



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mercher 18 Rhagfyr 2002**

**Wednesday 18 December 2002**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 4 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd  
*Questions to the Minister for Economic Development*
- 14 Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid  
*Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister*
- 24 Cwestiwn Brys  
*Urgent Question*
- 31 Cynnig Trefniadol  
*Procedural Motion*
- 37 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*
- 38 Datganiad ar Gyflenwad o Dywod a Graean yn Ne-ddwyrain Cymru  
*Statement on Sand and Gravel Supply in South-east Wales*
- 52 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*
- 55 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Diwygio'r Drefn Brydlesol (Hysbysiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002 a Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau'r Ddeddf Diwygio Deiliadaeth ar y Cyd a Lesddaliad 2002  
*Approval of the Leasehold Reform (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002 and Delegation of Functions of the Commonhold and Leasehold Reform Act 2002*
- 62 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Rhestri Ardrethu (Dyddiad Prisio) (Cymru) 2002  
*Approval of the Rating Lists (Valuation Date) (Wales) Order 2002*
- 65 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Fferyllol) a (Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002  
*Approval of the National Health Service (Pharmaceutical Services) and (General Medical Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002*
- 70 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Organebau a Addaswyd yn Enetig (Eu Gollwng yn Fwriadol) (Cymru) 2002  
*Approval of the Genetically Modified Organisms (Deliberate Release)(Wales) Regulations 2002*
- 85 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Deddf Digartrefedd 2002  
*Delegation of the Functions of the Homelessness Act 2002*
- 87 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ a Chymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 36  
*Delegation of Functions to the House Committee and Approval of Changes to Standing Order No. 36*
- 100 Dadl Fer: Clefyd Niwronau Motor: Darparu Gwasanaethau  
*Short Debate: Motor Neurone Disease: Providing Services*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd Questions to the Minister for Economic Development**

### **Diweithdra yn Sir Gaerfyrddin Unemployment in Carmarthenshire**

**C1 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddiweithdra yn Sir Gaerfyrddin? (OAQ21303)

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** The current unemployment rate in Carmarthenshire is 4.1 per cent. It has fallen by 0.3 per cent over the last year. Overall unemployment in Wales is at its lowest level since the mid 1970s.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** When you consider real unemployment figures, including those on people claiming sickness-related benefit, the number of claimants in Carmarthenshire has increased fivefold from 2,785 to 13,700. In your masterful appearance on Radio Wales the other morning, you argued that unemployment was beneficial to economic development. I cannot follow that argument, although I can think of one case of unemployment that would benefit Wales's economic development. How are the increased figures in Carmarthenshire beneficial to its economy?

**Andrew Davies:** As I said, the official unemployment rate is lower than for a generation. However, levels of economic inactivity remain unacceptably high. I have said that in Plenary and in the Economic Development Committee. It is a fundamental problem, particularly in many of our rural areas and in some of the former coal mining areas in the south Wales Valleys, where levels of economic inactivity, long-term sickness and disability are high. That is a result of the massive economic restructuring that we have seen over the last 20 to 30 years with the decline of traditional industries. I am delighted to say that the economic inactivity rates in Wales dropped last year by 28,000 people, which was more than in the rest of the UK. We are not being complacent—there

**Q1 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on unemployment in Carmarthenshire? (OAQ21303)

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Pedwar pwynt un y cant yw'r gyfradd ddiweithdra yn Sir Gaerfyrddin ar hyn o bryd. Mae wedi gostwng 0.3 y cant yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Mae diweithdra cyffredinol yng Nghymru ar ei lefel isaf ers canol y 1970au.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pan ystyriwch ffigurau diweithdra gwirioneddol, gan gynnwys y rhai ar bobl sy'n hawlio budd-dal yn gysylltiedig â salwch, cynyddodd nifer yr hawlwr yn Sir Gaerfyrddin bum gwaith o 2,785 i 13,700. Yn eich cyfraniad meistrolgar ar Radio Wales y bore o'r blaen, dadleuasoch fod diweithdra o fudd i ddatblygiad economaidd. Ni allaf ddilyn y ddatl honno, er y gallaf feddwl am un achos o ddiweithdra a fyddai o fudd i ddatblygiad economaidd Cymru. Sut mae'r ffigurau cynyddol yn Sir Gaerfyrddin o fudd i'w heconomi?

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais, mae'r gyfradd ddiweithdra yn is nag y bu ers cenhedlaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae lefelau o anweithgarwch economaidd yn parhau yn annerbiniol o uchel. Dywedais hynny yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ac yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Mae'n broblem sylfaenol, yn arbennig mewn llawer o'n hardaloedd gwledig ac yn rhai o'r hen ardaloedd glofaol yng Nghymoedd y De, lle mae lefelau o anweithgarwch economaidd, salwch hirdymor ac anabled yn uchel. Mae hynny o ganlyniad i'r ailstrwythuro economaidd anferth a welsom yn ystod yr 20 neu 30 mlynedd diwethaf yn dilyn dirywiad y diwydiannau traddodiadol. Yr wyf yn hynod falch o ddweud fod cyfraddau anweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghymru wedi gostwng o

is a challenge, but our policies are addressing it.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** As you admitted, there is a serious situation in Carmarthenshire, and it is probably even more serious in Pembrokeshire. Will you consider the possibility of using a taskforce, similar to the taskforces addressing the job losses in south-east Wales, to deal with the serious job situation in Carmarthenshire and Pembrokeshire?

**Andrew Davies:** Those bodies exist. Following some of the job losses in west Wales, officials have been working with local authorities in particular, and with the Welsh Development Agency in south-west Wales, to consider regeneration proposals for the Swansea bay region, Carmarthenshire, and particularly for Fishguard and Cardigan, in response to the Dewhurst job losses. I recently met the local authority and WDA representatives in Cardigan, who presented me with a regeneration package for south Ceredigion, which I am now considering. I am also asking for similar proposals for the north Pembrokeshire area, and, as colleagues may be aware, Carmarthenshire County Council compiled an imaginative package of regeneration for Carmarthen. A great deal is being done. In many cases, it is not in the public domain yet, but I hope to make announcements in the new year.

28,000 o bobl y llynedd, a oedd yn fwy na gweddill y DU. Nid bod yn hunanfodlon yr ydym—mae her, ond mae ein polisiau yn mynd i'r afael â hi.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Fel y gwnaethoch gyfaddef, mae'r sefyllfa'n ddifrifol yn Sir Gaerfyrddin, ac mae'n debyg ei bod yn waeth yn Sir Benfro. A wnewch chi ystyried y posibilrwydd o ddefnyddio tasglu, fel y tasgluoedd sy'n ymdrin â cholledion swyddi yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, er mwyn ymdrin â'r sefyllfa waith ddifrifol yn Sir Gaerfyrddin a Sir Benfro?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r cyrff hynny'n bodoli. Yn dilyn rhai o'r colledion swyddi yn y Gorllewin, bu swyddogion yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol yn arbennig, a chydag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn ne-orllewin Cymru, er mwyn ystyried cynigion adfywio ar gyfer ardal bae Abertawe, Sir Gaerfyrddin, ac yn arbennig ar gyfer Abergwaun ac Aberteifi, mewn ymateb i'r swyddi a gollwyd yn Dewhurst. Cyfarfûm yn ddiweddar â'r awdurdod lleol a chynrychiolwyr y WDA yn Aberteifi, a gyflwynodd becyn adfywio imi ar gyfer de Ceredigion, yr wyf yn ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd. Gofynnaf hefyd am gynigion tebyg ar gyfer ardal gogledd Sir Benfro, ac, fel y bydd fy nghyd-Aelodau yn ymwybodol, lluniodd Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin becyn adfywio llawn dychymyg ar gyfer Caerfyrddin. Mae llawer iawn yn cael ei wneud. Mewn llawer o achosion, nid yw'n wybodaeth gyhoeddus eto, ond gobeithiaf wneud cyhoeddiadau yn y flwyddyn newydd.

### Swyddi sydd wedi'u Colli yn Nghanol De Cymru Job Losses in South Wales Central

**Q2 Owen John Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on job losses in the South Wales Central region during the past year? (OAQ21261)

**Andrew Davies:** While job losses have occurred in some businesses, South Wales Central has seen a stable claimant count unemployment rate of around 3.4 per cent, and significant employment gains of 22,000, compared with this time last year.

**C2 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y swyddi sydd wedi'u colli yn ardal Canol De Cymru yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf? (OAQ21261)

**Andrew Davies:** Er y collwyd swyddi mewn rhai busnesau, gwelodd Canol De Cymru gyfradd ddiweithdra sefydlog o ran nifer yr hawlwyd o tua 3.4 y cant, a chynnydd sylweddol mewn cyflogaeth o 22,000, o gymharu â'r adeg hwn y llynedd.

**Owen John Thomas:** Since his last meeting with the ex-employees of Allied Steel and Wire, what steps has the Minister taken to persuade the Celsa steelmaking company of the advantages of restarting steel production at the Cardiff works and of re-employing the former workforce?

**Andrew Davies:** The First Minister and I have spoken to Celsa's senior executives and have welcomed their indications of interests in the former ASW site. We have been working with the trade unions, and I spoke to the head of the steelworkers' union, the Iron and Steel Trades Confederation the other day about reopening the site. The unions are quietly optimistic—as are we—that steel production will recommence in the new year, and Team Wales is ready to respond to the needs of Celsa and the unions when they restart production. At this stage, we are still waiting for that decision by Celsa.

**Peter Law:** Following the sad closure of the Corus works in Ebbw Vale, this week we heard the unfortunate news about the net reduction of 57 jobs at one of our flagship companies, Yuasa Battery, which is based in Rassau Industrial Estate in Ebbw Vale. Will you and your officials liaise supportively with the company and trade unions to do all that you can to help at this difficult time?

**Andrew Davies:** You raised that issue with me the other day, and I have taken it up with officials. I have asked them and the Welsh Development Agency to respond to the situation in your constituency. Members have often raised issues about job losses or development in their constituency and, as the Presiding Officer knows, I am more than happy to discuss with Members issues that affect their constituents. In this case, that work has already been instigated.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** In view of the hammer blow of job losses that have been suffered in South Wales Central and elsewhere in Wales, will you recognise that the rosy economic picture that you paint is a far cry from the experience of

**Owen John Thomas:** Ers ei gyfarfod diwethaf â chyn-weithwyr Allied Steel and Wire, pa gamau a gymerodd y Gweinidog i ddarbwylllo cwmni gweithgynhyrchu dur Celsa o'r manteision o ailgychwyn cynhyrchu dur yng ngwaith Caerdydd a'r manteision o ailgyflogi'r gweithlu blaenorol?

**Andrew Davies:** Siaradodd y Prif Weinidog a minnau ag uwch swyddogion gweithredol Celsa ac yr ydym wedi croesawu y diddordeb y maent wedi ei ddangos yn hen safle ASW. Buom yn gweithio â'r undebau llafur, a siaredais â phennaeth undeb y gweithwyr dur, y Cydffederasiwn y Crefftiau Haearn a Dur y diwrnod o'r blaen ynghylch ailagor y safle. Mae'r undebau yn dawel hyderus—fel yr ydym ni—y bydd cynhyrchu dur yn ailgychwyn yn y flwyddyn newydd, ac mae Tîm Cymru yn barod i ymateb i anghenion Celsa a'r undebau pan fyddant yn aildechrau cynhyrchu. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn parhau i aros am y penderfyniad hwnnw gan Celsa.

**Peter Law:** Yn dilyn y sefyllfa drist o gau gwaith Corus yng Nglynebwy, clywsom y newyddion anffodus yr wythnos hon y bydd un o'n cwmnïau mwyaf blaenllaw, Yuasa Battery, a leolir yn Ystad Ddiwydiannol Rassau yng Nglynebwy, yn cael gwared ar 57 o swyddi. A wnewch chi a'ch swyddogion gyd-drafod yn gefnogol â'r cwmni a'r undebau llafur i wneud popeth o fewn eich gallu i helpu ar yr adeg anodd hwn?

**Andrew Davies:** Gwnaethoch godi'r mater hwnnw gyda mi y diwrnod o'r blaen, a thrafodais ef â swyddogion. Gofynnais iddynt hwy ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru i ymateb i'r sefyllfa yn eich etholaeth. Mae Aelodau yn aml wedi codi materion ynghylch colledion swyddi neu ddatblygu yn eu hetholaeth ac, fel y gŵyr y Llywydd, yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i drafod materion gydag Aelodau sy'n effeithio ar eu hetholwyr. Yn yr achos hwn, cychwynnwyd ar y gwaith hwnnw eisoes.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** O ystyried yr ergyd drom o golli swyddi a ddioddefwyd yn Nghanol De Cymru a rhannau eraill o Gymru, a wnewch chi gydnabod fod y darlun economaidd teg a gyflwynwch yn dra gwahanol i brofiad pobl

ordinary people in Wales? In response to the reply that you gave to Rhodri Glyn Thomas, is it not true that economic inactivity in Wales has risen by 5 per cent since you came to office in 1999, and that that is double the UK figure? Does that not put into perspective the problems that people throughout Wales face? Is it not true that the First Minister is travelling around Wales saying that 33,000 new jobs have been created? How do you explain that today's statistics show that that figure has dropped to 25,000? Where have those 8,000 jobs gone in the past month?

**Andrew Davies:** I know that the leader of Plaid Cymru will not accept the good news on employment. Unemployment is at record low levels—it is at its lowest level for a generation. That is a massive achievement, given the fundamental problems that the world economy has encountered over the last 18 months; it has experienced a downturn that has been recognised as probably the worst for 25 years or more. Many thousands of jobs have been created and 28,000 people have left the status of economic inactivity at a time when the world economy has gone through extremely difficult times—those difficulties are reflected in the 30,000 job losses in the manufacturing industry in Wales last year. However, 25,000 jobs were created, which is a commendable achievement, given the difficulties in world trading conditions. Jobs are created and lost in any dynamic economy. I am not being complacent; I do not wish people to lose their jobs, but in any modern economy there is churn, and that is what the Welsh economy is currently experiencing.

gyffredin Cymru? Mewn ymateb i'r ateb a roddasoch i Rhodri Glyn Thomas, onid yw'n wir i anweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghymru gynyddu 5 y cant ers i chi ddod i rym yn 1999, a bod hynny ddwywaith gymaint â ffigur y DU? Onid yw hynny yn rhoi'r problemau y mae pobl ledled Cymru yn eu hwynebu yn eu cyd-destun? Onid yw'n wir bod y Prif Weinidog yn teithio o amgylch Cymru yn dweud bod 33,000 o swyddi newydd wedi eu creu? Sut yr eglurwch y ffaith y dengys ystadegau heddiw fod y ffigur hwnnw wedi gostwng i 25,000? I ble mae'r 8,000 o swyddi hynny wedi mynd yn ystod y mis diwethaf?

**Andrew Davies:** Gwn na fydd arweinydd Plaid Cymru yn derbyn y newyddion da am gyflogaeth. Mae diweithdra yn is nag y bu erioed—yr isaf ers cenhedlaeth. Mae hynny'n gamp anferthol, o ystyried y problemau sylfaenol a wynebodd yr economi fyd-eang yn ystod y 18 mis diwethaf; gwelodd ddirywiad a gydnabyddir fel y gwaethaf mae'n debyg ers 25 mlynedd neu fwy. Crewyd miloedd lawer o swyddi ac mae 28,000 o bobl wedi peidio a bod yn anweithgar yn economaidd ar adeg pan mae'r economi fyd-eang wedi mynd trwy gyfnod hynod o anodd—adlewyrchir yr anawsterau hynny yn y 30,000 o swyddi a gollwyd yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru y llynedd. Fodd bynnag, crewyd 25,000 o swyddi, sy'n gamp ganmoladwy, o gofio'r anawsterau yn yr amodau masnachu byd-eang. Creir a cholli swyddi mewn unrhyw economi ddeinamig. Nid wyf yn bod yn hunanfodlon; nid wyf am i bobl gollu eu swyddi, ond mae tro mewn unrhyw economi fodern, a dyna'r hyn y mae economi Cymru yn ei brofi ar hyn o bryd.

### Ymchwil Sector Preifat y DU UK Private Sector Research

**Q3 Phil Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on the proportion of UK private sector research carried out in Wales? (OAQ21301)

**Andrew Davies:** In 2001, Wales's share of UK business research and development spending stood at 1.1 per cent. My innovation action plan, 'Wales for Innovation', will bring together existing effective programmes

**C3 Phil Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar faint o ymchwil sector preifat y DU a wneir yng Nghymru? (OAQ21301)

**Andrew Davies:** Yn 2001, cyfran Cymru o wariant y DU ar ymchwil a datblygu busnes oedd 1.1 y cant. Bydd fy nghynllun gweithredu arloesedd, 'Cymru o Blaid Arloesi', yn cyfuno rhaglenni effeithiol sy'n

for research and development. It heralds a stronger technology and research and development drive to help develop more businesses with high growth potential and increase the long-term trend in business research and development in Wales.

**Phil Williams:** Even if we include Government-funded research and development, that would not alter the fact that the proportion of UK research in Wales is below 2 per cent and has fallen over the past few years. How do you reconcile that with the declared Government strategy, stated in 'BetterWales.com', that the Government expects that by March 2003, the percentage of UK research and development spending in Wales will have doubled? You have clearly not met that target, but do you accept that by failing even to move in the right direction, the basic requirement for a knowledge-driven economy as outlined in 'A Winning Wales' has not been met?

**Andrew Davies:** I openly accept that both the absolute level and the proportion of funding for research and development is not sufficient. One of the targets in 'A Winning Wales' is to increase that level. I have never said that what we are doing is acceptable—in fact, we plan to raise the level. When the figures for 2001 are compared with those for 1999, there is a drop from 1.8 per cent to 1.1 per cent. However, if you take another year, 1995, you could say that there has been a 0.1 per cent increase in research and development. It depends which year you use. The level of expenditure on research and development fluctuated between 1 per cent and 1.8 per cent between 1993 and 2001. In fact, 1999 was a year of exceptionally high levels of funding, affected by one project that distorted the overall figures. Having said that, we are not complacent, and that is why I brought forward our innovation action plan, 'Wales for Innovation', to increase the amount spent on research and development by the Government, the WDA and by the private sector. We are looking to enhance it wherever we can, and I believe that the 2 per cent target is achievable.

bodoli eisoes ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu. Mae'n rhagflaenu ymgyrch dechnoleg ac ymchwil a datblygu gryfach i helpu i ddatblygu rhagor o fusnesau sydd â photensial mawr o ran twf a chynyddu'r duedd hirdymor o ran ymchwil a datblygu busnes yng Nghymru.

**Phil Williams:** Hyd yn oed os ydym yn cynnwys ymchwil a datblygu a ariennir gan y Llywodraeth, ni fyddai hynny'n newid y ffaith bod cyfran ymchwil y DU yng Nghymru yn llai na 2 y cant ac mae wedi gostwng yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Sut yr ydych yn cysoni hynny â strategaeth ddatganedig y Llywodraeth, a nodwyd yn 'GwellCymru.com', bod y Llywodraeth yn disgwyl y bydd cyfran gwariant y DU ar ymchwil a datblygu yng Nghymru wedi dyblu erbyn mis Mawrth 2003? Mae'n amlwg nad ydych wedi cyrraedd y targed hwnnw, ond a dderbyniwch, wrth fethu â symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir hyd yn oed, nad ydych wedi cyflawni'r gofyniad sylfaenol ar gyfer economi a arweinir gan wybodaeth fel yr amlinellir yn 'Cymru'n Ennill'?

**Andrew Davies:** Derbyniaf yn agored nad yw'r lefel absoliwt na chyfran yr arian ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu yn ddigonol. Un o'r targedau yn 'Cymru'n Ennill' yw cynyddu'r lefel honno. Ni ddywedais erioed fod yr hyn a wnawn yn dderbyniol—yn wir, bwriadwn godi'r lefel. Pan gymherir y ffigurau ar gyfer 2001 gyda'r rhai ar gyfer 1999, ceir gostyngiad o 1.8 y cant i 1.1 y cant. Fodd bynnag, pe baech yn defnyddio ffigurau blwyddyn arall, 1995, gallech ddweud y bu cynnydd o 0.1 y cant o ran ymchwil a datblygu. Mae'n dibynnu pa flwyddyn a ddefnyddiwyd. Amrywiodd lefel y gwariant ar ymchwil a datblygu rhwng 1 y cant a 1.8 y cant rhwng 1993 a 2001. Yn wir, yr oedd 1999 yn flwyddyn lle y gwelwyd lefelau ariannu hynod o uchel, o ganlyniad i un prosiect a ystumiodd y ffigurau cyffredinol. Wedi dweud hynny, nid ydym yn hunanfodlon, a dyna pam ein bod wedi cyflwyno ein cynllun gweithredu arloesedd, 'Cymru o Blaid Arloesi', er mwyn cynyddu'r swm a gaiff ei wario ar ddatblygu ac ymchwil gan y Llywodraeth, y WDA a'r sector preifat. Yr ydym yn ceisio ei wella lle bynnag y gallwn, a chredaf y gellir cyflawni'r targed o 2 y cant.



2:10 p.m.

**Mick Bates:** Today is a great day because we have heard about the large, renewable energy power station that will be built near Neath, in the Dulais valley. We are aware that large companies can afford extensive programmes of research and development. However, is the Minister aware that much research and development is undertaken by small companies, often by those with one or two employees? Is there any way that you could offer more help, through your innovation plan, to these small companies that undertake a massive amount of research, out of their own profits?

**Andrew Davies:** You are right, Mick, a huge amount of research and development is carried out by companies large and small, and much of it is not registered for official statistical purposes. One aim of 'Wales for Innovation' is to try to get more reliable statistics on the amount of research and development that is undertaken. Most companies in Wales are small and medium-sized enterprises—98 per cent of companies in Wales have fewer than 250 employees. We are looking to get more reliable statistics and to see what we can do to help companies become more innovative. We are marketing and promoting the research and development tax credit. We are starting from a low base and there is a long way to go, but we are using every avenue open to us to increase the amount of research and development that is conducted by companies in Wales.

**Mick Bates:** Mae heddiw yn ddiwrnod gwych ohewydd clywsom am yr orsaf ynni adnewyddadwy fawr a adeiledir ger Castell-nedd, yng nghwm Dulais. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol y gall cwmnïau mawr fforddio rhaglenni ymchwil a datblygu helaeth. Fodd bynnag, a yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol y caiff llawer o waith ymchwil a datblygu ei gynnal gan gwmnïau bach, yn aml gan y rhai sydd ag un neu ddau o weithwyr? A oes unrhyw ffordd y gallwch gynnig mwy o gymorth, drwy gyfrwng eich cynllun arloesedd, i'r cwmnïau bach hyn sy'n cynnal swm anferth o waith ymchwil, allan o'u helw eu hunain?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydych yn gywir, Mick, i ddweud y gwneir llawer o waith ymchwil a datblygu gan gwmnïau bach a mawr, ac ni gofrestrir llawer ohono at ddibenion ystadegol swyddogol. Un o nodau 'Cymru o Blaid Arloesi' yw ceisio cael ystadegau mwy dibynadwy ar faint o waith ymchwil a datblygu a wneir. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o gwmnïau yng Nghymru yn fach a chanolig eu maint—mae gan 98 y cant o gwmnïau yng Nghymru lai na 250 o weithwyr. Yr ydym yn ceisio cael ystadegau mwy dibynadwy er mwyn gweld beth y gallwn ei wneud i helpu cwmnïau i fod yn fwy arloesol. Yr ydym yn marchnata a hybu'r credyd treth ymchwil a datblygu. Yr ydym yn cychwyn o sail isel ac mae ffordd bell i fynd, ond yr ydym yn defnyddio pob llwybr sy'n agored inni i gynyddu faint o waith ymchwil a datblygu a wneir gan gwmnïau yng Nghymru.

### **Rhagolygon ar gyfer Economi Cymru Predictions for the Welsh Economy**

**Q4 Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister make a statement on predictions for the Welsh economy in light of the Chancellor's pre-budget statement? (OAQ21322)

**Andrew Davies:** The Chancellor's pre-budget statement, as expected, revised the growth forecast of the UK economy downwards. This was in line with previous independent forecasts, which were taken into account when I presented my quarterly economic report to the Economic

**C4 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y rhagolygon ar gyfer economi Cymru yng ngoleuni datganiad rhag-gyllidebol y Canghellor? (OAQ21322)

**Andrew Davies:** Yn ôl y disgwyl, diwygiodd datganiad rhag-gyllidebol y Canghellor ragolwg twf economi y DU tuag i lawr. Yr oedd hyn yn unol â rhagolygon annibynnol blaenorol, a ystyriwyd pan gyflwynias fy adroddiad economaidd chwarterol i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd.

Development Committee.

**Nick Bourne:** The Chancellor accepted, as you said, that the growth forecast of the UK had to be reviewed, and he reduced it accordingly. In light of that review, the predictions in 'A Winning Wales'—variously described as aspirational, ambitious and incredible—are no longer achievable. Is it not time that you revisited that document? It leaves the Government open to ridicule—we would need double digit growth figures to narrow the gap in wealth in the way predicted in that document. That will not happen, unless you are seriously suggesting that we are on the verge of an economic miracle in Wales. I wish that were the case, but against the background of the job losses that we have discussed, we know that it is not so. Will you revisit 'A Winning Wales' and revise the growth figures downwards, so that we can consider what is achievable, instead of the wild hyperbole contained in that document?

**Andrew Davies:** Talking of wild hyperbole, that is what your supplementary is. 'A Winning Wales' is a 10-year strategy. The Assembly accepted it in Plenary a year ago, and the document was launched in the new year. To say that it is not working is a little premature. The Chancellor has revised downwards his estimates of gross domestic product growth for the UK as a whole. I accept that. However, while we work within that macro-economic framework, that does not mean that Wales could not do proportionately better than the rest of the UK. Consider the fall in unemployment, the reduction in economic inactivity, and the rise in average earnings—they rose 4.7 per cent in Wales last year, compared with a 4.6 per cent on average across the UK—if you are looking for hard economic evidence. That is against the background of difficult world trading conditions; the Welsh economy is doing remarkably well. I do not see any reason why that differential, in terms of performance, cannot be rolled out over the 10-year period.

**Nick Bourne:** Fel y dywedaso, derbyniodd y Canghellor fod angen adolygu rhagolwg twf y DU, ac fe'i gostyngodd yn unol â hynny. Yng ngoleuni'r adolygiad hwnnw, nid yw'r rhagfynegiadau yn 'Cymru'n Ennill'—a ddisgrifwyd yn amrywiol fel dyheadol, uchelgeisiol ac anghredadwy—yn gyflawnadwy mwyach. Onid yw'n bryd i chi ailedrych ar y ddogfen honno? Mae'n gwneud y Llywodraeth yn destun sbort—byddai angen inni ddyblu'r ffigurau twf er mwyn lleihau'r bwch mewn cyfoeth yn y modd a ragfynegwyd yn y ddogfen honno. Ni fydd hynny'n digwydd, oni bai eich bod yn awgrymu o ddifrif bod gwyrth economaidd ar fin digwydd yng Nghymru. Hoffwn pe bai hynny'n wir, ond yn erbyn y cefndir o golli swyddi a drafodwyd gennym, gwyddwn na fydd hyn yn digwydd. A wnewch chi ailedrych ar 'Cymru'n Ennill' a diwygio'r ffigurau twf tuag i lawr, er mwyn inni ystyried yr hyn y gallwn ei gyflawni, yn hytrach na'r ormodiaith wyllt a gynhwysir yn y ddogfen honno?

**Andrew Davies:** O siarad am ormodiaith wyllt, dyna yw eich cwestiwn atodol. Strategaeth 10 mlynedd yw 'Cymru'n Ennill'. Fe'i derbyniwyd gan y Cynulliad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn flwyddyn yn ôl, a lansiwyd y ddogfen yn y flwyddyn newydd. Mae ychydig yn rhy fuan i ddweud nad yw'n gweithio. Diwygiodd y Canghellor ei amcangyfrifon o dwf cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth ar gyfer y DU gyfan tuag i lawr. Derbyniaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, er ein bod yn gweithio o fewn y fframwaith macro-economaidd hwnnw, ni olyga hynny na all Cymru wneud yn well yn gyfrannol na gweddill y DU. Ystyriwch y cwmp mewn diweithdra, y gostyngiad mewn anweithgarwch economaidd, a'r cynnydd mewn enillion cyfartalog—gwelwyd cynnydd o 4.7 y cant yng Nghymru y llynedd, o gymharu â 4.6 y cant ar gyfartaledd ar draws y DU—os ydych yn chwilio am dystiolaeth economaidd gadarn. Mae hynny yn erbyn cefndir o amodau masnachu byd-eang anodd; mae economi Cymru yn gwneud yn rhyfeddol o dda. Ni welaf reswm pam na all y gwahaniaeth hwnnw, o ran perfformiad, gael ei gyflwyno dros gyfnod o 10 mlynedd.

**Kirsty Williams:** In his pre-budget statement the Chancellor acknowledged and recognised the problems faced by many companies due to the huge increases in insurance premiums. I recently wrote to you about Hippo Campo Ltd in my constituency, which is a well-regarded business, employing many people in Brecon and Radnorshire. Will you meet representatives of Hippo Campo Ltd and other frozen food suppliers that have similar problems with insurance premiums?

**Andrew Davies:** It is a huge problem on which I have answered questions in the Chamber and in the Economic Development Committee. Most Members have written to me on this issue because they have been approached by small companies like Hippo Campo Ltd. This massive problem is largely due to the market's reaction to events such as 11 September and last year's extreme weather conditions and the subsequent increases in premiums. I have made strong representations to Whitehall colleagues on this issue pointing out that Wales is disproportionately affected because of the number of small companies here. I am delighted that, partly because of the pressure that we brought to bear, the Government has announced a review. I circulated details of the terms of reference for that review to members of the Economic Development Committee last week. I am more than happy to meet with the company, with the proviso that I can only say that we will press its case with Whitehall colleagues. Either by meeting its representatives or in writing, I am more than happy to inform Hippo Campo Ltd of what we are doing. We still do not know whether this is a one-off hike in premiums or a longer-term rise. However, the rise in premiums for employee liability insurance is a massive problem and I am delighted with the UK Government's response.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn ei ddatganiad rhaggyllidebol cydnabu'r Canghellor y problemau a wynebir gan nifer o gwmnïau oherwydd y cynnydd anferth mewn premiymau yswiriant. Ysgrifennais atoch yn ddiweddar ynghylch Hippo Campo Ltd yn fy etholaeth i, busnes uchel ei barch, sy'n cyflogi nifer o bobl ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed. A wnewch chi gyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr Hippo Campo Ltd a chyflenwyr eraill bwyd wedi'i rewi sy'n cael problemau tebyg â phremiymau yswiriant?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae hon yn broblem anferth yr atebais gwestiynau arni yn y Siambr a'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Ysgrifennodd y rhan fwyaf o Aelodau ataf ynghylch y mater hwn oherwydd bod cwmnïau llai fel Hippo Campo Ltd wedi cysylltu â hwy. Achoswyd y broblem anferth hon yn bennaf gan ymateb y farchnad i ddigwyddiadau megis Medi 11 a thywydd eithafol y llynedd a'r cynnydd mewn premiymau o ganlyniad. Gwneuthum sylwadau cryf i'm cymheiriaid yn Whitehall gan dynnu sylw at y ffaith yr effeithir ar Gymru yn anghymesur oherwydd nifer y cwmnïau bach sydd yma. Yr wyf wrth fy modd, yn rhannol oherwydd y pwysau a roesom arni, fod y Llywodraeth wedi cyhoeddi adolygiad. Anfonais fanylion y cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer yr adolygiad hwnnw i aelodau y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i gyfarfod â'r cwmni, gyda'r amod na allaf ond dweud y byddwn yn dadlau o blaid yr achos gyda'n cymheiriaid yn Whitehall. Naill ai drwy gyfarfod â'i gynrychiolwyr neu'n ysgrifenedig, yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i hysbysu Hippo Campo Ltd o'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud. Ni wyddom o hyd ai cynnydd unwaith yn unig mewn premiymau ydyw neu godiad hirdymor. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynnydd mewn premiymau ar gyfer yswiriant atebolrwydd cyflogeion yn broblem anferth ac yr wyf yn hynod falch o ymateb Llywodraeth y DU.

### **Datblygiad Economaidd yng Nghanol De Cymru Economic Development in South Wales Central**

**Q5 David Melding:** How is the Minister promoting economic development in South Wales Central? (OAQ21273)

**C5 David Melding:** Sut mae'r Gweinidog yn hybu datblygiad economaidd yng Nghanol De Cymru? (OAQ21273)

**Andrew Davies:** Team Wales delivers a comprehensive package of advice and assistance to help support investment and job creation. Much of South Wales Central qualifies for maximum levels of assistance, and it benefits from Objective 1 and Communities First assistance. Since the Assembly's inception, grants of more than £70 million have been awarded to 170 companies in South Wales Central. These projects will create over 6,000 new jobs and safeguard more than 3,000. While there have been job losses in particular businesses, South Wales Central has seen a stable claimant-based unemployment rate of around 3.4 per cent, as I said earlier, and a significant employment gain of 22,000 compared to this time last year.

**David Melding:** Will you condemn British Airways' decision to remove its operations from Cardiff international airport? These operations amount to 46 flights a week and employ 70 staff. Do you agree that it was quite wrong for BA to pick on Leeds Bradford international airport, and Cardiff international airport specifically? It is a miserable response to devolution and BA's actions will bring it great disrepute in the future.

**Andrew Davies:** I regret BA's commercial decision to withdraw from Cardiff, but it follows earlier announcements of withdrawal from various other routes. It reduces passenger choice, particularly for business users. However, I am pleased by bmibaby's response. I have seen press reports that it may be interested in taking over some of BA's routes or destinations. I would not say that it reflected the general view of the air transport market. Low-cost carriers are doing extremely well, while larger operators such as BA and United Airlines in America experience difficulties. They are finding it difficult to compete with operators such as bmibaby, but I am reassured that Cardiff airport's long-term future is sound, which is why bmibaby located there. The number of flight destinations that it now provides is testimony to its faith in Cardiff international.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae Tîm Cymru yn darparu pecyn cynhwysfawr o gyngor a chymorth er mwyn cynorthwyo buddsoddiad a chreu swyddi. Mae llawer o Ganol De Cymru yn gymwys ar gyfer y lefelau uchaf o gymorth, ac mae'n elwa ar gymorth Amcan 1 a Chymunedau'n Gyntaf. Ers dyfodiad y Cynulliad, dyfarnwyd grantiau o fwy na £70 miliwn i 170 o gwmnïau yng Nghanol De Cymru. Bydd y prosiectau hyn yn creu dros 6,000 o swyddi newydd ac yn diogelu mwy na 3,000. Er y collwyd swyddi mewn busnesau arbennig, gwelodd Canol De Cymru gyfradd ddiweithdra sefydlog yn seiliedig ar hawl wyr o tua 3.4 y cant, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, a chynnydd sylweddol mewn cyflogaeth o 22,000 o gymharu â'r adeg hon y llynedd.

**David Melding:** A wnewch chi gondemnio penderfyniad British Airways i symud ei weithgareddau o faes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd? Mae'r gweithgareddau hyn gyfystyr â 46 o hediadau bob wythnos ac mae'n cyflogi 70 o staff. A gytunwch ei bod yn gwbl annheg i BA ddewis maes awyr rhyngwladol Leeds Bradford, a maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd yn benodol? Mae'n ymateb truenus i ddatganoli a bydd gweithredoedd BA yn dwyn anfri mawr arno yn y dyfodol.

**Andrew Davies:** Gresynaf benderfyniad masnachol BA i roi'r gorau i weithredu o Gaerdydd, ond mae'n dilyn cyhoeddiadau cynharach i dynnu'n ôl o lwybrau amrywiol eraill. Mae'n lleihau dewis i deithwyr, yn arbennig i deithwyr busnes. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yn dda gennyf glywed ymateb bmibaby. Gwelais adroddiadau yn y wasg y gallai fod â diddordeb mewn cymryd rhai o lwybrau neu gyrchfannau BA. Ni ddywedwn ei fod yn adlewyrchu barn gyffredinol y farchnad trafniadaeth awyr. Mae cludwyr costau isel yn gwneud yn hynod o dda, tra bod gweithredwyr mwy megis BA ac United Airlines yn America yn cael anawsterau. Maent yn ei chael yn anodd i gystadlu â gweithredwyr megis bmibaby, ond fe'm sicrhawyd bod dyfodol hirdymor maes awyr Caerdydd yn gadarn, a dyna pam y sefydlodd bmibaby yno. Mae nifer y gyrchfannau y mae'n darparu hediadau iddynt erbyn hyn yn brawf o'i ffydd ym maes awyr rhyngwladol

Caerdydd.

**Mentrau Bach a Chanolig eu Maint yng Nghymru**  
**Small and Medium-sized Enterprises in Wales**

**Q6 Val Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on aid to small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales? (OAQ21326)

**Andrew Davies:** Financial aid is available to SMEs in Wales through regional selective assistance and the Assembly investment grant. In addition, Finance Wales offers a suite of funds and management support programmes to assist SMEs that are unable to raise finance from commercial sources. Other enterprise support programmes, which are managed by the Welsh Development Agency and are complementary to regional selective grants and the Assembly investment grants, help SME's develop their potential and improve their competitiveness, as well as encouraging setting up new firms and enterprise generally.

2:20 p.m.

**Val Lloyd:** Using the internet is a way in which small traders can find new markets for their products. However, they are unable to set up the necessary merchandising accounts with banks because of the relatively low turnover involved. That forces them to use other companies' accounts for transactions. They must of course pay for that facility, which cuts their profits and makes the whole effort of trading electronically uneconomical. Will you address possible solutions to this problem?

**Andrew Davies:** We encourage as many companies as possible, in particular small companies, to seize the opportunities provided by electronic trading, or e-commerce. You are quite right to point out the advantages of this to businesses. That is why I was delighted that Opportunity Wales—funded by Objective 1 funding—was established; it aims to do precisely that in the Objective 1 areas. However, the issue of small companies not being able to access the

**C6 Val Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gymorth i fentrau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru? (OAQ21326)

**Andrew Davies:** Mae cymorth ariannol ar gael i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru drwy gyfrwng cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad. Yn ogystal, cynigia Cyllid Cymru gyfres o gronfeydd a rhaglenni cymorth rheoli i gynorthwyo busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint na allant godi cyllid o ffynonellau masnachol. Mae rhaglenni eraill sy'n darparu cymorth i fentrau, a reolir gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, ac sy'n ategu'r grantiau rhanbarthol dewisol a grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, yn cynorthwyo mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint i ddatblygu eu potensial a gwella eu gallu i gystadlu, yn ogystal ag annog y broses o sefydlu cwmnïau newydd a menter yn gyffredinol.

**Val Lloyd:** Mae defnyddio'r rhyngwrwd yn ffordd y gall masnachwyr bach ganfod marchnadoedd newydd ar gyfer eu cynnyrch. Fodd bynnag, ni allant sefydlu'r cyfrifon masnachu angenrheidiol gyda banciau oherwydd y trosiant cymharol isel dan sylw. Gorfoda hynny iddynt ddefnyddio cyfrifon cwmnïau eraill ar gyfer trafodion. Wrth gwrs rhaid iddynt dalu am y cyfleuster hwnnw, sy'n lleihau eu helw ac yn gwneud yr holl ymdrech o fasnachu'n electronig yn aneconomaidd. A wnewch chi ymdrin ag atebion posibl i'r broblem hon?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym yn annog cymaint o gwmnïau â phosibl, yn arbennig cwmnïau bach, i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd a ddarperir gan fasnachu electronig, neu e-fasnach. Yr ydych yn holl gywir i dynnu sylw at fanteision hyn i fusnesau. Dyna pam yr oeddwn yn hynod falch o weld Cyflle Cymru—a ariannwyd gan arian Amcan 1—yn cael ei sefydlu; ei nod yw gwneud hynny'n union yn yr ardaloedd Amcan 1. Fodd bynnag, ni chodwyd y mater nad yw

appropriate credit and financial handling facilities has been raised with me before: I will be taking it up with the financial services sector. As you may know, I am setting up a financial leaders services sector, such as the Welsh Electronics Forum and Aerospace Wales, in order to build links with sectors in those industries. I will take up these issues with them collectively as well as individually. If this is a bottleneck to companies trading electronically, we need to do whatever we can to remove it.

**William Graham:** Will you give details about the number of factory units, which have been made specifically available for small and medium-sized enterprises, that have been vacant for more than 12 months, the cost of maintaining those premises, and how that expenditure is accounted for within the provision of financial aid to Welsh enterprises?

**Andrew Davies:** I will provide you with the details of that in a written answer. I do not have those facts to hand. I will make that information available to you as soon as possible.

cwmnïau bach yn gallu cael mynediad i gyfleusterau credyd ac ymdriniaeth ariannol gyda mi o'r blaen: byddaf yn ei godi gyda'r sector gwasanaethau ariannol. Fel y gwyddoch efallai, yr wyf yn sefydlu sector arweinwyr gwasanaethau ariannol, megis Fforwm Electroneg Cymru ac Aerospace Wales, er mwyn datblygu cysylltiadau â'r sectorau yn y diwydiannau hynny. Byddaf yn codi'r materion hyn â hwy ar y cyd yn ogystal ag yn unigol. Os yw hyn yn creu anhawster i gwmnïau sy'n masnachu yn electronig, mae angen inni wneud cymaint ag y gallwn i'w ddileu.

**William Graham:** A wnewch roi manylion am nifer yr unedau ffatri, a ryddhawyd yn benodol ar gyfer mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint, a fu'n wag am fwy na 12 mis, y gost o gynnal a chadw yr adeiladau hynny, a sut y cyfrifir am y gwariant hwnnw o fewn y ddarpariaeth o gymorth ariannol i fentrau yng Nghymru?

**Andrew Davies:** Byddaf yn rhoi manylion am hynny ichi mewn ateb ysgrifenedig. Nid yw'r ffeithiau hynny wrth law gennyf. Byddaf yn rhyddhau'r wybodaeth honno ichi cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

## **Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister**

### **Portffolio Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Education and Lifelong Learning Portfolio**

**Q1 Janice Gregory:** How has the Minister's latest Assembly budget impacted on the finances available for the education and lifelong learning portfolio? (OAQ21282)

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** The education and lifelong learning portfolio will benefit from a 9.2 per cent increase in the financial year 2003-04 over 2002-03.

**Janice Gregory:** That is a welcome increase. Following your recent budget, the further education staff with whom I have spoken are delighted with the extra funding announced for FE pay for the next financial year. Will you ensure that this money will be ring-fenced so that it reaches the staff for whom it

**C1 Janice Gregory:** Sut mae cyllideb ddiweddaraf y Gweinidog wedi effeithio ar y cyllid sydd ar gael ar gyfer y portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes? (OAQ21282)

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Bydd y portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes yn elwa ar gynnydd o 9.2 y cant ym mlwyddyn ariannol 2003-04 o gymharu â 2002-03.

**Janice Gregory:** Mae hynny'n gynnydd i'w groesawu. Yn dilyn eich cyllideb ddiweddar, mae'r staff addysg bellach y siaradais â hwy wrth eu bodd â'r arian ychwanegol a gyhoeddwyd ar gyfer cyflogau addysg bellach ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. A wnewch chi sicrhau y caiff yr arian hwn ei

is intended? Will you also confirm that, in the longer term, the Government's intention is to bring FE lecturers' pay in Wales in line with the main pay scales of schoolteachers?

**Edwina Hart:** I have also been delighted by the comments I have received from those in the FE sector, and many Assembly Members have told me about the pleasure that FE sector staff have expressed to them. The aim of that extra £9 million is to secure a common pay scale with teachers by 2004, and it will be ring-fenced.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Despite that welcome increase in the budget, you will be aware that there are grave concerns about the funding of Education and Learning Wales and that there is a risk of a possible further 100 redundancies by the end of this financial year unless the situation is resolved. Given that there are already grave concerns about ELWa's capacity to deliver on the education and lifelong learning agenda—a situation which, as I am sure you would agree, would only be made worse by another 100 redundancies—can you tell us what representations you have received from the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning about ELWa's medium-term funding situation?

**Edwina Hart:** I am obviously aware of the situation with regard to ELWa and the rumours regarding the possibility of further redundancies. Many of these issues have been circulated in the public domain through the press. I have regular discussions with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning about all issues within her portfolio, and I am sure that ELWa will be part of further discussions in January when we will consider further budgetary issues.

glustnodi fel ei fod yn cyrraedd y staff hynny y bwriedir iddo eu cyrraedd? A wnewch chi hefyd gadarnhau mai bwriad y Llywodraeth, yn yr hirdymor, yw sicrhau bod cyflogau darlithwyr addysg bellach yng Nghymru yn unol â phrif raddfeydd cyflog athrawon ysgol?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf innau hefyd wrth fy modd â'r sylwadau a dderbyniais gan y rhai yn y sector addysg bellach, a dywedodd nifer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad wrthyf am y boddhad a fynegwyd wrthynt gan staff y sector addysg bellach. Nod y £9 miliwn ychwanegol hwnnw yw sicrhau graddfa gyflog gyffredin gydag athrawon erbyn 2004, a bydd yn cael ei glustnodi.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Er gwaethaf y cynnydd hwnnw yn y gyllideb sydd i'w groesawu, byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon dwys ynghylch ariannu Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru a bod posibilrwydd o 100 o ddiswyddiadau pellach erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon oni ddatrysir y sefyllfa. O gofio bod pryderon dwys eisoes ynghylch gallu ELWa i gyflawni'r agenda addysg a dysgu gydol oes—sefyllfa, yr wyf yn sicr y cytunwch, a fyddai'n cael ei gwaethgu pe bai 100 o swyddi eraill yn cael eu colli—a allwch ddweud wrthym pa sylwadau a dderbyniasoch gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ynghylch sefyllfa ariannu ELWa yn y tymor canolig?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn amlwg yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa mewn perthynas ag ELWa a'r sibrydion ynghylch diswyddiadau pellach posibl. Daeth nifer o'r materion hyn i sylw'r cyhoedd drwy'r wasg. Yr wyf yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ynghylch bob mater o fewn ei phortffolio, ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd ELWa yn rhan o drafodaethau pellach ym mis Ionawr pan fyddwn yn ystyried materion cyllidebol pellach.

### Grantiau Arbennig Special Grants

**Q2 Janet Ryder:** What effect does the announcement of special grants have on the overall annual budget? (OAQ21286)

**C2 Janet Ryder:** Pa effaith y mae'r cyhoeddiad am grantiau arbennig yn ei chael ar y gyllideb flynyddol gyffredinol? (OAQ21286)

**Edwina Hart:** Decisions to distribute resources by special grant schemes are made either as part of the annual budget planning round, or, where necessary, during the financial year. Funding for special grants is accommodated within the overall annual budget, except where there is a need to make additional funds available in-year. Decisions on funding allocations made outside the formal budget-setting process are made by the relevant spending Minister and me, on a case-by-case basis.

**Janet Ryder:** Most of those specific grants are paid to local government, and however well intentioned they are, they make a mockery of local control and priorities because, although the revenue settlement is £2,422 million, the money going to local government in specific grants brings the total to over £3,082 million. Councillors are becoming increasingly disillusioned, as local authorities are becoming nothing more than handling agents for central Government. After four years of Government, what have you done to increase the freedom of local authorities to set their own budgets?

**Edwina Hart:** You are correct, 90 per cent of Assembly support for local government is routed through the revenue support grant and the other 10 per cent is routed through the special grant system. The level of Assembly funding through specific grants to local authorities in Wales is substantially lower than that of England, and local government welcomes this. To give an example of changes I have made: £15 million of social services funding was previously paid by special grant, but will now be included in the settlement for 2003-04; and existing education and social services grants will be combined into overarching grants, where it is not suitable to roll them into the revenue support grant. As I have indicated, we will consider future requests for special grants on an individual basis, and, if possible, they will be short-term special grants, and will eventually be included in the revenue support grant. Therefore, in making more of these grants unhypothecated, we are meeting some of the key objectives in our commitment to giving freedom to local government with

**Edwina Hart:** Gwneir penderfyniadau i ddyrannu adnoddau drwy gyfrwng cynlluniau grant arbennig naill ai fel rhan o'r cylch cynllunio cyllideb blynyddol neu, lle y bo angen, yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol. Darperir arian ar gyfer grantiau arbennig o fewn y gyllideb flynyddol gyffredinol, heblaw am achosion pan fydd angen rhyddhau arian ychwanegol yn ystod y flwyddyn. Gwneir penderfyniadau ar ddyrannu cyllid y tu allan i'r broses pennu cyllideb ffurfiol gan y Gweinidog gwario priodol a minnau, fesul achos.

**Janet Ryder:** Telir y rhan fwyaf o'r grantiau penodol hynny i lywodraeth leol, ac er cystal eu bwriad, maent yn dirmygu rheolaeth a blaenoriaethau lleol oherwydd, er bod y setliad refeniw yn £2,422 miliwn, mae'r arian a gaiff llywodraeth leol mewn grantiau penodol yn dod â'r cyfanswm i dros £3,082 miliwn. Dadrithir cynghorwyr fwyfwy, gan fod awdurdodau lleol yn dod yn ddim mwy nag asiantau trafod ar gyfer y Llywodraeth ganolog. Ar ôl pedair blynedd o Lywodraeth, beth a wnaethoch i gynyddu rhyddid awdurdodau lleol i bennu eu cyllidebau eu hunain?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydych yn gywir, caiff 90 y cant o gymorth y Cynulliad i lywodraeth leol ei gyfeirio drwy gyfrwng y grant cynnal refeniw a chaiff y 10 y cant arall ei gyfeirio drwy'r system grant arbennig. Mae lefel arian y Cynulliad a delir i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru drwy gyfrwng grantiau arbennig yn sylweddol is na'r lefel yn Lloegr, a chroesewir hyn gan lywodraeth leol. I roi enghraifft o'r newidiadau a wneuthum: arferwyd talu £15 miliwn o'r arian ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol drwy gyfrwng grant arbennig, ond bellach caiff ei gynnwys yn y setliad ar gyfer 2003-04; a chaiff grantiau addysg a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol presennol eu cyfuno yn grantiau trosfwaol lle nad yw'n addas eu cynnwys yn y grant cynnal refeniw. Fel y dynodais, byddwn yn ystyried ceisiadau yn y dyfodol am grantiau arbennig unigol, ac, os yn bosibl, byddant yn grantiau byrdymor arbennig, a byddant yn y pen draw yn cael eu cynnwys yn y grant cynnal refeniw. Felly, drwy amhridiannu rhagor o'r grantiau hyn, yr ydym yn bodloni rhai o amcanion allweddol



regard to its responsibilities.

**David Ian Jones:** Do you agree that, because grants are paid on an ad-hoc basis, recipients cannot plan effectively for the future, and that recipients need a guaranteed income stream rather than grants which may not be available the following year?

**Edwina Hart:** I have provided local authorities and the Local Government and Housing Committee with a comprehensive list of hypothecated grants for 2003-04. Where possible, I have also provided authorities with details of grant distribution so that they are familiar with funding sources when they examine their budget processes. Therefore I do not accept the argument inherent in your question.

ein hymrwymiad i roi rhyddid i lywodraeth leol o ran ei chyfrifoldebau.

**David Ian Jones:** Gan y telir grantiau ar sail ad-hoc, a gytunwch na all y rhai sy'n eu derbyn gynllunio'n effeithiol ar gyfer y dyfodol, a bod angen llif incwm wedi ei warantu ar dderbynyddion yn hytrach na grantiau na fyddant, o bosibl, ar gael y flwyddyn ganlynol?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf wedi rhoi rhestr gynhwysfawr o grantiau a bridianwyd ar gyfer 2003-04 i awdurdodau lleol a'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai. Lle y bo modd, yr wyf hefyd wedi rhoi manylion i awdurdodau am ddyrannu grantiau fel eu bod yn gyfarwydd â'r ffynonellau ariannu pan fyddant yn archwilio eu prosesau cyllideb. Felly ni dderbyniaf y ddadl sydd ymhlyg yn eich cwestiwn.

### **Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Health and Social Services**

**Q3 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the funding of health and social services in Wales since 1999? (OAQ21245)

**Edwina Hart:** Expenditure on health and social services has increased from £2.7 billion in the 1999-2000 financial year to an estimated £3.6 billion in the 2002-03 financial year.

**Ann Jones:** The increases in funding that we have seen, and will continue to see, are the result of the high priority given to health and social services by the Government in Wales and in Westminster. Do you therefore agree that only the Labour Party can be trusted to take forward the investment needed to maintain a genuinely national health service that is free at the point of need for everyone in Wales?

**Edwina Hart:** You express the commitment of the Labour Party in Wales, and of the Labour Government in Westminster, to the national health service. We are prepared to invest the necessary resources. This investment in Wales has resulted in reduced prescription charges, free dental and eye

**C3 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ffordd yr ariannwyd iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru ers 1999? (OAQ21245)

**Edwina Hart:** Cynyddodd gwariant ar iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol o £2.7 biliwn ym mlwyddyn ariannol 1999-2000 i £3.6 biliwn amcangyfrifedig ym mlwyddyn ariannol 2002-03.

**Ann Jones:** Mae'r cynnydd mewn cyllid a welsom, ac y byddwn yn parhau i'w weld, yn deillio o'r flaenoriaeth uchel a roddir i iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gan y Llywodraeth yng Nghymru ac yn San Steffan. A gytunwch felly mai'r Blaid Lafur yn unig y gellir ymddiried ynnddi i ddatblygu'r buddsoddiad angenrheidiol i gynnal gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol gwirioneddol, sydd am ddim lle y mae ei angen, i bawb yng Nghymru?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydych yn mynegi ymrwymiad y Blaid Lafur yng Nghymru, a'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan, i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Yr ydym yn barod i fuddsoddi'r adnoddau angenrheidiol. Arweiniodd y buddsoddiad hwn yng Nghymru at ostyngiad mewn ffioedd

checks for at-risk groups, increased use of information and communications technology to reduce inefficiency, greater capital investment, and an increase in training facilities. The proof of the pudding for the electorate will be in the eating—they will see where the money has been invested.

**David Lloyd:** Cyflwynwyd adroddiad gan Syr John Bourn i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol heddiw, sydd yn darogan bod costau ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn debygol o gynyddu. A oes arian wrth gefn i hyn?

**Edwina Hart:** As a good Finance Minister, I make the necessary budgetary provisions for any decisions taken by the Government.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that there is a difference between extra spending and effective investment? Is it not the case that, because you have apprehended this distinction, you have frozen the health budget from 2004 onwards, until Derek Wanless can talk sense into your colleague, the Minister for Health and Social Services?

**Edwina Hart:** The Minister for Health and Social Services, the First Minister and I invited Derek Wanless to undertake work that we believed to be necessary in light of the large amount of money that is now available for health. I have put money into the reserve, as you are aware, as I thought that it was prudent to do so. I eagerly await the report from Derek Wanless and his colleagues, which I am sure will ensure much better expenditure decisions across Wales.

presgripsiwn, profion deintyddol a llygaid am ddim i grwpiau sydd mewn perygl, defnydd cynyddol o dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu er mwyn lleihau aneffeithiolrwydd, mwy o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf, a chynnydd mewn cyfleusterau hyfforddiant. Wrth ei flas y bydd yr etholwyr yn profi'r pwdin—byddant yn gweld lle y buddsoddiwyd yr arian.

**David Lloyd:** A report by Sir John Bourn that came before the Health and Social Services Committee today predicts that the cost of restructuring the health service is likely to increase. Has money been set aside for this?

**Edwina Hart:** Fel Gweinidog Cyllid da, gwnaf y darpariaethau cyllidebol angenrheidiol ar gyfer unrhyw benderfyniadau a wneir gan y Llywodraeth.

**David Melding:** A gytunwch fod gwahaniaeth rhwng gwariant ychwanegol a buddsoddiad effeithiol? Onid yw'n wir, gan eich bod wed dirnad y gwahaniaeth hwn, eich bod wedi rhewi'r gyllideb iechyd o 2004 ymlaen, hyd nes y gall Derek Wanless roi synnwyr ym mhen eich cyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol?

**Edwina Hart:** Gwahoddwyd Derek Wanless gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, y Prif Weinidog a minnau i ymgymryd â gwaith y credem y byddai ei angen yng ngoleuni'r swm mawr o arian sydd ar gael bellach ar gyfer iechyd. Rhoddais arian yn y gronfa wrth gefn, fel y gwyddoch, gan y credais ei bod yn ddoeth i wneud hynny. Disgwyliaf yn eiddgar am adroddiad Derek Wanless a'i gydweithwyr, ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yn sicrhau penderfyniadau llawer gwell ar wariant ledled Cymru.

### Mentrau Cyllid Preifat Private Finance Initiative

**C4 Elin Jones:** Pa fesurau all y Gweinidog eu cymryd i sicrhau bod datblygiadau mentrau cyllid preifat yn rhoi'r gwerth gorau am arian yn y tymor hir i'r gymuned leol? (OAQ21296)

**Q4 Elin Jones:** What measures can the Minister take to ensure that private finance initiative developments provide the best long-term value for money to the local community? (OAQ21296)

**Edwina Hart:** In all instances where the Welsh Assembly Government provides financial support to a PFI project, the business case is subject to review to ensure that it represents value for money.

**Elin Jones:** A ydych yn barod i newid y canllawiau presennol fel bod cost cynllun PFI yn cael ei gyhoeddi yn dilyn llofnodi cytundeb yn derfynol? Ni all mater o gyfrinachedd masnachol yn dilyn llofnodi cytundeb fod yn bwysicach na'r egwyddorion o dryloywder ac atebolrwydd i'r gymuned leol.

**Edwina Hart:** It is important that all decisions are accountable. I will review the guidance that I have issued in this respect and report back to Members in the new year.

2:30 p.m.

**Peter Black:** You have indicated in the past that you would not object to business cases for PFI schemes being published by those implementing such schemes once they had been approved and were no longer commercially confidential. Would it be possible for you to consider whether the Assembly could take a proactive role in this and perhaps publish those business cases on its own website?

**Edwina Hart:** I will consider your question in the context of Elin's supplementary and return to these issues in the new year.

**Nick Bourne:** You will no doubt have heard the comments of your Labour colleague, Jon Owen Jones, on PFI in Wales—he suggested that we had lost out on £400 million-worth of projects compared with Scotland. I know from your answers to previous questions on PFI that you take the same pragmatic approach as I do on this issue—if its success can be proven, it should be used. Have you had the opportunity of discussing this with Jon Owen Jones, because what we gain from Objective 1 is less than the benefit that we would have gained from PFI if it had been properly applied in Wales? It is important that you speak to him, to benefit from his opinion on this issue.

**Edwina Hart:** Ym mhob achos lle mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn darparu cymorth ariannol i brosiect PFI, mae'r achos busnes yn destun adolygiad er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn cynrychioli gwerth am arian.

**Elin Jones:** Are you prepared to change the current guidelines so that the cost of a PFI scheme is announced following the signing of the final contract? There cannot be an issue of commercial confidentiality after signing a contract that is more important than the principle of transparency and accountability to the local community.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'n bwysig fod atebolrwydd am bob penderfyniad. Adolygaf yr arweiniad a gyhoeddais ynglŷn â hyn ac adrodd yn ôl i'r Aelodau yn y flwyddyn newydd.

**Peter Black:** Yr ydych wedi nodi yn y gorffennol na fydddech yn gwrthwynebu cyhoeddi achosion busnes ar gyfer cynlluniau PFI gan y rhai sy'n gweithredu cynlluniau o'r fath unwaith y cânt eu cymeradwyo a phan na fyddant yn fasnachol gyfrinachol mwyach. A fyddai'n bosibl ichi ystyried p'un a allai'r Cynulliad gymryd rôl ragweithiol yn hyn o beth a chyhoeddi'r achosion busnes hynny ar ei wefan ei hun efallai?

**Edwina Hart:** Ystyriaf eich cwestiwn yng nghyd-destun cwestiwn ategol Elin a dychwelyd at y materion hyn yn y flwyddyn newydd.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn sicr y byddwch wedi clywed sylwadau eich cyd-aelod Llafur, Jon Owen Jones, ar PFI yng Nghymru—awgrymodd ein bod ar ein colled o werth £400 miliwn o brosiectau o gymharu â'r Alban. Gwn o'ch atebion i gwestiynau blaenorol ar PFI eich bod yn cymryd yr un ymagwedd ymarferol ag y gwnaf i ar y mater hwn—os gellir profi ei lwyddiant, dylid ei ddefnyddio. A gawsoch y cyfle i drafod hyn â Jon Owen Jones, gan fod yr hyn yr ydym yn ei ennill o Amcan 1 yn llai na'r hyn y byddem wedi ei ennill o PFI pe bai wedi ei gymhwyso yn briodol yng Nghymru? Mae'n bwysig eich bod yn siarad ag ef, er mwyn elwa ar ei farn ar y mater hwn.

**Edwina Hart:** He has not approached me to discuss PFI and I take what I read in the newspapers with a pinch of salt.

**Edwina Hart:** Nid yw wedi dod ataf i drafod PFI a chymeraf yr hyn a ddarllenaf mewn papurau newydd gyda phinsiad o halen.

### **Adleoli Swyddi Gwasanaeth Sifil y Cynulliad Relocating Assembly Civil Service Jobs**

**Q5 Dafydd Wigley:** What factors are discussed in the consideration of relocating Assembly civil service jobs? (OAQ21295)

**C5 Dafydd Wigley:** Pa ffactorau sy'n cael eu trafod wrth ystyried adleoli swyddi gwasanaeth sifil y Cynulliad? (OAQ21295)

**Edwina Hart:** In line with the criteria set out in the locations strategy report, work is proceeding to identify the number and type of jobs that will be relocated. That will involve difficult decisions, and the programme must be balanced against the needs of staff, many of whom, along with their partners, currently live and work in Cardiff.

**Edwina Hart:** Yn unol â'r meini prawf a amlinellwyd yn yr adroddiad strategaeth lleoliadau, mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo er mwyn nodi nifer a math y swyddi a ad-leolir. Bydd hynny'n cynnwys penderfyniadau anodd, a rhaid cydbwyso'r rhaglen yn erbyn anghenion y staff, y mae nifer ohonynt, ynghyd â'u partneriaid, yn byw ac yn gweithio yng Nghaerdydd ar hyn o bryd.

**Dafydd Wigley:** In recognising that there are challenges in terms of decentralising jobs from Cardiff—although we hope that that will take place sooner rather than later—do you accept that when existing civil service jobs are already located in the Objective 1 area, it would be highly undesirable if, as a matter of administrative convenience, they were moved to a non-Objective 1 area? Will you bear this in mind when considering the future of the Rent Officer Service that is currently based in Caernarfon?

**Dafydd Wigley:** Wrth gydnabod fod heriau o ran datganoli swyddi o Gaerdydd—er y gobeithiwn y bydd hynny'n digwydd yn gynt yn hytrach na'n hwyrach—a dderbyniwch y byddai'n hynod annymunol i symud swyddi i ardal nad yw'n rhan o Amcan 1, fel mater o gyfleustra gweinyddol, pan leolir swyddi gwasanaeth sifil mewn ardal Amcan 1 eisoes? A wnewch chi gadw hyn mewn cof wrth ystyried dyfodol y Gwasanaeth Swyddog Rhent a leolir yng Nghaernarfon ar hyn o bryd?

**Edwina Hart:** Yes, I will bear that in mind when considering the future of the Rent Officer Service. I hope to be in a position in the new year to make an announcement on office relocation.

**Edwina Hart:** Gwnaf, cadwaf hynny mewn cof wrth ystyried dyfodol y Gwasanaeth Swyddog Rhent. Gobeithiaf fod mewn sefyllfa yn y flwyddyn newydd i wneud cyhoeddiad ar ad-leoli swyddfeydd.

**Lorraine Barrett:** When considering where to locate Assembly jobs in Wales, will you take into account the conclusions of recent research based on residency figures, which show Cardiff South and Penarth unemployment figures as the third highest in Wales after Blaenau Gwent and Ynys Môn?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Wrth ystyried lle i leoli swyddi'r Cynulliad yng Nghymru, a wnewch chi ystyried casgliadau ymchwil ddiweddar sy'n seiliedig ar ffigurau preswyliaeth, sy'n dangos mai ffigurau diweithdra De Caerdydd a Phenarth yw'r trydydd uchaf yng Nghymru ar ôl Blaenau Gwent ac Ynys Môn?

**Edwina Hart:** Clearly there are issues to consider with regard to unemployment levels in Cardiff, and in your constituency; there are also issues about the type of employees working for the Assembly. We must be mindful that only a small number of ethnic

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'n amlwg fod materion i'w hystyried o ran lefelau diweithdra yng Nghaerdydd, ac yn eich etholaeth; ceir materion hefyd ynghylch y math o gyflogaion sy'n gweithio i'r Cynulliad. Rhaid inni gadw mewn cof mai dim ond nifer fach o aelodau

minority community members are employed by the Assembly. Such matters must be actively pursued and I will raise them with Carwyn Jones, who has responsibility for equal opportunities.

**William Graham:** Have you given any consideration to the establishment of a Welsh civil service?

**Edwina Hart:** That is an interesting question and I would like this matter to be subject to debate at some point. I have not given it active consideration, but it should be considered in the fullness of time. I also recognise the benefits of a UK civil service, in terms of staff being able to transfer to different departments, in Whitehall for example, before bringing their knowledge of those departments back to Wales. We should discuss this issue, but we must recognise the benefits of the existing system as well as any possible benefits of a Welsh civil service.

**Eleanor Burnham:** What Assembly jobs will be created in north Wales, particularly in Colwyn Bay?

**Edwina Hart:** Location issues in north Wales are long-term issues in terms of our location policy. As I indicated, the first phase will be in Merthyr Tydfil. However, we are actively considering the requirements of north Wales. There is an issue regarding where we should locate new jobs created by the Assembly and we may consider different locations for those jobs. We will also consider what departments or wider services could be moved to north Wales: that is important. Those issues are currently being actively considered.

cymuned lleiafrifoedd ethnig a gyflogir gan y Cynulliad. Rhaid mynd ar drywydd materion o'r fath a byddaf yn eu codi â Carwyn Jones, sy'n gyfrifol am gyfle cyfartal.

**William Graham:** A ydych wedi rhoi unrhyw ystyriaeth i sefydlu gwasanaeth sifil Cymreig?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae hynny'n gwestiwn diddorol a hoffwn i'r mater hwn fod yn destun dadl rhywbryd. Ni roddais lawer o ystyriaeth iddo, ond dylid ei ystyried yng nghyflawnder amser. Yr wyf hefyd yn cydnabod manteision gwasanaeth sifil y DU, o ran y ffaith bod staff yn gallu trosglwyddo i adrannau gwahanol, yn Whitehall er enghraifft, cyn dod â'u gwybodaeth am yr adrannau hynny yn ôl i Gymru. Dylem drafod y mater hwn, ond rhaid inni gydnabod manteision y system bresennol yn ogystal ag unrhyw fanteision posibl a ddaw yn sgîl gwasanaeth sifil Cymreig.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Pa swyddi Cynulliad a gaiff eu creu yn y Gogledd, yn arbennig ym Mae Colwyn?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae materion yn ymwneud â lleoliad yn y Gogledd yn faterion hirdymor o ran ein polisi lleoli. Fel y nodais, bydd y cam cyntaf ym Merthyr Tudful. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wrthi'n ystyried gofynion y Gogledd. Mae mater yn codi ynghylch lle y dylem leoli swyddi newydd a greir gan y Cynulliad a gallem ystyried lleoliadau gwahanol ar gyfer y swyddi hynny. Byddwn hefyd yn ystyried pa adrannau neu wasanaethau ehangach y gellid eu symud i ogledd Cymru: mae hynny'n bwysig. Ystyrir y materion hynny ar hyn o bryd.

### Cyflogau'r Sector Cyhoeddus Public Sector Wages

**C6 Cynog Dafis:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael â chydweithwyr yn San Steffan ynghylch yr effaith y byddai unrhyw gynnydd yng nghyflogau'r sector cyhoeddus yn ei chael ar gyllideb y Cynulliad? (OAQ21284)

**Edwina Hart:** I have ongoing discussions with Westminster colleagues on a range of

**Q6 Cynog Dafis:** What discussions has the Minister had with Westminster colleagues on the effect any increases in public sector wages would have on the Assembly's budget? (OAQ21284)

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn cael trafodaethau parhaus â chydweithwyr yn San Steffan ar

issues including, as appropriate, the effects of public sector pay increases.

**Cynog Dafis:** Byddai llawer ohonom yn cydymdeimlo'n gryf â galwad y diffoddwyr tân ar hyn o bryd am gydnabyddiaeth deg o'u hymroddiad a'u sgiliau. Teimlwn hefyd fod gan weithwyr sector cyhoeddus yn gyffredinol le i fod yn anfodlon â lefel eu cyflogau. Fodd bynnag, byddai tegwch o ran cyflogau yn arwain at ganlyniadau i gyllideb y Cynulliad. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda Changhellor y Trysorlys ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Peter Hain, ynghylch y sefyllfa bresennol—o ran sefyllfa'r diffoddwyr tân yn benodol—a chanlyniadau hynny i gyllideb y Cynulliad?

**Edwina Hart:** The Bain commission's recommendations have only recently been published. The Deputy Prime Minister made a statement to the House of Commons on the arrangements for any financial support that he might provide. I am currently in discussions on those matters.

**David Davies:** Mae pawb yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig talu mwy o arian i bobl sy'n gweithio yn y sector cyhoeddus. Os na ddaw arian gan Lywodraeth y DU ar gyfer hynny, a gytunwch ei bod yn bosibl defnyddio arian yng Nghymru yr ydym yn bwriadu ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer prosiectau fel Siambr newydd y Cynulliad?

**Edwina Hart:** We do not want to bring the issue of the new building into discussions on public sector pay. When recommendations on budget provision are made in England, the Chancellor of the Exchequer considers what will happen in terms of the public sector pay round. He then makes the necessary arrangements in terms of what money is allocated to the relevant Whitehall departments; we then receive our consequential money. The issue is under constant review. We also make estimates and I consider the Assembly's provisions, and what the local government pay settlement will be. It is an ongoing issue. You must recognise that every percentage point of the firefighters' pay settlement in Wales will cost £950,000.

amrywiaeth o faterion gan gynnwys, fel y bo'n briodol, effeithiau'r cynnydd yng nghyflogau'r sector cyhoeddus.

**Cynog Dafis:** Many of us would sympathise strongly with the firefighters' current demand for fair recognition of their commitment and skills. We also feel that public sector workers in general have reason to be dissatisfied with their levels of pay. However, fairness in terms of pay would have consequences for the Assembly's budget. What discussions have you had with the Chancellor of the Exchequer and the Secretary of State for Wales, Peter Hain, on the current situation—in terms of the firefighters' situation specifically—and the consequence of that for the Assembly's budget?

**Edwina Hart:** Dim ond yn ddiweddar y cyhoeddwyd argymhellion comisiwn Bain. Gwnaeth Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y DU ddatganiad i Dŷ'r Cyffredin ar y trefniadau ar gyfer unrhyw gymorth ariannol y gall ei ddarparu. Yr wyf mewn trafodaethau ar hyn o bryd ynghylch y materion hynny.

**David Davies:** Everyone agrees that it is important to pay more money to those who work in the public sector. If money does not come from the UK Government for that purpose, do you agree that it is possible to use the money in Wales that we intend to use for projects such as the new Assembly Chamber?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid ydym am gyflwyno'r adeilad newydd i drafodaethau ar gyflogau'r sector cyhoeddus. Pan wneir argymhellion ar ddarpariaeth cyllideb yn Lloegr, ystyria Canghellor y Trysorlys yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd o ran y cylch cyflogau'r sector cyhoeddus. Bydd wedyn yn gwneud y trefniadau priodol o ran faint o arian a ddyrennir i'r adrannau perthnasol yn Whitehall; byddwn wedyn yn derbyn ein harian canlyniadol. Adolygir y mater yn barhaus. Gwnawn amcangyfrifon hefyd ac ystyria ddarpariaethau'r Cynulliad, a'r hyn fydd setliad cyflogau llywodraeth leol. Mae'n fater parhaus. Rhaid ichi gydnabod y bydd pob pwynt canran o setliad cyflog y diffoddwyr tân yng Nghymru yn costio £950,000.

**Mentrau Cyllid Preifat**  
**Private Finance Initiatives**

**C7 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu cymeradwyo mwy o fentrau cyllid preifat cyn mis Mai 2003? (OAQ21250)

**Edwina Hart:** I expect to receive three full business cases for local government projects given outline approval in 1999. I am still considering the issue of a new bidding round for local government PFI credits with the Welsh Local Government Association.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid wyf yn credu mewn mentrau cyllid preifat: maent yn costio llawer mwy yn y pen draw a bydd hynny'n effeithio ar bwrs y wlad. Er fy mod yn croesawu'r ymrwymiad a roddasoch i Elin Jones yn gynharach eich bod am edrych o'r newydd ar y canllawiau ar gyfer mentrau cyllid preifat, a wnewch ystyried cynnwys yn y canllawiau hynny gyfeiriad at yr angen i ddefnyddio cynnyrch a chwmnïau o Gymru pan fo hynny'n bosibl er mwyn sicrhau rhyw werth o gynlluniau PFI?

**Edwina Hart:** We need to recognise that European procurement rules apply on those aspects of PFI schemes. I try to do what I can in terms of maximising the ability of Welsh firms to tender for any projects. You may not like PFI projects, Rhodri, but the Rhondda Cynon Taf lifelong learning facility project in Church Village and the Sirhowy Enterprise Way road scheme near Caerphilly are due for consideration before May.

**Peter Rogers:** I listened to your response to Jon Owen Jones's comments on private finance initiatives. He also claimed that the cost to the Assembly of not considering PFI as an option is equivalent to the cost of five hospitals and more than a dozen schools. Do you not think that his claims are relevant and that PFI should be considered more positively?

**Edwina Hart:** No-one has lost out as a result of any financial decisions taken by the Assembly regarding the building of a new

**Q7 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Does the Minister intend to approve any more private finance initiatives before May 2003? (OAQ21250)

**Edwina Hart:** Disgwyliaf dderbyn tri achos busnes llawn ar gyfer prosiectau llywodraeth leol a dderbyniodd gymeradwyaeth amlinellol yn 1999. Parhaf i ystyried y mater o gylch cynigion newydd ar gyfer credydau PFI llywodraeth leol gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I do not believe in private finance initiatives: they ultimately cost much more and that will affect the public purse. Although I welcome the commitment that you gave to Elin Jones earlier that you would look again at the guidelines for PFI schemes, will you consider including in those guidelines a reference to the need to use Welsh produce and companies where possible so that PFI schemes can be of some value?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae angen inni gydnabod fod rheolau caffael Ewropeaidd yn gymwys i'r agweddau hynny ar gynlluniau PFI. Ceisiaf wneud cymaint ag y gallaf o ran cynyddu gallu cwmnïau o Gymru i dendro am unrhyw brosiectau. Efallai nad ydych yn hoffi prosiectau PFI, Rhodri, ond bydd prosiect cyfleuster dysgu gydol oes Rhondda Cynon Taf yng Ngartholwg a chynllun ffordd Llwybr Menter Sirhywi yn cael eu hystyried cyn mis Mai.

**Peter Rogers:** Gwrandewais ar eich ymateb i sylwadau Jon Owen Jones ar fentrau cyllid preifat. Honnodd yntau hefyd fod y gost i'r Cynulliad o beidio ag ystyried PFI fel opsiwn yn cyfateb i gost pump ysbyty a mwy na dwsin o ysgolion. Oni chredwch fod ei honiadau yn berthnasol ac y dylid ystyried PFI yn fwy cadarnhaol?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid oes neb ar ei gollod o ganlyniad i unrhyw benderfyniad ariannol a wnaed gan y Cynulliad mewn perthynas ag

hospital or school. You are talking about the opinion of one Member of Parliament.

adeiladu ysbyty neu ysgol newydd. Yr ydych yn siarad am farn un Aelod Seneddol.

2:40 p.m.

## **Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question**

### **Canolfan Alwadau Pont Cleddau Cleddau Bridge Call Centre**

**Christine Gwyther:** Would the Minister make a statement on the 223 job losses at Cleddau Bridge call centre, which were announced by Vertex last Thursday, 12 December 2002? (EAQ21540)

**Christine Gwyther:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y 223 o swyddi a gollwyd yng nghanolfan alwadau Pont Cleddau, yn dilyn cyhoeddiad Vertex ddydd Iau diwethaf, 12 Rhagfyr 2002? (EAQ21540)

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** The announcement last week that Vertex, the technology and operational management provider for the Cleddau Bridge contact centre, is withdrawing from the site is terrible news for the people who work there. There is never a good time to hear of job losses but, this close to Christmas, it is particularly difficult and I am sure that we all feel extra sympathy for the position in which that puts the workers.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Mae'r cyhoeddiad yr wythnos diwethaf bod Vertex, y darparwr rheoli technoleg a gweithrediadau ar gyfer canolfan alwadau Pont Cleddau, yn tynnu'n ôl o'r safle yn newyddion dychrynlyd i'r bobl sy'n gweithio yno. Nid oes byth amser da i glywed am golledion swyddi, ond mor agos â hyn at y Nadolig, mae'n arbennig o anodd ac yr wyf yn siwr ein bod i gyd yn cydymdeimlo'n arbennig â'r sefyllfa y mae hynny'n rhoi y gweithwyr ynddi.

I am keeping myself closely informed about the co-ordinated action to provide all possible assistance to help affected workers gain alternative employment, including retraining assistance, if the need for that is identified. Our aim is to make the transition to new employment opportunities as seamless as possible, and the Assembly Government will do all that it can to achieve that.

Yr wyf yn cadw mewn cysylltiad agos â'r camau cydgyssylltiedig sy'n cael eu cymryd i ddarparu pob cymorth posibl i helpu'r gweithwyr dan sylw i gael gwaith amgen, gan gynnwys cymorth ail-hyfforddi os gwelir bod angen hynny. Ein nod yw gwneud y cam tuag at gyfleoedd am gyflogaeth newydd mor ddidrafferth â phosibl, a bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud popeth y gall i gyflawni hynny.

The facilities at Cleddau Bridge call centre are highly marketable; it is a world-class facility with a highly skilled workforce. Team Wales is already engaged in putting its full weight behind promoting the facilities and the talents of the staff currently working there. Meetings have already been held with Manpower UK Ltd to map out future scenarios, and a revised marketing proposition is being developed that can be pitched to the customer relationship management marketplace as a whole. The partial occupation of the site since the demise

Mae'r cyfleusterau yng nghanolfan alwadau Pont Cleddau yn rhai hawdd i'w marchnata; mae'n gyfleuster o'r radd flaenaf gyda gweithlu medrus iawn. Mae Tîm Cymru eisoes yn gweithio i roi ei holl egni i hyrwyddo'r cyfleusterau a thalentau'r staff sy'n gweithio yno ar hyn o bryd. Cynhaliwyd cyfarfodydd eisoes â Manpower UK Cyf i lunio syniadau ar gyfer y dyfodol, ac mae cynnig marchnata diwygiedig yn cael ei ddatblygu y gellir ei gyflwyno i'r farchnad rheoli perthynas â chwsmeriaid yn gyffredinol. Mae'r ffaith mai dim ond rhan



of ITV Digital, and the previous arrangements between Manpower UK Ltd and 7C Ltd, have tended to work against our ability to market the site. Manpower, the Welsh Development Agency, and the local authority will now focus on promoting the whole Cleddau Bridge site, and maximising its potential for employment. Manpower is fully engaged in the process of identifying fresh opportunities and is willing to consider fresh proposals.

Team Wales is 100 per cent committed to fully supporting the regeneration of the economy across west Wales, which has received considerable knocks in recent months. I have committed the Assembly to lead the Team Wales effort to develop a locally-owned action plan for regenerating the economy, which will be in place by January 2003.

I assure you that Team Wales is making every effort to attract new investment to the area. Evidence of this is the £16.5 million in support being given to Bluestone Leisure Ltd, the £45 million world-class tourism and leisure development in Pembrokeshire. That £16.5 million support package—including regional selective assistance of £10 million from the Assembly Government, as well as assistance from the WDA, Finance Wales and the Wales Tourist Board—is one of the largest packages put together in Wales in recent years. This strong Team Wales effort demonstrates our full commitment to delivering jobs and building the local economy in west Wales. I assure you that the Assembly Government will continue to put its full weight behind efforts to promote the world-class facilities at Cleddau Bridge in the coming weeks.

**Christine Gwyther:** Thank you for that answer, Minister. There is never a good time to be made redundant, but many of my constituents have been made redundant for the second time in eight months. I declare an interest as I have family and friends who have worked in that call centre. What Members may not know is that, for the past

o'r safle sydd wedi ei feddiannu ers i ITV Digital ddod i ben, ynghyd â'r trefniadau blaenorol rhwng Manpower UK Cyf a 7C Cyf, wedi tueddu i weithio yn erbyn ein gallu i farchnata'r safle. Bydd Manpower, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, a'r awdurdod lleol yn canolbwyntio yn awr ar hyrwyddo safle Pont Cleddau yn ei gyfanrwydd, a gwneud y defnydd eithaf ar ei botensial ar gyfer cyflogaeth. Mae Manpower yn chwarae rhan allweddol yn y broses o nodi cyfleoedd newydd ac yn fodlon ystyried cynigion newydd.

Mae Tîm Cymru wedi ymrwymo 100 y cant i roi cefnogaeth lawn i adfywio'r economi ar draws gorllewin Cymru, sydd wedi dioddef sawl ergyd fawr yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo'r Cynulliad i arwain ymdrech Tîm Cymru i ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu sydd â pherchnogaeth leol ar gyfer adfywio'r economi, a fydd yn weithredol erbyn Ionawr 2003.

Rhoddaf sicrwydd i chi fod Tîm Cymru yn gwneud pob ymdrech i ddenu buddsoddiad newydd i'r ardal. Mae'r £16.5 miliwn a roddir yn gymorth i Bluestone Leisure Cyf, sef y datblygiad twristiaeth a hamdden £45 miliwn o'r radd flaenaf yn Sir Benfro, yn dystiolaeth o hyn. Mae'r pecyn cymorth £16.5 miliwn hwnnw—gan gynnwys cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol o £10 miliwn gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn ogystal â chymorth gan y WDA, Cyllid Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru—yn un o'r pecynnau mwyaf a luniwyd yng Nghymru yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae'r ymdrech fawr hon gan Dîm Cymru yn dangos ein hymrwymiad llawn i sicrhau swyddi ac adeiladu economi leol gorllewin Cymru. Rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i roi ei holl gefnogaeth i'r ymdrechion i hyrwyddo'r cyfleusterau o'r radd flaenaf ym Mhont Cleddau dros yr wythnosau nesaf.

**Christine Gwyther:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Nid oes byth amser da i golli eich gwaith, ond mae llawer o'm hetholwyr wedi colli eu gwaith am yr ail dro mewn wyth mis. Datganaf fuddiant gan fod gennyf deulu a ffrindiau sydd wedi gweithio yn y ganolfan alwadau honno. Yr hyn na w'yr yr Aelodau efallai yw y bu fy etholwyr,

eight months, my constituents have been held over a barrel by the customer-handling companies that run the call centre, which had an exclusive, binding lease granted to them jointly by the county council and the Welsh Development Agency. Andrew, I want your assurance that this exclusivity deal is now null and void, so that we can now attract companies to the call centre that prefer to run their own business rather than to outsource. That will mean that my constituents can look forward to a brighter 2003, when, hopefully, we will see the call centre thriving once more.

As you have indicated, that will need strategic, directed work from the WDA in selling the facilities to incoming customers. I expect that to happen as a matter of urgency. I want you to go a step further. For the sake of other communities throughout Wales that may, in future, be similarly affected by Welsh Development Agency deals of this kind, will you instigate a thorough review into the WDA's leasing policy, so that safety clauses can be written into contracts to protect the communities from which client companies draw their workforce? These safety clauses should state that, where a client's business situation substantially changes or—as in our case when ITV Digital crashed—completely disappears, the lease terms should automatically come up for renewal and re-examination. That would protect the public investment, which is important, but, more importantly in my view, it would improve the prospects of keeping our publicly-funded business premises full and successful, providing jobs for people such as my constituents.

**Andrew Davies:** I have worked closely with you, as the local Member, on this issue since the demise of ITV Digital. Many people will not be aware that considerable interest was shown in the services provided at Cleddau Bridge by companies that would almost certainly have filled the call centre. Unfortunately, the conditions of service provided by Manpower and 7C were financially and commercially not attractive to those companies. That is the major reason why we have not been able to secure work

dros yr wyth mis diwethaf, ar drugaredd y cwmnïau trin cwsmeriaid sy'n rheoli'r ganolfan alwadau, a dderbyniodd brydles neilltuedig, cyfrwymol gan y cyngor sir ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Andrew, yr wyf am ichi ein sicrhau bod y cytundeb neilltuedig hwn bellach yn ddi-rym ac yn annilys, fel y gallwn ddenu cwmnïau i'r ganolfan alwadau sy'n dymuno cynnal eu busnes eu hunain yn hytrach na rhoi eu gwaith i gwmnïau eraill. Golyga hyn y gall fy etholwyr edrych ymlaen at 2003 fwy llewyrchus, pan welwn y ganolfan alwadau, gobeithio, yn ffynnu unwaith eto.

Fel yr ydych wedi nodi, bydd angen gwaith strategol, uniongyrchol gan y WDA i werthu'r cyfleusterau i gwsmeriaid newydd er mwyn cyflawni hynny. Disgwyliaf i hynny ddigwydd fel mater o frys. Yr wyf am ichi fynd un cam ymhellach. Er lles cymunedau eraill ledled Cymru a allai, yn y dyfodol, gael eu heffeithio yn yr un modd gan gytundebau tebyg Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, a wnewch chi annog adolygiad trylwyr i bolisi prydlesu'r WDA, fel y gellir cynnwys cymalau diogelwch mewn contractau i ddiogelu'r cymunedau y bydd cwmnïau cleientiaid yn cyflogi eu gweithlu ohonynt? Dylai'r cymalau diogelu hyn nodi, pan fydd sefyllfa fusnes y client yn newid yn sylweddol neu—fel yn ein hachos ni pan chwalodd ITV Digital—yn diflannu'n gyfan gwbl, dylai amodau'r brydles gael eu hadnewyddu a'u hail-archwilio yn awtomatig. Byddai hynny'n diogelu'r buddsoddiad cyhoeddus, sy'n bwysig, ond yr hyn sy'n bwysicach yn fy marn i yw y byddai'n gwella'r posibilrwydd o gadw ein heiddo busnes a gaiff ei ariannu yn gyhoeddus, yn llawn ac yn llwyddiannus, gan ddarparu swyddi i bobl fel fy etholwyr i.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf wedi cydweithio'n agos â chi, fel yr Aelod lleol, ar y mater hwn ers i ITV Digital ddod i ben. Ni fydd llawer o bobl yn ymwybodol o'r diddordeb sylweddol a ddangoswyd yn y gwasanaethau a ddarparwyd ym Mhont Cleddau gan gwmnïau a fyddai bron yn sicr wedi llenwi'r ganolfan alwadau. Yn anffodus, nid oedd yr amodau gwasanaeth a ddarparwyd gan Manpower a 7C yn ariannol nac yn fasnachol ddeniadol i'r cwmnïau hynny. Dyma'r prif reswm pam nad ydym wedi gallu sicrhau

there other than the temporary work that is now, sadly and regrettably, coming to an end.

We have worked strenuously to attract alternative operators over many months. The Welsh Development Agency has taken a lead on that and that work will continue. On the lease and the arrangements regarding the WDA deal at Cleddau Bridge and elsewhere, I give a commitment that we will review, with the WDA, how these operations are let. At the time, we had two blue-chip companies—Manpower and 7C—as well as ITV Digital, providing 1,000 jobs, with the support of the Assembly Government and regional selective assistance. We did not know what the future would hold. There are lessons to be learned and we need to review, as you said. I am happy to accept that. In response to your urgent question, we have already asked WDA officials to review these arrangements and are considering how we could improve the service and ensure that we are not faced with a similar situation in future.

**Elin Jones:** Er bod y cwestiwn brys hwn ar y ganolfan alwadau ym Mhont Cleddau, rhaid cofio y collwyd 1,000 o swyddi drwy Gymru yn ystod yr wythnos ddiwethaf. Yr oedd rhai o'r gweithwyr ym Mhont Cleddau yn clywed am yr ail dro o fewn ychydig fisoedd eu bod yn colli eu swyddi ac, fel chithau, cydymdeimlaf yn fawr â'r gweithwyr hynny.

Yr oeddech yn fras yn eich addewidion yn ôl ym mis Mai pan drafodwyd colli swyddi am yr tro cyntaf yn ITV Digital. Dywedasoeh:

'we have done it once and we will do it again.'

Fodd bynnag, y tro hwn yr ydych wedi methu hyd yn oed â sicrhau cytundeb oddi wrth eich chwaer Lywodraeth yn San Steffan, cytundeb y cyfeiriasoch ato fel achubiaeth i Ddoc Penfro ar un adeg. Yn awr, mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau wedi mynd â'i chytundeb i Sheffield, yn hytrach nag i Ddoc Penfro. Yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, fe'ch clywais yn clodfori canolfannau galwadau fel achubiaeth i nifer o ardaloedd. Er hynny, mae'r ganolfan hon yn wag heddiw, a bydd yn parhau i fod yn wag yn ôl

gwaith yno heblaw gwaith dros dro sydd bellach, yn anffodus, yn dod i ben.

Yr ydym wedi gweithio'n galed i ddenu gweithredwyr amgen dros lawer o fisoedd. Mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wedi bod ar y blaen o ran hynny a bydd y gwaith hwnnw yn parhau. O ran y brydles a'r trefniadau ynglŷn â chytundeb y WDA ym Mhont Cleddau ac mewn lleoliadau eraill, addawaf y byddwn, gyda'r WDA, yn adolygu'r modd y caiff y gweithrediadau hynny eu gosod. Ar y pryd, yr oedd gennym ddau gwmni rhagorol—Manpower a 7C—yn ogystal â ITV Digital, yn cyflogi 1,000 o bobl, gyda chymorth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a chymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Ni wyddem beth fyddai'r dyfodol. Mae gwarsi i'w dysgu ac mae angen adolygiad, fel y dywedasoeh. Yr wyf yn fodlon derbyn hynny. Mewn ymateb i'ch cwestiwn brys, yr ydym eisoes wedi gofyn i swyddogion y WDA adolygu'r trefniadau hyn ac yr ydym yn ystyried sut y gallwn wella'r gwasanaeth a sicrhau nad ydym yn wynebu sefyllfa debyg yn y dyfodol.

**Elin Jones:** Although this urgent question is on the Cleddau Bridge call centre, it must be remembered that 1,000 jobs were lost throughout Wales in the past week. Some of the workers in Cleddau Bridge were hearing for the second time in a few months that they had lost their jobs and I, like you, sympathise greatly with those workers.

You made bold promises back in May when job losses at ITV Digital were first discussed. You said:

'gwnaethom hynny unwaith ac fe'i gwnawn eto.'

However, this time you have failed even to secure a contract from your sister Government in Westminster, a contract to which you referred as the salvation of Pembroke Dock at one time. Now the Department for Work and Pensions has taken its contract to Sheffield, rather than to Pembroke Dock. During the past weeks, I have heard you singing the praises of call centres as the salvation of several areas. Despite that, this centre is empty today, and it will continue to be empty according to your

eich rhagamcanion ar gyfer y dyfodol agos.

Mae economi'r Gorllewin wedi dioddef ergyd ar ôl ergyd ers mis Mai. Er hynny, y buddsoddiad cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn Sir Benfro, er enghraifft, yw'r isaf yng Nghymru—buddsoddwyd £35,000 o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yno rhwng mis Ebrill a mis Hydref, er y buddsoddwyd £12 miliwn ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, er enghraifft. Pryd y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn cymryd o ddifrif y gwahaniaeth rhwng economi'r Gorllewin a'r Dwyrain a chreu buddsoddiad real i adfywio economi'r Gorllewin? Pan gaewyd Corus, gwnaethoch ymateb fel Llywodraeth i'r newidiadau hynny yn economi'r Dwyrain. Mae hynny i'w gymeradwyo. Fodd bynnag, nid ydych wedi gwneud yr un peth yn y Gorllewin, ac mae'n bryd i chi wneud hynny.

**Andrew Davies:** Back in the summer when ITV Digital went out of business and the call centre operation in Cleddau Bridge followed suit, we felt that, given a world-class facility and an extremely able, adaptable and committed workforce, operators would quickly move in. However, as I said in reply to Christine Gwyther's supplementary question, some significant businesses found the franchise and leasing arrangements, and the commercial offer by Manpower and 7C, to be unattractive. As a result, I have instigated a review of those arrangements. We are still confident that, given a world-class facility and the workforce, we will find operators for the centre in the long term. However, as I said, we are reviewing the operation. That will involve working with Manpower, which is still a leaseholder.

Call centres are important employers and they make a significant contribution to the wealth of Wales. Twenty-four thousand people work in the call centre industry, compared with 26,000 in the automotive industry, so call centres are significant employers in south-east and south-west Wales. The call centre industry is a growth sector, and a facility such as Cleddau Bridge can provide the excellent service required.

In terms of investment and the Welsh

estimations for the near future.

The west Wales economy has suffered blow after blow since May. Despite that, regional selective assistance investment in Pembrokeshire, for example, is the lowest in Wales—£35,000 in regional selective assistance was invested there between April and October, whereas £12 million was invested in Bridgend, for example. When will your Government take the difference between the economies of west and east Wales seriously and create real investment to regenerate the west Wales economy? When Corus closed you responded as a Government to those changes in the east Wales economy. That is to be commended. However, you have not done the same in west Wales, and it is time that you did so.

**Andrew Davies:** Yn ôl yn yr haf, pan ddaeth busnes ITV Digital i ben ac yna gwnaeth y ganolfan alwadau ym Mhont Cleddau yr un peth, ein teimlad oedd, o gofio'r cyfleusterau gwych a'r gweithlu medrus, hyblyg ac ymrwymedig, y byddai gweithredwyr yn symud i mewn yn gyflym. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i gwestiwn atodol Christine Gwyther, yr oedd rhai busnesau mawr o'r farn nad oedd y trefniadau rhyddfrefnio a phrydlesu, a'r cynnig masnachol gan Manpower a 7C, yn ddeniadol. O ganlyniad, yr wyf wedi annog adolygiad o'r trefniadau hynny. Yr ydym yn hyderus o hyd, o gofio'r cyfleusterau o'r radd flaenaf a'r gweithlu, y byddwn yn dod o hyd i weithredwyr ar gyfer y ganolfan yn yr hirdymor. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, yr ydym yn adolygu'r gweithrediad. Bydd hynny yn golygu cydweithio â Manpower, sy'n parhau i fod yn lesddeiliad.

Mae canolfannau galwadau yn gyflogwyr pwysig a gwnânt gyfraniad mawr i gyfoeth Cymru. Mae 24,000 o bobl yn gweithio yn y diwydiant canolfannau galwadau, o'i gymharu â 26,000 yn y diwydiant ceir, felly mae canolfannau galwadau yn gyflogwyr mawr yn y De-ddwyrain a'r De-orllewin. Mae'r diwydiant canolfannau galwadau yn sector sy'n tyfu, a gall cyfleuster megis Pont Cleddau ddarparu'r gwasanaeth ardderchog sydd ei angen.

O ran buddsoddiad ac ymateb Llywodraeth

Assembly Government's response, as I said in response to a question from Nick Bourne earlier, we are working with local authorities and the Welsh Development Agency to consider regeneration packages for the Swansea bay, Carmarthenshire, Pembrokeshire and Ceredigion areas. I hope to be able to report on those early in the new year.

I reiterate that regional selective assistance is demand-led. The Assembly Government does not force RSA on companies; companies request assistance from us. The Ford Motor Company requested RSA for its developments at Bridgend, as did Bluestone Leisure Ltd for its project. The £16.5 million investment package for that project is among the largest public sector investment in Wales for a private-sector-led development. That testifies to our commitment to the west Wales economy. It is not true that the Assembly Government is not investing in west Wales. We are investing significant amounts of money to help regenerate and boost the west Wales economy by means of RSA, Assembly investment grants and Objective 1.

2:50 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** We are well over the time allocated for this urgent question, but I will allow a question from one other Member who represents the affected region.

**Nick Bourne:** I will try to be brief. Sympathy has already been expressed—and rightly so—for those who have lost their jobs, and for their families. There is never a good time to lose your job; however, to lose it at this time of year is awful. The community has already suffered a body blow this year as a result of the ITV Digital job losses. I heard the Minister's comments on the action being taken in Pembrokeshire. I pressed the First Minister on this issue yesterday. We need concerted action, of the kind that was rightly taken following the Corus job losses, rather than sporadic, individual efforts in different parts of

Cynulliad Cymru, fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i gwestiwn gan Nick Bourne yn gynharach, yr ydym yn cydweithio ag awdurdodau lleol ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru i ystyried pecynnau adfywio ar gyfer ardaloedd bae Abertawe, Sir Gaerfyrddin, Sir Benfro a Cheredigion. Gobeithiaf gyflwyno adroddiad ar y rheini yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd.

Pwysleisiaf fod cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn cael ei arwain gan y galw. Nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gorfodi'r cymorth hwn ar gwmnïau; y cwmnïau sy'n gwneud cais am gymorth gennym ni. Gwnaeth Ford Motor Company gais am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol ar gyfer ei ddatblygiadau ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, fel y gwnaeth Bluestone Leisure Cyf ar gyfer ei brosiect yntau. Mae'r pecyn buddsoddiad o £16.5 miliwn ar gyfer y prosiect hwnnw ymysg y buddsoddiadau sector cyhoeddus mwyaf yng Nghymru ar gyfer datblygiad yn y sector preifat. Mae hynny yn profi ein hymrwymiad i economi gorllewin Cymru. Nid yw'n wir nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn buddsoddi yng ngorllewin Cymru. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi symiau sylweddol o arian i helpu i adfywio a rhoi hwb i economi gorllewin Cymru drwy gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad ac Amcan 1.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr ydym ymhell dros yr amser a bennwyd ar gyfer y cwestiwn brys hwn, ond caniatâf gwestiwn gan un Aelod arall sy'n cynrychioli'r rhanbarth dan sylw.

**Nick Bourne:** Ymdrechaf i fod yn fyr. Mynegwyd cydymdeimlad eisoes—fel sy'n briodol—ar gyfer y bobl hynny sydd wedi colli eu swyddi, ac ar gyfer eu teuluoedd hefyd. Nid oes byth amser da i golli'ch gwaith; fodd bynnag, mae'n ofnadwy colli swydd yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn. Mae'r gymuned eisoes wedi dioddef yn ergyd eleni o ganlyniad i golli swyddi ITV Digital. Clywais sylwadau'r Gweinidog am y camau sy'n cael eu cymryd yn Sir Benfro. Pwysais ar y Prif Weinidog ynglŷn â'r mater hwn ddoe. Mae angen gweithredu cadarn arnom, o'r math a gymerwyd yn dilyn colli swyddi Corus, yn hytrach nag ymdrechion

Pembrokeshire. The situation is now extremely serious, given the Dewhurst job losses and the serious rate of depopulation, with people leaving the area to live in Cardiff or England. Entire communities have been affected; it is not simply an issue of individual job losses. Therefore, a holistic approach is required, involving rural schools, post offices and other services. The situation is so serious that concerted Government action is required, involving all Government members, not just those involved in economic development, to ensure that the haemorrhaging of jobs from west Wales, and particularly Pembrokeshire, does not continue. I press you on that point.

**Andrew Davies:** I agree wholeheartedly, and I am taking that action. I am working with ministerial colleagues to address the issues facing west Wales, be they in Ceredigion, Pembrokeshire, Carmarthenshire or any other part of the region. We have learned from our response to the job losses at Corus that only by having a partnership or team approach—involving local authorities, the WDA, the Assembly and Education and Learning Wales working with the private sector—can we ensure a step-change in response to such situations. There are many individual projects in the area, such as the Bluestone project and the proposed Petroplus liquefied natural gas terminal at Milford Haven, for which I believe a planning application has just been submitted. I agree that a co-ordinated, holistic approach is required, and we are taking such an approach. My officials are meeting representatives of Pembrokeshire County Council and others today to discuss how we can ensure a joined-up approach. I agree that education and skills training are vital. Employers in north Pembrokeshire have said that there is an inadequate supply of skills in the region and that this skills shortage creates a bottleneck for them. Addressing skills, therefore, is a crucial aspect of our response in terms of economic development. I thank the Member for that question and for the way in which it was asked.

achlysurol, unigol mewn gwahanol rannau o Sir Benfro. Mae'r sefyllfa bellach yn ddifrifol iawn, o gofio'r swyddi a gollwyd yn Dewhurst a'r gyfradd ddiboblogi ddifrifol, gyda phobl yn gadael yr ardal i fyw yng Nghaerdydd neu yn Lloegr. Effeithiwyd ar gymunedau cyfan; nid mater o golli swyddi yn unig ydyw. Felly, mae angen ymagwedd gyfannol, sy'n cynnwys ysgolion gwledig, swyddfeydd post a gwasanaethau eraill. Mae'r sefyllfa mor ddifrifol fel bod angen ymdrech ddwys ar ran y Llywodraeth, sy'n cynnwys holl aelodau'r Llywodraeth, nid yn unig y rhai sy'n ymwneud â datblygu economaidd, i sicrhau nad yw'r swyddi sy'n diflannu o orllewin Cymru, ac yn arbennig o Sir Benfro, yn parhau. Pwysaf arnoch ar y pwynt hwnnw.

**Andrew Davies:** Cytunaf yn llwyr, ac yr wyf yn gweithredu felly. Yr wyf yn cydweithio â chyd-weinidogion i fynd i'r afael â'r materion sy'n wynebu gorllewin Cymru, pa un a ydynt yng Ngheredigion, yn sir Benfro, yn sir Gaerfyrddin neu mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r rhanbarth. Yr ydym wedi dysgu o'n hymateb i golli swyddi yn Corus mai dim ond drwy ymagwedd bartneriaeth neu dîm—sy'n cynnwys awdurdodau lleol, y WDA, y Cynulliad a Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru yn gweithio gyda'r sector preifat—y gallwn sicrhau newid sylweddol mewn ymateb i sefyllfaoedd o'r fath. Mae sawl prosiect unigol yn yr ardal, megis y prosiect Bluestone a'r orsaf nwy hylif naturiol Petroplus arfaethedig yn Aberdaugleddau, y credaf fod cais cynllunio newydd gael ei gyflwyno ar ei gyfer. Cytunaf fod angen ymagwedd gydgyssylltiedig a chyfannol, ac yr ydym yn mabwysiadu'r ymagwedd honno. Mae fy swyddogion yn cwrdd â chynrychiolwyr o Gyngor Sir Penfro ac eraill heddiw i drafod sut y gallwn sicrhau ymagwedd gydgyssylltiedig. Cytunaf fod addysg a hyfforddiant sgiliau yn hanfodol. Mae cyflogwyr yng ngogledd Sir Benfro wedi dweud nad oes cyflenwad digonol o sgiliau yn y rhanbarth a bod diffyg sgiliau yn creu anhawster iddynt. Felly mae mynd i'r afael â sgiliau yn rhan hanfodol o'n hymateb o ran datblygu economaidd. Diolchaf i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn hwnnw a'r modd y cafodd ei ofyn.

## Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

**The Presiding Officer:** I have given permission, under Standing Order No. 6.9, for David Melding to propose that the Assembly consider a matter of urgent public importance. I will then call the Minister to respond and the matter will be put to a vote.

**David Melding:** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.9, holds an urgent debate on the findings of Sir John Bourn's report on the likely costs of the NHS restructuring programme in Wales.*

Should I continue? I saw the Minister starting to rise, which I thought was a little premature.

**The Presiding Officer:** Please continue. I will call the Minister in good time.

**David Melding:** Plenary will be aware of the Welsh Assembly Government's assertion that the NHS structural reforms will be cost-neutral. It was a surprise to many of us when, in the summer, the First Minister and the Minister for Health and Social Services announced that cost-neutral did not mean zero cost. I asked the Assembly Library for the established definition of these terms and was told that they were interchangeable. Building on the First Minister's original contribution to accountancy terminology, the Welsh Assembly Government conceded that the transition costs were likely to be between £12.5 million and £15.5 million.

In May, the Welsh Assembly Government invited the Auditor General for Wales to review the transitional and running cost budgets of the new structures. I welcome that open and transparent approach, because it facilitates effective scrutiny. However, the findings of Sir John Bourn's report are dire and, as a consequence, the Welsh Assembly Government stands condemned of breaking yet another fundamental promise. For that reason, this matter should be debated in Plenary this afternoon.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi rhoi caniatâd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9, i David Melding gynnig bod y Cynulliad yn ystyried mater o bwys cyhoeddus brys. Yna, galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ymateb, a phleidleisir ar y mater.

**David Melding:** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9, yn cynnal dadl frys ar ganfyddiadau adroddiad Syr John Bourn ar gostau tebygol rhaglen ailstrwythuro'r GIG yng Nghymru.*

A ddylwn barhau? Gwelais y Gweinidog yn dechrau codi, a chredais fod hynny ychydig yn fuan.

**Y Llywydd:** Parhewch os gwelwch yn dda. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog mewn da bryd.

**David Melding:** Bydd y Cyfarfod Llawn yn ymwybodol o honiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru y bydd y diwygiadau strwythurol i'r GIG yn gost-niwtral. Bu'n syndod i lawer ohonom yn yr haf, pan gyhoeddodd y Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol nad oedd cost-niwtral yn golygu dim costau. Gofynnais i Lyfrgell y Cynulliad am ddiffiniad sefydledig o'r termau hyn a dywedwyd wrthyf eu bod yn gyfnewidiadwy. Gan adeiladu ar gyfraniad gwreiddiol y Prif Weinidog i derminoleg cyfrifo, cyfaddefodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fod y costau trosglwyddo yn debygol o fod rhwng £12.5 miliwn a £15.5 miliwn.

Ym mis Mai, estynnodd Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wahoddiad i Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru adolygu cyllidebau costau trosglwyddo a chynnal y strwythurau newydd. Croesawaf yr ymagwedd agored a thryloyw honno, gan ei bod yn hwyluso proses graffu effeithiol. Fodd bynnag, mae canfyddiadau adroddiad Syr John Bourn yn enbyd, ac o ganlyniad, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cael ei chondemnio am dorri addewid sylfaenol arall. Am hynny, dylai'r mater hwn gael ei drafod yn y

Cyfarfod Llawn y prynhawn yma.

Sir John observed that savings of £8.5 million would be required to achieve a cost-neutral budget. However, he states that:

‘These targets are based primarily on the need to achieve cost neutrality rather than a detailed assessment of future needs and how savings can be achieved from the current position.’

Sir John is an elegant and diplomatic person, so I will translate his words into more direct and brutal political language—the Minister’s calculations have been dashed off on the back of an envelope. The Minister faces severe embarrassment. Sir John is not confident that the transitional costs have been accurately anticipated. Staffing costs and accommodation costs are likely to exceed the Minister’s estimate. The Auditor General concludes that:

‘Given the uncertainty affecting the transitional cost estimates, I recommend that you consider adding a reasonable contingency to the budget.’

Translated, that means that it will probably cost more than the £15.5 million outlined after the Minister conceded the point in the first place.

The position on running costs is no better. Again, Sir John’s judgment is telling. He says that:

‘It is not immediately clear’—

I like that phrase—

‘how savings of £8.5 million necessary to achieve cost neutrality will be made...I am also concerned at the lack of detailed business planning in arriving at the savings targets and some of the estimates...At the present time, management cannot be certain that cost neutrality will be achieved.’

The Government made a central promise to achieve cost neutrality. The Auditor General says that, on the basis of the estimates that he can establish, there is no basis for us to believe that restructuring will be cost-neutral.

Nododd Syr John y byddai angen arbedion o £8.5 miliwn i gyflawni cyllideb cost-niwtral. Fodd bynnag, mae’n datgan:

Seilir y targedau hyn yn bennaf ar yr angen i gyflawni niwtraliaeth cost yn hytrach nag ar asesiad manwl o anghenion yn y dyfodol a sut y gellir arbed arian o’r sefyllfa bresennol

Mae Syr John yn unigolyn urddasol a doeth, felly trosaf ei eiriau yn iaith wleidyddol fwy uniongyrchol a diflewyn ar dafod—mae cyfrifiadau’r Gweinidog wedi cael eu cyfrifo ar frys ar gefn amlen. Mae’r Gweinidog yn wynebu embaras mawr. Nid yw Syr John yn hyderus bod y costau trosiannol yn rhai cywir. Mae costau staffio a chostau llety yn debygol o fynd y tu hwnt i amcangyfrif y Gweinidog. Daw’r Archwilydd Cyffredinol i’r casgliad:

O gofio’r ansicrwydd sy’n effeithio ar amcangyfrifon cost trosiannol, yr wyf yn argymhell eich bod yn ystyried ychwanegu swm wrth gefn rhesymol i’r gyllideb.

O’i drosi, golyga hynny ei bod yn debygol o gostio mwy na’r £15.5 miliwn a amlinellwyd wedi i’r Gweinidog ildio’r pwynt yn y lle cyntaf.

Nid yw sefyllfa’r costau cynnal yn llawer gwell. Eto, mae barn Syr John yn dweud y cyfan. Dywed:

Nid yw’n eglur ar yr olwg gyntaf—

Hoffaf yr ymadrodd hwnnw—

sut y gwneir arbedion o £8.5 miliwn sy’n angenrheidiol i niwtraleiddio’r gost...Yr wyf hefyd yn bryderus ynglŷn â’r diffyg cynllunio busnes manwl i gwrdd â’r targedau arbed arian a rhai o’r amcangyfrifon...Ar hyn o bryd, ni all y rheolwyr fod yn bendant y caiff y gost ei niwtraleiddio.

Gwnaeth y Llywodraeth addewid ganolog i gyflawni niwtraledd costau. Dywed yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, ar sail yr amcangyfrifon, nad oes sail inni gredu y bydd ailstrwythuro yn gost-niwtral. Mae hyd



He even recommends a contingency in case we need to meet the £8.5 million that the Minister, in a hope born of desperation, thinks that we will accrue from savings.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I remind the Member not to make now the speech that he might make were the Assembly to agree to hold a debate.

**David Melding:** I am grateful for that guidance. However, Sir John Bourn's report is long and much of it has been underlined, even by my discerning pen, so I assure you that I have much material for the debate. To quote the most damning part of the report, Sir John Bourn states:

'In my view, it is not good practice to embark on a programme of major structural change within a predetermined budget without considering in some detail the potential impact on the viability of the organisations that are affected.'

The Minister made some response to the report in the Health and Social Services Committee meeting this morning, and said that the report is positive. She is easily pleased. I know that this is the season of goodwill, but had I received that particular present from the Auditor General for Wales, I would have been a little more sour in my response. Rather than being cost-neutral, the structural changes will cost us at least £15.5 million in transitional costs and, potentially, a further £8.5 million. That makes a total of £24 million, although we were told that the changes would be cost-neutral. Even those figures may turn out to be underestimates. No-one in the Chamber—

3:00 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You have had five minutes.

**David Melding:** I will conclude with this: the Minister's judgment is seriously called into question, and we should debate that this afternoon.

yn oed yn argymell cynllun wrth gefn rhag ofn y byddwn yn gorfod talu'r £8.5 miliwn y mae'r Gweinidog, mewn gobaith sy'n deillio o anobaith, yn ei gredu y byddwn yn ei gronni o arbedion.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Atgoffaf y Gweinidog i beidio â gwneud yr araith yn awr y byddai yn ei gwneud efallai pe bai'r Cynulliad yn cytuno i gynnal dadl.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr arweiniad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae adroddiad Syr John Bourne yn un hir, a llawer ohono wedi ei danlinellu, hyd yn oed gan fy ysgrifbin detholgar i, felly rhoddaf sicrwydd i chi fod gennyf lawer o ddeunydd ar gyfer y ddadl. I ddyfynnu rhan fwyaf damniol yr adroddiad, dywed Syr John Bourne:

Yn fy marn i, nid yw'n arfer da dechrau ar raglen o newid strwythurol pwysig o fewn cyllideb rhagderfynedig heb ystyried mewn peth manylder yr effaith bosibl ar ddichonoldeb y sefydliadau yr effeithir arnynt.

Gwnaeth y Gweinidog ryw ymateb i'r adroddiad yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y bore yma, gan ddweud bod yr adroddiad yn gadarnhaol. Mae hi'n hawdd ei phlesio. Gwn fod hwn yn dymor ewyllys da, ond pe bawn wedi derbyn yr anrheg arbennig honno gan Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, byddwn wedi bod ychydig yn fwy sur fy ymateb. Yn hytrach na bod yn gost-niwtral, bydd y newidiadau strwythurol yn costio o leiaf £15.5 miliwn inni mewn costau trosiannol ac, o bosibl, £8.5 miliwn arall. Mae hynny yn gyfanswm o £24 miliwn, er inni gael gwybod y byddai'r newidiadau yn gost-niwtral. Gallai'r ffigurau hynny hyd yn oed fod yn dan-amcangyfrifon. Nid oes neb yn y Siambr—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cawsoch bum munud.

**David Melding:** Deuaf i ben fel hyn: mae amheuaeth ddifrifol ynghylch gallu'r Gweinidog i farnu, a dylem drafod hynny y prynhawn yma.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I am happy to deal with today's attempt by the Conservative Party to derail Assembly business. I cannot imagine what good it can do it or—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This request was made to me under Standing Order No. 6.9. It is perfectly in order and has been determined as such on the basis of advice. It cannot be described as an attempt to derail Assembly procedures.

**Jane Hutt:** Well, I hope that I can say that it is totally unnecessary to take this matter forward in the way that David Melding has chosen to do so. It risks damaging the morale of many individuals who are making enormous, successful efforts to bring about the reform of the health service in Wales, which the Assembly has endorsed. The Conservatives suggest that the content of the Auditor General's letter is surprising and urgent. It is neither. It is not surprising because, as you said, David, I agreed to the proposal of Ann Lloyd, the NHS Director, that the Auditor General for Wales and the National Audit Office should become involved in the ongoing work of the planning and preparation for the NHS structural change programme. Also, the Auditor General has confirmed that the overall financial envelope of £71.1 million is an accurate reflection of the current running costs. He has confirmed that the costs cannot be finalised until staff structures and business premises have been selected and terms of employment and redundancies have been agreed. He concluded that the costs should become progressively clearer as the structural change programme proceeds and decisions are made. He also concluded that all the necessary operational planning work is underway to identify how cost-neutrality will be achieved. All of that is contained in Sir John Bourn's letter.

He made a number of recommendations, which were accepted, in relation to securing further cost certainty. There is nothing in Sir John's letter that comes as a surprise, nor is there anything in the letter or in the recommendations that we are not already

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i ymdrin ag ymgais y Blaid Geidwadol heddiw i ddifetha busnes y Cynulliad. Ni allaf ddychmygu pa les y gall hyn ei wneud iddi na—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gwnaethpwyd y cais hwn imi o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9. Mae'n hollol mewn trefn ac fe'i pennwyd felly ar sail cyngor a dderbyniwyd. Ni ellir ei ddisgrifio fel ymgais i ddifetha gweithdrefnau'r Cynulliad.

**Jane Hutt:** Wel, gobeithio y gallaf ddweud nad oes angen mynd â'r mater hwn ymlaen yn y modd y mae David Melding wedi ei ddewis. Mae perygl y bydd yn digalonni sawl unigolyn sy'n ymdrechu'n galed ac yn llwyddiannus i ddiwygio'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, a gymeradwywyd gan y Cynulliad. Awgryma'r Ceidwadwyr bod cynnwys llythyr yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn peri syndod ac ymdeimlad o frys. Nid yw'r naill beth na'r llall. Nid yw'n peri syndod, oherwydd, fel y dywedasoeh, David, cytunais i gynnig Ann Lloyd, Cyfarwyddwr y GIG, y dylai Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru a'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol fod yn rhan o'r gwaith parhaus o gynllunio a pharatoi ar gyfer rhaglen newid strwythurol y GIG. Hefyd, mae'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol wedi cadarnhau bod y cyfanswm ariannol cyffredinol o £71.1 miliwn yn adlewyrchiad cywir o'r costau cynnal cyffredol. Mae wedi cadarnhau na ellir nodi'r costau terfynol hyd nes y bydd strwythurau staffio ac adeiladau busnes wedi eu dethol ac y cytunir ar delerau cyflogaeth a cholli swyddi. Daeth i'r casgliad y byddai'r costau yn dod yn gliriach wrth i'r rhaglen newid strwythurol fynd rhagddi ac wrth i benderfyniadau gael eu gwneud. Daeth i'r casgliad hefyd bod yr holl waith cynllunio gweithredol angenrheidiol i nodi sut y caiff niwtraled costau ei gyflawni, yn mynd rhagddo. Caiff hynny i gyd ei gynnwys yn llythyr Syr John Bourn.

Gwnaeth sawl argymhelliad, a dderbyniwyd, o ran cadarnhau sicrwydd costau pellach. Nid oes unrhyw beth yn llythyr Syr John sy'n peri syndod, ac nid oes unrhyw beth yn y llythyr nac yn yr argymhellion nad ydym yn eu cynllunio eisoes. Felly nid yw'n peri

planning. Therefore, it is not surprising. It is not urgent for four reasons. First, the matter was discussed fully in the Health and Social Services Committee meeting this morning. Secondly, the Committee has agreed a programme of returning to this issue following the recess—

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I will take your point of order when the Minister has concluded.

**Jane Hutt:** Thirdly, a copy of the Auditor General's letter was supplied to the Chair of the Audit Committee yesterday, and further opportunities to consider it will be available in that forum. Finally, the claim that we cannot reach cost-neutrality in our reorganisation is based upon a reading of the Auditor General's letter that is partial and incomplete. Sir John Bourn states that greater clarity is needed as to how the £8.5 million in savings necessary to ensure cost neutrality are to be achieved. Immediately after raising that matter he says:

'however, the necessary operational planning work is underway, and revised staff structures have been identified for the NHS Wales department and Health Commission Wales, which indicate that their savings targets are achievable.

The achievability of savings for the other parts of the structure will become clearer once the number and grading of their staff has been finalised and accommodation options have been more fully assessed and costed.'

In other words, the Health and Social Services Committee's decision to return to the topic after Christmas is more consistent with the Auditor General's text than is the request for an urgent debate today. I accept that David Melding has every right to make that request, but I hope that I have made my case to Members. A request for an urgent debate on this matter merely shows that the pantomime season has descended upon us. Let us reject that request today.

syndod. Nid oes unrhyw frys am bedwar rheswm. Yn gyntaf, trafodwyd y mater yn llawn yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y bore yma. Yn ail, mae'r Pwyllgor wedi cytuno ar raglen o ddychwelyd at y mater hwn yn dilyn y toriad—

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Derbyniaf eich pwynt o drefn pan fydd y Gweinidog wedi dod i ben.

**Jane Hutt:** Yn drydydd, rhoddwyd copi o lythyr yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ddoe, a bydd cyfleoedd pellach i'w ystyried o fewn y fforwm hwnnw. Yn olaf, mae'r honiad na allwn gyflawni niwtraledd costau wrth ad-drefnu yn seiliedig ar ddehongliad rhannol ac anghyflawn o lythyr yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol. Mae Syr John Bourn yn datgan bod angen mwy o eglurder ar sut i gyflawni'r £8.5 miliwn mewn arbedion i sicrhau niwtraledd costau. Yn syth ar ôl codi'r mater hwnnw, dywed:

fodd bynnag, dechrewyd ar y gwaith cynllunio gweithredol angenrheidiol, a nodwyd strwythurau staff wedi eu diwygio ar gyfer adran GIG Cymru a Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, sy'n dangos bod modd cyflawni'r targedau arbed arian.

Daw gallu rhannau eraill y stwythur i wneud arbedion yn eglurach unwaith y gwneir penderfyniad terfynol ynglŷn â niferoedd a graddau staff a phan fydd y dewisiadau o ran adeiladau wedi eu hasesu a'u costio'n llawnach.

Hynny yw, mae penderfyniad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i ddychwelyd at y pwnc ar ôl y Nadolig yn fwy cyson â thestun yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol na'r cais am ddadl frys heddiw. Derbyniaf fod gan David Melding bob hawl i wneud y cais hwnnw, ond hyderaf fy mod wedi cyflwyno fy nadl i'r Aelodau. Y cyfan a wna cais am ddadl frys ar y pwnc hwn yw dangos bod tymor y pantomeim wedi cyrraedd. Gadewch inni wrthod y cais hwnnw heddiw.

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. I did not get up to challenge the Minister the third time she said it, but as she has repeatedly said that this matter is not urgent, and alleged that it is only us who consider the matter to be urgent, it is worth giving her the opportunity to correct that. This matter has been deemed urgent by you, Presiding Officer, which is why we have the opportunity to make this request.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the leader of the Welsh Conservatives. This matter has been determined upon in the normal way, under Standing Order No. 6.9. I will now put the matter to a vote.

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** Point of order. Under Standing Order No. 6.9, before this matter can be put to a vote, Presiding Officer, you must determine whether you are satisfied that it is a matter of urgent public importance.

**The Presiding Officer:** Indeed. I have made that determination and I now put the matter to a vote.

**Carwyn Jones:** Does not that determination have to be made after listening to both sides of the argument?

**The Presiding Officer:** No, the determination is initially made in private. It was made this morning, and now we move to a vote. That has been the procedure that we have adopted throughout with regard to Standing Order No. 6.9.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Ni chodais i herio'r Gweinidog y trydydd tro iddi ei ddatgan, ond gan ei bod wedi dweud sawl gwaith nad yw'r mater hwn yn fater brys, ac wedi honni mai dim ond ni sy'n credu ei fod yn fater brys, mae'n werth rhoi'r cyfle iddi gywiro hynny. Pennwyd y mater hwn yn un brys gennyh chi, Lywydd, dyna pam y cawn y cyfle i wneud y cais hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Penderfynwyd ar y mater hwn yn y ffordd arferol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9. Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y mater hwn.

**Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Pwynt o drefn. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9, cyn y gellir pleidleisio ar y mater hwn, Lywydd, rhaid i chi benderfynu a ydych yn fodlon ei fod yn fater o bwys cyhoeddus brys.

**Y Llywydd:** Ydw yn wir. Gwneuthum y penderfyniad hwnnw ac yn awr pleidleisiwn ar y mater.

**Carwyn Jones:** Oni ddylai'r penderfyniad hwnnw gael ei wneud ar ôl gwranddo ar ddwy ochr y ddadl?

**Y Llywydd:** Na ddylai, gwneir y penderfyniad yn breifat yn y lle cyntaf. Fe'i gwnaethpwyd y bore yma, ac yn awr fe bleidleisiwn. Dyna'r weithdrefn a fabwysiadwyd gennym ar hyd yr amser o ran Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9.

*Cynnig: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.*

*Motion: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian

Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion rejected.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Point of order. A substantial point of order arises from the disgraceful attempt by the Minister for Health and Social Services to try to hide behind words quoted from Sir John Bourn's letter. We have witnessed a disgraceful attempt by the Government to refuse to be scrutinised on a matter of public importance. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'That is not a point of order.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I will hear the leader of the opposition develop his point of order and, if it is not a point of order, I will be the first to say so. I require no assistance from the Cabinet or anyone else.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The National Assembly must have an opportunity to scrutinise Sir John Bourn's comment that it is clear from current projections that these costs cannot be contained within the Government's figures. In view of the Government's refusal to allow a debate on the matter today, I ask that, in addition to a debate being held in the Health and Social Services Committee early in the new year, this matter be referred to the Audit Committee, under Standing Order No. 12. I appreciate the Minister's point that she referred the matter, but I believe that the matter should be referred to the Audit

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae pwynt o drefn sylweddol yn codi o'r ymgais gywilyddus gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i geisio cuddio y tu ôl i eiriau a ddyfynnwyd o lythyr Syr John Bourne. Yr ydym wedi bod yn dystion i ymgais gywilyddus gan y Llywodraeth i wrthod i fater o bwys cyhoeddus fod yn destun proses graffu. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Nid yw hynny yn bwynt o drefn.']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gwrandawaf ar arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn datblygu ei bwynt o drefn, ac os na fydd yn bwynt o drefn, fi fydd y cyntaf i ddweud hynny. Nid oes angen unrhyw gymorth arnaf gan y Cabinet nac unrhyw un arall.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Rhaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gael cyfle i graffu ar sylw Syr John Bourne ei bod yn glir oddi wrth y rhagamcanion presennol na ellir cynnwys y costau hyn o fewn ffigurau'r Llywodraeth. O gofio bod y Llywodraeth wedi gwrthod caniatáu dadl ar y mater heddiw, gwnaf gais, yn ogystal â bod y ddadl yn cael ei chynnal yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd, bod y mater hwn yn cael ei gyfeirio i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 12. Gwerthfawrogaf bwynt y Gweinidog ei bod wedi cyfeirio'r mater, ond

Committee. Considering Standing Order No. 12 on the responsibilities of the Audit Committee, do you deem it appropriate, Presiding Officer, that the Chair of the Audit Committee should accept a recommendation to consider this matter in detail, and that the Audit Committee should discuss that in its meeting tomorrow?

**The Presiding Officer:** Before I respond, I call the Chair of the Audit Committee.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Further to that point of order, this issue clearly impinges on the work of the Health and Social Services Committee, the Audit Committee and the Assembly as a whole. Having read Sir John Bourn's report carefully, I believe that the Audit Committee can beneficially consider aspects of this issue, and the Minister has acknowledged that. Therefore, I intend to put this item on the agenda for the Audit Committee meeting tomorrow, although we will probably not be able to consider it substantively until the new year.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the Chair of the Audit Committee. This is precisely how these matters should be dealt with. It is appropriate for matters to be raised in Plenary when there are concerns of order, but clearly the agenda for the Audit Committee meeting tomorrow is a matter for the, if I may say so, able Chair of that Committee to handle.

3:10 p.m.

### **Datganiad ar Gyflenwad o Dywod a Graean yn Ne-ddwyrain Cymru Statement on Sand and Gravel Supply in South-east Wales**

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** I issue this position statement to clarify a number of current issues. You will be aware that consultation on a draft marine dredging policy was carried out in summer 2001. The consultation received a substantial number of responses—over 1,000—and raised fundamental questions about the policy. The technical advisory group, which helped to prepare the draft, is being asked to consider the points raised and give its views before we amend and finalise the policy. This

credaf y dylai'r mater gael ei gyfeirio i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio. O ystyried Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12 ar gyfrifoldebau'r Pwyllgor Archwilio, a gredwch ei bod yn briodol, Lywydd, y dylai Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio dderbyn argymhelliad i ystyried hyn yn fanwl ac y dylai'r Pwyllgor Archwilio drafod hynny yn ei gyfarfod yfory?

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn imi ymateb, galwaf ar Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, mae'r mater hwn yn amlwg yn gwrthdaro â gwaith y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, y Pwyllgor Archwilio a'r Cynulliad yn gyffredinol. Wedi darllen adroddiad Syr John Bourn yn ofalus, credaf y byddai'n fanteisiol i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ystyried agweddau ar y mater hwn, ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi cydnabod hynny. Felly, bwriadaf roi'r mater hwn ar yr agenda ar gyfer cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Archwilio yfory, er na fyddwn, mae'n siwr, yn gallu ei ystyried yn sylweddol tan y flwyddyn newydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Dyma yn union sut y dylid ymdrin â materion o'r fath. Mae'n briodol i faterion gael eu codi mewn Cyfarfod Llawn pan fydd pryderon am drefn, ond mae'r agenda ar gyfer cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Archwilio yfory yn amlwg yn fater i Gadeirydd cymwys, os caf ddweud hynny, y Pwyllgor hwnnw ymdrin ag ef.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Cyhoeddaf y datganiad safbwynt hwn er mwyn esbonio nifer o faterion cyfredol. Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod ymgynghoriad ar bolisi carthu morol drafft wedi ei gynnal yn Haf 2001. Cafodd yr ymgynghoriad nifer sylweddol o ymatebion—dros 1,000—a chododd nifer o gwestiynau sylfaenol ynglŷn â'r polisi. Gofynnir i'r grŵp ymgynghorol technegol, a helpodd i baratoi'r drafft, ystyried y pwyntiau a godwyd a rhoi ei farn cyn inni ddiwygio a

is a difficult and complicated area—that is an understatement—and the policy is unlikely to be completed until summer.

Nevertheless, I need to take a decision on the dredging application for Nash bank, and I do not want to make it in a policy void. This position statement sets the context for decisions until the full marine dredging policy is in place. In addition to the need to consider the Nash licence, recent research has highlighted the issue of developing land-based sand and gravel supplies in south-east Wales. Therefore the position statement will also address some of the concerns raised by this research and suggest a way forward in terms of land-based sand and gravel.

The Assembly Government has been considering all the options for providing sand and gravel in a sustainable way. South-east Wales relies on marine-dredged sand as its primary source of fine aggregates. Currently, around 90 per cent of the total supply comes from dredging in the Bristol channel, and the region is in the unique position within the United Kingdom of having no land-based aggregates extraction.

We are endeavouring to find the best way to satisfy the demand for those materials in a way that is economically viable and environmentally acceptable. To that end, considerable research has been undertaken in recent years into all the options for land and marine sand and gravel extraction.

To give the policy context, we issued the draft 'Marine Aggregate Dredging Policy—South Wales' for consultation last year. In addition, there are two relevant documents for minerals planning policy. One is Assembly Government policy as set out in 'Minerals Planning Policy Wales' in December 2000. The second is a more technical document, 'Consultation Draft Minerals Technical Advice Note (Wales)—Aggregates', which was published in February 2002. This supplements the planning policies. It proposes a new method for assessing the demand for, and planning the supply of, aggregates, based on environmental capacity. It also requires

chwblhau'r polisi. Mae hwn yn faes anodd a chymhleth—a dweud y lleiaf—ac nid yw'n debyg y cwblheir y polisi tan yr haf.

Serch hynny, mae angen imi wneud penderfyniad ar y cais carthu ar gyfer banc Nash, ac nid wyf am ei wneud mewn gwagle polisi. Mae'r datganiad safbwynt hwn gosod y cyd-destun ar gyfer penderfyniadau hyd nes i'r polisi carthu morol llawn gael ei sefydlu. Yn ychwanegol i'r angen i ystyried trwydded Nash, mae ymchwil ddiweddar wedi tanlinellu mater datblygu cyflenwadau tywod a graean o'r tir yn y De-ddwyrain. Felly bydd y datganiad safbwynt hefyd yn mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r pryderon a godwyd gan yr ymchwil hon ac yn awgrymu ffordd ymlaen o ran tywod a graean o'r tir.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bod yn ystyried yr holl opsiynau ar gyfer darparu tywod a graean mewn ffordd gynaliadwy. Dibynna'r De-ddwyrain ar dywod a godir o'r môr fel ei phrif ffynhonnell o gerrig mân. Ar hyn o bryd daw tua 90 y cant o'r cyflenwad cyfan o garthu ym môr Hafren, ac mae'r ardal mewn safle unigryw o fewn y Deyrnas Unedig o fod heb safleoedd cloddio cerrig mân o'r tir.

Yr ydym yn ymdrechu i ganfod y ffordd orau o fodloni'r galw am y deunyddiau hyn, mewn modd sydd yn ymarferol yn economaidd, ac yn dderbyniol yn amgylcheddol. I'r perwyl hwnnw, cynhaliwyd llawer o ymchwil yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf i'r holl opsiynau ar gyfer cloddio tywod a graean morol.

I roi cyd-destun y polisi, cyhoeddwyd fersiwn drafft y 'Polisi Carthu Agregau'r Môr—De Cymru' gennym y llynedd ar gyfer ymgynghoriad. Yn ychwanegol, mae dwy ddogfen berthnasol ar gyfer polisi cynllunio mwynau. Y cyntaf yw polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fel y'i nodwyd yn 'Polisi Cynllunio Mwynau Cymru' yn Rhagfyr 2000. Yr ail yw dogfen fwy technegol, sef 'Consultation Draft Minerals Technical Advice Note (Wales)—Aggregates', a gyhoeddwyd yn Chwefror 2002. Mae hwn yn ategol at y polisiâu cynllunio. Mae'n cynnig dull newydd o asesu y galw am, a chynllunio ar gyfer, gyflenwi cerrig mân, wedi ei seilio ar gapasiti amgylcheddol. Mae hefyd yn

mineral planning authorities to safeguard resources for future generations and incorporates a map showing the distribution of land-based sand and gravel resources in south-east Wales.

This position statement sets out the policy that will be adopted to guide decisions until the outstanding draft policy documents are published in final form. For marine dredging, the most urgent decision relates to the renewal of the dredging licence for Nash bank. The draft marine policy document proposes a cautious approach to future dredging at Nash bank. While there is no evidence as yet that dredging has had any impact on the coast, this sandbank fulfils an important coastal defence function in relation to nearby beaches and cliffs. As a result of a careful assessment of research studies and monitoring data, I have thus concluded that there is a need for a gradual decline in extraction from Nash bank. It is proposed that dredging be terminated within five to 10 years, in order to maintain the crest height on that part of the sandbank, which is closest to the coast.

Regarding the concerns about the Helwick bank, we are working through the implications of consultation responses on this sandbank as well as assessing more research. Therefore, the position statement does not change the current draft policy for the Helwick bank.

The proposal to safeguard resources of sand and gravel in the Usk valley has raised strong objections from local residents. I have listened to their concerns, and confirm that land-based resources have not been identified to encourage exploitation. These will only be used if the resource is proven and where extraction is compatible with sustainable development. However, I believe that there is a continued need to safeguard sand and gravel resources in development plans.

Research may show a gap between what the local economy needs and what careful marine management or reuse of existing resources will deliver. To address this possibility, the existing regional technical group will work with the relevant local authorities to consider

ofynnol i awdurdodau cynllunio mwynau ddiogelu adnoddau ar gyfer cenedlaethau i ddod ac ymgorfforir map i ddangos dosbarthiad adnoddau tywod a graean o'r tir yn y De-ddwyrain.

Mae'r datganiad safbwynt hwn yn nodi'r polisi a gaiff ei fabwysiadu i lywio penderfyniadau hyd nes y bydd y dogfennau polisi drafft na phenderfynwyd arnynt eto yn cael eu cyhoeddi ar eu ffurf derfynol. Ar gyfer carthu morol mae'r penderfyniad pwysicaf yn ymwneud ag adfer y drwydded carthu ar gyfer banc Nash. Mae'r ddogfen polisi morol drafft yn argymhell ymagwedd ofalus tuag ar garthu ar fanc Nash. Er nad oes tystiolaeth hyd yn hyn bod carthu wedi effeithio ar yr arfordir, mae'r banc tywod hwn yn cyflawni swyddogaeth bwysig o ran amddiffyn yr arfordir, mewn perthynas â thraethau a chlogwyni cyfagos. O ganlyniad i asesiad gofalus o astudiaethau ymchwil a data fonitro, deuthum i'r casgliad felly bod angen lleihau'r cloddio o fanc Nash yn raddol. Cynigir bod carthu'n cael ei ddirwyn i ben o fewn pum i 10 mlynedd, er mwyn cynnal uchder brig y rhan honno o'r banc tywod, sydd agosaf at yr arfordir.

O ran y pryderon ynglŷn â banc Helwick, yr ydym yn gweithio drwy oblygiadau ymatebion ymgynghori ar y banc tywod hwn ynghyd ag asesu mwy o ymchwil. Felly, nid yw'r datganiad safbwynt yn newid y polisi drafft cyfredol ar gyfer banc Helwick.

Mae'r cynigion i ddiogelu adnoddau tywod a graean yn nyffryn afon Wysg wedi arwain at wrthwynebiadau cryf gan drigolion lleol. Yr wyf wedi gwrandao ar eu pryderon, a chadarnhaf na nodwyd adnoddau ar y tir i annog datblygiad yr adnoddau. Dim ond os bydd yr adnodd yn cael ei wireddu, a lle mae cloddio yn gydnaws â datblygiad cynaliadwy y caiff y rhain eu defnyddio. Fodd bynnag credaf fod angen parhaol i ddiogelu adnoddau tywod a graean mewn cynlluniau datblygu.

Efallai y bydd ymchwil yn dangos bwlch rhwng yr hyn sydd ei angen ar yr economi leol, a beth fydd rheoli morol gofalus neu ail ddefnydd o adnoddau presennol yn ei gyflawni. I ymdrin â'r posibilrwydd hwn, bydd y grŵp technegol rhanbarthol sy'n



areas from where extracting land-based sand and gravel would have the least environmental impact.

Research currently being undertaken by the Assembly Government on the best way to assess the demand and supply of land-based aggregates, and the future role to be played by the regional aggregates working parties in Wales, will be completed in spring 2003. This research will establish a way of assessing the environmental capacity of different areas of Wales to accommodate aggregates extraction.

The current Nash bank licence has been the subject of several short-term renewals and is due to end on 4 February 2003. My decision on this Government view on the licence renewal is based on the position statement, which I have issued today. The Government view indicates that dredging from Nash bank should continue for a further three years, with even more rigorous monitoring conditions and a gradual reduction in production over the following four years, leading to the end of dredging from Nash bank by February 2010.

A Government view on the Helwick bank licence is not imminent. It can only be finalised when the applicants submit all outstanding information and the environmental statement, coastal impact study, and relevant Assembly policy framework are available, which we currently forecast to be by the middle of next year. In the meantime, we are discussing a further research project with the City and County of Swansea Council to consider concerns about Port Eynon beach.

**Janet Davies:** I thank the Minister for her statement. I recognise that the supply of sand and gravel is a difficult issue because so many people want to use it, but do not want it to be extracted close to their own homes. Nevertheless, we must form a policy on this. Will you make a further statement next year, when you have more information on the research?

Your statement does not provide adequate

bodoli yn awr, yn gweithio gyda'r awdurdodau lleol perthnasol i ystyried ardaloedd lle y byddai cloddio tywod a graean o'r tir yn cael yr effaith amgylcheddol leiaf.

Bydd ymchwil sy'n cael ei wneud ar hyn o bryd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar y ffordd orau i asesu'r galw a'r cyflenwi ar gyfer cerrig mân o'r tir, a rôl y gweithgorau cerrig mân rhanbarthol yng Nghymru, yn cael ei chwblhau yng Ngwanwyn 2003. Bydd yr ymchwil hon yn sefydlu ffordd o asesu capasiti amgylcheddol gwahanol ardaloedd yng Nghymru i gynnwys cloddio cerrig mân.

Bu trwydded gyfredol banc Nash yn destun sawl adnewyddiad byrdymor ac mae disgwyl iddo ddod i ben ar 4 Chwefror 2003. Mae fy mhenderfyniad ar safbwynt y Llywodraeth ar adnewyddu'r drwydded wedi ei seilio ar y datganiad safbwynt a gyhoeddwyd gennyf heddiw. Dengys safbwynt y Llywodraeth y dylai carthu o fanc Nash barhau am dair blynedd arall, gydag amodau monitro mwy cadarn fyth a lleihad graddol mewn cynhyrchu dros y pedair blynedd ddilynol, gan arwain at ddirwyn carthu i ben o fanc Nash erbyn Chwefror 2010.

Ni cheir safbwynt gan y Llywodraeth ar drwydded banc Helwick yn fuan. Dim ond pan fydd yr ymgeiswyr wedi cyflwyno'r holl wybodaeth sydd eto'i ddod a phan fydd y datganiad amgylcheddol, astudiaeth effaith ar yr arfordir a fframwaith polisi perthnasol y Cynulliad ar gael, sef canol y flwyddyn nesaf yn ôl ein rhagolygon, y bydd yn derfynol. Yn y cyfamser yr ydym yn trafod prosiect ymchwil arall gyda Chyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe i ystyried pryderon am draeth Port Eion.

**Janet Davies:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad. Cydnabyddaf fod cyflenwi tywod a graean yn fater anodd oherwydd mae cymaint o bobl am eu defnyddio ond nid ydynt am iddynt gael eu cloddio ger eu cartrefi. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid inni lunio polisi ar hyn. A wnewch chi ddatganiad arall yn y flwyddyn newydd, pan fydd rhagor o wybodaeth am yr ymchwil gennyf?

Nid yw eich datganiad yn darparu

information on the Usk valley. It does not seem acceptable for local residents and businesses to be unsure of the situation. I accept that this site has been identified to safeguard the resource, not to exploit it, but do you feel that it is acceptable to safeguard a resource in this area, given that there is an indefinite time limit on it?

Turning to the Helwick bank, you say that you will not have information on this until the middle of next year, but the licence expires in June, which is the middle of next year. Therefore, when will you be able to make a decision on the licence? You may only have a few days or hours in which to do it.

Lastly, on the Nash bank, which is the big issue, you are extending the licence for three years, and phasing it out over another four years, which is the limit on the time for which the Nash bank can safely operate. Will you assure us that, along with strict monitoring, the licence will not be further extended?

**Sue Essex:** This has been a difficult, but important, way of progressing. We have carried out a huge amount of research and, last year, we issued the draft marine aggregate dredging policy, which set policy areas across the Bristol channel, in particular in the areas located in Wales. I mentioned revising the policy statement, by which I mean producing a final version of this statement. Therefore, the document that was produced last year should be in its final form by next summer. I will return to that point because there is more to say on the Usk valley.

3:20 p.m.

In terms of the Nash licence, the Government view is based on the available expert advice. If you listened carefully to what I said, the view is not formed on the basis that there is proven damage. Most people will be aware of the fact that this sandbank is located off the heritage coast of south Wales. We are concerned that the crest of this sandbank is being reduced. To date, the crest has had an important slowing effect on the fetch of waves as they reach the coast. The reason for

gwybodaeth ddigonol am ddyffryn afon Wysg. Nid yw'n ymddangos yn dderbyniol bod trigolion a busnesau lleol yn ansicr o'r sefyllfa. Derbyniaf fod y safle hwn wedi ei ddynodi i ddiogelu'r adnodd, nid i'w ddefnyddio, ond a gredwch ei bod yn dderbyniol diogelu adnodd yn yr ardal hon, o gofio bod terfyn amser amhenodol arno?

Gan droi at fanc Helwick, dywedwch na fydd gwybodaeth gennych ar hyn hyd ganol y flwyddyn nesaf, ond mae'r drwydded yn dod i ben ym mis Mehefin, ganol y flwyddyn nesaf. Felly, pryd byddwch yn gallu gwneud penderfynid ar y drwydded? Efallai mai dim ond ychydig ddyddiau neu oriau fydd gennych.

I gloi, ar fanc Nash, sef y mater o bwys, yr ydych yn ymestyn y drwydded am dair blynedd, ac yn ei therfynu'n raddol dros bedair blynedd arall, sef terfyn yr amser y gall banc Nash weithredu'n ddiogel. A wnewch chi ein sicrhau, ynghyd â monitro llym, na fydd y drwydded yn cael ei hymestyn ymhellach?

**Sue Essex:** Bu hwn yn ffordd anodd, ond pwysig, o ddatblygu. Cynhaliwyd llawer iawn o waith ymchwil gennym, a'r llynedd, cyhoeddwyd polisi carthu cerrig mân morol gennym, a bennodd ardaloedd polisi ar draws môr Hafren, yn arbennig yn yr ardaloedd yng Nghymru. Soniais am adolygu'r datganiad polisi, ac wrth hynny golygaf gynhyrchu fersiwn derfynol o'r datganiad hwn. Felly dylai'r ddogfen a gynhyrchwyd y llynedd fod ar ei ffurf derfynol erbyn haf nesaf. Byddaf yn dychwelyd at y pwynt hwnnw oherwydd mae mwy i'w ddweud am ddyffryn afon Wysg.

O ran trwydded Nash, seilir safbwynt y Llywodraeth ar y cyngor arbenigol sydd ar gael. Os gwnaethoch wrando'n astud ar yr hyn a ddywedais, nid yw'r safbwynt wedi ei llunio ar y sail bod difrod profedig. Bydd y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn ymwybodol bod y banc tywod hwn oddi ar arfordir treftadaeth y De. Yr ydym yn pryderu bod brig y banc tywod hwn yn lleihau. Hyd yma cafodd y brig effaith arafu pwysig ar gyrch y tonnau wrth iddynt gyrraedd yr arfordir. Y rheswm dros

this cautious approach is that that crest is being reduced; the danger is that wave impact could become much stronger and possibly cause coastal erosion on what is, as I said, a heritage coast. We have based our view on expert advice. We have recommended that the licence continue until 2010. That is what is stated in this statement, but we do not know what will happen then. Most people agree—as there has been concern on this issue for a long time—that this view is based on the best advice. The Crown Estate issues the licence. That is our thinking at the moment. That is why we have the policy base; the Government view will be in accordance with that.

On Helwick, the operator has not gone out to consultation on its environmental impact statement or the coastal impact study. Therefore, in terms of that licence's timescale, it is the general view that the operator would be severely pushing it to get that through by June. I do not believe that there will be a mismatch in terms of the timescale.

I do not agree with the comments that have been made on the Usk valley. I have been thinking carefully about this issue since I met Usk residents with David Davies and Huw Edwards MP a couple of weeks ago. The residents of Usk had prepared a substantial petition and wanted to come to the Assembly to present it. However, I said that it would be much easier for me to meet them in the Usk valley, rather than having coachloads of people come here. I listened carefully to what they said and I have taken many of their points on board, but there are important differences at stake. One such difference is safeguarding for sustainability, which is what we have not done in the past, partly because we have relied on marine aggregates for so long. In England, they have traditionally relied on land-based extraction and therefore, they have been safeguarding resources for many years. Safeguarding makes sense in terms of sustainability. I continue to stick to the principle of local authorities using the map that has been prepared.

However, I listened to what residents said.

yr ymagwedd bwylllog hon yw bod y brig yn cael ei leihau; y perygl yw y gallai effaith y tonnau ddod yn llawer cryfach ac o bosibl achosi erydu arfordirol ar yr hyn sydd, fel y dywedais yn arfordir treftadaeth. Seiliasom ein barn ar gyngor arbenigol. Yr ydym wedi argymhell bod y drwydded yn parhau tan 2010. Dyna a ddywedir yn y datganiad hwn ond ni wyddom beth fydd yn digwydd y pryd hwnnw. Cytuna'r rhan fwyaf o bobl—gan y bu pryder ynglŷn â'r mater hwn am amser hir—fod y farn hon wedi'i seilio ar y cyngor gorau. Ystad y Goron sy'n rhoi'r drwydded. Dyna'n tybiaeth ar hyn o bryd. Dyna paham bod gennym sail polisi; bydd barn y Llywodraeth yn unol â hynny.

O ran Helwick, nid yw'r gweithredwr wedi ymgynghori ar ei ddatganiad effaith amgylcheddol nac ar ei astudiaeth o'r effaith ar yr arfordir. Felly, o ran hyd y drwydded, y farn gyffredinol yw na fyddai'r gweithredwr yn llwyddo i gael y maen i'r wal erbyn Mehefin. Nid wyf yn credu y bydd camgymhariad o ran yr hyd.

Ni chytunaf â'r sylwadau a wnaed am ddyffryn afon Wysg. Bùm yn meddwl yn ofalus am y mater hwn ers imi gwrdd â thrigolion Brynbuga yng nghwmni David Davies a Huw Edwards AS rai wythnosau yn ôl. Yr oedd trigolion Brynbuga wedi paratoi deiseb sylweddol ac yr oeddent am ddod i'r Cynulliad i'w chyflwyno. Fodd bynnag, dywedais wrthynt y byddai'n llawer haws i mi gwrdd â hwy yn nyffryn afon Wysg yn hytrach na chael cannoedd o bobl yn dod yma. Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar yr hyn yr oedd ganddynt i'w ddweud ac yr wyf wedi ystyried llawer o'u pwyntiau, ond mae gwahaniaethau pwysig yn y fantol. Un o'r gwahaniaethau hyn yw diogelu ar gyfer cynaliadwyedd, peth na wnaethom yn y gorffennol, yn rhannol oherwydd ein bod wedi dibynnu ar gerrig mân morol am gyhyd. Yn Lloegr, maent yn draddodiadol wedi dibynnu ar gloddio o'r tir ac felly buont yn diogelu adnoddau am flynyddoedd lawer. Mae diogelu yn gwneud synnwyr o ran cynaliadwyedd. Parhaf i lynu wrth yr egwyddor fod awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio'r map a baratowyd.

Fodd bynnag, gwrandewais ar yr hyn a

The difference that exists now is that safeguarding does not correspond with exploitation—it was there before but we can strengthen it. We will be working with local authorities to prepare statements that make that point clear, to be included in unitary development plans. In addition—and I am sure that David Davies will want to talk about this—we will be carrying out further work to refine our definition of areas of possible land-based resources that do not interfere with environmentally sensitive areas. I will respond to the concerns of the residents of the Usk valley—and I am sure that people elsewhere have the same concerns—by saying that decoupling safeguarding and exploitation will give residents some degree of security.

**Val Lloyd:** I am sure that you will agree that the beaches of Swansea and Gower feature among Wales's greatest assets and tourist attractions. Erosion on those beaches is causing great concern to visitors and local people, especially in the Port Eynon area. I know that you are aware of the problem, as you visited the area recently at the invitation of Edwina Hart, the local Assembly Member. Different views are held as to the cause of the erosion. However, whatever the cause, the result is noticeable and is of concern to people across all the local constituencies. I welcome the further research study, and I hope that it will clarify the issue. Will you give some more information on the scope and range of the study that will be undertaken with Swansea council, and when it is expected to report?

**Sue Essex:** I have been to see the beauty of Port Eynon with Edwina Hart two years in a row, and I know it well. I understand why people, particularly those who are dependent on the tourism industry, or have holiday homes there, are concerned about the changes that have taken place at Port Eynon. Although the details have not been finalised with Swansea council, we have a considerable amount of data on changes, particularly on sand changes in the Port Eynon area, and we have some interpretation, but we do not have the full picture. There are differing views, as you said. We need some more research to fill the gaps and we must work with people to consider different

ddywedodd y trigolion. Y gwahaniaeth yn awr yw nad yw diogelu yn cyfateb â chloddio—yr oedd yno cyn hyn ond gallwn ei gryfhau. Byddwn yn gweithio gyda'r awdurdodau lleol i baratoi datganiadau sy'n gwneud y pwynt hwnnw'n eglur, i'w cynnwys yn y cynlluniau datblygu unedol. Yn ychwanegol—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd David Davies am siarad ynglŷn â hyn—byddwn yn gwneud gwaith pellach i fireinio ein diffiniad o ardaloedd sydd ag adnoddau tirol nad ydynt yn ymyrryd ag ardaloedd amgylcheddol sensitif. Byddaf yn ymateb i bryderon trigolion dyffryn afon Wysg—ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod gan bobl mewn mannau eraill yr un pryderon—drwy ddweud y bydd datgysylltu diogelu a chloddio yn rhoi rhyw fesur o ddiogelwch i'r trigolion.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod traethau Abertawe a Gŵyr ymhlith yr asedau a'r atyniadau mwyaf i ymwelwyr yng Nghymru. Mae erydiad ar y traethau hyn yn achosi pryder mawr i ymwelwyr a phobl leol, yn arbennig yn ardal Port Eynon. Gwn eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r broblem gan ichi ymweld â'r ardal yn ddiweddar ar gais Edwina Hart, yr Aelod Cynulliad lleol. Coleddir gwahanol farnau ar achos erydu. Fodd bynnag, beth bynnag yw'r achos, mae'r canlyniad yn amlwg i'w weld ac mae'n bryder i bobl ar draws yr etholaethau lleol i gyd. Croesawaf yr astudiaeth ymchwil bellach a gobeithiaf yn bydd yn egluro'r mater. A wnewch chi roi rhagor o wybodaeth ar gwmpas ac ystod yr astudiaeth a gaiff ei chynnal gan Gyngor Abertawe, a phryd mae disgwyl iddo roi ei adroddiad.

**Sue Essex:** Bùm i weld harddwch Port Eynon yng nghwmni Edwina Hart ddwy flynedd yn olynol, ac yr wyf yn gyfarwydd iawn â'r ardal. Gallaf ddeall pam mae pobl, yn arbennig y rhai sy'n dibynnu ar y diwydiant twristiaeth, neu sydd â chartrefi gwyliau yno, yn pryderu am y newidiadau sydd wedi digwydd ym Mhort Eynon. Er na chwblhawyd y manylion gyda chyngor Abertawe, mae gennym gryn dipyn o wybodaeth am y newidiadau, yn arbennig ar newidiadau tywod yn ardal Port Eynon, ac mae gennym rywffaint o eglurhad, ond nid yw'r darlun llawn gennym. Mae gwahanol farnau, fel y dywedasoeh. Rhaid wrth ragor o ymchwil i lanw'r bylchau a rhaid inni weithio

solutions. We have always struggled with the answers. Some people think the changes are due to dredging, others believe they are natural changes and others believe there may be peculiar or particular circumstances at Port Eynon. Having walked on many Gower beaches this summer, I have seen that Port Eynon is a unique case. It is the worst example by far of sand loss in that area. We need an explanation as to what has happened there, and a way forward must be found.

**David Davies:** You will not be surprised to hear that I am disappointed with your statement. I anticipated, along with many others, that following the thousands of representations and expressions of interest that you have received from people who are concerned about the effects of widespread quarrying on the Usk valley, that you might reconsider your decision to safeguard these areas. We are right to be concerned. You declared in your statement that you have listened to these concerns. However, you state clearly in one paragraph that where extraction is compatible with sustainable development, it will be used, although only if the resource is proven. I know that there is a caveat that you would not want that to happen but, by including paragraphs such as that, and by safeguarding these areas, you give developers the impression that there is a presumption in favour of quarrying. I assure you that if this goes ahead—and people have expressed an interest in this in my constituency office—they will put in planning applications. They will almost certainly be rejected by the local planning authority, and they will then come back on appeal to the National Assembly, where highly-paid planning consultants will argue with some conviction that because these areas have been set aside for quarrying, there is a presumption in favour of it.

In the following paragraph, you mention the existing regional technical group that will work with relevant local authorities to see where land-based sand and gravel could be extracted to cause the least environmental impact. There is no such place where it could happen with minimal environmental impact. However, I assure you that they will not be

gyda phobl i ystyried gwahanol atebion. Yr ydym bob amser wedi cael trafferth gyda'r atebion. Mae rhai pobl o'r farn bod y newidiadau yn ganlyniad carthu, mae eraill yn meddwl bod y newidiadau yn rhai naturiol ac eraill yn credu bod amgylchiadau hynod neu arbennig efallai ym Mhort Eynon. Wedi cerdded ar lawer o draethau Gŵyr yr haf hwn, yr wyf wedi gweld bod Port Eynon yn achos unigryw. Hon yw'r enghraifft waethaf o bell ffordd o golli tywod yn yr ardal honno. Rhaid inni gael eglurhad ynglŷn â'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yno a rhaid cael ffordd ymlaen.

**David Davies:** Ni fydd yn syndod i chi glywed fy mod yn siomedig gyda'ch datganiad. Rhagwelais, ynghyd â llawer arall, yn dilyn y miloedd o sylwadau a'r diddordeb a fynegwyd gan bobl sy'n pryderu am effaith cloddio cyffredinol yn nyffryn afon Wysg, y byddech efallai'n ailystyried eich penderfyniad i ddiogelu'r ardaloedd hyn. Yr ydym yn iawn i bryderu. Dywedasoeh yn eich datganiad eich bod wedi gwrandao ar y pryderon hyn. Fodd bynnag, dywedwch yn eglur mewn un paragraff y caiff gwaith cloddio ei wneud, lle mae'n gydnaws â datblygiad cynaliadwy, ond dim ond os yw'r adnodd wedi ei brofi. Gwn fod cafeat na fyddech yn dymuno i hynny ddigwydd ond, drwy gynnwys paragraffau megis y rheini, a thrwy ddiogelu'r ardaloedd hyn, rhowch yr argraff i ddatblygwyr fod rhagdybiaeth o blaid cloddio. Gallaf eich sicrhau os bydd hyn yn digwydd—ac mae pobl yn fy etholaeth wedi mynegi diddordeb yn hyn yn fy swyddfa etholaeth—byddant yn cyflwyno ceisiadau cynllunio. Byddant bron yn sicr o gael eu gwrthod gan yr awdurdod cynllunio lleol ac yna byddant yn dod yn ôl ar apêl i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, lle y bydd ymgynghorwyr cynllunio ar gyflogau uchel yn dadlau gyda pheth argyhoeddiad gan fod yr ardaloedd hynny wedi eu neilltuo ar gyfer cloddio, fod rhagdybiaeth o'i blaid.

Yn y paragraffau dilynol, soniwch am y grŵp technegol rhanbarthol sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd a fydd yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol perthnasol i weld ymhle y gallai tywod a graean gael eu cloddio i achosi'r effaith amgylcheddol leiaf. Nid oes unrhyw le y gallai ddigwydd gyda'r effaith amgylcheddol leiaf. Fodd bynnag, gallaf eich sicrhau,

keen to work with you, Minister. Monmouthshire County Council, one of the local planning authorities in the Usk valley, is against any form of safeguarding. I learnt today that Brecon Beacons National Park local planning authority stated that the ministerial statement on 18 December should make clear that the park is not expected to safeguard sites for sand and gravel extraction. You said that research into assessing aggregate demands would continue. I notice that some of that research will be finished after the election. I should not take a cynical view on that, but why was it not started earlier? Will you also confirm what research is ongoing to consider the link between sand loss and dredging on south Wales beaches?

I am also interested in beaches because, although I live in the Usk valley, I have surfed off south Wales beaches for nearly 15 years and I have seen that sand loss. However, I am not convinced that it is solely due to dredging. Much of the scientific research suggests that it is due to natural causes. There are people in Cardiff University who could research it for a small amount of money, and prove it conclusively. If you go ahead and safeguard these areas, planning applications will follow. The Usk valley is one of the most beautiful parts of the Welsh countryside and we do not want to see it desecrated by bulldozers and turned into a series of artificial lakes for jet-ski riders. That was one suggestion made by an Assembly planning official, who assured us that there would be no problem and that these places could be tidied up when quarrying takes place. We do not want quarrying to start in five days, five months, five years, 10 years or whatever. We do not want any quarrying in the Usk valley. It is one of the jewels in the crown of the Welsh countryside, and it must be preserved for future generations to enjoy.

3:30 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** I will answer some of your points, David. You keep using the word quarrying. Sand and gravel extraction is not quarrying as we know it. There is no

Weinidog, na fyddant yn awyddus i weithio gyda chi. Mae Cyngor Sir Mynwy, un o'r awdurdodau cynllunio lleol yn nyffryn Wysg, yn erbyn unrhyw fath o ddiogelu. Deallais heddiw fod awdurdod cynllunio lleol Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog wedi datgan y dylai'r datganiad gweinidogol ar 18 Rhagfyr egluro nad oes disgwyl i'r parc ddiogelu safleoedd cloddio am dywod a graean. Dywedasoeh y byddai ymchwil i asesu'r galw am gerrig mân yn parhau. Sylwaf y bydd peth o'r ymchwil wedi ei chwblhau ar ôl yr etholiad. Ni ddylwn arddel barn sinigaidd ar hynny, ond pam na chafodd ei ddechrau ynghynt? A wnewch chi hefyd gadarnhau pa ymchwil sy'n parhau i ystyried y cyswllt sydd rhwng colli tywod a threillio ar draethau'r De?

Mae gennyf ddiddordeb hefyd mewn traethau oherwydd, er fy mod yn byw yn nyffryn afon Wysg, yr wyf wedi syrffio oddi ar draethau'r De am bron i 15 mlynedd ac yr wyf wedi gweld y tywod hwnnw'n diflannu. Fodd bynnag nid wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi ei fod o ganlyniad i dreillio yn unig. Mae llawer o'r ymchwil wyddonol yn awgrymu ei fod o ganlyniad i achosion naturiol. Mae pobl ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd a allai ymchwilio iddo am swm bach o arian, a'i brofi yn derfynol. Os ewch ymlaen a diogelu'r ardaloedd hyn, bydd ceisiadau cynllunio yn dilyn. Mae dyffryn Wysg yn un o rannau harddaf cefn gwlad Cymru ac nid ydym am ei gweld yn cael ei difrodi gan deirw dur a'i throi yn gyfres o lynnoedd artiffisial ar gyfer gyrwyr jetiau sgïo. Dyna un awgrym a wnaed gan swyddog cynllunio yn y Cynulliad a'm sicrhodd na fyddai unrhyw broblem ac y byddai'r lleoedd hynny yn cael eu tacluso wrth chwarela. Nid ydym am weld chwarela'n dechrau ymhen pum niwrnod, pum mis, pum mlynedd, 10 mlynedd neu beth bynnag. Nid ydym am weld unrhyw chwarela yn nyffryn Afon Wysg. Mae'n un o ragoriaethau cefn gwlad Cymru, ac mae'n rhaid ei ddiogelu er mwyn i genedlaethau'r dyfodol ei fwynhau.

**Sue Essex:** Atebaf rai o'ch pwyntiau David. Yr ydych yn defnyddio'r gair 'chwarela' drwy'r amser Nid yw cloddio tywod a graean yn chwarela fel yr ydym ni yn ei ddeall. Nid

presumption in favour of land-based extraction. If you read my statement and the full position statement carefully, you will see a presumption in favour of marine sand extraction. However, marine sand extraction will, over time, be moved to more westerly areas, where evidence shows that sand that has been extracted is replaced. Therefore, moving dredging away from the shoreline, out to deeper areas is the sensible way forward.

We can only use our best judgment, in line with expert advice. Over time, there may well be a small gap between the supply of sand coming from marine-based supplies—and the development is in the hands of commercial operators—and the demand for it in south Wales. Interestingly, the demand for sand has stayed constant; there is no current evidence that it will increase. Therefore, we can be reasonably certain that we can work together with the regional aggregates working parties to try to get that balance right. If there is a small gap between supply and demand, land-based extraction supplies in south Wales may have to be used, but that does not mean that safeguarded areas will automatically be exploited.

When I met people in the Usk valley, to the best of my memory, everyone sitting around the table—and I think even you, David—accepted that there is a real difference in safeguarding resources in terms of sustainability. We all sit in the Chamber and agree on sustainable development, but it actually means safeguarding ‘one and only’ supplies. I could put it like this: God does not make these supplies anymore, so it makes sense to safeguard them. We have not done so in the past. Evidence shows that housing development has taken place in large areas of south Wales where resources are limited. Therefore, the first point is safeguarding, but it will not mean exploiting the Usk valley, nor will it infer any automatic development. We will work with local authorities to ensure that unitary development plans are worded appropriately, showing that there is a presumption against land-based extraction. Other conditions and qualifications will also be included in those plans, such as environmentally sensitive proposals.

oes unrhyw ragdybiaeth o blaid cloddio o'r tir. Os y darllenwch fy natganiad a'r datganiad safbwynt llawn yn ofalus, fe welwch ragdybiaeth o blaid cloddio tywod morol. Fodd bynnag, bydd cloddio tywod morol yn symud i ardaloedd mwy gorllewinol lle y dengys tystiolaeth fod tywod newydd yn dod yn lle'r tywod a gloddiwyd. Felly, symud carthu i ffwrdd o'r traethlin, allan i fannau dyfnach yw'r ffordd gall ymlaen.

Ni allwn ond defnyddio ein doethineb, yn unol â chyngor arbenigol. Dros amser, gall y bydd bwlch bychan rhwng y cyflenwad o dywod sy'n dod o gyflenwadau morol—ac mae'r datblygiad yn nwylo gweithredwyr masnachol—a'r galw amdano yn y De. Yn ddiddorol, bu'r galw am dywod yn gyson; nid oes unrhyw dystiolaeth ar hyn o bryd y bydd yn cynyddu. Felly, gallwn fod yn rhesymol sicr y gallwn weithio ar y cyd â gweithgorau cerrig mân rhanbarthol i geisio cael y cydbwysedd cywir. Os oes bwlch bychan rhwng cyflenwi a galw, efallai y bydd yn rhaid cloddio o'r tir yn y De, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu y bydd ardaloedd a ddiogelir yn cael eu defnyddio yn awtomatig.

Pan gyfarfûm â phobl yn nyffryn Wysg, os cofiaf yn iawn, derbyniodd pawb oedd yn eistedd o gwmpas y bwrdd—a hyd yn oed chi David fe gredaf—bod gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol mewn diogelu adnoddau o ran cynaliadwyedd. Mae pob un ohonom yn eistedd yn y Siambr ac yn cytuno ar ddatblygiad cynaliadwy, ond mewn gwirionedd mae'n golygu diogelu cyflenwadau ‘un yn unig’. Gallwn ei egluro fel hyn: Nid yw Duw yn gwneud y cyflenwadau hyn bellach, felly mae'n ddoeth eu diogelu. Ni wnaethom hynny yn y gorffennol. Dengys tystiolaeth fod datblygiadau tai wedi digwydd mewn rhannau helaeth o'r De lle mae adnoddau'n brin. Felly y pwynt cyntaf yw diogelu, ond ni fydd yn golygu camddefnyddio dyffryn afon Wysg nac yn awgrymu unrhyw ddatblygiad awtomatig. Byddwn yn gweithio gyda'n hawdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod cynlluniau datblygu unedol yn cael eu geirio'n briodol, gan ddangos bod rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn cloddio o'r tir. Caiff amodau a chymwysterau eraill eu cynnwys yn y cynlluniau hynny

Last week, I spoke to the leader of Monmouthshire council, who understood exactly what we are trying to do. I agree that the Usk valley is a lovely area of Wales and I do not want to see it exploited or lose its character. With careful dialogue between local authorities and the regional aggregates working parties, we can possibly identify areas in south Wales where we can find the resources properly because, currently, it is only a coarse sieve. Perhaps we can find areas without the environmental damage that you described in the Usk valley.

I do not want anyone to think that we have not listened; I have. From my discussions with the council, there was a real distinction—and people around the table at that meeting in Usk understood that—between putting lines on maps showing areas that need to be safeguarded for sustainability purposes, and exploitation. We can find the form of words to be included in unitary development plans. In my view, it will offset the worries and fears of the residents I met last week.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Minister, I also welcome your statement on what is a complex and contentious challenge for us all. During the last 10 years, dredging in the Bristol channel has steadily increased. Sand is now extracted in large quantities, while the sand levels on the beaches on the Gower and at Porthcawl have dropped significantly. Have you considered establishing a 10-mile exclusion zone around this coastline, as far as dredging is concerned?

**Sue Essex:** I am not sure where 10 miles would get us; we might well reach Somerset or Devon. There were not many comments on that from the English authorities, but they were worried about our policy impacting on their areas.

The whole point is that this has been scientifically evaluated, and it is the first

hefyd, megis cynigion amgylcheddol sensitif.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, siaradais ag arweinydd cyngor Sir Fynwy, a ddeallai yn union beth yr ydym yn ceisio ei wneud. Yr wyf yn cytuno bod dyffryn afon Wysg yn ardal hyfryd o Gymru, ac nid wyf am ei gweld yn cael ei chamddefnyddio nac yn colli ei chymeriad. Gyda deialog gofalus rhwng yr awdurdodau lleol a'r gweithgorau cerrig mân rhanbarthol, efallai y gallwn ddynodi ardaloedd yn y De, lle y gallwn ddarganfod yr adnoddau yn y ffordd gywir oherwydd, ar hyn o bryd, rhidyll eithaf bras ydyw. Efallai y gallwn ddarganfod ardaloedd heb y difrod amgylcheddol a ddisgrifiwch yn nyffryn Wysg.

Nid wyf am i neb feddwl nad ydym wedi gwranddo; yr wyf wedi gwranddo. O'm trafodaethau gyda'r cyngor, yr oedd gwahaniaeth pendant clir—ac yr oedd pobl o amgylch y bwrdd yn y cyfarfod hwnnw ym Mrynbuga yn deall hynny—rhwng rhoi llinellau ar fap yn dangos ardaloedd y mae angen eu diogelu at ddibenion cynaliadwyedd, a chamddefnyddio. Gallwn ddod o hyd i ffurf ar eiriau i'w cynnwys mewn cynlluniau datblygu unedol. Yn fy marn i, bydd yn lleddfu gofidiau a phryderon y trigolion y cyfarfûm â hwy yr wythnos diwethaf.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Weinidog, croesawaf innau eich datganiad am yr hyn sydd yn her gymhleth a dadleuol inni i gyd. Yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, mae carthu ym môr Hafren wedi cynyddu'n gyson. Caiff tywod ei gloddio mewn meintiau mawr, tra bod y lefelau tywod ar draethau Gŵyr a Phorthcawl wedi gostwng yn sylweddol. A ydych wedi ystyried sefydlu parth gwaharddedig 10 milltir o hyd ar hyd yr arfordir hwn, o ran carthu?

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn siŵr beth fyddai goblygiadau 10 milltir; gallem gyrraedd Gwlad yr Haf neu Ddyfnaint. Ni chafwyd llawer o sylwadau ar hynny gan yr awdurdodau yn Lloegr, ond yr oeddent yn gofidio y gallai ein polisi effeithio ar eu hardaloedd hwy

Yr holl bwynt yw bod hyn wedi cael ei werthuso yn wyddonol a dyma'r tro cyntaf,



time, to my knowledge, that it has been done in such a detailed way. We must make robust policy decisions, so that we can defend them against any challenges. That policy is based on a considerable amount of scientific research and data collection. Our draft policy last year, identifying policy issues relating to sediment areas within the Bristol channel, was based on that information. If somebody wishes to challenge it, we can defend it. It is much better to do it that way and following the natural areas of the Bristol channel, rather than enforce a mileage exclusion, which would not be defensible.

**Nick Bourne:** Thank you for the position paper. I will ask a specific question in relation to the policy in the Brecon Beacons National Park. As you know, a Symonds Group report on national parks, which was commissioned by the National Assembly in 2000, instructed that 16 areas should be protected within the Brecon Beacons National Park for possible extraction of sand and gravel in the future. When combined, the areas that lie in the Usk valley, between Sennybridge and Gilwern, are equal in size to the town of Brecon. Part of that area is recognised by CADW and the Countryside Council for Wales as archeologically important and diverse, and spans Roman and later periods. The majority of the proposed sites adjoin a special conservation area. Your statement does not clarify the policy in relation to mineral extraction within the national park. Will you state that it is only in cases where national need can be demonstrated that it should go ahead in those areas? There is confusion within the park about the policy of mineral extraction, and it concerns local people. I have received many representations from people in Crickhowell in relation to the Llanfair quarry. Will you clarify the policy within the national park?

**Sue Essex:** I will consider your point. I know of no representations on the national park, although they might have been received in the department. However, to reassure you, we are considering a staged process. The plan was produced by Professor Pethig, but I emphasise that we are not necessarily following exactly the recommendation in his

hyd y gwn i, iddo gael ei wneud mewn modd mor fanwl. Mae'n rhaid inni wneud penderfyniadau polisi cadarn, fel y gallwn eu hamddiffyn rhag unrhyw her. Seilir y polisi hwnnw ar lawer o ymchwil wyddonol a chasglu data. Seiliwyd ein polisi drafft y llynedd, yn dynodi materion polisi yn ymwneud ag ardaloedd gwaddodi o fewn môr Hafren, ar y wybodaeth honno. Os bydd rhywun yn dymuno ei herio gallwn ei amddiffyn. Mae'n llawer gwell ei wneud yn y modd hwn a dilyn ardaloedd naturiol môr Hafren yn hytrach na gorfodi gwaharddiad ar sail milltiroedd na fyddai'n amddiffynadwy.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolch i chi am eich papur safbwynt. Gofynnaf gwestiwn penodol mewn perthynas â'r polisi ym Mharc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog. Fel y gwyddoch, gorchmynnodd adroddiad gan Grŵp Symonds ar barciau cenedlaethol, a gomisiynwyd gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn 2000, y dylai 16 o ardaloedd gael eu diogelu o fewn Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog ar gyfer cloddio tywod a graean posibl yn y dyfodol. Pan y'u cyfunir, mae'r ardaloedd hynny yn nyffryn afon Wysg, rhwng Pontsenni a Gilwern, gymaint â thref Aberhonddu. Cydnabyddir rhan o'r ardal honno gan CADW a Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru fel ardal bwysig ac amrywiol yn archeolegol, ac mae'n rhychwantu'r cyfnodau Rhufeinig a diweddarach. Mae'r mwyafrif o'r safleoedd a gynigir yn cyffinio ag ardal gadwraeth arbennig. Nid yw eich datganiad yn esbonio'r polisi o ran cloddio mwynau o fewn y parc cenedlaethol. A wnewch chi ddatgan mai dim ond lle y gellir dangos angen cenedlaethol y dylid bwrw ymlaen ag ef yn yr ardaloedd hynny? Mae dryswch o fewn y parc ynglŷn â'r polisi ar gloddio mwynau, ac mae'n gofidio'r bobl leol. Yr wyf wedi derbyn llawer o sylwadau gan bobl yng Nghrucywel ynglŷn â chwarel Llanfair. A wnewch chi esbonio'r polisi o fewn y parc cenedlaethol?

**Sue Essex:** Rhoddaf ystyriaeth i'ch pwynt. Ni wn am unrhyw sylwadau ar y parc cenedlaethol, er y gallant fod wedi eu derbyn yn yr adran. Fodd bynnag, i dawelu eich meddwl, yr ydym yn ystyried proses fesul cam. Cynhyrchwyd y cynllun gan yr Athro Pethig, ond pwysleisiaf nad ydym o angenrheidrwydd yn dilyn yr argymhellion

report, which links defining the areas with exploitation. That is an important message. It is critical that the second sieve is achieved to take out the kind of areas to which you refer, where there are important environmental and historical considerations. It would be contrary to the spirit of sustainability if those areas that are environmentally and historically precious were affected. Much more refining work needs to be done on the original lines on the maps, which were produced in the report. However, I will clarify that point later, Nick.

**Ron Davies:** Will the Minister confirm that there is no scientific evidence to link the dredging in the Severn estuary with the loss of sand on beaches such as Oxwich and Port Eynon? Are you aware of an imaginative sand replenishment programme, which has been carried out for some time by your counterparts in England in the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs? Would it not help your investigations to start a similar experimental programme of sand replenishment on beaches such as Port Eynon or Oxwich? If that work was carried out at the same time that dredging work was allowed to continue at Nash bank, there would be a further opportunity to test whether or not there is a link between sand dredging and beach erosion?

**Sue Essex:** The decision that has been taken on Nash bank was based upon potential damage to the heritage coast. I have discussed the possibility of replenishment in the Port Eynon area with my team. However, that is not a straightforward panacea. We need to know exactly what we are doing and the possible results. That will come out of the Port Eynon study and work that has been done elsewhere will be considered. I would be glad to take your advice on other studies, and to consider other options of getting the sand quality that local people and visitors want in Gower.

**William Graham:** I am happy with some of your replies, particularly against land-based extraction. I know that you are aware of the feelings in the lower Usk valley, in the Rumney valley and the lower afon Llwyd valley—all of which are identified as areas of

yn ei adroddiad yn llwyr, sydd yn cysylltu diffinio'r ardaloedd â datblygu mwynau. Mae honno'n neges bwysig. Mae'n hanfodol cael ail-hidlo i amddiffyn y math o ardaloedd y cyfeiriwch atynt, lle y ceir ystyriaethau amgylcheddol a hanesyddol pwysig. Byddai'n groes i ysbryd cynaliadwyedd pe effeithid ar yr ardaloedd hynny sydd yn werthfawr yn amgylcheddol ac yn hanesyddol. Mae angen gwneud llawer iawn mwy o waith mireinio ar y llinellau gwreiddiol ar y mapiau, a gynhyrchwyd yn yr adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, egluraf y pwynt hwnnw yn ddiweddarach, Nick.

**Ron Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau nad oes tystiolaeth wyddonol i gysylltu carthu yn aber afon Hafren â cholli tywod ar draethau megis Oxwich a Phort Eynon? A ydych yn ymwybodol o raglen adfer tywod, y mae swyddogion cyfatebol yn Lloegr yn Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig wedi bod yn ei chynnal ers peth amser? Oni fyddai'n helpu eich ymchwiliadau pe baech yn dechrau rhaglen arbrofol debyg o adfer tywod ar draethau megis Port Eynon ac Oxwich? Pe bai'r gwaith hwnnw'n digwydd yr un pryd ag y caniatwyd i waith carthu barhau ar fanc Nash, byddai cyfle pellach i brofi a oes cyswllt rhwng carthu am dywod ac erydiad traethau?

**Sue Essex:** Seiliwyd y penderfyniad y daethpwyd iddo ar fanc Nash ar ddifrod posibl i'r arfordir treftadaeth. Yr wyf wedi trafod y posibilrwydd o ailgyflenwi yn ardal Port Eynon gyda'm tîm. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n ateb i bob problem. Mae angen inni wybod yn iawn beth yr ydym yn ei wneud a'r canlyniadau posibl. Daw hynny o'r astudiaeth ar Bort Eynon a bydd gwaith a wnaed mewn manau eraill yn cael ei ystyried. Byddwn yn falch i gymryd eich cyngor ar astudiaethau eraill, ac i ystyried opsiynau eraill o greu'r ansawdd tywod y mae'r bobl leol a'r ymwelwyr am ei gael yng Ngŵyr.

**William Graham:** Yr wyf yn fodlon ar rai o'ch atebion, yn enwedig yn erbyn cloddio ar y tir. Gwn eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r teimladau yn rhan isaf dyffryn Wysg, yng nghwm Rhymni a dyffryn isaf afon Llwyd—y mae pob un ohonynt wedi eu dynodi yn

possible gravel extraction. Is it not possible that the banks on the Severn estuary may well rebuild within a longer period? They should have ample opportunity to do so, and I welcome the comments in your statement. A year ago, during extreme weather conditions of flooding, the tremendous volumes of water running downstream were a plus for Newport and Cardiff as no dredging was required for ships to navigate their ports.

3:40 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** I hope that I said, and I certainly meant to say, that our statement presumes that the supply would mainly come from marine-based sources. We are encouraging the industry to look at resources away from the shore, where sand is in a valley as opposed to under a hill, and develop those. The situation in the Bristol channel is complex. The general view is that more sand is being taken from the channel than is replenished. There is a general push out from east to west and back, so it is the banks at the eastern end of the channel that seem to suffer most. Therefore, the replenishment is less than the sand that is lost. It is a complex marine environment. Who knows what climate change will do, but you are right to say that we have seen instances of beaches literally disappearing overnight over the last few years. One was in south Tenby that almost disappeared overnight. However, it did return with subsequent tides. We can only work on what we know. We will continue to monitor and research, and the more we refine our knowledge, the better it will be. I have said this before: nature is nature. In whatever we do, we must be aware that there are forces stronger than we are.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are out of time for this statement. However, I will call two Members if the questions and the answers are brief.

**Brian Gibbons:** First—and you touched on this—a historic review, going back many decades if not hundreds of years, would be useful to illuminate the sand movements along the south Wales coast. Secondly, the completion date of the Port Eynon study is

ardaloedd cloddio graean posibl. Onid yw'n bosibl y bydd glannau aber afon Hafren yn ailffurfio o fewn cyfnod hwy? Dylent gael digon o gyfle i wneud hynny, a chrosawaf y sylwadau yn eich datganiad. Flwyddyn yn ôl yn ystod llifogydd ofnadwy, yr oedd y llif enfawr o ddŵr a redodd i lawr yr afon o fantais i Gasnewydd a Chaerdydd gan nad oedd angen carthu er mwyn i longau fordwyo i'w porthladdoedd.

**Sue Essex:** Gobeithiaf fy mod wedi dweud, ac yn sicr bwriedais ddweud, fod ein datganiad yn rhagdybio y bydd y cyflenwad yn dod yn bennaf o ffynonellau morol. Yr ydym yn annog y diwydiant i edrych ar adnoddau oddi ar y lan, lle mae tywod mewn pant o'i gymharu ag o dan fryn, a'u datblygu. Mae'r sefyllfa ym môr Hafren yn gymhleth. Y farn gyffredinol yw bod mwy o dywod yn cael ei godi o'r sianel nag sy'n cael ei roi yn ôl. Mae gwthiad cyffredinol o'r dwyrain i'r gorllewin ac yn ôl, felly, mae'n ymddangos mai'r glannau ar ben dwyreiniol y sianel sy'n dioddef waethaf. Felly mae'r ailgyflenwi yn llai na'r tywod a gollir. Mae'n amgylchedd morol cymhleth. Pwy a ŵyr beth a wnaiff y newid yn yr hinsawdd, ond yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud ein bod wedi gweld enghreifftiau o draethau yn diflannu'n llythrennol dros nos dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Yr oedd un yn ne Dinbych-y-Pysgod a ddiflannodd bron dros nos. Fodd bynnag fe ddychwelodd gyda'r llanw dilynol. Dim ond ar yr hyn a wyddom y gallwn weithio. Byddwn yn parhau i fonitro ac ymchwilio, a po fwyaf y mireiniwn ein gwybodaeth, gorau oll fydd hi. Dywedais hyn o'r blaen: natur yw natur. Beth bynnag a wnawn, rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol fod grymoedd sy'n drech na ni.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Daeth yr amser ar gyfer y datganiad hwn i ben. Fodd bynnag, galwaf ar ddau Aelod os yw'r cwestiynau a'r atebion yn fyr.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn gyntaf—a gwnaethoch sôn am hyn—byddai adolygiad hanesyddol, yn mynd yn ôl, dros lawer o ddegawdau os nad cannoedd o flynyddoedd, yn ddefnyddiol i ddangos symudiadau tywod ar hyd arfordir y De. Yn ail, mae dyddiad cwblhau

important because that is the area of concern. If we had answers to that I am sure that they would either reassure or raise further concerns.

**Sue Essex:** I cannot give you a date for Port Eynon because we must agree that with Swansea council. However, as soon as I know, I will let you know. On the historical view, we have reasonably good data in south Wales since we have had dredging off the coast. However, in terms of hundreds of years, we cannot give an accurate picture. All you can do is read historical accounts, which are quite interesting as they will show that, despite what we think, there have been enormous fluctuations and changes in our coastline.

**Kirsty Williams:** Does not the prospect of exploiting land resources sit uncomfortably with the role and remit of the Brecon Beacons National Park? Will you write to concerned community councils in the area, such as Talybont on Usk, Llangynidr and Aberysgir, to set their minds at rest that no large-scale exploitation of resources along stretches of the Usk is intended?

**Sue Essex:** If that is their impression, then I will gladly to write to them.

astudiaeth Port Eion yn bwysig oherwydd honno yw'r ardal lle mae pryder. Pe bai gennym atebion i hynny yr wyf yn siwr y byddent naill ai'n tawelu meddyliau neu'n codi pryderon pellach.

**Sue Essex:** Ni allaf roi dyddiad i chi ar gyfer Port Eion oherwydd mae'n rhaid inni gytuno ar hynny gyda chyngor Abertawe. Fodd bynnag, cyn gynted ag y byddaf yn gwybod, rhoddaf wybod i chi. O ran y farn hanesyddol, mae gennym ddata eithaf da yn y De ers inni ddechrau carthu oddi ar yr arfordir. Fodd bynnag, o ran cannoedd o flynyddoedd, ni allwn roi darlun cywir. Yr unig beth y gallwch ei wneud yw darllen disgrifiadau hanesyddol, sydd yn eithaf diddorol, oherwydd dangosant, er gwaethaf yr hyn a gredwn, fod amrywiadau a newidiadau enfawr wedi digwydd i'n harfordir.

**Kirsty Williams:** Onid yw'r posibilrwydd o ddatblygu adnoddau ar y tir yn groes i rôl a chylch gorchwyl Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog? A wnewch chi ysgrifennu at gynghorau cymuned sy'n pryderu yn yr ardal, megis Talybont ar Wysg, Llangynidr ac Aberysgir, i dawelu eu meddyliau nad oes unrhyw fwriad i ddatblygu adnoddau ar raddfa fawr ar hyd darnau o afon Wysg?

**Sue Essex:** Os mai dyna yw'r argraff a gawsant, bydd yn dda gennyf ysgrifennu atynt.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Point of order. I have reflected on your response yesterday to my point of order of last week on the Plenary vote which defeated the motion remitting Bills to Subject Committees as part of the Queen's Speech debate. I have consulted the relevant Standing Order, and I am sure that you are aware, Presiding Officer, that the Standing Order under which that debate is conducted was agreed by the committee that reviewed our Standing Orders. All parties agreed to that. The original Standing Order was No. 6.5(vii), which states that, annually, there should be a debate with the Secretary of State for Wales on the Government's

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Yr wyf wedi bod yn meddwl am eich ymateb ddoe i'm pwynt o drefn ar y bleidlais yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf a orchfygodd y cynnig a oedd yn ailgyfeirio Mesurau i Bwyllgorau Pwnc fel rhan o'r ddadl ar Araith y Frenhines. Yr wyf wedi edrych ar y Rheol Sefydlog berthnasol, ac yr wyf yn siwr eich bod yn ymwybodol, Lywydd, i'r Pwyllgor a adolygodd ein Rheolau Sefydlog gytuno ar y Rheol Sefydlog y cynhelir y ddadl honno oddi tani. Cytunodd pob plaid ar hynny. Y Rheol Sefydlog wreiddiol oedd Rhif. 6.5 (vii), sy'n datgan y dylid cynnal dadl yn flynyddol

legislative programme. Subsequently, the review committee proposed an addition, which was agreed in Plenary.

'The motion for that debate shall remit bills and proposals for bills of particular importance to Wales to the relevant subject committees for further consideration and report'.

The second part of the Standing Order cannot be complied with because the Government has defeated its own motion. We are entitled to an explanation from the Government on what it intends to do. I refer you to point 1.6 of the Ministerial Code:

'Ministers, in common with all other Members of the Assembly, are bound by its Standing Orders...They must therefore adhere at all times to the requirements the Assembly has itself laid down and must be prepared to justify their conduct to the Assembly and the public.'

My reading of the Standing Order and the Ministerial Code is that the least that the Assembly can expect is a statement from the Business Minister on how he now intends to comply with the Standing Orders with which the Government and Members must also comply.

I have read your response, Presiding Officer, and in the second part of your statement, you say that Committees remain free, under Standing Order No. 9.8(i), to advise on proposed primary legislation. However, the Standing Order is not permissive; it is an instruction, and only through Plenary can the Assembly instruct Committees to remit Bills. Failing to comply with Standing Order No. 6.5(vii) would mean that we could not comply with Standing Order No. 6.5(iv) because that states that time will be made available for

'debates on reports submitted by subject committees, including reports on the outcome of consideration of bills remitted by plenary'.

gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar raglen ddeddfwriaethol y Llywodraeth. Yn dilyn hynny, cynigiodd y pwyllgor adolygu ychwanegiad a gafodd ei gytuno yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

Bydd y cynnig ar gyfer y ddadl honno yn cyfeirio mesurau a chynigion ar gyfer mesurau o bwys penodol i Gymru i'r pwyllgorau pwnc perthnasol i'w hystyried ymhellach ac i adrodd arnynt.

Ni ellir cydymffurfio ag ail ran y Rheol Sefydlog oherwydd i'r Llywodraeth orchfygu ei chynnig ei hun. Mae gennym hawl i esboniad oddi wrth y Llywodraeth ar beth y bwriada ei wneud. Fe'ch cyfeiriau at bwynt 1.6 o'r Cod i'r Gweinidogion.

'Mae'r Gweinidogion, ar y cyd â holl Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad...Gan hynny, rhaid iddynt lynu bob amser at y gofynion y mae'r Cynulliad ei hun wedi'u pennu a rhaid iddynt fod yn fodlon cyfiawnhau eu hymddygiad i'r Cynulliad ac i'r cyhoedd.'

Fy nealltwriaeth i o'r Rheol Sefydlog a'r Cod i'r Gweinidogion yw y gall y Cynulliad o leiaf ddisgwyl datganiad gan y Trefnydd i ddangos sut y bwriada gydymffurfio â'r Rheolau Sefydlog y mae angen i'r Llywodraeth a'r Aelodau hefyd gydymffurfio â hwy.

Darllenais eich ymateb, Lywydd, ac yn ail ran eich datganiad, dywedwch fod Pwyllgorau yn parhau'n rhydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 9.8(i), i gynghori ar ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol arfaethedig. Fodd bynnag nid yw'r Rheol Sefydlog yn ganiataol; cyfarwyddyd ydyw, a dim ond drwy Gyfarfod Llawn y gall y Cynulliad orchymyn i Bwyllgorau ailgyfeirio Mesurau. Mae methiant i gydymffurfio â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.5(iv) yn golygu na fyddai modd inni gydymffurfio â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.5(iv) oherwydd mae hwnnw'n datgan y caiff amser ei neilltuo ar gyfer

dadleuon ar adroddiadau a gyflwynir gan bwyllgorau pwnc, gan gynnwys adroddiadau ar ganlyniad ystyried mesurau a drosglwyddwyd gan gyfarfod llawn.

Therefore, we may be in breach of two parts of that Standing Order. I ask you to reflect on this because it is vital that we know what the Government intends to do to remedy this breach on our return in the new year.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have listened carefully to what the leader of the opposition has said, and it follows last week's exchanges. The Standing Order, as has been pointed out, requires the Assembly to hold an annual debate with the Secretary of State, and, as has also been pointed out, requires the Assembly to propose a motion to debate the remittance of Bills, and proposals for Bills, to the relevant Subject Committee for further consideration. Those are requirements of Standing Order No. 6.5(vii), and that debate took place on 11 December. However, the motion to remit and propose the Bills was defeated. Therefore, in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.5(iv), as the leader of the opposition has divined, there can be no Plenary debates on reports submitted by Subject Committees, or the outcome of their consideration of Bills remitted to them by Plenary, because no Bills have been remitted. However, I do not consider this to be a breach of Standing Orders because, clearly, if no Bills have been remitted, there can be no debate. The Assembly has decided by resolution that this will not take place. The Standing Orders that enable Plenary to remit Bills to Subject Committees for ease of consideration were introduced to reflect all-party agreement in the Assembly review of procedure. The review stated:

'We are of the strong view that the Assembly needs to have the maximum possible input into primary legislation brought before Parliament.'

The Assembly unanimously approved the report of the review, which contained proposals to strengthen our procedures, and the relevant Standing Orders were introduced in November 2002, in time for the debate on the Queen's Speech. However, although the procedures to enable the Assembly to remit Bills to Committee are in place, it requires the will of the Assembly to make use of

Felly, gallem fod yn torri dwy ran o'r Rheol Sefydlog honno. Gofynnaf ichi feddwl am hyn oherwydd mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn gwybod beth y bwriada'r Llywodraeth ei wneud i gywiro'r tor-rheol hwn pan ddychwelwn yn y flwyddyn newydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar yr hyn a ddywedodd arweinydd yr wrthblaid, ac mae'n dilyn trafodaethau'r wythnos diwethaf. Mae'r Rheol Sefydlog, fel y nodwyd, yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r Cynulliad gynnal dadl flynyddol gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, ac, fel y nodwyd hefyd, yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r Cynulliad gyflwyno cynnig i drafod ailgyfeirio'r Mesurau, a chynigion am Fesurau i'r Pwyllgor Pwnc Perthnasol i'w hystyried ymhellach. Dyna yw gofynion Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.5(vii), a chynhaliwyd y ddadl honno ar 11 Rhagfyr. Fodd bynnag gorchfygwyd y cynnig i ailgyfeirio a chynnig y Mesurau. Felly, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.5(iv), fel y daroganodd arweinydd yr wrthblaid, ni ellir cynnal dadleuon mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn ar adroddiadau a gyflwynwyd gan Bwyllgorau Pwnc, na chanlyniad eu hystyriaeth o Fesurau a ailgyfeiriwyd atynt gan y Cyfarfod Llawn, oherwydd nid ailgyfeiriwyd Fesurau. Fodd bynnag nid ystyriaf hyn i fod yn dor-rheol Sefydlog oherwydd, yn amlwg, os nad ailgyfeiriwyd unrhyw Fesurau, ni ellir cynnal dadl. Penderfynodd y Cynulliad drwy benderfyniad na fydd hyn yn digwydd. Cyflwynwyd y Rheolau Sefydlog sy'n galluogi'r Cyfarfod Llawn i ailgyfeirio Mesurau i Bwyllgorau Pwnc er mwyn hwyluso'r gwaith o'u hystyried i adlewyrchu cytundeb pob plaid yn adolygiad y Cynulliad o'r gweithdrefnau. Datganodd yr adolygiad:

'Rydym yn bendant o'r farn bod angen i'r Cynulliad gael cyfrannu i'r graddau mwyaf posibl at ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol a ddaw gerbron y Senedd.'

Cymeradwyodd y Cynulliad adroddiad yr adolygiad yn unfrydol. Yr oedd yn cynnwys cynigion i gryfhau ein gweithdrefnau, a chyflwynwyd y Rheolau Sefydlog perthnasol ym mis Tachwedd 2002, mewn pryd ar gyfer y ddadl ar Araith y Frenhines. Fodd bynnag, er bod y gweithdrefnau i alluogi'r Cynulliad i ailgyfeirio Mesurau i'r Pwyllgorau wedi'u sefydlu, mae angen ewyllys y Cynulliad i

them. The decision taken in Plenary on 11 December may not have been in keeping with the spirit of the review of procedure but it did not breach our Standing Orders as such. As I said yesterday in relation to this matter, there is nothing to prevent another motion being tabled to remit Bills to Subject Committees. Committees can also, as you have pointed out, advise on proposed primary legislation within their field, under Standing Order No. 9.8(i).

The First Minister and the Business Minister will have heard and read what has been said on this matter. It is for the Government to respond by way of a motion if it wishes to return to this area.

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** I take on board the leader of the opposition's points and will consider them further. He has raised some complex matters and I will discuss how these matters might be progressed.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful for that clear undertaking from the Business Minister.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.50 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.50 p.m.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Diwygio'r Drefn Brydlesol (Hysbysiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002 a Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau'r Ddeddf Diwygio Deiliadaeth ar y Cyd a Lesddaliad 2002**

**Approval of the Leasehold Reform (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002 and Delegation of Functions of the Commonhold and Leasehold Reform Act 2002**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have received a request to debate these two items together, although they will be voted on separately.

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the Leasehold Reform (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 3 December 2002. (NDM1271)*

wneud defnydd ohonynt. Efallai nad yw'r penderfyniad a wnaed yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 11 Rhagfyr yn unol ag ysbryd yr adolygiad o'r gweithdrefnau, ond ni wnaeth dorri ein Rheolau Sefydlog fel y cyfryw. Fel y dywedais ddoe mewn perthynas â'r mater hwn, nid oes dim i rwystro cyflwyno cynnig arall i ailgyfeirio Mesurau i Bwyllgorau Pwnc. Gall Pwyllgorau hefyd, fel y dywedaso, roi cyngor ar ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol arfaethedig yn eu meysydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 9.8(i).

Bydd y Prif Weinidog a'r Trefnydd wedi clywed ac wedi darllen beth a ddywedwyd ar y mater hwn. Mater i'r Llywodraeth yw ymateb drwy gynnig os dymuna ddychwelyd at y maes hwn.

**Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Derbyniaf bwyntiau arweinydd yr wrthblaid a byddaf yn eu hystyried ymhellach. Cododd rai materion cymhleth a byddaf yn trafod sut y gellir datblygu'r materion hyn.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr addewid glir honno gan y Trefnydd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Derbyniais gais i gynnal dadl ar y ddwy eitem hon gyda'i gilydd, er y bydd pleidlais arnynt ar wahân.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Diwygio'r Drefn Brydlesol (Hysbysiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Rhagfyr 2002. (NDM1271)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly:*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Leasehold Reform (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 10 December 2002;*

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 3 December 2002. (NDM1272)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 62 (1) (b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate all the functions of the National Assembly contained in or under the Commonhold and Leasehold Reform Act 2002 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated.*

*Nothing in this motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of the Assembly Committees in the exercise of the above functions. (NDM1279)*

I thank the Assembly for allowing these motions to be debated together. The Act makes it easier for leaseholders of houses to qualify for the right to buy the freehold of their house and extend their leases. It abolishes the low rent test and the residents' test for most purposes. These changes are among those that will come into effect in Wales on 1 January 2003. As a consequence, amendments are needed to the statutory notices which are to be served on landlords in applying for enfranchisement with the extension of long leaseholds under the Leasehold Reform Act 1967.

The current notices are set out in the Leasehold Reform Notices Regulations 1997. In the interest of making the amendments to

Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Diwygio'r Drefn Brydlesol (Hysbysiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Rhagfyr 2002;*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Rhagfyr 2002. (NDM1272)*

Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 62 (1) (b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo i Brif Weinidog Cymru holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn, neu o dan, Ddeddf Diwygio Deiliadaeth ar y Cyd a Lesddaliad 2002, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir yn ôl y gyfraith eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw.*

*Ni fydd unrhyw beth yn y cynnig hwn yn golygu y caiff goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn na rôl Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad o ran gweithredu'r swyddogaethau uchod eu lleihau. (NDM1279)*

Diolchaf i'r Cynulliad am ganiatáu i'r cynigion hyn gael eu dadlau gyda'i gilydd. Mae'r Ddeddf yn ei gwneud yn haws i brydleswyr tai fod yn gymwys am yr hawl i brynu rhydd-ddaliad eu tai ac ymestyn eu prydlesi. Mae'n diddymu'r prawf rhent isel a'r profion preswyllo i'r rhan fwyaf o ddibenion. Mae'r newidiadau hyn ymysg y rhai a ddaw i rym yng Nghymru ar 1 Ionawr 2003. O ganlyniad, mae angen gwelliannau i hysbysiadau statudol sydd i'w rhoi i landlordiaid wrth ymgeisio am breiniad prydlesoedd gydag ymestyniad prydlesoedd hir o dan Ddeddf Diwygio'r Drefn Brydlesol 1967.

Caiff yr hysbysiadau presennol eu nodi o fewn Rheoliadau Hysbysiadau Diwygio'r Drefn Brydlesol 1997. Er mwyn gwneud y



the forms easier to follow, it is intended that the new consolidated set of forms incorporated in the changes be introduced rather than simply amend the existing regulations. These amended forms are set out in the Leasehold Reform (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002, which are now before us.

As we have already approved the commencement Order that requires these amendments as a consequence, it makes sense for us to approve these amendment regulations today so that they can come into effect at the same time.

**Owen John Thomas:** I welcome the changes made to the existing leasehold legislation by this Order. The reforms will come into force on 1 January 2003. However, little or no consultation was undertaken with the people of Wales before drafting this legislation. While these regulations extend the rights of leaseholders to purchase their freehold or to extend their lease, they do not address the many inequities involved in determining the freehold price and other matters relating to the crucial purchase proceedings, namely that the standing value of the property is frequently overestimated and the value of the site as a proportion of the property price is frequently too high. The landowner, having in the past compelled the leaseholder to insure the property with a named company, then seeks compensation for the loss of commission. The leaseholder has to pay the fees of solicitors and surveyors of both parties. Although, the freehold purchase should be a simple matter involving three pieces of correspondence from each side, the combined transaction fee can often exceed £1,000, although the freehold price may be only a fraction of that sum.

Landlords often delay the transaction for long periods, causing unnecessary anxiety to the leaseholder despite the simplicity of the process. Often, landlords do not supply the leaseholder's solicitor with a breakdown of the freehold evaluation unless the leaseholder employs a surveyor. Employing a surveyor to check the evaluation can cost the leaseholder around £300 or more. When you buy a house,

gwelliannau i'r ffurflenni yn haws i'w dilyn, y bwriad yw y caiff y set o ffurflenni cyfunol newydd a ymgorfforir yn y newidiadau eu cyflwyno yn hytrach na diwygio'r rheoliadau presennol yn unig. Caiff y ffurflenni diwygiedig hyn eu cyflwyno yn y Rheoliadau Diwygio'r Drefn Brydlesol (Hysbysiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002, sydd ger ein bron yn awr.

Gan ein bod eisoes wedi cymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn cychwyn sy'n gwneud y gwelliannau hyn yn ofynnol, mae'n synhwyrol inni gymeradwyo'r gwelliannau hyn i'r rheoliadau heddiw fel y gallant ddod i rym yr un pryd.

**Owen John Thomas:** Croesawaf y newidiadau a wneir i ddeddfwriaeth y drefn brydlesol bresennol gan y Gorchymyn hwn. Daw'r diwygiadau i rym ar 1 Ionawr 2003. Fodd bynnag, ychydig iawn o ymgynghori, os o gwbl, a gafwyd gyda phobl Cymru cyn drafftio'r ddeddfwriaeth hon. Er bod y rheoliadau hyn yn ymestyn hawliau prydleswyr i brynu eu rhydd-ddaliad neu ymestyn eu prydles, nid ydynt yn mynd i'r afael â'r holl anghyfartaledd sydd ynghlwm wrth benderfynu ar bris y rhydd-ddaliad ac unrhyw faterion eraill sy'n gysylltiedig â'r trafodaethau prynu hanfodol, sef bod gwerth sefydlog yr eiddo yn aml yn cael ei oramcangyfrif a bod gwerth y safle fel rhan o bris yr eiddo yn aml yn rhy uchel. Yna, bydd y tirseiddiannwr, ar ôl mynnu bod y prydleswr yn yswirio'r eiddo gyda chwmmi penodol yn y gorffennol, yn gwneud cais am iawndal am golli comisiwn. Rhaid i'r prydleswr dalu ffioedd cyfreithwyr a syrfewyr y ddwy ochr. Er y dylai prynu rhydd-ddaliad fod yn fater syml yn ymwneud â thri darn o ohebiaeth gan bob ochr, gall y ffi gwerthiant cyfunol fod dros £1,000 yn aml, er efallai mai rhan fechan o'r swm hwnnw fydd pris y rhydd-ddaliad.

Bydd landlordiaid yn aml yn oedi cyn gweithredu am gyfnodau maith, gan greu pryder diangen i'r prydleswr er bod y broses yn un syml. Yn aml, ni fydd landlordiaid yn rhoi manylion gwerthusiad y rhydd-ddaliad i gyfreithiwr y prydleswr heb i'r prydleswr gyflogi syrfewr. Gall gostio £300 neu fwy i'r prydleswr gyflogi syrfewr i wirio'r gwerthusiad. Wrth brynu tŷ, ceir digon o

there will be plenty of evidence of its value, but with a freehold, there is no transparency, leaving you vulnerable to exploitation. Leasehold evaluation panels deal mainly with rent assessment and the leaseholder can face waiting over a year for a hearing even though no costs are awarded at local tribunal hearings. A leaseholder would normally need to be represented by a solicitor and a surveyor, often making the appeal process financially prohibitive. Leaseholders are usually aware that the freehold price increases as their lease shortens. That exerts pressure on them to settle at an inflated price. All these circumstances combine to coerce leaseholders into paying over the odds for their freeholds—an element referred to in tribunals as the ‘Delaforce effect’.

My own experience as an adviser for the Citizen’s Advice Bureau for many years has familiarised me with these injustices. Forty per cent of 99-year leaseholds in England and Wales are on dwellings in Wales, therefore it is a matter of some importance to us. The moderate reform is welcomed, but is only a shadow of the reform that this Assembly could achieve given legislative powers.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats have always been opposed to the principle of leasehold, as I stated in our last debate on this matter some weeks ago. One hundred years ago, Lloyd George described the system as legalised robbery. Our central aim is to abolish leasehold outright. That would be most easily achieved by making the conversion from leasehold to commonhold as simple and easy as possible. We propose that the automatic right of ballot for all leaseholders in a block of flats to determine their ownership status is petitioned by one third of leaseholders. If the majority of leaseholders then voted in favour, ownership of freehold would transfer to either a company in which each leaseholder held a share or a commonhold association that would handle maintenance of all common areas of the property. However, given the constraints of Assembly powers, we cannot implement our policies completely and we

dystiolaeth o’i werth, ond gyda rhydd-ddaliad, nid oes tryloywder, sy’n eich rhoi mewn sefyllfa i gael eich ecploetio. Bydd paneli gwerthuso prydles yn ymdrin ag asesiadau rhent gan amlaf, a gall y prydleswr wynebu cyfnod aros o dros flwyddyn am wrandawriad, er na chaiff costau eu dyfarnu mewn gwrandawriadau tribiwnlys lleol. Byddai angen i gyfreithiwr a syrfewr gynrychioli prydleswr fel arfer, gan wneud y broses apeliadau yn un afresymol yn ariannol. Mae prydleswr fel arfer yn ymwybodol bod pris y rhydd-ddaliad yn cynyddu wrth i’w prydles leihau. Mae hynny’n rhoi pwysau arnynt i ddod i gytundeb ar bris chwyddedig. Bydd yr holl amgylchiadau hyn yn cyfuno i orfodi prydleswr i dalu crocbris am eu rhydd-ddaliad—elfen y cyfeirir ati yn y tribiwnlysoedd fel ‘effaith Delaforce’.

Drwy fy mhrofiad personol fel cynghorydd i’r Ganolfan Cynghori am sawl blwyddyn yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â’r anghyfiawnderau hyn. Mae 40 y cant o brydlesau 99-mllynedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr ar anheddau yng Nghymru, felly mae’n fater o gryn bwysigrwydd inni. Croesewir y diwygiad cymedrol, ond dim ond elfen fach ydyw o’r diwygiad y gallai’r Cynulliad hwn ei gyflawni pe bai’n cael pwerau deddfwriaethol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi gwrthwynebu’r egwyddor o brydles erioed, fel y nodais yn ein dadl ddiwethaf ar y mater rai wythnosau yn ôl. Gan mlynedd yn ôl, disgrifiodd Lloyd George y system fel ysbeilio wedi’i gyfreithloni. Ein prif nod yw diddymu prydles yn gyfan gwbl. Y ffordd rwyddaf o gyflawni hynny fyddai drwy wneud y trosglwyddiad o brydles i ddeiliadaeth ar y cyd mor syml a rhwydd â phosibl. Cynigiwn y dylai hawl awtomatig i bleidlais pob prydleswr mewn bloc o fflatiau i benderfynu ar eu statws perchnogaeth gael ei ddeisebu gan draean o’r prydleswyr. Yna, pe bai mwyafrif y prydleswyr yn pleidleisio o blaid, byddai perchnogaeth y rhydd-ddaliad yn trosglwyddo naill ai i gwmni lle y byddai gan bob prydleswr gyfran ohono neu gymdeithas fasnachol a fyddai’n ymdrin â’r gwaith o gynnal a chadw holl ardaloedd cyffredin yr eiddo. Fodd bynnag, o gofio cyfyngiadau

recognise that passing this Bill is a step in the right direction. If the Assembly were to have powers akin to those of Scotland, then the Welsh Liberal Democrats would have to reconsider this issue.

**William Graham:** We welcome the measures proposed by the Minister today. They are a move forward. To address a comment made by a previous speaker, most well-managed estates have long pursued a policy of sale without excessive prices. These measures introduce the following changes to qualifying rules: the abolition of the residents' test—which was an important test; a new requirement that the tenant must hold the lease for two years only; abolition of the low rent test; and the right to buy the freehold within the term of a lease extension. Previously only a 50-year extension was permitted. New rights and qualifying rules for a personal representative of the leaseholder are greatly welcomed. These measures will be endorsed by my party.

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** I concur with William's comments. He has outlined the positive measures included in this legislation. I make it clear that the purpose of today's debate is solely to discuss the Leasehold Reform (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002 and not the merits of the Act. Members of all parties have strong views on leasehold reform and I emphasise the importance that we attach to the issue and reassure you that we have tried to be as involved as possible in this process. The Assembly carried out a consultation exercise on the draft Bill in Wales and those comments were outlined in the consultation paper in August 2000 on behalf of the Secretary of State for Wales. While the responses to the consultation were disappointing, comments from Wales were taken into account. During that consultation period, we did not receive comments from Members.

**Owen John Thomas:** Point of order. The Minister knows that she received correspondence from me—

pwerau'r Cynulliad, ni allwn weithredu ein polisiau yn llwyr a chydabyddwn bod pasio'r Mesur hwn yn gam i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Pe bai'r Cynulliad yn cael pwerau tebyg i rai yr Alban, yna byddai'n rhaid i Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ailystyried y mater hwn.

**William Graham:** Croesawn y mesurau a gaiff eu cynnig heddiw gan y Gweinidog. Maent yn gam ymlaen. I gyfeirio at sylw a wnaethpwyd gan siaradwr blaenorol, mae'r rhan fwyaf o ystadau a reolir yn dda wedi dilyn polisi o werthu heb godi prisiau gormodol ers peth amser. Mae'r mesurau hyn yn cyflwyno'r newidiadau canlynol i reolau cymhwysio: diddymu'r prawf preswylwyr—a oedd yn brawf pwysig; gofyniad newydd bod yn rhaid i denant ddal y brydles am ddwy flynedd yn unig; diddymu'r prawf rhent isel; a'r hawl i brynu'r rhydd-ddaliad o fewn cyfnod estyniad y brydles. Dim ond estyniad 50-mlynedd oedd yn cael ei ganiatáu yn flaenorol. Estynnir croeso mawr i'r hawliau a'r rheolau cymhwysio newydd ar gyfer cynrychiolydd personol y prydleswr. Caiff y mesurau hyn eu cefnogi gan fy mhlaid.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Cytunaf â sylwadau William. Mae wedi amlinellu'r mesurau cadarnhaol a gaiff eu cynnwys yn y ddeddfwriaeth hon. Fe'i gwnaf yn eglur mai diben y ddaedl heddiw yw trafod Rheoliadau Diwygio'r Drefn Brydlesol (Hysbysladau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002 yn unig ac nid manteision y Ddeddf. Mae gan Aelodau pob plaid farn bendant am ddiwygio'r drefn brydlesol a phwysleisiaf y pwys a roddwn ar y mater a'ch sicrhau ein bod wedi ymdrechu i chwarae cymaint o ran â phosibl yn y broses hon. Cynhaliodd y Cynulliad ymarfer ymgynghori ar y Mesur drafft yng Nghymru ac amlinellwyd y sylwadau hynny yn y papur ymgynghori ym mis Awst 2000 ar ran Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Er bod yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad yn siomedig, rhoddwyd ystyriaeth i sylwadau o Gymru. Yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori hwnnw, ni chawsom unrhyw sylwadau gan Aelodau.

**Owen John Thomas:** Pwynt o drefn. Gŵyr y Gweinidog ei bod wedi derbyn gohebiaeth gennyf—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. That is not a point of order for me. Correspondence between you and the Minister is nothing to do with me.

**Owen John Thomas:** She said that there was no consultation or response from any Members. That is patently untrue.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. That is not a point of order, but you have made your point, and it will be recorded.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw hynny yn bwynt o drefn i mi. Nid oes a wnelo gohebiaeth rhyngoch chi a'r Gweinidog yn ddim â mi.

**Owen John Thomas:** Dywedodd na chafodd ymgynghori nac ymateb gan unrhyw Aelod. Mae hynny yn gelwydd noeth.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw hynny yn bwynt o drefn, ond yr ydych wedi gwneud eich pwynt, a chaiff ei gofnodi.

*Cynnig (NDM1271): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1271): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1272): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1272): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1279): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1279): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

4:00 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Rhestri Ardrethu (Dyddiad Prasio) (Cymru) 2002**  
**Approval of the Rating Lists (Valuation Date) (Wales) Order 2002**

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Rating Lists (Valuation Date) (Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 3 December 2002. (NDM1273)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn y Rhestrau Ardrethu (Dyddiad Prasio) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Rhagfyr 2002. (NDM1273)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Rating Lists (Valuation Date) (Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 10 December 2002.*

*2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 3 December 2002. (NDM1274)*

There is a requirement to carry out a business rates re-evaluation every five years in England and Wales. That is set out in primary legislation. If the Order is not passed in Wales, the Valuation Office Agency will not be able to revalue business properties in Wales by reference to the common valuation dates. The antecedent valuation date has always been set two years in advance of the re-evaluation date in order to allow enough time for the Valuation Office Agency to carry out the valuations. This Order therefore sets the antecedent valuation dates as 1 April 2003. I ask you to support the motions.

**William Graham:** I support these necessary amendments. I recognise that the explanatory note does not form part of the Order, but I note that there was consideration by this administration to specify in those notes:

‘the day by reference to which the rateable value of a non-domestic hereditament is to be determined for the purposes of the local and central non-domestic rating lists which are to be compiled on 1 April 2005.’

Unfortunately, the date specified is 1 April 2003. Was that an attempt to give non-domestic ratepayers an early Christmas present in the form of a discount of one denarius?

**Eleanor Burnham:** This motion is of a technical nature and it is sensible to have a fixed date for the purpose of both central and

Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Rhestrau Ardrethu (Dyddiad Prisiau) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Rhagfyr 2002.*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Rhagfyr 2002. (NDM1274)*

Mae'n ofynnol cynnal ail-werthusiad o drethi busnes bob pum mlynedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Nodir hynny o dan ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Os na chaiff y Gorchymyn ei basio yng Nghymru, ni all Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisiau ailbrisiao eiddo busnes yng Nghymru drwy gyfeirio at y dyddiadau prisiau cyffredin. Y dyddiad prisiau rhagflaenol bob amser oedd dwy flynedd cyn y dyddiad ail-werthuso er mwyn galluogi digon o amser i Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisiau gynnal y prisiau. Felly mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn gosod y dyddiadau prisiau rhagflaenol ar gyfer 1 Ebrill 2003. Gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r cynigion.

**William Graham:** Cefnogaf y gwelliannau angenrheidiol hyn. Yr wyf yn cydnabod nad yw'r nodyn eglurhaol yn ffurfio rhan o'r Gorchymyn, ond nodaf i'r weinyddiaeth hon ystyried nodi yn y nodiadau hynny:

‘y diwrnod y mae'n rhaid cyfeirio ato i benderfynu gwerth ardrethol hereditament annomestig at ddibenion rhestrau ardrethu annomestig lleol a chanolog sydd i'w llunio ar 1 Ebrill 2005.’

Yn anffodus, y dyddiad a nodir yw 1 Ebrill 2003. Ai ymgais oedd hynny i roi anrheg Nadolig buan i drethdalwyr annomestig ar ffurf disgownt o un denariws?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r cynnig yn un technegol ei natur ac mae'n synhwyrol cael dyddiad penodol at ddiben llywodraeth

local government.

ganolog a llywodraeth leol.

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** I thank William for drawing our attention to the incorrect date.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Diolchaf i William am dynnu ein sylw at y dyddiad anghywir.

*Cynnig (NDM1273): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1273): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1274): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1274): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:



Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Fferyllol) a (Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002  
 Approval of the National Health Service (Pharmaceutical Services) and (General Medical Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the National Health Service (Pharmaceutical Services) and (General Medical Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 2 December 2002. (NDM1275)*

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Fferyllol) a (Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Rhagfyr 2002. (NDM1275)*

I propose that

Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the National Health Service (Pharmaceutical Services) and (General Medical Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 10 December 2002;*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Fferyllol) a (Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Rhagfyr 2002.*

*2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 2 December 2002. (NDM1276)*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Rhagfyr 2002. (NDM1276)*

This Order is mainly concerned with the treatment of erectile dysfunction. We take this subject seriously because although it is not directly life-threatening, it can affect relationships and mental wellbeing. At the same time, the Assembly has to make difficult decisions about priorities and if we use resources to treat one condition, those resources cannot be used to meet other demands. Current policy is that drug treatment under the NHS is available only to people with specified medical conditions or who are suffering from severe distress. As new drugs for this condition become available, they will be subject to the same policy. These regulations add the drug apomorphine hydrochloride, which is marketed as Uprima, to schedule 11 of the principal regulations.

Mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn ymwneud yn bennaf â thrin trafferthion codol. Er nad yw'n bygwth bywyd yn uniongyrchol, ystyriwn y pwnc hwn o ddifrif gan y gall effeithio ar berthynas a lles meddyliol. Ar yr un pryd, rhaid i'r Cynulliad wneud penderfyniadau anodd am flaenoriaethau ac os ydym yn defnyddio adnoddau i drin un cyflwr, ni ellir defnyddio'r adnoddau hynny i ddiwallu anghenion eraill. Y polisi presennol yw mai dim ond i bobl sy'n dioddef o gyflyrau meddygol penodol neu sy'n dioddef gofid difrifol y gellir rhoi triniaeth â chyffuriau o dan y GIG. Wrth i gyffuriau newydd ar gyfer y cyflwr hwn ddod ar gael, byddant yn agored i'r un polisi. Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn ychwanegu'r cyffur apomorffin hydroclorid, a gaiff ei farchnata fel Uprima, i atodlen 11 o'r prif reoliadau.

We are also taking this opportunity to make certain appliances available under the NHS that were not previously available. They will be subject to the same restrictions. The appliances are not specified in this amendment, which is an enabling Order. They will be added to the drug tariff by administrative action later. The Order also contains some unconnected amendments of a technical nature. Some relate to the extension of nurse prescribing and some are consequential on changes in primary legislation. These are essentially tidying-up exercises.

Manteisiwn ar y cyfle hwn hefyd i sicrhau bod rhai dyfeisiau penodol ar gael o dan y GIG nad oedd ar gael eisoes. Byddant yn agored i'r un cyfyngiadau. Ni chaiff y dyfeisiau hyn eu nodi yn y gwelliant hwn, sy'n Orchymyn galluogi. Cânt eu hychwanegu i'r rhestr gyffuriau gan weithgaredd gweinyddol yn ddiweddarach. Mae'r Gorchymyn hefyd yn cynnwys rhai gwelliannau digyswllt sydd yn dechnegol eu natur. Mae rhai yn ymwneud ag ymestyn hawl y nyrs i ragnodi ac mae rhai o ganlyniad i newidiadau mewn deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Ymarferion tacluso ydynt yn y bôn.

**Geraint Davies:** Plaid Cymru welcomes

**Geraint Davies:** Mae Plaid Cymru yn

these regulations. Making the drug Uprima available on the NHS will bring Wales in line with England, and will give GPs and patients further choice in the treatment of impotence. Unfortunately, impotence is still one of those taboo issues that we, as a society and as individuals, find it difficult to talk about. We should not lose sight of the importance of suitable and properly regulated treatment for those who need it for their physical and emotional wellbeing—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Are you giving way to Richard Edwards?

**Richard Edwards:** Sorry, I did not wish to intervene. I was merely returning to my chair.

**Geraint Davies:** I have one serious concern: outside the regulated NHS framework, Uprima and Viagra are already freely available to buy on the internet. Anyone can log on, go through a so-called online consultation and, subject to verification by a registered but anonymous GP, receive their drug of choice within hours.

Two issues are raised. First, the legal standpoint—it is technically against UK law to advertise the sale of prescription-only medicine. What is the legal position of companies that advertise and trade such medicine over the internet for financial gain? The second issue concerns the obvious and serious risk to individuals in obtaining drugs by those means. There are no one-to-one consultations, no personal discussions on an individual's circumstances and no access to medical records.

We also welcome the extended definition of nurse prescribing. Plaid Cymru applauds any move to develop the skills and career pathways of all health professionals. Of course, support and adequate training resources are vital. I was glad to hear announced earlier today that £0.5 million in funding has been made available for the training of nurses and pharmacists specifically to this end. I welcome the regulations.

croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn. Bydd sicrhau bod Uprima ar gael drwy'r GIG yn cysoni Cymru â Lloegr, a bydd yn rhoi mwy o ddewis i feddygon teulu a chleifion wrth drin analluedd. Yn anffodus, mae analluedd yn dal yn un o'r materion tabŵ hynny y byddwn ni fel cymdeithas ac fel unigolion yn ei chael yn anodd i'w drafod. Ni ddylem golli gafael ar bwysigrwydd triniaeth addas wedi ei rheoli'n briodol ar gyfer y rheini sydd ei angen ar gyfer eu lles corfforol ac emosiynol—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A ydych yn iddio i Richard Edwards?

**Richard Edwards:** Ymddiheuraf, nid oeddwn am ymyrryd. Dim ond dychwelyd i'm cadair yr oeddwn.

**Geraint Davies:** Mae gennyf un pryder difrifol: y tu allan i fframwaith rheoledig y GIG mae Uprima a Viagra eisoes ar gael yn rhwydd i'w prynu ar y rhyngwrwd. Gall unrhyw un gofrestru, mynd drwy'r hyn a elwir yn ymgynghoriad ar-lein ac, yn amodol ar gadarnhad meddyg teulu cofrestredig ond anhysbys, dderbyn eu cyffur dewisol o fewn ychydig oriau.

Codir dau fater. Yn gyntaf, y safbwynt cyfreithiol—mae'n dechnegol yn erbyn cyfraith y DU i hysbysebu bod meddyginiaeth drwy bresgripsiwn yn unig ar werth. Beth yw sefyllfa gyfreithiol cwmnïau sy'n hysbysebu ac yn masnachu meddyginiaeth o'r fath dros y rhyngwrwd er budd ariannol? Mae'r ail fater yn ymwneud â'r risg amlwg a difrifol i unigolion sy'n cael cyffuriau drwy'r ffyrdd hynny. Ni chynhelir ymgynghoriadau personol, na thrafodaethau personol am amgylchiadau'r unigolyn ac ni cheir mynediad i gofnodion meddygol.

Croesawn hefyd y diffiniad estynedig o ragnodi gan nyrsys. Mae Plaid Cymru yn cymeradwyo unrhyw gam i ddatblygu sgiliau a llwybrau gyrfaedd pob gweithiwr iechyd proffesiynol. Wrth gwrs, mae cymorth ac adnoddau hyfforddi digonol yn hanfodol. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed y cyhoeddiad yn gynharach heddiw bod £0.5 miliwn o gyllid wedi cael ei sicrhau i hyfforddi nyrsys a fferyllwyr yn benodol i'r perwyl hwn. Croesawaf y rheoliadau.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I am grateful to Geraint for his constructive remarks. It is a difficult subject, which must be dealt with sympathetically. Under the new arrangements, those drugs can be prescribed for a wide range of medical conditions. Patients who are in severe distress can obtain the drugs under the NHS from hospitals. We believe that we have got the priorities right in this regard.

The commercial advertising of Viagra and Uprima must be subject to some restrictions in terms of medical arrangements. However, because they are not under the control of the NHS, there is clearly less control, as you, Geraint, as a pharmacist, will be aware. I am also pleased that we are moving to extend nurse and pharmacist prescribing—a move that we discussed earlier this month and in Committee.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Geraint am ei sylwadau adeiladol. Mae'n bwnc anodd, a rhaid ymdrin ag ef gyda chydymdeimlad. O dan y trefniadau newydd, gall y cyffuriau hynny gael eu rhagnodi ar gyfer ystod eang o gyflyrau meddygol. Gall cleifion sydd mewn gofid difrifol gael y cyffuriau o dan y GIG gan ysbytai. Credwn ein bod wedi blaenoriaethu'n gywir yn hyn o beth.

Rhaid i'r broses o hysbysebu Viagra ac Uprima yn fasnachol fod yn destun rhai cyfyngiadau o ran trefniadau meddygol. Fodd bynnag, gan nad ydynt o dan reolaeth y GIG, mae'n amlwg bod llai o reolaeth, fel y gwyddoch chi, Geraint, fel fferylllydd. Yr wyf yn falch hefyd ein bod yn symud tuag at ragnodi gan nyrsys a fferyllwyr—cam a drafodwyd gennym yn gynharach y mis hwn ac yn y Pwyllgor.

*Cynnig (NDM1275): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1275): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val

Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1276): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1276): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

4:10 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Organebau a Addaswyd yn Enetig (Eu Gollwng yn Fwriadol) (Cymru) 2002**  
**Approval of the Genetically Modified Organisms (Deliberate Release)(Wales) Regulations 2002**

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German):** I propose that

*the National Assembly Considers the principle of the Genetically Modified Organisms (Deliberate Release) (Wales) Regulations 2002, including schedule 5, both laid in the Table Office on 2 December 2002. (NDM1277)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft order, The Genetically Modified Organisms (Deliberate Release) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 3 December 2002.*

*2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft and the Regulatory Appraisal laid in the Table Office on 2 December 2002. (NDM1278)*

Directive 2001/18/EC introduces a regulatory framework that is much tougher on the releases of genetically modified organisms into the environment than previous arrangements have been. For the first time, members of the public will be able to challenge and object to applications before a marketing consent is given to a genetically modified organism. In the new directive there will be an extensive environmental risk assessment that stresses environmental and health risks. There will also be greater transparency and openness during the consenting process and improved

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German):** Cynigaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Organebau a Addaswyd yn Enetig (Eu Gollwng yn Fwriadol) (Cymru) 2002, gan gynnwys Atodlen 5, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Rhagfyr 2002. (NDM1277)*

Cynigaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Organebau a Addaswyd yn Enetig (Eu Gollwng yn Fwriadol) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Rhagfyr 2002.*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Rhagfyr 2002. (NDM1278)*

Mae cyfarwyddeb 2001/18/EC yn cyflwyno fframwaith rheoliadol sy'n llymach o lawer ar ollwng organebau a addaswyd yn enetig i'r amgylchedd nag y bu trefniadau blaenorol. Am y tro cyntaf, bydd aelodau'r cyhoedd yn gallu herio a gwrthwynebu ceisiadau cyn y rhoddir caniatâd i farchnata organeb a addaswyd yn enetig. Yn y gyfarwyddeb newydd bydd asesiad risg amgylcheddol helaeth sy'n pwysleisio risgiau amgylcheddol ac iechyd. Bydd pethau'n fwy tryloyw ac agored yn ystod y broses ganiatáu a bydd gwell trefniadau ar gyfer monitro ôl-farchnata. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud hefyd y

arrangements for post-market monitoring. I am also pleased to say that the antibiotic-resistant marker genes, which may adversely affect human health and the environment, will be phased out by these regulations. The Welsh regulations have been drafted in a way that demonstrates the Assembly Government's commitment to applying the most restrictive approach to the commercialisation of GM crops. We have included the widest possible scope for the public to make representations as to the risk of damage to the environment. Also, part B applications will need to be advertised in a wider range of publications, to allow public engagement in the process.

I have carefully considered the argument that amending the Environmental Protection Act 1990 in implementing this directive may weaken our powers, and I wish to assure Members that this is not the case. In July 2001 the Assembly set out an article 16 notice on separation distances between organic and GM crops, on the grounds of adverse effects on human health and the environment. These regulations do not change our ability to take further action of this kind. It may be the case that the current definition of harm, in section 107(6) of the Environmental Protection Act, could be allowed under the directive. All legal opinion presented to me is agreed that the only terms under which you can take action are on the grounds of possible damage to the environment. We have ensured the widest possible scope for a definition of damage to the environment under the amended Act. Any other grounds, such as economic damage to property, would be inadmissible. Therefore, the definition as it stands can be interpreted in two ways, and it could mislead the public into thinking that the law is more powerful in Wales than elsewhere. I concluded that retaining this definition would, at best, constitute a symbolic gesture and, at worst, an irresponsible misleading of the public.

However, I will always welcome any new evidence that may yet mean that we should consider amending the Welsh regulations again in the future. In every decision on genetically modified organisms, I take

bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn raddol ddileu'r genynnau marcio sy'n gwrthsefyll gwrthfotigau, a all effeithio'n andwyol ar iechyd pobl, a'r amgylchedd. Drafftwyd rheoliadau Cymru mewn ffordd sy'n dangos ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gymhwyso'r ymagwedd fwy cyfyngol tuag at fasnacheiddio cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Yr ydym wedi rhoi'r cyfle ehangaf posibl i'r cyhoedd wneud sylwadau o ran y risg o niwed i'r amgylchedd. Hefyd, bydd angen hysbysebu ceisiadau rhan B mewn ystod ehangach o gyhoeddiadau i ganiatáu i'r cyhoedd gymryd rhan yn y broses.

Ystyriais y ddadl y gall diwygio Deddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990 wrth weithredu'r gyfarwyddeb hon wanhau ein pwerau, a dymunaf sicrhau'r Aelodau nad felly y mae. Ym mis Gorffennaf 2001 nododd y Cynulliad hysbysiad erthygl 16 ar bellterau gwahanu rhwng cnydau organig a chnydau a addaswyd yn enetig, ar sail effeithiau andwyol ar iechyd pobl a'r amgylchedd. Nid yw'r rheoliadau hyn yn newid ein gallu i gymryd camau pellach o'r math hwn. Efallai ei fod yn wir y gellid caniatáu'r diffiniad presennol o niwed, yn adran 107(6) Deddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd, o dan y gyfarwyddeb. Cytuna pob barn gyfreithiol a gyflwynwyd i mi mai'r unig delerau a fyddai'n caniatáu i chi gymryd camau yw'r rhai ar sail niwed posibl i'r amgylchedd. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod y cyfle ehangaf posibl ar gael i ddiffinio difrod i'r amgylchedd o dan y Ddeddf ddiwygiedig. Byddai unrhyw sail arall megis niwed economaidd i eiddo, yn annerbyniol. Felly, gall y diffiniad fel y saif gael ei ddehongli mewn dwy ffordd, a gallai gamarwain y cyhoedd i feddwl bod y gyfraith yn fwy pwerus yng Nghymru nag mewn unrhyw fan arall. Deuthum i'r casgliad y byddai cadw'r diffiniad hwn, ar y gorau, yn gyfystyr ag arwydd symbolaidd, ac ar y gwaethaf, yn enghraifft o gamarwain y cyhoedd yn anghyfrifol.

Fodd bynnag, byddaf bob amser yn croesawu unrhyw dystiolaeth newydd a all olygu y dylem ystyried diwygio rheoliadau Cymru unwaith eto yn y dyfodol. Mewn pob penderfyniad ar organebau a addaswyd yn

seriously our commitment to operate the most restrictive policy possible within the European Union legislative framework. The spirit of the policy is to investigate every avenue to ensure that we are doing all that we can to fulfil it. I have done so in this case, and I recommend this directive to the Assembly as a welcome step forward in the regulation of genetically modified organisms in Wales. I ask you to support the motions.

**Jocelyn Davies:** It should be noted that the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee has had much opportunity to discuss this Order and the issues surrounding it. We all know that the Assembly is duty bound to observe its previous resolution that we wish to restrict growing GM crops in Wales as much as the law allows. That decision was made unanimously in this Plenary and I support that stance.

The Minister will know from our Committee discussions that we are not happy with the new definition of harm in these regulations. When questioned on this, he claimed that the new definition, which is much narrower than the previous one, was the definition that was to be found in the directive. When we pointed out that there is no definition of harm in the directive, officials then told us that one had been extracted from the directive. We are unconvinced by that argument and we prefer the old definition. The Minister argued that we must change our idea of harm in order to be more transparent, but it is worth reminding ourselves that the old definition served us well for 12 years and it was not challenged in court once. Our request to revert to the previous concept of harm has been ignored. Your new definition only refers to damage to the environment and fails to offer any protection to property—including organic or conventional crops that may be contaminated by genetically modified organisms and rendered unsaleable. The issue of liability for such potentially huge losses remains unresolved. I have requested that the Minister's view be made public, but I have not received a reply other than that he might tell us at a later date. In opposition, of course,

enetig, cymeraf ein hymrwymiad i weithredu'r polisi mwyaf cyfyngedig posibl o ddifrif o fewn fframwaith deddfwriaethol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Meddylfryd y polisi yw ymchwilio i bob dull a modd i sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud popeth y gallwn i'w gyflawni. Gwneuthum hynny yn yr achos hwn ac argymhellaf y gyfarwyddeb hon i'r Cynulliad fel cam ymlaen i'w groesawu wrth reoleiddio organebau a addaswyd yn enetig yng Nghymru. Gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r cynigion.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Dylid nodi bod y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig wedi cael llawer o gyfle i drafod y Gorchymyn hwn a'r materion sydd ynghlwm wrtho. Gŵyr pob un ohonom fod y Cynulliad yn rhwym i ufuddhau i'w benderfyniad blaenorol ein bod yn dymuno cyfyngu ar gnydau sy'n tyfu a addaswyd yn enetig yng Nghymru gymaint ag y caniatâ'r gyfraith. Gwnaed y penderfyniad hwnnw yn unfrydol yn y Cyfarfod Llawn hwn a chefnogaf y safbwynt hwnnw.

Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod o'n trafodaethau yn y Pwyllgor nad ydym yn fodlon ar y diffiniad newydd o niwed yn y rheoliadau hyn. Pan gafodd ei holi ar hyn, honnodd mai'r diffiniad newydd, sy'n gulach o lawer na'r un blaenorol, oedd yr un a oedd yn y gyfarwyddeb. Pan ddywedasom nad oes diffiniad o niwed yn y gyfarwyddeb, dywedodd y swyddogion wrthym wedyn fod un wedi ei dynnu o'r gyfarwyddeb. Nid yw'r ddatl honno yn ein hargyhoeddi ac mae'n well gennym yr hen ddiffiniad. Dadleuodd y Gweinidog fod yn rhaid inni newid ein syniad o niwed er mwyn bod yn fwy tryloyw, ond mae'n werth atgoffa ein hunain bod yr hen ddiffiniad wedi ein gwasanaethu'n dda am 12 mlynedd ac na chafodd ei herio mewn llys barn erioed. Anwybyddwyd ein cais i ddychwelyd at y cysyniad blaenorol o niwed. Dim ond at niwed i'r amgylchedd y cyfeiria eich diffiniad newydd ac nid yw'n cynnig unrhyw ddiogelwch i eiddo—gan gynnwys cnydau organig neu gonfensiynol y gall organebau a addaswyd yn enetig eu difwyno a'u gwneud yn anwerthadwy. Mae'r atebolrwydd am golledion enfawr o bosibl yn parhau heb ei ddatrys. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r Gweinidog ddatgan ei farn yn gyhoeddus, ond ni chefais ateb heblaw y bydd yn dweud



the Minister took every opportunity to be vocal on all aspects of GM policy. Perhaps he will respond this afternoon with the same enthusiasm that he displayed previously. The previous Minister was clear on liability and said on several occasions that GM growers should be liable for the losses incurred as a result of contamination. Does that continue to be the Cabinet's view?

Finally, the Minister cited the inclusion of the precautionary principle as one of the most important aspects of these regulations. I welcomed that because I had assumed that it would mean that applicants would have to prove that no harm would be caused by growing these crops before they could proceed. Yet the regulations do not define what 'precautionary principle' means. In Committee, you said that it had been included at the request of Friends of the Earth, but your legal advice was that its inclusion made no difference to the application of these regulations. To my mind, that is the most arrogant and patronising approach: to be prepared to include matters to placate pressure groups just as long as the additions make no material difference. You are wrong on that front. Taking all those concerns together, we cannot support these regulations as they stand. Plaid Cymru will vote against this motion.

**Ron Davies:** There is one central point that I want to put to the Minister to see if I can get some reassurances from him. He mentioned earlier that the Assembly had a policy, agreed across all parties, to have the most restrictive approach possible on handling GMOs. At the heart of that has to be the concern expressed by people in the Assembly and outside regarding the safety implications of GMOs in terms of human health and the environment. Those are now included in the definition of harm in this new Order. A central part of that necessity to protect human health and the environment has been the right, which has existed hitherto, to call for a public hearing so that individuals can put their case to an

wrthym rywbyrd yn y dyfodol efallai. Pan oedd yn yr wrthblaid, manteisiodd y Gweinidog wrth gwrs ar bob cyfle i leisio ei farn ar bob agwedd ar bolisi cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Efallai y bydd yn ymateb y prynhawn yma gyda'r un brwdfrydedd a ddangosodd yn flaenorol. Yr oedd y Gweinidog blaenorol yn glir ar atebolrwydd a dywedodd ar sawl achlysur y dylai tyfwyr cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig fod yn atebol am y colledion yr aethpwyd iddynt o ganlyniad i ddifwyno. Ai barn y Cabinet yw hynny o hyd?

I gloi, nododd y Gweinidog mai cynnwys yr egwyddor ragofalus oedd un o'r agweddau pwysicaf ar y rheoliadau hyn. Croesewais hynny gan fy mod wedi tybio y byddai'n golygu y byddai ymgeiswyr yn gorfod profi cyn mynd yn eu blaenau, na fyddai tyfu'r cnydau hyn yn gwneud unrhyw niwed. Ac eto nid yw'r rheoliadau yn diffinio ystyr 'egwyddor ragofalus'. Yn y Pwyllgor, dywedasoeh ei fod wedi ei gynnwys ar gais Cyfeillion y Ddaear, ond eich cyngor cyfreithiol oedd nad oedd ei gynnwys yn gwneud unrhyw wahaniaeth i gymhwyso'r rheoliadau hyn. Yn fy marn i, dyna'r ymagwedd fwyaf haerllug a nawddoglyd: bod yn barod i gynnwys materion i dawelu carfanau pwyso ar yr amod nad yw'r ychwanegiadau yn gwneud unrhyw wahaniaeth mawr. Yr ydych yn anghywir i ddweud hynny. A chymryd yr holl bryderon hynny gyda'i gilydd, ni allwn gefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn fel y maent ar hyn o bryd. Bydd Plaid Cymru yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig hwn.

**Ron Davies:** Hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Gweinidog at un pwynt canolog i weld a allaf gael rhywfaint o sicrwydd ganddo. Soniodd yn gynharach fod gan y Cynulliad bolisi, y mae pob plaid yn gytûn arno, i fabwysiadu'r ymagwedd fwyaf cyfyngedig posibl tuag at ymdrin ag organebau a addaswyd yn enetig. Yr hyn sydd wrth wraidd hynny yw'r pryder a fynegwyd gan bobl yn y Cynulliad a'r tu allan o ran goblygiadau diogelwch organebau a addaswyd yn enetig o ran iechyd pobl a'r amgylchedd. Cynhwysir y rheini yn awr yn y diffiniad o niwed yn y Gorchymyn newydd hwn. Rhan ganolog o'r rheidrwydd hwnnw i ddiogelu iechyd pobl a'r amgylchedd fu'r hawl, sydd wedi bodoli hyd yma, i alw am

independent hearing about their concerns. That right existed previously.

It was such an important right that the Minister, in his previous incarnation as an ordinary Assembly Member, exercised it. In April 2000, in respect of Chardon LL, he used that right by calling for such a public hearing. Now, as a Minister, he argues for something different. I do not necessarily disagree with him on this point, but he is arguing that the right that previously existed when a seed was being considered for listing should now be considered—Minister, there is no point in shaking your head just yet. You argued the case for a public hearing in April 2000, and I will read out an extract from your own consultation document in a moment.

**Michael German:** You are on the wrong track.

**Ron Davies:** It might be better if you followed my argument and then tried to reply as coherently as you can.

I refer you to your consultation document dated 19 September 2002 in which you invited views on these matters and stated in summary:

‘We believe that the national list system is not the appropriate place to challenge GM safety assessments.’

These are your words from your own document:

‘Instead we plan to put in place improved, effective and transparent mechanisms that will enable public concerns on GM safety to be heard and taken into account before approvals are granted (ie under the Directive 90/220/EEC regime on the release of GMOs.)’

As it happens, I do not disagree with the Minister. That approach is sensible. Safety considerations should be examined when considering the release provisions and before listing the seeds. However, if the Minister wanted to do that, there would have to be

wrandawiad cyhoeddus fel y gall unigolion gyflwyno eu pryderon i wrandawiad annibynnol. Yr oedd yr hawl honno yn bodoli yn flaenorol.

Yr oedd yn hawl mor bwysig fel bod y Gweinidog, yn ei ymgorfforiad blaenorol fel Aelod Cynulliad cyffredin, wedi ei ymarfer. Yn Ebrill 2000, mewn perthynas â Chardon LL, defnyddiodd yr hawl honno drwy alw am wrandawiad cyhoeddus o’r fath. Nawr, fel Gweinidog, dadleua dros rywbeth gwahanol. Nid wyf o reidrwydd yn anghytuno ag ef ar y pwynt hwn ond mae’n dadlau y dylid ystyried yn awr yr hawl a fodolai yn flaenorol pan oedd hedyn yn cael ei ystyried ar gyfer rhestru—Weinidog, nid oes diben ysgwyd eich pen eto. Gwnaethoch ddadlau dros wrandawiad cyhoeddus yn Ebrill 2000, a darllenaf ddarn o’ch dogfen ymgynghori chi eich hun mewn eiliad.

**Michael German:** Yr ydych ar y trywydd anghywir.

**Ron Davies:** Efallai y byddai’n well pe baech yn dilyn fy nadl a cheisio ei ateb wedyn mor drefnus ag y gallwch.

Cyfeiriai at eich dogfen ymgynghori dyddiedig 19 Medi 2002 lle y gwahoddiwyd barn gennych ar y materion hyn a dywedasoich wrth grynhoi:

Ni chredwn mai system y rhestr genedlaethol yw’r lle priodol i herio asesiadau diogelwch GM.

Dyma’r geiriau o’ch dogfen chi eich hun:

Yn hytrach, bwriadwn gyflwyno gwell dulliau, a fydd yn effeithiol ac yn dryloyw, a fydd yn caniatáu i bryderon y cyhoedd ar ddiogelwch GM gael eu clywed a’u hystyried cyn i gymeradwyaeth gael ei rhoi (hy dan drefn Cyfarwyddeb 90/220/EEC ar ryddhau GMOs).

Fel y digwydd, nid anghytunaf â’r Gweinidog. Mae’r ymagwedd honno yn synhwyrol. Dylid archwilio ystyriaethau diogelwch wrth ystyried y darpariaethau gollwng a chyn rhestru’r hadau. Fodd bynnag, pe bai’r Gweinidog am wneud

provision for a public hearing in the Order before us today and there is none. Why has the Minister not made that provision? He has issued a consultation document making clear that he will remove from the seed listing regulations the right to a public hearing and wants to include it in the deliberate release regulations, namely these regulations. However, that right is not included here, and I would like to know why. The Minister may well argue that the regulations could be amended at a later date. I would be prepared to listen to that argument. However, if that is his argument, will the Minister address the issue of the attitude of the other countries who are party to this procedure, because Scotland, England, and Northern Ireland will have to agree to a subsequent amendment to these regulations? Largely because of opposition in Scotland, there has not been any possibility hitherto of reaching such an agreement.

4:20 p.m.

If we were to accept the Minister's suggestion to abolish the right to a public hearing in the belief that it might be reinstated in future, we would be buying a pig in a poke. That pig would not squeal, because the Minister is not capable of delivering on this. It would be disingenuous of him if he were to suggest otherwise. He may argue that it is matter of disengagement rather than of being disingenuous, as 'disengagement' seems to be the word of the week; he wants to disengage from the Government and his past when they prove to be inconvenient. However, he cannot put these issues to one side on this occasion.

The National Assembly has a clear, precise and unanimously agreed policy on GMOs. It is not for the Minister to set that policy to one side. There are three important principles at work: our policy of restrictive use of GMOs; our commitment to open government; and the fact that we have declared our policy as a National Assembly, which the Minister cannot set aside.

If the Minister wants us to support this Order,

hynny, byddai'n rhaid cael darpariaeth ar gyfer gwrandawriad cyhoeddus yn y Gorchymyn ger ein bron heddiw ac nid oes un ar gael. Pam na wnaeth y Gweinidog y ddarpariaeth honno? Mae wedi cyhoeddi dogfen ymgynghori yn egluro y bydd yn dileu'r hawl i wrandawriad cyhoeddus o'r rheoliadau rhestru hadau ac wedi dweud ei fod am ei chynnwys yn y rheoliadau gollwng yn fwriadol, sef y rheoliadau hyn. Fodd bynnag, ni chynhwysir yr hawl honno yma, a hoffwn wybod pam. Mae'n ddigon hawdd i'r Gweinidog ddadlau y gellid diwygio'r rheoliadau rywbryd yn y dyfodol. Byddwn yn barod i wrando ar y ddadl honno. Fodd bynnag, os mai dyna yw ei ddadl, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ymdrin â mater agwedd y gwledydd eraill sy'n rhan o'r weithdrefn hon, oherwydd bydd yn rhaid i'r Alban, Lloegr a Gogledd Iwerddon gytuno ar welliant dilynol i'r rheoliadau hyn? Yn bennaf oherwydd gwrthwynebiad yn yr Alban, ni fu'n bosibl hyd yma i ddod i gytundeb o'r fath.

Pe baem yn derbyn awgrym y Gweinidog i ddiddymu'r hawl i wrandawriad cyhoeddus yn y gred y gellid ei adfer yn y dyfodol, byddem yn prynu cath mewn cwd. Ni fyddai'r gath honno yn mewian, oherwydd nid yw'r Gweinidog yn gallu gweithredu ar hyn. Byddai'n annidwyll pe bai'n awgrymu fel arall. Gall ddadlau mai mater o ddadymafael yw hyn yn hytrach na bod yn annidwyll, a chan mai dadymafael neu 'disengagement' yw gair yr wythnos; mae am ddadymafael o'r Llywodraeth a'i orffennol pan fyddant yn anghyfleus. Fodd bynnag, ni all roi'r materion hyn o'r neilltu y tro hwn.

Mae gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bolisi clir, penodol y cytunwyd arno'n unfrydol ar organebau a addaswyd yn enetig. Nid cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog yw gosod y polisi hwnnw o'r neilltu. Mae tair egwyddor bwysig ar waith: ein polisi o ddefnydd cyfyngedig o organebau a addaswyd yn enetig; ein hymrwymiad i lywodraeth agored; a'r ffaith ein bod wedi datgan ein polisi fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, na all y Gweinidog ei roi o'r neilltu.

Os yw'r Gweinidog am inni gefnogi'r

will he give a clear and unequivocal undertaking that the right to a hearing will not be deleted from the seed listing regulations until such time as a similar provision is included in the deliberate release regulations? We should expect that from the Minister as a minimum requirement.

**Peter Rogers:** It is apparent that the use of GM crops has become increasingly controversial in recent years. The National Assembly must do all in its power to ensure that Wales stays GM-free. The First Minister and his deputy have, on separate occasions, advocated a GM-free Wales. Will they now honour their promises?

Not enough research has been conducted into the implications for human health and the environment of the controversial cultivation of GM crops. The Assembly needs to set an example to the rest of the UK in taking a united stand against adding Chardon LL to the national seed list. Moreover, Wales needs to set an example to the rest of Europe.

The Assembly has rejected amending the definition of harm to that contained in the English regulations. Restricting the definition could lead to adverse effects on human health. It is a priority of the elected Assembly to protect the public and represent its opinions. The public is clearly sceptical about GMOs, and that view must be respected.

We need a public consultation on the deliberate release directive. We cannot allow Chardon LL to be added to the United Kingdom national seed list or the EU common catalogue.

**Richard Edwards:** I am concerned that my constituents will interpret these regulations as a dilution of the Assembly's stand on GMOs, not a strengthening of it. I seek reassurance from the Minister in that regard. As the Assembly knows, resistance to GMOs in Pembrokeshire has been such that, last year, plans for GM maize crop trials in Mathry were aborted because of public pressure. Will the Minister give an unequivocal assurance that the narrower definition of harm

Gorchymyn hwn, a wnaiff addo'n glir a digamsyniol na chaiff yr hawl i wrandawriad ei dileu o'r rheoliadau rhestru hadau hyd nes y bydd darpariaeth debyg wedi ei chynnwys yn y rheoliadau gollwng yn fwriadol? Dylem ddisgwyl hynny gan y Gweinidog fel isafswm gofyniad.

**Peter Rogers:** Mae'n amlwg bod y defnydd o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig wedi mynd yn gynyddol ddadleuol dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wneud popeth o fewn ei allu i sicrhau bod Cymru'n parhau yn rhydd o addasu genetig. Mae'r Prif Weinidog a'i ddirprwy, ar achlysuron gwahanol, wedi dadlau dros Gymru sy'n rhydd o addasu genetig. A anrhydeddant eu haddewidion?

Ni wnaed digon o ymchwil i oblygiadau'r broses ddadleuol o dyfu cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig i iechyd pobl a'r amgylchedd. Mae angen i'r Cynulliad osod esiampl i weddill y DU drwy ddod ynghyd i wrthwynebu'r bwriad i ychwanegu Chardon LL at y rhestr hadau genedlaethol. At hynny, mae angen i Gymru osod esiampl i weddill Ewrop.

Mae'r Cynulliad wedi gwrthod diwygio'r diffiniad o niwed i'r un a gynhwysir yn rheoliadau Lloegr. Gallai cyfyngu ar y diffiniad effeithio'n andwyol ar iechyd pobl. Mae diogelu'r cyhoedd a chynrychioli eu barn yn un o flaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad etholedig. Mae'r cyhoedd yn amlwg yn amau organebau a addaswyd yn enetig, a rhaid parchu'r farn honno.

Mae angen ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus arnom ar y gyfarwyddeb gollwng yn fwriadol. Ni allwn ganiatáu i Chardon LL gael ei ychwanegu at restr hadau genedlaethol y Deyrnas Unedig na chatalog cyffredin yr UE.

**Richard Edwards:** Yr wyf yn bryderus y bydd fy etholwyr yn dehongli'r rheoliadau hyn fel gwanhau safbwynt y Cynulliad ar organebau a addaswyd yn enetig, ac nid fel rhywbeth sy'n ei gryfhau. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog am sicrwydd am hynny. Fel y gŵyr y Cynulliad, bu'r gwrthwynebiad i organebau a addaswyd yn enetig yn Sir Benfro mor gryf fel i gynlluniau ar gyfer treialon cnydau indrawn a addaswyd yn enetig ym Mathri y llynedd gael eu diddymu

contained in these regulations does not represent a retreat or does not in any way hamper our ability to pursue our stated GM policy? Will he explain why he asserts that the definition of harm must be changed to bring the Environmental Protection Act 1990 in line with the directive when that Act has been in force, unchallenged, for 12 years under the previous deliberate release directive, the relevant provisions of which are the same as those of the new directive?

**Mick Bates:** Some interesting comments have been made. I am mindful of our collective desire to have the most restrictive GM crop policy possible in Wales. Ron highlighted the principles at work and we have produced that policy. We can say that because Friends of the Earth is also at work on this in England and Scotland and has not had an impact. Ron also mentioned transparency. In Wales, using the powers available to us under article 16, we established a separation distance. We worked well with Friends of the Earth to achieve that. Far from this being negative, we see a strengthening of our principles.

'Farming for the Future' reflects our good practice of encouraging environmentally friendly farming and organic farming. We took every step possible to ensure that that was achievable. We used the Environmental Protection Act 1990 to enable us to establish a separation distance on environmental grounds. We should continue in that direction. Under article 16—soon to be article 23—we must ensure that we strengthen that. The case is not totally secure. A professor has provided evidence on wind pollination.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Which professor?

**Mick Bates:** I cannot remember the name at the minute. However, the professor said that a separation of 200m is not sufficient and that it should be extended.

**Cynog Dafis:** Mae'r pryder mwyaf yn

oherwydd pwysau'r cyhoedd. A rydd y Gweinidog sicrwydd diamwys nad yw'r diffiniad culach o niwed a gynhwysir yn y rheoliadau hyn mewn unrhyw ffordd yn amharu ar ein gallu i ddatblygu ein polisi penodedig ar addasu yn enetig? A wnaiff egluro pam yr honna fod yn rhaid newid y diffiniad o niwed i gysoni Deddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990 â'r gyfarwyddeb pan fu'r Ddeddf honno mewn grym, yn ddiwrthwynebiad, am 12 mlynedd o dan y gyfarwyddeb flaenorol ar ollwng yn fwriadol, y mae ei darpariaethau perthnasol yr un peth â rhai'r gyfarwyddeb newydd?

**Mick Bates:** Gwnaed rhai sylwadau diddorol. Sylweddolaf fod pob un ohonom am gael y polisi cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig mwyaf cyfyngedig posibl yng Nghymru. Pwysleisiodd Ron yr egwyddorion sydd ar waith ac yr ydym wedi cynhyrchu'r polisi hwnnw. Gallwn ddweud hynny gan fod Cyfeillion y Ddaear hefyd yn gweithio ar hyn yn Lloegr a'r Alban ac nid yw wedi cael effaith. Soniodd Ron hefyd am dryloywder. Yng Nghymru, gan ddefnyddio'r pwerau sydd ar gael i ni o dan erthygl 16, sefydlwyd pellter gwahanu gennym. Bu inni weithio'n dda gyda Chyfeillion y Ddaear i gyflawni hynny. Yn hytrach na bod hyn yn negyddol, fe'i gwelwn fel enghraifft o gryfhau ein hegwyddorion.

Mae 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol' yn adlewyrchu ein harfer da o annog ffermio sy'n ystyriol o'r amgylchedd a ffermio organig. Bu inni gymryd pob cam posibl i sicrhau y gellid cyflawni hynny. Defnyddiasom Ddeddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990 i'n galluogi i sefydlu pellter gwahanu ar sail amgylcheddol. Dylem barhau yn y cyfeiriad hwnnw. O dan erthygl 16—a fydd yn erthygl 23 cyn bo hir—rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cryfhau hynny. Nid yw'r achos yn hollol gadarn. Mae athro coleg wedi darparu tystiolaeth ar wyntbeilliad.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pa athro coleg?

**Mick Bates:** Ni allaf gofio'r enw ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd yr athro coleg nad yw gwahaniad o 200m yn ddigon ac y dylid ei ymestyn.

**Cynog Dafis:** The greatest concern relates to

ymwneud â'r ffaith y gallai ffermwyr organig ddiodeff yn fasnachol yn sgîl plannu cynydau GM yn agos i'w ffermydd. Gallai hyn effeithio ar y prisiau a dderbynia'r ffermwyr am eu cynnyrch, hyd yn oed mewn amgylchiadau lle na ellid profi niwed i'r amgylchedd. Felly mae perygl y gallai'r ffermwyr hyn ddiodeff gan nad yw'r diffiniad o niwed yn cynnwys niwed economaidd neu fasnachol. Mae cyfyngu'r diffiniad o niwed yn golled ac yn gwanhau'r sefyllfa flaenorol. Ni allaf ddeall pam eich bod yn fodlon cymeradwyo—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This is an intervention, not a speech.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for your timely intervention, Deputy Presiding Officer. I would like to put on record that the name of the professor is Professor Jean Emberlin, the director of the National Pollen Research Unit.

To answer Cynog's point, I accept that there will always be a risk involved. Only a definitive case, where it goes to a judicial review, will settle the matter. That route is available to Friends of the Earth, and it can be followed, as Cynog knows. In terms of the price of organic produce, I am not aware that any of the factors you outlined have caused the price of organic milk, for example, to fall. We must be cautious about using price as an argument because there is no connection at present.

We have a great opportunity, when marketing consent is discussed, to ensure that the regulations refer to Wales as a geographic area. I would like to hear the Minister's views on that. That would allow us, under marketing consent, to say that Wales, as a geographic area, can implement as restrictive a policy as possible on GM seeds.

Ron raised the issue of public hearings. I would also like to hear the Minister's views on this because previously, under part C, public hearings were possible. I have no doubt that the consultative processes under the current directive will provide a mechanism by which communities, such as those in Pembrokeshire, will be able to voice

the fact that organic farmers could suffer commercially as a result of GM crops being planted close to their farms. This could affect the price farmers receive for their produce, even in circumstances where environmental damage could not be proved. There is a risk, therefore, that these farmers could suffer because the definition of harm excludes economic or commercial harm. Restricting the definition of harm is detrimental, and it weakens our previous position. I cannot understand why you are willing to approve—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ymyriad yw hyn, nid araith.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch ichi am eich ymyriad amserol, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Hoffwn gofnodi mai enw'r athro coleg yw'r Athro Jean Emberlin, cyfarwyddwr yr Uned Ymchwil Paill Genedlaethol.

I ateb pwynt Cynog, derbyniaf y bydd risg yn gysylltiedig â hyn bob amser. Dim ond achos pendant, lle yr aiff i adolygiad barnwrol, fydd yn setlo'r mater. Mae'r trywydd hwnnw ar gael i Gyfeillion y Ddaear, a gellir ei ddilyn, fel y gŵyr Cynog. O ran pris cynnyrch organig, nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod unrhyw un o'r ffactorau a amlinellwyd gennych wedi achosi i bris llaeth organig, er enghraifft, ostwng. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus ynghylch defnyddio pris fel dadl oherwydd nid oes unrhyw gysylltiad ar hyn o bryd.

Mae gennym gyfle gwych, pan drafodir caniatâd marchnata, i sicrhau bod y rheoliadau yn cyfeirio at Gymru fel ardal ddaearyddol. Hoffwn glywed barn y Gweinidog ar hynny. Byddai hynny'n caniatáu inni, o dan ganiatâd marchnata, ddweud y gall Cymru, fel ardal ddaearyddol, weithredu polisi mor gyfyngedig â phosibl ar hadau a addaswyd yn enetig.

Cododd Ron fater gwrandawiaidau cyhoeddus. Hoffwn glywed barn y Gweinidog ar hyn hefyd oherwydd yn flaenorol, o dan ran C, yr oedd gwrandawiaidau cyhoeddus yn bosibl. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth gennyf y bydd y prosesau ymgynghorol o dan y gyfarwyddeb bresennol yn darparu mecanwaith lle y bydd

their opposition to GMOs.

cymunedau, megis y rhai yn Sir Benfro, yn gallu lleisio eu gwrthwynebiad i organebau a addaswyd yn enetig.

4:30 p.m.

Finally, there is no doubt that the overall effect of the policies that have already been implemented has been good. Scotland and England have failed to make as much progress as we have made. Two steps would help us to continue that progress. One would be to try to re-establish our GM group, so that the legalities of all positions can be well established. The second would be to raise the profile of our accomplishments in Wales by holding a European conference here to ensure that we learn from Europe and that Europe learns from us. There is no doubt that we will retain our position of having the most restrictive GM crop policy possible by accepting this regulation.

I gloi, nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth fod y polisiau a weithredwyd eisoes wedi cael effaith dda ar y cyfan. Mae'r Alban a Lloegr wedi methu â gwneud cymaint o gynnydd ag y gwnaethom ni. Byddai dau gam wedi ein helpu i barhau â'r cynnydd hwnnw. Un fyddai ceisio ailsefydlu ein grŵp cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig, fel y gellir sefydlu cyfreithlondebau pob safbwynt yn dda. Yr ail fyddai codi proffil ein cyflawniadau yng Nghymru drwy gynnal cynhadledd Ewropeaidd yma i sicrhau ein bod yn dysgu o Ewrop a bod Ewrop yn dysgu oddi wrthym ni. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth y byddwn yn parhau â'r safbwynt sydd gennym o gael y polisi cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig mwyaf cyfyngedig posibl drwy dderbyn y rheoliad hwn.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German):** I thank Members for the various points that they have raised. However, Jocelyn, you cannot have it both ways; when you want something, you say the precautionary principle is just a trite measure, when at the same time you are asking for a legal gesture, with regard to misleading the people of Wales on the legality issue. I would like to define the word 'harm' in both the Environmental Protection Act 1990, and in the directive. It must be borne in mind that the Act was drafted before the EU directives came into force. It has not been challenged because no-one has used harm to properties as a justification for an economic basis; otherwise, I am sure that it would have been challenged originally.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German):** Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am y pwyntiau amrywiol a godwyd ganddynt. Fodd bynnag, Jocelyn, ni allwch ei chael hi ddwy ffordd; pan fyddwch am gael rhywbeth, yr ydych yn dweud mai dim ond mesur ystrydebol yw'r egwyddor ragofalus, tra eich bod ar yr un pryd yn gofyn am arwydd cyfreithiol, o ran camarwain pobl Cymru ar fater cyfreithlondeb. Hoffwn ddiffinio'r gair 'niwed' yn Neddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990, ac yn y gyfarwyddeb. Rhaid cofio bod y Ddeddf wedi ei drafftio cyn i gyfarwyddebau'r UE ddod i rym. Ni chafodd ei herio gan nad oes neb wedi defnyddio niwed i eiddo fel cyfiawnhad dros sail economaidd; fel arall, mae'n siwr y byddai wedi cael ei herio'n wreiddiol.

The current legal definition of harm in section 107(6) of the Environmental Protection Act 1990 is capable of being interpreted in a way that is inconsistent with this directive. As the definition of harm includes harm to property, restrictions can be imposed on the use of GMOs because of the risk of conventional and organic farmers suffering economic loss. Member states can only impose restrictions on GMOs that have

Gellir dehongli'r diffiniad cyfreithiol presennol o niwed yn adran 107(6) o Ddeddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990 mewn ffordd sy'n anghyson â'r gyfarwyddeb hon. Gan fod y diffiniad o niwed yn cynnwys niwed i eiddo, gellir gosod cyfyngiadau ar y defnydd o organebau a addaswyd yn enetig oherwydd y risg y bydd ffermwyr confensiynol a ffermwyr organig yn wynebu colledion economaidd. Dim ond os oes

part C consent if there is

‘a risk to human health or the environment’

as stated in article 23 of Directive 2001/18/EC.

In its reference to the environment, the directive is looking at physical harm to animals, plants, land, air and water—the environment—and not pure economic losses that might be faced by one or more groups of producers. The domestic courts would interpret harm to property in section 107 (6) of the Environmental Protection Act 1990, in the light of the directive, as meaning physical harm to animals, plant, land, air and water, not risk of economic loss being suffered by GM or non-GM farmers. Hence, our definitions of harm and environment in regulation 5 of the draft regulations remove the misleading ambiguity in the current definition. On this matter, the legal advice from both Friends of the Earth and Assembly lawyers is that the Assembly can take action only on environmental grounds, not on economic grounds.

**Tom Middlehurst:** I am disappointed that I was not called in the debate. I was advised that I would be called.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. That is for me to decide.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Deputy First Minister, you will be aware of the impact on my constituency of the genetically modified maize trials that took place a year or so ago. Public concern about the matter was clearly reflected in the Chamber, not least by yourself. I have heard little today that reassures me. You have been at great pains to point out the additional measures and powers that will be deferred to the Assembly. However, we should do nothing that diminishes the right of the public to make the appropriate representations and to have the widest public access, through public hearings, that are currently available in the regulations. Without those assurances, I am

‘risg i iechyd pobl neu’r amgylchedd’

y gall aelod-wladwriaethau osod cyfyngiadau ar organebau a addaswyd yn enetig sydd â chaniatâd rhan C fel y nodir yn erthygl 23 o Gyfarwyddeb 2001/18/EC.

Yn ei chyfeiriad at yr amgylchedd, mae’r gyfarwyddeb yn edrych ar niwed ffisegol i anifeiliaid, planhigion, tir, aer a dŵr—yr amgylchedd—ac nid colledion economaidd yn unig a allai gael eu hwynebu gan un neu fwy o grwpiau o gynhyrchwyr. Byddai’r llysoedd yn y wlad hon yn dehongli niwed i eiddo yn adran 107(6) Deddf Diogelu’r Amgylchedd 1990, yng ngoleuni’r gyfarwyddeb, i olygu niwed ffisegol i anifeiliaid, planhigion, tir, aer a dŵr, nid risg o golled economaidd i ffermwyr cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig neu ffermwyr nad ydynt yn tyfu cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Felly, mae ein diffiniadau o niwed ac amgylchedd yn rheoliad 5 y rheoliadau drafft yn dileu’r amwysedd camarweiniol yn y diffiniad cyfredol. Ar y mater hwn, mae’r cyngor cyfreithiol gan Gyfeillion y Ddaear a chyfreithwyr y Cynulliad yn nodi mai dim ond ar sail amgylcheddol, ac nid ar sail economaidd y gall y Cynulliad weithredu.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Yr wyf yn siomedig na chefais fy ngalw yn y ddadl. Fe’m cyngorwyd y buaswn yn cael fy ngalw.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Fy mhenderfyniad i yw hynny.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol o effaith y treialon ar indrawn a addaswyd yn enetig ar fy etholaeth a gynhaliwyd flwyddyn neu ddwy yn ôl. Adlewyrchwyd pryder cyhoeddus am y mater yn glir yn y Siambr, nid yn lleiaf gennych chi. Nid wyf wedi clywed llawer heddiw i’r sicrhau. Yr ydych wedi trafferthu i nodi’r mesurau a’r pwerau ychwanegol a gaiff eu hildio i’r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem wneud unrhyw beth sy’n lleihau hawl y cyhoedd i wneud y sylwadau priodol ac i gael y mynediad cyhoeddus ehangaf, drwy wrandawladau cyhoeddus, sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd yn y rheoliadau. Heb y sicrwydd hwnnw, ni allaf gefnogi’r newidiadau



unable to support these regulatory changes.

**Michael German:** That was going to be my next point—I have dealt with the issue of harm and I now wish to mention public hearings. As you know, we are discussing a different set of regulations. The Assembly is consulting on the proposed changes and no decision has yet been made—the closing date on the consultation was 16 December. Along with the other UK administrations, we are seeking views on whether assessing the scientific issues surrounding genetic modification is more effectively done prior to authorisation of experiments or marketing release of GMO plants. Admittedly that could be done by amending or dealing with these particular regulations. However, this Assembly Government agrees that the right to a hearing should not be removed until an equivalent right is in its place. Both you and Ron have raised that issue, which I support entirely.

**Ron Davies:** With the greatest respect, that is not the point. I asked you to give a clear, unequivocal commitment not to remove the right in the listing regulations until these regulations are amended. The word that you used—and I am sure that it was carefully chosen—was that the Assembly Government believes that the right ‘should’ be there. However, you must get the agreement of the three other countries and, without that, the National Assembly’s policy in respect of genetically modified crops goes out of the window. If we agree to these regulations this afternoon without your having given a clear and specific commitment, we are selling the pass on GM crops in Wales.

**Michael German:** All I can say is that that is the Welsh Assembly Government’s commitment. I take that position, and I will argue for it. We are currently consulting on it: the consultation exercise has not finished, and the process continues. These regulations are now late in being determined; they must be in place by the end of 2002 to comply with the regulations already in place in England and Scotland.

I guarantee that I will argue at every step of

rheoliadol hyn.

**Michael German:** Dyna oedd fy mhwynt nesaf—yr wyf wedi delio â mater niwed a dymunaf yn awr sôn am wrandawiadau cyhoeddus. Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym yn trafod cyfres wahanol o reoliadau. Mae’r Cynulliad yn ymgynghori ar y newidiadau arfaethedig ac ni wnaed unrhyw benderfyniad eto—y dyddiad cau ar gyfer yr ymgynghoriad oedd 16 Rhagfyr. Ar y cyd â gweinyddiaethau eraill y DU, yr ydym yn ceisio barn ar ba un a asesir y materion gwyddonol sy’n gysylltiedig ag addasu genetig yn fwy effeithiol cyn awdurdodi arbrofion neu farchnata planhigion ag organebau a addaswyd yn enetig. Wrth gwrs, gellid gwneud hynny drwy ddiwygio neu ddelio â’r rheoliadau penodol hyn. Fodd bynnag, cytuna Llywodraeth y Cynulliad na ddylid dileu’r hawl i wrandawriad hyd nes y bydd hawl gyfatebol yn ei lle. Yr ydych chi a Ron wedi codi’r mater hwnnw, ac fe’i cefnogaf yn llwyr.

**Ron Davies:** Gyda’r parch mwyaf, nid dyna’r pwynt. Gofynnais ichi roi ymrwymiad diamwys a chlr i beidio â dileu’r hawl yn y rheoliadau rhestru hyd nes y diwygir y rheoliadau hyn. Y gair y bu i chi ei ddefnyddio—ac yr wyf yn siwr iddo gael ei ddewis yn ofalus—oedd bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn credu y ‘dylai’r hawl fod yno. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ichi gael cytundeb y tair gwlad arall a, heb hynny, dyna ddiwedd ar bolisi’r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o ran cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Pe gytunem i’r rheoliadau hyn y prynhawn yma heb ichi roi ymrwymiad clir a phenodol, yr ydym yn bradychu cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig yng Nghymru.

**Michael German:** Y cyfan a ddywedaf yw mai dyna yw ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Arddelaf y safbwynt hwnnw, a byddaf yn dadlau drosto. Yr ydym ar hyn o bryd yn ymgynghori arno: nid yw’r ymarfer ymgynghori wedi ei gwblhau eto, ac mae’r broses yn mynd rhagddi. Mae’r penderfyniad ar y rheoliadau hyn yn hwyr erbyn hyn; rhaid iddynt fod ar waith erbyn diwedd 2002 i gydymffurfio â’r rheoliadau sydd eisoes ar waith yn Lloegr a’r Alban.

Gwarantaf y byddaf yn dadlau bob cam o’r

the way for that decision, which is that the Assembly Government's position is correct. There should not be any changes to the public hearing list without that right being given an equivalent place in the regulations. However, if I am not legally in a position to argue for that because of the restrictions placed upon me by the other administrations, I will have to return and argue for it before the Assembly. I cannot decide on a matter that has been out to consultation, the result of which I have not yet seen or heard. The debate is ongoing, so I cannot present its conclusions to any forum. I have not yet read the consultative arguments.

**Ron Davies:** The logic of your argument is that you now include an equivalent right in the regulations that we are considering. If your wish is to take them out of the listing regulations, why do you not put them in these release regulations?

**Michael German:** You misunderstand me. It is not my intention to take them out of the listing regulations. The listing regulations are not before us; they are not being debated here today. I have stated the Welsh Assembly Government's position, namely that the right to a hearing should not be removed until an equivalent right is in place. That is as much of a guarantee as one can give on this matter. When we come to debate the regulations before us, we will have to transpose any amendments made into this directive. However, if no changes are made, the regulations will remain as they are.

**Peter Law:** Mike, many times we have heard you expressing one point of view as leader of the Liberal Democrat group, or expressing another as the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad. We all know your previous stance on this as leader of the Liberal Democrat group. Is it not therefore the height of hypocrisy that you expect us to agree to a new set of regulations today without the right to a public hearing, when you have taken advantage of that in the past? Should you not be telling us that, as Minister, you commit yourself to supporting the view that the right to a public hearing be perpetuated in these new

ffordd o blaid y penderfyniad hwnnw, sef bod safbwynt Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gywir. Ni ddylai fod unrhyw newidiadau i restr y gwrandawiaid cyhoeddus heb i'r hawl honno gael lle cyfatebol yn y rheoliadau. Fodd bynnag, os nad wyf mewn sefyllfa yn gyfreithiol i ddadlau o blaid hynny oherwydd y cyfyngiadau a osodwyd arnaf gan y gweinyddiaethau eraill, bydd yn rhaid imi ddychwelyd a dadlau o'i blaid ger bron y Cynulliad. Ni allaf benderfynu ar fater yr ymgynghorwyd yn ei gylch, ac nad wyf wedi gweld na chlywed ei ganlyniad eto. Mae'r ddadl yn mynd rhagddi, felly ni allaf gyflwyno ei chasgliadau i unrhyw fforwm. Nid wyf wedi darllen dadleuon yr ymgynghoriad eto.

**Ron Davies:** Rhesymeg eich dadl yw eich bod yn awr yn cynnwys hawl gyfatebol yn y rheoliadau a ystyriwn. Os dymunwch eu dileu o'r rheoliadau rhestru, pam na roddwch hwy yn y rheoliadau gollwng hyn?

**Michael German:** Yr ydych wedi fy nghamddeall. Nid wyf yn bwriadu eu dileu o'r rheoliadau rhestru. Nid yw'r rheoliadau rhestru ger ein bron; ni chânt eu trafod yma heddiw. Yr wyf wedi datgan safbwynt Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, sef na ddylid dileu'r hawl i wrandawiad hyd nes bod hawl gyfatebol yn ei lle. Ni allaf roi mwy na hynny o warant ar y mater hwn. Pan ddaw'n amser i drafod y rheoliadau ger ein bron, bydd yn rhaid inni drosglwyddo unrhyw ddiwygiadau a wnaed i'r gyfarwydddeb hon. Fodd bynnag, os na wneir newidiadau, bydd y rheoliadau yn aros fel y maent.

**Peter Law:** Mike, yr ydym wedi eich clywed sawl gwaith yn mynegi un safbwynt fel arweinydd grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, neu'n mynegi un arall fel y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor. Gŵyr pob un ohonom eich safbwynt blaenorol ar hyn fel arweinydd grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Felly onid ydych yn hollol ragrithiol yn disgwyl inni gytuno i gyfres newydd o reoliadau heddiw heb yr hawl i wrandawiad cyhoeddus, pan ydych wedi manteisio ar hynny yn y gorffennol? Oni ddylech fod yn dweud wrthym eich bod, fel Gweinidog, yn addo cefnogi'r farn fod yr

regulations?

**Michael German:** As I said, I am committed to having a right to a public hearing, either in the existing regulations, which are not before us today, or in these regulations. If a change were to be made, those regulations would have to be brought before us for debate. My view and the view of the Government here is that the right to a hearing should not be removed until there is an equivalent right in these regulations. However, no decision has yet been made as to whether there will be any change to any of these regulations. The right to a hearing remains in place.

**Mick Bates:** To make this point absolutely clear, is the right to a public hearing diminished by voting for these regulations today or not?

**Michael German:** It is not diminished, because the right to a hearing is still in place. If it were to be removed, that would be different. The Assembly will not remove the right to a hearing without debating the regulations here. A right to a hearing remains in place, but concerns a different set of regulations.

**Ron Davies:** Point that out to Mick Bates, then. Your consultation document of 19 September 2002 states

‘in summary, we believe that the national list system is not the appropriate place to challenge GM safety assessments’.

That is your policy, Mike. You want to take the right to a public hearing out of the listing regulations. Will you explain that to Mick in one-syllable words so that he can understand it?

**Michael German:** I will explain it once again to you in one-syllable words, Ron. The right to a public hearing is still in place as part of these regulations. Any changes to that would have to be made by the Assembly.

The issue of whether there is an economic basis—

hawl i wrandawriad cyhoeddus yn parhau yn y rheoliadau newydd hyn?

**Michael German:** Fel y dywedais, yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i gael hawl i wrandawriad cyhoeddus, naill ai yn y rheoliadau presennol, nad ydynt ger ein bron heddiw, neu yn y rheoliadau hyn. Pe bai newid yn cael ei wneud, byddai'n rhaid i'r rheoliadau hynny gael eu dwyn ger ein bron i'w trafod. Fy marn i a barn y Llywodraeth yma yw na ddylai'r hawl i wrandawriad gael ei dileu hyd nes bod hawl gyfatebol yn y rheoliadau hyn. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaed unrhyw benderfyniad eto ar ba un a fydd unrhyw newid i unrhyw un o'r rheoliadau hyn ai peidio. Erys yr hawl i wrandawriad mewn grym.

**Mick Bates:** I wneud y pwynt hwn yn hollol glir, a yw'r hawl i wrandawriad cyhoeddus yn cael ei lleihau drwy bleidleisio dros y rheoliadau hyn heddiw ai peidio?

**Michael German:** Ni chaiff ei lleihau, oherwydd mae'r hawl i wrandawriad mewn grym o hyd. Pe bai'n cael ei dileu, byddai hynny'n wahanol. Ni fydd y Cynulliad yn dileu'r hawl i wrandawriad heb drafod y rheoliadau yma. Erys yr hawl i wrandawriad mewn grym, ond mae'n ymwneud â chyfres wahanol o reoliadau.

**Ron Davies:** Dywedwch hynny wrth Mick Bates, felly. Noda eich dogfen ymgynghori dyddiedig 19 Medi 2002

i grynhoi, ni chredwn mai system y rhestr genedlaethol yw'r lle priodol i herio asesiadau diogelwch GM.

Dyna eich polisi, Mike. Yr ydych am ddileu'r hawl i wrandawriad cyhoeddus o'r rheoliadau rhestru. A eglurwch hynny i Mick mewn geiriau unsill fel y gall ei ddeall?

**Michael German:** Fe'i hegluraf unwaith yn rhagor i chi mewn geiriau unsill, Ron. Mae'r hawl i wrandawriad cyhoeddus mewn grym o hyd yn y rheoliadau hyn. Byddai unrhyw newidiadau i hynny yn gorfod cael eu gwneud gan y Cynulliad.

Mae'r cwestiwn a oes sail economaidd—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up now.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben yn awr.

**Michael German:** In that case I will finish there.

**Michael German:** Os felly, gorffennaf yn awr.

4:40 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM1277): O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 19.  
Motion (NDM1277): For 31, Abstain 0, Against 19.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1278): O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 19.  
Motion (NDM1278): For 31, Abstain 0, Against 19.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William

Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

Hancock, Brian  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Deddf Digartrefedd 2002 Delegation of the Functions of the Homelessness Act 2002**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We are now short of time, so I appeal for short speeches by Members.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr ydym yn brin o amser erbyn hyn, felly gofynnaf i Aelodau am areithiau byr.

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62 (1) (b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate to the First Minister all the functions of the National Assembly, save those which by law cannot be so delegated, contained in or under the Homelessness Act 2002. (NDM1280)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gan weithredu o dan adran 62(1)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo i Brif Weindog Cymru holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn, neu o dan, Ddeddf Digartrefedd 2002, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir yn ôl y gyfraith eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw. (NDM1280)*

**Janet Ryder:** When does the Minister intend to review the strategies that councils will put in place? When they are reviewed, will she ensure that what councils say is happening is really the case in practice? In my constituency, as in many others, there are people who qualify as being homeless but are not treated as a priority in their areas. Will she also satisfy herself that those who are offered accommodation are made aware of subsection 7C of the Homelessness Act 2002,

**Janet Ryder:** Pryd mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu adolygu'r strategaethau y bydd cynghorau yn eu rhoi ar waith? Pan gânt eu hadolygu, a wnaiff sicrhau bod yr hyn y dywed y cynghorau sy'n digwydd yn digwydd mewn gwirionedd? Yn fy etholaeth i, fel mewn sawl un arall, mae pobl a elwir yn ddigartref ond na chânt eu trin fel blaenoriaeth yn eu hardaloedd. A wnaiff hi fodloni ei hun bod y rheini y cynigir llety iddynt yn ymwybodol o isadran 7C o Ddeddf

which states that

‘the applicant is free to reject a qualifying offer without affecting the duty owed to him under this section by the authority.’?

There are many people in my constituency, particularly women in refuges, who have accepted an offer of accommodation that they feel is unacceptable and unsuitable, because they are scared of jeopardising future offers of accommodation. When you review the strategies, will you bear those issues in mind? Will you also join me in congratulating the jazz group, Assembly Broadband, which raised £285 yesterday for Cardiff Action for the Single Homeless?

**William Graham:** The Government will know that it is failing on the homelessness issue. Sadly, homelessness continues to rise. The use of bed and breakfast accommodation for the homeless also continues to rise, despite assurances to the contrary. We will vote against this measure—although we do not often have to directly criticise the Finance Minister—because she has entrusted much of the thrust and direction of this legislation to the Deputy Minister, in whom we have no confidence whatsoever.

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** This is a delegation of functions Order. I note Janet Ryder’s comments and I congratulate those who raised the money. I do not accept that we are not successful in dealing with homelessness, to which we have allocated a great deal of additional money. We are doing the business and trying to tackle this issue properly in Wales.

Digartrefedd 2002, sy’n nodi

gall yr ymgeisydd wrthod cynnig amodol heb i hynny effeithio ar gyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod tuag ato dan yr adran hon.

Mae llawer o bobl yn fy etholaeth, yn enwedig merched mewn llochesi, sydd wedi derbyn cynnig o lety sydd yn annerbyniol ac anaddas yn eu barn hwy, am eu bod yn ofni na chânt unrhyw gynigion llety yn y dyfodol. Pan adolygwch y strategaethau, a wnewch chi gadw’r materion hynny mewn cof? A ymunwch â mi hefyd i longyfarch y grŵp jazz, Assembly Broadband, a gododd £285 ddoe ar gyfer Cardiff Action for the Single Homeless?

**William Graham:** Gŵyr y Llywodraeth ei bod yn methu o ran digartrefedd. Yn anffodus, mae digartrefedd yn parhau i godi. Mae defnyddio llety gwely a brecwast ar gyfer y digartref yn parhau i godi hefyd, er gwaethaf sicrwydd i’r gwrthwyneb. Byddwn yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y mesur hwn—er nad oes rhaid inni feirniadu’r Gweinidog Cyllid yn uniongyrchol yn aml—gan ei bod wedi ymddiried llawer o swm a sylwedd a chyfeiriad y ddeddfwriaeth hon i’r Dirprwy Weinidog, nad oes gennym unrhyw hyder ynddo o gwbl.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Dirprwyo’r Gorchymyn swyddogaethau yw hyn. Nodaf sylwadau Janet Ryder a hoffwn longyfarch y rheini a gododd yr arian. Ni dderbyniaf nad ydym yn llwyddiannus wrth ddelio â digartrefedd gan inni neilltuo swm mawr ychwanegol o arian iddo. Yr ydym yn gwneud ein gwaith ac yn ceisio mynd i’r afael â’r mater hwn yn gywir yng Nghymru.

*Cynnig (NDM1280): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.*

*Motion (NDM1280): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Davies, David  
Graham, William  
Jones, David Ian  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 4.45 p.m.  
 The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.45 p.m.*

**Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ a Chymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reol  
 Sefydlog Rhif 36  
 Delegation of Functions to the House Committee and Approval of Changes to  
 Standing Order No. 36**

**Y Llywydd:** Byddwn yn trafod y cynigion hyn gyda'i gilydd.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will discuss these motions together.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** I propose that

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Cynigiaf fod

*in exercise of its powers under section 62 of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and of all other powers enabling it in that behalf, the National Assembly for Wales:*

*wrth arfer ei bwerau o dan adran 62 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a'r holl bwerau eraill sy'n ei alluogi yn hynny o beth, mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*(1) delegates to the House Committee established under Standing Order No. 36 its functions:*

*(1) yn dirprwyo i Bwyllgor y Ty a sefydlwyd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 36 ei swyddogaethau:-*

*(a) under sections 33, 34(1), 40, and 85 of that Act; and*

*(a) o dan adrannau 33, 34(1), 40 a 85 y Ddeddf honno; ac*

<i>(b) in respect of the civil service management functions within the meaning of section 1 of the Civil Service (Management Functions) Act 1992,</i>	<i>(b) o ran y gwasanaeth sifil, swyddogaethau rheoli o fewn ystyr adran 1 Deddf y Gwasanaeth Sifil (Swyddogaethau Rheoli) 1992;</i>
<i>but subject to the following limitations:</i>	<i>ond yn ddarostyngedig i'r cyfyngiadau a ganlyn:-</i>
<i>(i) the said functions are only delegated so far as applicable to the Committee's terms of reference under Standing Order No. 36.2; and</i>	<i>(i) ni fydd y swyddogaethau hynny ond yn cael eu dirprwyo cyn bellad ag y mae'n gymwys i gylch gorchwyl y Pwyllgor o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 36.2; a</i>
<i>(ii) the House Committee shall delegate to staff of the Assembly the above functions delegated to it.</i>	<i>(ii) bydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn dirprwyo i staff y Cynulliad y swyddogaethau uchod a ddirprwywyd iddo</i>
<i>(2) revokes any existing delegation by it of the above functions to the First Minister but only so far as those functions are now delegated to the House Committee. (NDM1258)</i>	<i>(2) yn diddymu unrhyw ddirprwyo blaenorol ganddo o'r swyddogaethau uchod i'r Prif Weinidog ond dim ond i'r graddau y mae'r swyddogaethau hynny bellach wedi'u dirprwyo i Bwyllgor y Tŷ. (NDM1258)</i>
I propose that	Cynigiau fod
<i>the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act and Standing Order No. 34:</i>	<i>y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34:</i>
<i>(i) considers the report of the Business Committee laid in the Table Office on 9 December 2002; and</i>	<i>(i) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Rhagfyr 2002; ac yn</i>
<i>(ii) approves the following revision of Standing Orders:</i>	<i>(ii) cymeradwyo'r diwygiad a ganlyn i'r Rheol Sefydlog.</i>
<i>For Standing Order No. 36 substitute</i>	<i>Rhoi yn lle rheol sefydlog Rhif 36:</i>
<i>Standing Order No. 36 - House Committee Title</i>	<i>Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 36 - Pwyllgor y Ty Teitl</i>
<i>There shall be a House Committee.</i>	<i>Bydd yna Bwyllgor Ty</i>
<i>Terms of Reference</i>	<i>Cylch Gorchwyl</i>
<i>36.2 Subject to the following provisions of this Standing Order, the Committee is responsible for:</i>	<i>36.2 Yn amodol ar ddarpariaethau canlynol y rheol sefydlog hon, mae'r Pwyllgor yn gyfrifol am:</i>
<i>(a) the provision to and for Members (including when acting in proceedings of the Assembly) of facilities, accommodation, staff and such other support services as are reasonably necessary for the better performance by Members of their position as Members of the Assembly, including in its</i>	<i>(a) ddarparu i'r Aelodau ac ar eu cyfer (gan gynnwys pan fyddant yn cymryd rhan yn nhrefodion y Cynulliad) gyfleusterau, llety, staff a'r gwasanaethau cymorth eraill sy'n rhesymol angenrheidiol er mwyn i'r Aelodau arfer eu gwaith yn well fel Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, gan gynnwys yn rhinwedd ei waith</i>



*capacity as a legislative body ;*

*fel corff deddfwriaethol;*

*(b) the provision of translation services between English and Welsh for proceedings of the Assembly;*

*(b) darparu gwasanaethau cyfieithu Cymraeg a Saesneg ar gyfer trafodion y Cynulliad;*

*(c) the preparation of guidance to Members on matters within the Committee's responsibilities;*

*(c) paratoi canllawiau i'r Aelodau ar faterion y mae'r Pwyllgor yn gyfrifol amdanynt;*

*(d) the provision of advice to the Assembly on matters relating to its terms of reference and to Members' salaries, allowances and pensions;*

*(d) rhoi cyngor i'r Cynulliad ar faterion yn ymwneud â'i gylch gorchwyl a chyflogau, lwfansau a phensiynau'r Aelodau;*

*(e) the preparation of a draft budget for the expenditure to be incurred by it and for the administration of the approved budget; and*

*(e) paratoi cyllideb ddrافت ar gyfer y gwariant y bydd yn ei dynnu a gweinyddu'r gyllideb gymeradwy; a*

*(f) the provision of such other services to and for Members of a similar nature to those described above including responsibility for any extension to the building where the Assembly normally meets in Plenary session, as the Assembly may from time to time authorise by resolution in Plenary.*

*(f) pharatoi'r gwasanaethau eraill i'r Aelodau ac ar eu cyfer sy'n debyg i'r rhai a ddisgrifir uchod gan gynnwys cyfrifoldeb dros unrhyw estyniad i'r adeilad lle mae'r Cynulliad yn arfer cynnal ei gyfarfodydd llawn, yn unol â'r hyn y gallai'r Cynulliad ei awdurdodi o bryd i'w gilydd drwy benderfyniad yn y cyfarfod llawn.*

*36.3 Nothing in paragraph 36.2 shall make it part of the Committee's terms of reference to have responsibility:-*

*36.3 Ni fydd unrhyw beth ym mharagraff 36.2 yn peri y bydd cylch gorchwyl y pwyllgor yn rhoi iddo gyfrifoldeb:-*

*(a) in any field in which the Assembly has functions (within the meaning of section 57 of the Act); or*

*(a) yn unrhyw faes y mae gan y Cynulliad swyddogaethau ynddo (o fewn ystyr adran 57 o'r Ddeddf); nac*

*(b) in respect of proceedings of the Assembly Cabinet*

*(b) o ran trafodion Cabinet y Cynulliad*

#### *Membership*

#### *Aelodaeth*

*36.4 Subject to the requirement of section 54 (2) (b) of the Act and paragraph 8.3 that, as far as is practicable, the balance of the political groups in the Assembly is reflected in the membership of the Committee, the House Committee shall consist of at least 7 and not more than 11 members including the Chair.*

*36.4 Yn ddarostyngedig i ofynion adran 54 (2) (b) y Ddeddf a pharagraff 8.3, y dylai cydbwysedd grwpiau gwleidyddol y Cynulliad, cyn belled ag y mae hynny'n ymarferol, gael ei adlewyrchu yn aelodaeth y Pwyllgor, bydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn cynnwys o leiaf 7 a hyd at 11 aelod gan gynnwys y Cadeirydd.*

*36.5 If elected to be members of the Committee, the Presiding Officer, the Deputy Presiding Officer and the Business Minister shall cease to be members of the Committee once they cease to hold those offices.*

*36.5 Os cânt eu hethol yn aelodau o'r Pwyllgor, bydd y Llywydd, y Dirprwy Lywydd a'r Trefnydd yn peidio â bod yn aelodau o'r pwyllgor unwaith y byddant wedi gadael y swyddi hynny.*

36.6 *In the event of the Presiding Officer or the Deputy Presiding Officer or the Business Minister not being members of the Committee they shall be entitled to attend meetings of the Committee and may participate in meetings, with the consent of the Chair, but may not vote.*

36.7 *A Committee member ('the member'), who has given advance notice to the Chair, may be represented at a meeting of the Committee by another Member nominated from the same political group who has been identified in advance. In giving such notice, the member shall indicate the reason for the need for substitution. The nominated representative may participate in the meeting of the Committee in all respects as if he or she were a member of it. No Member may represent more than one Committee member at a meeting.*

36.8 *The Committee shall elect one of its members to chair it.*

36.9 *Another member of the Committee may chair a meeting of the Committee in the absence of the Chair of the Committee or if the Chair is disqualified from participating in the Committee's consideration of any matter or otherwise voluntarily withdraws from such participation. Such member shall be appointed at the meeting concerned or at a previous meeting.*

#### *Meetings*

36.10 *The Committee shall meet not less than once in every 4 weeks that the Assembly meets in Plenary, unless the Committee decides otherwise.*

36.11 *The Committee may, as it considers appropriate, meet in public or in private, but the minutes of its meetings shall be published not later than 6 weeks after the meeting to which the minutes relate.*

36.12 *The Committee may report to the Assembly from time to time and shall submit an annual report.*

#### *The Presiding Office*

36.6 *Os na fydd y Llywydd neu'r Dirprwy Lywydd neu'r Trefnydd yn aelodau o'r Pwyllgor bydd ganddynt hawl i fynychu cyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor a chânt gymryd rhan yn y cyfarfodydd, gyda chaniatâd y Cadeirydd, ond ni chânt bleidleisio.*

36.7 *Gall aelod o'r Pwyllgor ('yr aelod'), ar ôl rhoi hysbysiad ymlaen llaw i'r Cadeirydd, gael ei gynrychioli yn un o gyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor gan aelod arall a enwebir o blith yr un grwp gwleidyddol y mae'r aelod hwnnw'n perthyn iddo ac a enwir ymlaen llaw. Wrth roi rhybudd o'r fath, bydd yr aelod yn rhoi'r rheswm dros anfon eilydd. Gall yr aelod a enwebir gymryd rhan yn y cyfarfod ym mhob agwedd fel pe bai ef neu hi yn aelod o'r pwyllgor. Ni chaff unrhyw aelod gynrychioli mwy nag un aelod o'r Pwyllgor mewn cyfarfod.*

36.8 *Bydd y Pwyllgor yn ethol un o'r aelodau'n Gadeirydd.*

36.9 *Caff aelod arall o'r Pwyllgor gadeirio un o gyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor yn absenoldeb y cadeirydd neu os na chaniateir i'r cadeirydd gymryd rhan yn ystyriaethau'r Pwyllgor o unrhyw fater neu os yw'n dewis peidio â chymryd rhan. Penodir yr aelod hwnnw gan y Pwyllgor naill ai yn y cyfarfod o dan sylw neu mewn cyfarfod blaenorol.*

#### *Cyfarfodydd*

36.10 *Bydd y Pwyllgor yn cyfarfod o leiaf unwaith ym mhob pedair wythnos y bydd y Cynulliad yn cynnal cyfarfodydd llawn, oni bai bod y Pwyllgor yn penderfynu fel arall.*

36.11 *Bydd y Pwyllgor yn cyfarfod yn gyhoeddus neu'n breifat, fel y gwêl yn briodol, ond caiff cofnodion y cyfarfodydd eu cyhoeddi chwe wythnos fan bellaf ar ôl pob cyfarfod.*

36.12 *Gall y Pwyllgor adrodd i'r Cynulliad o bryd i'w gilydd a bydd yn cyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol.*

#### *Swyddfa'r Llywydd*

36.13 *The staff support services that the Committee is responsible for providing under its terms of reference shall be provided through the unit of Assembly staff known as the Presiding Office and headed by the Clerk and which is established and maintained under arrangements put in place by the Permanent Secretary.*

*Code of Conduct*

36.14 *The Chair of the Committee shall prepare and submit to the Assembly for its approval guidance ('the Code') to:-*

*(a) the Committee on its terms of reference; and*

*(b) the members of the Committee on their responsibilities as members of the Committee.*

*The Code shall include guidance on the relationship of the Committee and its members with the Permanent Secretary and with the Clerk and the other staff in the Presiding Office.*

*The Chair of the Committee shall issue a copy of the Code to each member of the Committee and shall seek to ensure that each member of the Committee complies with it.*

*Assembly Ministers and Other Assembly Staff*

36.17 *Subject to paragraph 36.18, nothing in this Standing Order shall make it part of the Committee's terms of reference to provide facilities, accommodation, staff or other support services or guidance to or for any Member when acting as an Assembly Minister or Assembly staff who are not part of the Presiding Office.*

36.18 *Paragraph 36.17 shall not apply to the advice that the Committee may give under paragraph 36.2(d) in so far as it relates to advice on Members' salaries, allowances and pensions.*

*Transitional Provisions*

36.19 *The first members of the Committee as*

36.13 *Bydd gwasanaethau staff cymorth y mae'r Pwyllgor yn gyfrifol am eu darparu o dan ei gylch gorchwyl yn cael eu darparu drwy uned staff y Cynulliad a elwir yn Swyddfa'r Llywydd. Y Clerc fydd pennaeth Swyddfa'r Llywydd a chaiff ei sefydlu a'i chynnal o dan drefniadau a wneir gan yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol.*

*Cod Ymddygiad*

36.14 *Bydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn paratoui ac yn cyflwyno i'r Cynulliad eu cymeradwyo ganllawiau ('y Cod') i'r:-*

*(a) Pwyllgor ar ei gylch gorchwyl; ac i*

*(b) aelodau'r Pwyllgor ar eu cyfrifoldebau fel aelodau'r Pwyllgor.*

*Bydd y cod yn cynnwys canllawiau ar berthynas y Pwyllgor a'i aelodau â'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol a'r Clerc a staff eraill yn Swyddfa'r Llywydd.*

*Bydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn rhoi copi o'r cod i bob aelod o'r Pwyllgor a bydd yn ceisio sicrhau bod pob aelod o'r Pwyllgor yn cydymffurfio ag ef.*

*Gweinidogion y Cynulliad a Staff Eraill y Cynulliad*

36.17 *Yn ddarostyngedig i baragraff 36.18, ni fydd unrhyw beth yn y Rheol Sefydlog hon yn peri ei bod yn rhan o gylch gorchwyl y pwyllgor i ddarparu cyfleusterau, llety, staff na gwasanaethau cymorth eraill na chanllawiau i unrhyw aelod nac ar ei gyfer wrth weithredu fel Gweinidog y Cynulliad neu staff y Cynulliad nad ydynt yn rhan o Swyddfa'r Llywydd.*

36.18 *Ni fydd paragraff 36.17 yn berthnasol i'r cyngor y gallai'r Pwyllgor ei roi o dan baragraff 36.2(d) i'r graddau y mae'n ymwneud â chyngor ar gyflogau, lwfansau a phensiynau'r Aelodau.*

*Darpariaethau Trosiannol*

36.19 *Bydd aelodau cyntaf y Pwyllgor, yn*

*reconstituted by the preceding paragraphs of this Standing Order shall be elected as soon as possible, whereupon the members of the House Committee as constituted under the provisions replaced by this Standing Order shall cease to hold office in that capacity and to that extent paragraph 8.3 shall not apply. This paragraph shall cease to have effect on the members of the House Committee as previously constituted ceasing to hold office.* (NDM1257)

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No.34:*

*(i) considers the report of the Business Committee laid in the Table Office on 9 December 2002;*

*(ii) approves the following revisions to Standing Orders:*

*(a) Interpretation paragraph*

*Definition of Clerk: Replace 'Office of Presiding Officer' with 'Presiding Office'*

*(b) Standing Order No. 4*

*4.3 and 4.4 replace 'Office of the Presiding Officer' with 'Table Office'*

*(c) Standing Order No. 5*

*5.1 at the end add 'and a Member of the House Committee answering on behalf of that Committee'*

*(d) Standing Order No. 6*

*6.3 insert new (vi) as follows:*

*(vi) a member of the House Committee to answer questions for oral answer at least once, and for at least 5 minutes, in every four weeks that the Assembly meets in plenary.*

*6.5 insert new subparagraph as follows:*

*unol â'r ailgyfansoddi ym mharagraffau blaenorol y Rheol Sefydlog hon, yn cael eu hethol cyn gynted â phosibl, a phryd hynny bydd aelodau Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn unol â'r cyfansoddiad yn y darpariaethau y daw'r Rheol Sefydlog hon yn eu lle, yn peidio â dal y swyddi hynny ac i'r graddau hynny ni fydd paragraff 8.3 yn gymwys. Bydd effaith y paragraff hwn ar aelodau Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn unol â'r cyfansoddiad blaenorol yn dod i ben pan fyddant yn peidio â dal y swyddi hyn.* (NDM1257)

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34:*

*(i) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Rhagfyr 2002;*

*(ii) yn cymeradwyo'r diwygiadau a ganlyn i'r Rheolau Sefydlog*

*(a) Paragraff Dehongli*

*Diffiniad o'r Clerc: Rhoi 'Swyddfa'r Llywydd' yn lle 'Swyddfa'r Llywydd' [Nid yw'r newid hwn yn effeithio ar y fersiwn Gymraeg]*

*(b) Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 4*

*4.3 a 4.4 rhoi 'i'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno' yn lle 'i Swyddfa'r Llywydd'*

*(c) Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 5*

*5.1 ychwanegu ar y diwedd 'ac aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ sy'n ateb ar ran y Pwyllgor hwnnw'*

*(d) Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6*

*6.3 rhoi (vi) newydd fel a ganlyn:*

*(vi) i aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ ateb cwestiynau llafar o leiaf unwaith, ac am o leiaf 5 munud, ym mhob pedair wythnos y bydd y Cynulliad yn cwrdd mewn Cyfarfod Llawn.*

*6.5 ychwanegu is-baragraff newydd fel a*

	ganlyn:
<i>(va) debate on annual report of the House Committee</i>	<i>(va) dadl ar adroddiad blynyddol Pwyllgor y Tŷ</i>
6.9. at end add:	6.9 ychwanegu ar y diwedd:
<i>If the matter is within the responsibilities of the House Committee, then for 'Minister' in this paragraph, there shall be substituted 'a member of the House Committee answering on behalf of that Committee'.</i>	<i>os bydd y mater yn rhan o gyfrifoldebau Pwyllgor y Tŷ, yna yn lle 'Gweinidog' yn y paragraff hwn, rhodder 'aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ yn ateb ar ran y Pwyllgor hwnnw.'</i>
6.11 after entry 'Statements by Ministers' insert:	6.11 ar ôl 'Datganiadau gan Weinidogion' ychwanegu:
<i>Statements by a member of the House Committee about any matter coming within the responsibilities of that Committee</i>	<i>Datganiadau gan aelodau Pwyllgor y Tŷ ynghylch unrhyw fater sy'n rhan o gyfrifoldebau'r Pwyllgor hwnnw</i>
New 6.26 (A) as follows:	6.26A newydd fel a ganlyn:
<i>Members may table questions for oral answer by a member of the House Committee about any matter coming within the responsibilities of that Committee.</i>	<i>caiff Aelodau gyflwyno cwestiynau i'w hateb ar lafar gan aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ ynghylch unrhyw fater sy'n rhan o gyfrifoldebau'r Pwyllgor hwnnw.</i>
6.28	6.28
<i>(i) after 'two questions' insert 'to a particular Minister'</i>	<i>(i) ar ôl 'dau gwestiwn' ychwanegu 'i Weinidog penodol'</i>
<i>(ii) after words 'paragraph 6.3 (i)' insert 'or to a member of the House Committee under paragraph 6.3 (vi)'</i>	<i>(ii) ar ôl y geiriau 'paragraff 6.3(i)' ychwanegu 'neu i aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ o dan baragraff 6.3(vi)'</i>
<i>(iii) leave out 'by a particular Minister'</i>	<i>(iii) dileu 'gan Weinidog penodol'</i>
6.30 after 'Ministers' insert:	6.30 ar ôl 'Ysgrifenyddion y Cynulliad' ychwanegu:
<i>and the member of the House Committee.</i>	<i>a'r aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ</i>
6.31 at end add:	6.31 ychwanegu ar y diwedd:
<i>This paragraph shall not apply to questions for oral answer by a member of the House Committee.</i>	<i>ni fydd y paragraff hwn yn berthnasol i gwestiynau i'w hateb ar lafar gan aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ.</i>
6.34 (A): omit	6.34(A): dileu
6.37 (ii) after 'Officer,' insert:	6.37 (ii) ar ôl 'Llywydd', ychwanegu:
<i>or, if the matter is within the responsibilities of the House Committee, a member of that</i>	<i>(neu, os yw'r mater yn rhan o gyfrifoldebau Pwyllgor y Tŷ, aelod o'r pwyllgor hwnnw).</i>

Committee.

6.37 (iii) leave out 'Minister' and insert 'Member'

6.37 (iii) dileu 'y Gweinidog' ac ychwanegu 'yr Aelod'

(e) Standing Order No. 12

(e) Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12

12.5 Omit present paragraph 12.5 and insert:

12.5 Dileu paragraff 12.5 a rhoi yn ei le:

12.5. Whenever the Committee submits a report to the Assembly under paragraph 12.3(i) it shall send a copy to the First Minister. If the report relates to any matter coming within the responsibilities of the House Committee, it shall at the same time also send a copy to the chair of that Committee. Within 30 working days of the First Minister receiving the report a Minister shall, if the report relates to a matter for which a Minister is accountable or responsible to the Assembly, lay before the Assembly a response to the Audit Committee's report on behalf of the Assembly Cabinet and, if that response is of an interim character, the Minister shall lay a final response before the Assembly within a further two months. In so far as the Audit Committee's report relates to matters coming within the responsibilities of the House Committee, then within 30 working days of the chair receiving a copy of that report, a member of the House Committee shall, on behalf of that Committee, lay before the Assembly a response to the Audit Committee's report; and if that response is of an interim character a member of the House Committee shall lay a final response before the Assembly within a further two months.

12.5 . Pan fydd y Pwyllgor yn cyflwyno adroddiad i'r Cynulliad o dan baragraff 12.3(i) bydd yn anfon copi at y Prif Weinidog. Os bydd yr adroddiad yn ymwneud ag unrhyw fater sy'n rhan o gyfrifoldebau Pwyllgor y Tŷ, bydd yn anfon ar yr un pryd gopi i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor hwnnw. O fewn 30 diwrnod gwaith ar ôl i'r Prif Weinidog dderbyn adroddiad bydd Gweinidog, os yw'r adroddiad yn ymwneud â mater y mae'r Gweinidog yn atebol neu'n gyfrifol amdano i'r Cynulliad, yn gosod gerbron y Cynulliad ymateb i adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio ar ran Cabinet y Cynulliad, ac os yw'r ymateb hwnnw'n un interim, bydd y Gweinidog yn gosod ymateb terfynol gerbron y Cynulliad o fewn dau fis pellach. I'r graddau y mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio'n ymwneud â materion sy'n rhan o gyfrifoldebau Pwyllgor y Tŷ, yna ymhen 30 diwrnod gwaith ar ôl i'r Cadeirydd dderbyn copi o'r adroddiad hwnnw, bydd aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ, ar ran y Pwyllgor hwnnw, yn gosod gerbron y Cynulliad ymateb i adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio; ac os bydd yr ymateb hwnnw'n un interim, bydd aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ yn gosod ymateb terfynol gerbron y Cynulliad o fewn dau fis pellach.

12.7 at end add:

12.7 ychwanegu ar y diwedd:

(or if the matter is within the responsibility of the House Committee, if he or she was at the relevant time a member of the House Committee as reconstituted after [date]).

(neu os yw'r mater yn rhan o gyfrifoldebau Pwyllgor y Tŷ, os oedd ef neu hi ar yr adeg berthnasol yn aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ wedi'i ailgyfansoddi ar ôl [dyddiad])

(f) Standing Order No. 16

(f) Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 16

16.1 (ii) at end insert 'or the Code of Conduct under Standing Order No. 36.14'.

16.1 (ii) ychwanegu ar y diwedd 'neu'r Cod Ymddygiad o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 36.14.

(g) Standing Order No. 17

(g) Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17

17.5 (iii) at end insert:

17.5 (iii) ychwanegu ar y diwedd:

<i>or, as the case may be, members of the House Committee</i>	<i>neu aelodau Pwyllgor y Tŷ</i>
<i>(h) Standing Order No. 19</i>	<i>(h) Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19</i>
<i>Replace references to 'Office of Presiding Officer' by 'Presiding Office' in paragraphs 00, 5A and 7A each time it occurs</i>	<i>Newid y cyfeiriadau at 'Swyddfa'r Llywydd' i 'Swyddfa'r Llywydd' ym mharagraffau 00, 5A a 7A bob tro y mae'n digwydd [Nid yw'r newid hwn yn effeithio ar y fersiwn Gymraeg]</i>
<i>19.00 omit 'between the Presiding Officer, the Clerk and' and insert 'with'</i>	<i>19.00 dileu 'rhwng y Llywydd, y Clerc a'r' a rhoi 'â'r'</i>
<i>19.5A after first 'House Committee' insert 'following discussion by the Committee with the Finance Minister'</i>	<i>19.5A ar ôl 'Bwyllgor y Tŷ' ychwanegu 'ac ar ôl trafodaeth yn y Pwyllgor â'r Gweinidog Cyllid'</i>
<i>19.5A omit 'Clerk may, subject to paragraph 19.5B,' and insert 'House Committee may, following discussion with the Finance Minister,'</i>	<i>19.5A dileu 'yn ddarostyngedig i baragraff 19.5B, caiff y Clerc' a rhoi 'caiff Pwyllgor y Tŷ, ar ôl trafod â'r Gweinidog Cyllid,</i>
<i>Omit paragraph 19.5B</i>	<i>Dileu paragraff 19.5B</i>
<i>19.7A omit 'the Presiding Officer and'</i>	<i>19.7A dileu 'a'r Llywydd a'</i>
<i>19.22 omit 'Presiding Officer' and insert 'House Committee'</i>	<i>19.22 dileu 'y Llywydd' a rhoi 'Pwyllgor y Tŷ'</i>
<i>(i) Standing Order No. 20</i>	<i>(i) Reol Sefydlog 20</i>
<i>20.3 after 'Minister' insert 'or the Chair of the House Committee'</i>	<i>20.3 ar ôl 'Weinidog' rhoi 'neu Gadeirydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ'</i>
<i>(j) Standing Order No. 21</i>	<i>(j) Rheol Sefydlog 21</i>
<i>Insert new paragraph 21.10, as follows:</i>	<i>Rhoi paragraff 21.10 newydd fel a ganlyn:</i>
<i>21.10 Where a report or further report relates to a matter within the responsibility of the House Committee, the provisions in this Standing Order which relate to the involvement of Ministers (other than the First Minister) and of subject committees shall, so far as appropriate, not apply, but the chair of the House Committee shall make appropriate arrangements with the First Minister for the report to be considered by that committee and for its response to be sent to the First Minister.</i>	<i>12.10 Pan fo adroddiad neu adroddiad pellach yn ymwneud â mater sy'n rhan o gyfrifoldebau Pwyllgor y Tŷ, ni fydd darpariaethau'r Rheol Sefydlog hon sy'n ymwneud â rhan y Gweinidogion (ac eithrio'r Prif Weinidog) a'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc, cyn belled ag y bo'n briodol, yn berthnasol, ond bydd Cadeirydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn gwneud trefniadau priodol gyda'r Prif Weinidog i'r adroddiad gael ei ystyried gan y Pwyllgor hwnnw ac i'w ymateb gael ei anfon at y Prif Weinidog.</i>
<i>(k) Standing Order No. 33</i>	<i>(k) Rheol Sefydlog 33</i>
<i>Standing Order No. 33.1 omit 'Office of the</i>	<i>Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 33.1 dileu 'i Swyddfa'r</i>

*Presiding Officer' and insert 'Table Office'.*  
(NDM1259)

I must first apologise, as there are slight errors in the Welsh translation of the changes to Standing Orders. There is nothing that changes the meaning of the text, but there are a few missing circumflexes. I assure Members that, should Plenary approve the changes, corrections will be made prior to publication.

The proposal before the Assembly is to reconstitute the House Committee as one to which executive powers in respect of 'parliamentary' services are delegated. This further move towards separation between the Assembly's government and legislative functions is in keeping with the Assembly's resolution on 14 February 2002. The Presiding Officer and the First Minister have warmly endorsed the principle behind the change. The present House Committee and the Business Committee are also unanimously in support of these proposals. In constitutional terms, they are an important step forward. In practice, however, we expect little change in how the Presiding Office operates and is governed, and in how the House Committee operates.

There are three motions before the Assembly: NDM1257, which establishes the new Committee; NDM1258, which formally delegates powers to the Committee; and NDM1259, which makes the necessary consequential changes to other Standing Orders. In the interest of brevity, I will not explain the changes. However, I am happy to answer Members' questions.

**Peter Black:** I welcome the motions. I will make two brief comments, as we are running out of time. First, on the provision to allow the House Committee to meet in public, although that is a matter for the Committee, I believe that it should do so whenever possible. I understand that it may need to meet in private to discuss confidential staff issues and so on, but otherwise it should meet in public, so that people can see how it operates and scrutinise its work.

*Llywydd' a rhoi 'i'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno'.*  
(NDM1259)

Rhaid imi ymddiheuro yn gyntaf, am fod mân wallau yn y cyfieithiad Cymraeg o'r newidiadau i'r Rheolau Sefydlog. Ni cheir unrhyw beth sy'n newid ystyr y testun, ond mae ambell acen grom ar goll. Rhoddaf sicrwydd i'r Aelodau, os bydd y Cyfarfod Llawn yn cymeradwyo'r newidiadau, y gwneir cywiriadau cyn eu cyhoeddi.

Y cynnig ger bron y Cynulliad yw ailgyfansoddi Pwyllgor y Tŷ fel un y dirprwyir pwerau gweithredol iddo o ran gwasanaethau 'seneddol'. Mae'r symudiad pellach hwn tuag at wahanu rhwng llywodraeth y Cynulliad a swyddogaethau deddfwriaethol yn unol â phenderfyniad y Cynulliad ar 14 Chwefror 2002. Mae'r Llywydd a'r Prif Weinidog wedi cymeradwyo'r egwyddor sydd y tu ôl i'r newid yn frwd. Yn ogystal, mae Pwyllgor y Tŷ presennol a'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn unfrydol o blaid y cynigion hyn. Yn gyfansoddiadol, maent yn gam pwysig ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, yn ymarferol, prin iawn yw'r newid a ddisgwyliwn o ran sut y gweithreda Swyddfa'r Llywydd a'r modd y caiff ei reoli, ac o ran y modd mae Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn gweithredu.

Mae tri chynnig ger bron y Cynulliad: NDM1257, sy'n sefydlu'r Pwyllgor newydd; NDM1258, sy'n dirprwyo pwerau i'r Pwyllgor yn ffurfiol; ac NDM1259, sy'n gwneud y newidiadau dilynol angenrheidiol i Reolau Sefydlog eraill a ddaw yn sgîl hynny. Er mwyn arbed amser, ni roddaf esboniad o'r newidiadau. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn fodlon ateb cwestiynau'r Aelodau.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf y cynigion. Gwnaf ddau sylw byr, gan fod amser yn brin. Yn gyntaf, o ran y ddarpariaeth i ganiatáu i Bwyllgor y Tŷ gyfarfod yn gyhoeddus, er bod hynny'n fater i'r Pwyllgor, credaf y dylai wneud hynny pa bryd bynnag y bo'n bosibl. Yr wyf yn deall y mae'n bosibl y bydd angen iddo gyfarfod yn breifat er mwyn trafod materion staff cyfrinachol ac ati, ond dylai gyfarfod yn gyhoeddus fel arall, fel y gall pobl weld sut y mae'n gweithredu a chraffu ar ei waith.



Secondly—perhaps I should have commented on this in the Committee—I notice that we are effectively reintroducing oral questions to the House Committee in the Chamber. That caused unease when it was first introduced—as a Member sitting behind me has just commented, it was a shambles. It is important that we exercise restraint in how we utilise oral questions to the Committee in the Chamber, and concentrate on important, rather than trivial, matters.

**Alun Pugh:** I am generally happy to see these changes coming into effect. However, I am not happy with the idea of reintroducing oral questions to the House Committee. They may have added the word ‘narthex’ to my vocabulary and provided column inches for many diary writers, but I am unsure as to their purpose.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I shall ensure that the two points made by Peter are placed before the reconstituted House Committee for its consideration. In terms of accountability and scrutiny, it is desirable to have oral questions to the Committee. That was dispensed with as a result of the Assembly review of procedures report. However, if the House Committee is to have executive functions, it is important that those functions are scrutinised and that the Committee is accountable. We do not have to have 15 minutes of oral questions; we can have five minutes. I am sure that Plenary will decide on that in due course.

Yn ail—efallai y dylwn fod wedi gwneud sylw ar hyn yn y Pwyllgor—sylwaf ein bod yn ailgyflwyno cwestiynau llafar i'r Pwyllgor Tŷ yn y Siambr, i bob pwrpas. Achosodd hynny anesmwythder pan gafodd ei gyflwyno y tro cyntaf—fel y mae Aelod sy'n eistedd y tu ôl imi newydd ei ddweud, yr oedd yn draed moch. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn pwylo o ran sut yr ydym yn defnyddio cwestiynau llafar i'r Pwyllgor yn y Siambr, a chanolbwyntio ar faterion pwysig, yn hytrach na rhai dibwys.

**Alun Pugh:** Yn gyffredinol, yr wyf yn fodlon i'r newidiadau hyn ddod yn weithredol. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn fodlon gyda'r syniad o ailgyflwyno cwestiynau llafar i'r Pwyllgor Tŷ. Efallai eu bod wedi ychwanegu'r gair ‘narthex’ at fy ngeirfa a rhoi deunydd ychwanegol i lawer o gofnodwyr dyddiaduron, ond yr wyf yn ansicr ynghylch eu diben.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Byddaf yn sicrhau y caiff y ddau bwynt a wnaed gan Peter eu gosod gerbron y Pwyllgor Tŷ wedi ei ailgyfansoddi er mwyn iddo eu hystyried. O ran atebolrwydd a chraffu, mae'n ddymunol cael cwestiynau llafar i'r Pwyllgor. Hefgorwyd hynny o ganlyniad i adolygiad y Cynulliad o'r adroddiad gweithdrefnau. Fodd bynnag, os yw Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn mynd i gael swyddogaethau gweithredol, mae'n bwysig craffu ar y swyddogaethau hynny a sicrhau bod y Pwyllgor yn atebol. Nid oes rhaid inni gael 15 munud o gwestiynau llafar; gallwn gael pum munud. Yr wyf yn siwr y bydd y Cyfarfod Llawn yn penderfynu ar hynny maes o law.

*Cynnig (NDM1258): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1258): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet

Davies, Ron  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1257): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1257): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin

Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1259): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1259): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

4:50 p.m.

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Clefyd Niwronau Motor: Darparu Gwasanaethau Motor Neurone Disease: Providing Services**

**Cynog Dafis:** Mae Eleanor Burnham wedi gofyn am gael gwneud cyfraniad—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Cynog Dafis:** Eleanor Burnham has asked to contribute to the debate—*[Interruption.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gwn fod Aelodau am ddymuno Nadolig Llawen i'w gilydd, ond a allwch wneud hynny y tu allan?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I know that Members want to wish each other a Merry Christmas, but can you do so outside?

**Cynog Dafis:** Fis Mai diwethaf, fe'm gwahodddwyd i gwrdd â chynrychiolwyr Cymdeithas Clefyd Niwronau Motor yng Nghymru. Ar ôl clywed eu sylwadau, addewais y defnyddiwn y ddadl fer i gyflwyno'u hachos. Gwnaf hynny mewn modd amhleidiol, er y bydd ymyl gwleidyddol i rai sylwadau. Bydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn gwybod mai afiechyd cynyddgar, marwol yw clefyd niwronau motor. Mae'n ymosod ar gelloedd nerfol yn yr ymennydd ac ar linyn yr asgwrn cefn, ac oddeutu 14 mis yw disgwyliad oes nodweddiadol y dioddefydd adeg diagnosis, er bod rheswm i fod yn ffyddiog y gallai hynny newid yn y dyfodol—cyfeiriaf at hynny yn nes ymlaen.

**Cynog Dafis:** Last May, I was invited to meet representatives of the Motor Neurone Disease Association in Wales. Having heard their comments, I promised to use the short debate to present their case. I do so in a non-partisan way, although some of my comments will have a political edge. Assembly Members will know that motor neurone disease is a fatal, degenerative disease. It attacks nerve cells in the brain and the spinal cord. On average, a sufferer's life expectancy is 14 months from the time of diagnosis, although there is reason to hope that that could change in the future—I will refer to that later.

Cyflymder y dirywiad, sy'n peri i'r claf golli'r gallu yn gynddol i symud, nes methu â siarad, na hyd yn oed anadlu a llyncu yn y pen draw, yw un o'r rhesymau pam y dylid trin dioddefwyr mewn ffordd arbennig. Mae oddeutu 300 o bobl yn dioddef o glefyd niwronau motor yng Nghymru ar unrhyw adeg. Mae'n gyflwr anghyffredin, ac mae perygl felly na roddir yr un sylw iddo ag a roddir i afiechydion proffil uchel, megis canser a chlefyd y galon. Fodd bynnag, mae lefel dioddefaint a thrallod y cleifion yn gyfryw fel ei fod yn teilyngu sylw a gwasanaeth o'r radd uchaf.

The speed of degeneration, which causes the patient to progressively lose mobility, until he or she is unable to talk, or ultimately even breathe or swallow, is one of the reasons why sufferers should be given exceptional treatment. Around 300 people suffer from motor neurone disease in Wales at any given time. It is not a common disease, and there is a danger therefore that it might not receive the same attention given to more high profile diseases, such as cancer and heart disease. However, patients' level of pain and suffering is such that it deserves attention and services of the highest quality.

Mae angen darparu'r gwasanaeth yn brydlon. Y brif broblem yw nad yw prosesau arferol darparu gwasanaethau meddygol a gofal yn addas ar gyfer delio â chyflwr sy'n cynyddu mor ddidostur o gyflym ac mor ddiwrthdro. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod yr enghreifftiau lu o sylw a gofal ardderchog a roddir i gleifion niwronau motor. Nid creu darlun pesimistaidd ac anffafriol o'r ddarpariaeth yw fy mwriad y prynhawn yma. Fodd bynnag, mae diffygion sylweddol yn y system sy'n golygu bod dioddefaint yn dwysáu a chyfleoedd i wella ansawdd bywyd yn cael eu colli.

Mewn arolwg a gynhaliwyd gan y Gymdeithas Clefyd Niwronau Motor, dywedodd 12 y cant o'r cleifion nad oeddent wedi derbyn y gwasanaethau yr oedd eu hangen arnynt gan y gwasanaethau iechyd a chymdeithasol lleol. Mae rhai o'r disgrifiadau yn ddirdynol. Mae'r diffygion yn ymwneud ag anaddasrwydd a phrydlondeb.

Trof yn gyntaf at wasanaethau meddygol. Mae'n hanfodol cael diagnosis cynnar a chywir. Mae mwy nag un rheswm pam nad yw hynny'n digwydd yn ddigon aml. Yn gyntaf, yr ydym yn brin o niwrolegwyr yng Nghymru. Mae tri i bob miliwn o'r boblogaeth mewn cymhariaeth â chwech yn Lloegr, 12 yn yr Almaen a 100 yn Nenmarc. Mae prinder niwrolegwyr yn golygu bod y proses o gael diagnosis yn cael ei gohirio. Fy nghwestiwn cyntaf i'r Gweinidog yw pa ragolygon sydd y bydd y sefyllfa hon yn gwella, a pha gynlluniau sydd ganddi i sicrhau hyn? I wneud fy unig bwynt gwleidyddol y prynhawn yma—mae'n bwynt dilys—onid yw'r sefyllfa hon yn adlewyrchu methiant y setliad ariannol i Gymru i lenwi'r bwlch cyllido sydd yn agor ymhellach o flwyddyn i flwyddyn?

Cyfeirir cleifion niwronau motor yn aml at yr ymgynghorydd anghywir. Er enghraifft, gall y meddyg teulu gymryd, yn ddigon dealladwy, fod y claf wedi cael strôc. Nid yw gwneud diagnosis cychwynnol yn fater syml. Fy ail gwestiwn i'r Gweinidog yw beth y gellir ei wneud i wella ymwybyddiaeth o'r clefyd hwn ymysg meddygon teulu? Hefyd, beth y gellir ei wneud i sicrhau bod cleifion

The service must be provided promptly. The main problem is that the usual processes of providing medical services and care are inappropriate to deal with a disease that progresses at such a cruel and unstoppable rate. It is important to acknowledge the numerous examples of the excellent care and attention that is given to motor neurone sufferers. It is not my intention to paint a pessimistic and unfavourable picture of the provision this afternoon. However, there are significant weaknesses in the system, which means that suffering is intensified and opportunities to improve quality of life are being lost.

In a survey conducted by the Motor Neurone Disease Association, 12 per cent of patients said that they had not received the services that they needed from local health and social services. Some of the descriptions are heart-rending. The failures relate to inappropriate and untimely service.

I turn in the first instance to medical services. It is vital that an early and correct diagnosis is made. There are many reasons why that does not happen often enough. First, there is a shortage of neurologists in Wales. There are three for every million of the population, compared to six in England, 12 in Germany and 100 in Denmark. A shortage of neurologists means that the diagnosis process is delayed. My first question to the Minister is what are the prospects for an improvement in this situation, and what plans does she have to ensure this? To make my only political point this afternoon—it is a valid point—does this situation not reflect the failure of the funding settlement for Wales to meet the funding gap, which is widening year on year?

Motor neurone patients are often referred to the wrong consultant. For example, the general practitioner may assume, quite understandably, that the patient has suffered a stroke. Making the initial diagnosis is not a simple matter. My second question for the Minister is what can be done to increase awareness of this disease among GPs? Also, what can be done to ensure that patients who

sydd yn cael eu cyfeirio at ymgynghorwyr amhriodol yn cael eu cyfeirio at niwrolegydd yn fuan, yn hytrach nag aros am gyfnod hir tra bo'r cyflwr yn gwaethygu? Weithiau bydd yr ymgynghorydd yn mynd â'r claf ar draws y coridor i weld y niwrolegydd; weithiau, gall wythnosau neu fisoedd fynd heibio cyn i'r claf weld niwrolegydd.

Mae diagnosis prydlon yn bwysig am sawl rheswm. Yn gyntaf, ac yn arwyddocaol, mae'n bosibl erbyn hyn i estyn hyd oes ac efallai gwella ansawdd bywyd y claf yn sylweddol drwy roi triniaeth briodol. Mae'r cyffur riluzole yn arafu colli'r niwronau a, thrwy hynny, gynydd y clefyd yn sylweddol. Mae gwahaniaeth dychrynlyd rhwng dechrau cymryd riluzole pan fo dyn wedi colli, er enghraifft, 20 y cant o'r niwronau, a dechrau ar ôl colli 80 y cant ohonynt. Yn fynych, mae cymaint ag 17 mis rhwng ymddangosiad y symptomau cyntaf a'r diagnosis terfynol, a'r clefyd erbyn hynny wedi lledu ymhell.

Mae ymyriadau eraill sydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr i ddisgwyliad oes ac ansawdd bywyd, er enghraifft bwydo yn uniongyrchol i'r stumog a darparu ocsigen i'w anadlu ar hyd y nos, gan fod diffyg maeth a gwendid anadlu yn cyflymu gwaethygiad y claf. Drwy gyfuniad o riluzole a'r ymyriadau eraill, byddai'n bosibl, mae'n debyg, estyn disgwyliad oes o'r 14 mis presennol i gymaint â thair neu bedair blynedd, neu fwy. Fodd bynnag, byddai gan hynny ymhlygiadau cost i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, sydd yn enghraifft berffaith o'r ffordd y mae datblygiadau a thechnolegau newydd yn rhoi pwysau cynyddol ar y gwasanaeth iechyd, ond ni chredaf y byddai unrhyw Aelod yn dadlau na ddylid talu'r costau hynny o'r pwrs cyhoeddus.

Ar hyn o bryd nid oes rhagolygon y gellid gwella'r afiechyd enbyd hwn; y cwbl y gellir ei wneud yw arafu ei gynydd. Am y rheswm hwnnw, bydd angen gofal lliniarol o ansawdd uchel ym mhob achos. Gwn fod trafod ar hyn o bryd ar y strategaeth gofal lliniarol a'r bwriad i gynhyrchu cynllun gweithredu. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog, felly, gadw cleifion

have been referred to inappropriate consultants are referred to a neurologist as soon as possible rather than waiting for a long period while the condition worsens? Sometimes the consultant will take the patient across the corridor to see the neurologist; sometimes, weeks or months can go by before the patient sees a neurologist.

Timely diagnosis is important for several reasons. First, and significantly, it is now possible to extend life expectancy and perhaps improve the patient's quality of life considerably by providing appropriate treatment. The drug riluzole slows the depletion of neurones and, in doing so, considerably slows the progress of the disease. There is a startling difference between starting to take riluzole after having lost, for example, 20 per cent of the neurons, and starting to take the drug when 80 per cent have been lost. It can often be as long as 17 months between the appearance of the first symptoms and the final diagnosis, and by that time the disease will have progressed significantly.

There are other interventionist measures that can make a substantial difference to life expectancy and quality of life, for example, feeding directly to the stomach and providing oxygen to breathe through the night as lack of nutrition and difficulty in breathing accelerate the patient's deterioration. Through a combination of riluzole and other interventionist measures, it would apparently be possible to extend life expectancy from the current 14 months to as much as three or four years, or more. However, that would have cost implications for the health service, which is a perfect example of the way developments and new technologies are placing increasing pressure on the health service, but I do not believe that any Member would argue that those costs should not be met from the public purse.

There are currently no prospects of a cure for this terrible disease; we can only slow its advance. For that reason, we will need palliative care of a high standard in all cases. I know that the palliative care strategy and the intention to publish an action plan is being discussed. I therefore ask the Minister to bear motor neurone sufferers in mind

niwronau motor mewn cof yn ystod y broses hon. Yn benodol, a wnaiff gynnal trafodaethau gyda Chymdeithas Gofal Lliniarol Arbenigol a Hosbisau Cymru er mwyn annog a helpu hosbisau i dderbyn cleifion niwronau motor, a chleifion eraill, yn enwedig clefydau niwrolegol? Mae'r Gymdeithas Clefyd Niwronau Motor, sydd â chryn arbenigedd yn y maes hwn, yn fwy na pharod i gynnig gwybodaeth a chynghori ar arferion da mewn perthynas â'r clefyd hwn. Ar hyn o bryd, am resymau digon dealladwy, mae llawer o'r hosbisau yn anfodlon derbyn cleifion niwronau motor. Efallai fod modd mynd i'r afael â hynny drwy gydweithrediad.

Mae'n enbyd o bwysig bod lleoli cleifion niwronau motor mewn amgylchiadau amhriodol yn dod i ben. Gall hyn ddigwydd oherwydd camddiagnosis neu resymau eraill. Ceir enghreifftiau o gleifion yn cael eu rhoi mewn lleoliadau cwbl anaddas, megis wardiau geriatrig. Er bod galluoedd corfforol y cleifion hyn yn methu'n llwyr—er enghraifft, maent yn methu â siarad a bwyta, ac yn cael trafferth i anadlu—mae eu meddyliau yn gwbl effro i'w hamgylchiadau a'u cyflwr. Maent yn cael eu rhoi ymysg pobl y mae eu meddyliau efallai wedi drysu a'u hymddygiad yn gynhyrfus a chawdelog. Mae'n anodd dychmygu uffern gwaeth na hynny. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym sut mae rhwystro sefyllfaoedd fel hyn rhag codi?

Trof at bwysigrwydd prydlondeb mewn darparu gofal cymdeithasol ac—i anghofio gwahaniaethau gwleidyddol am y tro—mae'r Gymdeithas Clefyd Niwronau Motor yn teimlo y gall y cydlyn rhwng y gwasanaethau iechyd a chymdeithasol, a fyddai'n digwydd drwy'r byrddau iechyd lleol arfaethedig, fod yn help yn yr achos hwn. Mae cydlyn gwasanaethau iechyd a chymdeithasol yn allweddol. Fodd bynnag, mae pryder ynglŷn â sut y bydd comisiynu gwasanaethau arbenigol yn gweithio o dan y trefniadau newydd. Gan mai cymharol brin yw clefyd niwronau motor, ychydig o ddioddefwyr fydd yn byw yn ardal pob bwrdd iechyd lleol. Beth all y Gweinidog ei wneud i dawelu'r ofnau hyn? Gobeithio na fydd rhaid aros am y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol yn 2004 cyn gweld gwelliant.

during this process. In particular, will she enter into discussions with the Welsh Association for Hospice and Specialist Palliative Care to encourage and help hospices to accept motor neurone patients, and other patients, especially those with neurological illnesses? The Motor Neurone Disease Association, which has considerable expertise in this area, is more than willing to provide information and to advise on good practice in relation to this illness. At present, for understandable reasons, many hospices are unwilling to accept motor neurone patients. Perhaps, with co-operation, we could tackle this.

It is vital that we cease to place motor neurone patients in inappropriate surroundings. This can occur because of misdiagnosis or for other reasons. There are examples of patients being put in wholly inappropriate surroundings, such as geriatric wards. Although the physical functions of these patients fail completely—for example, they cannot talk or eat and have difficulty breathing—their minds are alert and they are aware of their circumstances and condition. They are placed among people whose minds are perhaps confused and whose behaviour is agitated and confused. It is difficult to imagine a worse hell than that. Can the Minister tell us how we can prevent such situations?

I turn to the importance of the timely provision of social care and—putting aside political differences for the moment—the Motor Neurone Disease Association believes that the co-ordination between health and social services within the proposed local health boards could be of assistance in this case. The co-ordination of health and social services is vital. However, there is concern as to how commissioning specialist services would work under the new arrangements. Since motor neurone disease is relatively rare, few sufferers will live within each local health board area. What can the Minister do to alleviate these fears? I hope that we will not have to wait until the national service framework is in place in 2004 before we see an improvement.

5:00 p.m.

Mae'n allweddol ym maes gofal bod proses llwybr cyflym ar waith o'r adeg y ceir diagnosis. Yn rhy aml, nid felly y mae. Dyma rai dyfyniadau o arolwg Cymdeithas Clefyd Niwronau Motor o broblemau cleifion:

'Mi gyrhaeddodd yr *arm-support* symudol chwe mis yn rhy hwyr, pan nad oedd ysgrifennu na bwydo yn bosibl mwyach a'r *support* yn werth dim'.

'Fwy na blwyddyn ar ôl i'r mesuriadau gael eu gwneud rwy'n dal i aros am y platform pren i gael ei wneud ar gyfer mynediad y gadair olwyn i'r tŷ'.

'Mae cael unrhywbeth wedi bod yn frwydr. Dwy'n dal i fod ddim yn gallu cael bath neu gawod. Rwy'n ffael mynd i'r gwely—yn gorfod cysgu yn y gadair'.

Mae adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol dan bwysau a llawer o bobl yn gorfod aros eu tro am wasanaethau. Fodd bynnag, y gwahaniaeth gyda'r clefyd hwn yw mai cwta 14 mis fydd ar ôl i'r claf. Onid yw'n bosibl trefnu proses llwybr cyflym o'r funud y ceir y diagnosis? A all y Gweinidog drefnu hyn gyda'r awdurdodau lleol? Yn benodol, a all roi cyfarwyddyd newydd ynglŷn â'r grant cyfleusterau i'r methodig? Mae offer ac ati yn aml yn hir cyn cyrraedd y claf. Yn wir, mae achosion o offer yn cyrraedd ar ôl i'r claf farw.

Mae budd-daliadau y tu hwnt i gyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol y Gweinidog, ond ni ellir peidio â chyfeirio atynt yn awr. Mae'n annerbyniol y gwrthodir budd-dal methodigedd i glaf ambell waith am nad yw'r symptomau wedi lledu yn ddigon pell, er ei fod yn amlwg y byddant wedi datblygu ymhen ychydig o amser wedyn. Bydd y claf wedyn yn gorfod mynd drwy'r profion am yr eildro, ac yn gorfod aros am ddyddiad i wneud hynny. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y lwfans gweini ac yn blaen. Gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog o leiaf ddylanwadu ar ei chyd-Weinidogion yn Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol i newid y fath agweddau. Efallai y bydd angen newid yn y swyddfeydd lleol gan fod Llywodraeth y DG yn dweud mai yno y

It is vital in the area of care that fast track processes are in place from the time a diagnosis is made. Too often, that is not the case. Here are some quotes from the Motor Neurone Disease Association's survey of patients problems:

The adjustable arm-support arrived six months too late, when writing and feeding were no longer possible and support was worthless.

Over a year after the measurements were taken, I am still waiting for the wooden platform to be constructed for wheelchair access into the house.

Getting anything has been a struggle. I am still not able to take a bath or a shower. I cannot get up to bed—I have to sleep in the chair.

The social services departments are under pressure and many people are forced to wait their turn for services. However, the difference with this disease is that the patient only has 14 months left. Is it not possible to arrange a fast-track process from the moment the diagnosis is made? Can the Minister arrange this with the local authorities? Specifically, can she give new guidance on the disabled facilities grant? Equipment and so on is often late in reaching the patient. Indeed, in some cases the equipment arrives after the patient has died.

Benefits are outside the Minister's direct remit, but we cannot avoid referring to this issue now. It is unacceptable that a patient is occasionally refused disability benefit on the grounds that the symptoms are not sufficiently advanced, although it is obvious that they will have developed within a short time afterwards. The patient must then endure the tests for the second time, and must wait for an appointment to do so. The same is true of the attendance allowance and so on. I hope the Minister can at least influence her ministerial colleagues in the UK Government to change such attitudes. There may be a need for change in the local offices since the UK Government says that that is where the problem currently lies. We need to raise



mae'r broblem ar hyn o bryd. Mae eisiau codi ymwybyddiaeth a dealltwriaeth.

Cyfeiriais hyd yma at y cleifion, ond dylem ystyried eraill, sef y cynhalwyr. Llafur cariad yw gofalu, ond llafur caled. Mae popeth a ddywedais eisoes yn berthnasol iddynt hwy hefyd. Mae trefnu seibiant ar eu cyfer yn hanfodol. Gallai'r hosbis fod yn werthfawr iawn yn hyn o beth.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae darparu ar gyfer anghenion cleifion clefyd niwronau motor yn dibynnu'n drwm ar ymdrechion gwirfoddolwyr Cymdeithas MND. Mae'n anodd dychmygu beth fyddai'r sefyllfa heb ei chyfraniad aruthrol. Byddai'n argyfwng, mae'n debyg. Mae'n rhoi gofal a chefnogaeth, yn cynnig help ariannol, yn darparu amrywiaeth o offer arbenigol, yn cynnal wyth o ganolfannau gofal ar draws y DG—gan gynnwys un yn Ysbyty Rookwood yng Nghaerdydd—ac mae'n cyllido'r unig raglen ymchwil i glefyd niwronau motor. Mae'n cynnal llinell ffôn gymorth saith diwrnod yr wythnos ac yn rhoi gwybodaeth a chynghor i ddiodeddfwyr a'u cynhalwyr, ac i weithwyr proffesiynol iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Mae ganddi ddau gynghorydd gofal rhanbarthol yng Nghymru. Mae'n enghraifft berffaith o gyfraniad allweddol y sector gwirfoddol i wasanaethau.

Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf incwm blynyddol o £8 miliwn drwy apêl elusennol—sy'n debyg o godi i £10 miliwn—mae'n amheus y gall barhau i ddarparu ar y raddfa bresennol. Mae'n gobeithio sefydlu partneriaeth gyda'r sector statudol fydd ar sail cyfraniad 50/50 tuag at gost rhedeg ei chanolfannau gofal. Mae'n amlwg y byddai goblygiadau ariannol o ran symud y pwyslais o'r sector gwirfoddol i'r sector statudol. Ni ofynnwn am unrhyw ymrwymiad gan y Gweinidog o ran hynny. Fodd bynnag, dylai unrhyw wladwriaeth sydd o ddifrif am wasanaethau lles y bobl dderbyn ei chyfrifoldeb dros wasanaethau allweddol o'r fath. Dylai cyfraniad y sector gwirfoddol fod yn ychwanegol at hynny; ni ddylai orfod ysgwyddo cymaint o'r baich ag a wna ar hyn o bryd.

Yn y cyfamser, mae llawer y gellid ac y dylid ei wneud i sicrhau darpariaeth brydlon ac addas mewn ffordd a fyddai'n gweddnewid

awareness and understanding.

I have so far referred to the patients, but we should consider others, namely the carers. Caring is a labour of love, but it is hard labour. Everything that I have so far said is also relevant to them. Arranging respite for them is essential. Hospices could be invaluable in this regard.

Currently, provision for motor neurone disease sufferers' needs depends heavily on the efforts of volunteers in the MND Association. It is hard to imagine what the situation might be without its enormous contribution. There would more than likely be a crisis. It provides care and support, offers financial assistance, provides a variety of specialist equipment, runs eight care centres throughout the UK—including one at Rookwood Hospital in Cardiff—and funds the only research programme into motor neurone disease. It operates a telephone helpline seven days a week and provides advice and information to sufferers and their carers, and to health and social care professionals. It has two regional care consultants in Wales. It is a perfect example of the vital contribution of the voluntary sector to services.

However, despite an annual income of £8 million through charitable appeal—which is likely to increase to £10 million—it is doubtful that it can maintain provision at the current level. It hopes to establish a partnership with the statutory sector on the basis of a 50/50 contribution towards its care centres' running costs. It is obvious that there would be financial implications in shifting the emphasis from the voluntary sector to the statutory sector. I would not ask for any commitment from the Minister on that matter. However, any state that is serious about people's welfare services should accept responsibility for key services such as this. The voluntary sector's contribution should be additional to that; it should not have to carry as much of the burden as it currently does.

In the meantime, there is much that could and should be done to ensure timely and appropriate provision in a way that would

bywydau dioddefwyr clefyd niwronau motor. Ni fydd hynny'n cael effaith ar brif benawdau'r papurau newydd, ni fydd yn newid y sefyllfa rhestrau aros. Dyna pam nad yw'r math hwn o glefyd yn cael sylw haeddiannol. Nid oes angen i mi ddadlau ymhellach. Dyma fater eithriadol o bwysig, ac yr wyf yn hollol siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn awyddus i wneud ei heithaf i ddefnyddio ei phŵer a'i dylanwad a'r pwysau polisi sydd ar gael iddi er mwyn symud ymlaen.

**Eleanor Burnham:** As Cynog eloquently stated, MND is a progressive condition, and, on average, lasts from two to five years. It is therefore vital that care and services for sufferers is planned and is readily available. However, there have been cases when sufferers have survived for 10 years or more. Stephen Hawking, uniquely I believe, still survives into his sixties with enormous help and support and at huge cost—for example, his voice synthesiser was purchased in America.

The fundamental challenge for most MND sufferers is early access to neurological help, early diagnosis and consequential access to all the necessary support and resources; that was explained to me at a recent Flintshire MND group meeting. I will not go into detail about neurologists because Cynog has already done that. However, I understand that the average waiting time for an urgent appointment with a neurologist in Wales is currently between six and 13 weeks, and up to two years for non-urgent appointments. The Motor Neurone Disease Association standards of care state that people with suspected MND should have an appointment within no less than four weeks after referral and a further follow up appointment two weeks after diagnosis. I urge the Minister to assure us that she will urgently consider increasing funding for neurologists to ensure early diagnosis, that she will provide the relevant resources to help individual MND sufferers to cope with their quickly deteriorating condition, whether in their homes or at a hospice.

transform the lives of motor neurone disease sufferers. That will not have an impact on newspaper headlines or change the situation as far as waiting lists are concerned, which is why this kind of illness is not given the attention that it deserves. There is no need for me to say any more. This is an exceptionally important issue, and I am sure that the Minister will do her utmost to use her power and influence and the policy levers available to her to move this issue forward.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Fel y dywedodd Cynog yn huawdl, mae MND yn gyflwr cynyddgar, ac, ar gyfartaledd, mae'n para rhwng dwy a phum mlynedd. Felly mae'n hanfodol y caiff gofal a gwasanaethau i ddiodefwyr eu cynllunio a'u bod ar gael yn hawdd. Fodd bynnag, bu achosion lle y goroesodd diodefwyr am 10 mlynedd neu fwy. Mae Stephen Hawking, sy'n unigryw fe gredaf, yn fyw o hyd ac yn ei chwedegau gyda help a chefnogaeth aruthrol, ac ar gost fawr iawn—er enghraifft, prynwyd ei syntheseisydd llais yn America.

Yr her sylfaenol i'r rhan fwyaf o ddiodefwyr MND yw gallu manteisio yn gynnar ar gymorth niwrolegol, diagnosis cynnar ac, yn dilyn hynny, cael yr holl gymorth a'r adnoddau angenrheidiol; esboniwyd hynny wrthyf mewn cyfarfod grŵp MND yn Sir y Fflint yn ddiweddar. Ni fanylaf ar niwrolegwyr gan fod Cynog eisoes wedi gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, deallaf fod yr amser aros ar gyfartaledd am apwyntiad brys gyda niwrolegydd yng Nghymru rhwng chwech a thair wythnos ar ddeg ar hyn o bryd, a hyd at ddwy flynedd ar gyfer apwyntiadau heb fod yn rhai brys. Mae safonau gofal y Gymdeithas Clefyd Niwronau Motor yn datgan y dylai pobl yr amheuir eu bod yn dioddef o MND gael apwyntiad o fewn dim llai na phedair wythnos ar ôl eu cyfeirio ac apwyntiad dilynol pellach bythefnos ar ôl y diagnosis. Anogaf y Gweinidog i roi sicrwydd inni y bydd yn ystyried cynyddu'r arian ar gyfer niwrolegwyr ar unwaith er mwyn sicrhau diagnosis cynnar, ac y bydd yn darparu'r adnoddau perthnasol i helpu diodefwyr MND unigol i ymdopi â'u cyflwr sy'n dirywio'n gyflym, boed yn eu cartrefi neu mewn hosbis.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I am pleased that we have had this debate and I thank Cynog Dafis for introducing it; I appreciate his non-partisan approach. I also thank Eleanor for her comments. My first, and most important point, is that the Welsh Assembly Government recognises that motor neurone disease is a debilitating condition that has profound affects on those who suffer from it and the carers who care for them. Last August, I found out for myself the important work that the Motor Neurone Disease Association does, when I met representatives from that important organisation. I have also met people suffering with motor neurone disease and some of their carers at the Cardiff care centre for motor neurone disease. As you said, Cynog, the centre at Rookwood is important. I have also had the opportunity to discuss some of the major issues facing patients with motor neurone disease who live in Wales. I am deeply impressed by the multi-agency staff teams that are working in partnership; they work well at local level. I am also impressed by the patients' determination, despite their illness.

Health authorities are responsible for the provision of all health services, including motor neurone disease. We expect, and have expected the health authorities to work in partnership to plan and prioritise their local services, to determine the level of service and weigh up the needs in each of their areas. That is where local knowledge and resources apply. The increase in funding allocation over the last three years, 1999-2000 to this year, from £2.6 billion to £3.6 billion means that we should enable a step change to be seen by patients. This should be reflected across the board, including patients with motor neurone disease. Working with the voluntary sector is important. That partnership will endure however much funding comes through. It will be about the work that the Motor Neurone Disease Association is doing on research, providing services and, critically, in effectively raising awareness.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi cynnal y ddatl hon a diolchaf i Cynog Dafis am ei chyflwyno; gwerthfawrogaf ei ymagwedd amhleidiol. Diolchaf hefyd i Eleanor am ei sylwadau. Fy mhwynt cyntaf, a'r pwynt pwysicaf, yw bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n cydnabod bod clefyd niwronau motor yn gyflwr gwanhaol â chanddo effeithiau ofnadwy ar y rhai sy'n dioddef ohono a'r gofalwyr sy'n gofalu amdanynt. Fis Awst diwethaf, cefais brofiad personol o'r gwaith pwysig y mae'r Gymdeithas Clefyd Niwronau Motor yn ei wneud, pan gyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr o'r sefydliad pwysig hwnnw. Yr wyf hefyd wedi cyfarfod â phobl sy'n dioddef o glefyd niwronau motor a rhai o'u gofalwyr yng nghanolfan gofal Caerdydd ar gyfer clefyd niwronau motor. Fel y dywedaso, Cynog, mae'r ganolfan yn Rookwood yn bwysig. Cefais y cyfle hefyd i drafod rhai o'r prif faterion sy'n wynebu cleifion sy'n dioddef o glefyd niwronau motor sy'n byw yng Nghymru. Gwnaeth y timau staff aml asiantaethol sy'n gweithio mewn partneriaeth argraff ddofn arnaf; maent yn gweithio'n dda ar lefel leol. Gwnaeth agwedd benderfynol y cleifion, er gwaethaf eu salwch, argraff arnaf hefyd.

Mae awdurdodau iechyd yn gyfrifol am ddarparu'r holl wasanaethau iechyd, gan gynnwys clefyd niwronau motor. Yr ydym yn disgwyl, ac wedi disgwyl i'r awdurdodau iechyd weithio mewn partneriaeth i gynllunio a blaenoriaethu eu gwasanaethau lleol, er mwyn penderfynu ar lefel y gwasanaeth a phwyso a mesur yr anghenion ym mhob un o'u hardaloedd. Dyna lle y bydd gwybodaeth ac adnoddau lleol yn berthnasol. Mae'r cynnydd mewn dyrannu arian dros y tair blynedd diwethaf, 1999-2000 hyd at eleni, o £2.6 biliwn i £3.6 biliwn yn golygu y dylem sicrhau bod y cleifion yn gweld newid sylweddol. Dylai hyn gael ei adlewyrchu'n gyffredinol, gan gynnwys cleifion sy'n dioddef o glefyd niwronau motor. Mae gweithio gyda'r sector gwirfoddol yn bwysig. Bydd y bartneriaeth honno yn parhau waeth faint o arian a sicrheir. Bydd yn ymwneud â'r gwaith y mae Cymdeithas Clefyd Niwronau Motor yn ei wneud o ran ymchwil, darparu gwasanaethau ac, yn hanfodol, y gwaith o godi ymwybyddiaeth yn effeithiol.

5:10 p.m.

**Peter Rogers:** I am grateful to Cynog for introducing this important debate. I have become aware of motor neurone disease, and the Motor Neurone Disease Association, since becoming an Assembly Member. I was recently given its badge, called the David Niven badge, which I wear in the lapel of another of my suits. I have never before worn anything that so many people have asked me what it means. Awareness is probably the most important factor, therefore, what will you do to raise awareness of this disease?

**Jane Hutt:** We must turn awareness into action.

The Cardiff care centre, which has operated since 1996, provides an out-patient clinic, therapist services, and advice on symptom management. It is supported by the Motor Neurone Disease Association. Many of the points that you raised, Cynog, are critical to early diagnosis and to ensuring that awareness is shared with health professionals, particularly the GP and primary health care community. That responsibility must kick in with fast-track action—I agree with you on that—and it involves not just the health service but local authorities and housing departments. The Department for Work and Pensions is responsible for benefits issues; I can raise these through Westminster Government Ministers.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am not sure of the accuracy of one of Cynog's points. I cannot comment on some of the points about means-tested benefit. However, on attendance allowance, the rules governing the provision of attendance allowance for people suffering from a terminal illness are more helpful than Cynog suggested. It may be worth exploring that, rather than letting it go on the record as not being as helpful as it should be.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I want to show Cynog that there is cross-party support for this matter, and I join the Minister in thanking

**Peter Rogers:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Cynog am gyflwyno'r ddadl bwysig hon. Yr wyf wedi dod yn ymwybodol o glefyd niwronau motor, a Chymdeithas Clefyd Niwronau Motor, ers dod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Yn ddiweddar rhoddwyd ei bathodyn imi, sy'n dwyn y teitl bathodyn David Niven, a wisgaf ar labed un o'm siwtiau eraill. Nid wyf erioed wedi gwisgo unrhyw beth y mae cymaint o bobl wedi holi ynghylch yr hyn y mae'n ei olygu. Mae'n debygol mai ymwybyddiaeth yw'r ffactor bwysicaf, felly beth a wnewch i godi ymwybyddiaeth am y clefyd hwn.

**Jane Hutt:** Rhaid inni droi ymwybyddiaeth yn gamau gweithredu.

Mae canolfan gofal Caerdydd, a fu'n weithredol ers 1996, yn darparu clinig cleifion allanol, gwasanaethau therapyddion, a chyngor ar reoli symptomau. Fe'i cynhelir gan y Gymdeithas Clefyd Niwronau Motor. Mae nifer o'r pwyntiau a godwyd gennyh, Cynog, yn hanfodol er mwyn cael diagnosis cynnar ac er mwyn sicrhau y caiff yr ymwybyddiaeth ei rhannu â gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol, yn arbennig y meddyg teulu a'r gymuned gofal iechyd sylfaenol. Rhaid i'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw ddechrau gyda gweithredu dull carlam—cytunaf â chi ar hynny—ac mae'n cynnwys nid yn unig y gwasanaeth iechyd ond awdurdodau lleol ac adrannau tai. Mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau yn gyfrifol am faterion budd-daliadau; gallaf godi'r rhain drwy Weinidogion Llywodraeth San Steffan.

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid wyf yn siwr am gywirdeb un o bwyntiau Cynog. Ni allaf wneud sylwadau ar rai o'r pwyntiau am fuddal yn seiliedig ar brawf modd. Fodd bynnag, ar lwfans mynychu, mae'r rheolau sy'n rheoli'r gwaith o ddarparu lwfans mynychu ar gyfer pobl sy'n dioddef o salwch terfynol yn fwy defnyddiol nag yr awgrymodd Cynog. Efallai ei bod yn werth ymchwilio i hynny, yn hytrach na gadael iddo gael ei gofnodi fel rhywbeth nad yw mor ddefnyddiol ag y dylai fod.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr wyf am ddangos i Cynog bod cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol ar gyfer y mater hwn, ac ymunaf â'r Gweinidog

him for raising it. I also wanted to mention David Niven. After David Niven was diagnosed with this illness it came to the forefront. Will you consider, Minister, how this disease is designated? When it is diagnosed, is it designated a terminal illness? Brian is right, there is a process for fast-tracking the provision of benefit in such cases. Is motor neurone disease registered as such?

**Jane Hutt:** This short debate has raised that useful point. I will seek clarification and write to Cynog; the information will then be shared with all Assembly Members.

I want to move on to some of the other important points that Cynog raised, particularly support for carers. I mentioned local authorities, and this partnership must be local. That is why joint-working between health and social services is fundamental, not only in terms of planning policy and commissioning, but also in delivering the care package that people need in that situation. The carers special grant scheme, which is provided through the local authority, engages much more with carers to ensure that we reach those needs that perhaps must be identified by the users and carers themselves. We must ensure that we have the respite care that is so important for carers. Some £17 million, invested over four years, is making a difference—as I am sure many colleagues recognise—in reaching out to some of these groups that are perhaps more invisible to the public eye, but who are, in terms of the health and social care professionals and their carers, at the top of the agenda.

On the health service workforce, we now have our workforce plans in relation to medical staff, including consultants. They show that 8.45 whole time equivalent consultant neurologists are employed in Wales, and that there are no vacancies. However, there are pressures on Welsh NHS trusts, and an expansion in numbers is planned over the next five years. We recognise that, and that is one point that I discussed with the medical staff at the Cardiff care centre. That must come through our

i ddiolch iddo am ei godi. Yr oeddwn hefyd am grybwyll David Niven. Ar ôl i David Niven ganfod ei fod yn dioddef o'r salwch hwn, daeth y salwch i'r amlwg. A ystyriwch, Weinidog, sut y disgrifir yr afiechyd hwn? Pan gaiff ei ganfod, a gaiff ei ddisgrifio fel salwch terfynol? Mae Brian yn iawn, mae proses dull carlam ar gyfer darparu budd-daliadau mewn achosion o'r fath. A yw clefyd niwronau motor wedi'i gofrestru yn y modd hwnnw?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r ddadl fer hon wedi codi'r pwynt defnyddiol hwnnw. Byddaf yn ceisio eglurhad ac yn ysgrifennu at Cynog; yna rhennir y wybodaeth â holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Yr wyf am symud ymlaen at rai o'r pwyntiau pwysig eraill a godwyd gan Cynog, yn arbennig y gefnogaeth i ofalwyr. Crybwyllais awdurdodau lleol, a rhaid i'r bartneriaeth hon fod yn lleol. Dyna pam mae cydweithio rhwng y gwasanaethau iechyd a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn hanfodol, nid yn unig o ran polisi cynllunio a chomisiynu, ond hefyd wrth gyflawni'r pecyn gofal sydd ei angen ar bobl yn y sefyllfa honno. Mae cynllun grant arbennig y gofalwyr, a ddarperir drwy'r awdurdod lleol, yn cynnwys gofalwyr llawer mwy er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn diwallu'r anghenion hynny y dylai'r defnyddwyr a'r cynhalwyr eu hunain eu nodi efallai. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym y gofal seibiant sydd mor bwysig i'r gofalwyr. Mae tua £17 miliwn, a fuddsoddiwyd dros bedair blynedd, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth—fel y cydnabu llawer o gyd-Aelodau mae'n siwr—wrth estyn allan at rai o'r grwpiau hyn sydd efallai yn fwy anweladwy i'r cyhoedd, ond sydd, o ran y gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol a'u gofalwyr, ar frig yr agenda.

O ran gweithlu'r gwasanaeth iechyd, mae gennym ein cynlluniau gweithlu bellach mewn perthynas â staff meddygol, gan gynnwys meddygon ymgynghorol. Maent yn dangos inni bod 8.45 o niwrolegwyr sy'n gyfwerth â meddygon ymgynghorol niwrolegol llawn amser wedi'u cyflogi yng Nghymru, ac nad oes unrhyw swyddi gwag. Fodd bynnag, mae pwysau ar ymddiriedolaethau GIG Cymru, a bwriedir cynyddu'r nifer dros y pum mlynedd nesaf. Yr ydym yn cydnabod hynny, ac mae

increased investment in medical training numbers. There were 966 registered medical students in 1999. This has been increased in recent years to more than 1,000, and will be up to 1,385 by 2004. However, we must also work on improving the number of specialist registrars. There are 630 specialist registrars currently in training. These include, importantly, seven neurologists, one neuropathologist, and five neurosurgeons. We need to expand and increase the numbers of those specialist registrar posts to ensure that we have those applicants for our new posts when we have an expansion in neurologists numbers.

On average, motor neurone disease takes three to four years to run its course, and there is no known cure. That relates back to access to fast-track benefits. We must consider, as Cynog said, how we can ensure that our palliative care strategy and services take the needs of motor neurone disease patients into account.

**Brian Hancock:** When I met the vice-dean of the University of Wales College of Medicine, Professor Baroness Finlay, she said that there is a shortage of research in some areas of medicine. If there were more research programmes we would not only be training our future consultants and specialists, but also we would attract those brighter people into the area to do that research. Will you consider further research programmes to ensure that we do this?

**Jane Hutt:** That is an important point. The profile of motor neurone disease has increased considerably in the laboratory and in the clinic. There have been several advances in research, and it is no longer in the scientific backwater. It is more at the forefront of neuro-degenerative disease research. More understanding of the disease is emerging from the research in terms of molecular genetic cell biology and the susceptibility of genes. All that work is going

hynny'n un pwynt a drafodais â'r staff meddygol yng nghanolfan gofal Caerdydd. Rhaid i hynny ddigwydd drwy fuddsoddi mwy yn y niferoedd hyfforddi meddygol. Cofrestrodd 966 o fyfrwyr ar gyfer meddygaeth yn 1999. Cynyddodd hynny yn ystod y blynnyddoedd diwethaf i fwy na 1,000, a bydd wedi cyrraedd 1,385 erbyn 2004. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd weithio i wella nifer y cofrestryddion arbenigol. Mae 630 o gofrestryddion arbenigol yn hyfforddi ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys, yn bwysig, saith o niwrolegwyr, un niwropatholegwr, a phum llawfeddyg niwrolegol. Rhaid inni ehangu a chynyddu nifer y swyddi i gofrestryddion arbenigol er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn derbyn yr ymgeiswyr hynny ar gyfer ein swyddi newydd pan fyddwn yn cynyddu nifer y niwrolegwyr.

Ar gyfartaledd, mae clefyd niwronau motor yn cymryd tair i bedair blynedd i redeg ei gwrs, ac nid oes gwellhad sy'n hysbys. Mae hynny'n cyfeirio'n ôl at fudd-daliadau dull carlam. Rhaid inni ystyried, fel y dywedodd Cynog, sut y gallwn sicrhau bod ein strategaeth gofal lliniarol a'n gwasanaethau yn ystyried anghenion cleifion clefyd niwronau motor.

**Brian Hancock:** Pan gyfarfûm ag is-ddeon Coleg Meddygaeth Prifysgol Cymru, yr Athro Barwnes Finlay, dywedodd wrthyf bod prinder ymchwil mewn rhai meysydd meddygol. Pe byddai mwy o raglenni ymchwil ni fyddem yn hyfforddi ein hymgynghorwyr a'n harbenigwyr ar gyfer y dyfodol yn unig, ond byddem hefyd yn denu'r bobl fwy galluog hynny i'r maes er mwyn gwneud yr ymchwil honno. A ystyriwch raglenni ymchwil pellach er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud hyn?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig. Mae proffil clefyd niwronau motor wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol yn y labordy ac yn y clinig. Bu sawl datblygiad mewn ymchwil, ac nid yw bellach ar ôl yr oes yn wyddonol. Mae'n fwy ar y blaen i ymchwil i glefydau niwrolegol dirywiol. Mae mwy o ddealltwriaeth am y clefyd yn ymddangos o'r ymchwil o ran bioleg celloedd genetig moleculwaidd a rhagduddiad genynnau. Mae'r holl waith hwnnw yn mynd rhagddo, a

ahead, which will be important to screen new therapies. Pharmaceutical companies are also funding research. Therefore, research on understanding the disease and on treatment—although there could always be more, Brian—is more to the forefront.

We do not have immediate plans, as you know, for a national service framework for neurological conditions. However, we are considering the Department of Health's national service framework for long-term conditions. When that is published we will release it for consultation and consider how we should take this forward in Wales, because that framework will have a particular focus on the needs of people with neurological disease, brain and spinal injury. That will be an opportunity for us to embrace what is happening locally in centres such as the Cardiff care centre. It is also an opportunity, as we mentioned yesterday when we talked of stroke, to consider whether there are clinical pathways and diagnoses, particularly in the support package that needs to be provided as well as in the treatment following diagnosis.

Cynog has rightly brought this distressing disease to our attention. If you have met patients with motor neurone disease you know of the profound impact that it has on their lives, and their extraordinary courage in that situation. I witnessed that when I met patients in August, and some have come to the Assembly—I believe that Members of all parties met them. Therefore, we have brought them to the forefront today. However, it also reminds me that I must revisit the discussions that I had in August with the people that I met at Rookwood Hospital. As we move into the new arrangements from 1 April, the local health boards will be well placed to provide a care package with the local government health service, working together with carers, and on disability facilities, grants, and benefits. On the role and relationship with Health Commission Wales, that will occur during the early stages of diagnosis and enable access to effective neurological treatment.

Thank you for bringing this to our attention,

bydd hyn yn bwysig er mwyn sgrinio therapïau newydd. Mae cwmnïau fferyllol yn ariannu ymchwil hefyd. Felly, bydd ymchwil i ddeall y clefyd ac ar y driniaeth—er y gellid gwneud mwy bob amser, Brian—yn bwysicach.

Nid oes gennym gynlluniau yn y dyfodol agos, fel y gwyddoch, ar gyfer fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer cyflyrau niwrolegol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn ystyried fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol yr Adran Iechyd ar gyfer cyflyrau tymor hwy. Pan gyhoeddir hwnnw byddwn yn ei ryddhau ar gyfer gwaith ymgynghori a byddwn yn ystyried sut y dylem ddatblygu hyn yng Nghymru, oherwydd bydd gan y fframwaith hwnnw ffocws penodol ar anghenion pobl â chanddynt glefyd niwrolegol ac anafiadau i'r ymennydd ac i'r asgwrn cefn. Rhydd hynny gyfle inni gofleidio'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn lleol mewn canolfannau megis canolfan gofal Caerdydd. Mae'n gyfle hefyd, fel y dywedasom ddoe pan soniwyd am strôc, i ystyried a oes llwybrau clinigol a diagnosis, yn arbennig yn y pecyn cymorth, y mae angen eu darparu yn ogystal ag yn y driniaeth ar ôl diagnosis.

Mae Cynog, yn gywir, wedi tynnu ein sylw at y clefyd ofnadwy hwn. Os ydych wedi cyfarfod cleifion sy'n dioddef o glefyd niwronau motor yna gwyddoch am yr effaith ddofn a gaiff ar eu bywydau, a'u dewrder hynod yn y sefyllfa honno. Cefais brofiad o hynny pan gyfarfûm â chleifion ym mis Awst, ac mae rhai wedi dod i'r Cynulliad—credaf fod Aelodau pob plaid wedi cyfarfod â hwy. Felly, yr ydym wedi rhoi sylw arbennig iddynt heddiw. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn fy atgoffa bod yn rhaid imi ailystyried y trafodaethau a gefais yn Awst â'r bobl y cyfarfûm â hwy yn Ysbyty Rockwood. Wrth inni wynebu'r trefniadau newydd o 1 Ebrill, bydd y byrddau iechyd lleol mewn sefyllfa dda i ddarparu pecyn gofal gyda'r gwasanaeth iechyd llywodraeth leol, gan gydweithio â gofalwyr, ac ar gyfleusterau anabledd, grantiau a budd-daliadau. O ran y rôl a'r berthynas â Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, bydd hynny'n digwydd yn ystod camau cynnar y diagnosis ac yn galluogi pobl i gael triniaeth niwrolegol effeithiol.

Diolch i chi am dynnu ein sylw at hyn,

Cynog. Finally, the Motor Neurone Disease Association is an important partner for the National Assembly for Wales. It plays a vital role in supporting research, in providing services and in raising awareness.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog, ac wrth wneud hynny, diolchaf i gynifer o Aelodau am aros i wrando, sy'n dangos mor bwysig yw'r ddadl fer hon.

Wrth ddod â chyfarfod heddiw i ben, dymunaf gyfarchion y tymor i chi i gyd.

Cynog. I gloi, mae'r Gymdeithas Clefyd Niwronau Motor yn bartner pwysig i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae'n chwarae rôl hanfodol wrth gynnal ymchwil, wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau ac wrth godi ymwybyddiaeth.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank the Minister, and in doing so, I thank so many Members for remaining behind, which shows the importance of this short debate.

In bringing today's business to a close, I wish you all season's greetings.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.21 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.21 p.m.*