory. Ar y sail honno, gobeithiaf y caiff fy natganiad busnes diwygiedig ei dderbyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the revised business statement?

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes diwygiedig?

Gwelaf nad oes.

I see that there are not.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes diwygiedig.  
Revised business statement adopted.*

Dyna ddiwedd busnes heddiw. Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cydweithrediad.

That is the end of today's business. I thank Members for their co-operation.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.11 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.11 p.m.*