



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mercher 19 Ionawr 2000**  
**Wednesday 19 January 2000**

## **Cynnwys Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd  
*Questions to the Secretary for Economic Development*
- 12 Cwestiynau i'r Ysgrifennydd Cyllid  
*Questions to the Finance Secretary*
- 18 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*
- 20 Datganiad ar Gyngor Prydain ac Iwerddon  
*Statement on the British-Irish Council*
- 26 Adolygu Rheolau Sefydlog: Paneli Cynllunio  
*Revision to Standing Orders: Planning Panels*
- 39 Canlyniad Arolwg y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol  
*The Outcome of the National Curriculum Review*
- 69 Cymeradwyo 11 o Orchmynion y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol  
*Approval of the 11 National Curriculum Orders*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd Questions to the Secretary for Economic Development**

### **Canolfan Alwadau Newydd Arfaethedig, Merthyr Tudful Proposed New Call Centre, Merthyr Tydfil**

**Q1 Huw Lewis:** Will the Secretary for Economic Development comment on the role played by the Assembly in the development of the proposed new call centre in Merthyr Tydfil? (OAQ3108)

**The Secretary for Economic Development (Rhodri Morgan):** I can confirm that I have been in discussion with a company about a possible large call centre project in Merthyr Tydfil, which would be very welcome if it is successfully brought to a conclusion. The Welsh Development Agency, my officials and the Welsh Industrial Development Advisory Board have also been involved. Any dealings we have with potential inward investors are commercially confidential until such time as the company chooses to make an announcement, sometimes with support from us, but at their behest. Decisions on where to locate an investment are often finely balanced, sometimes in competition with other countries. The premature release of information before the company is ready can be extremely sensitive and seriously jeopardise our prospects of securing a project and can occasionally involve the breach of stock exchange rules and so forth.

**Huw Lewis:** Thank you for the work you have put into this project which, if delivered, would make an enormous difference and be welcome news for my constituency and a large part of the surrounding region. Would you agree that it is important that individual Assembly Members have a role in the development of this sort of project in their constituencies and in local economic regeneration in general? Will you describe any mechanisms that the Welsh Development Agency might have to ensure that constituency Assembly Members are involved in the work of the WDA at ground level to ensure this happens? I am thinking particularly of how we work through local

**C1 Huw Lewis:** A wnaiff yr Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd roi ei sylwadau ar rôl y Cynulliad yn natblygiad y ganolfan alwadau newydd arfaethedig ym Merthyr Tudful? (OAQ3108)

**Yr Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd (Rhodri Morgan):** Gallaf gadarnhau imi fod mewn trafodaeth gyda chwmni ynghylch prosiect mawr posibl i sefydlu canolfan alwadau ym Merthyr Tudful, y byddai croeso mawr iddi pe llwyddid i'w sicrhau. Bu Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, fy swyddogion i a Bwrdd Cynghori Datblygu Diwydiannol Cymru yn ymwneud â hyn hefyd. Mae unrhyw drafodaethau a gawn gyda darpar fuddsoddwyr oddi allan yn fasnachol gyfrinachol hyd nes dewisa'r cwmni wneud datganiad, weithiau gyda'n cefnogaeth ni, ond ar eu cais hwy. Yn aml bydd penderfyniadau ynghylch lleoliad buddsoddiad yn y fantol, a hynny weithiau mewn cystadleuaeth â gwledydd eraill. Gall rhyddhau gwybodaeth yn gynamserol cyn bod y cwmni'n barod fod yn fater sensitif iawn a pheryglu'n gobeithion o sicrhau prosiect, ac weithiau gall olygu torri rheolau'r gyfnewidfa stoc ac ati.

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch am y gwaith a roesoch i mewn i'r prosiect hwn a fydd, os y'i gwireddir, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth anferth ac yn newyddion ardderchog i'm hetholaeth i ac i ran fawr o'r ardal o'i chwmpas. A fydddech chi'n cytuno ei bod yn bwysig fod Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn cael rôl yn natblygiad y math yma o brosiect yn eu hetholaethau ac mewn adfywiad economaidd lleol yn gyffredinol? A wnewch chi ddisgrifio unrhyw fecanweithiau a fo gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru er mwyn sicrhau y caiff Aelodau Cynulliad lleol gyfranogi at waith yr Awdurdod Datblygu ar y llawr i sicrhau y digwydd hyn? Yr wyf yn meddwl yn enwedig am y modd y byddwn yn gweithio drwy bartneriaethau lleol Amcan 1

Objective 1 partnerships bearing in mind that confidentiality can be of primary importance.

**Rhodri Morgan:** I do not know what happened to the sound system then; it sounded as if Huw Lewis had joined the Stereophonics. The most important principle is the one I explained in answer to the original question—anything which might lead to the increased risk of a leak of the information about the company's name or the nature of the project would be prejudicial to our chances of securing inward investment projects. I am willing to consider the issue and the suggestion made by the Member for Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney, but when you widen the pool of people who know about a prospective project that is not yet confirmed, companies might be more reluctant to deal with us in Wales because there is more chance of a leak here than elsewhere. However responsible Assembly Members are, companies would not welcome the idea of anyone being involved other than the Cabinet member and WDA officials responsible. Members of the Welsh Industrial Development Advisory Board show absolute confidentiality at all times. When the project goes in front of a local authority for planning permission it must be discussed in public to a degree. So the issue is trying to keep the number of people who know about a project to a minimum until it is signed, sealed and delivered.

**Alun Cairns:** I am sure you would join me in welcoming the establishing of every call centre, which enables us to diversify into the service sector and move away from our over-dependence on manufacturing, or our former over-dependence on manufacturing. Is this the sort of project that may be at risk from now on because of the failure to negotiate the regional selective assistance map and reach agreement with the European Commission?

**Rhodri Morgan:** This project is not at risk because it was presented before 31 December. In theory, if a project was presented today for the first time we might have a problem, as would nine out of the 15 states of the European Union, which are in the same position, although unfortunately not our next door neighbour to the west, the Irish

gan gofio y gall cyfrinachedd fod yn hollbwysig.

**Rhodri Morgan:** Nid wyf yn gwybod beth ddigwyddodd i'r system sain yn awr; yr oedd yn swnio fel petai Huw Lewis wedi ymuno â'r Stereophonics. Yr egwyddor bwysicaf yw honno a esboniais wrth ateb y cwestiwn gwreiddiol—byddai unrhyw beth a allai arwain at gynyddu'r perygl o ollwng gwybodaeth am enw'r cwmni neu natur y prosiect yn rhagfarnu'n cyfle o sicrhau prosiectau buddsoddi o'r tu allan. Yr wyf yn fodlon ystyried y mater a'r awgrym a wnaed gan yr Aelod dros Ferthyr Tudful a'r Rhymni, ond pan ledwch y cylch o bobl sydd yn gwybod am brosiect posibl nad yw wedi'i gadarnhau eto, gallai cwmnïau fod yn fwy cyndyn o ddelio gyda ni yng Nghymru am fod mwy o siawns i wybodaeth gael ei gollwng allan yma nag mewn mannau eraill. Pa mor gyfrifol bynnag y bo Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ni fyddai cwmnïau'n croesawu'r syniad o gynnwys neb arall ar wahân i'r aelod Cabinet a'r swyddogion cyfrifol o fewn Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Mae aelodau Bwrdd Cyngori Datblygu Diwydiannol Cymru'n arddel cyfrinachedd llwyr bob amser. Pan ddaw'r prosiect ger bron awdurdod lleol am ganiatâd cynllunio mae'n rhaid ei drafod yn gyhoeddus i ryw raddau. Felly mater ydyw o geisio cadw nifer y bobl sydd yn gwybod am brosiect i'r isafswm hyd nes bo wedi'i lofnodi, ei selio a'i draddodi.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn ymuno â mi i groesawu sefydlu pob canolfan alwadau, sydd yn ein galluogi i arallgyfeirio i'r sector gwasanaeth a symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth ein gorddibyniaeth ar weithgynhyrchu, neu'n gorddibyniaeth a fu gynt ar weithgynhyrchu. Ai dyma'r math o brosiect a all fod mewn perygl o hyn allan oherwydd y methiant i negodi'r map cymorth dethol rhanbarthol a dod i gytundeb gyda'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd?

**Rhodri Morgan:** Nid oes perygl i'r prosiect hwn oherwydd fe'i cyflwynwyd cyn 31 Rhagfyr. Mewn egwyddor, pe cyflwynid prosiect heddiw am y tro cyntaf efallai y byddai gennym broblem, fel naw o 15 gwladwriaeth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd sydd yn yr un sefyllfa, er nad felly ein cymydog gorllewinol, Gweriniaeth Iwerddon,

Republic, because they have an agreed system up and running.

The latest information we have about the length of time before we get agreement of the new map from Europe is a bit more encouraging than it was when we were bemoaning the problems over the RSA map not being agreed by 31 December. Concerns were expressed about that before Christmas when the Secretary of State made the announcement on 22 December, the last day of the parliamentary session and a few days after the Assembly had adjourned for the Christmas recess. The latest thinking by the Department of Trade and Industry, based on its information of negotiations with the European Union, is that it may not be more than a few months before this problem is solved. That probably means that no projects will be prejudiced because we have enough in the pipeline from companies to which we made provisional offers before 31 December and which are therefore covered for RSA. By the time new projects are received, the RSA map will also have been received. One or two projects may fall between those two stools, but I am far more hopeful about this than I was before Christmas.

2:07 p.m.

**Val Feld:** I am sure that like me, Rhodri, you welcome the development of call centres in Wales, which provide important first steps into employment, particularly for young people. An important example in my constituency is Cable and Wireless. However, this type of work is different from what we have had before. Do you welcome the Health and Safety Executive's decision to examine standards in call centres? Do you agree that we should also try to encourage the management of call centres to support and facilitate the membership of trade unions among their staff?

**Rhodri Morgan:** I would agree with those principles. We cannot oblige a company to support membership of trade unions, but we would encourage it, partly because it is linked

ysywaeth, gan fod ganddynt hwy system gytunedig sydd ar ei thraed ac ar waith.

Mae'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf sydd gennym ynglŷn â'r amser a gymer inni gael cytundeb ar y map newydd gan Ewrop ychydig yn fwy gobeithiol nag yr ydoedd pan oeddem yn cwyno am y problemau a gaem wrth i'r map cymorth dethol rhanbarthol fod heb ei gytuno erbyn 31 Rhagfyr. Mynegwyd pryderon ynghylch hynny cyn y Nadolig pan wnaethpwyd y cyhoeddiad gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ar 22 Rhagfyr, diwrnod olaf y sesiwn seneddol ac ychydig ddyddiau wedi i'r Cynulliad gau am y gwyliau Nadolig. Y farn ddiweddaraf gan yr Adran Ddiwydiant a Masnach, ar sail eu gwybodaeth am negodiadau gyda'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, yw y bydd y broblem hon wedi'i datrys efallai o fewn ychydig fisoedd. Mae'n debyg y bydd hynny'n golygu na fydd unrhyw brosiectau wedi'u peryglu gan fod gennym ddigon ar y gweill gan gwmnïau a gafodd gynigion amodol gennym cyn 31 Rhagfyr ac sydd felly'n gymwys ar gyfer cymorth dethol rhanbarthol. Erbyn inni dderbyn prosiectau newydd, bydd y map cymorth dethol rhanbarthol wedi dod i law hefyd. Gallai un neu ddau o brosiectau gwmpo rhwng y ddwy stôl, ond yr wyf yn llawer mwy gobeithiol ynglŷn â hyn nag yr oeddwn cyn y Nadolig.

**Val Feld:** Fel fi, Rhodri, mae'n siŵr gen i eich bod chithau'n croesawu datblygiad canolfannau galwadau yng Nghymru, sydd yn darparu camau cyntaf pwysig i fyd gwaith, yn enwedig i bobl ifanc. Un enghraifft bwysig yn f'etholaeth i yw Cable and Wireless. Fodd bynnag, mae'r math yma o waith yn wahanol i'r hyn a fu gennym o'r blaen. Ydych chi'n croesawu penderfyniad y Gweithredwyr Iechyd a Diogelwch i archwilio safonau mewn canolfannau galwadau? Ydych chi'n cytuno y dylem hefyd geisio annog rheolwyr canolfannau galwadau i gefnogi a hyrwyddo aelodaeth o undebau llafur ymhlith eu staff?

**Rhodri Morgan:** Cytunaf â'r egwyddorion hynny. Ni allwn orfodi cwmni i gefnogi aelodaeth o undebau llafur, ond byddem yn annog hynny, yn rhannol oherwydd ei fod yn

with solving health and safety problems. People are aware of major problems with eye damage and repetitive strain injury from sitting for excessively long periods in front of screens and in chairs that are not ergonomic. The new world of call centres is linked with health and safety problems. Call centres come in all shapes and sizes in terms of the quality of employment offered. Wages range from barely above the minimum wage to between £25,000 and £30,000 a year for people doing distance repairs on aeroplane engines and so on. We would like the maximum number of call centres coming to Wales to be at the top end of the employment range but we cannot always guarantee that. It is a rapidly growing industry. Some say that it will not last for more than 10 to 20 years because of the internet's impact in taking over from call centres, perhaps by the year 2020. We will have to see whether that happens, but in 2000 they are welcome in Wales.

gysylltiedig â datrys problemau iechyd a diogelwch. Mae pobl yn ymwybodol o broblemau mawr gyda niwed i'r llygaid ac anaf straen ailadroddus wrth eistedd am gyfnodau rhy hir o flaen sgrin ac mewn cadeiriau anergonomaidd. Mae byd newydd canolfannau galwadau wedi'i gysylltu â phroblemau iechyd a diogelwch. Ceir canolfannau galwadau o bob maint a llun yn nhermau ansawdd y gyflogaeth a gynigir. Amrywia cyflogau o fymryn dros yr isafswm cyflog I rhwng £25,000 a £30,000 y flwyddyn i bobl sydd yn atgyweirio peiriannau awyrennau o bell a'u math. Hoffem i gymaint ag sydd yn bosibl o'r canolfannau galwadau a ddaw i Gymru fod ar ben uchaf yr amrediad cyflogaeth, ond ni allwn warantu hynny bob amser. Mae'n ddiwydiant sydd yn tyfu'n gyflym. Dywed rhai na wnaiff bara mwy na 10 i 20 mlynedd oherwydd effaith y rhyngwyd yn disodli canolfannau galwadau, efallai erbyn y flwyddyn 2020. Bydd yn rhaid inni weld a ddigwydd hynny ai peidio, ond yn 2000 mae croeso iddynt yng Nghymru.

### **Diogelu Swyddi yn Nelyn Safeguarding Jobs in Delyn**

**Q2 Alison Halford:** With reference to my previous question (OAQ2169VB), exactly which 130 and 447 jobs were created or safeguarded in Delyn in 1997-98 and 1998-99 respectively? (OAQ2982) [R]

**C2 Alison Halford:** Gan gyfeirio at fy nghwestiwn blaenorol (OAQ2169VB), pa 130 a 447 o swyddi yn union a grëwyd neu a ddiogelwyd yn Nelyn yn 1997-8 a 1998-9, yn y drefn honno? (OAQ2982) [R]

With your razor-sharp mind, you will instantly recall that I first asked that question on 24 November.

Gyda'ch meddwl miniog, fe gofiwch yn syth imi ofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw gyntaf ar 24 Tachwedd.

**Rhodri Morgan:** Due to the influenza I had over Christmas, which blasted my memory cells, I forgot about the previous answer. However, following a further study by my officials, I can tell you that the previous figure was incorrect. I said that 447 jobs were created or safeguarded in Delyn during 1998-99; the actual figure is 491. That brings the total to 621 jobs created or safeguarded over the period.

**Rhodri Morgan:** Oherwydd y fflw y bûm o dani dros y Nadolig, a ffrwydrodd gelloedd fy nghof, anghofiais am yr ateb blaenorol. Fodd bynnag, yn dilyn astudiaeth bellach gan fy swyddogion, gallaf ddweud wrthyh fod y ffigur blaenorol yn anghywir. Dywedais y cafodd 447 o swyddi eu creu neu eu diogelu yn Nelyn yn 1998-99; 491 yw'r ffigur mewn gwirionedd. Gwna hynny gyfanswm o 621 o swyddi a grëwyd neu a ddiogelwyd dros y cyfnod.

I will name the largest projects involved at a range of locations in Delyn: 140 jobs were created at Cartoinvest at Oakenholt, 80 jobs

Fe enwaf y prosiectau mwyaf dan sylw mewn amrediad o leoliadau yn Nelyn: crewyd 140 o swyddi yn Cartoinvest yn Oakenholt, crewyd

were created at Twin Chefs at Flint and 160 jobs were safeguarded at Castle Cement. During 1997-98, 100 jobs were safeguarded in the Mostyn area and 30 jobs were created at Dynochem in Mold. I can provide fuller details if required.

**Alison Halford:** I congratulate Rhodri, the economy and the Government of Wales for these excellent figures. It is very good news.

**Rhodri Morgan:** I am grateful for those warm thoughts from the Member for Delyn. It is fair to say that it is not only a matter of successful individual projects; the economy's underlying condition is certainly as good as it has been in the last 10 years. I am hopeful that 2000 will be a year of improving prosperity. The fears that many of us expressed, including myself, about whether we could narrowly avoid a recession in May and June when this Assembly first came into existence have now evaporated. I am not saying that Wales is a land flowing with milk and honey, but the year 2000 shows every prospect of being a prosperous year throughout Wales.

**The Presiding Officer:** Before I call Peter Rogers, I remind Assembly Members that he also is a Member for Delyn.

**Peter Rogers:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. I come from an area that does not have such a good record for creating work. That is Ynys Môn, which has one of the highest unemployment figures in Wales.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question is not about Ynys Môn, it is about Delyn.

**Peter Rogers:** I know, but it is about job creation in north Wales. There has been a recent mass exodus of workers from Ynys Môn, to Ireland in particular, which has now set up a recruitment agency in Ynys Môn. It is a serious matter for an area to lose many of its young people. We have an abundance of gas in the Irish sea. We have the Shell pipeline that goes from Ynys Môn to Ellesmere Port. A gas-fired power station would give a long-term future to Anglesey's biggest employer, Anglesey Aluminium, which provides quality jobs. We have to

80 o swyddi yn Twin Chefs yn y Fflint a diogelwyd 160 o swyddi yn Castle Cement. Yn ystod 1997-98, diogelwyd 100 o swyddi yn ardal Mostyn a chrëwyd 30 o swyddi yn Dynochem yn yr Wyddgrug. Gallaf roi manylion llawnach os oes eisiau.

**Alison Halford:** Llongyfarchiadau i Rhodri, yr economi a Llywodraeth Cymru ar y ffigyrau ardderchog hynny. Mae'n newyddion da iawn.

**Rhodri Morgan:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y meddyliau cynnes hynny gan yr Aelod dros Ddelyn. Teg dweud nad mater o brosiectau unigol llwyddiannus yn unig ydyw; mae cyflwr gwaelodol yr economi yn sicr gystal ag y bu yn y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Yr wyf yn obeithiol y bydd 2000 yn flwyddyn o ffyniant cynyddol. Bellach diflannodd yr ofnau a fynegwyd gan lawer ohonom, a minnau yn eu plith, pan ddaeth y Cynulliad hwn i fodolaeth ym mis Mai a Mehefin, ynghylch a allem osgoi dirwasgiad o drwch blewyn. Nid dweud yr wyf fod Cymru'n wlad y llaeth a'r mêl, ond mae pob argoel y bydd y flwyddyn 2000 yn flwyddyn newydd lewyrchus drwy Gymru gyfan.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn imi alw Peter Rogers, hoffwn atgoffa Aelodau'r Cynulliad ei fod yntau'n Aelod dros Ddelyn hefyd.

**Peter Rogers:** Diolch, Llywydd. Yr wyf yn hanu o ardal sydd heb record gystal am greu gwaith, sef Ynys Môn, sydd â ffigyrau diweithdra ymhlith yr uchaf yng Nghymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cwestiwn am Ddelyn yw hwn, nid Ynys Môn.

**Peter Rogers:** Mi wn i, ond mae a wnelo â chreu gwaith yng ngogledd Cymru. Bu i lu o weithwyr adael Ynys Môn yn ddiweddar, a hynny i Iwerddon yn arbennig, gwlad sydd bellach wedi sefydlu asiantaeth recriwtio yn Ynys Môn. Mae'n fater difrifol i ardal golli llawer o'i phobl ifanc. Mae gennym ddigonedd o nwy ym môr Iwerddon. Mae gennym y bibell Shell sydd yn mynd o Ynys Môn i Ellesmere Port. Byddai pwerdy nwy'n rhoi dyfodol tymor-hir i gyflogwr mwyaf yr Ynys, sef Alwminiwm Môn, sydd yn darparu swyddi o safon. Rhaid inni gofio—

remember—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I would like a question, not a speech.

**Peter Rogers:** Is Rhodri aware of the predictions that we could create 4,000 jobs in Ynys Môn if investment in a gas-fired power station was secured, which would stop the exodus of young people from this area?

**Rhodri Morgan:** I can certainly confirm that the pipeline which connects the constituency of Delyn and Ynys Môn is one that is full of gas. [*Laughter.*] It is true that the further west you go in Wales, the greater the economic difficulties. That is why the WDA has been given targets. The WDA exceeds the targets at the moment, which are the percentage of jobs to be created or safeguarded, and the percentage of investments that it is connected with in terms of pump priming. It is meeting targets higher than those set for it for the west Wales and Valleys area—roughly the Objective 1 area.

The gas-fired powered station is a matter for the Department of Trade and Industry, although we are lobbying for it. However, as regards the previously thought dependency of the jobs at Anglesey Aluminium on securing that power station, that problem has now been deferred for five years by the deal that has now been struck with British Energy—formerly British Nuclear Fuels Limited. We are grateful for the efforts of other Government departments in securing that deal for reasonably priced electricity, which will ensure that Anglesey Aluminium is not put out of business. The contract runs from 2000 to 2005. What happens after 2005 is another matter. By then we will need to have the gas-fired power station to protect the jobs in Anglesey Aluminium.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Hoffwn gael cwestiwn, nid araith.

**Peter Rogers:** A yw Rhodri'n ymwybodol o'r darogan y gallem greu 4,000 o swyddi ym Môn pe gellid sicrhau buddsoddiad mewn pwerdy nwy, a fyddai'n atal y llif pobl ifanc allan o'r ardal?

**Rhodri Morgan:** Yn sicr gallaf gadarnhau fod y bibell sydd yn cysylltu etholaeth Delyn ac Ynys Môn yn un sydd yn llawn o nwy. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae'n wir po fwyaf tua'r gorllewin yr ewch chi yng Nghymru, mwyaf yw'r anawsterau economaidd. Dyna pam y gosodwyd targedau i'r Awdurdod Datblygu. Ar hyn o bryd mae'r Awdurdod yn curo'r targedau, sef y ganran o swyddi sydd i'w creu neu eu diogelu, a'r ganran o fuddsoddiadau y mae'n gysylltiedig â hwy yn nhermau arian cychwyn. Mae'n cwrdd â thargedau uwch na'r rhai a osodwyd iddo ar gyfer ardal y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd—sef yr ardal Amcan 1 yn fras.

Mater i'r Adran Ddiwydiant a Masnach yw'r pwerdy nwy, er ein bod ni'n lobbïo drosto. Fodd bynnag, o safbwynt y gred flaenorol fod y swyddi yn Alwminiwm Môn yn dibynnu ar sicrhau'r pwerdy hwnnw, mae'r broblem honno bellach wedi'i gohirio am bum mlynedd drwy'r fargen sydd wedi'i tharo gyda British Energy—British Nuclear Fuels Limited gynt. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar am ymdrechion adrannau eraill o'r Llywodraeth i sicrhau'r fargen honno i gael trydan am bris rhesymol, a fydd yn sicrhau na fydd Alwminiwm Môn yn mynd allan o fusnes. Mae'r contract hwnnw'n rhedeg o 2000 i 2005. Mater arall yw beth a ddigwydd ar ôl 2005. Erbyn hynny bydd arnom ni angen y pwerdy nwy er mwyn gwarchod y swyddi yn Alwminiwm Môn.

### **Cyhoeddi Gwybodaeth am Amcan 1 Publishing Information about Objective 1**

**Q3 Brian Hancock:** When will any information be published in newspapers or on the web for people/organisations/partnerships with potential projects for Objective 1 funding? (OAQ3102) [R]

**C3 Brian Hancock:** Pryd fydd unrhyw wybodaeth yn cael ei chyhoeddi mewn papurau newydd neu ar y we i bobl/cyrff/partneriaethau a chanddynt brosiectau posibl ar gyfer derbyn cyllid Amcan 1? (OAQ3102) [R]



**Rhodri Morgan:** In the period up to 1 April and beyond, information on the Objective 1 programme will be provided in ways tailored to the needs of the different sectors wishing to use Objective 1 funds. These will include the use of a hotline, websites and newsletters. This should not be confused with the information about negotiations with Europe that we dealt with in the emergency question yesterday.

**Brian Hancock:** It is interesting that although today is the nineteenth day of the period that we could be spending Objective 1 funds, we are still looking for information. What role is envisaged for the Wales European Centre in relation to the urgent need to get information to the communities of west Wales and the Valleys in the Objective 1 areas, on how to access European funds?

2:17 p.m.

**Rhodri Morgan:** The Wales European Centre has shareholders, including local authorities, universities, training and enterprise councils, voluntary agencies, and so on, which cover west Wales and the Valleys. They invested in setting up the Wales European Centre to obtain the earliest possible information on any changes or wrinkles in the regulations so that they might be able to tailor applications to fit in. That refers not only to Objective 1, but to anything and everything that might get you any kind of grant assistance or contract from Europe. That is the purpose of the Wales European Centre. The Assembly encourages the centre, and hopes that its resources to enable this kind of flow of information to potential applicants for all manner of contact, grant or contract assistance from Europe, will be improved in the future.

**Nick Bourne:** We know that the single programming document presentation was inept and that there is a major problem on match funds. We know that from people in your own party. Given that we are in this serious position, can we at least investigate how this Objective 1 project can be properly implemented? We spent £2 million—probably quite properly—advertising the Assembly elections. Should we not be doing

**Rhodri Morgan:** Yn y cyfnod hyd at 1 Ebrill ac wedyn, darperir gwybodaeth am y rhaglen Amcan 1 mewn ffyrdd fydd yn addas i anghenion y gwahanol sectorau fydd yn dymuno defnyddio cyllid Amcan 1. Bydd y rhain yn cynnwys defnyddio llinell boeth, gwefannau a newyddlenni. Ni ddylid cymysgu hyn â'r wybodaeth ynghylch negodi ag Ewrop, a drafodwyd gennym yn y cwestiwn brys ddoe.

**Brian Hancock:** Mae'n ddi-ddorol ein bod ni heddiw, bedwar diwrnod ar bymtheg i mewn i'r cyfnod pryd y gallem fod yn gwario arian Amcan 1, yn dal i chwilio am wybodaeth. Pa rôl a ragwelir i Ganolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru mewn perthynas â'r angen brys i gael gwybodaeth i gymunedau'r gorllewin a'r Cymoedd sydd yn yr ardaloedd Amcan 1, ynghylch sut i gael gafael ar arian Ewrop?

**Rhodri Morgan:** Mae gan Ganolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru gyfranddalwyr, yn cynnwys awdurdodau lleol, prifysgolion, canolfannau hyfforddi a menter, asiantaethau gwirfoddol, ac ati, sydd yn cynrychioli'r gorllewin a'r Cymoedd. Buddsoddodd y rhain yn sefydliad Canolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru er mwyn cael y wybodaeth gynharaf bosibl ar unrhyw newidiadau neu grychau yn y rheoliadau fel y gallent deilwrio ceisiadau i ffitio i mewn. Mae hynny'n wir nid yn unig am Amcan 1, ond am unrhyw beth a phopeth a allai ddenu unrhyw fath o gymorth grant neu gontract o Ewrop. Dyna bwrpas Canolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru. Mae'r Cynulliad yn hybu'r ganolfan, ac yn gobeithio y caiff ei hadnoddau i alluogi'r math yma o lif gwybodaeth i ddarpar ymgeiswyr am bob math o gymorth cyswllt, grant neu gontract o Ewrop, eu gwella yn y dyfodol.

**Nick Bourne:** Gwyddom fod cyflwyniad y ddogfen raglennu sengl yn ddi-glem a bod problem fawr gydag arian cyfatebol. Gwyddom hynny gan bobl yn eich plaid chi. A derbyn ein bod ni yn y sefyllfa ddifrifol hon, allwn ni o leiaf ymchwilio sut y gellir gweithredu'r prosiect Amcan 1 yma'n iawn? Gwariwyd £2 filiwn gennym—a hynny'n ddigon priodol, mae'n debyg—ar hysbysebu etholiadau'r Cynulliad. Oni ddylem fod yn

something similar to let people know how they can access Objective 1 funds? In particular, should we not be giving this project over to a group of businessmen or businesswomen, such as John Harvey-Jones and Angela Gidden, and take it out of the party political arena? We are getting bogged down in political correctness in the Committee. It is high time that we ensured that the private sector was able to access these funds. Will you act to ensure that we get the implementation right at least, and will you do so swiftly to ensure that that can happen now?

**Rhodri Morgan:** If Nick's suggestion was accepted by the Assembly, it would be thrown straight back in his face by the European Commission. They would not accept a programme monitoring committee that did not abide by certain principles of equal opportunities, which he seems to find objectionable but which are obligatory if you want to get any money out of Europe. The idea is a complete nonsense. It is not an option. I would not entertain it. If he were in charge and proposed that, it would be thrown straight back. Not a penny would flow from Europe on the basis that he has just mentioned, as highly as I regard both Sir John Harvey-Jones and Angela Gidden.

As regards the practicalities, we are about to appoint a chief executive. Good progress is being made there and we hope that the appointment will be in place in February. The expenditure that has been allocated for the administration of the funds—Nick mentioned that £2 million was spent on the Welsh Assembly elections information campaign—is £3 million a year. It will not be cheap to implement such large programmes as we are discussing. It is a massive administrative expenditure, although of course it is very good if it helps to bring in up to £400 million in European grants every year for the next seven years. I believe that £3 million for £400 million is a good bargain. Nevertheless, £3 million is much more than the £2 million to which Nick referred.

**Michael German:** One criticism that came out of the European Commission's report was that it was not clear how we would get private sector engagement. The Economic

gwneud rhywbeth tebyg i adael i bobl wybod sut y gallant gael arian Amcan 1? Yn arbennig, oni ddylem fod yn trosglwyddo'r prosiect hwn i grŵp o ddynion busnes, neu ferched busnes, fel John Harvey-Jones ac Angela Gidden, a'i dynnu allan o arena gwleidyddiaeth plaid? Yr ydym yn cael ein llethu gan gywirdeb gwleidyddol yn y Pwyllgor. Mae'n hen bryd inni sicrhau y gall y sector preifat fynd at yr arian hyn. A wnewch chi weithredu i sicrhau y gweithredir y cynllun yn iawn, o leiaf, ac a wnewch chi hynny'n fuan er mwyn sicrhau y gall hynny ddigwydd yn awr?

**Rhodri Morgan:** Petai'r Cynulliad yn derbyn awgrym Nick, byddai'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn ei daflu'n ôl yn ei wyneb yn syth. Ni fyddent hwy'n derbyn pwyllgor monitro rhaglen nad oedd yn glynu wrth rai egwyddorion megis cyfle cyfartal, sydd, fe ymddengys, yn ffiaidd yn ei olwg ef ond sydd yn ofynnol os ydych am gael unrhyw arian allan o Ewrop. Dwli llwyr yw'r syniad. Nid yw'n opsiwn. Ni fyddwn i'n ei ystyried. Petai ef wrth y llyw ac yn cynnig hynny, fe gâi ei daflu'n ôl yn syth. Ni fyddai'r un geiniog yn llifo o Ewrop ar y sail y mae ef newydd ei grybwyll, er cymaint yr wyf yn parchu Syr John Harvey-Jones ac Angela Gidden ill dau.

O ran y manylion ymarferol, yr ydym ar fin penodi prif weithredwr. Mae camau cadarnhaol yn cael eu cymryd yn hynny o beth a gobeithiwn gael penodiad ym mis Chwefror. Y gwariant a glustnodwyd ar gyfer gweinyddu'r cyllid—soniodd Nick y gwariwyd £2 filiwn ar ymgyrch hysbysrwydd etholiadau'r Cynulliad—yw £3 miliwn y flwyddyn. Ni fydd yn rhad gweithredu rhaglenni mor fawr ag sydd dan drafodaeth. Mae'n wariant gweinyddol enfawr, er ei fod wrth gwrs yn dda iawn os bydd yn helpu i ddod â hyd at £400 miliwn o grantiau Ewropeaidd i mewn bob blwyddyn am y saith mlynedd nesaf. Mae £3 miliwn am £400 miliwn yn fargen dda, yn fy nhyb i. Fodd bynnag, mae £3 miliwn yn llawer mwy na'r £2 filiwn a grybwyllwyd gan Nick.

**Michael German:** Un feirniadaeth a ddaeth allan o adroddiad y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd oedd nad ydoedd yn glir sut y byddem yn tynnu'r sector preifat i mewn. Cynigiodd y

Development Committee offered the private sector an opportunity to set up its own technical assistance to disperse information. Given the frustrations of the Economic Development Committee—and the Assembly as a whole—because of the lack of information given to people to run the projects, when will we have the pieces of paper that were promised to us to distribute to the people of Wales? Secondly, what response have you received from the private sector and has that offer been formally made to them?

**Rhodri Morgan:** We hope that the newsletter will be ready shortly. I have seen it in mock-up full colour gloss this morning. It will be converted into the 30,000 print run that we wish to see, as soon as the printing is sorted out. That problem will be solved soon.

On the wider issues of private sector involvement, and its putting ideas to us, I believe that it is slightly premature. I am not sure that the flow of information is coming in to us in the way that Mike describes—perhaps I misunderstand his question. However, the European Commission set out its stall on 19 December, seven weeks into the five-month negotiating period. We set out our stall on 3 November and negotiations are proceeding. The First Secretary and I will be in Brussels the week after next. We are meeting Monsieur Barnier, the Regional Policy Commissioner. I am sure we can make some progress at that meeting. We hope that the European Commission will formally respond, either by the end of January or early February. There will then be a further two months of negotiation during February and March before we, I hope and trust, finalise successfully the negotiations by 1 April.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yng ngoleuni'r atebion y mae Rhodri wedi eu rhoi i'r Cynulliad hyd yn hyn, a ddywed wrthym gydag unrhyw sicrwydd ym mha fis eleni y bydd ceisiadau yn cael eu derbyn ar gyfer Amcan 1?

**Rhodri Morgan:** Ebrill.

Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd gyfle i'r sector preifat sefydlu'i wasanaeth cymorth technegol ei hun i ledaenu gwybodaeth. Yn wyneb rhwystredigaethau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd—a'r Cynulliad yn gyffredinol—oherwydd y diffyg gwybodaeth a roddir i bobl i redeg y prosiectau, pa bryd y cawn ni'r darnau papur a addawyd inni i'w dosbarthu i bobl Cymru? Yn ail, pa ymateb a gawsoch gan y sector preifat ac a wnaethpwyd y cynnig hwnnw iddynt yn ffurfiol?

**Rhodri Morgan:** Yr ydym yn gobeithio y bydd y newyddlen yn barod cyn hir. Yr wyf wedi gweld y patrwm sgleiniog llawn lliw y bore yma. Caiff 30,000 copi eu hargraffu yn unol â'n dymuniad cyn gynted ag y bydd yr argraffu wedi'i setlo. Caiff y broblem honno ei datrys yn fuan.

Ar gwestiwn ehangach cyfranogiad y sector preifat, a'r sector hwnnw'n cyflwyno syniadau inni, mae hynny ychydig yn gynamserol i'm tyb i. Nid wyf yn sicr bod y llif gwybodaeth yn dod i mewn atom yn y modd a ddisgrifiwyd gan Mike—efallai imi gamddeall ei gwestiwn. Fodd bynnag, cyhoeddodd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ei safbwynt ar 19 Rhagfyr, saith wythnos i mewn i'r cyfnod negodi pum mis. Cyhoeddassom ni ein safbwynt ni ar 3 Tachwedd ac mae negodi'n mynd rhagddo. Bydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd a mi ym Mrwsel yr wythnos ar ôl nesaf. Byddwn yn cyfarfod â Monsieur Barnier, y Comisiynydd Polisi Rhanbarthol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn gamu ymlaen yn y cyfarfod hwnnw. Gobeithiwn gael ymateb ffurfiol gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, un ai erbyn diwedd Ionawr neu'n gynnar ym mis Chwefror. Wedyn bydd dau fis pellach o negodi yn ystod Chwefror a Mawrth cyn i ni, gobeithiaf a hyderaf, derfynu'r negodi'n llwyddiannus erbyn 1 Ebrill.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** In the light of the answers that Rhodri has given to the Assembly so far, will he tell us with any certainty in which month this year will Objective 1 applications be accepted?

**Rhodri Morgan:** April.

## Cwestiynau i'r Ysgrifennydd Cyllid Questions to the Finance Secretary

### Grant Bloc Cymreig (Adnoddau Ychwanegol) Welsh Block Grant (Additional Resources)

**Q1 Peter Black:** What additional resources have been provided from the UK Government as part of the Welsh block grant to meet additional costs arising from new legislation and statutes for 2000-01? (OAQ2993)

**The Finance Secretary (Edwina Hart):** The financial implications for the Assembly of all Westminster legislation are discussed with the relevant Whitehall department. This is a requirement of the concordats between the Assembly and Government departments. It is also contained in the statement of funding policy published by the Treasury in March 1999. Each measure is discussed on a case-by-case basis and there are ongoing discussions in several instances. We must also recognise that much Westminster legislation is permissive and the Assembly has a choice as to whether it wishes to introduce it in Wales and to what extent. These issues are, of course, taken into account in this Chamber's debates and in the annual budget planning round.

**Peter Black:** Thank you for that answer. I have asked this question on several occasions and have had difficulty obtaining a straight answer. It is indicative of the quality of information that is available to financial spokespeople as part of the budget round. Will Edwina Hart endeavour to improve the quality of that information, so that we can access the information needed to respond to the budget in a meaningful way during future budget rounds?

**Edwina Hart:** I have taken on board many of the comments that have been made to me by the financial spokespeople of the various parties, regarding the transparency of the budget process. I recognise that with the amount of legislation coming from Westminster and the implications it has in Wales it would be useful, perhaps, to have an early indication of where the costs fall in Wales. Obviously some money is not transferred to us in that respect. Currently, I

**C1 Peter Black:** Pa adnoddau ychwanegol sydd wedi'u darparu gan Lywodraeth y DU fel rhan o'r grant bloc Cymreig i dalu'r costau ychwanegol sydd yn deillio o ddeddfwriaeth a statudau newydd ar gyfer 2000-01? (OAQ2993)

**Yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Caiff goblygiadau ariannol holl ddeddfwriaeth San Steffan ar y Cynulliad eu trafod gyda'r adran berthnasol yn Whitehall. Mae hyn yn ofynnol dan y concordatiau rhwng adrannau'r Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad. Fe'i gwelir hefyd yn y datganiad ar bolisi cyllido a gyhoeddodd y Trysorlys ym mis Mawrth 1999. Caiff pob mesur ei drafod fesul un ac mae sawl enghraifft o drafodaethau parhaol. Rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd bod llawer o ddeddfwriaeth San Steffan yn oddefol a gall y Cynulliad ddewis a yw am ei chyflwyno yng Nghymru ai peidio, ac i ba raddau. Wrth reswm, ystyrir y materion hyn yn nadleuon y Siambr ac yn y rownd cynllunio cyllideb flynyddol.

**Peter Black:** Diolch ichi am eich ateb. Yr wyf wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwn sawl tro o'r blaen ac wedi methu â chael ateb syml. Mae hyn yn dangos beth yw ansawdd y wybodaeth sydd ar gael i lefarwyr ariannol fel rhan o'r rownd gyllideb. A wnaiff Edwina Hart fentro i godi safon y wybodaeth honno, fel ein bod yn gallu cael gafael ar y wybodaeth angenrheidiol i ymateb i'r gyllideb mewn modd ystyrion yn ystod rowndiau cyllideb y dyfodol?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf wedi derbyn nifer o'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan lefarwyr ariannol yr amrywiol bleidiau, ynghylch tryloywder proses y gyllideb. Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod swmp y ddeddfwriaeth sydd yn ein cyrraedd o San Steffan a'i goblygiadau yng Nghymru yn golygu y byddai'n ddefnyddiol cael syniad yn fuan ynghylch ble fydd y costau yn disgyn yng Nghymru. Yn amlwg, ni chaiff peth arian ei drosglwyddo i ni yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Ar hyn o bryd, yr

have about 22 legislative areas on which I have some concerns. Some money will be available outside the block, there is other money for which I have already made provision. However, I will be delighted to look at that area, because that will become increasingly important as the Assembly develops, in terms of what has happened during the last century in Westminster and the impact it has on our finances in Wales.

**Phil Williams:** To meet those 22 measures, to some extent out of a budget that was essentially fixed over a year ago, have you any estimate of what the total implication will be? What sort of sums are we talking about? Also, how many of them have already been covered by our existing block?

**Edwina Hart:** I will give an indication of some of the legislation, Phil, and I would be pleased at a later stage, if you wish, to place something in the Library for Members, to indicate where we are going in some of these areas. Take, for instance, the Food Standards Agency. That has a direct impact in Wales. Obviously, I have made provision in the Assembly's budget for that. However, there are other areas, for instance, the Deregulation (Weights and Measures) Order 1999 that has an impact on local authorities. That money comes from the Department of Trade and Industry. If this is the type of financial information which would interest you as Assembly Members, I would be delighted to keep you appraised regularly.

**Nick Bourne:** I ask a simple question on the most important issue facing Wales. Could you tell us what extra funds you are seeking from the Treasury over and above the Barnett formula for Objective 1 for this first year?

2:27 p.m.

**Edwina Hart:** I make it clear, as I have on every other occasion, that the necessary funds are available to deal with the European structural funds issue in the first year. However, I have also made it clear to the

wyf yn pryderu am oddeutu 22 maes deddfwriaethol. Bydd rhywfaint o arian ar gael y tu allan i'r bloc, yr wyf eisoes wedi darparu ar gyfer symiau eraill o arian. Fodd bynnag, byddaf wrth fy modd i edrych ar y maes hwnnw, gan y bydd yn gynyddol bwysig wrth i'r Cynulliad ddatblygu, yn nhermau yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn ystod y ganrif ddiwethaf yn San Steffan a'r effaith a gaiff hynny ar ein cyllid yng Nghymru.

**Phil Williams:** I fodloni'r 22 mesur hynny, i ryw raddau allan o gyllideb a bennwyd, i bob pwrpas, dros flwyddyn yn ôl, a oes gennych chi unrhyw amcangyfrif o faint fydd cyfanswm y goblygiadau? Pa fath o gyfansymiau yr ydym ni'n sôn amdanynt? Hefyd, faint ohonynt sydd wedi'u cynnwys yn y bloc sydd gennym eisoes?

**Edwina Hart:** Amlinellaf beth o'r ddeddfwriaeth, Phil, a buaswn yn falch, yn hwyrach ymlaen, os dymunwch chi, o roi rhywbeth yn Llyfrgell yr Aelodau, i ddangos lle yr ydym yn mynd gyda golwg ar rai o'r meysydd hyn. Meddyliwch, er enghraifft, am yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd. Mae ganddi effaith uniongyrchol ar Gymru. Yn amlwg yr wyf wedi darparu ar gyfer hynny yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai meysydd eraill, er enghraifft, y Gorchymyn Dadreoli (Pwysau a Mesur) 1999 sydd yn effeithio ar awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r arian hwnnw yn dod o'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant. Os mai dyma'r math o wybodaeth ariannol sydd o ddiddordeb i chi fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, buaswn wrth fy modd yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i chi yn rheolaidd.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn gofyn cwestiwn syml ar y mater pwysicaf sydd yn wynebu Cymru. A allwch chi ddweud wrthym pa gronfeydd ychwanegol a ydych chi'n eu ceisio gan y Trysorlys uwchlaw fformwla Barnett ar gyfer Amcan 1 ar gyfer y flwyddyn gyntaf hon?

**Edwina Hart:** Egluraf, fel yr wyf wedi ei wneud bob tro arall, bod y cronfeydd angenrheidiol ar gael i ddelio â mater cronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop yn y flwyddyn gyntaf. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf hefyd wedi

Assembly on many occasions that I have had discussions with Treasury officials and elsewhere within Government about the nature of the settlement that we need in the spending review to ensure that we maximise the opportunities in Wales. I continue with those discussions, which are broad based.

I accept what the Assembly has said, that you want this dealt with outside the Welsh block. You want sufficient additional funding to be allocated so that we can have the full benefit of Objective 1. I am attempting to do that through the spending review process. I assure you that it is in nobody's interest, least of all this Government's, least of all Wales's, that I should fail in that attempt. I should be allowed to continue to negotiate to try and get what I can out of the spending review for the benefit of the people of Wales.

egluro i'r Cynulliad, sawl tro yn y gorffennol, fy mod wedi cael trafodaethau gyda swyddogion y Trysorlys a manau eraill o fewn y Llywodraeth ynghylch natur y setliad sydd ei angen arnom yn yr arolwg gwariant i sicrhau ein bod yn gallu cael cymaint o gyfleoedd yng Nghymru ag y bo modd. Yr wyf yn parhau gyda'r trafodaethau hyn, sydd yn rhai eang iawn.

Yr wyf yn derbyn yr hyn mae'r Cynulliad wedi ei ddweud, eich bod chi eisiau delio â hyn y tu allan i'r bloc Cymreig. Yr ydych eisiau gweld dyrannu digon o gyllid ychwanegol fel ein bod yn gallu manteisio'n llawn ar Amcan 1. Yr wyf yn ceisio gwneud hynny drwy'r broses arolwg gwariant. Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau na fyddai o fudd i neb, yn enwedig y Llywodraeth hon a Chymru, petai fy ymdrechion yn methu. Dylwn gael parhau â'm trafodaethau i geisio cael cymaint ag y gallaf o'r arolwg gwariant er budd pobl Cymru.

### Planhigyn y Cynulliad Assembly Plant

**Q2 David Davies:** What was the estimated cost of the large plant that obscured the back exit to the Assembly building for part of December? (OAQ2995)

It now appears to be doing a guided tour of the building.

**Edwina Hart:** I rather charitably thought, and told officials, that this question was about plant and machinery. I made various inquiries about the nature of the plant and machinery that was located at the rear of the building. However, my officials said that they thought the question was about a potted plant. I thought surely not. I did not think that anybody would want to ask me a question about the location of a potted plant. There is no cost to the National Assembly for Wales, as this plant was inherited from the previous occupants of the building. [*Laughter.*]

**David Davies:** Does the Finance Secretary share my dismay that so many Members of this Chamber seem to think that matters of public expenditure are to be laughed at? She may recall that a similar question showed that

**C2 David Davies:** Tua faint oedd cost y planhigyn mawr a oedd yn sefyll o flaen y ffordd allan yng nghefn adeilad y Cynulliad am ran o fis Rhagfyr? (OAQ2995)

Mae'n ymddangos ei fod ar daith o gylch yr adeilad erbyn hyn.

**Edwina Hart:** Tybiais, gan feddwl y gorau, a dywedais wrth swyddogion mai cyfeirio at offer a pheiriannau oedd y gair 'plant' yn y cwestiwn hwn. Bûm yn holi ynghylch natur yr offer a'r peiriannau a oedd y tu allan i'r adeilad. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd fy swyddogion eu bod yn meddwl mai cwestiwn am blanhigyn oedd hwn. Go brin, meddyliais. Nid oeddwn yn meddwl y byddai neb eisiau gofyn cwestiwn imi ynghylch lleoliad planhigyn. Nid yw'n costio dim i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, oherwydd etifeddwyd y planhigyn hwn oddi wrth breswylwyr blaenorol yr adeilad. [*Chwerthin.*]

**David Davies:** A yw'r Ysgrifennydd Cyllid yr un mor siomedig â mi fod cymaint o Aelodau'r Siambr hon yn meddwl bod materion gwariant cyhoeddus yn destun chwerthin? Efallai ei bod yn cofio bod

£32,000 has been wasted on curtains for the Assembly building—curtains which do not even close. The First Secretary's official spokesman apparently complained that this question cost £180. Yes, that is an issue. However, the issue should be that there should be a reduction in the cost of answering straightforward questions such as this. That reduction should be achieved, not by discouraging Members from exercising their right to challenge the Executive, but by instituting the same sort of 2 per cent efficiency savings year on year that her department expects from local authorities and police authorities.

**Edwina Hart:** Members are entitled to ask the questions they wish and I have always made that clear. However, there is a great deal of public interest in the cost. I have been asked for and have placed details about the cost of answering questions in the Members' Library. That calculation has to be global; obviously some questions are quicker to answer than others. It is a global estimate of the cost of a certain number of questions on a certain day. Those costs are under-estimated in my opinion. They do not take into account the time that I take to go through them in my preparation—my hourly rate—and the hourly rate of the officials that come to see me when I go through them and suggest that we need further information. I accept that all Members have the right to ask questions. That is what democracy and accountability is about. It is also what devolution is about—it is a pity that you did not support that previously.

cwestiwn tebyg wedi dangos bod £32,000 wedi ei wastraffu ar lenni i adeilad y Cynulliad—llenni nad ydynt yn cau hyd yn oed. Yn ôl pob sôn, cwynodd llefarydd swyddogol y Prif Ysgrifennydd bod y cwestiwn hwn wedi costio £180. Ydy, mae hynny yn bwynt. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt yw y dylai cost ateb cwestiynau syml fel hwn gael ei gostwng. Dylid cyflawni'r gostyngiad hwnnw, nid drwy annog Aelodau i beidio â defnyddio'u hawl i herio'r Weithrediaeth, ond drwy weithredu yr un math o gynilion effeithlonrwydd 2 y cant, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn y mae ei hadran yn eu disgwyl gan awdurdodau lleol ac awdurdodau heddlu.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae gan Aelodau'r hawl i ofyn y cwestiwn y maent yn dymuno ei gyflwyno ac yr wyf bob tro wedi egluro hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae gan y cyhoedd ddiddordeb mawr yn y gost. Gofynnwyd imi roi manylion y gost o ateb cwestiynau yn Llyfrgell yr Aelodau, ac yr wyf wedi gwneud hynny. Rhaid i'r cyfrifo fod yn gyffredinol; yn amlwg, gellir ateb rhai cwestiynau yn gynt nag eraill. Amcangyfrif gyffredinol o'r gost ydyw drwy edrych ar nifer benodol o gwestiynau ar ddiwrnod penodol. Yn fy marn i, mae'r amcangyfrif yn rhy isel. Nid ydynt yn ystyried yr amser a dreulir wrth imi fynd trwyddynt tra'n paratoi—tâl yn ôl yr awr—a thâl fy swyddogion yn ôl yr awr pan ddônt i fy ngweld pan fyddaf yn mynd trwyddynt ac yn awgrymu bod angen rhagor o wybodaeth arnom. Yr wyf yn derbyn fod gan bob Aelod yr hawl i ofyn cwestiynau. Dyna hanfod democratiaeth ac atebolrwydd. Dyna hanfod datganoli hefyd—mae'n bechod nad oeddech yn cefnogi hynny yn gynt.

### **Cyllideb 2000-01 (Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol) 2000-01 Budget (Secretary for Health and Social Services)**

**Q3 Helen Mary Jones:** What representation has the Finance Secretary received from the Secretary for Health and Social Services regarding the 2000-01 budget? (OAQ3079)

**Edwina Hart:** I have an ongoing dialogue with the Secretary for Health and Social Services on budgetary matters.

**C3 Helen Mary Jones:** Pa sylwadau a gafodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cyllid gan yr Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynghlŷn â chyllideb 2000-01? (OAQ3079)

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn cael trafodaethau parhaus gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynghylch materion cyllidebol.

**Helen Mary Jones:** What further discussion have you had during the last few days about the provision needed to ensure that health providers in Wales can give nurses the pay rise that they deserve without cutting other areas of expenditure, particularly new developments, and will those discussions extend to your colleagues in the Treasury?

**Edwina Hart:** I am in favour of adhering to the settlement agreements that have been reached for nurses and doctors. That sends out an important message that we value them. I was consulted about that decision and made my views known. I will have a series of discussions this week, with a further meeting tomorrow, to consider the issues and pressures that exist in the health service.

I am conscious of the Assembly's views and the concerns expressed in the Chamber yesterday about health and budgetary matters and the moneys available. I am also conscious that we possibly need to look differently at how health budgets are structured and at how they reflect the needs of the various communities in Wales. This is an ongoing issue. If I have anything to say about health matters in terms of budget and issues that are of direct concern to Jane Hutt and myself, I will make an announcement in the Assembly. It is clear that representations have been made by Parliamentary colleagues, Assembly Members and others to Members of Parliament about the pressures in the health service and the need to consider that constructively in the spending review. This is also an issue over the border, not only in Wales. These discussions are in hand. I am anxious to find a way forward to get the health service balances correct, to make sure that money is targeted at areas of need and to move on with the discussion to try to raise our health standards and expenditure to European levels. When talking of European levels we all recognise that Europe has a different approach in some areas of health, such as contribution. These discussions are ongoing and will take place this week.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Pa drafodaethau pellach ydych chi wedi eu cael yn ystod y dyddiau diwethaf ynghylch y ddarpariaeth angenrheidiol i sicrhau y gall y darparwyr iechyd yng Nghymru roi'r codiad cyflog haeddiannol i nyrsys heb dorri ar feysydd gwariant eraill, datblygiadau newydd yn enwedig, ac, a fydd y trafodaethau hyn yn cynnwys eich cydweithwyr yn y Trysorlys?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf o blaid cadw at gytundebau'r setliad a bennwyd ar gyfer nyrsys a meddygon. Mae hynny'n cyfleu'r neges bwysig ein bod yn eu gwerthfawrogi. Ymgynghorwyd â mi ynghylch y penderfyniad hwnnw a rhoddais fy sylwadau. Bydd gennyf gyfres o drafodaethau yr wythnos yma, gyda chyfarfod arall yfory i ystyried y materion dan sylw a'r pwysau sydd ar y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o farn y Cynulliad a'r pryderon a leisiwyd yn y Siambr ddoe ynghylch materion iechyd a chyllidebol a'r arian sydd ar gael. Yr wyf hefyd yn ymwybodol efallai bod angen inni edrych o'r newydd ar strwythur cyllidebau iechyd a sut y maent yn adlewyrchu anghenion gwahanol gymunedau Cymru. Mae hyn yn fater parhaus. Os bydd gennyf rywbeth i'w ddweud ynghylch materion iechyd o ran cyllideb a materion sydd o bryder uniongyrchol i Jane Hutt a minnau, cyhoeddaf hynny yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n amlwg y cyflwynwyd sylwadau gan gydweithwyr Seneddol, Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac eraill i Aelodau Seneddol ynghylch y pwysau sydd ar y gwasanaeth iechyd a'r angen i ystyried hynny'n adeiladol yn yr arolwg gwariant. Mae hwn yn fater o bwys dros y ffin hefyd, nid yng Nghymru'n unig. Mae'r trafodaethau hyn ar y gweill. Yr wyf yn awyddus i ddod o hyd i ffordd ymlaen ac i sicrhau bod mantolenni'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn gywir, i sicrhau y caiff yr arian ei dargedu i'r meysydd lle mae ei angen ac i barhau gyda'r trafodaethau i geisio codi safonau ym maes iechyd a chynyddu'n gwariant at lefelau Ewropeaidd. Pan fyddwn yn sôn am lefelau Ewropeaidd, yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod bod gan Ewrop wahanol agwedd mewn rhai meysydd sydd yn ymwneud ag iechyd, megis cyfrannu. Mae'r trafodaethau hyn yn mynd rhagddynt a chânt eu cynnal yr wythnos yma.



**David Melding:** Is the Finance Secretary committed to raising the level of expenditure on health in Wales to the European average in five years to match the Prime Minister's commitment?

**Edwina Hart:** I would be delighted to be able to do what I can in terms of the Prime Minister's commitment. The money available to me will be dictated by what I receive from the spending review. I am not obligated to place block grant money into health, even if money is being put into health in England. I can place the block grant money wherever I choose according to my priorities. I feel as passionately as you about this because at the end of the day the issue brought to my attention in my surgeries, as I am sure happens with everybody else in the Chamber, is health. When talking of health, I am also conscious that what might be acceptable in other European countries and in America—private health—is not acceptable to the public in Wales. They want a health service that is funded totally by Government. That has its own pressures, with people perhaps unwilling to consider changes and different patterns within health provision. However, I would like to see us move in that upward direction, David.

**Kirsty Williams:** Given your constituency concerns, Edwina, and the pictures from hospitals throughout Wales in recent weeks, will you give the Assembly a commitment that you will do all you can in the next three weeks before we finalise the budget, to ensure that more money is made available to health authorities and trusts to deal with winter pressures next year? Do you accept that if money is not found in the next three weeks, no extra money will be available to deal with these concerns?

**Edwina Hart:** I am in a difficult position with the budget. I have put all my cards on the table in terms of funding for the health authorities and the health budget. When we decided on the sub-expenditure and main expenditure groups supplement in December, that was the amount of money available. If I

**David Melding:** A yw'r Ysgrifennydd Cyllid wedi ymroi i godi y lefel gwariant ar iechyd yng Nghymru at gyfartaledd Ewrop ymhen pum mlynedd i gyflawni ymrwymiad y Prif Weinidog?

**Edwina Hart:** Byddwn wrth fy modd petawn yn gallu gwneud cymaint ag y gallwn o ran ymrwymiad y Prif Weinidog. Yr arolwg gwariant a fydd yn pennu faint o arian a fydd ar gael imi. Nid oes rhaid imi roi arian grant bloc i iechyd, hyd yn oed os rhoddir arian at iechyd yn Lloegr. Gallaf roi'r arian grant bloc lle bynnag y dymunaf, yn ôl fy mlaenoriaethau. Yr wyf innau fel chithau'n teimlo'n gryf am hyn oherwydd y pwnc sydd yn codi dro ar ôl tro yn fy nghymorthfeydd yw iechyd. Yr wyf yn siŵr mai yr un yw'r sefyllfa gyda phawb arall yn y Siambr. Wrth drafod iechyd, yr wyf hefyd yn ymwybodol nad yw'r hyn sydd, o bosibl, yn dderbyniol mewn gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop ac yn America—iechyd preifat—yn dderbyniol i'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru. Maent eisiau gwasanaeth iechyd sydd yn cael ei gyllido'n gyfan gwbl gan y Llywodraeth. Mae hynny ynddo'i hun yn creu pwysau, gan fod pobl efallai yn amharod i ystyried newid a phatrymau gwahanol o fewn y ddarpariaeth iechyd. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn hoffi ein gweld yn symud rhagom yn y cyfeiriad hwn, David.

**Kirsty Williams:** Ag ystyried eich pryderon o ran eich etholaeth, Edwina, a'r lluniau o ysbytai ledled Cymru yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, a wnewch chi addo i'r Cynulliad y byddwch yn gwneud cymaint ag y gallwch yn ystod y tair wythnos nesaf cyn inni benderfynu'n derfynol ar y gyllideb, i sicrhau y bydd mwy o arian ar gael i'r awdurdodau ac ymddiriedolaethau iechyd i ddelio â'r pwysau ychwanegol yn ystod y gaeaf nesaf? A ydych chi'n derbyn oni ddeuir o hyd i arian o fewn y tair wythnos nesaf, na fydd arian ychwanegol ar gael i ddelio â'r pryderon hyn?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf mewn sefyllfa anodd o ran y gyllideb. Yr wyf wedi bod yn gwbl agored gyda chi o ran cyllid ar gyfer yr awdurdodau iechyd a'r gyllideb iechyd. Pan benderfynasom ar ychwanegiad ar gyfer y grwpiau is-wariant a phrif wariant ym mis Rhagfyr, dyna faint o arian a oedd ar gael.

could, I would take the views of health authorities and trusts into account and give that commitment. It would be wrong of me to give a bland commitment and say, 'yes, I can do it', when I do not know if I could. I would not want to do that and end up betraying the general public. I will do everything I can and monitor the health issues. This also applies to other budgets that continue through the year. I will see if I can make a difference and assist in any way possible. I, like you, am conscious about how people felt over the Christmas period.

Petai modd, byddwn yn ystyried sylwadau'r awdurdodau a'r ymddiriedolaethau iechyd ac yn rhoi'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. Ni fyddai'n iawn imi roi ymrwymiad syml felly a dweud 'Gallaf wneud hyn', pan nad wyf yn gwybod a allaf. Ni fyddwn eisiau gwneud hynny a bradychu'r cyhoedd yn y pen draw. Fe wnaif gymaint ag y gallaf a monitro sefyllfa maes iechyd. Mae hyn yn wir o ran y cyllidebau eraill hefyd sydd yn parhau drwy gydol y flwyddyn. Caf weld a allaf wneud gwahaniaeth a chynorthwyo mewn unrhyw fodd. Yr wyf fi, fel chithau, yn ymwybodol o sut yr oedd pobl yn teimlo yn ystod cyfnod y Nadolig.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Alison Halford:** Point of order. I raise this for the accuracy of the record. It comes under Standing Order No. 1.9. Presiding Officer, you mentioned that Peter Rogers was also a Member for Delyn. Much as I like Peter, I suggest politely that the people of Delyn who voted for me and ensured an outstanding majority, rejected a Tory Member. Perhaps the record should note that he is a list Member for north Wales. He was not voted to represent Delyn. That is my privilege. The Labour Administration serves the people of Delyn well, as the figures that the Secretary for Economic Development gave us prove.

**Alison Halford:** Pwynt o drefn. Nodaf hwn o ran cywirdeb y cofnod. Daw dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 1.9. Lywydd, dywedoch fod Peter Rogers hefyd yn aelod dros Ddelyn. Er mor hoff ydwyf o Peter, awgrymaf yn garedig fod pobl Delyn, a bleidleisiodd drosof fi gan sicrhau mwyafrif amlwg, wedi gwrthod Aelod Ceidwadol. Efallai y dylai'r cofnod nodi mai Aelod rhestr dros ogledd Cymru ydyw ef. Ni etholwyd ef i gynrychioli Delyn. Fy mraint i yw hynny. Mae'r Weinyddiaeth Lafur yn gwasanaethu pobl Delyn yn dda, fel profodd y ffigyrau a roddodd yr Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful for that point of order, which allows me to restate in this millennium what I stated in the previous one. All Assembly Members are equal constituency Members for the constituents that they represent. We are elected by different means, by first past the post and proportional representation, but our ability to represent constituents in all parts of our respective constituencies is the same. I was trying to make the point gently to Rhodri Morgan earlier that Alison Halford was not the Member for Delyn, but a Member for Delyn. Delyn rejoices in having five Members, one of whom was elected on a first past the post basis, and others who were elected on the list system. I do not wish this Chamber to perpetuate the distinction between list and constituency Members or between Members on their form of election. I

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y pwynt hwn o drefn, sydd yn fy ngalluogi i ailddweud yn y mileniwm hwn yr hyn a ddywedais yn y mileniwm diwethaf. Mae pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn Aelodau etholaeth cydradd ar ran yr etholwyr a gynrychiolant. Cawn ein hethol drwy wahanol ffyrdd, drwy'r ymgeisydd sydd gyntaf i'r felin a thrwy gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, ond yr un yw ein gallu i gynrychioli etholwyr ym mhob rhan o'n hetholaethau penodol. Yr oeddwn yn ceisio egluro'n garedig i Rhodri Morgan yn gynharach nad Alison Halford oedd yr Aelod dros Ddelyn ond yn hytrach mai un o'r Aelodau dros Ddelyn oedd hi. Mae Delyn yn llawenhau fod ganddi bum Aelod. Etholwyd un ohonynt drwy fod yn gyntaf i'r felin ac etholwyd y pedwar arall drwy'r system restr. Nid wyf eisiau i'r Siambr barhau i weld gwahaniaeth rhwng Aelodau rhestr ac

believe that is the wish of all Members.

Aelodau etholaeth na rhwng Aelodau oherwydd y modd eu hetholwyd. Credaf mai dyna yw dymuniad yr holl Aelodau.

2:37 p.m.

**Rhodri Morgan:** Further to that point of order, all I tried to do was to use what I thought was a good, clear name for Alison Halford as the Member for Delyn. If the Presiding Officer is telling me that we should never refer to Members by the constituencies that they represent, I will abide by his instructions. I was not trying to mislead the house or give Alison any artificial status above her normal station. Would it not be normal that the person who is the Member for that constituency could be referred to by that means?

**Rhodri Morgan:** Yn dilyn y pwynt o drefn hwn, y cwbl yr oeddwn yn ceisio ei wneud oedd defnyddio'r hyn a feddyliwn a oedd yn enw clir, da i Alison Halford fel yr Aelod dros Ddelyn. Os yw'r Llywydd yn dweud wrthyf na ddylem ni fyth gyfeirio at Aelodau yn ôl yr etholaethau a gynrychiolant, dilynaf ei gyfarwyddiadau. Nid oeddwn yn ceisio camarwain y tŷ na rhoi statws ffug i Alison uwch law ei safle arferol. Oni fyddai'n naturiol cyfeirio at y person sydd yn Aelod dros yr etholaeth honno yn ôl yr etholaeth?

**The Presiding Officer:** It has been our custom and practice in the last millennium in this Assembly that we refer to Members by their names. However, they are occasionally referred to by the area they represent in our agenda papers or in the order of business.

**Y Llywydd:** Bu'n ddefod ac yn arfer gennym yn ystod y mileniwm diwethaf yn y Cynulliad hwn i gyfeirio at Aelodau yn ôl eu henwau. Fodd bynnag, cyfeirir atynt o bryd i'w gilydd yn ôl yr ardal y maent yn ei chynrychioli yn ein papurau agenda ac yn nhrefn y busnes.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Further to that point of order I am happy to acknowledge that the First Secretary, despite the verdict of the voters of Llanelli, is one of the Members who represents Llanelli, as he represents other places in mid and west Wales. I welcome your important ruling and will join you in reminding the Secretary for Economic Development that we are here, not in another place.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yn dilyn y pwynt hwn o drefn yr wyf yn falch o gydnabod bod y Prif Ysgrifennydd, er gwaethaf barn pleidleiswyr Llanelli, yn un o'r Aelodau sydd yn cynrychioli Llanelli, yn yr un modd ag y mae'n cynrychioli mannau eraill yng nghanolbarth a gorllewin Cymru. Croesawaf eich dyfarniad pwysig ac ymunaf â chi i atgoffa'r Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd mai yma yr ydym ni, ac nid mewn man arall.

**The Presiding Officer:** That enables me to add to that point of order and say that I am also represented by the First Secretary.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae hynny'n fy ngalluogi i ychwanegu at y pwynt hwn o drefn a dweud fy mod innau hefyd yn cael fy nghynrychioli gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd.

**Nick Bourne:** To correct Helen Mary Jones, it is because of the verdict of the electors at Llanelli, rather than despite it, that the First Secretary sits where he does.

**Nick Bourne:** I gywiro Helen Mary Jones, oherwydd penderfyniad etholwyr Llanelli, nid er ei waethaf, y mae'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn eistedd lle y mae.

**Alison Halford:** In the interests of accuracy, following your ruling you may wish to consider that the forms on which we endeavour to claim our expenses should be rewritten because they indicate clearly that

**Alison Halford:** I fod yn gywir, yn dilyn eich dyfarniad efallai yr hoffech ystyried y dylid ailysgrifennu y ffurflenni yr ydym yn ceisio hawlio treuliau arnynt, gan eu bod yn nodi'n glir bod rhaid ichi ddangos eich bod,

you have to show yourself either to be a constituency Member or a list Member. That small detail might be important.

**The Presiding Officer:** I will have to consult officials on this matter. I have filled this form in myself and I will check whether that is the case. However, that does not affect the way that we describe each other or choose to describe each other in the Chamber. We will now move on.

un ai yn Aelod etholaeth, neu'n Aelod rhestr. Efallai fod y manylyn bach yna'n bwysig.

**Y Llywydd:** Bydd rhaid imi ymgynghori â'm swyddogion ar y mater hwn. Yr wyf wedi llenwi'r ffurflen hon fy hun a byddaf yn edrych i weld ai felly y mae. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hwn yn effeithio ar y ffordd yr ydym yn disgrifio ein gilydd neu'n dewis disgrifio ein gilydd yn y Siambr. Symudwn ymlaen yn awr.

### **Datganiad ar Gyngor Prydain ac Iwerddon Statement on the British-Irish Council**

**The First Secretary:** On 17 December, the British-Irish Council held its historic first meeting in London. I represented the Assembly along with Andrew Davies and Edwina Hart. The Prime Minister chaired the meeting. Also present were the Taoiseach, the Scottish First Minister, the Northern Ireland First and Deputy First Ministers and representatives from the Governments of the Isle of Man and the Channel Islands. I have placed the statement that I made at the meeting and the summit communiqué on the intranet. As I promised, I intend to report to the Assembly as soon as possible after each meeting of the Council. I do so today rather than yesterday for the convenience of Assembly business. The Council's importance means that its business needs the widest possible audience. We should be in no doubt about the significance of this first meeting. It did far more than symbolise the culmination of the Northern Ireland peace process. For the first time ever we have a single body to consider all of the issues that affect all residents of these islands.

Devolution may have made the Council a practical possibility but the great wealth of interest that we all have in common means that it has not happened a moment too soon. It is a basic principle of policy-making that decisions taken in isolation are more likely to be bad ones. Whatever our views, there is always much to be gained by discussing pressing issues with others. At the very least, everyone gains the benefit of everyone else's

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Ar 17 Rhagfyr, cynhaliodd Cyngor Prydain ac Iwerddon ei gyfarfod hanesyddol cyntaf yn Llundain. Cynrychiolais y Cynulliad ynghyd ag Andrew Davies ac Edwina Hart. Cadeiriwyd y cyfarfod gan y Prif Weinidog. Yr oedd y Taoiseach, Pen Weinidog yr Alban, Pen Weinidog a Dirprwy Ben Weinidogion Gogledd Iwerddon a chynrychiolwyr Llywodraethau Ynys Manaw ac Ynysoedd y Sianel yn bresennol hefyd. Rhoddais y datganiad a gyflwynais yn y cyfarfod ac yng ngohebiaeth yr uwchgynhadledd ar y fewnrwyd. Fel yr addewais, yr wyf yn bwriadu rhoi adroddiad i'r Cynulliad cyn gynted ag y bo modd ar ôl pob cyfarfod o'r Cyngor. Yr wyf yn gwneud hyn heddiw yn hytrach na ddoe, er hwylustod i fusnes y Cynulliad. Mae pwysigrwydd y Cyngor yn golygu bod angen y gynulleidfa fwyaf posibl i'w fusnes. Ni ddylem amau o gwbl pa mor bwysig oedd y cyfarfod cyntaf hwn. Yr oedd yn llawer mwy na symbol o broses heddwch Gogledd Iwerddon ar ei anterth. Am y tro cyntaf erioed, mae gennym un corff i ystyried yr holl faterion sydd yn effeithio ar holl breswylwyr yr ynysoedd hyn.

Efallai fod datganoli wedi galluogi'r Cyngor i fod yn bosibilrwydd ymarferol ond mae'r holl bethau sydd gennym yn gyffredin yn golygu ei bod yn hen bryd i hyn ddigwydd. Un o egwyddorion sylfaenol llunio polisi yw bod penderfyniadau a wneir ar eich pen eich hun yn fwy tebygol o fod yn rhai gwael. Beth bynnag fo ein barn, byddwn bob amser ar ein hennill o drafod materion dyrys gydag eraill. O leiaf, mae pawb ar eu hennill o brofiad

experience and, where appropriate, we will work together to develop policies that serve the interests of all and are the stronger for having been dealt with by consensus. The Council has the potential to serve this purpose across the British Isles. I invited the Council to meet in Cardiff at the earliest opportunity. Dublin and Belfast clearly have a claim to host early meetings, but I am sure that all parties here will look forward to welcoming the council to Cardiff at the earliest possible date.

Members will see from the council's communiqué that it has agreed a broad and challenging programme for its first year. The Assembly can and will contribute fully to discussions of all the issues—drugs, transport, the environment and the knowledge economy. Wales, with our colleagues in Scotland, will lead jointly the council's consideration of social exclusion and inclusion. I am particularly pleased about that as it gives us the chance to shape the development of policy on these important issues, to demonstrate the value of the cross-cutting approaches that we have already developed in the Assembly and to enhance our strong links with Scotland.

The Belfast agreement provides for the council to be comprised of sovereign and devolved executives. I am committed to involving all of the Assembly in the council's business and my statement today is just a small part of that. In particular, I look forward to the relevant Subject Committees playing a part in the council's policy development work. The Belfast agreement also provides for links between legislatures, and although that is not ultimately a matter for the council, I hope that we can make equal progress on that front.

The council has made a constructive start. Now we must demonstrate its value in practical terms to tackle issues of common interest together, and to demonstrate what Wales has to offer to the rest of these islands, while remaining open to new ideas from others. That is a challenging agenda. It is well-suited to the new political landscape that we inhabit. It is one that my colleagues and I

pawb arall a, lle bo hynny'n addas, byddwn yn cydweithio i ddatblygu polisiau a fydd yn gwasanaethu buddiannau pawb a bydd y rheini'n gryfach gan eu bod wedi eu llunio drwy gonsensws. Mae gan y Cyngor y potensial i wasanaethu'r diben hwn dros Ynysoedd Prydain. Gwahoddais y Cyngor i gyfarfod yng Nghaerdydd ar y cyfle cyntaf. Yn amlwg, mae Dulyn a Belfast yn awyddus iawn i gynnal rhai o'r cyfarfodydd cynharaf, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pob plaid yn edrych ymlaen i groesawu'r cyngor i Gaerdydd cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Gall aelodau weld o ohebiaeth y cyngor ei fod wedi cytuno ar raglen eang a llawn her ar gyfer ei flwyddyn gyntaf. Gall, a bydd y Cynulliad yn cyfrannu'n llawn i'r trafodaethau ar yr holl faterion hyn—cyffuriau, trafnidiaeth, yr amgylchedd a'r economi wybodaeth. Bydd Cymru, ar y cyd â'n cyfeillion yn yr Alban, yn arwain ystyriaeth y cyngor ar ddieithrwch a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o hynny gan ei fod yn cynnig y cyfle inni lunio datblygiad polisi ar y materion pwysig hyn, i ddangos gwerthoedd yr agweddau trawsbynciol hyn yr ydym eisoes wedi eu datblygu yn y Cynulliad ac i gynyddu ein cysylltiadau cryf â'r Alban.

Mae cytundeb Belfast yn golygu bod y cyngor yn cynnwys gweithrediaethau sofran a gweithrediaethau wedi eu datganoli. Yr wyf wedi ymroi i gynnwys yr holl Gynulliad ym musnes y cyngor a darn bach o hynny yw fy natganiad heddiw. Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen yn enwedig at weld y Pwyllgorau Pwnc perthnasol yn chwarae rhan yng ngwaith datblygu polisi'r cyngor. Mae'r cytundeb Belfast hefyd yn creu cysylltiadau rhwng cyrff deddfu, ac er nad ydy hynny'n fater i'r cyngor yn y pen draw, gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gallu gwneud yr un math o gynydd yn hynny o beth.

Mae'r cyngor wedi dechrau ar ei waith mewn ffordd adeiladol. Yn awr rhaid inni ddangos ei werth mewn termau ymarferol i fynd i'r afael â materion sydd o ddiddordeb cyffredinol gyda'n gilydd, ac i ddangos beth sydd gan Gymru i'w gynnig i weddill yr ynysoedd hyn, tra'n parhau i fod yn barod i dderbyn syniadau newydd gan eraill. Mae hon yn agenda sydd yn llawn her. Mae'n

approach with relish, as I am sure does the whole Assembly.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I thank the First Secretary for making this statement. There has been cross-party support for the council's establishment, not only in this Assembly but also in the Scottish Parliament and in the Northern Ireland Assembly. We welcome the fact that the council will consider a number of important issues in its first year. In the interest of cross-party consensus, we support the idea of having an early meeting of the council in Cardiff. If the First Secretary wishes to convey that to his colleagues on the council, I am sure that it would assist him in arguing his case.

One issue has been omitted from those that will be discussed in the council. Although devolution is the driver for setting up the council, I thought that the financing of devolution would have been of considerable interest. Has the First Secretary had discussions either within the council or outside with his colleagues in Northern Ireland and in Scotland about looking again at how this Assembly is financed, particularly through the Barnett formula?

**The First Secretary:** I was convinced that all the parties would support an early meeting of the council in Cardiff, and that had already been indicated at an informal level. I am grateful for that support. I do not think that we can argue against the priority for meetings to take place in Dublin and Belfast but we will ensure that we are immediately behind them in the queue.

Looking aside from the imperatives of the peace process, and the need for different parts of these islands that have different constitutional settlements to be able to sit around the same table without raising major issues of principle, one interesting point about the British-Irish Council is that there are different powers and responsibilities in every part. There are also differences in financing—because the situation of the Scottish economy is different to ours, for

addas iawn i'r tirlun gwleidyddol newydd yr ydym yn rhan ohono. Mae'n un yr wyf finnau a'm cydweithwyr yn troi ati gydag awch, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y mae gweddill y Cynulliad hefyd.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolchaf i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd am gyflwyno'r datganiad hwn. Mae sefydlu'r cyngor wedi derbyn cefnogaeth trawsbleidiol, nid yn unig yn y Cynulliad ond yn Senedd yr Alban ac yng Nghynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon hefyd. Croesawn y ffaith y bydd y cyngor yn ystyried nifer o faterion pwysig yn ystod ei flwyddyn gyntaf. Gyda golwg ar gonsensws trawsbleidiol, yr ydym yn cefnogi'r syniad o gael cyfarfod buan o'r cyngor yng Nghaerdydd. Os yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn dymuno cyfleu hynny i'w gydweithwyr ar y cyngor, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai o gymorth iddo wrth ddadlau ei achos.

Mae un mater wedi ei hepgor o'r rhai sydd i'w trafod yn y cyngor. Er mai datganoli yw'r prif reswm am sefydlu'r cyngor, yr oeddwn yn meddwl y buasai cyllido datganoli o gryn ddiddordeb. A yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd wedi trafod edrych o'r newydd ar sut y cyllidir y Cynulliad hwn yn enwedig drwy'r fformwla Barnett, un ai o fewn y cyngor neu'r tu allan iddo gyda'i gydweithwyr yng Ngogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr oeddwn yn sicr y byddai pob plaid yn cefnogi cyfarfod buan o'r cyngor yng Nghaerdydd. Dangoswyd hynny eisoes ar lefel anffurfiol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eu cefnogaeth. Nid wyf yn meddwl y gallwn ddadlau yn erbyn y flaenoriaeth i gynnal cyfarfodydd yn Nulyn ac ym Melfast ond byddwn yn sicrhau ein bod yn syth ar eu holau ar y rhestr aros.

A gadael gofynion hollbwysig y broses heddych o'r neilltu, a'r ffaith fod angen i wahanol rannau yr ynysoedd hyn, sydd â setliadau cyfansoddiadol gwahanol, allu eistedd o gylch yr un bwrdd heb godi materion mawr o egwyddor, un pwynt difyr ynghylch Cyngor Prydain ac Iwerddon yw bod gan bob rhan wahanol bwerau a chyfrifoldebau. Mae yna wahaniaethau hefyd o ran cyllido—oherwydd bod sefyllfa economi'r Alban yn wahanol i'n sefyllfa ni,

instance. That leads to differences, in that what would help us might not help them in the same way. At opportunities other than the council meeting or its margins, I will discuss the way that we in the devolved bodies in Scotland, Northern Ireland and here in Wales interface with decisions that have to be taken by the UK Government and seek to do the best for those that we represent. We will return to that from time to time.

**Nick Bourne:** I welcome the First Secretary's statement and hope that we can look forward to full representation at such meetings in future. The Welsh Conservative Party recognises the culmination of the peace process that this represents and we hope that it contributes to a lasting peace throughout these islands. We have already committed ourselves informally to supporting a proposal that the council comes to Cardiff, and perhaps to other venues in Wales as well. That would be a welcome development and we look forward to it taking place on an early occasion.

2:47 p.m.

**The First Secretary:** One of the most important things is that ordinary work can lead to extraordinary outcomes. When I was in a conference recently with elected representatives from Britain and America, I noticed that elected representatives from Northern Ireland were present. It was some way into the session before I was able to distinguish who represented which party, and that was only by asking. That sort of day-to-day work has allowed the coming together of people who previously had been on the opposite sides of a divide. A period of day-to-day working within the Northern Ireland Assembly after the election enabled everybody to take that next step forward to allow the Northern Ireland Assembly to come into being properly, to form its executive and indeed to form the British-Irish Council. We can learn a little from that in this Chamber because it will be some time before we manage to bring all our institutions to full maturity. I am certain that we will get there.

er enghraifft. Mae hynny'n arwain at wahaniaethau. Efallai na fyddai rhywbeth a fyddai o gymorth i ni yn eu cynorthwyo hwy yn yr un modd. Daw cyfleoedd eraill, ar wahân i gyfarfod y cyngor neu ei gyfarfodydd ymylol, i drafod y berthynas rhwng y cyrff a ddatganolwyd yn yr Alban, Gogledd Iwerddon ac yma yng Nghymru a phenderfyniadau y mae rhaid i Lywodraeth y DU eu gwneud gan ymdrechu i wneud y gorau dros y rheini yr ydym yn eu cynrychioli. Byddwn yn dychwelyd at hynny o bryd i'w gilydd.

**Nick Bourne:** Croesawaf ddatganiad y Prif Ysgrifennydd a gobeithiaf y gallwn edrych ymlaen at gynrychiolaeth lawn mewn cyfarfodydd o'r fath yn y dyfodol. Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn cydnabod bod hyn yn arwydd fod y broses heddwch yn ei hanterth a gobeithiwn y bydd yn cyfrannu at heddwch a fydd yn parhau ledled yr ynsoedd hyn. Yr ydym eisoes wedi ymrwymo'n anffurfiol i gefnogi cynnig bod y cyngor yn dod i Gaerdydd, ac efallai, i leoliadau eraill yng Nghymru hefyd. Byddai hynny yn ddatblygiad i'w groesawu ac edrychwn ymlaen at weld hyn yn digwydd yn fuan.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Un o'r pethau pwysicaf yw y gall gwaith cyffredin arwain at ganlyniadau rhyfeddol. Pan oeddwn mewn cynhadledd yn ddiweddar gyda chynrychiolwyr wedi eu hethol o Brydain ac America, sylwais fod cynrychiolwyr wedi eu hethol o Ogledd Iwerddon yn bresennol. Yr oedd y sesiwn wedi dechrau ers peth amser cyn imi allu gwahaniaethu rhwng pwy oedd yn cynrychioli pa blaid, a dim ond drwy ofyn oedd hynny. Mae'r math hwnnw o waith beunyddiol wedi caniatáu pobl i ddod at ei gilydd a fyddai, yn y gorffennol, ar ochrau hollol wahanol. Mae cyfnod o waith beunyddiol yng Nghynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon, ar ôl yr etholiad, wedi galluogi pawb i gymryd y cam nesaf tuag at sefydlu Cynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon o ddifrif, i ffurfio ei weithrediaeth ac yn wir i ffurfio Cyngor Prydain ac Iwerddon. Gallwn ddysgu ychydig o hynny yn y Siambr hon gan y bydd hi'n beth amser cyn i'n holl sefydliadau ni aeddfedu'n llawn. Yr wyf yn ffyddiog y gallwn gyflawni hynny.

As for the British-Irish Council coming to Wales, I did not specifically invite it to Cardiff, but to Wales in order to leave the options as wide open as possible. The principle of a body that will exist for many years coming to different parts of Wales on different occasions in the future should be put on record as our aspiration from today.

**Michael German:** I thank Alun for his statement. The fact that we now have elected colleagues in Northern Ireland who will hopefully develop their processes of Government in a peaceful way is humbling to us all. I welcome the fact that there is an open invitation for the British-Irish Council to Wales. I am particularly interested in the part of your statement that referred to how the broader Assembly could deal and work with colleagues in other legislatures and, in particular, your comment about the use of committees. If we are looking for a broad play in our relationships, we should perhaps consider some way in which that relationship can be developed. I hope that you will be able to bring before us a paper on precisely the mechanisms by which we would be able to locate ourselves with our colleagues. The Presiding Officer may also wish to engage in that process. We have a lot to offer in terms of process or work. We can also gain from the experience of others. It may be useful to incorporate into that paper an idea of the nature of the relationship and the issues and processes which we can exchange, stating what benefit they can bring in the short and longer term.

**The First Secretary:** I am happy to respond to that suggestion, Presiding Officer. On the reference to yourself, I know that you have already had contact with Presiding Officers or Speakers in other devolved institutions. It is that sort of contact at every level, involving Presiding Officers, members of the Administration and also members of different committees and parties, that will achieve the greatest benefits. I am happy to endorse that sentiment and perhaps to bring a paper before the Assembly with some suggestions and ideas to which Members can respond, no doubt adding to them or agreeing or disagreeing with them.

Gyda golwg ar Gyngor Prydain ac Iwerddon yn dod i Gymru, ni wahoddais ef i Gaerdydd yn benodol, ond i Gymru, i gadw ein hopsiynau mor agored â phosibl. Dylid cofnodi'r egwyddor heddiw ein bod yn gobeithio y bydd y corff hwn a fydd yn dod i wahanol rannau o Gymru ar wahanol adegau yn y dyfodol.

**Michael German:** Diolchaf i Alun am ei ddatganiad. Mae hi'n ffaith sydd yn gwneud inni gyd deimlo'n ostynedig fod gennym bellach gydweithwyr wedi eu hethol yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, a fydd gobeithio, yn datblygu prosesau eu Llywodraeth mewn ffordd heddychlon. Croesawaf y ffaith fod yna wahoddiad agored i Gyngor Prydain ac Iwerddon i Gymru. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb arbennig yn y rhan honno o'ch datganiad a oedd yn crybwyll sut y gallai'r Cynulliad ehangach ddelio a gweithio gyda chydweithwyr mewn cyrff deddfu eraill ac, yn enwedig, eich safbwynt ynghylch defnyddio'r pwyllgorau. Os ydym yn chwilio am gysylltiadau eang, efallai y dylem ni ystyried ryw ffordd y gallem ddatblygu y berthynas honno. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn gallu cyflwyno papur inni a fydd yn edrych ar yr union fecanweithiau gallem eu defnyddio i gyd-gysylltu â'n cymheiriaid. Efallai y carai'r Llywydd gyfrannu at y broses honno hefyd. Mae gennym lawer i'w gynnig o ran proses neu waith. Gallwn hefyd ddysgu o brofiadau eraill. Gallai fod yn ddefnyddiol cynnwys yn y papur amlinelliad o beth yw natur y berthynas, y materion a'r prosesau y gallwn eu cyfnewid, gan nodi pa fudd a geid o hynny yn y tymor byr a'r tymor hir.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr wyf yn falch o ymateb i'r awgrym hwn, Lywydd. O ran y cyfeiriad atoch chi, gwn eich bod eisoes wedi bod mewn cysylltiad â Llywyddion neu Lefarwyr sefydliadau datganoledig eraill. Y math hwn o gysylltiad ar bob lefel, gan gynnwys Llywyddion, aelodau o'r Weinyddiaeth ac aelodau amrywiol bwyllgorau a phleidiau fydd yn arwain at y budd mwyaf. Yr wyf yn fodlon cymeradwyo'r meddylfryd hwnnw ac efallai gyflwyno papur i'r Cynulliad gydag ychydig o awgrymiadau a syniadau y gall Aelodau ymateb iddynt, drwy ychwanegu atynt neu gytuno neu anghytuno â hwy.



**Brian Gibbons:** *Go raibh míle maith agat, a Chathaoirleach.* Thank you very much, Presiding Officer. It is with a sense of occasion that I contribute to this statement, not least because the British-Irish Council has occurred in the wake of the Good Friday Agreement but also as an integral part of that agreement. It is appropriate, on this occasion, to pay tribute to the people who have allowed us to make this much progress on this issue: the previous Conservative Administration, the present Labour Administration, the various political parties in Northern Ireland and also the non-political institutions such as the churches and the trade union movement which have all worked to create the space that allows this peace process to take place. I have no doubt that, if we can make the British-Irish Council work, it will help to consolidate the peace process in Ireland. It will also help to build reconciliation, which is so much a part of Ireland's future and of the relationship between Britain and Ireland. If we work together it will not only consolidate the peace process, it will enhance the cultural, social and economic wellbeing of the people of this island.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae'n amhosibl imi ymateb yn yr Wyddeleg i sylwadau Brian, ond diolchaf iddo. Defnyddiais y Gymraeg yng nghyfarfod cyntaf y cyngor er mwyn datblygu'r syniad ein bod yn gweithio fel Cynulliad dwyieithog—ond nid Cynulliad teirieithog.

Brian's points about the contribution of different sectors to peace in Northern Ireland are correct. In a previous role, I worked on the relationship between Government and the voluntary sector in every part of the United Kingdom, including Northern Ireland, and realised the powerful roles that the voluntary and community sectors had to play. They often played a role that elected Members were unable to play at that time due to the nature of the environment. That convinced me more than ever of the voluntary and community sectors' potential with which we as an Assembly are trying to interface. That is a good example of us learning lessons from the experience in Northern Ireland. I am

**Brian Gibbons:** *Go raibh míle maith agat, a Chathaoirleach.* Diolch yn fawr iawn ichi Lywydd. Teimlaf fy mod yn cyfrannu at y datganiad hwn ar achlysur pwysig iawn, nid yn unig oherwydd bod Cyngor Prydain ac Iwerddon wedi'i sefydlu o ganlyniad i Gytundeb Dydd Gwener y Groglith ond hefyd fel rhan hollbwysig o'r cytundeb hwnnw. Mae'n briodol ar yr achlysur hwn, talu teyrnged i bobl sydd wedi ein galluogi i wneud cymaint o gynnydd â hyn ar y mater: y Weinyddiaeth Geidwadol flaenorol, y Weinyddiaeth Lafur bresennol, yr amrywiol bleidiau gwleidyddol yng Ngogledd Iwerddon a'r sefydliadau an-wleidyddol megis yr eglwysi a'r mudiad undebau llafur sydd i gyd wedi gweithio i greu llwyfan i'r broses heddwch weithio. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth, os gallwn wneud i Gyngor Prydain ac Iwerddon lwyddo, y bydd hynny o gymorth i gyfnerthu'r broses heddwch yn Iwerddon. Bydd hefyd o gymorth i feithrin cymod sydd yn rhan mor bwysig o ddyfodol Iwerddon a'r berthynas rhwng Prydain ac Iwerddon. Nid yn unig y bydd hyn yn cyfnerthu'r broses heddwch. Drwy gydweithio, y bydd yn cyfrannu at les diwylliannol, cymdeithasol ac economaidd pobl yr ynys hon.

**The First Secretary:** It is impossible for me to respond to Brian's comments in the Irish language, but I thank him. I used Welsh in the council's first meeting to develop the idea that we work as a bilingual Assembly—but not a trilingual one.

Mae pwynt Brian ynghylch cyfraniad y gwahanol sectorau at greu heddwch yng Ngogledd Iwerddon yn gywir. Mewn swydd flaenorol, yr oeddwn yn gweithio ar y berthynas rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r sector gwirfoddol ym mhob rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig, gan gynnwys Gogledd Iwerddon, a sylweddolais pa mor rymus oedd swyddogaeth y sector gwirfoddol a chymunedol. Yr oeddent yn aml yn cyflawni swyddogaeth na allai Aelod Etholedig mo'i chyflawni ar y pryd, oherwydd natur yr amgylchedd. Bu hynny'n ddigon i fy argyhoeddi fwy nag erioed gymaint o botensial oedd gan y sector yr ydym ni fel Cynulliad, yn ceisio cydweithio ag ef. Mae

certain that we can learn a great deal from a number of people like David Trimble and Seamus Mallon, colleagues in Scotland and in the smaller administrations, whose interest in the development of our institution contributes to the development of their own. We have much to gain from this as well as something to contribute positively.

hon yn enghraifft dda ohonom ni yn dysgu gwersi o brofiad Gogledd Iwerddon. Yr wyf yn ffyddiog y gallwn ddysgu llawer iawn gan nifer o bobl fel David Trimble a Seamus Mallon, cydweithwyr yn yr Alban ac mewn gweinyddiaethau llai y mae eu diddordeb yn natblygiad ein sefydliad yn cyfrannu at ddatblygiad eu sefydliadau hwythau. Mae gennym lawer i'w ennill o hyn yn ogystal â rhywbeth i gyfrannu'n gadarnhaol.

### **Adolygu Rheolau Sefydlog: Paneli Cynllunio Revision to Standing Orders: Planning Panels**

**The Secretary for the Environment and Local Government (Peter Law):** I propose that

**Ysgrifennydd yr Amgylchedd a Llywodraeth Leol (Peter Law):** Cynigiaf fod

*the Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order 26 approves the following revision to Standing Orders with effect from 1 February 2000.*

*y Cynulliad, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 26 yn cymeradwyo'r adolygiad canlynol i'r Rheolau Sefydlog o 1 Chwefror 2000.*

I also propose the following amendment. Add at the end of motion

Yr wyf hefyd yn cynnig y gwelliant canlynol. Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig

*STANDING ORDER 27 – Planning Decision Committees*

*RHEOL SEFYDLOG Rhif 27 – Pwyllgorau Penderfyniadau Cynllunio*

*Application*

*Cymhwyso*

*27.1 This Standing Order governs the method by which the Assembly decides how to act in respect of:*

*27.1 Mae'r Rheol Sefydlog hon yn llywodraethu dull y Cynulliad ar gyfer penderfynu sut mae gweithredu mewn cysylltiad â'r canlynol:*

*(i) Appeals under Section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (in those cases where the Assembly has recovered jurisdiction to determine the appeal from the appointed Inspector);*

*(i) Apeliadau o dan Adran 78 Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 (yn yr achosion hynny lle bydd y Cynulliad wedi adfeddiannu awdurdod ar gyfer penderfynu'r apêl oddi wrth yr Arolygydd penodedig);*

*(ii) Applications for planning permission which have been called in by the Assembly for decision under Section 77 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990;*

*(ii) Ceisiadau am ganiatâd cynllunio sydd wedi'u galw i mewn gan y Cynulliad ar gyfer penderfyniad o dan Adran 77 Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990;*

*(iii) Applications to confirm an Order made under the Transport and Works Act 1992.*

*(iii) Ceisiadau am gadarnhau Gorchymyn a wnaed o dan Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth a Gwaith 1992.*

*27.2 An appeal or application which falls within paragraph 27.1 shall be decided by a*

*27.2 Bydd apêl neu gais a gwmpesir gan baragraff 27.1 yn cael ei benderfynu gan*

*Committee ('a Planning Decision Committee') elected for the purpose under this Standing Order unless paragraph 27.8 applies in which case the Assembly may by motion delegate the function to do so in a different manner in relation to that particular appeal or application. Where a number of appeals or applications are the subject of a single Inspector's report, the motion electing the Planning Decision Committee shall authorise that Committee to decide all those appeals or applications. Where it is expedient to do so, a motion may authorise a Planning Decision Committee to decide more than one appeal or application which are not the subject of a single Inspector's report. In such a case the reference in paragraph 27.16 to signing a decision letter means the signing of decision letters in all appeals or applications which it is authorised to decide.*

#### *Initiation of Procedure*

*27.3 When the Assembly Secretary having responsibility for planning matters ('the Assembly Secretary') receives the report of the Inspector appointed to investigate and report on an appeal or application which falls within 27.1, the Assembly Secretary shall prepare a brief written statement identifying the location and nature of the development to which it relates and make it available to all members of the Planning Decision Panel ('the Panel') (as defined in Annex A to this Standing Order) and to the Clerk to the Assembly committee having responsibility for planning matters ('the Committee Clerk').*

#### *Election of Committee*

*27.4 Within 10 working days of receipt by the Committee Clerk of the statement prepared under paragraph 27.3, the Committee Clerk shall provide the Assembly Business Secretary with the names of the four members of the Panel who appear to the Committee Clerk to be qualified to serve on the Planning Decision Committee in accordance with the Annex A to this Standing Order.*

*27.5 The provisions contained in Annex A to this Standing Order shall only continue in*

*Bwyllgor ('Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio') a etholir i'r diben hwnnw o dan y Rheol Sefydlog hon oni bai fod paragraff 27.8 yn berthnasol pryd y caiff y Cynulliad, drwy gynnig, ddirprwyo'r swyddogaeth berthnasol mewn dull gwahanol mewn perthynas â'r apêl neu gais penodol hwnnw. Pan fydd nifer o apeliadau neu geisiadau yn destun adroddiad Arolygydd unigol, bydd y cynnig sy'n ethol y Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio yn awdurdodi'r Pwyllgor hwnnw i benderfynu'r holl apeliadau neu geisiadau hynny. Lle bydd yn hwylus gwneud hynny, bydd modd cynnig awdurdodi Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio i benderfynu mwy nag un apêl neu gais sydd heb fod yn destun adroddiad Arolygydd unigol. Yn y cyfryw achos, mae'r cyfeiriad ym mharagraff 27.16 at lofnodi llythyr penderfyniad yn golygu llofnodi'r llythyr penderfyniad yn yr holl apeliadau neu geisiadau y mae wedi'i awdurdodi i'w penderfynu.*

#### *Cychwyn y Weithdrefn*

*27.3 Pan fydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad sy'n gyfrifol am faterion cynllunio ('yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad') yn derbyn adroddiad yr Arolygydd a benodwyd i ymchwilio a gwneud adroddiad ar apêl neu gais a gwmpesir gan 27.1, bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad yn paratoi datganiad ysgrifenedig byr yn nodi lleoliad a natur y datblygiad y cyfeirir ato ac yn trefnu iddo fod ar gael i holl aelodau'r Panel Penderfyniadau Cynllunio ('y Panel') (fel y'i diffinnir yn Atodiad A i'r Rheol Sefydlog hon) ac i Glerc y pwyllgor Cynulliad sy'n gyfrifol am faterion cynllunio ('Clerc y Pwyllgor').*

#### *Ethol Pwyllgor*

*27.4 Cyn pen 10 niwrnod ar ôl i Glerc y Pwyllgor gael y datganiad a baratowyd o dan baragraff 27.3, bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor yn rhoi i Drefnydd y Cynulliad enwau'r pedwar aelod o'r Panel y mae'n ymddangos i Glerc y Pwyllgor eu bod yn gymwys i wasanaethu ar y Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio yn unol ag Atodiad A i'r Rheol Sefydlog hon.*

*27.5 Bydd y darpariaethau a gynhwysir yn Atodiad A i'r Rheol Sefydlog hon yn dal yn*

*force (unless previously revoked) until the next ordinary election for Assembly members is held. As soon as may be after the holding of such election the Assembly Business Secretary shall submit to the Business Committee a proposal for a form of Annex A intended to remain in force until the next ordinary election and the procedure for revising Standing Orders under Standing Order 26 shall apply to the proposal.*

*27.6 When the Assembly Business Secretary receives the names of the four Members of the Panel notified by the Committee Clerk under paragraph 27.4, the Assembly Business Secretary shall:*

*i) table a motion in accordance with the model motion set out in Annex B to this Standing Order inviting the Assembly to establish a Planning Decision Committee and to elect those four Members to it;*

*ii) immediately communicate a copy of the motion to the Deputy Presiding Officer and the members of the Business Committee.*

*27.7 Any motion tabled under paragraph 27.6 shall be considered by the Assembly in plenary session as soon as possible, subject to the requirements of Standing Order 6.12. No amendment may be proposed to such a motion. The motion shall be proposed and once proposed, it shall not be the subject of debate but shall be voted on immediately.*

*27.8 If for any reason the Committee Clerk is unable to compile a list of four Members or if a motion tabled under 27.6 (i) is defeated, the Business Secretary shall as soon as possible table a motion proposing that the function of making the decision on the appeal or application be delegated by the Assembly in some other manner and the provisions of paragraph 27.6 (ii) and 27.7 shall apply to such a motion except that amendments to it shall be permitted. The motion and any amendments shall be proposed and neither the motion nor any amendments shall be debated. The Presiding Officer shall determine the order in which any amendments are voted on. If such a motion, whether amended or not, is defeated, then in that event the function specified in the motion*

*weithredol tan yr etholiad arferol nesaf ar gyfer aelodau'r Cynulliad yn unig, oni bai eu bod yn cael eu diddymu cyn hynny. Cyn gynted ag y bo modd ar ôl cynnal y cyfryw etholiad, bydd Trefnydd y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno i'r Pwyllgor Busnes gynnig am ffurf ar Atodiad A y bwriedir iddi ddal yn weithredol tan yr etholiad arferol wedi hynny a bydd y drefn ar gyfer diwygio Rheolau Sefydlog o dan Reol Sefydlog 26 yn gymwys i'r cynnig.*

*27.6 Pan fydd Trefnydd y Cynulliad yn cael enwau'r pedwar Aelod o'r Panel a hysbyswyd gan Glerc y Pwyllgor o dan baragraff 27.4, bydd Trefnydd y Cynulliad yn gwneud y canlynol:*

*i) cyflwyno cynnig yn unol â'r cynnig enghreifftiol a geir yn Atodiad B i'r Rheol Sefydlog hon yn gwahodd y Cynulliad i sefydlu Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio ac ethol y pedwar Aelod hwnnw;*

*ii) rhoi copi o'r cynnig i'r Dirprwy Lywydd ac aelodau'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn syth.*

*27.7 Bydd unrhyw gynnig a gyflwynir o dan baragraff 27.6 yn cael ei ystyried gan y Cynulliad mewn cyfarfod llawn cyn gynted ag y bo modd, yn amodol ar ofynion Rheol Sefydlog 6.12. Ni fydd modd cynnig gwelliant i'r cyfryw gynnig. Caiff y cynnig ei gynnig ac ar ôl iddo gael ei gynnig, ni fydd yn destun dadl ond bydd pleidlais arno yn syth.*

*27.8 Os bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor, am unrhyw reswm, heb allu llunio rhestr o bedwar Aelod neu os bydd cynnig a gyflwynir o dan 27.6 (i) yn cael ei drechu, bydd y Trefnydd, cyn gynted ag y bo modd, yn cyflwyno cynnig yn cynnig bod y Cynulliad yn dirprwyo, mewn rhyw ffordd arall, y swyddogaeth o benderfynu ar yr apêl neu'r cais a bydd darpariaethau paragraff 27.6 (ii) a 27.7 yn gymwys i'r cyfryw gynnig ond caniateir gwneud gwelliannau iddo. Bydd y cynnig ac unrhyw welliannau yn cael eu cynnig ac ni fydd dadl ar y cynnig nac ar unrhyw welliannau. Bydd y Llywydd yn penderfynu trefn pleidleisio ar unrhyw welliannau. Os bydd y cyfryw gynnig, wedi'i wella neu beidio, yn cael ei drechu, caiff y swyddogaeth a bennir ynddo ei ddirprwyo i'r Prif*

*shall be delegated to the First Secretary.*

*Ysgrifennydd.*

*Application of Standing Order 8*

*Cymhwyso Rheol Sefydlog 8*

*27.9 Only the following provisions of Standing Order 8 shall apply to a Planning Decision Committee:*

*27.9 Dim ond y darpariaethau canlynol yn Rheol Sefydlog 8 fydd yn gymwys i Bwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio:*

- i) Paragraphs 8.7 to 8.13;*
- ii) Paragraphs 8.18 and 8.19;*
- iii) Paragraphs 8.23 and 8.24.*

- i) paragraffau 8.7 i 8.13;*
- ii) paragraffau 8.18 ac 8.19;*
- iii) paragraffau 8.23 ac 8.24;*

*27.10 Notwithstanding paragraph 27.9, the requirement of Section 54 of the Act that the balance of the parties in the Assembly shall, as far as is practicable, be reflected in the membership of a committee shall be secured by the manner of selection of members of a proposed Planning Decision Committee set out in Annex A to this Standing Order.*

*27.10 Er gwaethaf paragraff 27.9, bydd y gofyniad yn Adran 54 y Ddeddf, sef bod cydbwysedd y pleidiau yn y Cynulliad yn cael ei adlewyrchu, cyn belled ag y bo'n ymarferol, yn aelodaeth pwyllgor, yn cael ei sicrhau drwy'r dull ar gyfer dewis aelodau Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio arfaethedig a nodir yn Atodiad A i'r Rheol Sefydlog hon.*

*Consideration by a Planning Decision Committee*

*Ystyriaeth gan Bwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio*

*27.11 Each Planning Appeal Committee shall be identified by a reference comprising the year in which it was elected and a serial number.*

*27.11 Dylid adnabod pob Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio drwy gyfeirnod sy'n cynnwys blwyddyn ei ethol a rhif cyfresol.*

*27.12 The Assembly Secretary, if a member of a Planning Decision Committee, shall be the Chair of the Committee. If the Assembly Secretary is not a member of the Committee the Chair shall be elected by the members of the Committee or, if the members of the committee are unable to agree, nominated to act by the Chair of the Committee having responsibility for planning matters.*

*27.12 Yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad, os yw'n aelod o Bwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio, fydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor. Os nad yw'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor, rhaid i'r Cadeirydd gael ei (h)ethol gan aelodau'r Pwyllgor neu, os na fydd aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn gallu dod i gytundeb, rhaid iddo/iddi gael ei (h)enwebu i weithredu gan Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor sy'n gyfrifol am faterion cynllunio.*

*27.13 The Chair may vote and if there is an equality of votes may in addition exercise a casting vote at his or her discretion.*

*27.13 Caiff y Cadeirydd bleidleisio, ac os bydd pleidlais gyfartal caiff, ar ben hynny, arfer pleidlais fwrw, fel y barno'n ddoeth.*

*27.14 A Planning Decision Committee shall meet in private and its members shall be under an obligation to observe the confidentiality of any discussion by the Committee and of any documents considered by the Committee with the exception of the Committee's decision letter when adopted together with any documents to which it refers.*

*27.14 Bydd Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio yn cyfarfod yn breifat a bydd ei aelodau o dan ddyletswydd i gadw cyfrinachedd unrhyw drafodaeth gan y Pwyllgor ac unrhyw ddogfennau sy'n cael eu hystyried gan y Pwyllgor heblaw llythyr penderfyniad Pwyllgor ar ôl iddo gael ei fabwysiadu ynghyd ag unrhyw ddogfennau y mae'n cyfeirio atynt.*

27.15 *The Committee may request the attendance at its meetings of members of the staff of the Assembly for the purpose of:*

- i) *obtaining their advice;*
- ii) *preparing a draft decision letter giving reasons for their decision;*
- iii) *minuting the Committee's decisions.*

27.16 *The Committee's functions shall cease when the Chair signs a decision letter which the Committee has resolved to adopt. Where no decision letter has been signed on or before the date specified in the motion establishing the Committee, the Committee shall cease to exist. The Committee shall otherwise cease to exist when the Chair signs the decision letter.*

*Standing Order 27*

*Annex A*

*Qualification for Membership of the Planning Decision Panel*

*1. The Assembly Members who are Members of the Planning Decision Panel are those:*

- a) *who are members of the Assembly committee having responsibility for planning matters;*
- b) *who have completed a course of relevant training approved by the Chair of the Assembly committee having responsibility for planning matters; and*
- c) *who have agreed to be bound by the current Code of Conduct for members of Planning Decision Committees issued by the Presiding Officer.*

*2. A Member of the Panel is disqualified from being a member of a particular Planning Decision Committee if:*

- a) *the site of the development to which the appeal or application relates falls in whole or in part within the constituency or electoral region of that member; or*
- b) *the Member has an interest in the subject*

27.15 *Caiiff y Pwyllgor ofyn i aelodau o staff y Cynulliad fod yn bresennol yn ei gyfarfodydd i'r dibenion canlynol:*

- i) *cael cyngor ganddynt;*
- ii) *paratoi llythyr penderfyniad drafft sy'n rhoi rhesymau dros eu penderfyniad;*
- iii) *cofnodi penderfyniadau'r Pwyllgor.*

27.16 *Bydd swyddogaethau'r Pwyllgor yn peidio pan fydd y Cadeirydd yn llofnodi llythyr penderfyniad y mae'r Pwyllgor wedi penderfynu ei fabwysiadu. Lle na fydd llythyr penderfyniad wedi'i lofnodi ar y dyddiad a bennwyd yn y cynnig i sefydlu'r Pwyllgor neu cyn hynny, bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod. Fel arall, bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod pan fydd y Cadeirydd yn llofnodi'r llythyr penderfyniad.*

*Rheol Sefydlog 27*

*Atodiad A*

*Amodau ar gyfer Aelodaeth y Panel Penderfyniadau Cynllunio*

*1. Dyma'r Aelodau Cynulliad fydd yn Aelodau o'r Panel Penderfyniadau Cynllunio:*

- a) *rhai sydd yn aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Cynulliad sy'n gyfrifol am faterion cynllunio;*
- b) *rhai sydd wedi gorffen cwrs hyfforddiant perthnasol a gymeradwywyd gan Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cynulliad sy'n gyfrifol am faterion cynllunio; ac*
- c) *rhai sydd wedi cytuno i gael eu rhwymo gan y Côd Ymddygiad cyfredol a gyhoeddir gan y Llywydd ar gyfer aelodau Pwyllgorau Penderfyniadau Cynllunio.*

*2. Bydd Aelod o'r Panel yn cael ei ddatgymhwyso rhag bod yn aelod o Bwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio penodol os bydd:*

- a) *safle'r datblygiad y mae'r apêl neu'r cais yn gysylltiedig ag ef wedi'i leoli yn llwyr neu'n rhannol yn etholaeth neu ranbarth etholiadol yr aelod hwnnw; neu*
- b) *os bydd yr Aelod â buddiant yn nhestun yr*

*matter of the appeal or application which, if he or she were to take part in the proceedings of the Committee the Member would be obliged to declare under Standing Order 4.5 or which would prohibit the Member from voting on that subject matter under Standing Order 4.7; or*

*c) there are other circumstances (as set out in the Code of Conduct referred to in paragraph 1(c) above) which could be seen to call into question the ability of the Member to consider the appeal or application objectively and impartially.*

#### *Party Balance*

*3. For the purpose of ensuring compliance with Standing Order 27.10, the Committee Clerk shall maintain separate lists (in alphabetical order where a list includes more than one person) of members of the Panel in accordance with the political groups to which they belong, as follows:*

*List A The Labour Party*

*List B Plaid Cymru*

*List C The Conservative Party*

*List D The Liberal Democrat Party*

*4. When the Committee Clerk receives a notification under Standing Order 27.3 the Committee Clerk will prepare a provisional list of members of the Planning Decision Committee of which one will be the Assembly Secretary comprising two members of List A, one member of List B and a member of either List C or List D.*

*5. In selecting the member (other than the Assembly Secretary) from List A or from List B the Committee Clerk will select names in rotation except that where a member would have served on a Planning Decision Committee but was disqualified from doing so, or was otherwise unable to serve, that member will be treated as the member on that list next due for selection.*

*6. In selecting the member from either List C or D the Committee Clerk will select members from each list alternately, beginning with List C.*

*apêl neu'r cais y byddai'n ofynnol iddo neu iddi, petai'n cymryd rhan yng ngweithredoedd y Pwyllgor, ei ddatgan o dan Reol Sefydlog 4.5 neu a fyddai'n rhwystro'r Aelod rhag pleidleisio ar y testun hwnnw o dan Reol Sefydlog 4.7; neu*

*c) os bydd amgylchiadau eraill (fel y'u nodir yn y Cód Ymddygiad y cyfeirir ato ym mharagraff 1(c) uchod) y gellid eu hystyried yn rhywbeth a fyddai'n codi amheuon ynglŷn â gallu'r Aelod i ystyried yr apêl neu'r cais yn wrthrychol ac yn ddiuedd.*

#### *Cydbwysedd y Pleidiau*

*3. Er mwyn sicrhau cydymffurfio â Rheol Sefydlog 27.10, bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor yn cadw rhestrau ar wahân (yn nhrefn yr wyddor os bydd rhestr yn cynnwys mwy nag un person) o aelodau'r Panel yn ôl y grwpiau gwleidyddol y maent yn aelodau ohonynt, fel a ganlyn:*

*Rhestr A Y Blaid Lafur*

*Rhestr B Plaid Cymru*

*Rhestr C Y Blaid Geidwadol*

*Rhestr D Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol*

*4. Pan fydd Clerc y Pwyllgor yn cael hysbysiad o dan Reol Sefydlog 27.3, bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor yn paratoi rhestr amodol o aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio, a'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad yn un ohonynt, fydd yn cynnwys dau aelod o Restr A, un aelod o Restr B ac aelod o naill ai Restr C neu Restr D.*

*5. Wrth ddewis yr aelod (heblaw'r Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad) o Restr A neu o Restr B bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor yn dewis enwau yn gylchredol ond bod aelod a fyddai wedi gwasanaethu ar Bwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio ond a ddatgymhwyswyd rhag gwneud hynny neu a oedd fel arall heb allu gwasanaethu, yn cael ei drin fel yr aelod nesaf i'w ddewis o'r rhestr honno.*

*6. Wrth ddewis yr aelod o naill ai Restr C neu D bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor yn dewis aelodau o'r ddwy restr bob yn ail, gan ddechrau gyda Rhestr C.*

7. *The Committee Clerk will notify each member whose name appears on a provisional list of members of a Planning Decision Committee, identifying the relevant appeal or application.*
7. *Bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor yn hysbysu pob aelod y mae ei enw yn ymddangos ar restr dros dro o aelodau Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio, gan dynnu sylw at yr apêl neu gais perthnasol.*
8. *Each of the members notified will, having consulted the statement provided under paragraph 27.3, then notify the Committee Clerk within two working days if that member is disqualified under paragraph 2 above from serving on the Committee, or is otherwise unable to serve, in which case the Committee Clerk will (subject to paragraph 10 below) select the name of the next member from the same list (or in the case of Lists C and D the name of the member from the alternate list) and notify that member in accordance with paragraph 7 above.*
8. *Bydd pob un o'r aelodau a hysbysir, ar ôl edrych ar y datganiad a geir o dan baragraff 27.3, yn hysbysu Clerc y Pwyllgor wedyn, cyn pen dau ddiwrnod gwaith, a yw'r aelod hwnnw wedi'i ddatgymhwyso o dan baragraff 2 uchod rhag gwasanaethu ar y Pwyllgor, neu a yw heb allu gwasanaethu fel arall, ac yn yr achos hwnnw bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor (yn amodol ar baragraff 10 isod) yn dewis enw'r aelod nesaf o'r un rhestr (neu, yn achos Rhestrau C a D, enw'r aelod o'r rhestr arall) ac yn hysbysu'r aelod hwnnw yn unol â pharagraff 7 uchod.*
9. *If both members from List C and D are disqualified or otherwise unable to serve, the Committee Clerk will select an additional member from List B.*
9. *Os yw'r ddau aelod o restrau C a D wedi'u datgymhwyso neu fel arall heb allu gwasanaethu, bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor yn dewis aelod ychwanegol o Restr B.*
10. *If the Assembly Secretary is disqualified or otherwise unable to serve the Committee Clerk will select the Chair of the Assembly committee having responsibility for planning matters in preference to any other member appearing on the same List.*
10. *Os bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad wedi'i ddatgymhwyso neu fel arall heb allu gwasanaethu bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor yn dewis Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cynulliad sy'n gyfrifol am faterion cynllunio cyn unrhyw aelod arall sydd yn ymddangos ar yr un Rhestr.*
11. *When the Committee Clerk has compiled a list of 4 Members who are not disqualified or otherwise unable to serve, the Committee Clerk will notify the Assembly Business Secretary under paragraph 27.4.*
11. *Pan fydd Clerc y Pwyllgor wedi llunio rhestr o 4 Aelod sydd heb eu datgymhwyso nac fel arall heb allu gwasanaethu, bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor yn hysbysu Trefnydd y Cynulliad o dan baragraff 27.4.*
12. *If for any reason the Committee Clerk is unable to compile such a list of 4 Members the Committee Clerk shall notify the Assembly Business Secretary of that fact and of the reasons.*
12. *Os bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor, am unrhyw reswm, heb allu llunio'r cyfryw restr o 4 Aelod, bydd Clerc y Pwyllgor yn hysbysu Trefnydd y Cynulliad am y ffaith honno a'r rhesymau.*
- Standing Order 27*
- Rheol Sefydlog 27*
- Annex B*
- Atodiad B*
- Model Motion Establishing a Planning Decision Committee*
- Cynnig Enghreifftiol i Sefydlu Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio*
- It is resolved:*
- Penderfynir:*
1. *That a committee, to be known as Planning Decision Committee 1999/1 be*
2. *Sefydlu pwyllgor, a adwaenir fel Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio 1999/1, yn unol â*



*established, in accordance with Standing Order 27 to discharge the functions of the Assembly under (Section 77 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 or as the case may be) in respect of the matter(s) identified in the Schedule to this motion and that the Assembly's functions in that respect be delegated to that Committee.*

1. *That the members of that Committee be:*

*AB (Chair)  
CD  
EF  
GH*

3. *That the Committee shall cease to exist when the Chair of the Committee signs the decision letter in accordance with Standing Order 27.16 or on the (date) whichever is the earlier.*

4. *That if the Committee shall cease to exist without the Chair having signed a decision letter in respect of (all of) the matter(s) identified in the Schedule to this motion then in that event the functions identified in paragraph 1 above are, in relation to such matter(s), delegated to the First Secretary.*

#### *Schedule*

*An application by X for permission to carry out certain development at Y, namely...*

**Peter Law:** Before the Assembly came into being, the National Assembly Advisory Group was commissioned to advise on the way it should conduct its business. The group recommended that those planning decisions, which were previously made by the Secretary of State for Wales should be dealt with by a panel drawn from the relevant Subject Committee in the Assembly. This motion brings that recommendation into effect and adds the democratic dimension that will, I believe, be applauded by the people of Wales. The revision of Standing Orders provides for the formation of a committee of four Members as and when a planning case falls to be determined by the Assembly.

Members of the committee will be drawn

*Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27, i gyflawni swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad o dan (Adran 77 Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 neu yn ôl y galw) mewn perthynas â'r mater(ion) a nodir yn yr Atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, a dirprwyo swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad yn hynny o beth i'r Pwyllgor hwnnw.*

2. *Mai dyma fydd aelodau'r Pwyllgor hwnnw:*

*AB (Cadeirydd)  
CD  
EF  
GH*

3. *Y bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod pan fydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn llofnodi'r llythyr penderfyniad yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 27.16 neu ar (dyddiad), pa un bynnag a ddaw gyntaf.*

4. *Os bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod heb i'r Cadeirydd fod wedi llofnodi llythyr penderfyniad mewn perthynas â'r (cyfan o'r) mater(ion) a nodir yn yr Atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, bydd y swyddogaethau a nodir ym mharagraff 1 uchod yn cael eu dirprwyo i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd mewn perthynas â'r cyfryw fater(ion).*

#### *Atodlen*

*Cais gan X am ganiatâd i wneud datblygiad yn Y, sef ...*

**Peter Law:** Cyn i'r Cynulliad ddod i fodolaeth, comisiynwyd Grŵp Ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i gynghori ynghylch y modd y dylai gyflawni ei fusnes. Argymhellodd y grŵp y dylai'r penderfyniadau cynllunio hynny a wneid gynt gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru gael eu trafod gan banel wedi'i dynnu o'r Pwyllgor Pwnc perthnasol yn y Cynulliad. Daw'r cynnig hwn â'r argymhelliad hwnnw i rym gan ychwanegu'r dimensiwn democrataidd a gymeradwyir, dybiwn i, gan bobl Cymru. Mae diwygio'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn darparu ar gyfer ffurfio pwyllgor o bedwar Aelod pan ddaw achos cynllunio i'w benderfynu gan y Cynulliad.

Tynnir aelodau'r pwyllgor o Bwyllgor yr

from the Environment and Local Government Committee. Each planning decision committee will be delegated the power to determine the case and will be wound up when it has taken its decision. Planning decision committees will decide on major planning appeals and applications that have been called in for the Assembly rather than the local planning authority to determine. Those decisions are, at present, made by myself or the First Secretary. The arrangements have been designed to ensure public confidence in the fairness of the planning system and Members will not take part in the decision if they have an interest in the case. Members will serve on planning decision committees on a rota basis so that there can be no doubt that the selection procedure is fair. It is correct to accept the National Assembly Advisory Group's recommendations and adopt a procedure that means that decisions no longer rest with an individual in the Assembly. I commend this motion to the Members.

**Janet Ryder:** This motion has all-party support and we welcome the procedures that are being set out. However, after looking at them again, I suggest that we set ourselves a timescale, since we are keen to set timescales for local planning departments. I hope that will be considered and implemented. For clarification, could all Members be issued with the criteria for making decisions to call in applications by Peter Law or the First Secretary?

2:57 p.m.

**David Davies:** Earlier, I raised concerns about the chair of this committee often being drawn from the Labour Party. I have been reassured by the fact that, in many instances, members will be allowed to decide on the chair if the relevant Assembly Secretary does not want to, or is unable to do so. We have had small, nagging concerns but are happy to take the Assembly Secretary's word that this process will be fair. We will watch this space with interest.

**Peter Black:** I support Janet Ryder's comments on timescales. It is important that,

Amgylchedd a Llywodraeth Leol. Dirprwyir yr hawl i bob pwyllgor benderfyniadau cynllunio i benderfynu ar yr achos, a chaiff ei ddirwyn i ben wedi iddo wneud ei benderfyniad. Pwyllgorau benderfyniadau cynllunio fydd yn penderfynu ar apeliadau cynllunio mawr a cheisiadau a alwyd i mewn i'w penderfynu gan y Cynulliad yn hytrach na gan yr awdurdod cynllunio lleol. Gwneir y penderfyniadau hyn ar hyn o bryd gennyf fi neu'r Prif Ysgrifennydd. Cynlluniwyd y trefniadau i sicrhau hyder y cyhoedd yn nhgwch y system gynllunio ac ni fydd Aelodau'n cymryd rhan yn y penderfyniad os oes ganddynt fuddiant yn yr achos. Bydd Aelodau'n gwasanaethu ar bwyllgorau benderfyniadau cynllunio ar sail trefn rota fel na all fod unrhyw amheuaeth nad yw'r drefn ddewis yn deg. Mae'n gywir derbyn argymhellion Grŵp Ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a mabwysiadu gweithdrefn sydd yn golygu na fydd penderfyniadau mwyach yn nwylo unigolyn yn y Cynulliad. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig hwn i'r Aelodau.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae cefnogaeth gan y pleidiau i gyd i'r cynnig hwn a chroesawn y gweithdrefnau a amlinellir. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl edrych arnynt eto, awgrymaf y dylem osod amserlen inni'n hunain, gan ein bod yn frwd dros osod amserlenni i adrannau cynllunio lleol. Gobeithiaf y caiff hyn ei ystyried a'i weithredu. Er mwyn eglurder, a allai pob Aelod gael copi o'r meini prawf a ddefnyddir i alw ceisiadau i mewn gan Peter Law neu'r Prif Ysgrifennydd?

**David Davies:** Yn gynharach, mynegais bryderon y byddai cadeirydd y pwyllgor hwn yn aml yn cael ei dynnu o'r Blaid Lafur. Tawelwyd fy ofnau gan y ffaith y caniateir i'r aelodau, mewn llawer o achosion, benderfynu ar y cadeirydd os na fydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad yn dymuno, neu'n gallu, cymryd y swydd. Bu gennym fân bryderon ond yr ydym yn hapus i gymryd gair yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad y bydd y broses hon yn un deg. Byddwn yn gwyllo'r gofod hwn gyda diddordeb.

**Peter Black:** Cefnogaf sylwadau Janet Ryder ar amserlenni. Mae'n bwysig, os ydym am

if we are to set targets for local authorities for returning planning applications, the Assembly has the same sort of targets for appeals and determinations. Standing Order No. 27.14 on how these meetings are to be conducted states that they are to take place in private. I understand that that may well be the advice that we have had to date. However, it seems to me that, in the interest of openness and transparency, there is no reason why these meetings should not take place in public. That would be a new departure for the way in which planning applications are made at this level, but planning meetings are held in public at a local authority level. Planning application appeals are also held in public. It is only reasonable to suggest that, after this committee has been meeting for some time, we review the procedures and see whether there is any reason why we should not meet in public. That would enable people who are interested in an appeal or in the process itself to see how things operate and that justice is being done.

**Sue Essex:** I do not know if everyone here realises just how innovative this approach is. Alun and Peter are to be commended because we have followed through the National Assembly Advisory Group's recommendations and are testing something that, to the best of my knowledge, has not been tested elsewhere in the UK. If it works, I hope that we will be a role model. Many outside organisations are watching us and we must ensure that we can deliver this properly and fairly. I hope that we will monitor the situation and report back to the Assembly on progress.

I stress that the membership of each panel or committee will be drawn up on a balanced approach and on a party political basis. However, it is imperative that decisions are not taken on a party political basis once the panels are formed. That will place a new discipline on all of us. Perhaps some of us who have been on planning committees are used to dealing with that, but others may not be. We are, and will be, acting in a quasi-legal situation, and we will have to be seen to be fair in our decisions.

osod targedau i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer anfon ceisiadau cynllunio'n ôl, fod y Cynulliad yn cael yr un math o dargeddi ar gyfer apeliadau a phenderfyniadau. Ar gwestiwn sut y cynhelir y cyfarfodydd hyn, dywed Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.14 eu bod i'w cynnal yn breifat. Deallaf mai dyna, yn ôl pob tebygrwydd, yw'r cyngor a gawsom hyd yma. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ymddangos i mi, o safbwynt bod yn agored a thryloyw, nad oes dim rheswm pam na ddylai'r cyfarfodydd hyn fod yn gyhoeddus. Byddai hynny'n ddatblygiad newydd yn y modd y gwneir penderfyniadau cynllunio ar y lefel hon, ond mae cyfarfodydd cynllunio yn agored i'r cyhoedd ar lefel awdurdod lleol. Cynhelir apeliadau ar geisiadau cynllunio yn llygad y cyhoedd hefyd. Nid yw ond rhesymol awgrymu y gallem adolygu'r drefn ar ôl i'r pwyllgor hwn gyfarfod dros gyfnod, gan weld a oes unrhyw reswm pam na ddylem agor ein cyfarfodydd i'r cyhoedd. Byddai hynny'n caniatáu i bobl sydd â diddordeb mewn apêl neu yn y broses ei hun weld sut y mae pethau'n gweithio a gweld bod cyfiawnder yn cael ei weinyddu.

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn gwybod a yw pawb yma'n sylweddoli'n union pa mor arloesol yw'r drefn hon. Rhaid llongyfarch Alun a Peter oherwydd yr ydym wedi dilyn argymhellion Grŵp Ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac yn treialu rhywbeth na chafodd ei brofi, hyd y gwn i, yn unman arall yn y DU. Os bydd yn gweithio, yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwn ni'n batrwm i eraill. Mae llawer o gyrff allanol yn ein gwyllo a rhaid inni sicrhau y gallwn weithredu hyn yn iawn ac yn deg. Gobeithio y byddwn yn monitro'r sefyllfa ac yn adrodd yn ôl i'r Cynulliad ar yr hyn a gyflawnir.

Pwysleisiaf y caiff aelodaeth pob panel neu bwyllgor ei sefydlu ar sail gytbwys ac ar sail pleidiau gwleidyddol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hollbwysig na wneir penderfyniadau ar sail gwleidyddiaeth plaid unwaith y bydd y paneli wedi'u ffurfio. Bydd hynny'n gosod disgyblaeth newydd arnom i gyd. Efallai fod rhai ohonom a fu ar bwyllgorau cynllunio wedi hen arfer delio â hynny, ond nid eraill efallai. Yr ydym, ac fe fyddwn, yn gweithredu mewn sefyllfa led-gyfreithiol, a bydd yn rhaid i bobl weld ein bod yn deg yn ein penderfyniadau.

I wish to clarify with Peter, Janet Ryder's point about call-ins. Presumably, the decision to call in an application will rest with Alun or Peter. I hope that people recognise—and I speak on behalf of my Committee members—that we work extremely hard. We have a heavy load, which reflects Peter's load. I do not know how we will cope with that, but I am sure that we will. We will look at the timetables and so on to ensure that we respond speedily. However, this is an additional burden on the Committee and, after 12 months, we will have to review not just how the decision-making process has worked, but the toll it takes on the Committee members.

**Peter Law:** I thank Members for their valued contributions. I assure Janet that we will pursue timescales and targets rigidly; it behoves us to do so. There will be all-party support for that and members of the planning panels will ensure that, as Assembly Secretary, I see that it happens. I will arrange for my reply to Glyn Davies, which indicates the criteria for calling in appeals, to be made available to every Member. Those guidelines went through the Assembly last year. Calling in is still undertaken by the First Secretary or myself and that will continue. Today is a special day for inclusivity after David Davies said that he was reassured and had taken my word. I feel that I achieved something in the Environment and Local Government Committee this morning. I am grateful for those kind comments, David.

We have an agreed system for chairpersons' appointments. Peter Black made a point about meetings. At the moment, we must hold meetings in private because public enquiries precede the panel's meetings. However, we are in the privileged position of being able to review everything and I understand his point. I appreciate the Chair of the Environment and Local Government Committee's comments today about the innovative nature of this proposal. It is unique and ground-breaking. We can be proud of the proposal and I am sure that Members will make it work. The

Hoffwn roi eglurhad gyda Peter i bwynt Janet Ryder ynghylch galw i mewn. Mae'n debyg mai Alun neu Peter fydd yn penderfynu galw cais i mewn. Gobeithio y bydd pobl yn sylweddoli—ac yr wyf yn siarad ar ran aelodau fy Mhwyllgor—ein bod yn gweithio'n eithriadol o galed. Mae gennym faich trwm, sydd yn adlewyrchu baich Peter. Nid wyf yn gwybod sut y gwnawn ymdopi â hynny, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnawn. Edrychwn ar yr amserlenni ac yn y blaen er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn ymateb yn gyflym. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn faich ychwanegol ar y Pwyllgor ac ymhen 12 mis bydd yn rhaid inni adolygu nid yn unig sut y mae'r broses benderfynu wedi gweithio, ond sut y mae'n effeithio ar aelodau'r Pwyllgor.

**Peter Law:** Diolch i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau gwerthfawr. Yr wyf yn sicrhau Janet y byddwn yn glynu'n gaeth at amserlenni a tharged; dyna sydd yn briodol. Bydd pob plaid yn cefnogi hynny a bydd aelodau'r panelau cynllunio'n sicrhau fy mod i fel Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad yn ymorol fod hynny'n digwydd. Gwnaf drefniadau i f'ateb i Glyn Davies, sydd yn nodi'r meini prawf ar gyfer galw apeliadau i mewn, fod ar gael i bob Aelod. Aeth y canllawiau hynny drwy'r Cynulliad y llynedd. Y Prif Ysgrifennydd neu fi sydd yn gyfrifol o hyd am alw i mewn a bydd hynny'n parhau. Mae heddiw'n ddiwrnod arbennig i gynhwysedd wedi i David Davies ddweud ei fod wedi cael tawelwch meddwl ac wedi derbyn fy ngair. Teimlaf fy mod wedi cyflawni rhywbeth ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd a Llywodraeth Leol y bore yma. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y sylwadau caredig hynny, David.

Mae gennym system yr ydym wedi cytuno arni ar gyfer penodi cadeiryddion. Gwnaeth Peter Black bwynt ynghlŷn â chyfarfodydd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n rhaid inni gynnal cyfarfodydd yn breifat oherwydd bod ymchwiliadau cyhoeddus wedi'u cynnal cyn cyfarfodydd y panel. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn y sefyllfa freintiedig o allu adolygu popeth ac yr wyf yn deall ei bwynt. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi sylwadau Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd a Llywodraeth Leol heddiw ynghylch natur arloesol y cynnig hwn. Mae'n unigryw ac yn torri tir newydd. Gallwn fod yn falch o'r cynnig ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd

arrangements in this Standing Order provide us with the opportunity of operating differently in Wales, in a more transparent and inclusive way. It is important that confidence in the planning system is maintained, and that it is fair and seen to be fair. A wide range of options were considered before these proposals were put to you and the motion reflects the need to meet the requirements of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and planning law. I thank Members for their support.

yr Aelodau yn gwneud iddo weithio. Mae'r trefniadau yn y Rheol Sefydlog hon yn darparu cyfle inni weithredu'n wahanol yng Nghymru, mewn ffordd fwy tryloyw a chynhwysol. Mae'n bwysig cynnal hyder yn y system gynllunio, a'i bod yn deg ac yn cael ei gweld yn un deg. Ystyriwyd amrywiaeth eang o opsiynau cyn cyflwyno'r cynigion hyn i chi ac mae'r cynnig yn adlewyrchu'r angen i gwrdd â gofynion Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a chyfraith gynllunio. Diolch i'r Aelodau am eu cefnogaeth.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Michael, Alun  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

3:07 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf am bleidlais ar y cynnig wedi ei ddiwygio. Bydd angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i dderbyn y cynnig hwn. **The Presiding Officer:** I call for a vote on the motion as amended. A majority of two-thirds is needed to adopt this motion.

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Michael, Alun  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion adopted.*

### **Canlyniad Adolygiad y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol The Outcome of the National Curriculum Review**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the names of Gareth Jones and Jenny Randerson.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dewis gwelliant 1 yn enwau Gareth Jones a Jenny Randerson.

**The Secretary for Education and Children (Rosemary Butler):** I propose that the Assembly

**Yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant (Rosemary Butler):** Cynigiau fod y Cynulliad

*(a) welcomes the outcome of the first Wales only review of the national curriculum;*

*(a) yn croesawu canlyniad yr adolygiad cyntaf o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a oedd yn benodol i Gymru*

*(b) agrees that ACCAC has achieved in full the original aims of the review (laid in the Table Office on 11 January 2000); that the revised curriculum (copies of the programmes of study and attainment targets are available on the National Assembly for Wales website at home page/policy and information/education/national curriculum review) reflects the distinctive needs of Wales and the importance of every child receiving a broad and balanced education; that the new programmes of study and attainment targets will be more manageable for teachers; and that taken with the new frameworks for personal and social education and work related education the new curriculum will ensure that young people are better prepared for the responsibilities and challenges of adult life.*

*(b) yn cytuno bod ACCAC wedi cyflawni amcanion gwreiddiol yr adolygiad (a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Ionawr 2000) yn llawn; bod y cwricwlwm diwygiedig (ceir copi o'r rhaglenni astudio a'r targedau cyrhaeddiad ar wefan Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru o dan hafan/polisi a gwybodaeth/addysg/adolygiad o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol) yn adlewyrchu anghenion arbennig Cymru a phwysigrwydd sicrhau bod pob plentyn yn derbyn addysg eang a chytbwys; bod y rhaglenni astudio newydd a'r targedau cyrhaeddiad yn fwy hylaw i'r athrawon; a bod y cwricwlwm gyda'r fframweithiau newydd ar gyfer addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol ac addysg sydd yn gysylltiedig â gwaith yn sicrhau y bydd pobl ifanc wedi'u paratoi yn well ar gyfer y cyfrifoldebau a'r heriau a fydd yn eu hwynebu fel oedolion.*

It gives me great pleasure to open this debate on the review of the national curriculum in Wales. The importance of ensuring that every child receives a broad and balanced curriculum lies at the heart of our policy for raising standards in Welsh schools. It is fitting that this, the first curriculum to be presented to the Assembly, is also the first to have been developed in Wales and designed to meet the distinctive characteristics and needs of education in Wales.

Mae'n rhoi pleser mawr imi agor y ddadl hon ar adolygiad y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yng Nghymru. Pwysigrwydd sicrhau y caiff pob plentyn gwricwlwm eang a chytbwys sydd wrth wraidd ein polisi ar gyfer codi safonau yn ysgolion Cymru. Mae'n addas mai'r cwricwlwm hwn, y cyntaf i'w gyflwyno i'r Cynulliad, yw'r cyntaf hefyd i gael ei ddatblygu yng Nghymru a'i gynllunio i wrdd ag anghenion a nodweddion arbennig addysg yng Nghymru.

The original remit for the review of the

Gwnaed y cais cyntaf am adolygu'r

national curriculum was issued to the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales, ACCAC, in 1997. The key features of that remit were that ACCAC should provide a curriculum that would be more manageable and flexible for teachers, that would reflect the priorities of the 'Building Excellent Schools Together' White Paper, prepare pupils for the opportunities, responsibilities and experiences of adult and working life and promote progression between key stages and into post-16 education. The other important aspect of the remit issued to ACCAC was that the review should be evolutionary in nature, and build on the best of the curriculum currently in place in Wales. That was intended partly to ensure a degree of continuity for teachers. However, it also reflected the evidence from Estyn, the schools inspectorate, as to the positive impact that a broad and balanced curriculum was having in helping to raise standards in Welsh schools. In light of this evolutionary approach to the present review, I am happy to support the amendment in the names of Jenny Randerson and Gareth Jones. We need to ensure that the curriculum in Wales continues to evolve in line with the educational needs of this country. It will be for the Assembly to consider any future changes.

It is important to appreciate the amount of detailed work with which ACCAC has been engaged subsequently. The programmes of study for the 11 national curriculum subjects, now available on the internet, are the culmination of a long and carefully planned process. Throughout this process ACCAC has been anxious to involve teachers as fully as possible. This contact with teachers was a crucial element of the research that was conducted into the strengths and weaknesses of the existing curriculum. ACCAC then worked with groups of teachers in preparing the revised programmes of study. Teachers were consulted extensively during the statutory consultation that took place following the publication of those programmes of study in May last year. An indication of the thoroughness with which ACCAC approached this task is the enormously positive response that the detailed programmes of study have received.

cwricwlwm cenedlaethol i Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, ACCAC, yn 1997. Prif nodweddion y cais hwnnw oedd y dylai ACCAC ddarparu cwricwlwm a fyddai'n fwy hydrin a hyblyg i athrawon, a fyddai'n adlewyrchu blaenoriaethau'r Papur Gwyn 'Adeiladu Ysgolion Ardderchog Gyda'n Gilydd,' yn paratoi disgyblion ar gyfer cyfleoedd, cyfrifoldebau a phrofiadau bywyd oedolyn a gwaith ac yn hybu symud ymlaen rhwng cyfnodau allweddol ac i addysg ôl-16. Yr agwedd bwysig arall ar y canllawiau a roddwyd i ACCAC oedd y dylai'r adolygiad fod yn esblygol ei natur, gan adeiladu ar y gorau o'r cwricwlwm a fodolai ar y pryd yng Nghymru. Bwriad hynny yn rhannol oedd sicrhau rhyw radd o ddilyniant i athrawon. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd hefyd yn adlewyrchu'r dystiolaeth gan Estyn, yr arolygaeth ysgolion, ynghylch yr effaith gadarnhaol yr oedd cwricwlwm eang a chytbwys yn ei chael o ran helpu i godi safonau yn ysgolion Cymru. Yng ngoleuni'r agwedd esblygol hon i'r adolygiad presennol, yr wyf yn hapus i gefnogi'r gwelliant yn enwau Jenny Randerson a Gareth Jones. Mae angen inni sicrhau fod y cwricwlwm yng Nghymru yn dal i esblygu yn unol ag anghenion addysgol y wlad hon. Mater i'r Cynulliad fydd ystyried unrhyw newidiadau yn y dyfodol.

Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli gymaint o waith manwl a wnaed gan ACCAC yn ddiweddar. Mae'r rhaglenni astudio ar gyfer 11 pwnc y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol, sydd ar gael bellach ar y rhynggrwyd, yn ganlyniad proses hir a gynlluniwyd yn ofalus. Drwy gydol y broses hon bu ACCAC yn awyddus i gynnwys athrawon gymaint ag yr oedd modd. Yr oedd y cyswllt hwn ag athrawon yn elfen allweddol yn yr ymchwil a wnaethpwyd i gryfderau a gwendidau'r cwricwlwm presennol. Wedyn gweithiodd ACCAC gyda grwpiau o athrawon i baratoi'r rhaglenni astudio diwygiedig. Ymgynghorwyd yn llawn ag athrawon yn ystod yr ymgynghori statudol a ddigwyddodd yn sgîl cyhoeddi'r rhaglenni astudio hynny ym mis Mai y llynedd. Arwydd o ba mor drwyadl yr aeth ACCAC ati i gyflawni'r dasg hon yw'r ymateb hynod o gadarnhaol a fu i'r rhaglenni astudio manwl.



In addition to ACCAC's external consultations, I have ensured that the Pre-16 Education Committee was kept fully informed of developments within the review. In October of last year, Brian Connolly, chairman of ACCAC, presented a report on the consultation to the Pre-16 Education Committee. A working group, led by John Marek, and including Jenny Randerson, Jonathan Morgan and Gareth Jones, was set up to scrutinise the proposals and to question ACCAC officials directly. I am pleased to say that the working group was supportive of ACCAC's work and recommended that I take the necessary steps to bring forward the proposals to Plenary. I hope that John Marek will speak later in this debate. I commend Brian Connolly and all the ACCAC staff who were involved in this work. Schools in Wales will reap the benefits of their careful preparation in years to come.

Given our commitment to evolutionary change, it is not surprising that a number of crucial aspects of the new curriculum remain unchanged. There are still 11 national curriculum subjects in Wales, along with religious education. There has been no change in the distinctive options available in Wales at key stage 4 and we continue to emphasise that every child is entitled to a broad and balanced education.

However, although many aspects of the new curriculum remain the same, there are some important changes. These include greater consistency between the Welsh and English programmes of study, greater flexibility for schools in their choice of modern foreign language provision and the introduction of explicit references to sustainable development in geography. In physical education, a wider range of activities and forms of exercise have been introduced for pupils at key stage 4. Games are no longer compulsory, which creates greater choice for those pupils not motivated by competitive team sports.

ACCAC's advice did not only cover the detailed content of the 11 national curriculum programmes of study but also gave particular scrutiny to the themes that run across the

Yn ogystal ag ymgynghoriadau allanol ACCAC, yr wyf wedi sicrhau y rhoddwyd pob gwybodaeth i'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 am y datblygiadau o fewn yr adolygiad. Ym mis Hydref y llynedd, cyflwynodd Brian Connolly, cadeirydd ACCAC, adroddiad ar yr ymgynghoriad i'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16. Sefydlwyd gweithgor, dan arweiniad John Marek, ac yn cynnwys Jenny Randerson, Jonathan Morgan a Gareth Jones, i archwilio'r cynigion a holi swyddogion ACCAC yn uniongyrchol. Mae'n dda gennyf ddweud y bu i'r gweithgor gefnogi gwaith ACCAC ac argymhell fy mod i'n cymryd y camau angenrheidiol i ddod â'r cynigion ymlaen i Gyfarfod Lawn. Gobeithio y bydd John Marek yn siarad yn ddiweddarach yn y ddadl. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo Brian Connolly a holl staff ACCAC a fu'n ymhél â'r gwaith hwn. Bydd ysgolion yng Nghymru yn medi ffrwyth eu paratoad gofalus mewn blynyddoedd i ddod.

O gofio'n hymrwymiad i newid esblygol, nid yw'n syndod bod nifer o agweddau allweddol yn y cwricwlwm newydd yn aros yn ddigyfnewid. Ceir 11 o bynciau cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yng Nghymru o hyd, ynghyd ag addysg grefyddol. Ni fu dim newid yn y dewisiadau gwahaniaethol sydd ar gael yng Nghymru yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 a daliwn i bwysleisio fod gan bob plentyn hawl i addysg eang a chytbwys.

Fodd bynnag, er bod sawl agwedd o'r cwricwlwm newydd yn aros yr un peth, y mae rhai newidiadau pwysig. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys mwy o gysondeb rhwng rhaglenni astudio Cymru a Lloegr, mwy o hyblygrwydd i ysgolion yn eu dewis o ddarpariaeth ieithoedd tramor modern, a chyflwyno cyfeiriadau penodol at ddatblygiad cynaliadwy mewn daearyddiaeth. Mewn addysg gorfforol, cyflwynwyd amrediad ehangach o weithgareddau a ffurfiau o ymarfer i ddisgyblion yng nghyfnod allweddol 4. Nid yw chwaraeon yn orfodol mwyach, sydd yn creu mwy o ddewis i'r disgyblion hynny na chânt eu symbylu gan chwaraeon tîm cystadleuol.

Yn ogystal ag ymdrin â chynnwys manwl 11 rhaglen astudiaeth y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol, rhoddodd cyngor ACCAC sylw arbennig i'r themâu sydd yn rhedeg ar draws

curriculum, many of which reflect the Assembly's priorities. They include issues such as equality of opportunity, social inclusion, sustainable development, food and the promotion of healthy lifestyles and the Curriculum Cymreig.

One innovation in the presentation of the new curriculum is the use of symbols to help teachers identify opportunities to develop these themes. The Curriculum Cymreig symbol, for example, highlights all the areas across the curriculum where there are explicit opportunities to develop and apply knowledge of the cultural, economic, environmental, historical and linguistic characteristics of Wales. I have also accepted ACCAC's advice that they provide further guidance and case studies for schools so that the teaching of the Curriculum Cymreig continues to improve.

The new programmes of study also highlight opportunities for developing pupils' mastery in the key skills of literacy, numeracy and information and communication technology. The most effective key skills teaching harnesses every opportunity for developing those skills across the curriculum. By highlighting those opportunities more clearly, the new curriculum will reinforce the important work that is already going on in schools to raise standards in those areas.

The cross-cutting themes, on which the new curriculum will perhaps have the greatest impact, are personal and social education and work-related education. ACCAC's advice includes new frameworks covering each of these areas. The personal and social education framework will provide schools with a common core of PSE for all pupils from the age of five up to 16. It defines the nature and purpose of PSE and identifies, by key stage, the key components of it.

The framework also gives explicit attention to the Assembly's key policy priorities of promoting equality of opportunity and social inclusion, healthy lifestyles, lifelong learning and sustainable development. In encouraging the delivery of PSE across the curriculum, the

y cwricwlwm, llawer ohonynt yn adlewyrchu blaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad. Maent yn cynnwys materion fel cyfle cyfartal, cynhwysiant cymdeithasol, datblygiad cynaliadwy, bwyd a hybu ffyrdd iach o fyw a'r Cwricwlwm Cymreig.

Un datblygiad newydd yng nghyflwyniad y cwricwlwm newydd yw defnyddio symbolau i helpu athrawon i nodi cyfleoedd i ddatblygu'r themâu hyn. Mae symbol y Cwricwlwm Cymreig, er enghraifft, yn tanlinellu'r holl fannau ar draws y cwricwlwm lle ceir cyfleoedd amlwg i ddatblygu a chymhwyso gwybodaeth am nodweddion diwylliannol, economaidd, amgylcheddol, hanesyddol a ieithyddol Cymru. Yr wyf hefyd wedi derbyn cyngor ACCAC eu bod yn darparu astudiaethau achos a chanllawiau pellach i ysgolion fel y ceir gwelliant parhaus yn nysgu'r Cwricwlwm Cymreig.

Mae'r rhaglenni astudiaeth newydd hefyd yn amlygu cyfleoedd ar gyfer datblygu meistrolaeth disgyblion yn y sgiliau allweddol sef llythrennedd, rhifedd a thechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Mae'r addysg fwyaf effeithiol o ran dysgu sgiliau allweddol yn manteisio ar bob cyfle i ddatblygu'r sgiliau hynny ar draws y cwricwlwm. Drwy amlygu'r cyfleoedd hynny'n gliriach, bydd y cwricwlwm newydd yn atgyfnerthu'r gwaith pwysig sydd eisoes yn digwydd mewn ysgolion i godi safonau yn y meysydd hynny.

Y themâu trawsbynciol, y bydd y cwricwlwm newydd efallai'n cael yr effaith fwyaf arnynt, yw addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol ac addysg berthnasol i waith. Mae cyngor ACCAC yn cynnwys fframweithiau newydd ar gyfer y ddau faes hyn. Bydd y fframwaith addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol yn darparu craidd cyffredin o ABCh i bob disgybl o bump i 16 oed. Mae'n diffinio natur a phwrpas ABCh ac yn nodi, fesul cyfnod allweddol, ei chydrannau allweddol.

Mae'r fframwaith hefyd yn rhoi sylw penodol i flaenoriaethau polisi allweddol y Cynulliad o hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol, ffyrdd iach o fyw, dysgu gydol oes a datblygiad cynaliadwy. Wrth annog cyflwyno ABCh ar draws y cwricwlwm, daw

Assembly's priorities will become the priorities of our young people.

I have taken ACCAC's advice that PSE should be non-statutory for the moment. It is important to give schools the opportunity to take on board the content of the framework in their delivery of PSE, which will be new and different for some schools, especially primary schools. This will also give schools the chance to use the framework across the curriculum, in the ways that I have described, rather than confining it to specific PSE lessons.

However, the important issues covered by PSE—equality of opportunity and better health—means that I will be monitoring closely the teaching of PSE across Wales. I will consider how ACCAC and Estyn can best advise the Assembly when we review the position in two years' time.

3:17 p.m.

To reflect the importance of education in the economic prosperity of Wales, ACCAC also develops a framework for work-related education for 14 to 19-year-olds. The framework builds on best practice across Wales. It aims to bring greater consistency to work-related education and set it in the context of the national policy and the wider curriculum, outlining its purposes and benefits. It lists the learning outcomes and key learning opportunities for all 14 to 19-year-olds. The framework also provides a basis for reviewing, planning and evaluating work-related education activities within schools.

This framework promotes a shared vision of the best way forward, through collaboration and commitment, for local partnerships and support networks. It is aimed at all interested parties including schools and colleges, training and enterprise councils, education-business partnerships, careers companies and local education authorities. All of these have a part to play in improving provision in this aspect of the curriculum. Once again, I have accepted ACCAC's advice that the framework should be introduced on a non-statutory basis, but that it should be reviewed

blaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad yn flaenoriaethau'n pobl ifanc.

Yr wyf wedi cymryd cyngor ACCAC y dylai ABCh fod yn anstatudol am y tro. Mae'n bwysig rhoi'r cyfle i ysgolion dderbyn cynnwys y fframwaith yn y modd y cyflwynant ABCh, a fydd yn newydd ac yn wahanol i rai ysgolion, yn enwedig ysgolion cynradd. Bydd hyn hefyd yn rhoi cyfle i ysgolion ddefnyddio'r fframwaith ar draws y cwricwlwm, yn y ffyrdd a ddisgrifiais, yn hytrach na'i gyfyngu i wersi ABCh penodol.

Fodd bynnag, oherwydd y materion pwysig a drafodir gan ABCh—cyfle cyfartal a gwell iechyd—byddaf yn monitro'n agos y modd y dysgir ABCh ledled Cymru. Byddaf yn ystyried sut y gall ACCAC ac Estyn gynorthwyo'r Cynulliad orau pan fyddwn yn adolygu'r sefyllfa ymhen dwy flynedd.

I adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd addysg i ffyniant economaidd Cymru, mae ACCAC hefyd yn datblygu fframwaith ar gyfer addysg berthnasol i waith ar gyfer plant 14 i 19 oed. Mae'r fframwaith yn adeiladu ar yr arfer gorau ledled Cymru. Ei nod yw sicrhau mwy o gysondeb mewn addysg berthnasol i waith a'i gosod yng nghyd-destun y polisi cenedlaethol a'r cwricwlwm ehangach, gan amlinellu ei dibenion a'i manteision. Mae'n rhestru'r canlyniadau dysgu a'r cyfleoedd dysgu allweddol i bawb rhwng 14 a 19 oed. Mae'r fframwaith hefyd yn darparu sail ar gyfer adolygu, cynllunio ac arfarnu gweithgareddau addysg berthnasol i waith o fewn ysgolion.

Mae'r fframwaith hwn yn hyrwyddo gweledigaeth ar y cyd ar gyfer y ffordd orau ymlaen, drwy gydweithio ac ymrwymiad, i bartneriaethau lleol a rhwydweithiau cefnogi. Mae wedi'i anelu at bawb sydd â diddordeb, gan gynnwys ysgolion a cholegau, cynghorau hyfforddi a menter, partneriaethau addysg-busnes, cwmnïau gyrfaoedd ac awdurdodau addysg lleol. Mae gan bawb o'r rhain ran i'w chwarae i wella darpariaeth yn yr agwedd hon ar y cwricwlwm. Unwaith eto, yr wyf wedi derbyn cyngor ACCAC y dylid cyflwyno'r fframwaith ar sail anstatudol, ond

in two years' time.

Food is another important issue, which is reflected by its inclusion in several subjects including the new personal and social education framework. Given its importance in the curriculum in areas such as design and technology, and science and physical education, I have accepted ACCAC's advice that further guidance for schools should be produced, showing the place of food, including organic food and food safety, within the revised curriculum.

I take seriously the challenge of improving the linguistic abilities of young Welsh people. We propose to increase schools' flexibility in their provision of modern foreign languages. In addition to this increased flexibility within the curriculum, I was pleased to pledge, last November, my support for the language in action project. The Centre for Information on Language Teaching and Research will run the project with the support of the Assembly, ACCAC and Estyn. This support includes Assembly funding of some £100,000 over the next two years. The project aims to promote foreign language capability in Wales and to reverse the decline in the number of pupils opting for modern foreign languages at key stage 4. This project, which encourages the study of modern foreign languages, will ensure that it continues beyond the age of 16. I will monitor closely progress in this area to ensure that lessons learnt from the project can be used across Wales to promote the learning of modern foreign languages.

Further evidence of our commitment to developing modern foreign language teaching in Welsh schools is the introduction of bursaries to encourage more teachers. If our efforts to encourage more pupils to learn languages are to be successful, we will need to ensure that there are well-qualified teachers available to support them. In December, I announced the bursary scheme, which is designed to encourage more language graduates to work and train as teachers. These bursaries of £5,000 will be introduced from September 2000. They will

y dylid ei adolygu ymhen dwy flynedd.

Mae bwyd yn fater pwysig arall, a adlewyrchir trwy ei gynnwys mewn sawl pwnc gan gynnwys y fframwaith addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol newydd. Yn wyneb ei bwysigrwydd i'r cwricwlwm mewn meysydd fel dylunio a thechnoleg, a gwyddoniaeth ac addysg gorfforol, yr wyf wedi derbyn cyngor ACCAC y dylid cynhyrchu canllawiau pellach i ysgolion, i ddangos lle bwyd, yn cynnwys bwyd organig a diogelwch bwyd, o fewn y cwricwlwm diwygiedig.

Yr wyf yn cymryd o ddifrif yr her i wella galluoedd ieithyddol pobl ifanc Cymru. Bwriadwn gynyddu hyblygrwydd ysgolion yn eu darpariaeth o ieithoedd tramor modern. Yn ogystal â'r hyblygrwydd cynyddol hwn o fewn y cwricwlwm, yr oeddwn yn falch o addo, fis Tachwedd diwethaf, fy nghefnogaeth i'r prosiect iaith ar waith. Bydd y Ganolfan Wybodaeth ar Ddysgu ac Ymchwil Iaith yn rhedeg y prosiect gyda chymorth y Cynulliad, ACCAC ac Estyn. Mae'r gefnogaeth hon yn cynnwys cyllid o ryw £100,000 gan y Cynulliad dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf. Nod y prosiect yw hyrwyddo gallu mewn ieithoedd tramor yng Nghymru a gwrth-droi'r dirywiad yn y nifer o ddisgyblion sydd yn dewis ieithoedd tramor modern yng nghyfnod allweddol 4. Bydd y prosiect hwn, sydd yn annog astudio ieithoedd tramor modern, yn sicrhau ei fod yn parhau tu hwnt i oed 16. Byddaf yn cadw llygad gofalus ar yr hyn a gyflawnir yn y maes yma er mwyn sicrhau y gall gwersi a ddysgir o'r prosiect gael eu defnyddio ledled Cymru i hybu dysgu ieithoedd tramor modern.

Ceir tystiolaeth bellach o'n hymrwymiad i ddatblygu dysgu ieithoedd tramor modern yn ysgolion Cymru gyda chyflwyniad bwsariaethau i annog mwy o athrawon. Os yw'n hymdrechion i annog mwy o ddisgyblion i ddysgu ieithoedd i lwyddo, bydd angen inni eu sicrhau fod athrawon cymwys ar gael i'w cefnogi. Ym mis Rhagfyr, cyhoeddais y cynllun bwsariaeth, a fwriedir i annog mwy o raddedigion iaith i weithio a hyfforddi fel athrawon. Cyflwynir y bwsariaethau hyn o £5,000 o fis Medi 2000. Fe'u telir i fyfyrwyr sydd yn ymrwymo i

be paid to students who undertake a postgraduate certificate in education course, which will equip them to teach a modern foreign language and enable them to do so. The additional students attracted by this scheme will be qualified to work as teachers in 2001.

Taken together, these changes will produce a curriculum that has more flexibility and allows far greater discretion for teachers to exercise their professional skills, to provide greater clarity through improved drafting and better presentation of content by adopting a more consistent style across all subjects. These programmes of study will be slimmer and simpler and more manageable for teachers, and will open up greater opportunities to develop the basic and key skills of literacy and numeracy across the curriculum.

The curriculum will be published as soon as possible after the Assembly votes on the new legislation. However, ACCAC's work will not stop there. I have already mentioned some of the specific additional guidance that will be provided. ACCAC will also organise dissemination conferences for teachers and local education authority advisors. These will be on the general changes as well as the two new frameworks—personal and social education and work-related education. Further guidance on the frameworks and other aspects of the revised curriculum will also be provided.

In the local government revenue settlement, we announced that there is scope for an additional £91 million for education, as part of the local authority spending for 2000-01. Discussions about local authority spending needs included the £765,000 that was the Welsh Local Government Association's assessment of the costs associated with implementing the revised national curriculum for Wales. The additional £91 million will more than cover pay increases and inflation and will allow authorities to meet increased demand and new burdens such as these. Additional provision has also been made within GEST, the grants for educational support and training programme, to ensure that schools can prepare themselves for implementing the revisions in September this

ddilyn cwrs tystysgrif addysg i ôl-raddedigion, a fydd yn eu cymhwyso i ddysgu iaith dramor fodern ac yn eu galluogi i wneud hynny. Bydd y myfyrwyr ychwanegol a ddenir gan y cynllun hwn yn cymhwyso i weithio fel athrawon yn 2001.

O'u cymryd gyda'i gilydd, bydd y newidiadau hyn yn creu cwricwlwm a chanddo fwy o hyblygrwydd, fydd yn caniatáu llawer mwy o ddisgresiwn i athrawon i arfer eu sgiliau proffesiynol, i sicrhau mwy o eglurder drwy well drafftio a gwell cyflwyniad drwy fabwysiadu arddull mwy cyson ar draws pob pwnc. Bydd y rhaglenni astudio hyn yn ysgafnach ac yn symlach ac yn haws i athrawon eu rheoli, gan agor cyfleoedd mwy i ddatblygu sgiliau sylfaenol ac allweddol llythrennedd a rhifedd ar draws y cwricwlwm.

Cyhoeddir y cwricwlwm cyn gynted ag y bo modd ar ôl i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio ar y ddeddfwriaeth newydd. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd gwaith ACCAC yn dod i ben. Soniais eisoes am y canllawiau penodol ychwanegol a ddarperir. Bydd ACCAC hefyd yn trefnu cynadleddau rhannu gwybodaeth i athrawon ac ymgynghorwyr yr awdurdodau addysg lleol, i drafod y newidiadau cyffredinol yn ogystal â'r ddau fframwaith newydd—addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol ac addysg berthnasol i waith. Darperir arweiniad pellach ar y fframweithiau ac agweddau eraill ar y cwricwlwm diwygiedig hefyd.

Yn y cytundeb refeniw i lywodraeth leol, cyhoeddassom fod lle i £91 miliwn ychwanegol at addysg, fel rhan o wariant awdurdodau lleol am 2000-01. Mewn trafodaethau am anghenion gwario awdurdodau lleol cynhwyswyd y £765,000 sef asesiad Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru o'r costau cysylltiedig â gweithredu'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol diwygiedig i Gymru. Bydd y £91 miliwn ychwanegol yn fwy na digon i dalu am godiadau cyflog a chwyddiant ac yn caniatáu i awdurdodau ateb galw cynyddol a beichiau newydd fel y rhain. Gwnaethpwyd darpariaeth ychwanegol hefyd o fewn y rhaglen grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant (GEST) er mwyn sicrhau y gall ysgolion ymbaratoi i weithredu'r diwygiadau ym mis Medi eleni. Clustnodwyd cyfanswm

year. A total of £7.63 million has been notionally allocated under GEST activity 3 'Raising Standards through the Curriculum' which includes training and other activities to support the introduction of the revised curriculum. As you see, we are making substantial resources available to support schools' preparations.

We have worked closely with Estyn and ACCAC to ensure that the transition will be as painless as possible for schools and teachers. Many of you wish to add to my comments on the national curriculum review, so I close by thanking all those involved in bringing the review to this point—not only ACCAC and Estyn, but also teachers, local authorities, teaching unions and business organisations. The fact that they had the chance to comment and contribute is testament to our working values of inclusiveness and partnership.

**Gareth Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 1 ar ran Jenny Randerson a minnau. Ychwanegu pwynt ar ddiwedd y cynnig

*yn darparu cefnogaeth ariannol ddigonol ar gyfer hyfforddiant i sicrhau gweithredu'r cynigion hyn yn llawn.*

Datganaf ddiddordeb arbennig yn y Gorchymyn sydd yn ymwneud â daearyddiaeth gan i mi fod yn rhannol gyfrifol am ei ysgrifennu. Os bydd unrhyw gŵyn ynglŷn â'i gynnwys byddwch yn gwybod at bwy i ddod.

Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i ymateb i'r ddadl ar ganlyniad arolwg y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol. Mae'r cynnig yn ein gwahodd i groesawu adolygiad cyntaf y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a oedd yn benodol i Gymru. Mae'n bleser gennyf fi, ar ran Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, wneud hynny a chydabod y gwaith pwysig a gyflawnwyd, nid yn unig gan dîm proffesiynol ACCAC sydd yn chwarae rhan mor allweddol yn natblygiad addysg yng Nghymru, ond hefyd gan yr unigolion hynny, yn athrawon ac athrawesau yn ein hysgolion a'n colegau. Heb eu cyfraniad hwy byddai wedi bod yn amhosibl cyflawni'r adolygiad.

o £7.63 miliwn mewn enw dan weithgaredd GEST 3 'Codi Safonau drwy'r Cwricwlwm', sydd yn cynnwys hyfforddiant a gweithgareddau eraill i ategu cyflwyniad y cwricwlwm diwygiedig. Fel y gwelwch, yr ydym yn darparu adnoddau sylweddol i gefnogi paratodau ysgolion.

Yr ydym wedi gweithio'n agos gydag Estyn ac ACCAC i sicrhau y bydd y trawsnewid mor ddi-boen ag sydd yn bosibl I ysgolion ac athrawon. Mae llawer ohonoch yn dymuno ychwanegu at fy sylwadau ar adolygiad y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol, felly hoffwn gloi drwy ddiolch i bawb a fu'n ymwneud â dod â'r adolygiad i'r fan hon—nid yn unig ACCAC ac Estyn, ond hefyd athrawon, awdurdodau lleol, undebau'r athrawon a sefydliadau busnes. Mae'r ffaith y cawsant gyfle i roi sylwadau a chyfrannu yn destament i'n gwerthoedd o gynhwysiant a phartneriaeth mewn gwaith.

**Gareth Jones:** I propose amendment 1 on behalf of Jenny Randerson and myself. Add at the end of the motion

*provides sufficient financial support for training to ensure the full implementation of these proposals.*

I declare a special interest in the geography Order, as I was partly responsible for writing it. If there is any complaint about its contents you will know where to come.

I am pleased to have this opportunity to respond to the debate on the outcome of the national curriculum review. The motion invites us to welcome the first Wales-only review of the national curriculum. It is a pleasure for me, on behalf of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, to do so, and to acknowledge the important work that was accomplished, not only by ACCAC's professional team, which plays such a key role in developing education in Wales, but also by individuals—the teachers in our schools and colleges. Without their contribution it would have been impossible to undertake this review.

Mae'r adolygiad a'r ymgynghori eang a brwd a fu'n rhan allweddol ohono i'w gydnabod fel campwaith addysgol, gweinyddol a chydweithredol. Cofier hefyd mai ymateb i anghenion ysgolion a'u pryderon ynghylch y cwricwlwm cyfredol o ran pwysau gwaith a'i strwythur anhylaw oedd y prif gymhelliad i ymgymryd â'r adolygiad.

The review and the broad and enthusiastic consultation that was a crucial part of it should be acknowledged as an educational, administrative and collaborative feat. We must also remember that the main incentive for undertaking the review was to respond to the needs of schools and their concerns about the current curriculum from the point of view of work pressures and its inflexible framework.

O ganlyniad, mae'r cwricwlwm ar ei newydd wedd yn haeddu derbyniad gwresog a chydnabyddiaeth fel carreg filltir bwysig yn hanes a datblygiad addysg yng Nghymru. Yn aml, yn rhy aml efallai, mae pobl yn barod i feirniadu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol am beidio â chyflawni. Gadewch i ni a phob aelod o'r cyhoedd a'r cyfryngau sydd yn gwrando y prynhawn yma sylweddoli y bydd y Cynulliad, wrth fabwysiadu'r Gorchmynion hyn, wedi cyflawni un o'r cyraeddiadau pwysicaf a mwyaf pellgyrhaeddol posibl o dan ein trefn lywodraethol newydd.

As a result, the reviewed curriculum deserves to be warmly welcomed and acknowledged as an important milestone in the history and development of education in Wales. Frequently, too frequently perhaps, people are ready to criticise the National Assembly for non-achievement. Let us and every member of the public and the media who is listening this afternoon realise that the Assembly, in adopting these Orders, will have achieved one of the most important and far-reaching attainments possible under our new governmental system.

Am y tro cyntaf erioed bydd gennym gwricwlwm cenedlaethol a fydd wedi ei ddatblygu yng Nghymru ac a fydd yn adlewyrchu anghenion arbennig Cymru. Mae cael cydnabod hynny yn glod i bawb sydd wedi ymwneud â'r fenter, ac mewn ysbryd cynhwysol—clywsom hynny yn gynharach rhwng Peter Law a David Davies—yn rhywbeth y dylem i gyd fel Aelodau o Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ymfalchïo ynddo.

For the first time ever we will have a national curriculum that will have been developed in Wales and that will reflect the special needs of Wales. Being able to recognise that is a credit to everybody who has been involved with this venture, and in the spirit of inclusiveness—we heard that earlier between Peter Law and David Davies—it is something in which all of us as Members of the National Assembly for Wales should take pride.

Dau beth sydd yn dylanwadu o ddifrif ar addysg: cyllid a chwricwlwm. Mae'n rhyfedd, o ystyried yr holl newidiadau a wnaed ym myd addysg gan y Ceidwadwyr, er yr holl ddatganoli rheolaeth i lywodraethwyr ysgolion, yr erys dau beth dan reolaeth gadarn ganolog: cyllid a chwricwlwm. Afraid dweud mai gan bwy bynnag sydd yn rheoli'r cyllid a'r cwricwlwm y mae'r grym i ddylanwadu a chreu newid ym myd addysg.

Two things have a real influence on education: funding and the curriculum. It is strange, considering all the changes made in education by the Conservatives, despite all the devolution of power to school governors, that two things remain under firm central control: funding and the curriculum. It is unnecessary to say that it is those who control funding and the curriculum who have the power to influence and make changes in education.

3:27 p.m.

Mae'n anferthol bwysig i ni yng Nghymru fod rheolaeth y cwricwlwm wedi'i datganoli i'r Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n ddweud sylweddol. Mae cael dylanwadu ar

It is immensely important to us in Wales that the control of the curriculum has been devolved to the Assembly. That says a lot. It is not only a privilege to be able to influence

gwricwlmw a'i reoli nid yn unig yn fraint, y mae'n gyfrifoldeb aruthrol. Rhaid defnyddio'r grym hwnnw'n ofalus oherwydd hanfod addysg yw profiadau dysgu ein plant, sef y cwricwlmw. Nid oes unrhyw beth yn fwy gwerthfawr na'r profiadau hynny. Y cynnwys a'r dulliau dysgu sydd yn dylanwadu a siapio meddyliau ifanc fel eu bod yn datblygu ac yn cyrraedd yr hyn y dymunem iddynt fod, ond eto gyda'r gobaieth a'r bwriad y byddant yn annibynnol ac wedi eu paratoi i wynebu sialensau'r byd a'r dyfodol. Mae'n bwysig cael y cydbwysedd yn iawn.

Gwyddom beth oedd amcanion adolygiad Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlmw ac Asesu Cymru, a rhaid cytuno ei fod wedi cyflawni'r amcanion gwreiddiol yn llawn. Mae'n bleser dweud hynny. Y canlyniad yw bod y cwricwlmw newydd yn fwy hylaw ac mae cwtogi wedi digwydd yn ôl y galw. Mae'r compendium cynradd yn sicr o fod yn gaffaeliad i'n hathrawon yn y sector cynradd. Mae'n datrys y broblem o'r holl ddogfennau a ddefnyddir ar hyn o bryd, sydd yn ddryslyd a dweud y lleiaf. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd athrawon yn croesawu'r compendium cynradd yn frwd ac mae ACCAC i'w longyfarch am gyflawni gwelliant a chymorth sylweddol i'r athrawon yn eu gwaith o ddydd i ddydd. Yn yr un modd, bydd y fformat a'r strwythur cyffredin ar gyfer yr holl Orchmynion yn helpu ysgolion i gynllunio ar draws y cwricwlmw.

Rhaid cydnabod bod pryder am un neu ddau agwedd ar y cwricwlmw newydd wedi'i gofnodi yn ddiweddar, er enghraifft technoleg bwyd a'r amser a ddyrennir i addysg gorfforol, er y gallem ddadlau bod rheoli amser yn fater uniongyrchol i'r ysgol. Cyn belled ag y mae technoleg bwyd yn y cwestiwn, yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y canllawiau a ddarperir gan ACCAC, y cyfeiriodd yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant atynt ac a fydd yn cael eu cylchredeg i'r ysgolion, yn tanlinellu pwysigrwydd academiaidd y pwnc o ran maetheg a hybu iechyd yr unigolyn. Yr wyf hefyd yn sicr y byddant yn rhoi arweiniad i ysgolion ar y modd y gellir defnyddio'r cwricwlmw newydd i gyflwyno technoleg bwyd yn effeithiol ac yn berthnasol, yn enwedig yng Nghymru lle mae amddifadedd a thlodi yn dwysáu'r broblem

and control the curriculum, it is an immense responsibility. That power must be used carefully because the essence of education is our children's learning experiences, namely the curriculum. Nothing is more valuable than those experiences. The content and teaching methods influence and shape young minds so that they develop into what we would wish them to be, yet with the hope and intention that they will be independent and prepared to face the challenges of the world and the future. It is important to strike the right balance.

We know the objectives of the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales's review, and we must agree that it has fully met the original objectives. It is a pleasure to say that. The result is that the new curriculum is more manageable and has been cut back as required. The primary compendium will certainly be an asset to our primary sector teachers. It resolves the problem of all the documentation used at the moment, which is confusing to say the least. I am certain that teachers will welcome the primary compendium enthusiastically and ACCAC is to be congratulated for achieving significant improvements and assistance for teachers in their day-to-day work. In the same way, the common format and structure for all the Orders will assist schools to plan across the curriculum.

It must be acknowledged that concern has been noted recently about one or two aspects of the new curriculum, for example food technology and the time allocated to physical education, although we could argue that time management is a direct matter for the school. On food technology, I am sure that the guidelines provided by ACCAC, to which the Secretary for Education and Children referred and which will be circulated to schools, will underscore the academic importance of the subject in relation to nutrition and promoting the health of the individual. I am also sure that they will give schools guidance on the way in which the new curriculum can be used to present food technology effectively and relevantly, particularly in Wales where deprivation and poverty intensify the problem and limit the opportunity to provide



ac yn cyfyngu'r cyfle i ddarparu bwydydd maethlon. Mae hynny yn adlewyrchiad o gyflwr truenus yr economi. Mae'r pryder hwnnw yno a rhaid inni ei gydnabod.

Serch hynny, rhaid cydnabod bod ACCAC wedi llwyddo i roi ystyriaeth ddwys a manwl i nifer o agweddau pwysig, yn enwedig ehangder a chydbwysedd yn y cwricwlwm, dilyniant a pharhad, sgiliau sylfaenol ac allweddol ac elfennau trawsgwricwlaidd. Mae yma syniadau newydd a hyblygrwydd; hynny yw, mae'r canllawiau anstatudol yn rhoi cyfle i ysgolion ac athrawon pwnc ddilyn trywydd sydd yn apelio atynt—'disgresiwn' oedd y gair yr oedd Rosemary yn ei ddefnyddio—yn eu bröydd eu hunain. Mae hynny'n bwysig i ni yng Nghymru.

Mae'r gofynion trawsgwricwlaidd megis technoleg gwybodaeth a'r Cwricwlwm Cymreig neu ddatrys problemau yn golygu y bydd pob adran neu bwnc yn cyfrannu at ddatblygu sgiliau'r plentyn. Nid cyfrifoldeb un neu ddau o bynciau mwyach fydd ymwneud â'r sgiliau allweddol hyn. Dylai hyn wneud pob pwnc ac athro yn berthnasol i fyd y disgybl. Gellir dadlau mai yn y modd y bydd yr ysgolion yn ymateb i'r dulliau trawsgwricwlaidd hyn y bydd llwyddiant y dyfodol. Nid gwybodaeth yn unig sydd ei hangen ar ddisgyblion ein hoes ni, ond hefyd deallusrwydd a'r sgiliau i ddefnyddio gwybodaeth.

Mae'r cwricwlwm newydd hwn yn caniatáu i'r ysgol edrych ar y sbectrum cyfan yn hytrach na gweithio mewn dull darniog neu bynciol. Mae hefyd yn rhoi cyfle i ysgolion addasu eu cynlluniau gwaith i ymgorffori syniadaeth sydd yn newid ac yn dod yn bwysig ac sydd yn haeddu mwy o gydnabyddiaeth. Er enghraifft, mae lle i ymgorffori agweddau ar gyfle cyfartal a datblygiad cynaliadwy yn yr elfennau trawsgwricwlaidd hyn, fel bod pob athro yn yr ysgol yn ymwneud â'r maes ac yn ei ymgorffori yn ethos yr ysgol. Ni allwn bellach ddibynnu ar un neu ddau i fynd i'r afael â'r gwaith pwysig hwn. Mae'n holl bwysig fod yr unigolion yn mynd ati fel tîm i sicrhau bod y materion pwysig hyn yn cael eu mewoli yn yr ysgolion. Dyna yw'r ethos y dylid ei ddatblygu yn yr ysgol. Ceir lle a chyfle i wneud hynny gyda'r elfennau

nutritious foods. That is a reflection of the pitiful state of the economy. That concern exists and we must acknowledge it.

However, it must be acknowledged that ACCAC has succeeded in giving intensive and detailed consideration to many important aspects, particularly breadth and balance in the curriculum, progression and continuity, basic and key skills and cross-curricular elements. There are new ideas and flexibility here; that is, the non-statutory guidelines give schools and subject teachers the opportunity to follow a track that appeals to them—Rosemary used the word 'discretion'—in their own areas. That is important for us in Wales

The cross-curricular requirements such as information technology and the Curriculum Cymreig or problem solving mean that every department or subject will contribute to the development of a child's skills. Involvement with these key skills will no longer be the responsibility of one or two subjects. This should make every subject and teacher relevant to the pupil's world. It could be argued that future success lies in the way in which the schools respond to these cross-curricular methods. It is not only knowledge that today's pupils require, but also intelligence and the skills to use knowledge.

This new curriculum allows the school to look at the whole spectrum rather than take a piecemeal or subject approach. It also gives schools the opportunity to adapt their work schemes to incorporate ideologies that change and become important and deserve more recognition. For example, there is scope to incorporate aspects of equal opportunity and sustainable development in these cross-curricular elements, so that every teacher in the school is involved in the field and incorporates it in the school's ethos. We can no longer depend on one or two to be involved in this important work. It is crucial that individuals set about this as a team to ensure that these important issues are internalised in the schools. That is the ethos that should be developed in the school. There is scope and opportunity to do that with the cross-curricular elements. The new

trawsgwricwlaidd. Mae'r cwricwlwm newydd yn ffordd fwy effeithiol o ddysgu am werthoedd cymdeithasol a chymunedol. Dyna pam y bydd y rhaglen addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol, a fydd yn orfodol ymhen dwy flynedd, yn atgyfnerthu'r dull hwn o addysgu. Gobeithiaf y bydd ein hysgolion yn gweld Cwricwlwm 2000 fel cyfle i dorri tir newydd ac i addasu eu syniadau mewn oes sydd yn newid mor gyflym.

Gwelwn, felly, fod llawer mwy i'r cwricwlwm newydd na chasgliad o bynciau. Mae'n cyfeirio at syniadau pwysig, datblygiad cynaliadwy, datrys problemau, gwneud penderfyniadau, a llu o sgiliau ac agweddau y gall ein hathrawon eu cyflwyno mewn modd cyffrous, dyfeisgar a pherthnasol. Mae'r cyfle ar gael, dim ond i'r ysgolion fanteisio arno. Dylai'r cwricwlwm newydd ddod â chyfnod sefydlog i'n hysgolion. Croesewir hynny fel rhywbeth sydd ei angen ar ein hathrawon. Bydd y cwricwlwm hefyd yn ddigon hyblyg i ysgolion addasu eu cynlluniau gwaith yn ôl anghenion bro neu gymuned ar un llaw, a newidiadau pellgyrhaeddol byd-eang ar y llaw arall.

Cyfeiriaf yn gryno at y gwelliant a gynigir gan Jenny Randerson, ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a minnau. O ystyried rhagoriaethau'r cwricwlwm hwn, bydd ei lwyddiant yn dibynnu ar y modd y'i mabwysiedir gan yr athro unigol o fewn tîm yr ysgol. Cyfeiriaf at hynny eisoes ac at bwysigrwydd y rhan honno o'r cwricwlwm a'r defnydd ohoni. Nid maes athro unigol yw'r cwricwlwm bellach ond ysgol gyfan. Ceir agweddau sydd yn gofyn am hyfforddiant i'r unigolyn ac i'r ysgol gyfan os ydym am weithredu'r cynigion hyn yn llawn.

Er mwyn sicrhau dilyniant effeithiol rhwng y cyfnodau allweddol, yn enwedig rhwng cyfnodau allweddol 2 a 3 lle na welir y dilyniant gorau mewn rhai dalgylchoedd ar hyn o bryd, bydd rhaid cynnal sesiynau hyfforddi ar y cyd rhwng cynrychiolwyr neu dimau o'r ddau gyfnod allweddol. Dylid pwysleisio mai amhosibl fyddai llwyddo gyda'r amcanion trawsgwricwlaidd oni chynhelir hyfforddiant ysgol gyfan. Bydd paratoi ein hathrawon ar gyfer y dulliau

curriculum is a more effective way of learning about social and community values. That is why the personal and social education programme, that will become compulsory within two years, will reinforce this method of teaching. I hope that our schools will see Curriculum 2000 as an opportunity to break new ground and adapt their ideas in such a rapidly changing age.

We see, therefore, that there is far more to the new curriculum than a collection of subjects. It refers to important ideas, sustainable development, problem solving, making decisions and many other skills and aspects that our teachers can present in an exciting, inventive and relevant way. The opportunity is there, so long as the schools take advantage of it. The new curriculum should bring a stable period to our schools. That will be welcomed as something that our teachers need. The curriculum will also be flexible enough for schools to adapt their schemes of work according to area or community needs on the one hand, and far-reaching global changes on the other.

I will briefly refer to the amendment proposed by Jenny Randerson, on behalf of the Liberal Democrats, and myself. Considering the merits of this curriculum, its success will depend on the way it is adopted by the individual teacher within the school's team. I have previously referred to that and to the importance of that part of the curriculum and how it is used. The curriculum is no longer a field for the individual teacher but for the whole school. There are aspects that require training for the individual and for the whole school if we are to fully implement these proposals.

To ensure effective continuity between key stages, especially between key stages 2 and 3 where the best continuity is not experienced in some catchment areas at the moment, joint training sessions will have to be held between representatives or teams from both key stages. It should be emphasised that the success of the cross-curricular objectives will be impossible without whole school training. Preparing our teachers for these cross-curricular methods will depend on a

trawsgwricwlaidd hyn yn dibynnu ar fuddsoddiad sylweddol o arian am gyfnod hwy na blwyddyn. Bydd angen cynnal y buddsoddiad am rai blynyddoedd fel bo modd i'n hysgolion ymdopi nid yn unig â'r newidiadau arfaethedig ond hefyd i ymbaratoi ar gyfer pwysau ychwanegol a osodir ar y cwricwlwm yn y dyfodol agos. Mae sicrhau gweithredu'r cynigion hyn yn golygu mwy na hyfforddiant. Mae'n golygu ymrwymiad i ddulliau newydd o addysgu sydd yn gofyn am ein cefnogaeth ariannol i ganiatáu i athrawon fwrw ati o ddifrif gydag un o'r datblygiadau mwyaf cyffrous a gyflawnwyd gan y Cynulliad hyd yn hyn. Erfyniaf amoch i gefnogi'r gwelliant a'r cynnig sydd gerbron.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I welcome the review on behalf of the Welsh Conservative Party. We feel that ACCAC has conducted itself impeccably. In undertaking the review it kept the Pre-16 Education Committee fully aware of the situation and review process. The Committee has been fully involved and fully briefed. This kind of review and input from an Assembly Committee is testament to the kind of work that Subject Committees can be and are involved in.

3:37 p.m.

We recognise that the curriculum will have to be reviewed. It is an ongoing process, not a settled issue. It will need to be reviewed time and time again. A number of issues must be looked at in some depth. Many issues were raised in the Committee and in the subgroup that examined the review. An issue close to my own heart is information technology. Children and young people must be encouraged to think positively about the use of computers, e-mail and the internet, particularly in the primary sector. Information technology can be used to deliver key subjects such as mathematics, sciences, geography and history. The use of IT will be a crucial factor in the years ahead.

The Committee also highlighted work-related education as being important. In the past, young people would often go out on a work placement, but would not have a meaningful experience within that work placement as one

substantial financial investment for a longer period than a year. The investment will have to be sustained for some years so that our schools will be able to cope not only with the proposed changes but also to prepare for additional pressures that will be placed on the curriculum in the near future. Ensuring the implementation of these proposals means more than training. It means a commitment to new teaching methods that demand our financial support in order to allow teachers to seriously undertake one of the most exciting developments achieved by the Assembly so far. I implore you to support the amendment and the motion before you.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Croesawaf yr adolygiad ar ran y Blaid Geidwadol Gymreig. Teimlwn fod ACCAC wedi gweithredu'n berffaith. Yn ystod yr adolygiad sicrhaodd fod y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa a'r broses adolygu. Rhoddwyd rhan lawn a gwybodaeth lawn i'r Pwyllgor. Mae'r math hwn o adolygiad a mewnbwn gan un o Bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad yn destament i'r math o waith y gall ac y mae Pwyllgorau Pwnc yn ymhél ag ef.

Cydnabyddwn y bydd yn rhaid adolygu'r cwricwlwm. Mae'n broses barhaus, nid mater wedi'i benderfynu. Bydd angen ei adolygu dro ar ôl tro. Rhaid edrych ar nifer o faterion mewn cryn ddyfnder. Codwyd nifer o faterion yn y Pwyllgor ac yn yr is-grŵp a archwiliodd yr adolygiad. Mater agos at fy nghalon i yw technoleg gwybodaeth. Rhaid annog plant a phobl ifanc i feddwl yn bositif am ddefnyddio cyfrifiaduron, e-bost a'r rhyngwyd, yn enwedig yn y sector cynradd. Gellir defnyddio technoleg gwybodaeth i gyflwyno pynciau allweddol megis mathemateg, y gwyddorau, daearyddiaeth a hanes. Bydd defnydd technoleg gwybodaeth yn ffactor allweddol yn y blynyddoedd a ddaw.

Tanlinellodd y Pwyllgor hefyd bwysigrwydd addysg berthnasol i waith. Yn y gorffennol, byddai pobl ifanc yn aml yn mynd allan ar leoliad gwaith heb gael unrhyw brofiad ystyrlon o fewn y lleoliad gwaith hwnnw fel

might expect. We must ensure that schools and pupils consider actively the kind of work-related education they wish to undertake. Guidance must be offered to companies that take on students so that they understand their role and to ensure that work-related education is meaningful and that students gain something from it.

The issue of modern foreign languages was also raised in the sub-group and the Committee. Wales has a poor record of learning continental mainland European languages. For many young people, who are and will be travelling, working and living abroad in the future, the use of a second or third language is vital. We need to look closely at how the Assembly can encourage young people to think positively about learning modern foreign languages. We must ensure that key stage 1 and 2 targets are achievable in the long term. Extra targets put pressure on schools. Within the region that I represent, schools sometimes find it difficult to reach those targets. They are often looking for additional resources and support for teaching staff. We welcome Gareth Jones and Jenny Randerson's amendment calling for extra resources to assist those teachers. We believe passionately in that. The support and resources must be available for those teachers, if we are to deliver the kind of education that we should.

It has been a pleasure to be part of this review. It has been exciting and extensive. It shows how the Assembly's Subject Committees can have a direct influence on a matter that is extremely important for the future of the nation. On that basis, I offer the Conservative Group's support to this motion and to the amendment.

**Jenny Randerson:** In jointly proposing this amendment, we were seeking to raise an issue which has been discussed many times in the Committee. There has been agreement within the Committee on all of the issues on the agenda paper today. However, we intended to put down a marker without throwing the process of the new curriculum's introduction into chaos. The last thing hard-pressed teachers in schools need is a delay in receiving details of their new national curriculum Orders and a rejection of the

a ddisgwylid. Mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau fod ysgolion a disgyblion yn ystyried o ddifrif y math o addysg berthnasol i waith y maent ei heisiau. Rhaid cynnig arweiniad i gwmnïau a fydd yn derbyn myfyrwyr er mwyn iddynt ddeall eu rôl a sicrhau fod addysg berthnasol i waith yn ystyrllon a bod myfyrwyr yn elwa rhywfaint ohoni.

Codwyd mater ieithoedd tramor modern yn yr is-grŵp a'r Pwyllgor hefyd. Mae gan Gymru record wael ym maes dysgu ieithoedd cyfandir Ewrop. I lawer o bobl ifanc sydd ac a fydd yn teithio, yn gweithio ac yn byw dramor yn y dyfodol, mae gallu defnyddio ail neu drydedd iaith yn hanfodol. Mae angen inni edrych yn fanwl ar sut y gall y Cynulliad annog pobl ifanc i edrych yn bositif ar ddyysgu ieithoedd tramor modern. Mae angen sicrhau y gellir cyflawni targedau cyfnod allweddol 1 a 2 yn y tymor hir. Mae targedau ychwanegol yn rhoi pwysau ar ysgolion. O fewn yr ardal a gynrychiolaf i, bydd ysgolion weithiau'n ei chael yn anodd cyrraedd y targedau hyn. Maent yn aml yn edrych am adnoddau a chefnogaeth ychwanegol i'w hathrawon. Croesawn welliant Gareth Jones a Jenny Randerson yn galw am adnoddau ychwanegol i helpu'r athrawon hynny. Credwn hynny yn angerddol. Mae'n rhaid i'r gefnogaeth a'r adnoddau fod ar gael i'r athrawon hynny, os ydym am gyflwyno'r addysg y dylem ei chyflwyno.

Pleser oedd ymwneud â'r adolygiad hwn. Bu'n gyffrous ac yn drwyadl. Mae'n dangos sut y gall Pwyllgorau Pwnc y Cynulliad gael dylanwad uniongyrchol ar fater sydd yn eithriadol o bwysig i ddyfodol y genedl. Ar y sail honno, cynigïaf gefnogaeth y Grŵp Ceidwadol i'r cynnig hwn ac i'r gwelliant.

**Jenny Randerson:** Wrth gyd-gyflwyno'r gwelliant hwn, yr oeddem yn ceisio codi mater sydd wedi'i drafod lawer gwaith yn y Pwyllgor. Cytunwyd o fewn y Pwyllgor ar bob un o'r materion ar y papur agenda heddiw. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddem yn bwriadu gosod marc heb greu anhrefn yn y broses o gyflwyno'r cwricwlwm newydd. Y peth olaf sydd ei angen ar athrawon prysur mewn ysgolion yw oedi cyn cael manylion am eu Gorchmynion cwricwlwm cenedlaethol newydd a bod y cynllun yn cael ei wrthod.

scheme. Teachers need every minute of the period between now and September to develop their new schemes of work. I am a governor in a primary and secondary school and I know that those at the sharp end are looking forward to the new curriculum with mixed emotions because of the amount of work that must go into it.

In general, the Liberal Democrats welcome the simplification of the national curriculum and its increased flexibility. As a concept, the national curriculum had a consensus ever since it was introduced, but it was agreed that it was over-prescriptive. Teachers have been weighed down with detail and have had very little flexibility in what they teach. These Orders go some way to correcting that, and, to a certain extent, to reflecting a distinctively Welsh view. This is a balancing act between teachers' desire for flexibility and their desire to promote their own specialisms. I was a teacher, so I know very well that all teachers think that other teachers should be flexible, but that their own subject is vital. That must be reflected and has been to a large extent in this national curriculum. We are disappointed about some aspects of it.

We approached this issue in an exemplary fashion in the Pre-16 Education Committee, by setting up a sub-committee to look at it in detail. However, we were told that the process was well under way and if we tried to hold it up by making changes, teachers would not thank us. Therefore, we have taken that on board. On balance, the new Orders are much better than the old ones. However, there are concerns, which have been mentioned today. It is right to continue to flag up those concerns, because the Assembly must be in a position to drive the direction of the national curriculum in the future. After all, what is the point of the Assembly if we do not influence education, which is the building block for everything else?

Rosemary announced around £7.5 million of GEST funding. We must ensure that that is genuine money, specifically for this process. We must send out a clear message that teachers must be trained in the new national

Mae pob munud o'r cyfnod o hyn tan fis Medi yn allweddol i athrawon er mwyn datblygu'u cynlluniau gwaith newydd. Yr wyf yn llywodraethwr mewn ysgol gynradd ac uwchradd a gwn fod y rheiny sydd yn y rheng flaen yn edrych ymlaen at y cwricwlwm newydd gyda theimladau cymysg oherwydd y gwaith mawr y bydd yn ei olygu.

Yn gyffredinol, mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu symleiddio'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a'i hyblygrwydd ychwanegol. Fel cysyniad, bu consensws ar y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol byth ers ei gyflwyno, ond cytunwyd ei fod yn rhy gyfarwyddol. Mae athrawon wedi'u llethu gan fanylion a heb gael braidd ddim hyblygrwydd yn yr hyn a ddysgant. Aiff y Gorchmynion hyn beth o'r ffordd at gywiro hynny ac, i ryw raddau, at adlewyrchu golwg gwbl Gymreig ar bethau. Mater yw hyn o gydbwysio rhwng awydd athrawon am hyblygrwydd â'u hawydd i hyrwyddo'u pynciau arbenigol eu hunain. Bùm i'n athrawes, felly gwn yn iawn fod pob athro'n meddwl y dylai athrawon eraill fod yn hyblyg, ond bod eu pwnc hwy yn hanfodol. Rhaid adlewyrchu hynny, ac fe wnaed hynny i raddau helaeth, yn y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol hwn. Yr ydym yn siomedig ynghylch rhai agweddau ohono.

Aethom ati i drafod y mater hwn mewn modd canmoladwy yn y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16, drwy sefydlu is-bwyllgor i edrych yn fanwl arno. Fodd bynnag, dywedwyd wrthym fod y broses ar waith ac na fyddai athrawon yn diolch inni am geisio'i dal yn ôl drwy wneud newidiadau. Felly, yr ydym wedi derbyn hynny. Ar y cyfan, mae'r Gorchmynion newydd yn llawer gwell na'r hen rai. Fodd bynnag, y mae pryderon, a grybwyllwyd heddiw. Mae'n briodol i barhau i dynnu sylw at y pryderon hyn, oherwydd mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad fod mewn safle i bennu cyfeiriad y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yn y dyfodol. Wedi'r cyfan, beth yw diben y Cynulliad os na ddylanwadwn ar addysg, sydd yn gonglfaen i bopeth arall?

Cyhoeddodd Rosemary oddeutu £7.5 miliwn o arian GEST. Rhaid inni sicrhau mai arian go iawn yw hyn, yn benodol ar gyfer y broses hon. Rhaid inni anfon neges glir allan fod yn rhaid hyfforddi athrawon yn y cwricwlwm

curriculum and that, for once, the costs will not be dumped on schools to fund from their mainstream budgets. We must also be aware that the forthcoming local government settlement is very poor, despite additional money for schools. Councils cannot be expected to fund training out of the goodness of their hearts and will not do so. Therefore, we must parcel extra money through to schools.

There are key elements of training in the new curriculum, which are needed. Personal and social education has already been referred to—

**Kirsty Williams:** On that issue, do you share my regret and that of many black and ethnic organisations in Wales that, despite the recommendations that arose from the Stephen Lawrence inquiry, there is not a stronger, more explicit reference to and emphasis on the need to develop children's learning of issues surrounding cultural diversity and racism? Should this not be included at the first possible opportunity?

**Jenny Randerson:** That is a good point. That issue is brought out more clearly in the English curriculum. The amendment to the motion in the debate that follows this one, refers to the possibility of looking at this issue again and it is intended that personal and social education or citizenship will be looked at within the next year or so. I regret the fact that PSE is not a compulsory part of the curriculum, but the reasons for that were good. Teachers needed training and they were not ready to make this aspect compulsory, so I hope that there will be an opportunity to consider that again. That is one area where we need more training.

Food and nutrition have also been mentioned and there has been a great deal of concern expressed recently about the omission of specific references to food and nutrition in the design and technology curriculum. That is, in many ways, part of the freedom that is being given to teachers to decide their own priorities. In the interests of joined-up government, we discussed social inclusion and health yesterday. You cannot have a well-balanced and healthy society if you do not understand the importance of a good diet

enedlaethol newydd, ac na chaiff y costau, am unwaith, eu dadlwytho i ysgolion i'w talu o'u cyllidebau prif-ffrwd. Rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol hefyd fod y cytundeb llywodraeth leol sydd ar ddod yn wael iawn, er gwaethaf arian ychwanegol i ysgolion. Ni ellir disgwyl i gynghorau dalu am hyfforddiant o ddaioni eu calon, ac ni wnânt hynny. Felly, rhaid inni barselu arian ychwanegol drwodd i ysgolion.

Y mae elfennau allweddol o ran hyfforddiant yn y cwricwlwm newydd, sydd yn angenrheidiol. Cyfeiriwyd at addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol eisoes—

**Kirsty Williams:** Ar y mater hwnnw, ydych chi'n rhannu fy ngofid a gofid llawer o gyrff du ac ethnig yng Nghymru nad oes, er gwaethaf yr argymhellion a gododd o ymchwiliad Stephen Lawrence, gyfeiriad a phwyslais cryfach, mwy pendant, ar yr angen i ddatblygu addysg i blant ym materion amrywiaeth ddiwylliannol a hiliaeth? Oni ddylid cynnwys hyn ar y cyfle cyntaf posibl?

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt da. Amlygir y mater hwnnw'n gliriach yng nghwricwlwm Lloegr. Mae'r gwelliant i'r cynnig, yn y ddadl nesaf ar ôl hon, yn cyfeirio at y posibilrwydd o edrych ar y mater hwn eto a bwriedir edrych ar addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol neu ddinasyddiaeth o fewn y flwyddyn nesaf yn fras. Gresynaf nad yw ABCh yn rhan orfodol o'r cwricwlwm, ond yr oedd rhesymau da dros hynny. Yr oedd angen hyfforddi athrawon ac nid oeddent yn barod i wneud yr agwedd hon yn orfodol, felly yr wyf yn gobeithio y ceir cyfle i ystyried hynny eto. Dyna un maes lle mae arnom angen mwy o hyfforddiant.

Soniwyd hefyd am fwyd a maeth, a mynegwyd cryn dipyn o bryder yn ddiweddar am absenoldeb unrhyw gyfeiriadau penodol at fwyd a maeth yn y cwricwlwm dylunio a thechnoleg. Mae hynny, mewn llawer ffordd, yn rhan o'r rhyddid a roddir i athrawon i benderfynu eu blaenoriaethau eu hunain. O safbwynt llywodraeth gydgyssylltiedig, trafodasom gynhwysiant cymdeithasol a iechyd ddoe. Ni allwch gael cymdeithas gytbwys ac iach os nad ydych yn deall pwysigrwydd arferion bwyta da a sut i'w

and how to achieve it.

3:47 p.m.

The flexibility that we applaud this afternoon can be a problem. I regret that modern foreign languages will still not be compulsory at GCSE level. As Jonathan Morgan mentioned, recent figures illustrate a steep decline in numbers taking modern foreign languages at GCSE, at A-level and at University. Interestingly, the decline exists in England as well as in Wales. We need to take a fundamental look at this whole issue.

We do our young people a great disservice by acquiescing to the British phobia about foreign languages. As someone with a reasonable grasp of French from my youth, who is now grappling with Welsh and finding it difficult—I think it is because I am old—I know that it is easier to learn a language when you are young. Research proves that if you are bilingual you can become trilingual very easily. We have a rare gift in Wales. As a bilingual country, we have a unique opportunity to become trilingual. If the Dutch can do it, so can we.

**Janet Ryder:** When parents look at the educational choices for their children, we must stress the many advantages that those children will have should they choose Welsh-medium education. The result of much research in Wales, and in other fully bilingual countries that offer bilingual education, shows that children who have learned a second language at an early age are much more able to take on third and fourth languages. I hope that it will be clear in this new curriculum that a bilingual education is a good education and that it sets children in good stead for the future.

**Jenny Randerson:** I agree with those remarks. I remind you of a comment made by a German captain of industry who said, 'I will sell in any language but I will only buy in my own.' That emphasises that if we are to compete in Europe we must accept the need for better language skills.

sicrhau.

Gall yr hyblygrwydd yr ydym yn ei gymeradwyo heddiw fod yn broblem. Gresynaf na fydd ieithoedd tramor modern yn parhau yn orfodol ar lefel TGAU eto. Fel y soniodd Jonathan Morgan, mae ffigurau diweddar yn dangos cwmp serth yn y nifer sydd yn astudio ieithoedd tramor modern ar lefel TGAU, lefel-A ac yn y Brifysgol. Yn ddi-ddorol, mae'r cwmp yn digwydd yn Lloegr yn ogystal ag yng Nghymru. Mae angen inni edrych ar yr holl fater hwn yn ei hanfod.

Gwnawn gam mawr â'n pobl ifanc drwy gyd-fynd â'r ffobia Prydeinig ynglŷn â ieithoedd tramor. Fel rhywun a gafodd grap go lew ar Ffrangeg pan oeddwn yn ifanc, ac sydd bellach yn ymrafael â'r Gymraeg ac yn ei chael yn anodd—am fy mod yn hen, yr wyf yn amau—gwn ei bod yn haws dysgu iaith pan fyddwch yn ifanc. Dengys ymchwil y gall pobl ddwyieithog fynd yn dairieithog yn hawdd iawn. Mae gennym rodd brin yng Nghymru. Fel gwlad ddwyieithog, mae gennym gyfle unigryw i fod yn dairieithog. Os gall yr Iseldirwyr wneud, gallwn ninnau.

**Janet Ryder:** Pan fydd rhieni yn edrych ar y dewisiadau addysgol i'w plant, mae angen inni bwysleisio y manteision lu a gaiff y plant hynny os dewisant addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Dengys canlyniadau llawer o ymchwil yng Nghymru, ac mewn gwledydd eraill cwbl ddwyieithog sydd yn cynnig addysg ddwyieithog, fod plant a ddysgodd ail iaith yn ifanc yn llawer mwy abl i ddysgu trydedd a phedwaredd iaith. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn glir yn y cwricwlwm newydd hwn fod addysg ddwyieithog yn addysg dda a'i bod yn rhoi sylfaen dda i blant ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cytunaf â'r sylwadau hynny. Hoffwn eich atgoffa o sylw gan gaptan diwydiant o'r Almaen a ddywedodd, 'fe wnaif werthu mewn unrhyw iaith, ond dim ond yn fy iaith fy hun y gwnaf brynu.' Mae hynny'n tanlinellu bod yn rhaid inni dderbyn yr angen am well sgiliau iaith os ydym am gystadlu yn Ewrop.

The review of the national curriculum is well overdue. It is the result of a different approach in Wales for the first time. It could be better and it could be more distinctively Welsh. It is important that the Assembly takes the lead on further developments and that we act in tune with the wishes and views of parents and teachers. Teachers have been through the mill in the last couple of decades. They have been the subject of constant criticism. They have been told to act as professionals, but professional judgment was largely taken away from them by an over-prescriptive national curriculum. Handled well, this more flexible national curriculum could be the first step towards restoring that professional judgment. I hope that the straitjacket of performance-related pay does not act as a counterweight to that.

This is a tentative start. Schools need more money to deliver the national curriculum. New schemes of work mean new books and equipment. Schools need more money for building repairs. I was in a school last week that is unable to deliver the PE curriculum because it does not have the facilities or buildings for it. As part of a new start, this national curriculum is strongly welcomed by the Liberal Democrats.

**John Marek:** I also welcome the proposals and I identify with all that has been said in this serious debate and I support the amendment. To make sense of the debate, members of the public will need more than the statutory instruments. They must have the programmes of study. This is one of the difficulties with this subject. All the meat and explanation is in programmes of study and not in the statutes. However, it is true that the National Assembly for Wales was set up when the process was almost complete.

Jenny Randerson was correct in saying that we did not want to upset a process that was already in train, but we had good oversight and we were assisted by the curriculum authority. The Pre-16 Education Committee considered the matter seriously and appointed a small committee to look at it in detail. The

Yr oedd yn hen bryd adolygu'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol. Dyma ganlyniad agwedd wahanol yng Nghymru am y tro cyntaf. Gallai fod yn well a gallai fod yn fwy unigryw Gymreig. Mae'n bwysig bod y Cynulliad yn arwain ar ddatblygiadau pellach a'n bod yn gweithredu mewn cytgor â dymuniadau a syniadau rhieni ac athrawon. Bu athrawon drwy'r felin yn yr ychydig ddegawdau diwethaf. Buont yn destun beirmiadu diddiwedd. Dywedwyd wrthynt am ymddwyn yn broffesiynol, ond dygwyd barn broffesiynol oddi wrthynt i raddau helaeth gan gwricwlwm cenedlaethol rhy gyfarwyddol. O'i drin yn iawn, gallai'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol mwy hyblyg hwn fod yn gam cyntaf tuag at adfer y farn broffesiynol honno. Gobeithiaf na fydd rhwymedigaeth tâl-yn-ôl-perfformiad yn gwrthweithio hynny.

Dechrau petrus yw hwn. Mae angen mwy o arian ar ysgolion i gyflwyno'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol. Mae cynlluniau gwaith newydd yn golygu llyfrau ac offer newydd. Mae ysgolion angen mwy o arian ar gyfer atgyweirio adeiladau. Yr oeddwn mewn ysgol yr wythnos diwethaf sydd yn methu cyflwyno'r cwricwlwm addysg gorfforol am nad oes ganddi'r cyfleusterau na'r adeiladau priodol. Fel rhan o ddechrau newydd, croesewir y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol hwn yn wresog gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

**John Marek:** Yr wyf innau hefyd yn croesawu'r cynigion ac yn uniaethu â phopeth a ddywedwyd yn y ddadl ddifrifol hon ac yr wyf yn cefnogi'r gwelliant. I wneud synnwyr o'r ddadl, bydd aelodau'r cyhoedd angen mwy na'r offerynnau statudol. Rhaid iddynt gael y rhaglenni astudiaeth. Dyma un o'r anawsterau gyda'r pwnc hwn. Mae'r holl gig ac eglurhad mewn rhaglenni astudiaeth ac nid yn y statudau. Fodd bynnag, y mae'n wir fod y broses bron wedi'i chwblhau pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Yr oedd Jenny Randerson yn gywir pan ddywedodd nad oedd arnom eisiau tarfu ar broses a oedd eisoes ar fynd, ond fe gawsom arolygaeth dda ac fe'n cynorthwywyd gan yr awdurdod cwricwlwm. Ystyriodd y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 y mater yn ddifrifol a phenododd bwyllgor bach i edrych arno'n



committee realised that it was not a major piece of revision, but that there was wide agreement in Wales that these changes were desired and that the new curriculum should therefore be less prescriptive and more flexible.

There are problems, but they are exemplified well in amendment 1, on finance. There are also problems concerning modern foreign languages. It cannot be right that we do not teach modern foreign languages properly. We have a bad record on that in Wales and we must change that.

Another big difference in the consultation results was the division on teaching Welsh as a second language. As Assembly Members, we should take this out of the political arena. We can do so if we address the question of bilingual education at an early age properly, as Jenny Randerson and Janet Ryder indicated. Committee members should take note of these issues and try to de-politicise them. I am sure that we will then be able to agree.

I will not continue as I do not want to repeat what others have said. If we can, I believe we should finish early today so that we can get to our desks and do some productive work. I welcome these proposals and I hope they are supported unanimously.

**Peter Rogers:** John mentioned the status of food education and that is what I will discuss. The Meat and Livestock Commission is the only organisation in the country with a regional network of food technology teachers. It has 11 regional representatives, a full time head office and it has invested £250,000 in classroom resources. The commission argues that objectives for improving food safety and hygiene and raising nutritional understanding can only be achieved by delivering quality food-related education as part of design and technology.

In Ynys Môn, the local health group will target cardiac disease of which there is a high occurrence in that part of Wales. Targeting it in schools, the group will advise pupils on healthy eating coupled with exercise. We should aim for a commitment to a healthy

fanwl. Sylweddolodd y pwyllgor nad oedd yn ddiwygiad mawr, ond bod cytundeb eang yng Nghymru fod eisiau'r newidiadau hyn ac y dylai'r cwricwlwm newydd felly fod yn llai cyfarwyddol ac yn fwy hyblyg.

Y mae problemau, ond fe'u darlunnir yn dda yng ngwelliant 1, ar gyllid. Y mae problemau hefyd ynghylch ieithoedd tramor modern. Ni all fod yn iawn nad ydym yn dysgu ieithoedd tramor modern yn gywir. Mae gennym record wael ar hynny yng Nghymru a rhaid inni newid hynny.

Gwahaniaeth mawr arall yng nghanlyniadau'r ymgynghori oedd y rhaniad ar ddysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith. Fel Aelodau Cynulliad, dylem dynnu hyn allan o'r ymryson wleidyddol. Gallwn wneud hyn os deliwn yn briodol â chwestiwn addysg ddwyieithog i blant ifanc, fel y soniodd Jenny Randerson a Janet Ryder. Dylai aelodau'r Pwyllgor nodi'r materion hyn a cheisio'u dad-boliticeiddio. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddwn wedyn yn gallu cytuno.

Ni wnaf barhau gan nad oes arnaf eisiau ailadrodd yr hyn y mae eraill wedi'i ddweud. Os gallwn, credaf y dylem orffen yn gynnar heddiw fel y gallwn fynd at ein desgiau a gwneud rhywfaint o waith cynhyrchiol. Croesawaf y cynigion hyn a gobeithiaf y cânt gefnogaeth unfrydol.

**Peter Rogers:** Soniodd John am statws addysg bwyd a dyna beth yr wyf i am ei drafod. Y Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw yw'r unig gorff yn y wlad gyda rhwydwaith rhanbarthol o athrawon technoleg bwyd. Mae ganddo 11 o gynrychiolwyr rhanbarthol, prif swyddfa lawn-amser ac mae wedi buddsoddi £250,000 mewn adnoddau ystafell ddosbarth. Dadl y Comisiwn yw mai dim ond trwy roi addysg safonol ar faterion bwyd fel rhan o ddylunio a thechnoleg y gellir cyflawni amcanion ar gyfer gwella diogelwch a hylendid bwyd a chynyddu dealltwriaeth am faeth.

Yn Ynys Môn, bydd y grŵp iechyd lleol yn targedu afiechyd y galon sydd yn arbennig o gyffredin yn y rhan honno o Gymru. Gan dargedu mewn ysgolion, bydd y grŵp yn cynghori disgyblion ar fwyta'n iach ynghyd ag ymarfer corff. Dylem anelu at ymrwymiad

lifestyle. The most appropriate place for food-related education is within design and technology, as food technology. Students will then become aware of the versatility of food and the world around them. Knowledge and skills will also develop, enabling children to be of practical use around the home. In turn, children's understanding of how food gets on the table is vital and can only be ensured if the teaching of food technology is made compulsory. We will achieve good quality teaching if we support teachers who are already trained as food specialists, as reflected in the amendment on food nutrition, which was originally proposed to the motion in the next debate and has now been ruled out of order. I urge the Assembly to consider this issue in its future deliberations.

3:57 p.m.

**Val Feld:** I must declare an interest, because I was a member of the working party for the personal and social education curriculum. I am delighted to hear the warm words that have been spoken about it. It was the most extraordinarily difficult work. Of all the work I carried out when I was at the Equal Opportunities Commission—and some of it was tough—this was a complex issue with which to get to grips and it is good that it has reached this stage. I feel proud of what we have achieved as a party to bring this process forward and that I was able to contribute at some stage to assess our progress.

I will make some comments about food and PSE. I am pleased to hear from Rosemary Butler that there will be further work on food, because many people have been anxious about this and there are a range of reasons why it is now an enormously important issue for us. It is not just because I have a concern about the number of Little Chefs between here and north Wales—and I would like to see greater diversity—but it is also because we have real considerations about the safety of our food and the introduction of technology. We have had debates on GM food. We also know how critical it is to diet in terms of long-term health and preventing poor health. This morning, I met with many people from the hospitality industry—the

i ffordd iach o fyw. Y lle mwyaf priodol i addysg bwyd yw o fewn dylunio a thechnoleg, dan enw technoleg bwyd. Wedyn daw myfyrwyr i wybod am holl bosibiliadau bwyd a'r byd o'u cwmpas. Bydd gwybodaeth a sgiliau'n datblygu hefyd, gan alluogi plant i fod o ddefnydd ymarferol o gwmpas y tŷ. Yn ei dro, mae'n hanfodol bod plant yn deall sut y mae bwyd yn cyrraedd y bwrdd, a'r unig ffordd i sicrhau hynny yw gwneud technoleg bwyd yn bwnc gorfodol. Gallwn sicrhau addysg o ansawdd da os cefnogwn athrawon sydd eisoes wedi'u hyfforddi fel arbenigwyr bwyd, fel a adlewyrchir yn y gwelliant ar faeth bwyd, a gynigiwyd yn wreiddiol i'r cynnig yn y ddadl nesaf ac sydd erbyn hyn wedi'i farnu allan o drefn. Anogaf y Cynulliad i ystyried y mater hwn yn ei drafodaethau yn y dyfodol.

**Val Feld:** Rhaid imi ddatgan diddordeb, oherwydd yr oeddwn yn aelod o weithgor y cwricwlwm addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol. Yr wyf wrth fy modd o glywed y geiriau caredig a siaradwyd amdano. Yr oedd yn waith anhygoel o anodd. O'r holl waith a wneuthum pan oeddwn yn y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal—ac yr oedd llawer o hwnnw'n galed—yr oedd hwn yn fater cymhleth i fynd i'r afael ag ef ac mae'n dda ei fod wedi cyrraedd y fan hon. Teimlaf yn falch o'r hyn yr ydym wedi'i gyflawni fel plaid i ddod â'r broses hon yn ei blaen a'm bod wedi gallu cyfrannu ar ryw gam i asesu'n gwaith.

Gwnaf ychydig o sylwadau am fwyd ac ABCh. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed gan Rosemary Butler y bydd mwy o waith ar fwyd, oherwydd mae llawer o bobl wedi bod yn bryderus ynglŷn â hyn ac mae llawer o resymau pam y mae'n fater eithriadol o bwysig inni erbyn hyn. Nid dim ond am fy mod yn poeni am y nifer o Little Chefs rhwng y fan yma a'r gogledd—ac fe hoffwn weld mwy o amrywiaeth—ond hefyd am fod gennym ystyriaethau gwirioneddol am ddiogelwch ein bwyd ac am gyflwyniad technoleg. Yr ydym wedi cael dadleuon am fwyd a addaswyd yn enetig. Gwyddom hefyd mor allweddol ydyw i arferion bwyta yn nhermau iechyd tymor-hir ac atal iechyd gwael. Y bore yma, cwrddais â llawer o bobl

people who cater for us—who are concerned about what they consider a significant skills and labour shortage in that industry. Tourism and the expansion of the use of Welsh food are so important to our economic development strategy. Therefore, it is important that we consider how we introduce children to the notion of using food effectively and get them interested and excited in the production of food and in cooking generally, at an early age. I hope that that will be seriously considered in the details of the guidance that will be produced.

I wanted to reassure Kirsty Williams about the PSE curriculum, but she has left the Chamber. However, there was considerable discussion on racism at the meetings that I attended about the integration of equality into the PSE curriculum. Gareth Jones indicated that the PSE curriculum was considered to be something that had to be taken on board by a school as a whole, and not to be taught in small, isolated lessons. Some of it might filter through into lessons, but much of the PSE curriculum was for integration into a range of other subjects. While there is clearly some good practice in Welsh schools, it is incredibly patchy. At the Equal Opportunities Commission a few years ago, we carried out a survey of Welsh schools and found that the momentum to develop equal opportunities had decreased significantly.

The working party approached the work by developing some broad concepts and that is evident. There are several references to the expectations of what pupils will achieve and to the importance of recognising cultural differences. Diversity is included in the curriculum at key stage 1, by learning to value and celebrate cultural difference. It is also included at key stage 2, by valuing cultural diversity and equal opportunity, and key stage 3 concentrates on respect for the dignity of all. The principle was founded on the notion of children and young people learning, as they grow, to accept, recognise and value differences while developing a sense that we are all equal, even if we are different. The practice and detail of how they

o'r diwydiant croeso—y bobl sydd yn arlwyio i ni—sydd yn bryderus ynghylch yr hyn a ystyrient fel prinder sgiliau a llafur sylweddol yn y diwydiant hwnnw. Mae twristiaeth ac ehangu'r defnydd o fwyd Cymreig mor bwysig i'n strategaeth ddatblygu economaidd. Felly, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ystyried sut yr ydym yn cyflwyno plant i'r syniad o ddefnyddio bwyd yn effeithiol ac ennyn diddordeb a chyffro ynddynt ynghylch cynhyrchu bwyd a choginio yn gyffredinol, yn gynnar yn eu hoes. Gobeithio y caiff hynny ei ystyried o ddifrif ym manylion y canllawiau a gynhyrchir.

Yr oeddwn eisiau tawelu meddwl Kirsty Williams ynglŷn â'r cwricwlwm ABCh, ond mae hi wedi gadael y Siambr. Fodd bynnag, bu cryn drafodaeth am hiliaeth yn y cyfarfodydd a fynychais ynglŷn â cynnwys cydraddoldeb yn y cwricwlwm ABCh. Nododd Gareth Jones fod y cwricwlwm ABCh yn cael ei ystyried fel rhywbeth yr oedd yn rhaid i ysgol ei gofleidio fel cyfanrwydd. Nid oedd yn rhywbeth i'w ddysgu mewn gwersi bach, ar wahân. Gallai rhywfaint ohono ddiferu drwodd i mewn i wersi, ond yr oedd llawer o'r cwricwlwm ABCh i'w integreiddio i amrediad o bynciau eraill. Er ei bod yn amlwg fod rhywfaint o ymarfer da yn ysgolion Cymru, mae'n anhygoel o dameidiog. Yn y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal ychydig o flynyddoedd yn ôl, gwnaethom arolwg o ysgolion Cymru a gwelsom fod y momentwm i ddatblygu cyfleoedd cyfartal wedi lleihau'n arwyddocaol.

Aeth y gweithgor ati drwy ddatblygu rhai cysyniadau eang ac mae hynny'n amlwg. Ceir sawl cyfeiriad at y disgwyliadau o'r hyn a gyflawnir gan ddisgyblion ac at bwysigrwydd cydnabod gwahaniaethau diwylliannol. Mae amrywiaeth wedi'i chynnwys yn y cwricwlwm yng nghyfnod allweddol 1, drwy ddysgu gwerthfawrogi a dathlu gwahaniaeth diwylliannol. Fe'i cynhwysir hefyd yng nghyfnod allweddol 2, drwy werthfawrogi amrywiaeth ddiwylliannol a chyfle cyfartal, ac mae cyfnod allweddol 3 yn canolbwyntio ar barch tuag at urddas pawb. Seiliwyd yr egwyddor ar y syniad o blant a phobl ifanc yn dysgu, wrth iddynt dyfu, i dderbyn, cydnabod a gwerthfawrogi gwahaniaethau tra'n datblygu

will learn and understand those lessons will be developed from those values.

Work that is done now to produce teaching materials will be important. I urge Rosemary, who will be sympathetic to this, to ensure that some of the grants for educational and support training are allocated for educating teachers on how to teach equal opportunities and to improve their understanding of the subtle ways in which the differences between women and men make them unequal, or that the differences that make black and white people unequal may be sensed in schools, often without teachers realising it. These subtle ways still include practices such as a teacher saying that the girls are sitting nice and quietly and reading their books while the boys are rowdy, or lining the girls and the boys up separately. I hope that significant resources will be invested to alleviate the lack of understanding about the cultural differences between our communities because it is important that teachers understand the principles of equality in order to integrate them in their work.

The work-related curriculum is important because for the first time it will start to integrate into schools work and an understanding of the work for which we are preparing pupils. That is important for our work on developing enterprise, the entrepreneurship plan, and the idea that we are determined to ensure that people have a sense of the importance of lifelong learning. We are preparing our young people for the world they will live in, and preparing them to use their skills and talents to develop our economy.

**Mick Bates:** I am pleased to hear the comments in this significant debate, particularly about the critical issue of food technology. Many people referred to funding. I always remember that lovely saying: if you think education is expensive, try ignorance. In this debate on the curriculum, we have a chance to bring forward real joined-up thinking that will produce a better economy

synnwyr ein bod i gyd yn gydradd, hyd yn oed os ydym yn wahanol. Datblygir yr ymarfer a manylion y ffordd y byddant yn dysgu ac yn deall y gwersi hynny ar sail y gwerthoedd hyn.

Bydd y gwaith a wneir yn awr i gynhyrchu defnyddiau dysgu yn bwysig. Anogaf Rosemary, a fydd yn cydymdeimlo â hyn, i wneud yn siŵr y caiff rhywfaint o'r grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant eu dyrannu i addysgu athrawon sut i ddysgu cyfle cyfartal ac i wella'u dealltwriaeth o'r ffyrdd cynnil y mae'r gwahaniaethau rhwng merched a dynion yn eu gwneud yn anghydradd, neu'r modd y gall y gwahaniaethau sydd yn gwneud pobl wynion a duon yn anghydradd gael eu synhwyro mewn ysgolion, yn aml heb i'r athrawon sylweddoli hynny. Mae'r ffyrdd cynnil hyn yn dal i gynnwys arferion fel yr athro/athrawes yn dweud bod y merched i gyd yn eistedd yn dawel bra ac yn darllen eu llyfrau tra bod y bechgyn yn cadw twrw, neu gosod y merched a'r bechgyn mewn rhesi ar wahân. Gobeithiaf y caiff adnoddau sylweddol eu buddsoddi I liniaru'r diffyg dealltwriaeth am y gwahaniaethau diwylliannol rhwng ein cymunedau oherwydd mae'n bwysig fod athrawon yn deall egwyddorion cydraddoldeb er mwyn eu hintegreiddio yn eu gwaith.

Mae'r cwricwlwm perthnasol i waith yn bwysig oherwydd am y tro cyntaf bydd yn dechrau integreiddio i waith mewn ysgolion a ddealltwriaeth o'r gwaith yr ydym yn paratoi disgyblion ar ei gyfer. Mae hynny'n bwysig i'n gwaith ar ddatblygu menter, y cynllun entrepreneuriaeth, a'r syniad ein bod yn benderfynol o sicrhau y caiff pobl synnwyr o bwysigrwydd dysgu gydol oes. Yr ydym yn paratoi'n pobl ifanc ar gyfer y byd y byddant yn byw ynddo, ac yn eu paratoi i ddefnyddio'u sgiliau a'u doniau i ddatblygu'n heconomi.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed y sylwadau yn y ddadl arwyddocaol hon, yn enwedig ynghylch mater allweddol technoleg bwyd. Cyfeiriodd nifer o bobl at gyllid. Yr wyf bob amser yn cofio'r ymadrodd hyfryd hwnnw: os ydych chi'n meddwl fod addysg yn ddrud, rhowch gynnig ar anwybodaeth. Yn y ddadl hon am y cwricwlwm, mae gennym gyfle I ddod ymlaen â syniadau

in Wales. I relate my remarks particularly to food technology. Over the years, there has been a dilution of food technology in the curriculum. I welcome the fact that guidelines will be published shortly. I hope they will concentrate on including food technology in design and technology itself.

I fear that sometimes in education there is a tendency to break down the constituent parts of a discipline and disperse them to various sectors of the curriculum, with loss of focus. We need to encourage a subject like food technology for many reasons, which others have expounded, including health, welfare, social and educational reasons, but particularly for economic reasons. In Wales, the agricultural industry is central to our culture, and it must be joined through education, which teaches people the skills to prepare Welsh food. What better way is there to demonstrate sustainable development? It would sustain an economy through our education system and provide a quality product at the end of the day. Those of you who attended the Welsh Food Alliance conference in Cardiff, including Christine Gwyther, the Secretary for Agriculture and Rural Development, know that it was an excellent day. Many people indicated the great benefits to Wales of emphasising the need for food technology. I hope that the authorities will have significant funds so that they can match the grants for educational and support training. All too often we leave authorities out on a limb without significant funds to ensure training. Rosemary is shaking her head but I know of one authority that has already said that there is a shortfall and that it is struggling to find ways to match grants for educational and support training. Overall, I welcome this curriculum document but I look forward to significant reviews to demonstrate the often-mentioned flexibility. This is a moving target and the need for reviews will be particularly evident in food technology.

4:07 p.m.

**William Graham:** As chairman of the Pre-

cydlynol gwirioneddol a fydd yn creu gwell economi yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn sôn yn arbennig am dechnoleg bwyd. Dros y blynyddoedd cafodd technoleg bwyd yn y cwricwlwm ei lastwreiddio. Croesawaf y ffaith y caiff canllawiau eu cyhoeddi cyn bo hir. Gobeithio y byddant yn canolbwyntio ar gynnwys technoleg bwyd o fewn dylunio a thechnoleg ei hun.

Mae gennyf ofn y ceir tueddiad weithiau ym myd addysg i ddatgymalu cydrannau rhyw ddisgyblaeth arbennig a'u gwasgaru i amrywiol sectorau'r cwricwlwm, gan golli ffocws. Mae angen inni annog pwnc fel technoleg bwyd am sawl rheswm, a enwyd gan eraill, yn cynnwys rhesymau iechyd, lles, cymdeithasol ac addysgol, ond yn enwedig am resymau economaidd. Yng Nghymru, mae'r diwydiant amaethyddol yn ganolog i'n diwylliant, a rhaid iddo gael ei uno drwy addysg, sydd yn dysgu'r sgiliau i bobl gynhyrchu bwyd Cymreig. Pa well ffordd sydd i arddangos datblygiad cynaliadwy? Byddai'n cynnal economi drwy ein system addysg ac yn darparu cynnyrch o safon ar ddiwedd y dydd. Mae'r rheiny yn eich plith a fynychodd gynhadledd Cynghrair Bwyd Cymru yng Nghaerdydd, gan gynnwys Christine Gwyther, yr Ysgrifennydd Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, yn gwybod y cafwyd diwrnod ardderchog. Nododd llawer o bobl y manteision mawr i Gymru o bwysleisio'r angen am dechnoleg bwyd. Gobeithiaf y caiff yr awdurdodau gyllid sylweddol fel y gallant ateb y grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant. Yn llawer rhy aml byddwn yn gadael awdurdodau yn ddiymgeledd heb arian arwyddocaol i sicrhau hyfforddiant. Mae Rosemary'n ysgwyd ei phen ond gwn am un awdurdod sydd eisoes wedi dweud bod diffyg cyllid a'i bod yn ei chael yn anodd canfod ffyrdd i gael arian cyfatebol tuag at y grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant. Ar y cyfan, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ddogfen gwricwlwm hon ond edrychaf ymlaen at adolygiadau sylweddol i arddangos yr hyblygrwydd y soniwyd cymaint amdano. Targed symudol yw hwn a bydd yr angen am adolygiadau'n arbennig o amlwg ym maes technoleg bwyd.

**William Graham:** Fel cadeirydd y Pwyllgor

16 Education Committee, I endorse the splendid work ACCAC has put into this report. It was presented well in the Committee and they answered all our questions extremely well and to the entire satisfaction of the Committee members. That is not always the case. I also place on record my thanks to the working group—we are not allowed sub-committees—which prepared the consideration of the finer points of this document for the Committee. I hope that next time the Assembly itself will commission the national curriculum.

**Rosemary Butler:** I thank everyone for their interesting contributions. I knew we had one or two professional experts in education; I had not realised that we had so many. The quality of the debate has been exceptional and there are several people who could also have contributed, including Owen John Thomas, another professional teacher, who contributes in committee. I am pleased by the speakers' support for the motion and by the welcome for the curriculum review. It shows the strength of consensus in the Chamber. To that can be added the positive support shown by schools, teachers, and education advisers across the country.

This curriculum will meet the early challenges of the new century. From September 2000 it will ensure that students in Wales will be prepared for active, responsible lives in the new millennium. As I said, the evolutionary nature of the review means that, apart from the new frameworks, there have not been extensive changes for me to highlight today. Jenny Randerson's point about ensuring that teachers have the information as soon as possible so that they can deliver in September is well made. However, there is nothing new here. As Jenny knows, this review has been out in public for some time, so that work has already started. It is good that we are not making major changes because teachers and schools have worked hard over the years to deliver the best kind of education possible for our children in Wales.

Inspection evidence and research has shown that the national curriculum delivers a broad

Addysg Cyn-16, ategaf y gwaith rhagorol a wnaeth ACCAC i greu'r adroddiad hwn. Cafodd ei gyflwyno'n dda yn y Pwyllgor ac atebwyd ein holl gwestiynau'n eithriadol o dda ac er boddhad llawn aelodau'r Pwyllgor. Nid yw hynny bob amser yn digwydd. Hoffwn gofnodi hefyd fy niolch i'r gweithgor—nid oes gennym hawl cael is-bwyllgorau—a baratôdd ystyriaeth y pwyntiau mwy manwl yn y ddogfen hon ar ran y Pwyllgor. Gobeithiaf mai'r Cynulliad ei hun fydd yn comisiynu'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol y tro nesaf.

**Rosemary Butler:** Diolch i bawb am eu cyfraniadau diddorol. Gwyddwn fod gennym un neu ddau o arbenigwyr proffesiynol ym myd addysg; nid oeddwn wedi sylwi bod gennym gynifer. Bu ansawdd y dadl yn eithriadol ac mae llawer o bobl eraill a allai fod wedi cyfrannu, gan gynnwys Owen John Thomas, athro proffesiynol arall, sydd yn cyfrannu yn y pwyllgor. Caf fy modloni gan y gefnogaeth a fynegwyd i'r cynnig gan siaradwyr a chan y croeso i adolygiad y cwricwlwm. Mae'n dangos y cryfder consensws yn y Siambr. At hynny gellir ychwanegu'r gefnogaeth gadarnhaol a roddwyd gan ysgolion, athrawon ac ymgynghorwyr addysg ledled y wlad.

Bydd y cwricwlwm yn ateb heriau cynnar y ganrif newydd. O fis Medi 2000 bydd yn sicrhau y bydd myfyrwyr yng Nghymru wedi'u paratoi ar gyfer bywydau gweithgar, cyfrifol yn y mileniwm newydd. Fel y dywedais, mae natur esblygol yr adolygiad yn golygu na fu, ar wahân i'r fframweithiau newydd, unrhyw newidiadau mawr i mi dynnu sylw atynt heddiw. Gwnaeth Jenny Randerson bwynt da ynglŷn â sicrhau fod athrawon yn cael yr wybodaeth cyn gynted ag y bo modd fel y gallant gyflawni ym Medi. Fodd bynnag, nid oes dim byd newydd yma. Fel y gŵyr Jenny, mae'r adolygiad hwn wedi bod allan yn gyhoeddus ers tro, felly mae gwaith eisoes wedi dechrau. Mae'n beth da nad ydym yn gwneud newidiadau mawr oherwydd mae athrawon ac ysgolion wedi gweithio'n galed dros y blynyddoedd i ddarparu'r math gorau posibl o addysg i'n plant yng Nghymru.

Dangosodd tystiolaeth o archwiliadau ac ymchwil fod y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yn

and balanced education but that some aspects could be improved. This review delivers those improvements, principally through improving flexibility—which has been stressed this afternoon—and manageability, so that teachers have the right tools to do this important job. Some good points have been made on flexibility and the thinning down of the curriculum, to give our excellent teachers space to use their professional skills. That is why this new review is so important.

Gareth Jones spoke exceptionally well. He did not get paid by the Committee for his views on geography, though he may have been paid for them previously. As he said, this is one of the Assembly's most important and far reaching debates. This is the first time a truly Welsh approach to education is being delivered. He also stressed stability and that is important. Our teachers need stability but the fact that they are also given flexibility is a unique feature of this curriculum. Gareth and Jenny Randerson also mentioned the allocation of money. We are committed to putting an additional £844 million into education over the next three years. There is £7 million for delivering training for the new curriculum and other related issues to ensure that teachers have the tools to deliver next September.

Jonathan Morgan made a good point on information technology. As a young man, he is probably one of the few people here who knows a great deal about IT. The Pre-16 Education Committee is looking closely at IT and how we can deliver on it. We have a large amount of money in our budget for IT in schools. It is important that we deliver the best possible form of IT as soon as possible. The Pre-16 Education Committee, and Huw Lewis in particular, is keen that we move ahead with this.

Everyone is concerned about the drop in the take-up of modern foreign languages. It is being addressed and I hope that the project I mentioned earlier, to which we have allocated a £100,000, will produce serious research that we can put into action quickly.

cynnig addysg eang a chytbwys ond y gellid gwella rhai agweddau. Mae'r adolygiad hwn yn cyflawni'r gwelliannau hynny, yn bennaf drwy wella hyblygrwydd—fel a bwysleisiwyd y prynhawn yma—a hydrinedd, fel bod gan athrawon yr arfau iawn i wneud y gwaith pwysig hwn. Gwnaed rhai pwyntiau da ar hyblygrwydd a theneuo'r cwricwlwm, i roi lle i'n hathrawon gwych i ddefnyddio'u sgiliau proffesiynol. Dyna pam y mae'r adolygiad newydd hwn mor bwysig.

Siaradodd Gareth Jones yn eithriadol o dda. Ni chafodd dâl gan y Pwyllgor am ei sylwadau ar ddaeyddiaeth, er y gellid bod wedi talu iddo amdanynt o'r blaen. Fel y dywedodd ef, dyma un o ddadleuon pwysigaf a mwyaf pellgyrhaeddol y Cynulliad. Dyma'r tro cyntaf i agwedd wirioneddol Gymreig ar addysg gael ei chyflwyno. Pwysleisiodd sefydlogrwydd hefyd, ac mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae ar ein hathrawon angen sefydlogrwydd, ond nodwedd unigryw'r cwricwlwm hwn yw ei fod yn rhoi hyblygrwydd iddynt hefyd. Soniodd Gareth a Jenny Randerson hefyd am y dyraniad ariannol. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i roi £844 miliwn yn ychwanegol i mewn i addysg dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Mae £7 miliwn ar gyfer rhoi hyfforddiant ar gyfer y cwricwlwm newydd a materion cysylltiedig eraill er mwyn sicrhau bod gan athrawon yr arfau i gyflawni'r gwaith fis Medi nesaf.

Gwnaeth Jonathan Morgan bwynt da ar dechnoleg gwybodaeth. Fel dyn ifanc, mae'n debyg ei fod yn un o'r ychydig bobl yma sydd yn gwybod llawer am TG. Mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 yn edrych yn agos ar TG a sut y gallwn ei ddarparu. Mae gennym swm mawr o arian yn ein cyllideb ar gyfer TG mewn ysgolion. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cyflwyno'r ffurf orau bosib o TG cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16, a Huw Lewis yn arbennig, yn awyddus inni symud ymlaen ar hyn.

Mae pawb yn poeni am y cwmp yn y niferoedd sydd yn dewis astudio ieithoedd tramor modern. Mae sylw'n cael ei roi i hyn a gobeithio y bydd y prosiect y soniais amdano'n gynharach, yr ydym wedi clustnodi £100,000 ar ei gyfer, yn cynhyrchu gwaith ymchwil difrifol y gallwn ei weithredu ar fyrder.

The purpose of this curriculum is to raise standards. Unless we can raise the standard of our children's education, then the future of the nation cannot develop as quickly as we would like.

Peter Rogers always makes a good contribution on food and speaks up for his region. I was pleased that John Marek as Chairman of that working group was able to say that there was unanimity among the group on that issue. A number of people made points about food. There has been a co-ordinated and concerted campaign on food. We have had many discussions today and in the Committee reflecting the concerns that some of those groups have expressed to me and other Assembly Members. Food is covered in a number of subjects as well as in the personal and social education framework and we do not take this issue lightly. I am satisfied that the revised curriculum together with the guidance that ACCAC will provide, reflects the importance of food and food safety for all our lives. I take the point that that guidance should be given early. I hope that it will be delivered soon.

**Richard Edwards:** You have made the point that I was about to make. I was going to urge you to ensure that the guidance would be early. My understanding was that ACCAC was saying that the guidance could not be delivered before June this year. That would be far too late to aid the timetabling process. I am pleased to hear you say that it will be soon. I hope soon is in the next month or so.

**Rosemary Butler:** I cannot say when it will be.

**Richard Edwards:** June will be too late.

**Rosemary Butler:** The Chief Executive of ACCAC is sitting behind you.

**Brian Gibbons:** Will there be opportunities for students and pupils to partake in the practical activity of cooking? The practical activity seems to be a novelty unlike the theoretical aspect. I am talking about the

Amcan y cwricwlwm hwn yw codi safonau. Os na allwn godi safon addysg ein plant, yna ni all dyfodol ein cenedl ddatblygu mor gyflym ag yr hoffem.

Bydd Peter Rogers bob amser yn gwneud cyfraniad da ar fwyd ac yn siarad dros ei ardal. Yr oeddwn yn falch fod John Marek fel Cadeirydd y gweithgor hwnnw wedi gallu dweud y bu unfrydedd ymhlith y grŵp ar y mater hwnnw. Gwnaeth llawer o bobl bwyntiau am fwyd. Bu ymgyrch cydgysylltiedig a chydweithredol ar fwyd. Cawsom lawer o drafodaethau heddiw ac yn y Pwyllgor yn adlewyrchu'r pryderon a fynegwyd gan rai o'r grwpiau hynny i mi ac Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad. Ceir sylw i fwyd mewn nifer o bynciau yn ogystal ag yn y fframwaith addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol ac nid ydym yn cymryd y mater hwn yn ysgafn. Yr wyf yn fodlon fod y cwricwlwm diwygiedig ynghyd â'r arweiniad y bydd ACCAC yn ei roi, yn adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd bwyd a diogelwch bwyd i'n bywydau ni i gyd. Cymeraf y pwynt y dylid rhoi arweiniad yn fuan. Gobeithiaf y caiff ei roi yn fuan.

**Richard Edwards:** Yr ydych wedi gwneud y pwynt yr oeddwn i am ei wneud. Yr oeddwn yn mynd i'ch annog chi i sicrhau y byddai'r arweiniad yn fuan. Fy nealltwriaeth i oedd fod ACCAC yn dweud na ellid rhoi'r arweiniad cyn mis Mehefin eleni. Byddai hynny'n llawer rhy hwyr i helpu'r broses amserlennu. Mae'n dda gennyf glywed gennych y bydd yn fuan. Gobeithio fod buan o fewn y mis nesaf.

**Rosemary Butler:** Ni allaf ddweud pa bryd y bydd hynny.

**Richard Edwards:** Bydd Mehefin yn rhy hwyr.

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae Prif Weithredwr ACCAC yn eistedd y tu ôl i chi.

**Brian Gibbons:** A fydd cyfleoedd i fyfyrwyr a disgyblion i gymryd rhan yng ngweithgaredd ymarferol coginio? Mae'r gweithgaredd ymarferol fel petai'n nofolti yn wahanol i'r agwedd ddamcaniaethol. Yr wyf



practical skills involved in cooking, like boiling an egg and making toast.

**Rosemary Butler:** You are obviously a gourmet chef. The beauty of the curriculum is its flexibility, allowing teachers to decide the best way for teaching pupils about food. Although there has been a lot of late information, none of that information is new. The food industry made that information available previously. It took the opportunity of having a second front to get its point across but it was taken on board by ACCAC in the original review. I would not want people to think that we have not taken the food industry's observations on board. Jenny Randerson indicated that we all like a broad curriculum as long as our area is core. We talk a great deal about cross-cutting in the Assembly. Jane Hutt is introducing a raft of health-related programmes on diet. We have had the healthy schools and the healthy classroom initiatives, which will ensure that people are aware of the importance of food. We say that devolution is not an event, but that it progresses continually. We can say the same about this curriculum. It will be reviewed by the Assembly and we can proceed from there. PSE is voluntary at the moment, but, hopefully, in two years' time, we will be able to make it compulsory.

4:17 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am just interested in the practical activity of cooking.

**Rosemary Butler:** It is up to the schools how they deliver this as we are not being prescriptive. It is flexible and should be delivered as is best suited to the setting and the local circumstances. We must not be prescriptive—that is the whole point.

Val Feld's point on racism and anti-racism was well made and she is always eloquent on this. As a member of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, Val will be aware that they have discussed the Macpherson report. Edwina Hart reported that she has money put aside for implementing that

yn sôn am y sgiliau ymarferol a ddefnyddir i goginio fel berwi wŷ a gwneud tost.

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae'n amlwg eich bod yn gogydd o fri. Mantais fawr y cwricwlwm yw ei hyblygrwydd, yn caniatáu i athrawon benderfynu ar y ffordd orau i ddysgu disgyblion am fwyd. Er y bu llawer o wybodaeth ddiweddar, nid oes dim o'r wybodaeth honno'n newydd. Yr oedd y diwydiant bwyd wedi darparu'r wybodaeth honno o'r blaen. Cymerasant y cyfle i gael ail ffrynt i drosglwyddo'u neges, ond fe'i derbyniwyd gan ACCAC yn yr adolygiad gwreiddiol. Ni fyddwn am i bobl feddwl nad ydym wedi ystyried sylwadau y diwydiant bwyd. Nododd Jenny Randerson ein bod ni i gyd yn hoffi cwricwlwm eang, dim ond i'n maes ni fod yn un craidd. Siaradwn lawer yn y Cynulliad am draws-byncio. Mae Jane Hutt yn cyflwyno rafft o raglenni iechyd yn ymwneud â deiet. Cawsom y cynllun ysgolion iach a'r cynllun ystafell ddosbarth iach a fydd yn sicrhau bod pobl yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd bwyd. Dywedwn nad digwyddiad yw datganoli, ond ei fod yn symud rhagddo'n barhaus. Gallwn ddweud yr un peth am y cwricwlwm hwn. Caiff ei adolygu gan y Cynulliad a gallwn symud ymlaen o'r fan honno. Mae ABCh yn wirfoddol ar hyn o bryd, ond, gobeithio, ymhen dwy flynedd, gallwn ei gwneud yn orfodol.

**Brian Gibbons:** Diddordeb yn y gweithgaredd ymarferol o goginio sydd gennyf, dyna i gyd.

**Rosemary Butler:** Mater i'r ysgolion yw sut y cyflwynant hyn gan nad ydym yn rhoi cyfarwyddyd. Mae'n hyblyg a dylid ei gyflwyno yn y modd mwyaf addas i'r sefyllfa a'r amgylchiadau lleol. Rhaid inni beidio â bod yn rhag-gyfarwyddol—dyna'r pwynt yn union.

Gwnaeth Val Feld ei phwynt yn dda ynghylch hiliaeth a gwrth-hiliaeth ac mae hi bob amser yn huawdl ar hyn. Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, bydd Val yn ymwybodol eu bod wedi trafod adroddiad Macpherson. Dywedodd Edwina Hart fod ganddi arian wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer

report, and we will talk about the best way to spend that money.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Will Rosemary Butler ensure that her officials are prepared to come to speak to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity about matters relating to the Macpherson report? We had a sub-committee meeting of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity to look precisely at Macpherson issues. There is some question about whether or not some officials in your department have been approached to talk to us on curriculum matters. There appears to be some difficulty. I welcome this opportunity to let you know about that, so that you can follow it up. I will formally contact Jane Hutt, as Chair of the Committee, to request that she mentions this to you more formally, but I thought that this was an opportunity to make you aware of it, so that we do not become too complacent about how we drive forward the Macpherson recommendations.

**Rosemary Butler:** There is no need for you to wait until a Plenary session to approach me on such an issue.

**Helen Mary Jones:** It was only at lunchtime today that we discussed it. I saw the opportunity to mention it in passing when you referred to it.

**Rosemary Butler:** I was not aware of a difficulty. I would like to come to the Committee myself when the officials attend, so that I can hear your observations.

One point that has been raised by many speakers, including Jonathan Morgan and Val Feld, is work experience. It is vital that when children partake in work experience, they are not expected to make cups of tea, stick a couple of stamps on envelopes and then post them. It should not be about that. It must have value, and I hope that all Assembly Members will make a commitment to provide work experience for a pupil, perhaps from their own constituency. That would be valuable. We must ensure that we have a worthwhile programme of work for them. I have already committed myself to taking two students, and I hope that you will do the same. That will move things forward and

gweithredu'r adroddiad hwnnw, a chawn siarad am y ffordd orau i wario'r arian hwnnw.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A wnaiff Rosemary Butler sicrhau bod ei swyddogion yn barod i ddod i annerch y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ar faterion yn ymwneud ag adroddiad Macpherson? Cawsom gyfarfod is-bwyllgor o'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal i edrych yn benodol ar faterion Macpherson. Mae rhywfaint o amheuaeth ynghylch a ofynnwyd i swyddogion o'ch adran chi i siarad â ni ai peidio ynglŷn â materion cwricwlwm. Mae'n debyg fod rhyw anhawster. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle hwn i roi gwybod i chi am hynny fel y gallwch ddilyn y mater. Byddaf yn cysylltu'n ffurfiol â Jane Hutt, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor, i ofyn iddi grybwyll hyn wrthych yn fwy ffurfiol, ond meddyliais fod hwn yn gyfle i roi gwybod i chi amdano fel na fyddwn yn llaesu dwylo gormod ynghylch y modd yr ydym yn gyrru ymlaen ag argymhellion Macpherson.

**Rosemary Butler:** Nid oes angen i chi aros tan Gyfarfod Lawn cyn dod ataf fi ar fater o'r fath.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Dim ond amser cinio heddiw y trafodwyd y peth gennym. Gwelais i'r cyfle i'w grybwyll wrth fynd heibio pan gyfeirioch chi ato.

**Rosemary Butler:** Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol fod anhawster. Hoffwn ddod i'r Pwyllgor fy hun pan fydd y swyddogion yn bresennol, fel y gallaf glywed eich sylwadau.

Un pwynt a godwyd gan lawer o siaradwyr, gan gynnwys Jonathan Morgan a Val Feld, yw profiad gwaith. Mae'n hanfodol, pan fydd plant yn cymryd rhan mewn profiad gwaith, nad oes disgwyl iddynt wneud paneidiau o de, glynu stamp neu ddau ar amlenni ac wedyn eu postio. Nid dyna fwriad y peth. Rhaid iddo gael gwerth, a gobeithiaf y bydd holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ymrwymo i ddarparu profiad gwaith i ddisgybl, efallai o'u hetholaeth eu hunain. Byddai hynny'n werthfawr. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym raglen waith werth chweil iddynt. Yr wyf eisoes wedi ymrwymo i gymryd dau fyfyrwr, a gobeithiaf y gwnewch chi yr un peth. Fe wnaiff hynny symud pethau ymlaen

show that we are leading from the front.

Jonathan Morgan made a point that this should be exciting. Gareth Jones said that the new curriculum is vital and I know that Jenny Randerson, although she expressed a few concerns, is behind it. It is good that we have cross-party support.

Today does not mark the end of ACCAC's work on this revised curriculum. Much work remains to be done, not only by ACCAC but by local education authorities, schools and the teachers and pupils themselves, to ensure that this curriculum continues to work. Someone said earlier that they hope that this curriculum will be implemented well. I have no doubt that, with our highly skilled, professional workforce, it will be implemented well and the children will benefit greatly. We must mark this opportunity and stress that we welcome the work that has gone into this review. We need to record our approval of the changes that have been made and provide all those involved in implementing the review with a positive message for the work ahead. This is only the beginning of the process. It is now up to us to ensure that the funding and training is available and that teachers have the opportunity to put this excellent tool into place.

a dangos ein bod yn arwain o'r tu blaen.

Gwnaeth Jonathan Morgan bwynt y dylai hwn fod yn gyffrous. Dywedodd Gareth Jones fod y cwricwlwm newydd yn hanfodol ac yr wyf yn gwybod bod Jenny Randerson, er iddi fynegi ambell bryder, y tu ôl iddo. Mae'n dda bod gennym gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol.

Nid yw heddiw'n gweld diwedd gwaith ACCAC ar y cwricwlwm diwygiedig hwn. Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud eto, nid yn unig gan ACCAC ond gan awdurdodau addysg lleol, ysgolion a'r athrawon a'r disgyblion eu hunain, i sicrhau bod y cwricwlwm hwn yn dal i weithio. Dywedodd rhywun yn gynharach eu bod yn gobeithio y caiff y cwricwlwm hwn ei weithredu'n dda. Nid oes gennyf amheuaeth, gyda'n gweithlu sgilgar a phroffesiynol ni, y caiff ei weithredu'n dda ac y caiff y plant fudd aruthrol. Rhaid inni nodi'r cyfle hwn a phwysleisio ein bod yn croesawu'r gwaith a aeth i mewn i'r adolygiad hwn. Mae angen inni gofnodi'n cymeradwyaeth i'r newidiadau a wnaethpwyd a rhoi neges gadarnhaol am y gwaith sydd o'n blaenau i bawb a fydd yn ymwneud â gweithredu'r adolygiad. Dim ond dechrau'r broses yw hyn. Mater i ni yn awr yw sicrhau bod y cyllid a'r hyfforddiant ar gael ac y caiff athrawon gyfle i roi'r arf pwysig hwn yn ei le.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian

Hart, Edwina  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Michael, Alun  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment adopted.*

Amended motion:

*that the Assembly*

*(a) welcomes the outcome of the first Wales-only review of the national curriculum;*

*(b) agrees that ACCAC has achieved in full the original aims of the review (laid in the Table Office on 11 January 2000); that the revised curriculum (copies of the programmes of study and attainment targets are available on the National Assembly for Wales website at home page/policy and information/education/ national curriculum review) reflects the distinctive needs of Wales and the importance of every child receiving a broad and balanced education; that the new programmes of study and attainment targets will be more manageable for teachers; and that taken with the new frameworks for personal and social education and work related education the new curriculum will ensure that young people are better prepared for the responsibilities and challenges of adult life; and*

Y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*fod y Cynulliad*

*(a) yn croesawu canlyniad yr adolygiad cyntaf o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a oedd yn benodol i Gymru*

*(b) yn cytuno bod ACCAC wedi cyflawni amcanion gwreiddiol yr adolygiad (a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Ionawr 2000) yn llawn; bod y cwricwlwm diwygiedig (ceir copi o'r rhaglenni astudio a'r targedau cyrhaeddiad ar wefan Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru o dan hafan/polisi a gwybodaeth/addysg/adolygiad o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol) yn adlewyrchu anghenion arbennig Cymru a phwysigrwydd sicrhau bod pob plentyn yn derbyn addysg eang a chytbwys; bod y rhaglenni astudio newydd a'r targedau cyrhaeddiad yn fwy hylaw i'r athrawon; a bod y cwricwlwm gyda'r fframweithiau newydd ar gyfer addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol ac addysg sydd yn gysylltiedig â gwaith yn sicrhau y bydd pobl ifanc wedi'u paratoi yn well ar gyfer y cyfrifoldebau a'r heriau a fydd yn eu hwynebu fel oedolion; ac*

*(c) provides sufficient financial support for training to ensure the full implementation of these proposals.*      *(c) yn darparu cefnogaeth ariannol ddigonol ar gyfer hyfforddiant i sicrhau gweithredu'r cynigion hyn yn llawn.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Michael, Alun  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Motion as amended adopted.*

**Cymeradwyo 11 o Orchmylion y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol  
Approval of the 11 National Curriculum Orders**

**The Secretary for Education and Children   Yr   Ysgrifennydd   Addysg   a   Phlant**

**(Rosemary Butler):** I propose that the Assembly

*(a) having considered the two reports of the Legislation Committee relating to the draft Orders 'The Education (National Curriculum) (Attainment Targets and Programmes of Study in English, Mathematics, Physical Education, Science, Welsh, Modern Foreign Languages, Art, Geography, History, Technology, Music) (Wales) Order 2000', laid in the Table Office on 15 December 1999; and*

*(b) having considered the draft Orders and the associated documents—the programmes of study and attainment targets (copies of which are available on the National Assembly for Wales website at home page/policy and information/education/national curriculum review);*

*(c) approves the making of the Orders in accordance with the drafts laid in the Table Office on 6 December 1999.*

This is essentially a technical matter. The Orders are necessary to give effect to the new programmes of study that we have been discussing this afternoon. The Legislation Committee considered the Orders on 7 December. The Legislation Committee reported that it did not consider that there were any issues arising under Standing Order No. 11.5 in respect of which the Committee needed to invite the Assembly to pay special attention. A few technical points relating to formatting of the Orders were noted, which have been attended to.

We have always viewed the review of the national curriculum for Wales as an evolutionary process. In the light of this approach, I am happy to support the amendment in the names of Jenny Randerson, Jonathan Morgan and Gareth Jones. We will need to ensure that the curriculum in Wales can continue to evolve in line with the educational needs of this country, and it will be for the Assembly to consider any future changes.

**The Presiding Officer:** Before I call Jenny Randerson to propose the amendment in her

**(Rosemary Butler):** Cynigiau fod y Cynulliad

*(a) yn dilyn ystyried y ddau adroddiad gan y Pwyllgor Deddfau yn ymwneud â'r Gorchmynion drafft 'Y Gorchmynion Addysg (Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol) (Targedau Cyrhaeddiad a Rhaglenni Astudio mewn (Saesneg, Mathemateg, Addysg Gorfforol, Gwyddoniaeth, Cymraeg, Ieithoedd Tramor Modern, Celf, Daearyddiaeth, Hanes, Technoleg, Cerdd) (Cymru) 2000', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Rhagfyr 1999; a*

*(b) wedi ystyried y Gorchmynion drafft a'r dogfennau cysylltiedig—y rhaglenni astudio a'r targedau cyrhaeddiad (mae copïau ar gael ar wefan Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru o dan hafan/polisi a gwybodaeth/addysg/adolygiad o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol);*

*(c) yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchmynion yn unol â'r drafftiau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Rhagfyr 1999.*

Mater technegol yw hwn yn ei hanfod. Mae angen y Gorchmynion er mwyn rhoi grym i'r rhaglenni astudio newydd y buom yn eu trafod heddiw'r prynhawn. Ystyriodd y Pwyllgor Deddfau y Gorchmynion ar 7 Rhagfyr. Adroddodd y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad oedd yn ystyried fod unrhyw faterion yn codi dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 y byddai angen i'r Pwyllgor wahodd y Cynulliad i roi sylw arbennig iddynt. Nodwyd ambell bwynt technegol ynglŷn â fformatio'r Gorchmynion, a deliwyd â'r rheiny.

Yr ydym bob amser wedi gweld adolygiad y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol i Gymru fel proses esblygol. Yng ngoleuni'r agwedd hon, yr wyf yn hapus i gefnogi'r gwelliant yn enwau Jenny Randerson, Jonathan Morgan a Gareth Jones. Bydd angen inni sicrhau y gall y cwricwlwm yng Nghymru barhau i esblygu yn unol ag anghenion addysgol y wlad hon, a mater i'r Cynulliad fydd ystyried unrhyw newidiadau yn y dyfodol.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn imi alw ar Jenny Randerson i gynnig y gwelliant yn ei henw

name, and that of Jonathan Morgan and Gareth Jones, I refer to amendments 2 and 3. Although they were originally accepted by the Table Office, their adoption would have put in doubt the approval of the Orders. I have therefore ruled them out of order. I apologise for the short notice in doing this, but as I explained yesterday, I was not present in the Assembly until Monday.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose amendment 1. Add after point (c)

*resolves that these proposals should be reconsidered in the future by the National Assembly for Wales in accordance with changing educational needs.*

Can I comment upon the ruling out of order of the other amendments?

**The Presiding Officer:** Not really.

**Jenny Randerson:** I will express my concern then. While I understand that you have to take legal advice—and I understand it was legal advice tabled very late in the day—

**The Presiding Officer:** To comment on the ruling I have just made, you are perfectly at liberty to refer to any of the issues that would have arisen in a debate on the amendments in this debate. This is a debate on the principle of the Order, and it can relate to any of the matters referred to in the amendments. However, I was unable to accept the amendments as tabled, because if adopted, they would have expressed disagreement with the content of the relevant document published by ACCAC. Therefore, it would have put my position, as the person responsible in the Government of Wales Act 1998 for signing the Orders on behalf of the Assembly, in some doubt. The Orders approved have to be clear. There has to be clarity as to whether an Order is approved or not by the Assembly. That is why I could not select these amendments. However, you are able, as is any other Assembly Member, to speak in this debate on the principle of the Orders and make any remarks that you would have made had the amendments been selected as in order for debate.

hi, ac eiddo Jonathan Morgan a Gareth Jones, cyfeiriau at welliannau 2 a 3. Er iddynt gael eu derbyn yn wreiddiol gan y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, byddai eu mabwysiadu wedi bwrw amheuaeth dros gymeradwyaeth y Gorchmynion. Yr wyf felly wedi deddfu eu bod allan o drefn. Ymddiheuraf am y byr rybudd wrth wneud hyn, ond fel yr eglurais ddoe, nid oeddwn yn bresennol yn y Cynulliad tan ddydd Llun.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiau welliant 1. Ychwaneger ar ôl pwynt (c)

*yn penderfynu y dylai'r cynigion hyn gael eu hailystyried yn y dyfodol gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, wrth i anghenion addysgol newid.*

A gaf i wneud sylw ar y dyfarniad fod y gwelliannau eraill allan o drefn?

**Y Llywydd:** Ddim mewn gwirionedd.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mynegaf fy mhryder felly. Yr wyf yn deall fod yn rhaid i chi gymryd cyngor cyfreithiol—a deallaf mai cyngor cyfreithiol ydoedd a gyflwynwyd yn hwyr iawn yn y dydd—

**Y Llywydd:** I wneud sylw ar y dyfarniad yr wyf newydd ei wneud, y mae perffaith ryddid i chi gyfeirio at unrhyw rai o'r materion a fuasai wedi codi mewn dadl ar y gwelliannau yn y ddadl hon. Dadl yw hon ar egwyddor y Gorchmyn, a gall ymwneud ag unrhyw rai o'r materion y cyfeiriwyd atynt yn y gwelliannau. Fodd bynnag, nid oeddwn yn gallu derbyn y gwelliannau fel y'u cyflwynwyd, oherwydd petaent wedi cael eu derbyn, byddent wedi mynegi anghytundeb â chynnwys y ddogfen berthnasol a gyhoeddwyd gan ACCAC. Felly, byddai hynny wedi rhoi fy sefyllfa i, fel y person cyfrifol yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 am lofnodi'r Gorchmynion ar ran y Cynulliad, mewn peth amheuaeth. Mae'n rhaid i'r Gorchmynion a gymeradwyir fod yn glir. Mae'n rhaid cael eglurder a ydyw Gorchmynion wedi'i gymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad ai peidio. Dyna pam na allwn ddewis y gwelliannau hyn. Fodd bynnag, gallwch chi, neu unrhyw Aelod arall o'r Cynulliad, siarad yn y ddadl hon ar egwyddor y Gorchmynion a gwneud unrhyw sylwadau

y buasech wedi'u gwneud pe bai'r gwelliannau wedi'u dewis fel rhai a oedd mewn trefn i'w trafod.

4.27 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** I regret that amendments 2 and 3 in the names of myself, Gareth Jones and Jonathan Morgan, which were tabled a day and a half before the closing time, in order for them to be looked at with a view to their legality, have been ruled out of order. You rightly say that I can say what I want at this point. However, it cannot be put on record as an Assembly decision. We were careful in how we worded our three amendments to bear in mind the Legislation Committee's report to which Rosemary Butler has just referred, which states:

'An Order does not itself have to contain the provisions to be made. An Order may direct that provision is to have effect as specified in a separately published document.'

In my earlier speech I said that we had no desire to throw the new national curriculum and its introduction into chaos. The last thing that we wanted to do was to add to the burden of teachers who will have to grapple with the new curriculum. We wanted to make our views known in a way which did not upset the Order, and the advice I was given at the time was that was the case with the amendments we tabled.

The amendment that stands deals with the speed with which changes take place in education. ICT is the perfect example. What is included in the curriculum will look out-of-date in two years' time. Therefore, we need a responsive, flexible approach to how we look at the new national curriculum. The Assembly must be involved in that. Another example is the food curriculum. The situation has already moved on from what it was when our sub-committee met, because we were unaware of the concerns and that we were not looking at what is called the written guidance. There are two elements to this process: the national curriculum Order and the written guidance. What I have read out from the Legislation Committee, which did

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn gresynu fod gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enwau Gareth Jones, Jonathan Morgan a mi, a gyflwynwyd ddiwrnod a hanner cyn yr amser cau, er mwyn iddynt gael eu hastudio o safbwynt eu cyfreithlondeb, wedi'u dyfarnu allan o drefn. Dywedwch yn gywir y gallaf ddweud beth a fynnaf ar y pwynt hwn. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir ei gofnodi fel penderfyniad gan y Cynulliad. Buom yn ofalus wrth eirio'n tri gwelliant gan gofio adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau y mae Rosemary Butler newydd gyfeirio ato, sydd yn datgan:

'Nid oes raid i Orchymyn ei hun gynnwys y darpariaethau sydd i'w gwneud. Gall Gorchymyn gyfarwyddo bod darpariaeth i gael effaith fel a bennir mewn dogfen a gyhoeddir ar wahân.'

Yn fy araith gynharach dywedais nad oedd gennym unrhyw awydd i fwrw'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol newydd a'i gyflwyniad i anhrefn llwyr. Y peth olaf y dymunem ei wneud oedd ychwanegu at faich athrawon fydd yn gorfod ymgiprys â'r cwricwlwm newydd. Yr oedd arnom eisiau cyhoeddi'n barn mewn modd na fyddai'n tarfu ar y Gorchymyn, a'r cyngor a roddwyd i mi ar y pryd oedd mai dyna fel y byddai hi gyda'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gennym ni.

Mae'r gwelliant sydd yn sefyll yn ymwneud â chyflymder newidiadau mewn addysg. Mae technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu'n enghraifft berffaith. Bydd yr hyn sydd wedi'i gynnwys yn y cwricwlwm yn edrych yn henffasiwn mewn dwy flynedd. Felly, mae angen ymagwedd ymatebol, hyblyg i'r modd yr edrychwn ar y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol newydd. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad gael rhan yn hynny. Enghraifft arall yw'r cwricwlwm bwyd. Mae'r sefyllfa eisoes wedi symud ymlaen o'r hyn ydoedd pan gyfarfu'n hisbwyllgor, oherwydd nad oeddem yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon ac nad oeddem yn edrych ar yr hyn a elwir yn arweiniad ysgrifenedig. Mae dwy elfen i'r broses hon: Gorchymyn y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a'r



not see the written guidance, shows that the Order stands as a separate issue. What we were trying to do in our amendments, which have been ruled out of order, was—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is not appropriate to refer to amendments that are out of order and therefore have not been moved. However, you can speak on the issue as widely as you care to, because this is a second reading type debate, if that is helpful, on the principle of the Order.

**Jenny Randerson:** I was coming to the principle. We hope that by looking at this flexibly we will be able to reconsider and respond in the written guidance to people's concerns about food and nutrition as part of the national curriculum. Amendment 1, which still stands, deals with flexibility. If you stretched the point, and without referring to the out of order amendments, you could apply that flexibility to the language aspect of the curriculum. We need to consider language skills. The Pre-16 Education Committee has agreed that it needs to look at language skills and the teaching of them. There is no point in us looking at the teaching of language skills if we do not amend the national curriculum when we have suggestions on how to improve it. The amendment outlines the need for a way to review this curriculum and amend it without having constant change. We must have stability, but at the same time, we must be responsive. Otherwise, we are not being fair to the young people of Wales.

**Gareth Jones:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith ein bod yn cael cyfeirio'r drafodaeth at fwyd a maetheg ac astudio iaith dramor—ail neu drydedd iaith yng Nghymru, yn dibynnu sut yr edrychwch arni—er mai'r rhain oedd pwnc y gwelliannau y barnwyd eu bod allan o drefn. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi cael cyfle i wyntyllu hyn am sawl rheswm.

Mae gwelliant 1 yn sefyll, a hoffwn gyfeirio ato yn fyr. Mae gwelliant 1 yn bwysig oherwydd ei fod yn ymwneud â'r ddau fater y cyfeiriwyd atynt. Mae geiriad y gwelliant hwn yn bwysig.

arweiniad ysgrifenedig. Mae'r hyn yr wyf i wedi'i ddarllen o eiriau'r Pwyllgor Deddfau, na welodd yr arweiniad ysgrifenedig, yn dangos fod y Gorchymyn yn sefyll fel mater ar wahân. Yr hyn yr oeddem ni'n ceisio'i wneud gyda'n gwelliannau, y barnwyd eu bod allan o drefn, oedd—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'n briodol cyfeirio at welliannau sydd allan o drefn ac sydd felly heb eu cynnig. Fodd bynnag, gallwch siarad ar y mater mor eang ag y mynnwch, gan fod hon yn ddadl o fath ail ddarlleniad, os yw hynny o gymorth, ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr oeddwn yn dod at yr egwyddor. Gobeithiwn, wrth inni edrych ar hyn yn hyblyg, y gwnawn edrych eto ac ymateb yn yr arweiniad ysgrifenedig i bryderon pobl ynghylch bwyd a maeth fel rhan o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol. Mae gwelliant 1, sydd yn dal i sefyll, yn delio â hyblygrwydd. Pe baech yn ymestyn y pwynt, a heb gyfeirio at y gwelliannau sydd allan o drefn, gallech gymhwyso'r hyblygrwydd hwnnw i'r agwedd iaith yn y cwricwlwm. Mae angen inni ystyried sgiliau iaith. Mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 wedi cytuno fod angen edrych ar sgiliau iaith a'r modd y dysgir hwy. Nid oes diben inni edrych ar y modd y dysgir sgiliau iaith os na ddiwygiwn y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol pan fydd gennym awgrymiadau ar sut i'w wella. Mae'r gwelliant yn amlinellu'r angen am ffordd i adolygu'r cwricwlwm a'i ddiwygio heb gael newid o hyd. Rhaid wrth sefydlogrwydd, ond ar yr un pryd, rhaid inni fod yn ymatebol. Fel arall nid ydym yn rhoi chwarae teg i bobl ifanc Cymru.

**Gareth Jones:** I welcome the fact that we can refer the discussion to food and nutrition and to the study of a foreign language—a second or third language in Wales, depending on how you look at it—although these were the subject of the amendments that were ruled out of order. I am glad that we have had the opportunity to air that for several reasons.

Amendment 1 stands, and I would like to make reference to it briefly. Amendment 1 is important because it concerns the two things to which we have made reference. The wording of this amendment is important.

'y dylai'r cynigion hyn gael eu hailystyried yn y dyfodol gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, wrth i anghenion addysgol newid.'

'these proposals should be reconsidered in future by the National Assembly for Wales in accordance with changing educational needs.'

Yr wyf yn falch ei fod yn sefyll a bod cyfle i ni bleidleisio arno. Gofynnaf am gefnogaeth yr Aelodau ar hyn.

I am pleased that that stands and that we have an opportunity to vote on it. I ask for the Members' support on this.

Yr ydym eisoes wedi sôn am waith da ein hathrawon yn ein hysgolion. Mae cael sefydlogrwydd yn ein hysgolion yn holl bwysig. Maent wedi wynebu cymaint o newidiadau ac maent yn dal i wynebu newidiadau. Mae'n bwysig eu bod yn edrych ar y sefyllfa newydd a pharatoi'r cwricwlwm newydd ar gyfer mis Medi 2000. Cânt y cyfle, gobeithio, i baratoi cynlluniau gwaith ar gyfer Cwricwlwm 2000 a chael digon o gyfle i ymdopi â'r gofynion newydd. Fel y gwyddom, mae unrhyw adolygiad yn gostus iawn yn ariannol ac o ran amser proffesiynol.

We have already mentioned the good work of our teachers in our schools. It is important that we have stability in our schools. They have faced so many changes and still face changes. It is important that they look at the new situation and prepare the new curriculum for September 2000. They will hopefully have the opportunity to prepare schemes of work for Curriculum 2000 and have plenty of opportunity to get to grips with the new requirements. As we know, any review is financially costly and costly as regards professional time.

Wrth gyflwyno'r gwelliant hwn nid ydym yn gofyn am adolygiad llawn a buan. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau y bydd y Cynulliad, trwy'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 ac mewn ymgynghoriad ag ACCAC, yn dilyn y datblygiadau a fydd yn digwydd o'n cwmpas fel bo modd inni ymateb i'r datblygiadau ac addasu'r cwricwlwm yn ôl y galw. Er enghraifft, nid ydym yn gwybod eto sut y bydd datblygiadau ETAG ôl-16 yn dylanwadu ar y ddarpariaeth cyn-16.

In tabling this amendment we are not looking for a full and prompt review. We are attempting to ensure that the Assembly, through the Pre-16 Education Committee and in consultation with ACCAC, will follow the developments that will be happening around us so that we can respond to the developments and adapt the curriculum as the need arises. For example, we do not know at present how ETAG's post-16 recommendations will influence under-16 provision.

Mae anghenion addysg yn newid yn gyson. Nid ydym yn ddall i hynny. Nid newidiadau mawr yw'r amcan yma. Mae newidiadau mawr eisoes wedi digwydd. Nid ydym yn gofyn am ddim ar y raddfa honno. Mae'n rhesymol y bydd angen monitro llwyddiant ac effeithiolrwydd y cwricwlwm a gweld pa mor berthnasol ydyw i'n disgyblion. Bydd yn rhaid i'r cwricwlwm newydd fod yn un byw a hyblyg. Rhaid iddo fod yn ymatebol ac yn un y medrir ei addasu, nid yn ôl mympwy ond yn ôl gofyn a barn broffesiynol. Mae'r allwedd i'r newidiadau hyn i'w chael yn yr elfennau trawsgwricwlaidd.

Education needs change constantly. We are not blind to that fact. The aim is not to secure major changes. Major changes have already been made. We are not asking for anything on that scale. It stands to reason that we will need to monitor the success and effectiveness of the curriculum and see how relevant it is to our pupils. This new curriculum will have to be a living and flexible one. It must be responsive and adaptable, not arbitrarily but according to need and professional judgement. The key to these changes lies in the cross-curricular elements.

Eisoes buom yn siarad am gyfle cyfartal a hawliau grwpiau ethnig lleiafrifol. Os nad yw hynny yn y cwricwlwm ar hyn o bryd bydd

We have already spoken about equality of opportunity and the rights of ethnic minority groups. If that is not in the curriculum at

rhaid ei wau i mewn rhywsut trwy'r elfennau trawsgwricwlaidd. Dyna'r unig ffordd i'w wneud. Ni fedrwn roi'r cyfrifoldeb am hyn ar ysgwyddau un neu ddau o bobl. Rhaid iddo gael ei wau trwy ethos yr ysgol fel bod pawb yn deall ei gilydd a'u hanghenion.

present we must weave it in somehow through cross-curricular elements. That is the only way to do it. We cannot place the responsibility for this on the shoulders of one or two people. It must be weaved through the ethos of the school so that everyone understands one another and their requirements.

4:37 p.m.

Nid wyf yn rhagweld newidiadau yn y pynciau oni bai bod achos anghyffredin dros hynny. Gwnaethpwyd achos cryf ynghylch dysgu technoleg bwyd, ond mae'n rhaid bod yn agored i drafodaeth. Mae'r amser pan oedd cwricwlwm yn parhau am hanner canrif neu fwy wedi hen ddiplannu. Yn yr ysbryd o barodrwydd i addasu i newidiadau mewn anghenion addysgol y cyflwynaf y gwelliant hwn, a gofynnaf ichi ei gefnogi.

I do not anticipate changes in the subjects unless some unusual circumstances arise. A strong case has been made as regards teaching food technology, but we must be open to discussion. The time when a curriculum would last for half a century or more has long since disappeared. It is in the spirit of willingness to adapt to changing educational needs that I propose this amendment, and I ask you to support it.

**Rosemary Butler:** In my opening remarks, I said that I would support this amendment. We must continue to look at the curriculum, but it is vital that we do not change it every few months. Estyn will report on the standards and the way in which the curriculum is implemented to the Committee, which will have regular reports from ACCAC. It will be kept under continual review, as it would be unfair to teachers if we were to undertake a sudden review. However, I support that amendment.

**Rosemary Butler:** Yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, dywedais y byddem yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwn. Rhaid inni barhau i edrych ar y cwricwlwm, ond mae'n hanfodol nad ydym yn ei newid bob mis neu ddau. Bydd Estyn yn rhoi adroddiadau ar y safonau a'r ffordd y mae'r cwricwlwm yn cael ei weithredu i'r Pwyllgor, a fydd yn derbyn adroddiadau rheolaidd gan ACCAC. Bydd adolygu parhaus ar y broses, gan y byddai'n annheg i athrawon pe cynhelid adolygiad sydyn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwn.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison

Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Michael, Alun  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment adopted.*

Amended motion:

*that the Assembly*

*(a) having considered the two reports of the Legislation Committee relating to the draft Orders 'The Education (National Curriculum) (Attainment Targets and Programmes of Study in English, Mathematics, Physical Education, Science, Welsh, Modern Foreign Languages, Art, Geography, History, Technology, Music) (Wales) Order 2000', laid in the Table Office on 15 December 1999; and*

*(b) having considered the draft Orders and the associated documents—the programmes of study and attainment targets (copies of which are available on the National Assembly for Wales website at home page/policy and information/education/national curriculum review);*

*(c) approves the making of the Orders in accordance with the drafts laid in the Table Office on 6 December 1999; and*

*(d) resolves that these proposals should be reconsidered in the future by the National Assembly for Wales in accordance with*

Y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*fod y Cynulliad*

*(a) yn dilyn ystyried y ddau adroddiad gan y Pwyllgor Deddfau yn ymwneud â'r Gorchymynion drafft 'Y Gorchymyn Addysg (Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol) (Targedau Cyrhaeddiad a Rhaglenni Astudio mewn Saesneg, Mathemateg, Addysg Gorfforol, Gwyddoniaeth, Cymraeg, Ieithoedd Tramor Modern, Celf, Daearyddiaeth, Hanes, Technoleg, Cerdd) (Cymru) 2000', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Rhagfyr 1999; a*

*(b) wedi ystyried y Gorchymynion drafft a'r dogfennau cysylltiedig—y rhaglenni astudio a'r targedau cyrhaeddiad (mae copïau ar gael ar wefan Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru o dan hafan/polisi a gwybodaeth/addysg/adolygiad o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol);*

*(c) yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymynion yn unol â'r drafftiau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Rhagfyr 1999; a*

*(d) yn penderfynu y dylai'r cynigion hyn gael eu hailystyried yn y dyfodol gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, wrth i anghenion*

*changing educational needs.*

*addysgol newid.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 38, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 38, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Michael, Alun  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
German, Michael  
Humphreys, Christine  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion adopted.*

**Y Llywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw. Diolch yn fawr am eich amynedd, yn enwedig wrth inni fynd trwy'r broses gymhleth o gymeradwyo deddfwriaeth eilaidd.

**The Presiding Officer:** That is the end of today's Plenary. Thank you for your forbearance, particularly as we went through the complicated process of approving secondary legislation.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4:41 p.m.  
The session ended at 4:41 p.m.*