



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Iau 7 Rhagfyr 2000**

**Thursday 7 December 2000**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |    |  |
|----|--|
| 3  | Cynnig Trefniadol<br><i>Procedural Motion</i>  |
| 4  | Ethol i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth<br><i>Election to the Partnership Council</i>  |
| 5  | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg<br><i>Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language</i>   |
| 13 | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig<br><i>Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs</i>   |
| 20 | Diwygio Rheolau Sefydlog Rhif 6.20 a Rhif 4<br><i>Revisions to Standing Orders No. 6.20 and No. 4</i>  |
| 23 | Diwygio Penderfyniad Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Aelodau a Swyddogion y Cynulliad) (Cyflogau, Lwfansau ayb) 1999<br><i>Amendment to the National Assembly for Wales (Assembly Members and Officers) (Salaries, Allowances etc.) Determination 1999</i> |
| 24 | Derbyn Cyllideb y Cynulliad<br><i>Adopting the Assembly's Budget</i>   |
| 44 | Datganiad ar y Comisiynydd Plant<br><i>Statement on the Children's Commissioner</i>  |
| 52 | Derbyn Cyllideb y Cynulliad (Parhad y Ddadl)<br><i>Adopting the Assembly's Budget (Continuation of the Debate)</i>   |
| 79 | Dadl Fer: Mynediad i Bawb<br><i>Short Debate: Access for All</i>   |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Presiding Officer:** In the absence of the Minister for Assembly Business I call on another Member to propose the motion. **Y Llywydd:** Yn absenoldeb y Trefnydd, galwaf ar Aelod arall i gynnig y cynnig.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I propose that

**Jocelyn Davies:** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, allows a no-named day motion on elections to the Partnership Council to be brought forward.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn caniatáu i gynnig heb ddyddiad trafod ar yr etholadau i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth gael ei gyflwyno.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**Ethol i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth  
Election to the Partnership Council**

**The Minister for Assembly Business Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod  
**(Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, in accordance with paragraphs 1(1) and 4 of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 1998, appoints the following persons to be members of the Partnership Council: Edwina Hart in place of Peter Law, David Lloyd in place of Ieuan Wyn Jones, William Graham in place of Glyn Davies.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â pharagraffau 1(1) a 4 Atodlen 11 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penodi'r canlynol yn aelodau o'r Cyngor Partneriaeth: Edwina Hart yn lle Peter Law, Dai Lloyd yn lle Ieuan Wyn Jones, William Graham yn lle Glyn Davies.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg  
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language**

**Gweithredu Argymhellion Adroddiad Wallace  
Implementing the Recommendations of the Wallace Report**

**Q1 Tom Middlehurst:** Could the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language bring forward proposals for the implementation of the recommendations in the Wallace report which require decision by the National Assembly for Wales? (OAQ8249)

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** The four recommendations that require Assembly attention are already in hand. Edwina Hart is conducting a review of remuneration of Assembly sponsored public body Chairs and members, which includes the Arts Council of Wales in its remit. I have already agreed that the Assembly will fund the cost of restructuring the ACW. There are ongoing internal discussions on the Wallace report's suggestion that the Arts Council should be brought within the Delivering Better Government programme of events and seminars. We have received 76 applications for the five vacancies on the Arts Council and we expect to conduct interviews early in the new year.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Do you agree that any proposals should include the issue of the constitution of the Arts Council and its membership? You have said that you will consider the remuneration of the Chair. That is an important issue raised by the Wallace report. Is there not also a need to clearly define the role and function of the Chair and his or her relationship with the chief executive?

**Jenny Randerson:** I agree that those issues need to be considered. They are being considered as part of the action plan that the Arts Council is producing and as part of the taskforce that I have set up to deal with the restructuring of the Arts Council.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Do you agree that, if it emerges that the proposed regionalisation of

**C1 Tom Middlehurst:** A all y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg gyflwyno cynigion ar gyfer gweithredu argymhellion adroddiad Wallace sydd yn gofyn am benderfyniad gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru? (OAQ8249)

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Mae'r pedwar argymhelliad sydd angen sylw'r Cynulliad eisoes ar y gweill. Mae Edwina Hart yn cynnal adolygiad o daliadau Cadeiryddion ac aelodau cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, sydd yn cynnwys Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn ei gylch gwaith. Cytunais eisoes y bydd y Cynulliad yn ariannu cost ailstrwythuro CCC. Mae trafodaethau mewnol yn parhau ynglŷn ag awgrym adroddiad Wallace y dylid dod â Chyngor y Celfyddydau o fewn rhaglen ddigwyddiadau a seminarau Rhoi Llywodraeth Well ar Waith. Derbyniad 76 o geisiadau am y pum swydd wag ar Gyngor y Celfyddydau a disgwyliwn gynnal cyfweiliadau yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd.

**Tom Middlehurst:** A gytunwch y dylai unrhyw gynigion gynnwys mater cyfansoddiad Cyngor y Celfyddydau a'i aelodaeth? Dywedsoch yr ystyriwch dâl y Cadeirydd. Mae hwnnw'n fater pwysig a godwyd gan adroddiad Wallace. Onid oes angen hefyd ddiffinio rôl a swyddogaeth y Cadeirydd yn glir a'i berthynas neu ei pherthynas â'r prif weithredwr?

**Jenny Randerson:** Cytunaf fod angen ystyried y materion hynny. Fe'u hystyrir yn rhan o'r cynllun gweithredu a gynhyrcha Cyngor y Celfyddydau ac sydd yn rhan o'r tasglu a sefydlais i ymdrin â gwaith ailstrwythuro Cyngor y Celfyddydau.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A gytunwch, os daw i'r amlwg bod y gwaith arfaethedig i ranbartholi

the Arts Council leads to a permanent increase in the council's administration costs, that would be unacceptable in view of the many practitioners in the artistic communities in Wales, and that you should rethink the regionalisation project in its entirety? It is important to get cash to arts practitioners and not spend money on bureaucracy and administration costs.

**Jenny Randerson:** I agree that it is important that we get as much money as possible to arts practitioners. The overall result of this restructuring and reorganisation should be that the administration is much more efficient, focused and more effective than it has been in the past. I will consider any restructuring proposals with a critical eye and with those issues in mind.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn ogystal ag adroddiad Wallace, bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o adroddiad PriceWaterhouse Coopers ar strategaeth Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ar theatr i bobl ifanc. Mae'r adroddiad hwnnw yn feirniadol o'r arfer o ddsbarthu cyllidebau heb unrhyw asesiad o'r amcanion y bwriedir eu cyflawni drwyddynt. Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn tynnu sylw at sawl diffyg trefniadol arall. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod yr adroddiad hwnnw ac adroddiad Wallace yn dangos bod angen newidiadau sylfaenol yn y modd y mae Cyngor y Celfyddydau yn gweithredu? A yw hi'n credu hefyd bod yr ewyllys yn y cyngor i gyflawni'r newidiadau hynny? A wnaiff hi sicrhau y bydd y tasglu arfaethedig yn ddigon annibynnol a deinamig i sicrhau bod y newidiadau hynny yn digwydd?

**Jenny Randerson:** There is unanimity in the Committee, and I agree with those Members who have voiced their opinions that we need a fundamental review and change. The Arts Council's response so far has been encouraging. However, a response is only the first step to implementing that change. I agree that we need to have an ongoing review. The taskforce is fully independent. You will know that the Arts Council has advertised for an independent adviser. That post will be filled probably within the next few days. In addition, I have appointed Elan Closs Stephens as an outside thinker for the

Cyngor y Celfyddydau yn arwain at gynnydd parhaol yng nghostau gweinyddol y cyngor, na fyddai'n dderbyniol ym marn yr ymarferwyr niferus yng nghymunedau celfyddydol Cymru, ac y dylech ailystyried y prosiect rhanbartholi yn gyfan gwbl? Mae'n bwysig rhoi arian i ymarferwyr y celfyddydau ac i beidio â gwario arian ar fiwrocratiaeth a chostau gweinyddol.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cytunaf ei bod yn bwysig y rhoddwn gymaint o arian â phosibl i ymarferwyr y celfyddydau. O ganlyniad cyffredinol i'r gwaith ailstrwythuro ac aildrefnu hwn, dylai'r weinyddiaeth fod yn llawer mwy effeithlon ac effeithiol ac â llawer mwy o ffocws nag y bu yn y gorffennol. Ystyriaf unrhyw gynigion ailstrwythuro yn feirniadol a chan gadw'r materion hynny mewn cof.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** In addition to the Wallace report, the Minister will be aware of the PriceWaterhouse Coopers report on the Arts Council of Wales's strategy on theatre for young people. That report is critical of the custom of distributing budgets without assessing their intended objectives. The report also draws attention to a number of other organisational deficiencies. Does the Minister agree that that report and the Wallace report show that fundamental changes need to be made in the way in which the Arts Council operates? Does she also believe that the council has the will to achieve those changes? Will she ensure that the proposed taskforce will be independent and dynamic enough to ensure that those changes are implemented?

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae unfrydedd yn y Pwyllgor, a chytunaf â'r Aelodau hynny a leisiodd eu barn bod angen adolygiad a newidiadau sylfaenol. Bu ymateb Cyngor y Celfyddydau yn galonogol hyd yma. Fodd bynnag, dim ond y cam cyntaf at weithredu'r newidiadau hynny yw ymateb. Cytunaf fod angen adolygiad parhaus arnom. Mae'r tasglu yn hollol annibynnol. Gwyddoch i Gyngor y Celfyddydau hysbysebu am gynghorydd annibynnol. Mae'n debyg y llenwir y swydd honno o fewn yr ychydig ddyddiau nesaf. Yn ogystal, penodais Elan Closs Stephens fel meddyliwr allanol i'r tasglu.

taskforce.

### **Hybu Cyfranogiad Menywod mewn Pêl-droed Promoting Women's Participation in Football**

**Q2 Ann Jones:** What consideration has Jenny Randerson given to promoting women's participation in football in Wales? (OAQ8350)

**Jenny Randerson:** Yesterday, I attended a women and girls' forum at the Sports Council for Wales, which was designed to encourage female participation in sport. The council contributes funding for a women and girls' development officer at the Football Association of Wales and provides three part-time local authority girls' football development officers in Powys, Cardiff and Denbighshire, as well as financial support for two national squads for girls' football. In addition, the council has developed a women and girls' action plan that sets targets to develop leader courses for women and girls and to set up opportunities for girls' mini-football.

**Ann Jones:** That is encouraging. I am sure that you will join me in thanking Caroline Hume, the teenager from Denbigh, who, last year, was debarred from playing football in a mixed team, and who single-handedly took on the FAW and persuaded it to change its rules. She now plays for the youth team in Denbigh. Will you liaise further with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to ensure full participation for young girls and, hopefully one day for women, in mixed football teams?

9:15 a.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** Thank you for highlighting Caroline Hume's case, which led to a rethink of the rules. I was pleased with the FAW's decision that girls under 16 could continue to play in mixed teams if there was not a girls' team in the area. That has directly affected Caroline. I will liaise with Jane Davidson, especially as the physical education and school sport taskforce that was set up by Rosemary Butler is due to report in the near future. We will need to liaise on

**C2 Ann Jones:** Pa ystyriaeth a roddwyd gan Jenny Randerson i hybu cyfranogiad menywod mewn pêl-droed yng Nghymru? (OAQ8350)

**Jenny Randerson:** Mynychais fforwm menywod a merched ddoe yng Nghyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, a oedd â'r nod o annog cyfranogiad menywod a merched mewn chwaraeon. Cyfranna'r cyngor arian ar gyfer swyddog datblygu menywod a merched yng Nghymdeithas Pêl-droed Cymru a darpara dri swyddog datblygu pêl-droed merched rhan amser yn awdurdodau lleol Powys, Caerdydd a Sir Ddinbych, ynghyd â chymorth ariannol ar gyfer dwy sgwad genedlaethol ar gyfer pêl-droed i ferched. Yn ogystal, datblygodd y cyngor gynllun gweithredu menywod a merched sydd yn gosod targedau i ddatblygu cyrsiau arweinwyr ar gyfer menywod a merched ac i sefydlu cyfleoedd ar gyfer gemau pêl-droed mini i ferched.

**Ann Jones:** Mae hynny'n galonogol. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr ymunwch â mi i ddiolch i Caroline Hume, merch ifanc yn ei harddegau o Ddinbych, a ataliwyd rhag chwarae pêl-droed mewn tîm cymysg y llynedd, ac a heriodd Gymdeithas Pêl-droed Cymru ar ei phen ei hun a'i darbwylo i newid ei rheolau. Chwaraea ar gyfer y tîm ieuencid yn Ninbych erbyn hyn. A gysylltwch ymhellach â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i sicrhau cyfraniad llawn ar gyfer merched ifanc, a menywod rhyw ddiwrnod, gobeithio, mewn timau pêl-droed cymysg?

**Jenny Randerson:** Diolch am amlygu achos Caroline Hume, lle yr ailystyriwyd y rheolau o'i herwydd. Yr oeddwn yn falch o benderfyniad Cymdeithas Pêl-droed Cymru y gallai merched o dan 16 oed barhau i chwarae mewn timau cymysg os nad oedd tîm merched yn yr ardal. Effeithiodd hynny ar Caroline yn uniongyrchol. Trafodaf â Jane Davidson, yn enwedig gan y bydd y tasglu addysg gorfforol a chwaraeon ysgolion a sefydlwyd gan Rosemary Butler yn cyflwyno

many issues.

**Glyn Davies:** I also welcome your answer. I declare a family interest in my question. When my daughter wanted to play national cricket—she was playing for Welshpool men’s team at the time—she had to train and eventually play in England because there was no opportunity in Wales. Do you agree that the opportunity for women to play sport at a serious level is not good enough in Wales across all sports, not just football?

**Jenny Randerson:** There have been many problems in Wales and England. Those problems are being ironed out gradually, but more can be done. I have discussed this issue on several occasions with the Sports Council and it is committed to it. The question of the media’s attitude to women’s sport should also be raised. According to figures that were given to us last night in a seminar on women’s and girls’ sport, the media devotes less than 5 per cent of its time or its column inches to women’s sport. That is disgraceful.

**Rosemary Butler:** The Minister has read my mind. This is a major issue in Wales. Two colleagues have talked about women participating at a serious level in cricket, football and a wide range of other sport. I have monitored local newspapers and I am concerned about the lack of coverage of women’s sport. I am glad that Jenny has noted an issue that was raised at the last project committee that women should get a fair share of publicity in high quality sport.

**Jenny Randerson:** I did a small survey as I drove in this morning. In three minutes of sports news on the radio there was one sentence about women’s sport. In the year in which, for example, Tanni Grey-Thompson has achieved so much for Wales, it is time to recognise women in sport.

ei adroddiad yn y dyfodol agos. Bydd angen inni gydweithio ar lawer o faterion.

**Glyn Davies:** Croesawaf finau eich ateb. Datganaf fuddiant teuluol yn fy nghwestiwn. Pan fu fy merch yn awyddus i chwarae criced cenedlaethol—chwaraeai i dîm dynion y Trallwng ar y pryd—bu’n rhaid iddi hyfforddi a chwarae yn Lloegr yn y pen draw gan nad oedd unrhyw gyfle yng Nghymru. A gytunwch nad yw’r cyfle i fenywod gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon ar lefel ddifrifol yn ddigon da yng Nghymru mewn chwaraeon yn gyffredinol, nid yn unig pêl-droed?

**Jenny Randerson:** Bu llawer o broblemau yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Datrysir y problemau hynny yn raddol, ond gellir gwneud mwy. Trafodais y mater hwn ar sawl achlysur gyda’r Cyngor Chwaraeon ac mae’n ymrwymedig iddo. Dylid codi cwestiwn ynghylch agwedd y cyfryngau tuag at chwaraeon menywod hefyd. Yn ôl ffigurau a roddwyd inni neithiwr mewn seminar ar chwaraeon menywod a merched, neilltua’r cyfryngau lai na 5 y cant o’u hamser neu eu colofnau i chwaraeon menywod. Mae hynny’n warthus.

**Rosemary Butler:** Darllenodd y Gweinidog fy meddwl. Mae hwn yn fater pwysig yng Nghymru. Siaradodd dau gyd-Aelod am gyfranogiad menywod ar lefel ddifrifol mewn criced, pêl-droed ac amrywiaeth eang o chwaraeon eraill. Yr wyf wedi monitro papurau newydd lleol a phryderaf am y diffyg sylw a roddir i chwaraeon menywod. Yr wyf yn falch i Jenny nodi mater a godwyd ym mhwyllgor diwethaf y prosiect y dylai menywod gael cyhoeddusrwydd teg mewn chwaraeon o ansawdd uchel.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynhaliais arolwg bach wrth imi yrru i mewn y bore yma. Yn y tair munud a neilltuwyd i newyddion chwaraeon ar y radio, dim ond un frawddeg oedd am chwaraeon menywod. Yn y flwyddyn pan gyflawnodd Tanni Grey-Thompson, er enghraifft, cymaint dros Gymru, mae’n bryd cydnabod menywod mewn chwaraeon.



**Adolygiad o Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru**  
**Review of the Arts Council of Wales**

**Q3 Jonathan Morgan:** When was the last quinquennial review of the Arts Council of Wales completed and when will the next review be completed? (OAQ8309)

**Jenny Randerson:** The council has not had such a review since its establishment in 1994. The review was originally scheduled for this year, but has been postponed to enable the council to concentrate on following the Wallace report's recommendations. I expect the review to start in April 2002, and to take around six months.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Is it not unacceptable that of all the Assembly sponsored public bodies in Wales, the Arts Council of Wales is the only one that has avoided a thoroughgoing review? In the forthcoming review, when we finally get to it, will you ask the review panel to examine the Arts Council of Wales's royal charter and whether or not it is the appropriate legal basis for this organisation in this post-devolution era?

**Jenny Randerson:** I cannot do anything about or comment on the lack of a review in the past, but the Arts Council is under constant review at present. The Wallace report, which was ordered and accepted by my predecessor, Tom Middlehurst, addressed the finance and management side in detail. The PriceWaterhouse Coopers review and the Post-16 Education and Training Committee's review have been undertaken. The Arts Council is under greater scrutiny than any other Assembly sponsored public body. The next review, which will take place in 2002, will be meaningful because by then it will be operating in its new format. With reference to your comments on the royal charter, I have investigated this and I know your feelings on this matter: no body has ever had its royal charter revoked. There has never been a request to revoke a body's royal charter. I gather that the Privy Council would be extremely concerned if there were such a request. *[Interruption.]* I knew that that would raise comments.

**C3 Jonathan Morgan:** Pryd cwblhawyd adolygiad pum mlynedd diwethaf Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, a phryd y cwblheir yr adolygiad nesaf? (OAQ8309)

**Jenny Randerson:** Ni chafodd y cyngor adolygiad o'r fath ers ei sefydlu yn 1994. Amserlennwyd yr adolygiad ar gyfer eleni yn wreiddiol, ond fe'i gohiriwyd er mwyn galluogi'r cyngor i ganolbwyntio ar fynd ar drywydd argymhellion adroddiad Wallace. Disgwyliaf i'r adolygiad ddechrau ym mis Ebrill 2002, a chymryd tua chwe mis.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Onid yw'n annerbyniol mai Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, o bob un o'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, yw'r unig un sydd wedi osgoi adolygiad trylwyr? Yn yr adolygiad i ddod, pan y'i cyrhaeddwn o'r diwedd, a ofynnwch i'r panel adolygu archwilio siarter frenhinol Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ac a yw'n sail gyfreithiol briodol ai peidio ar gyfer y sefydliad hwn yn y cyfnod ôl-ddatganoledig hwn?

**Jenny Randerson:** Ni allaf wneud unrhyw beth am y diffyg adolygiad yn y gorffennol na rhoi sylwadau arno, ond adolygir Cyngor y Celfyddydau yn barhaus ar hyn o bryd. Ymdriniodd adroddiad Wallace, a gafodd ei orchymyn a'i dderbyn gan fy rhagflaenydd, Tom Middlehurst, â'r ochr ariannu a rheoli yn fanwl. Cynhaliwyd adolygiad PriceWaterhouse Coopers ac adolygiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16. Archwilir Cyngor y Celfyddydau yn fanylach nag unrhyw gorff cyhoeddus arall a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Bydd yr adolygiad nesaf, a gynhelir yn 2002, yn ystyrllon oherwydd y bydd yn gweithredu ar ei ffurf newydd erbyn hynny. Gan gyfeirio at eich sylwadau ar y siarter frenhinol, ymchwiliais i hyn a gwn eich teimladau ar y mater hwn: ni ddiddymwyd siarter frenhinol unrhyw gorff erioed. Ni fu cais erioed i ddiddymu siarter frenhinol corff. Deallaf y byddai'r Cyfrin Gyngor yn pryderu'n fawr iawn pe byddai cais o'r fath. *[Torri ar draws.]* Gwyddwn yr achosai hynny sylwadau.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Can the Privy Councillors present please contain themselves?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. A fydd y Cyfrin Gynghorwyr sydd yn bresennol cystal â rheoli eu hunain?

**Jenny Randerson:** It would be a controversial and lengthy process. However, there have been many cases where royal charters have been amended. There is no reason why the royal charter cannot be amended to suit our purposes. There is no evidence that the royal charter has caused the Arts Council's problems. In Wales the Sports Council, the National Library and the National Museums and Galleries of Wales also have royal charters. That does not affect our control and influence over them.

**Jenny Randerson:** Byddai'n broses ddadleuol a hir. Fodd bynnag, bu llawer o achosion lle y diwygiwyd siarteri brenhinol. Nid oes rheswm pam na ellir diwygio siarter frenhinol i gyd-fynd â'n dibenion. Ni cheir tystiolaeth yr achoswyd problemau Cyngor y Celfyddydau gan y siarter frenhinol. Yng Nghymru, mae siarteri brenhinol gan y Cyngor Chwaraeon, y Llyfrgell Genedlaethol ac Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru. Nid effeithia hynny ar ein rheolaeth neu ein dylanwad drostynt.

### **Cyfansoddiad Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru The Constitution of the Arts Council of Wales**

**C4 Cynog Dafis:** Pa drafodaethau a gafodd Jenny Randerson â chynrychiolwyr o Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ynghylch ei gyfansoddiad? (OAQ8372)

**Q4 Cynog Dafis:** What discussions has Jenny Randerson had with representatives of the Arts Council of Wales regarding its constitution? (OAQ8372)

**Jenny Randerson:** I have not had any discussions with the Arts Council regarding its constitution.

**Jenny Randerson:** Ni chefais unrhyw drafodaethau â Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ynglŷn â'i gyfansoddiad.

The Arts Council was established by royal charter in 1994. I have no evidence to suggest that royal charter status has ever caused the Assembly any difficulties in obtaining compliance with policies from any of its sponsored bodies that were established in such a way. I am sorry if that repeats what I have just said.

Sefydlwyd Cyngor y Celfyddydau gan siarter frenhinol yn 1994. Nid oes tystiolaeth gennyf i awgrymu yr achosodd statws siarter frenhinol erioed unrhyw broblemau i'r Cynulliad i gael unrhyw un o'r cyrff a noddir ganddo ac a sefydlwyd yn y fath fodd i gydymffurfio â pholisïau. Mae'n flin gennyf os yw hynny'n ailadrodd yr hyn yr wyf newydd ei ddweud.

**Cynog Dafis:** Symudaf y drafodaeth ymlaen o sylwadau Jonathan Morgan a nodi y byddai rhai ohonom yn croesawu cais gan y Cynulliad a fyddai'n achosi tipyn o gythrwfl yn y Cyfrin Gyngor, fel y'i gelwir; gelwir hynny arno yn briodol gan ei fod yn gyfrin. Y pwynt yw bod Cyngor y Celfyddydau yn gorff gwahanol yn ei hanfod i Lyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru a'r Amgueddfa Genedlaethol oherwydd asiantaeth yw Cyngor y Celfyddydau. Mae'n gwneud yr un math o waith ym maes y celfyddydau â, dyweder, y mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn ei wneud ym maes datblygu economaidd. Datblygu celfyddydol yw ei nod.

**Cynog Dafis:** I will move the discussion forward from Jonathan Morgan's comments and note that some of us would welcome an application by the Assembly that would cause considerable uproar in the Privy Council, as it is called; it is appropriately titled because it is private. The point is that the Arts Council is fundamentally different to the National Library of Wales and the National Museum because the Arts Council is an agency. It does the same sort of work in the arts as, let us say, the Welsh Development Agency does in the area of economic development. Its purpose is artistic development.

A dderbyniwch bod Cyngor y Celfyddydau mewn categori gwahanol ac y byddai'n synhwyrol i ddod â'r cyngor hwnnw i'r un math o batrwm â chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill a noddir gan y Cynulliad?

**Jenny Randerson:** There is no reason why the Arts Council's royal charter status should prevent us from controlling, developing and reforming the Arts Council as we would wish. There is no evidence that the royal charter has caused the Arts Council's problems. I am concerned that a number of Assembly Members are allowing this issue to override the real concerns about the Arts Council and the need to review and reform it. All the problems associated with the Arts Council can be overcome without going through a tortuous process that would last many years. I am anxious to get on with reforming the Arts Council without getting tied up in a legal wrangle with the Privy Council: whether we like it or not, we cannot control it.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call the Right Honourable Ron Davies.

**Ron Davies:** How can the Minister presume to know the Privy Council's attitude?

**Jenny Randerson:** I took soundings. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**Peter Rogers:** Do you think that changes to the Arts Council's constitution will bring any direct benefits to the people of north Wales?

**Jenny Randerson:** Changes to the way in which the Arts Council operates and administers its finances will bring benefits to north Wales, particularly as—I am sure that you are aware, Peter—there were five places on the Arts Council that were not filled in the previous round of appointments, specifically because of our concern that there were not enough applicants from the North. We have had 76 applicants for five places and I am told—although I have not yet seen the applications—that those applicants are of a high calibre. We will have no trouble in filling those five vacancies.

Do you accept that the Arts Council is in a different category and that it would be sensible to bring that council into the same sort of regime as other Assembly sponsored public bodies?

**Jenny Randerson:** Nid oes unrhyw reswm pam y dylai statws siarter frenhinol Cyngor y Celfyddydau ein hatal rhag rheoli, datblygu a diwygio Cyngor y Celfyddydau fel y dymunem. Nid oes tystiolaeth yr achoswyd problemau Cyngor y Celfyddydau gan y siarter frenhinol. Pryderaf fod nifer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn caniatáu i'r mater hwn ddod yn bwysicach na'r pryderon gwirioneddol am Gyngor y Celfyddydau a'r angen i'w adolygu a'i ddiwygio. Gellir goresgyn pob un o'r problemau sydd yn gysylltiedig â Chyngor y Celfyddydau heb fynd drwy broses gymhleth a barhâi am nifer o flynyddoedd. Yr wyf yn awyddus i fynd ymlaen â'r gwaith o ddiwygio Cyngor y Celfyddydau heb gael fy nghlymu mewn dadl gyfreithiol gyda'r Cyfrin Gyngor: pa un a ydym yn ei hoffi ai peidio, ni allwn ei reoli.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf y Gwir Anrhydeddus Ron Davies.

**Ron Davies:** Sut gall y Gweinidog dybio ei bod yn gwybod agwedd y Cyfrin Gyngor?

**Jenny Randerson:** Ymgynghorais ynglŷn â'r mater. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**Peter Rogers:** A gredwch y daw newidiadau i gyfansoddiad Cyngor y Celfyddydau ag unrhyw fanteision uniongyrchol i bobl gogledd Cymru?

**Jenny Randerson:** Daw newidiadau yn y ffordd y gweithreda Cyngor y Celfyddydau ac y gweinydda ei arian â manteision i ogledd Cymru, yn enwedig oherwydd—yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith, Peter—y bu pum lle ar Gyngor y Celfyddydau nas llenwyd yn y cylch olaf o benodiadau, yn benodol oherwydd ein gofid nad oedd digon o ymgeiswyr o'r Gogledd. Cawsom 76 o geisiadau am bum swydd a dywedwyd wrthyf—er na welais y ceisiadau eto—fod yr ymgeiswyr hynny o galibr uchel. Ni chawn drafferth i lanw'r pum swydd hynny.

9:25 a.m.

### **Trosglwyddo Swyddogaeth Loteri Transfer of Lottery Function**

**Q5 William Graham:** What plans does Jenny Randerson have for the transfer of the film lottery function from the Arts Council of Wales? (OAQ8349)

**Jenny Randerson:** The Arts Council of Wales and Sgrîn have written jointly to the National Assembly and to the Department for Culture, Media and Sport. The two bodies have proposed that responsibility for distributing lottery funds should be transferred to Sgrîn. There are matters that fall to both the Assembly and the Department for Culture, Media and Sport to consider. These are being given urgent consideration.

**William Graham:** Thank you for your statement. Though acknowledging that artistic quality is paramount, what will be your policy to promote the wonderful range of locations in Wales to maximise employment and tourism opportunities?

**Jenny Randerson:** The location aspect of filming in Wales is promoted by the three film commissions. There is one for south Wales, although I gather that the Newport area and the area that you represent, South Wales East, is not represented on the board. There are ongoing talks between the three film commissions and Sgrîn to improve their representation so that Sgrîn can take on a bigger role in the aspect of promoting Wales as a location, especially abroad.

**Elin Jones:** Symudodd Gŵyl Ffilm Ryngwladol Cymru o Aberystwyth i Gaerdydd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg i sicrhau y bydd Gŵyl Ffilm Ryngwladol Cymru o fudd i Gymru gyfan yn y dyfodol?

**Jenny Randerson:** This year's International Film Festival of Wales, which is about to finish in Cardiff, was very successful. Last year's festival doubled the previous number

**C5 William Graham:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan Jenny Randerson i drosglwyddo'r swyddogaeth loteri sydd yn ymwneud â ffilmiau o ofal Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru? (OAQ8349)

**Jenny Randerson:** Ysgrifennodd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru a Sgrîn ar y cyd i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac i'r Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon. Cynigiodd y ddau gorff y dylid trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros ddsbarthu arian y loteri i Sgrîn. Mae materion y mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad a'r Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon eu hystyried. Rhoddir ystyriaeth frys iddynt.

**William Graham:** Diolch am eich datganiad. Er y cydnabyddwch fod ansawdd celfyddydol o'r pwys mwyaf, beth fydd eich polisi i hyrwyddo'r amrywiaeth bendigedig o leoliadau a geir yng Nghymru er mwyn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd o ran cyflogaeth a thwristiaeth?

**Jenny Randerson:** Hyrwyddir yr agwedd lleoliadau ffilmio yng Nghymru gan y tri chomisiwn ffilm. Mae un ar gyfer de Cymru, er y deallaf na chynrychiolir ardal Casnewydd a'r ardal a gynrychiolwch chi, De Ddwyrain Cymru, ar y bwrdd. Mae trafodaethau parhaus rhwng y tri chomisiwn ffilm a Sgrîn er mwyn gwella eu cynrychiolaeth fel y gall Sgrîn ymgymryd â rôl fwy o ran hyrwyddo Cymru fel lleoliad, yn enwedig dramor.

**Elin Jones:** The International Film Festival of Wales moved from Aberystwyth to Cardiff some years ago. What plans does the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language have to ensure that the International Film Festival of Wales will benefit the whole of Wales in future?

**Jenny Randerson:** Bu Gŵyl Ffilm Ryngwladol Cymru eleni, sydd ar fin dod i ben yng Nghaerdydd, yn llwyddiannus iawn. Dyblodd gŵyl y llynedd nifer y bobl a

of attendances. Although it was based in Cardiff, there were many showings of films and events in other venues throughout Wales, including Aberystwyth, Blackwood and Tredegar. When I attended the film festival, I emphasised that it should serve the whole of Wales.

fynychodd yn flaenorol. Er iddi gael ei chynnal yng Nghaerdydd, dangoswyd llawer o ffilmiau a digwyddiadau mewn lleoliadau eraill ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys Aberystwyth, y Coed Duon a Thredegar. Pan fynychais yr ŵyl ffilmiau, pwysleisiais y dylai wasanaethu Cymru gyfan.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs**

### **Tir Gofal**

**Q1 Glyn Davies:** Will the Minister for Rural Affairs make a statement on Tir Gofal? (OAQ8307)

**C1 Glyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig ddatganiad ar Tir Gofal? (OAQ8307)

**The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones):** In October, Tir Gofal was formally approved by the European Commission as part of the rural development plan for Wales. The scheme is recognised by other European countries as being at the forefront of sustainable farming and countryside conservation. Successful applications from the first round have nearly all been signed up, and processing of successful applications from the second round is well underway. The third round will open early in the new year and, in accordance with the recommendations of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee, will stay open for five months to give farmers a good opportunity to apply.

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones):** Ym mis Hydref, cymeradwywyd Tir Gofal yn ffurfiol gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn rhan o'r cynllun datblygu gwledig ar gyfer Cymru. Mae gwledydd Ewropeaidd eraill yn cydnabod bod y cynllun yn rheng flaen ffermio cynaliadwy a chadwraeth cefn gwlad. Cofrestrwyd bron pob cais llwyddiannus o'r cylch cyntaf, ac mae'r gwaith o brosesu'r ceisiadau llwyddiannus o'r ail gylch wedi hen ddechrau. Bydd y trydydd cylch yn dechrau yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd ac, yn unol ag argymhellion y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, erys ar agor am bum mis er mwyn rhoi cyfle da i ffermwyr wneud cais.

**Glyn Davies:** The main reason that Tir Cymen, the pilot scheme on which Tir Gofal was based, was an economic success, was the creation of jobs off the farm, which in turn depended on the critical mass that was achieved because it was within a confined area. Do you agree that if Tir Gofal is to be as successful, it needs to achieve that same critical mass and receive the necessary funding?

**Glyn Davies:** Y prif reswm pam y bu Tir Cymen, y cynllun peilot y seiliwyd Tir Gofal arno, yn llwyddiant economaidd, oedd y crëwyd swyddi oddi ar y fferm, a oedd yn dibynnu yn eu tro ar y màs critigol a gyflawnwyd oherwydd ei fod o fewn ardal gyfyngedig. A gytunwch, os yw Tir Gofal i fod yr un mor llwyddiannus, bod angen iddo gyflawni'r un màs critigol a chael yr arian angenrheidiol?

**Carwyn Jones:** As you know, Glyn, Tir Gofal is an agri-environmental scheme and is also a relatively new scheme and needs time to bed itself in. However, as I reported to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee yesterday, we need to keep Tir Gofal under review to measure whether it is targeting the people that we wanted to target,

**Carwyn Jones:** Fel y gwyddoch, Glyn, mae Tir Gofal yn gynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol a chynllun cymharol newydd hefyd ac mae angen amser iddo ymsefydlu. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais wrth y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, mae angen inni barhau i adolygu Tir Gofal i fesur a yw'n targedu'r bobl y dymunasom eu

and April will be the earliest point at which we can begin that review.

**Elin Jones:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn credu ei bod yn briodol fod Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru yn hysbysebu am swyddogion Tir Gofal yn ngogledd-orllewin Cymru heb ofyn am sgiliau dwyieithog ar gyfer swyddi sydd yn golygu delio yn uniongyrchol â ffermwyr? A wnaiff y Gweinidog godi'r mater â Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun cydymffurfio â'i gynllun iaith?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o hynny. Yr wyf yn falch, Elin, eich bod wedi codi hynny y bore yma. Os ysgrifennwch ataf yn swyddogol, fe ysgrifennaf at Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r mater.

targedu, ac Ebrill fydd y cynharaf y gallwn ddechrau'r adolygiad hwnnw.

**Elin Jones:** Does the Minister believe it appropriate that the Countryside Council for Wales advertises for Tir Gofal officials in north-west Wales without asking for bilingual skills for posts that involve dealing directly with farmers? Will the Minister raise the issue with the Countryside Council for Wales, particularly in the context of complying with its language scheme?

**Carwyn Jones:** I was not aware of that. I am pleased, Elin, that you have raised it this morning. If you write to me officially, I will write to the Countryside Council for Wales in order to address the matter.

### **Monitro Dosbarthu Bwyd Monitoring the Distribution of Food**

**Q2 Janet Davies:** What provisions has Carwyn Jones made to monitor the distribution of food from the Intervention Board? (OAQ8263)

**Carwyn Jones:** Under the EU surplus food scheme, which ceased in 1998, cans of stewed steak were made available to certain categories of the public. Responsibility for the administration and overall monitoring of that scheme rests with the Intervention Board. It is also responsible for the investigation of potential fraudulent activity.

The then Welsh Office's agriculture department approved all the designated organisations in Wales that distributed food under the scheme. The Welsh Office's role also included a sample of spot-checks that distribution was taking place to monitor the number of cans each person received and the eligibility of recipients.

**Janet Davies:** I note the second part of your reply with great interest. However, will you take action to ensure that complaints about abuse of food distribution as an aid to election campaigns by local politicians are pursued rigorously and that a framework of

**C2 Janet Davies:** Pa gamau y mae Carwyn Jones wedi'u cymryd er mwyn monitro sut y mae bwyd yn cael ei ddosbarthu gan y Bwrdd Ymyrraeth? (OAQ8263)

**Carwyn Jones:** O dan gynllun bwyd dros ben yr UE, a ddaeth i ben yn 1998, rhoddwyd caniau o stêc wedi'i stiwiwio i rai categorïau o'r cyhoedd. Mae'r Bwrdd Ymyrraeth yn gyfrifol am weinyddu a monitro'r cynllun hwnnw yn gyffredinol. Mae hefyd yn gyfrifol am ymchwilio i weithgarwch twyllodrus posibl.

Cymeradwyodd adran amaethyddiaeth yr hen Swyddfa Gymreig bob un o'r sefydliadau penodedig yng Nghymru a ddosbarthodd fwyd o dan y cynllun. Yr oedd rôl y Swyddfa Gymreig hefyd yn cynnwys sampl o hapwiriadau i sicrhau bod y gwaith dosbarthu yn digwydd ac i fonitro faint o ganiau a gafodd pob person a chymhwyster y bobl hynny.

**Janet Davies:** Mae ail ran eich ateb yn ddiddorol iawn. Fodd bynnag, a gymerwch gamau i sicrhau y dilynir cwynion ynglŷn â chamddefnyddio dosbarthu bwyd er mwyn cynorthwyo ymgyrchoedd etholiadol gan wleidyddion lleol yn drwyadl ac y sefydlir

rules is established to control such practices?

fframwaith o reolau i reoli ymarferion o'r fath?

**Carwyn Jones:** If you refer to the article in *The Western Mail* on 29 November about the food distributed by Llanelli Rural Community Council, the Intervention Board is aware of the case and there is an ongoing investigation by the anti-fraud team. It would be inappropriate for me to comment at this stage in any detail as that might prejudice the investigation and any subsequent legal action. I will write to you as soon as the inquiry is completed to inform you of the outcome.

**Carwyn Jones:** Os cyfeiriwch at yr erthygl yn *The Western Mail* ar 29 Tachwedd ynglŷn â'r bwyd a ddosbarthwyd gan Gyngor Cymunedol Gwledig Llanelli, mae'r Bwrdd Ymyrraeth yn ymwybodol o'r achos ac mae ymchwiliad ar y gweill gan y tîm gwrth-dwyll. Ni fyddai'n briodol imi roi sylwadau manwl ar hyn o bryd oherwydd y gallai niweidio'r ymchwiliad ac unrhyw gamau cyfreithiol yn dilyn. Ysgrifennaf atoch cyn gynted ag y cwblheir yr ymchwiliad er mwyn eich hysbysu o'r canlyniadau.

**Janet Davies** *rose*—

**Janet Davies** *a gododd*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Only one supplementary question per person is allowed.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dim ond un cwestiwn atodol yr un a ganiateir.

### **Iechyd a Diogelwch ar Ffermydd yng Nghymru Health and Safety on Welsh Farms**

**Q3 Ann Jones:** What discussions has Carwyn Jones had with the Health and Safety Executive concerning health and safety on Welsh farms? (OAQ8353)

**C3 Ann Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Carwyn Jones wedi'u cynnal â'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch ynghylch iechyd a diogelwch ar ffermydd yng Nghymru? (OAQ8353)

**Carwyn Jones:** I have not had any discussions with the Health and Safety Executive, but my officials are in close contact with it. During the next few weeks, they will meet representatives of the Health and Safety Executive to discuss the extent to which Farming Connect can include health and safety information and advice within the services the HSE already provides for the farming community in Wales.

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni chynhaliiais unrhyw drafodaethau â'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch, ond mae fy swyddogion mewn cysylltiad agos â hi. Yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf, byddant yn cwrdd â chynrychiolwyr o'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch i drafod i ba raddau y gall Farming Connect gynnwys gwybodaeth a chynghor iechyd a diogelwch o fewn y gwasanaethau a ddarpara'r HSE eisoes ar gyfer y gymuned ffermio yng Nghymru.

**Ann Jones:** I am sure that you agree that we must ensure that all our workplaces are safe and this includes farms. When your officials meet with the Health and Safety Executive, will you consider discussing whether we should raise the minimum age for driving tractors from 13 to 16? We should also introduce a minimum age of 18 for the handling and application of chemicals on farms and make the chemical industry responsible for the collection, disposal and recycling of empty spray and chemical

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein gweithleoedd yn ddiogel ac mae hyn yn cynnwys ffermydd. Pan fydd eich swyddogion yn cwrdd â'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch, a ystyriwch drafod a ddylem godi'r isafswm oedran ar gyfer gyrru tractorau o 13 i 16 oed? Dylem gyflwyno isafswm oedran o 18 oed hefyd ar gyfer trin a chymhwysio cemegion ar ffermydd a gwneud y diwydiant cemegol yn gyfrifol am gasglu, gwaredu ac ailgylchu cyfansoddion chwistrelliadau gwag a

components.

**Carwyn Jones:** Health and safety is not a devolved matter, although as I indicated, we are in close contact with the HSE and it is right and proper that we make representations on behalf of the people of Wales. There have been several deaths on farms in the past four years, including, tragically, four children and 10 adults over the age of 65. Our aim should be to prevent all accidents, and if there is any measure that can be introduced to improve farm safety then it should be considered seriously. My understanding is that several matters might be considered for improving farm safety, which would not incur any great cost to the farmer. That is something for future discussion.

**David Lloyd:** Yn dilyn y pwynt hwnnw, datganaf fuddiant fel mab fferm ac fel rhywun a oedd yn gyrru tractor yn 13 oed. A oes strategaeth benodol i hybu diogelwch ar ffermydd, yn enwedig o gofio'r holl anafiadau hyn y soniasoch amdanynt?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae hyn yn fater y dylai'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch ei ystyried, fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i'r cwestiwn gwreiddiol. Gallwn drafod hyn â'r awdurdod i ystyried pa fath o rôl y gall Farming Connect ei chwarae y flwyddyn nesaf ynghylch iechyd a diogelwch.

**Peter Rogers:** I must be careful in asking my question following my catastrophic slip of the tongue when talking of green wellies a few Plenaries ago. [*Laughter.*] Are you aware of the latest European directive, which seeks to ban farmers from using their tractors for more than two hours because of total body vibration? Could you make it clear to your European counterparts that we will not tolerate any of this bureaucratic nonsense?

9:35 a.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** You mentioned, Peter, the difficulties that you had some weeks ago in pronouncing some words, which would have necessitated the assistance of the Health and Safety Executive, as well as a general practitioner, if they had been correct. On

chemegol.

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid yw iechyd a diogelwch yn fater datganoledig, er fel y nodais, yr ydym mewn cysylltiad agos â'r HSE ac mae'n gywir ac yn briodol y cyflwynwn sylwadau ar ran pobl Cymru. Bu farw nifer o bobl ar ffermydd yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf, yn cynnwys, yn drasig, bedwar plentyn a 10 oedolyn dros 65 oed. Dylem anelu at atal pob damwain, ac os oes unrhyw fesur y gellir ei gyflwyno i wella diogelwch ar ffermydd, dylid ei ystyried o ddifrif. Deallaf y gellid ystyried nifer o faterion i wella diogelwch ar ffermydd, na fyddent yn mynd i unrhyw gost fawr i'r ffermwr. Mae hynny yn rhywbeth y dylem ei drafod yn y dyfodol.

**David Lloyd:** Following that point, I declare an interest as the son of a farmer and as someone who drove a tractor at the age of 13. Is there a specific strategy to promote safety on farms, particularly bearing in mind all the injuries that you mentioned?

**Carwyn Jones:** This is a matter that the Health and Safety Executive should consider, as I said in my answer to the original question. We can discuss this with the executive to consider what kind of role Farming Connect can play next year on matters of health and safety.

**Peter Rogers:** Rhaid imi fod yn ofalus wrth ofyn fy nghwestiwn yn sgîl fy llithriad tafod ofnadwy wrth siarad am welingtons gwyrdd rai Cyfarfodydd Llawn yn ôl. [*Chwerthin.*] A ydych yn ymwybodol o'r gyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd ddiweddaraf, sydd yn ceisio gwahardd ffermwyr rhag defnyddio eu tractorau am fwy na dwy awr oherwydd bod y corff cyfan yn dirgrynu? A allech esbonio'n glir i'ch cymheiriaid Ewropeaidd na chaniatawn y nonsens biwrocraidaidd hwn?

**Carwyn Jones:** Crybwyllasoch, Peter, yr anawsterau a gawsoch ychydig wythnosau yn ôl wrth ynganu rhai geiriau, a fyddai wedi gofyn am gymorth yr Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch, ynghyd â meddyg teulu, pe byddent wedi bod yn gywir. Ynglŷn â



tractor driving, the European Commission does not introduce health and safety legislation for the sake of it but to protect working people. However, if there is inappropriate legislation, I will take the matter up with the European Commission.

gyrru tractor, ni chyflwynna'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ddeddfwriaeth iechyd a diogelwch dim ond er mwyn ei chyflwyno ond yn hytrach er mwyn diogelu pobl sydd yn gweithio. Fodd bynnag, os oes deddfwriaeth amhriodol, trafodaf y mater gyda'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd.

### **Ymateb i Gyfeillion y Ddaear Response to Friends of the Earth**

**Q4 Mick Bates:** When will Carwyn Jones make a full response to the questions about the Flintshire genetically modified maize trial submitted by Friends of the Earth on 16 June? (OAQ8304)

**C4 Mick Bates:** Pryd y bydd Carwyn Jones yn rhoi ateb llawn i'r cwestiynau a gyflwynwyd gan Gyfeillion y Ddaear ar 16 Mehefin am y profion ar indrawn a addaswyd yn enetig a gynhaliwyd yn Sir y Fflint? (OAQ8304)

**Carwyn Jones:** I responded fully to that letter on 5 December.

**Carwyn Jones:** Atebais y llythyr hwnnw yn llawn ar 5 Rhagfyr.

**Mick Bates:** I am pleased that this question has had some effect. It was reported in *The Independent on Sunday* on 3 December that four genetically modified maize trials were carried out this summer at secret locations in the United Kingdom. Will you undertake to write to the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions, and Aventis to find out whether any of these trials were held in Wales?

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn falch y cafodd y cwestiwn hwn rywfaint o effaith. Cafwyd adroddiad yn *The Independent on Sunday* ar 3 Rhagfyr y cynhaliwyd pedwar prawf ar indrawn a addaswyd yn enetig yn ystod yr haf mewn lleoliadau cyfrinachol yn y Deyrnas Unedig. A ydych yn addo ysgrifennu at y Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd, Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau, ac Aventis i ddarganfod a gynhaliwyd unrhyw un o'r profion hyn yng Nghymru?

**Carwyn Jones:** I am not aware that any of these trials were held in Wales. I am aware of the article in *The Independent on Sunday*. Whether it was accurate or not will need to be investigated. If it is accurate, I give an assurance that I will write to find out where these trials took place, if indeed there were such trials.

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol y cynhaliwyd unrhyw un o'r profion hyn yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r erthygl yn *The Independent on Sunday*. Bydd angen ymchwilio i ddarganfod a oedd yn gywir ai peidio. Os bydd yn gywir, sicrhaf yr ysgrifennaf i ddarganfod ble y cynhaliwyd y profion hyn, pe cynhaliwyd profion o'r fath mewn gwirionedd.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** You will be aware that the forthcoming seeds marketing regulations have an important part to play in this GM issue. What part did you have in framing them, and when can we expect them to come before the Assembly?

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod rhan bwysig gan y rheoliadau marchnata hadau arfaethedig i'w chwarae ynglŷn â'r mater addasu yn enetig hwn. Pa ran a gymerasoch wrth eu llunio, a phryd y gallwn ddisgwyl iddynt ddod gerbron y Cynulliad?

**Carwyn Jones:** The seeds marketing regulations will come before the Assembly

**Carwyn Jones:** Gobeithio y daw y rheoliadau marchnata hadau gerbron y

during the first part of next year hopefully. The Assembly has potentially more control over those regulations than over the seeds list regulations. These are all matters that can be discussed at the appropriate time by the GM strategy group, which met for the first time yesterday.

**Janet Ryder:** You said in Committee yesterday that you now have two conflicting legal opinions over the GM crop in Flintshire. How will you resolve this situation, and are you prepared to have two conflicting legal opinions standing?

**Carwyn Jones:** The legal opinions that I have seen—from the Office of the Counsel General and from Friends of the Earth—are so far apart that there is no way of reconciling them other than by sorting the matter out in court. However, we do not have that luxury in the National Assembly, which is why it is important that the GM strategy group considers what the situation actually is. With that in mind, the proposal made to the GM strategy group yesterday was that, first, a presentation would be made by the Office of the Counsel General's lawyers, with appropriate questions from the members of the GM strategy group. If the group then wished to invite other outside organisations to make representations, that would be done.

Cynulliad yn ystod rhan gyntaf y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae mwy o reolaeth gan y Cynulliad o bosibl dros y rheoliadau hynny na thros y rheoliadau rhestrau hadau. Gall y grŵp strategaeth hadau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig, a gyfarfu am y tro cyntaf ddoe, drafod pob un o'r materion hyn pan fo'n briodol.

**Janet Ryder:** Dywedasoeh yn y Pwyllgor ddoe bod dwy farn gyfreithiol sydd yn groes i'w gilydd gennyh erbyn hyn ynglŷn â'r cnwd a addaswyd yn enetig yn Sir y Fflint. Sut y datryswhc y sefyllfa hon, ac a ydych yn barod i gael dwy farn gyfreithiol sydd yn groes i'w gilydd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r barnau cyfreithiol a welais—o Swyddfa'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol a Chyfeillion y Ddaear—mor wahanol fel nad oes ffordd o'u cymodi ar wahân i ddatrys y mater yn y llys. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n bosibl yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, sydd yn rheswm pam ei bod yn bwysig bod y grŵp strategaeth hadau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig yn ystyried beth yw'r sefyllfa yn union. Gan gofio hynny, y cynnig a wnaethpwyd i'r grŵp strategaeth hadau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig ddoe oedd y gwnâi cyfreithwyr Swyddfa'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol gyflwyniad yn gyntaf, gyda chwestiynau priodol gan aelodau o'r grŵp strategaeth hadau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig. Os oedd grŵp yn awyddus i wahodd sefydliadau allanol i roi sylwadau wedyn, câi hynny ei wneud.

### **Yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd The Food Standards Agency**

**Q5 David Davies:** Does Carwyn Jones have the same access to all the information that is available to his Westminster colleagues from the Food Standards Agency? (OAQ8295)

**Carwyn Jones:** Yes.

**David Davies:** Then you are no doubt aware that the FSA is currently looking at the safety, or otherwise, of French beef imports. If there is any suggestion, as there may well be, that French beef imports are less than 100 per cent safe, will you ensure that all consumers in Wales are made fully aware of the risks, and that steps are taken immediately to implement a full ban on

**C5 David Davies:** A yw'r holl wybodaeth a roddir gan yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd i'w gydweithwyr yn San Steffan ar gael i Carwyn Jones hefyd? (OAQ8295)

**Carwyn Jones:** Ydyw.

**David Davies:** Yna mae'n siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried diogelwch, neu anniogelwch, cig eidion Ffrengig a fewnforir. Os ceir unrhyw awgrym, fel sydd yn ddigon posibl, bod y cig eidion Ffrengig a fewnforir yn llai na 100 y cant yn ddiogel, a sicrhewch fod pawb yng Nghymru yn hollol ymwybodol o'r peryglon, ac y cymerir camau

unsafe beef imports coming into Wales?

ar unwaith i weithredu gwaharddiad llawn ar y cig eidion anniogel a fewnforir i Gymru?

**Carwyn Jones:** The Food Standards Agency was established as an independent watchdog on food safety, taking food safety out of the realms of the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food and its territorial departments. The FSA has investigated the situation in France. It has found no reason to ban the import of French beef into the UK. It has welcomed, in particular, the decision that was taken in Brussels on Monday to introduce an over 30 months scheme. An over 30 months rule will be introduced throughout the European Union from 1 January.

**Carwyn Jones:** Sefydlwyd yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd fel sefydliad gwarchod annibynnol ar ddiogelwch bwyd, gan dynnu diogelwch bwyd o gyfrifoldebau'r Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd a'i hadrannau tiriogaethol. Ymchwiliodd yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd i'r sefyllfa yn Ffrainc. Ni chanfu unrhyw reswm dros wahardd mewnforio cig eidion i'r DU. Croesawodd yn benodol y penderfyniad a wnaethpwyd ym Mrwsel ddydd Llun i gyflwyno cynllun dros 30 mis. Cyflwynir rheol dros 30 mis ledled yr Undeb Ewropeaidd o 1 Ionawr.

**Brian Gibbons:** I do not know whether you are aware that at yesterday's Health and Social Services Committee meeting, when Joy Whinney from the FSA was in attendance, I specifically raised this question, and pursued it in some depth. She was in a position to confirm that concerns about food safety from places such as France and Germany had more to do with nationalism and xenophobia than with scientific evidence.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni wn a ydych yn ymwybodol y codais y cwestiwn hwn yn benodol, a'i olrhain yn eithaf trylwyr, yn ystod cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddoe, pan fu Joy Whinney o'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yn bresennol. Bu mewn sefyllfa i gadarnhau bod y pryderon am ddiogelwch bwyd o leoedd megis Ffrainc a'r Almaen yn ymwneud â chenedlaetholdeb a senoffobia yn fwy na thystiolaeth wyddonol.

**Carwyn Jones:** That is exactly what she told the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee, and I see no reason to disagree with her.

**Carwyn Jones:** Dyna'n union a ddywedodd wrth y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, ac ni welaf unrhyw reswm dros anghytuno â hi.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn dilyn y trafferthion a nodwyd eisoes o ran cael safonau cyson drwy Ewrop, a gytunwch ei bod yn bryd yn awr i ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o sefydlu asiantaeth safonau bwyd a fyddai'n gweithredu drwy Ewrop?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Following the difficulties already noted regarding consistent standards throughout Europe, do you agree that it is now time to consider the possibility of establishing a food standards agency that would operate throughout Europe?

**Carwyn Jones:** Os cofiaf yn iawn, trafodwyd hyn yn y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Cafodd y syniad hwn ei ystyried drwy Ewrop gyfan. Mae'n syniad da. Mae BSE, er enghraifft, yn broblem Ewropeaidd. Os oes problem Ewropeaidd, y sefydliad gorau i ystyried hynny fyddai asiantaeth Ewropeaidd a allai ddatrys y problemau.

**Carwyn Jones:** If I remember rightly, this was discussed by the European Commission. This idea has been considered throughout Europe. It is a good idea. BSE, for example, is a Europe-wide problem. If there is a Europe-wide problem, the best institution to consider that would be a European agency that could resolve the problems.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'r cynnig i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modwleiddio) (Cymru) 2000 wedi ei dynnu yn ôl a chaiff ei

**The Presiding Officer:** The motion for the approval of Common Agriculture Policy Support Schemes (Modulation) (Wales) Regulations 2000 has been withdrawn and

drafod yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mawrth nesaf. will be debated in next Tuesday's Plenary session.

**Diwygio Rheolau Sefydlog Rhif 6.20 a Rhif 4  
Revisions to Standing Orders No. 6.20 and No. 4**

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 26:*

*gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 26:*

*i. considers the report of the Business Committee laid in the Table Office on 28 November 2000;*

*i. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Tachwedd 2000;*

*ii. approves the following revisions to the Standing Orders;*

*ii. yn cymeradwyo'r diwygiadau canlynol i'r Rheolau Sefydlog*

*iii. resolves that the revisions shall take effect immediately:*

*iii. yn penderfynu y dylent ddod i rym ar unwaith:*

**Standing Order No. 6.20**

**Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.20**

*1. In sub paragraph (i) delete 'by' and insert 'either'.*

*1. Yn is-baragraff (i) ar ôl 'hynny' ychwaneger 'un ai'.*

*2. In sub paragraph (ii) insert 'by' before 'roll call' and add ', or' after 'membership.'*

*2. Yn is-baragraff (ii) ychwanegu 'drwy' cyn 'alw' ac ychwanegu 'neu' ar ôl 'wyddor'.*

*3. Add new sub paragraph:*

*3. Ychwanegu is-baragraff newydd:*

*(iii) if the Presiding Officer so decides, by show of hands. Where at least three Members object to the Presiding Officer's decision, a roll call in alphabetical order shall take place.*

*(iii) os bydd y Llywydd yn penderfynu hynny, drwy godi dwylo. Os yw tri neu fwy o Aelodau'n gwrthwynebu penderfyniad y Llywydd, cynhelir cofrestr yn nhrefn yr wyddor.*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 26:*

*gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 26:*

*i. considers the report of the Business Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 November 2000;*

*i. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Tachwedd 2000;*

*ii. approves the following revisions to the*

*ii. yn cymeradwyo'r diwygiadau canlynol i'r*

*Standing Orders;*

iii. resolves that the revisions shall take effect immediately:

**Standing Order No. 4 – Annex**

1. In the 'General' section, delete:

1. In registering an interest, a Member is required to enter the existence of a contract or the source of the income or benefit, and to indicate to within £5,000 the sums involved.

2. Renumber the remaining paragraphs of the 'General' section.

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig i ddiwygio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.20. Mae angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i dderbyn y cynnig.

*Rheolau Sefydlog;*

iii. yn penderfynu y dylai'r diwygiadau ddod i rym ar unwaith:

**Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 4 – Atodiad**

1. Yn yr adran 'Cyffredinol', dileu:

1. Wrth gofnodi buddiant, mae'n ofynnol i Aelod gofrestru bodolaeth contract neu ffynhonnell yr incwm neu'r fantais, a dangos y symiau cysylltiedig, o fewn £5,000

2. Ailrifo'r paragraffau sydd yn dilyn yn yr adran 'Cyffredinol'.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the motion to revise Standing Order No. 6.20. A majority of two thirds is necessary to adopt the motion.

*Cynnig: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig i ddiwygio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 4. Mae angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i dderbyn y cynnig.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the motion to revise Standing Order No. 4. A majority of two thirds is necessary to adopt the motion.

*Cynnig: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**Diwygio Penderfyniad Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Aelodau a Swyddogion y Cynulliad) (Cyflogau, Lwfansau ayb) 1999  
Amendment to the National Assembly for Wales (Assembly Members and Officers) (Salaries, Allowances etc.) Determination 1999**

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*acting under section 16(2) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and Standing Order No. 3 amends the National Assembly for Wales (Assembly Members and Officers) (Salaries, Allowances etc.) Determination 1999, e-mailed to all Members on 30 November 2000, as follows:*

*Delete sections 9.1 and 9.2 and insert the following:*

*9.1 Members are entitled to claim an office costs allowance to cover the costs to him/her of maintaining a constituency office where those costs are necessarily incurred in connection with his/her duties as an Assembly Member.*

*9.2 Members may claim an amount of office costs allowance not exceeding £9,300 in the year commencing 1 April 2000.*

I refer to the recommendations that have been made in this respect by the Deputy Presiding Officer and the relevant Members' committee.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i dderbyn y cynnig hwn.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*gan weithredu o dan adran 16(2) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 3 yn diwygio Penderfyniad Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Aelodau a Swyddogion y Cynulliad) (Cyflogau, Lwfansau etc.) 1999, a e-bostiwyd at yr holl Aelodau ar 30 Tachwedd 2000, fel a ganlyn:*

*Dliew adranau 9.1 a 9.2 a rhoi'r canlynol i mewn:*

*9.1 Mae gan yr Aelodau hawl i hawlio Lwfans Costau Swyddfa i dalu iddo/iidi'r costau cynnal swyddfa yn yr etholaeth pan fydd y costau hynny yn cael eu tynnu o angenrhaid mewn perthynas â'i ddylestwyddau fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad.*

*9.2 Caiff yr Aelodau hawlio swm o'r Lwfans Costau Swyddfa nad yw'n fwy na £9,300 yn y flwyddyn sydd yn dechrau ar 1 Ebrill 2000.*

Cyfeiriaf at yr argymhellion a wnaethpwyd yn hyn o beth gan y Dirprwy Lywydd a'r pwyllgor Aelodau perthnasol.

**The Presiding Officer:** A majority of two thirds is necessary to adopt this motion.

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick

Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 9.44 a.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 9.44 a.m.*

**Derbyn Cyllideb y Cynulliad  
Adoption of the Assembly's Budget**

9:45 a.m.

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I propose that  
**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.3, adopts the final budget for the financial years* *yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.3, yn derbyn y gyllideb derfynol ar gyfer y blynyddoedd*



*2001-02, 2002-03 and 2003-04, laid in the Table Office on Wednesday 29 November 2000 by the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, Edwina Hart.*

*ariannol 2001-02, 2002-03 a 2003-04, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ddydd Mercher 29 Tachwedd 2000 gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, Edwina Hart.*

It is my pleasure to present the final budget proposals for 2001-02, 2002-03 and 2003-04. In my first draft budget, I set out some of the priorities that we would be following in the budget round. These were: more money for front-line services, tackling the problems of social exclusion, investing in children and children's services, and sustainable development. I also said that we were committed to delivering a made in Wales agenda. The First Minister's statement on the programme for Government sets out how we would achieve this. I can make further announcements and allocations in pursuit of our agenda. Since the draft budget, each Committee has been consulted by the relevant Minister on the proposed allocation. I am pleased to say that every Committee endorsed the draft budget. That reflects the fact that, in developing the draft budget, we listened carefully to the Committees' and our partners' views. The budget proposals meet 54 of the 55 Committee priorities. I therefore see no reason to significantly alter the budget but I am responsive to points raised by Committees in further allocations that I will announce this morning. I am responding to the amendment to the draft budget motion that the Assembly approved, but I make allocations in accordance with the duty to promote sustainable development, paying particular attention to tackling social disadvantage and equal opportunities.

I remind the Assembly that this budget will largely determine the Assembly's spending priorities for the next three years. We will have about £11 billion at our disposal by 2003-04. It is important that we get the allocations right. This budget commits over £180 million extra by 2003-04 to promoting social inclusion, about £120 million extra will go into services for children and young people by 2003-04, and over £100 million extra, by the third year, will go towards programmes that contribute directly to sustainable development. These are some of our main priorities for the future and we are

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno cynigion y gyllideb derfynol ar gyfer 2001-02, 2002-03 a 2003-04. Yn fy nghyllideb ddrafft gyntaf, nodais rai o'r blaenoriaethau y byddem yn eu dilyn yng nghylch y gyllideb. Y rhain oedd: rhagor o arian ar gyfer gwasanaethau'r rheng flaen, mynd i'r afael â phroblemau dieithrwch cymdeithasol, buddsoddi mewn plant a gwasanaethau plant, a datblygu cynaliadwy. Dywedais hefyd ein bod yn ymrwymedig i gyflwyno agenda a grëwyd yng Nghymru. Noda datganiad y Prif Weinidog ar y rhaglen ar gyfer y Llywodraeth sut y byddem yn cyflawni hyn. Gallaf wneud cyhoeddiadau a dyraniadau pellach ar drywydd ein hagenda. Ers y gyllideb ddrafft, ymgynghorwyd â phob Pwyllgor gan y Gweinidog perthnasol ar y dyraniad a gynigiwyd. Adlewyrcha hynny'r ffaith inni wrando'n ofalus ar farn y Pwyllgorau a'n partneriaid wrth ddatblygu'r gyllideb ddrafft. Mae cynigion y gyllideb yn bodloni 54 allan o 55 o flaenoriaethau'r Pwyllgorau. Felly ni welaf unrhyw reswm dros newid y gyllideb yn sylweddol ond ymatebaf i bwyntiau a godwyd gan Bwyllgorau mewn dyraniadau pellach a gyhoeddaf y bore yma. Ymatebaf i'r gwelliant i gynnig y gyllideb ddrafft a gymeradwyodd y Cynulliad, ond gwnaf ddyraniadau yn unol â'r ddyletswydd i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy, gan roi sylw arbennig i fynd i'r afael ag anfantais gymdeithasol a chyfle cyfartal.

Atgoffaf y Cynulliad y bydd y gyllideb hon yn pennu blaenoriaethau gwariant y Cynulliad i raddau helaeth am y tair blynedd nesaf. Bydd gennym tua £11 biliwn i'w ddefnyddio erbyn 2003-04. Mae'n bwysig inni gael y dyraniadau'n gywir. Ymrwyma'r gyllideb hon dros £180 miliwn yn ychwanegol erbyn 2003-04 i hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol, aiff tua £120 miliwn yn ychwanegol i wasanaethau ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc erbyn 2003-04 ac, erbyn y drydedd flwyddyn, aiff dros £100 miliwn yn ychwanegol at raglenni sydd yn cyfrannu'n uniongyrchol at ddatblygu

putting in financial resources to make a difference.

In terms of individual services, the health budget will increase by £669 million by 2003-04. That is an average annual real terms increase of 5.1 per cent per year. In education, we are tackling the problems of poor school buildings head on, with an extra £86 million over three years to raise total provision to nearly £300 million over the next three years. We are determined to meet the target in 'Betterwales.com' that all schools should be in good physical shape and properly maintained by 2010. That target was set by my colleague, the former Secretary for Education and Children, Rosemary Butler, who insisted that we were to meet that target in the budgetary process.

**Mick Bates:** I am concerned about a recent announcement on schools' budgets by David Blunkett, who purported to speak on behalf of England and Wales. Will you clarify the situation?

**Edwina Hart:** Mr Blunkett may say what he likes in the House of Commons but he does not speak for Wales. Education is a devolved matter. I am sorry that civil servants, perhaps, or he did not take proper advice to realise that devolution is a reality. The Assembly will decide on education priorities in Wales as we have done in the partnership agreement, providing greater resources to tackle some of the problems in education.

We are substantially increasing the local government revenue support grant. It will enable increased spending by local authorities of 5.6 per cent in 2001-02. That is a total increase in Assembly support for local government of 8 per cent that year. Allocations to housing, economic development, transport, the environment and agriculture have been significantly increased. We are determined to turn the partnership agreement into action. As we are approaching the season of goodwill, I can make further

cynaliadwy. Dyma rai o'n prif flaenoriaethau ar gyfer y dyfodol ac yr ydym yn ymrwymo adnoddau ariannol er mwyn gwneud gwahaniaeth.

O ran gwasanaethau unigol, bydd cynnydd o £669 miliwn yn y gyllideb iechyd erbyn 2003-04. Mae hynny'n gynnydd blynyddol mewn termau gwirioneddol o 5.1 y cant y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd. O ran addysg, yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael yn uniongyrchol â phroblemau adeiladau gwael mewn ysgolion, gyda £86 miliwn yn ychwanegol dros dair blynedd i godi cyfanswm y ddarpariaeth i bron £300 miliwn yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o gyrraedd y targed yn 'Gwellcymru.com', sef y dylai pob ysgol fod mewn cyflwr ffisegol da a chael ei chynnal a'i chadw'n gywir erbyn 2010. Gosodwyd y targed hwnnw gan fy nghyd-Aelod, y cyn Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant, Rosemary Butler, a fynnodd ein bod yn bodloni'r targed hwnnw yn y broses gyllidebol.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch cyhoeddiad diweddar ar gyllidebau ysgolion gan David Blunkett, a honnodd ei fod yn siarad ar ran Cymru a Lloegr. A eglurwch y sefyllfa?

**Edwina Hart:** Gall Mr Blunkett ddweud yr hyn a fynna yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin ond nid yw'n siarad dros Gymru. Mae addysg yn fater datganoledig. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf na chymerodd gweision sifil, efallai, neu ef gyngor cywir i sylweddoli bod datganoli yn realiti. Bydd y Cynulliad yn penderfynu ar flaenoriaethau addysg yng Nghymru fel y gwnaethom yn y cytundeb partneriaeth, gan ddarparu mwy o adnoddau i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau mewn addysg.

Yr ydym yn cynyddu grant cynnal refferniw llywodraeth leol yn sylweddol. Bydd yn galluogi awdurdodau lleol i wario 5.6 y cant yn fwy yn 2001-02. Mae hynny'n cyfanswm o 8 y cant o gynnydd yn y cymorth gan y Cynulliad i lywodraeth leol y flwyddyn honno. Cynyddwyd y dyraniadau i dai, datblygu economaidd, trafniadaeth, yr amgylchedd ac amaethyddiaeth yn sylweddol. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o droi'r cytundeb partneriaeth yn weithredoedd. Wrth agosáu at dymor ewyllys da, gallaf gyhoeddi

good news announcements. I am allocating an additional £10 million in 2002-03 and 2003-04 towards integrated transport projects. That point was raised by the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee and Sue Essex. The additional money will come from the capital modernisation fund. Sue will consider further how to use that money most effectively in the pursuit of our transport agenda.

Members will wish to note that we have had further allocations from the Treasury's capital modernisation fund. It will be up to the Assembly to decide how to use those moneys. I propose to add them to the reserves for the time being and we shall return to this in future planning rounds. The additional allocation for integrated transport reflects our commitment to sustainable development, which I know is a concern to the Assembly. On 16 November, the Assembly adopted a motion relating to the European regional innovation grant scheme. I am pleased to announce a further allocation of £257,000 in 2001-02 to sustainable development to begin work on that scheme. As a result of the Chancellor's pre-budget report, we will also receive an extra £1.7 million a year from 2002-03 from the aggregates levy and that has been added to the budget. We will also, as you know, receive an extra £3 million from the consequentials announced for flood protection. The moneys from 2001-02 to 2003-04 have been placed in the flood defence credit approvals line, pending our assessment of the need for extra resources for flood defences. I stress that Sue Essex and I are discussing the need for extra resources. We will report back to the Assembly in due course, taking into account the concerns expressed in the Chamber and in the Committee.

The Economic Development Committee expressed concern about the size of the international relations line in the budget. I have responded to this by increasing the budget by £100,000 for 2001-02. The partnership agreement stresses the need to encourage higher skill, higher value foreign direct investment through improved

rhagor o newyddion da. Dyrannaf £10 miliwn yn ychwanegol yn 2002-03 a 2003-04 i brosiectau trafndiaeth integredig. Codwyd y pwynt hwnnw gan Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth a Sue Essex. Daw'r arian ychwanegol o'r gronfa moderneiddio cyfalaf. Bydd Sue yn ystyried ymhellach sut i ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw yn fwyaf effeithiol wrth fynd ar drywydd ein agenda drafnidiaeth.

Bydd Aelodau yn dymuno nodi ein bod wedi cael dyraniadau pellach o gronfa moderneiddio cyfalaf y Trysorlys. Y Cynulliad fydd yn penderfynu sut i ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw. Bwriadaf ei ychwanegu at y cronfeydd am y tro a dychwelwn at hyn mewn cylchoedd cynllunio yn y dyfodol. Adlewyrcha'r dyraniad ychwanegol ar gyfer trafndiaeth integredig ein hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, y gwn ei fod yn destun pryder i'r Cynulliad. Ar 16 Tachwedd, derbyniwyd cynnig gan y Cynulliad yn ymwneud â'r cynllun grant arloesedd rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd. Mae'n bleser gennyf gyhoeddi dyraniad pellach o £257,000 yn 2001-02 i ddatblygu cynaliadwy i gychwyn gwaith ar y cynllun hwnnw. O ganlyniad i adroddiad y Canghellor cyn y gyllideb, byddwn hefyd yn derbyn £1.7 miliwn y flwyddyn yn ychwanegol o 2002-03 o'r ardoll gyfansymiol ac ychwanegwyd hynny i'r gyllideb. Byddwn hefyd, fel y gwyddoch, yn derbyn £3 miliwn yn ychwanegol o ganlyniad i'r cyhoeddiadau a wnaethpwyd o ran diogelu rhag llifogydd. Rhoddwyd yr arian o 2001-02 i 2003-04 yn y llinell gymeradwyo credyd amddiffyn rhag llifogydd, tra'n aros am ein hasesiad o'r angen am adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd. Pwysleisiaf fod Sue Essex a minnau yn trafod yr angen am adnoddau ychwanegol. Adroddwn yn ôl i'r Cynulliad yn y man, gan ystyried y pryderon a fynegwyd yn y Siambr ac yn y Pwyllgor.

Mynegodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd bryder ynghylch maint y llinell cysylltiadau rhyngwladol yn y gyllideb. Ymatebais i hyn drwy gynyddu'r gyllideb £100,000 ar gyfer 2001-02. Pwysleisia'r cytundeb partneriaeth yr angen i annog buddsoddiad uniongyrchol tramor ag iddo sgiliau a gwerth uwch drwy farchnata gwell. Byddaf yn dyrannu £1

marketing. I will allocate an extra £1 million for 2001-02 out of a carry-forward for the Welsh Development Agency for this purpose.

I turn to education. The partnership agreement commits us to piloting a Welsh baccalaureate. I propose £600,000 for 2001-02 to begin work on this important measure. The Education and Lifelong Learning Committee has also taken forward recommendations in its recent report on information and communication technology in education. I know that the Committee wishes to see this work adequately funded and believes that an audit should be carried out of information and communications technology equipment in schools. I agree wholeheartedly with this, because we need to know what we have and what we need. I am allocating an extra £700,000 for 2001-02 out of the carry-forward to move ahead with the ICT report, including the audit.

I propose to add a further £1.125 million to the local government settlement for 2001-02 to cover the preparatory costs of the supporting people measure.

I am also allocating a further £60,000 to the National Museums and Galleries of Wales for 2001-02 to extend free admission to all students and the disabled. I am sure that the National Assembly will be pleased with this and I hope that this will extend the Christmas cheer into further areas of Assembly business.

The other changes from the draft budget are of a technical nature and I have provided separate notes on each of the transfers for Assembly Members. Further technical amendments are likely and these will be brought to the Assembly in a supplementary budget in the new year. In particular, some of the annually managed expenditure figures may alter in relation to issues concerning the common agricultural policy, and so on.

Therefore, I present the final budget to the Assembly for adoption. We began our deliberations in May, which seems a long time ago. I am grateful to the Committees, the Opposition spokespeople and my

miliwn yn ychwanegol ar gyfer 2001-02 allan o arian a gariwyd drosodd ar gyfer Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru at y diben hwn.

Trof at addysg. Ymrwma'r cytundeb partneriaeth ni i gynnal cynllun peilot o fagloraeth Gymreig. Bwriadaf roi £600,000 ar gyfer 2001-02 i gychwyn gwaith ar y mesur pwysig hwn. Gweithredodd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes hefyd argymhellion yn ei adroddiad diweddar ar dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu mewn addysg. Gwn y dymuna'r Pwyllgor weld y gwaith hwn yn cael ei ariannu'n ddigonol a chred y dylid cynnal archwiliad o gyfarpar technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu mewn ysgolion. Cytunaf yn gyfan gwbl â hyn, oherwydd mae angen inni wybod beth sydd gennym a beth sydd ei angen arnom. Dyrannaf £700,000 ychwanegol ar gyfer 2001-02 allan o'r arian a gariwyd drosodd er mwyn bwrw ymlaen gyda'r adroddiad TGCh a chyfathrebu, gan gynnwys yr archwiliad.

Bwriadaf ychwanegu £1.125 miliwn ychwanegol at y setliad llywodraeth leol ar gyfer 2001-02 i gwrdd â chostau paratoi y mesur cynnal pobl.

Dyrannaf hefyd £60,000 ychwanegol i Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru ar gyfer 2001-02 i ymestyn mynediad am ddim i bob myfyriwr a'r anabl. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn hapus gyda hyn a gobeithiaf y bydd yn ymestyn ewyllys da'r Nadolig i feysydd eraill ym musnes y Cynulliad.

Mae natur dechnegol i'r newidiadau eraill o'r gyllideb ddrafft a darperais nodiadau ar wahân ar bob un o'r trosglwyddiadau i Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Mae gwelliannau technegol pellach yn debygol a daw'r rhain i'r Cynulliad mewn cyllideb atodol yn y flwyddyn newydd. Yn arbennig, gall rhai o'r ffigurau gwariant a reolir yn flynyddol newid mewn perthynas â materion sydd yn ymwneud â'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredinol, ac ati.

Felly, cyflwynaf y gyllideb derfynol i'r Cynulliad i'w mabwysiadu. Cychwynnwyd ar ein trafodaethau ym mis Mai, a ymddengys ymhell yn ôl. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Pwyllgorau, llefarwyr yr Wrthblaid a'm cyd-

ministerial colleagues for the constructive way in which they have engaged in the budget process. I commend this budget to you for ratification.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Diolch am y cyfle i ymateb i ddatganiad Siôn Corn ar y gyllideb. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio nad Siôn Corn yw Gordon Brown, ond Prudence. Felly, nid wyf yn siŵr a allwn gytuno'n llwyr â sylwadau Edwina ar y gyllideb.

Yr ydym wedi clywed sôn yn gyson ar ran y Llywodraeth, yn y Cynulliad ac yn Llundain, fod Cymru wedi gwneud yn dda o'r setliad ariannol a gyhoeddwyd gan Ganghellor y Trysorlys ym mis Gorffennaf. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio i'r setliad hwn ddod ar ôl i'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain gadw'n gaeth am dair blynedd at gynlluniau gwariant y Blaid Geidwadol. Nid yw'r cynlluniau gwario newydd yn dod i rym tan gyfnod yr etholiad cyffredinol. Mae'n rhyfedd bod y gwariant hwn—cynnydd sylweddol yn ôl Llafur—yn dod i rym ychydig wythnosau cyn cyhoeddi'r etholiad a ddisgwylir ym mis Mai.

Felly, yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf—rhaid inni roi'r setliad hwn yn ei gyddestun—mae pobl Cymru wedi gweld gostyngiad yn eu safon byw, ac mae gwariant ar y sector cyhoeddus wedi bod yn arswydus o isel. Hyd yn oed wedi cyhoeddi'r setliad hwn ym mis Gorffennaf, ni fydd y gyfran o gyfoeth y wlad a werir ar y sector cyhoeddus yn ddim ond yr hyn ydoedd yn ystod blwyddyn olaf John Major fel Prif Weinidog.

Nid oes ryfedd, felly, fod cefnogwyr traddodiadol Llafur wedi'u siomi gan Lywodraeth Lafur. Yr oeddent yn disgwyl i'r Llywodraeth wella'r gwasanaeth iechyd, addysg, tai, trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus a phensiynau. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn a gawsant oedd rhywbeth cwbl annisgwyl: y Blaid Lafur yn gwisgo dillad y Ceidwadwyr ac wedi ymddieithrio oddi wrth werthoedd traddodiadol pobl Cymru.

9:55 a.m.

**Brian Gibbons** *rose*—

Weinidogion am y ffordd adeiladol yr ymgymerasant â phroses y gyllideb. Cymeradwyaf y gyllideb hon ichi i'w chadarnhau.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Thank you for the opportunity to respond to Father Christmas's statement on the budget. However, we must remember that Gordon Brown is not Father Christmas, but Prudence. Therefore, I am not sure that we can agree fully with Edwina's comments on the budget.

We have often heard claims by the Government, in the Assembly and in London, that Wales has profited greatly from the financial settlement announced by the Chancellor of the Exchequer in July. However, we must remember that this settlement came after the Government in London stuck rigidly for three years to the Conservative Party's spending plans. The new spending plans do not come into force until the period of the general election. It is strange that this expenditure—a substantial increase according to Labour—comes into force a few weeks before the anticipated election in May.

Therefore, during the last three years—we must put this settlement into context—the people of Wales have seen a reduction in their standard of living, and public sector expenditure has been appallingly low. Even after this settlement was announced in July, the proportion of the country's wealth that will be spent on the public sector will only be equivalent to that spent during John Major's last year as Prime Minister.

It is no wonder, therefore, that Labour's traditional supporters have been disappointed by a Labour Government. They expected the Government to improve the health service, education, housing, public transport and pensions. However, what they got was something totally unexpected: the Labour Party wearing the Conservatives' clothing and alienating itself from the traditional values of the people of Wales.

**Brian Gibbons** *a gododd*—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Hyd yn oed gyda'r cynnydd yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad, mae'r ffigurau moel y tu ôl i'r rhyngwlad yn dangos darlun tra gwahanol. Mae'r grant bloc wedi codi, ond y tu mewn i'r cynnydd hwnnw, gwelwn yr arian a oedd wedi'i neilltuo i Gymru beth bynnag o'r cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd.

**Delyth Evans** *rose*—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn dilyn yr un patrwm yn union ag Edwina ar y pwynt hwn, felly nid wyf yn derbyn ymyriadau gan fod amser mor brin ac yr wyf am symud ymlaen.

O edrych ar y arian ychwanegol a fydd ar gael dros y tair blynedd nesaf—[*Torri ar draws.*] Mae rhaid i'r Blaid Lafur wrando ar hyn, ni waeth a yw'n ei hoffi ai peidio. Yr arian ychwanegol a fydd ar gael dros y tair blynedd nesaf o'r cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd yw £628 miliwn, sef £421 miliwn o arian Ewropeaidd a £207 miliwn o arian cyfatebol. O dynnu hynny i ffwrdd, gwelwch fod y cynnydd yn y grant bloc ar gyfer gwario arferol yn llai nag ydyw yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn ei chyfanrwydd—cynnydd o 7.3 y cant o'i gymharu ag 8 y cant.

Nid oes angen dadlau nad yw hyn yn wahaniaeth anferth ynddo'i hun. Fodd bynnag, o gofio bod Cymru yn un o rannau tlotaf y DU fel ag y mae hi, mae unrhyw anfanteision fel hyn yn ychwanegu at yr anghydraddoldeb cyfoeth o fewn Prydain.

Fel y dywedasom o'r blaen, mae'r arian Ewropeaidd yn llai na'r hyn sydd yn ddyledus inni. Mae'r dyraniad o £421 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf yn llai na'r hyn yr ydym i fod i'w gael o Ewrop. Mae'n profi unwaith eto—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Ieuan, will you give way?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** No, I am following the same pattern as Edwina on this.

**The First Minister:** No, you are not.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Even with the increase in the Assembly's budget, the actual figures behind the rhetoric show quite a different picture. The block grant has increased, but within that increase, we see the money that was earmarked for Wales anyway from the European structural funds.

**Delyth Evans** *a gododd*—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am following exactly the same pattern as Edwina on this point, therefore I am not taking interventions because time is so short and I want to move on.

Looking at the additional funding that will be available during the next three years—[*Interruption.*] The Labour Party must listen to this, whether it likes it or not. The additional funding that will be available during the next three years from the European structural funds will be £628 million, which equates to £421 million of European money and £207 million of match funding. If you deduct that, you will see that the increase in the block grant for routine spending is less than that of the United Kingdom as a whole—an increase of 7.3 per cent compared to 8 per cent.

There is no need to argue that this is not an enormous difference in itself. However, bearing in mind that Wales is already one of the poorest areas of the UK, any such disadvantage adds to the inequality of wealth within Britain.

As we said, the European funding is less than that which is due to us. The allocation of £421 million over the next three years is less than what is due to us from Europe. It proves once more—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ieuan, a ildiwch?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Na wnaf, yr wyf yn dilyn yr un patrwm ag Edwina ar hyn.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nac ydych.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Ieuan is not giving way. It is clear that he has the perfect right not to give way. [*Interruption.*] Order. He must be heard.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Point of order.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We are on a point of order at the moment, Jocelyn. Ieuan must be heard; he wishes to speak and has every right to do so. I shall ensure that he can. Is there anything further to this point?

**Jocelyn Davies:** I am standing in for Val Feld on this occasion because I am sure that she would be on her feet telling Labour Members not to catcall, especially the First Minister. He is displaying rowdy behaviour and setting a bad example to all his Members. [*Applause.*]

**The First Minister:** Further to that point of order, and Dai Lloyd's applause—I do not know what Jocelyn Davies thinks of that—the issue, simply, is that I do not mind Ieuan having the right not to give way to an intervention, but he should not blame us for it and say that Edwina did not give way, when she did.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am pleased, Rhodri, that you do not mind the fact that Ieuan has the right not to take interventions, because he does have that right. I ask that Members settle down and listen to Ieuan.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** It is vitally important, because time is so limited on the budget debate, that I should be given an opportunity to outline my case. It is clear that the Labour Party Members simply do not like it. They must accept that these are justified criticisms of this budget. They will have their opportunity to make their case, and it seems as though they will be in some difficulty.

Education is an important point in this budget. This is a matter of great importance to us as a nation. If we examine the increase that there will be in spending on education in Wales, through this settlement for the next three years, we will have an average increase of 3.2 per cent. This compares to a

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw Ieuan yn ildio. Mae'n glir fod ganddo berffaith hawl i beidio ag ildio. [*Torri ar draws.*] Trefn. Rhaid gwrando arno.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Pwynt o drefn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydym ar bwynt o drefn ar hyn o bryd, Jocelyn. Rhaid gwrando ar Ieuan; dymuna siarad ac mae ganddo bob hawl i wneud hynny. Sicrhaf y gall siarad. A oes unrhyw beth ychwanegol i'r pwynt hwn?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Cynrychiolaf Val Feld ar yr achlysur hwn oherwydd yr wyf yn sicr y byddai'n sefyll ar ei thraed yn dweud wrth yr Aelodau Llafur i beidio â gweiddi ar draws, yn enwedig y Prif Weinidog. Mae'n codi trwr ac yn rhoi esiampl wael i'w holl Aelodau. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, a chymeradwyaeth Dai Lloyd—ni wn beth y mae Jocelyn Davies yn ei feddwl o hynny—y mater, yn syml, yw nad oes gwahaniaeth gennyf fod gan Ieuan hawl i beidio ag ildio i ymyriad, ond ni ddylai ein beio ni am hynny a dweud na ildiodd Edwina, pan wnaeth hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf yn falch, Rhodri, nad oes gwahaniaeth gennych fod gan Ieuan yr hawl i beidio â chymryd ymyriadau, oherwydd mae ganddo'r hawl. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau lonyddu a gwrando ar Ieuan.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n hynod bwysig imi gael cyfle i amlinellu fy achos, gan fod yr amser ar gyfer y ddadl ar y gyllideb mor brin. Mae'n glir nad yw Aelodau'r Blaid Lafur yn hoffi hynny. Rhaid iddynt dderbyn bod y rhain yn feirniadaethau cyfiawn ar y gyllideb hon. Cânt eu cyfle i wneud eu hachos, ac ymddengys y cânt rywfaint o anhawster.

Mae addysg yn bwynt pwysig yn y gyllideb hon. Mae'n fater o bwys mawr inni fel cenedl. Pan archwiliwn y cynnydd a fydd mewn gwariant ar addysg yng Nghymru, drwy'r setliad hwn am y tair blynedd nesaf, bydd y cynnydd ar gyfartaledd yn 3.2 y cant. Cymhara hyn â chynnydd cymaradwy yn

comparable increase in England of 5.6 per cent. This is a significant difference that will cost us dearly. We have estimated that this will mean that, in order to reach the same level of spending as that on education in England, we would need an extra £50 million over those three years.

Edwina told us that she does not take a lead from England on these matters. On the whole, that is a good principle. However, she must therefore explain how we can maintain our education system if Wales does not receive such a sum. I heard an interesting argument on the radio this morning, Edwina, that, when comparing expenditure in England and Wales, London must be excluded from the English total. That is extraordinary. Do you take Cardiff out of Wales's total expenditure when comparing it with England? That is not a credible position to take, and I have never heard of it being used before. That proves that there is no challenge to our figures, which show that education in Wales will receive £50 million less over the next three years because matched funding must be provided for out of our budget.

Higher education causes concern. The gap in funding per student places the higher education sector in Wales at a disadvantage to England, and even more so to Scotland. The increase of 10 per cent in capital funding for schools over the next three years will not have a significant impact on the state of our school buildings. Although it is an increase, local education authorities tell us time and time again that they do not want one-off emergency handouts, as that does not offer them financial sustainability. We must have long-term investment to ensure that our school buildings are in a proper condition.

We welcome the increase in the housing budget, although it only goes some way towards reversing the downward trend in expenditure. Even greater priority must be given to housing, as we have some of the worst housing stock in the European Union. We must do more to acknowledge the strong link between improved housing and better

Lloegr o 5.6 y cant. Mae hyn yn wahaniaeth sylweddol y byddwn yn talu'n ddrud amdano. Amcangyfrifwyd y golyga hyn y byddai angen £50 miliwn yn ychwanegol arnom dros y tair blynedd hynny er mwyn cyrraedd yr un lefel o wariant ar addysg ag a geir yn Lloegr.

Dywedodd Edwina wrthym nad yw'n cymryd arweiniad o Loegr ar y materion hyn. Ar y cyfan, mae honno'n egwyddor dda. Fodd bynnag, rhaid iddi felly esbonio sut y gallwn gynnal ein system addysg os nad yw Cymru'n derbyn swm o'r fath. Clywais ddadl ddiddorol ar y radio y bore yma, Edwina, y dylid eithrio Llundain o gyfanswm Lloegr wrth gymharu gwariant yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae hynny yn anghredadwy. A ydych yn cymryd Caerdydd allan o gyfanswm gwariant Cymru wrth ei chymharu â Lloegr? Nid yw hwnnw yn safbwynt credadwy i'w gymryd, ac ni chlywais amdano'n cael ei ddefnyddio erioed o'r blaen. Profa hynny nad oes her i'n ffigurau, sydd yn dangos y bydd addysg yng Nghymru yn derbyn £50 miliwn yn llai yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf oherwydd y bydd yn rhaid darparu arian cyfatebol allan o'n cyllideb.

Mae addysg uwch yn achosi pryder. Mae'r bwlch ariannu fesul myfyriwr yn rhoi'r sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru o dan anfantais o'i chymharu â Lloegr, a hyd yn oed yn fwy felly o'i chymharu â'r Alban. Ni chaiff y cynnydd o 10 y cant mewn arian cyfalaf i ysgolion yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf effaith arwyddocaol ar gyflwr adeiladau ein hysgolion. Er ei fod yn gynnydd, dywed awdurdodau addysg lleol wrthym dro ar ôl tro na ddymunant gael dyraniadau ariannol ar frys unwaith yn unig, gan nad yw hynny yn cynnig cynaliadwyedd ariannol iddynt. Rhaid inni gael buddsoddiad tymor hir i sicrhau bod adeiladau ein hysgolion mewn cyflwr priodol.

Croesawn y cynnydd yn y gyllideb tai, er mai dim ond rhan o'r ffordd yr â tuag at wyrdroi'r tueddiad ar i lawr o ran gwariant. Rhaid rhoi mwy o flaenoriaeth hyd yn oed i dai, gan fod gennym ryw faint o'r stoc tai gwaethaf yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Rhaid inni wneud rhagor i gydnabod y cysylltiad cryf rhwng gwell tai a gwell iechyd.



health.

We also need significant extra funding in health and social services, for example to fund the recruitment and training of social workers, to provide a resourced care package for the elderly and to develop the provision of heart disease diagnosis, treatment and care in the North.

We welcome the extra £10 million allocated for integrated transport policies, which we have strongly advocated. However, even more money must be allocated to it. More money must be spent on the genuine integration of transport policies in Wales. For example, there is much scope for better interchanges between bus and train services in stations throughout Wales—from Swansea to Bangor and from Aberystwyth to Llandudno Junction. *[Interruption.]* I am enjoying the discussion between the First Minister and the Minister for Assembly Business, which is discourteous to the Assembly.

Although it is not much money, we welcome the £250,000 for sustainable development to begin work on the European regional innovation grant scheme. Plaid Cymru called for this in an amendment during the Plenary debate on the sustainable development scheme. We are grateful that that has been acted upon so quickly.

In conclusion, this budget is not what it is made out to be. Although progress has been made compared to last year, it is not much when placed into the context of the £20 billion surplus that Gordon Brown has in the Treasury.

Edwina has not addressed the outstanding issue of whether we should now consider a fairer funding formula for Wales. Interestingly, there was a commitment to consider the Barnett formula in the original draft of the Lib-Lab coalition document. No-one has told us why that was not included in the final document. The silence of both parties on this is deafening.

**Michael German:** I am waiting for the

Mae angen arian ychwanegol sylweddol hefyd ar iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, er enghraifft i ariannu'r gwaith o recriwtio a hyfforddi gweithwyr cymdeithasol, i ddarparu pecyn gofal ag adnoddau ar gyfer yr henoed ac i ddatblygu'r ddarpariaeth o ddiagnosis clefyd y galon, triniaeth a gofal yn y Gogledd.

Croesawn y £10 miliwn ychwanegol a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer polisiau trafndiaeth integredig. Argymhellwyd hyn yn gryf gennym. Fodd bynnag, rhaid dyrannu hyd yn oed rhagor o arian iddo. Rhaid gwario rhagor o arian ar integreiddio gwreiddiol ar bolisiau trafndiaeth yng Nghymru. Er enghraifft, mae llawer o le i wella'r cyfnewid rhwng gwasanaethau bysiau a threnau mewn gorsafoddedd ledled Cymru—o Abertawe i Fangor ac o Aberystwyth i Gyffordd Llandudno. *[Torri ar draws.]* Yr wyf yn mwynhau'r drafodaeth rhwng y Prif Weinidog a'r Trefnydd, sydd yn anghwrtais i'r Cynulliad.

Er nad yw'n llawer o arian, croesawn y £250,000 ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy i ddechrau gwaith ar y cynllun grant arloesi rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd. Galwodd Plaid Cymru am hyn mewn gwelliant yn ystod y ddadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy. Yr ydym yn falch y gweithredwyd ar hynny mor gyflym.

I gloi, nid yw'r gyllideb hon yr hyn yr honnir ei bod. Er y gwnaethpwyd cynnydd o'i gymharu â'r llynedd, nid yw'n llawer o'i roi yng nghyd-destun yr £20 biliwn dros ben sydd gan Gordon Brown yn y Trysorlys.

Ni roddodd Edwina sylw i'r mater sydd heb ei benderfynu, sef a ddylem ystyried fformwla gyllido decach erbyn hyn ar gyfer Cymru. Yn ddiddorol, cafwyd ymrwymiad i ystyried fformwla Barnett yn nrafft gwreiddiol dogfen clymblaid y Blaid Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Ni ddywedodd neb wrthym pam na chafodd ei chynnwys yn y ddogfen derfynol. Mae distawrwydd y ddwy blaid ar hyn yn fyddarol.

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn aros am

Conservatives' commitment on the Barnett formula. It will be interesting to see whether Mr Hague intends to reduce England's public expenditure and therefore harm health and education in Wales, which he will do unless he reforms the Barnett formula. I will wait to hear about that.

You will have heard Charles Kennedy's announcement in the last week that gave a firm commitment, as I have given to the Assembly, that this will be included in our manifesto. The Liberal Democrats are a United Kingdom party.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I see. You have still not explained why the commitment was taken out of the partnership document.

**Michael German:** It will be in the manifesto. Wait and see.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** We still have not heard why the commitment was not included in the final draft. It is an interesting omission.

Let us return to the real issue of this budget. There has been an increase in European funds for Wales. However, the match funding is at the expense of some of our core services. Nobody is fooled by that and nobody has challenged our figures. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales is committed to spreading prosperity throughout Wales and providing decent long-term funding for our public services. Labour has abandoned those principles and will pay a heavy price for it.

10.05 a.m.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I intend to call Kirsty Williams next on the principle of going from Government to opposition and back again. I then intend to call the leader of the Welsh Conservative Party, Nick Bourne, so that we can have a block of the main speeches in the debate. After that, I intend to take the delayed statement on the Children's Commissioner. Sadly, I have heard that Richard Edwards is ill so it seems that there will not be a short debate. That allows us an extra half an hour to continue this debate if there are sufficient speakers.

ymrwymiad y Ceidwadwyr ar fformwla Barnett. Bydd yn ddiddorol gweld a yw Mr Hague yn bwriadu gostwng gwariant cyhoeddus Lloegr ac felly niweidio iechyd ac addysg yng Nghymru, yr hyn fydd yn digwydd oni fydd yn diwygio fformwla Barnett. Arhosaf i glywed am hynny.

Byddwch wedi clywed cyhoeddiad Charles Kennedy yn ystod yr wythnos diwethaf a roddodd ymrwymiad cadarn, fel y rhoddais innau i'r Cynulliad, y caiff hyn ei gynnwys yn ein manifffesto. Plaid y Deyrnas Unedig yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Felly. Nid ydych wedi esbonio o hyd pam y tynnwyd yr ymrwymiad allan o'r ddogfen bartneriaeth.

**Michael German:** Bydd yn y manifffesto. Cewch weld.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ni chlywsom o hyd pam na chafodd yr ymrwymiad ei gynnwys yn y drafft terfynol. Mae'n hepgoriad diddorol.

Gadewch inni ddychwelyd i fater gwirioneddol y gyllideb hon. Cafwyd cynnydd yn arian Ewrop i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'r arian cyfatebol ar draul rhai o'n gwasanaethau craidd. Ni chafodd neb ei dwyllo gan hynny ac ni heriodd neb ein ffigurau. Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn ymrwymedig i ledaenu ffyniant ledled Cymru a darparu cyllid digonol tymor hir ar gyfer ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Rhoddodd y blaid Lafur y gorau i'r egwyddorion hynny a bydd yn talu pris uchel am hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Bwriadaf alw ar Kirsty Williams nesaf ar yr egwyddor o fynd o'r Llywodraeth i'r wrthblaid ac yn ôl wedyn. Yna bwriadaf alw ar arweinydd y Blaid Geidwadol Gymreig, Nick Bourne, fel y gallwn gael bloc o'r prif areithiau yn y ddadl. Wedi hynny, bwriadaf gymryd y datganiad a ohiriwyd ar y comisiynydd plant. Yn anffodus, clywais fod Richard Edwards yn sâl felly ymddengys na fydd dadl fer. Mae hynny yn caniatáu hanner awr ychwanegol inni barhau â'r ddadl hon os oes digon o siaradwyr.

**Kirsty Williams:** I will speak this morning in place of Peter Black who usually speaks on finance matters for the Liberal Democrats. As announced earlier this week, Peter has suffered a bereavement so he is at home with his family. Standing in for Peter is an impossible task. He was recently described by a colleague as 'omnicompetent'. His energy and tenacity are legendary to friends and foe. I will deliver his speech. However, I confess that I am completely incapable of writing Peter's usual two press releases and issuing them at the same time.

It is a privilege to speak in favour of a budget for Wales that owes so much to Peter's negotiating skills. It is a budget based on the Liberal Democrat—Labour Party partnership Government, which Peter played an instrumental part in negotiating. It is a budget that will set Wales on the road to a prosperous future. However, before we look ahead, I remind Members of the 18 years following 1979 when the Conservatives ran down Wales. In that period, public debate was not about investment in public services for all, it was about snatching from school milk, cuts, privatisation, sleaze and fat cats.

**David Melding:** Do you accept that a lower proportion of GDP is currently spent on public services than under the last Conservative Government?

**Kirsty Williams:** I accept that GDP has increased. Therefore, that sways the figure slightly. We have perhaps suffered from some cautiousness by the Labour Government in London, from which this National Assembly, with a new administration, will now break away.

William Hague's Conservative Party now says that it will cut taxes and slash public spending. Its sums do not add up. It has not yet worked out by how much it would cut the Assembly's block grant. I look forward to hearing an announcement from the Conservative Party about that.

**Kirsty Williams:** Siaradaf y bore yma yn lle Peter Black sydd fel arfer yn siarad ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar faterion cyllid. Fel y cyhoeddwyd yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, mae Peter wedi cael profedigaeth felly mae gartref gyda'i deulu. Mae siarad yn lle Peter yn dasg amhosibl. Fe'i disgrifiwyd gan gyd-Aelod yn ddiweddar fel 'hollalluog'. Mae ei egni a'i ddycnwch yn chwedlonol i gyfeillion a gelynion. Traddodaf ei araith. Fodd bynnag, cyfaddefaf fy mod yn hollol analluog i ysgrifennu dau ddatganiad arferol Peter i'r wasg a'u cyhoeddi ar yr un pryd.

Mae'n ffrainc siarad o blaid cyllideb i Gymru sydd â'i dyled yn fawr i sgiliau negodi Peter. Mae'n gyllideb sydd yn seiliedig ar Lywodraeth bartneriaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—y Blaid Lafur, y chwaraeodd Peter ran allweddol yn y broses negodi. Mae'n gyllideb a fydd yn rhoi Cymru ar ben y ffordd i ddyfodol ffyniannus. Fodd bynnag, cyn inni edrych ymlaen, hoffwn atgoffa'r Aelodau o'r 18 mlynedd yn dilyn 1979 pan ddirwasgodd y Ceidwadwyr Gymru. Yn y cyfnod hwnnw, nid oedd a wnelo dadl gyhoeddus â buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i bawb, ond yn hytrach â chipio o laeth ysgoion, toriadau, preifateiddio, llygredd a phobl ar gyflogau breision.

**David Melding:** A dderbyniwch y gwerir canran is o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus ar hyn o bryd nag o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf?

**Kirsty Williams:** Derbyniaf fod CMC wedi cynyddu. Felly, mae'n dylanwadu rywfaint ar y ffigur. Yr ydym o bosibl wedi dioddef o beth ochelgarwch gan y Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain, y bydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hwn, gyda gweinyddiaeth newydd, yn torri'n rhydd ohono.

Dywed Plaid Geidwadol William Hague yn awr y bydd yn gostwng trethi ac yn torri ar wariant cyhoeddus. Nid yw ei symiau yn gywir. Nid yw wedi gweithio allan eto faint y bydd yn torri ar grant bloc y Cynulliad. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed cyhoeddiad gan y Blaid Geidwadol ar hynny.

**Cynog Dafis:** Hoffwn gael barn Kirsty Williams ar y gyllideb addysg. Mae Ieuan Wyn Jones eisoes wedi disgrifio sut y mae'r setliad Cymreig yn llawer salach nag un Lloegr. Mae hynny'n effeithio'n arbennig ar Bowys. A yw Kirsty Williams yn derbyn dadansoddiad Cyngor Sir Powys y bydd yn wynebu toriadau'r flwyddyn nesaf o bron i £1 filiwn ar sail y cyllid a ymrwymwyd yn barod? Beth yw ei hymateb i hynny fel yr Aelod sydd yn cynrychioli Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed yn y Cynulliad hwn?

**Kirsty Williams:** I am aware of Powys County Council's fears. It is impossible for Powys County Council to accurately describe their settlement. It cannot state that there will be a £1 million shortfall because it does not know at this stage, and it will not know until next week, what will be its local government formula settlement. There are fears and we must take them seriously. I have arranged meetings with Edwina Hart and the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to ensure that pupils in Powys do not lose out. However, it is impossible for Powys County Council at this stage to accurately reflect its local government settlement because it was only this morning that the Minister for Finance signed off the letters to inform the treasurers of their settlement. I accept that there are fears. We must ensure that the additional special grant report, which I understand that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will propose on 19 December, sends a clear message to the local authorities that feel exposed because they are unsure of what the final settlement will be. That has been confused even more by the fact that David Blunkett has not woken up to devolution and made inaccurate statements on 19 July 2000 on education spending for England and Wales.

**Glyn Davies:** Is that your view as an independent party?

**Kirsty Williams:** We are both independent parties, Glyn. I realise that that is difficult for you to understand.

**Glyn Davies:** Point of order. At the beginning of this debate, Dirprwy Lywydd, you said that you would take speakers from the Government and the opposition in turn.

**Cynog Dafis:** I would like to hear Kirsty Williams's view on the education budget. Ieuan Wyn Jones has already described how the Welsh settlement is much poorer than England's. That particularly affects Powys. Does Kirsty Williams accept Powys County Council's analysis that it will face cuts next year of almost £1 million on the basis of the funding that has already been committed. What is her reaction to that as the Member for Brecon and Radnoshire in this Assembly?

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o ofidiau Cyngor Sir Powys. Mae'n amhosibl i Gyngor Sir Powys ddisgrifio eu setliad yn gywir. Ni all ddadlau y bydd diffyg o £1 filiwn oherwydd ni wŷr ar hyn o bryd, ac ni fydd yn gwybod tan yr wythnos nesaf, beth fydd ei setliad fformwla llywodraeth leol. Mae gofidiau ganddo a rhaid inni eu cymryd o ddifrif. Trefnais gyfarfodydd ag Edwina Hart a'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i sicrhau nad yw disgyblion ym Mhowys ar eu colled. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amhosibl i Gyngor Sir Powys adlewyrchu'n gywir ei setliad llywodraeth leol ar hyn o bryd gan mai dim ond y bore yma y llofnododd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid y llythyrau yn hysbysu'r trysoryddion o'u setliad. Derbyniaf fod gofidiau'n bodoli. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr adroddiad grant arbennig ychwanegol, y deallaf y bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn ei gynnig ar 19 Rhagfyr, yn anfon neges glir i'r awdurdodau lleol sydd yn teimlo'n fregus oherwydd nad ydynt yn siŵr beth fydd y setliad terfynol. Dryswyd hyn hyd yn oed yn fwy gan y ffaith nad yw David Blunkett wedi deffro i ddatganoli a gwnaeth ddatganiadau anghywir ar 19 Gorffennaf 2000 ynghylch y gwariant ar addysg i Gymru a Lloegr.

**Glyn Davies:** Ai dyna eich safbwynt chi fel plaid annibynnol?

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr ydym ill dau yn bleidiau annibynnol, Glyn. Sylweddolaf fod hynny yn anodd ichi ei ddeall.

**Glyn Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Ar ddechrau'r ddadl hon, Ddirprwy Lywydd, dywedasoeh y byddech yn cymryd siaradwyr o'r Llywodraeth a'r wrthblaid yn eu tro. Mae'r

The current speaker is pretending to be a member of the opposition.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That is up to her. There is nothing out of order so far.

**Kirsty Williams:** A year ago, Plaid Cymru did a deal. Its Members sat on their hands to allow the budget go through. That was an honourable position, if they felt that they needed to do so. However, what they achieved for Wales was unclear. The deal was never published and such secrecy is not accountable. The so-called Party of Wales is afraid of the people of Wales holding it to account. The budget before us today, in comparison, is a contrast to the Conservative years of underinvestment and Plaid Cymru's shady dealings in last year's negotiations. It is based—

**Jocelyn Davies:** You are speaking on behalf of the Government and, if I remember rightly, last year, the Government thanked us for that position. Has the Government changed its mind?

**Kirsty Williams:** I do not know whether Jocelyn is aware of this but there is a slight difference between the Government that responded to her last year and the Government this year. There is a difference, if you had not noticed.

This budget is based on a written and published agreement between two proud and independent political parties, who will put aside their differences to work for the benefit of the Assembly and the people of Wales. It is a three-year budget that supports a radical programme of Government that will give Wales its own and clearly defined direction to meet its needs.

Our top priority is additional funding for schools. We will be able to invest in enough new teachers to reduce class sizes, not only for five to seven-year-olds but for all primary school children, as promised in the Welsh Liberal Democrat manifesto. We will fully fund training grants for new primary school teachers by increasing the total training budget, and we will start tackling the massive

siaradwr presennol yn esgus bod yn aelod o'r wrthblaid.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae hynny yn dibynnu arni hi. Nid oes dim allan o drefn hyd yn hyn.

**Kirsty Williams:** Flwyddyn yn ôl, tarodd Plaid Cymru fargen. Eisteddodd ei haelodau ar eu dwylo i ganiatáu i'r gyllideb fynd yn ei blaen. Yr oedd yn sefyllfa anrhydeddus, os teimlent fod angen iddynt wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yr hyn a gyflawnasant dros Gymru yn aneglur. Ni chyhoeddwyd y fargen byth ac nid yw cyfrinachedd o'r fath yn atebol. Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, fel y'i gelwir, yn ofni gweld pobl Cymru yn ei dal yn atebol. Mae'r gyllideb ger ein bron heddiw, o'i chymharu, yn wrthgyferbyniol i flynyddoedd y Ceidwadwyr o danfuddsoddi ac ymwneud amheus Plaid Cymru yn nhreffodaethau y llynedd. Mae'n seiliedig—

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yr ydych yn siarad ar ran y Llywodraeth ac, os cofiaf yn iawn, y llynedd, diolchwyd inni am hynny gan y Llywodraeth. A yw'r Llywodraeth wedi newid ei meddwl?

**Kirsty Williams:** Ni wn a yw Jocelyn yn ymwybodol o hyn ond mae ychydig o wahaniaeth rhwng y Llywodraeth a ymatebodd iddi y llynedd a Llywodraeth eleni. Mae gwahaniaeth, os nad oeddech wedi sylwi.

Mae'r gyllideb hon yn seiliedig ar gytundeb ysgrifenedig cyhoeddedig rhwng dwy blaid wleidyddol falch ac annibynnol, a fydd yn rhoi eu gwahaniaethau o'r neilltu er mwyn gweithio er lles y Cynulliad a phobl Cymru. Mae'n gyllideb tair blynedd sydd yn cefnogi rhaglen Llywodraeth radicalaidd a fydd yn rhoi i Gymru ei chyfeiriad pendant clir ei hun i fodloni ei hanghenion.

Ein prif flaenoriaeth yw cyllid ychwanegol i ysgolion. Gallwn fuddsoddi mewn digon o athrawon newydd i leihau maint dosbarthiadau, nid yn unig i blant rhwng pump a saith mlwydd oed ond i holl blant ysgolion cynradd, fel yr addawodd maniffesto'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymreig. Ariannwn yn llawn grantiau hyfforddi ar gyfer athrawon ysgolion cynradd

school maintenance backlog. Cynog and Ieuan are right to say that we need sustained, planned investment. This budget will deliver that for schools. We will also fund nursery places for all three and four-year-olds whose parents want that.

On health, a subject that is close to my heart, this budget will not only invest in increasing clinical capacity to reduce patient waiting times, but will invest in preventing illness and promoting good health. I am not just talking about freezing prescription charges, introducing free dental check-ups for those under 25 and over 60 and introducing an eye examination programme, all of which are Welsh Liberal Democrat manifesto commitments that will have positive health benefits. I am also talking about the increased investment in housing, which is a vital contribution to improve people's health in this country.

This budget also provides increased spending to support crisis-hit farmers in Wales's rural communities. This partnership budget provides £10 million over three years to alleviate the changes of the Tir Mynydd regime and an additional £60 million for agri-environmental schemes and Tir Gofal. There will also be increased support for rural bus services and public transport and rate relief for hard-pressed rural small business.

This is a budget of which to be proud. It is based on the values of liberty and social justice for all, sustainability and equality of opportunity. It will gain credit for the Assembly and, most importantly, help set Welsh people free of the poverty that has plagued them for too long.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am sorry to interrupt the flow of debate. I said earlier that Richard Edwards would not be here but, since then, an amendment to that information has come to my attention. I gather that he intends to be present, although he is still unwell. Therefore, I must protect the half an

newydd drwy gynyddu cyfanswn y gyllideb hyfforddi, a dechreuwn fynd i'r afael â'r ôl-groniad anferth o waith cynnal a chadw mewn ysgolion. Mae Cynog ac Ieuan yn gywir i ddweud bod angen buddsoddiad cynaliadwy wedi ei gynllunio arnom. Cyflwynna'r gyllideb hon hynny i ysgolion. Ariannwn hefyd leoedd mewn meithrinfeydd ar gyfer pob plentyn tair a phedair oed y dymuna eu rhieni hynny ar eu cyfer.

O ran iechyd, mater sydd yn agos iawn i'm calon, bydd y gyllideb hon nid yn unig yn buddsoddi i gynyddu'r gallu clinigol i ostwng amseroedd aros i gleifion, ond yn buddsoddi i atal salwch a hybu iechyd da. Siaradaf nid yn unig am rewi costau presgripsiynau, cyflwyno archwiliadau deintyddol am ddim i rai dan 25 a thros 60 a chyflwyno rhaglen archwilio llygaid, sydd oll yn ymrwymadau maniffesto'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymreig a fydd â manteision iechyd cadarnhaol. Siaradaf hefyd am fwy o fuddsoddi mewn tai, sydd yn gyfraniad hanfodol i wella iechyd pobl yn y wlad hon.

Darpara'r gyllideb hon fwy o wariant hefyd i gynnal ffermwyr yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan yr argyfwng yng nghymunedau gwledig Cymru. Darpara'r gyllideb bartneriaeth hon £10 miliwn dros dair blynedd i leddfu'r newidiadau yng nghyfundrefn Tir Mynydd a £60 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol a Thir Gofal. Bydd mwy o gymorth hefyd i wasanaethau bysiau a thrafnidiaeth gyhoeddus wledig a rhyddhad rhag trethi i fusnesau bach gwledig sydd dan bwysau.

Mae hon yn gyllideb i ymfalchïo ynddi. Mae'n seiliedig ar werthoedd rhyddid a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol i bawb, cynaliadwyedd a chyfle cyfartal. Bydd yn ennyn ffydd yn y Cynulliad, ac, yn bwysicaf oll, yn helpu i ryddhau pobl Cymru o'r tlodi sydd wedi eu blino cyhyd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae'n flin gennyf amharu ar lif y ddadl. Dywedais yn gynharach na fyddai Richard Edwards yma ond, ers hynny, daeth newid i'r wybodaeth honno i'm sylw. Deallaf y bwriada fod yn bresennol, er ei fod yn dal yn anhwylyus. Felly, rhaid imi ddiogelu'r hanner awr a

hour allocated for the short debate, so this debate must end at 12.05 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** Before I come to the substance of the budget, I thank Edwina Hart for the process of the budget system. She has been open in discussion with colleagues and I am grateful for that.

This budget shows that we have not reached the level of spending in Wales, as a proportion of gross domestic product, that we had during the last year of the Conservative Government. That is incontrovertible. Kirsty Williams, who spoke on behalf of the Government for at least some of the time, seemed to confirm that.

10:15 a.m.

I will consider the areas of public spending that most concern the Conservative group and, probably, the National Assembly. There have been increases in health. However, let us consider the capital side of the account. According to the Government's NHS stocktake report, even with this increase, we have not reached the same level of capital spending as when the Conservatives left Government. Under the last Government, there was record spending on the NHS of over £100 million a year on average. That has now reached £70 million under this Government, which is two-thirds of the level under the Conservative Government. This must be seen in perspective before it is hailed as a great success. Spending on health has not reached the same level as when Labour came into power.

We welcome the Minister for Finance's conversion to the private finance initiative. She is a strong advocate of it, although she has trouble with some of her troops. Even some Cabinet members have difficulties with the concept of PFI. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning is one example. PFI is a means of delivering capital schemes. Many hospital improvement schemes and capital projects are waiting for funding—at the Princess of Wales Hospital, Tenby Cottage Hospital and Morriston Hospital, to name only three.

neilltuwyd ar gyfer y ddadl fer, a rhaid i'r ddadl orffen am 12.05 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** Cyn imi ddod at sylwedd y gyllideb, diolchaf i Edwina Hart am broses system y gyllideb. Bu'n agored mewn trafodaethau â chyd-Aelodau ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny.

Dengys y gyllideb hon nad ydym wedi cyrraedd y lefel gwariant yng Nghymru, fel canran o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth, a gawsom yn ystod blwyddyn olaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Mae hynny'n ddiaddadl. Ymddengys bod Kirsty Williams, a siaradodd ar ran y Llywodraeth am ryw faint o'r amser o leiaf, wedi cadarnhau hynny.

Ystyriaif y meysydd o wariant cyhoeddus sydd yn achosi'r pryder mwyaf i'r grŵp Ceidwadol ac, yn ôl pob tebyg, y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Cafwyd cynnydd yn y gwariant o ran iechyd. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni ystyried ochr gyfalaf y cyfrif. Yn ôl adroddiad cloriannu NHS y Llywodraeth, hyd yn oed gyda'r cynnydd hwn, ni chyrraeddwyd yr un lefel o wariant cyfalaf ag a gafwyd pan adawodd y Ceidwadwyr y Llywodraeth. O dan y Llywodraeth ddiwethaf, cafwyd y gwariant uchaf eto ar yr NHS o dros £100 miliwn y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd. Erbyn hyn cyrraeddodd hynny £70 miliwn o dan y Llywodraeth hon, sef dwy ran o dair o'r lefel o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Rhaid gweld hyn mewn persbectif cyn ei alw'n llwyddiant mawr. Ni chyrraeddodd y gwariant ar iechyd yr un lefel ag a wnaeth pan ddaeth Llafur i rym.

Croesawn y ffaith fod y Gweinidog dros Gyllid wedi troi at y fenter cyllid preifat. Mae'n gefnogwr brwd ohoni, er ei bod yn cael trafferth gyda rhai o'i mintai. Caiff hyd yn oed rhai aelodau o'r Cabinet anawsterau gyda chysyniad y fenter cyllid preifat. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn un enghraifft. Mae'r fenter cyllid preifat yn ffordd o gyflwyno cynlluniau cyfalaf. Mae llawer o gynlluniau gwella ysbytai a phrosiectau cyfalaf yn aros am gyllid—Ysbyty Tywysoges Cymru, Ysbyty'r Bwthyn Dinbych y Pysgod ac Ysbyty Treforus, i enwi ond tri.

There are insufficient funds in the health budget to deal with waiting times and lists. Those funds will not achieve the target of a reduction in waiting lists by 15,000 to 65,000 by April 2001, for which the Minister hopes. Unless she makes it an issue of confidence that she is convinced that that target will be reached, we do not believe that it will be, according to the figures in the health budget.

When we discuss waiting times and lists, we should never lose sight of the fact that there are individual stories of misery and difficulty behind them. We hear weekly if not daily, when the postal service is working, of people who can afford to do so being forced to go private. Many people cannot afford to, and we must protect them. The waiting times and lists situation is pivotal. We are convinced that the reduction that you expect will not be delivered.

On education, we have heard much from the Liberal Democrat party about its imprint on the budget. Kirsty asked us to note that there was something different about the Government of Wales this year compared to last year. This is the difference: because the Liberal Democrats now support the Government, other opposition parties, or previous opposition parties, could not influence the important areas in the budget. I found two areas in which the Liberal Democrats have had an impact. The first is the £600,000 allocated for a pilot scheme for the Welsh baccalaureate. In fairness, as the Minister for Finance confirmed to me yesterday, the Committee had requested that. The Liberal Democrats' second impact is to ensure that, in Powys in particular but throughout Wales also, schools are suffering because of a year on year reduction in their budgets.

**Kirsty Williams** *rose—*

**Nick Bourne:** I will give way in a minute. It is no good pretending that that is not true. Assembly Members for mid and west Wales know from the barrage of e-mails that they receive, not least from the chairman of Powys County Council's education committee, that

Nid oes digon o arian yn y gyllideb iechyd i ymdrin ag amseroedd a rhestrau aros. Ni fydd yr arian hwnnw yn cyrraedd y targed o ostyngiad yn y rhestrau aros o 15,000 i 65,000 erbyn Ebrill 2001, y gobeithia'r Gweinidog amdanynt. Oni wna hyn yn fater o ymddiriedaeth ei bod yn argyhoeddedig y cyrhaeddir y targed, ni chredwn y bydd hynny'n digwydd, yn ôl ffigurau'r gyllideb iechyd.

Wrth drafod amseroedd a rhestrau aros, ni ddylem byth anwybyddu'r ffaith fod straeon unigol o ddiodefaint ac anhawster y tu ôl iddynt. Clywn yn wythnosol os nad yn ddyddiol, pan fydd y gwasanaeth post yn gweithio, am bobl sydd yn gallu fforddio hynny yn cael eu gorfodi i fynd yn breifat. Ni all llawer o bobl fforddio hynny, a rhaid inni eu diogelu. Mae'r sefyllfa amseroedd a rhestrau aros yn ganolog. Yr ydym yn sicr na chyflawnir y gostyngiad a ddisgwyliwch.

O ran addysg, clywsom lawer gan blaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am ei dylanwad ar y gyllideb. Gofynnodd Kirsty inni nodi bod rhywbeth yn wahanol am Lywodraeth Cymru eleni o'i chymharu â'r llynedd. Dyma'r gwahaniaeth: gan fod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol erbyn hyn yn cefnogi'r Llywodraeth, ni allai'r gwrthbleidiau eraill, neu'r gwrthbleidiau blaenorol, ddylanwadu ar y meysydd pwysig yn y gyllideb. Deuthum o hyd i ddau faes lle cafodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ddylanwad. Y cyntaf yw'r £600,000 a neilltuwyd ar gyfer cynllun peilot y fagloriaeth Gymreig. A bod yn deg, fel y cadarnhaodd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid imi ddoe, gwnaeth y Pwyllgor gais am hynny. Yr ail ddylanwad a gafodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yw sicrhau bod ysgolion yn dioddef, ym Mhowys yn arbennig ond ledled Cymru hefyd, o ganlyniad i ostyngiad yn eu cyllidebau o flwyddyn i flwyddyn.

**Kirsty Williams** *a gododd—*

**Nick Bourne:** Ildiaf yn y man. Nid oes pwynt esgus nad yw hynny'n wir. Fe wŷr Aelodau'r Cynulliad dros ganolbarth a gorllewin Cymru o'r llwyth o negeseuon e-bost a dderbyniant, nid lleiaf gan gadeirydd pwyllgor addysg Cyngor Sir Powys, y bydd



there will be a reduction. That has been made worse because areas outside the Objective 1 area suffer because money must be taken from elsewhere due to the shortfall in match funding. That money is principally taken out of the education budget. This is a bad budget for education.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you agree that, although Powys County Council has concerns, it is impossible for it to say accurately what its education budget will be? The money for education comes primarily from the local government settlement. It does not know now what its budget will be. The council has concerns, but it cannot accurately tell you, or any other Assembly Member, that it will lose £1 million. It does not know what its local government settlement will be, and that is primarily where the money for education will come from.

**Nick Bourne:** I feel sorry for the Assembly Member for Brecon and Radnorshire. She has been dealt a difficult deck of cards by having to come in to speak on behalf of the Liberal Democrats' spokesman. Given the situation in Powys, she has a difficult position to defend.

**Cynog Dafis** *rose*—

**Nick Bourne:** I will give way in a minute. Edwina confirmed to Ieuan Wyn Jones and myself yesterday that local authorities have received ballpark figures of what their settlement will be. Powys is right to be concerned. This is not a great conspiracy by opposition parties. There are genuine concerns throughout Powys and the rest of Wales. The director of the National Association of Headteachers in Wales, Alun Jones, shares that concern. This is not a Conservative plot, but a bad budget for education in Wales, which reflects Liberal Democrat influence. They have let it through by being part of the Government team and supporting the budget, which is bad news for Wales.

**Cynog Dafis:** I gadarnhau'r hyn a ddywedodd Nick Bourne, yn ôl ein ffigurau ni, yn ystod y blynyddoedd 2002-03, bydd y codiad mewn gwariant ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant yn Lloegr yn 5.7 y cant. Yng

gostyngiad yn digwydd. Gwaethygydd hynny oherwydd bydd ardaloedd y tu allan i ardal Amcan 1 yn dioddef am fod yn rhaid tynnu arian o rywle arall o ganlyniad i'r diffyg mewn arian cyfatebol. Caiff yr arian hwnnw ei dynnu allan o'r gyllideb addysg yn bennaf. Mae hon yn gyllideb wael i addysg.

**Kirsty Williams:** Er bod gan Gyngor Sir Powys bryderon, oni chytunwch ei bod yn amhosibl iddo ddweud yn union beth fydd ei gyllideb addysg? Daw'r arian ar gyfer addysg o'r setliad llywodraeth leol yn bennaf. Ni wŷr yn awr beth fydd ei gyllideb. Mae gan y cyngor bryderon, ond ni all ddweud yn union wrthych chi, nac unrhyw Aelod arall o'r Cynulliad, y bydd yn colli £1 miliwn. Ni wŷr beth fydd ei setliad llywodraeth leol, a daw'r arian ar gyfer addysg o hwnnw yn bennaf.

**Nick Bourne:** Teimlaf yn flin dros Aelod Cynulliad Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed. Cafodd dasg anodd wrth orfod dod i mewn i siarad ar ran llefarydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. O gofio'r sefyllfa ym Mhowys, mae ganddi sefyllfa anodd i'w hamddiffyn.

**Cynog Dafis** *a gododd*—

**Nick Bourne:** Ildiaf yn y man. Cadarnhaodd Edwina i Ieuan Wyn Jones a minnau ddoe fod awdurdodau lleol wedi derbyn ffigurau cyffredinol o swm eu setliad. Mae Powys yr iawn i fod yn bryderus. Nid yw hyn yn gynllwyn mawr gan y gwrthbleidiau. Mae pryderon gwirioneddol ledled Powys a gweddill Cymru. Mae cyfarwyddwr Cymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon yng Nghymru, Alun Jones, yn rhannu'r pryder hwnnw. Nid yw hwn yn gynllwyn gan y Ceidwadwyr, ond yn gyllideb wael i addysg yng Nghymru, sydd yn adlewyrchu dylanwad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Gadawsent i'r mater fynd drwodd drwy fod yn rhan o dîm y Llywodraeth a chefnogi'r gyllideb, sydd yn newyddion drwg i Gymru.

**Cynog Dafis:** To confirm what Nick Bourne said, according to our figures, during the years 2002-03, the increase in spending for education and training in England will be 5.7 per cent. In Wales, it will only be 2.1 per

Nghymru, 2.1 y cant yn unig a fydd, sef hanner y codiad yn Lloegr. Nid yw'r ffigurau ar gyfer y flwyddyn ganlynol yn llawer gwell. Mae hynny'n siŵr o greu straen, pryder, gofidiau a phroblemau sylweddol o ystyried ein bod yn dibynnu ar addysg a hyfforddiant i gystadlu'n effeithiol yn yr economi ac mewn meysydd eraill.

**Nick Bourne:** That is correct. The fact that David Blunkett made a statement for England and Wales was just a smokescreen. He announced a spending increase for England and Wales, as is done in Westminster, but England has done better out of that settlement because it has made provision for that money to go directly to the schools and we have not. We heard about reduction in infant class sizes, but there is only money in the budget towards reducing class sizes for the first year. Therefore, how schools are supposed to plan for that in years two and three remains a mystery. Schools need to be able to plan year-on-year, and their complaint is that the additional funding in the first year is not translated across into years two to four. Therefore, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning and the Liberal Democrat Members who support her have let Wales down.

On agriculture, we welcome the additional funding for Tir Gofal, but we think that there should be more. This scheme should be encouraged and we know that there are more people wishing to take it up than are able to do so. We also welcome news on the new entrant scheme, but it must be tied to an early retirement scheme. It is no good having one without the other. The Liberal Democrat Party should understand that. There were new entrants into the Cabinet and, as a consequence, some Cabinet Members were forced to take early retirement. Some of us sympathised more with those who had been forced into early retirement than the new entrants, but that is another story. Those two schemes need to go hand-in-hand. More money should also be put into forestry schemes. A huge amount of timber is currently imported from outside the UK and Wales.

cent, which is half the increase in England. The figures for the following year are not much better. That is bound to create strain, anxiety, concern and serious problems given that we depend on education and training to compete effectively in the economy and in other areas.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hynny'n gywir. Dim ond cuddio'r gwirionedd y mae'r ffaith fod David Blunkett wedi gwneud datganiad i Gymru a Lloegr. Cyhoeddodd gynnydd mewn gwariant ar gyfer Lloegr a Chymru, fel y gwneir yn San Steffan, ond elwodd Lloegr yn fwy o'r setliad gan iddi wneud darpariaeth i'r arian hwnnw fynd yn uniongyrchol i'r ysgolion ac ni wnaethom ni hynny. Clywsom am ostyngiad ym maint dosbarthiadau babanod, ond dim ond ar gyfer gostwng maint dosbarthiadau am y flwyddyn gyntaf y mae arian yn y gyllideb. Felly, erys yn ddirgelwch sut y dylai ysgolion gynllunio ar gyfer hynny ym mlynnyddoedd dau a thri. Mae angen i ysgolion allu cynllunio o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, a'u cwyn yw na throsglwyddir y cyllid ychwanegol yn y flwyddyn gyntaf i flwyddyn dau hyd flwyddyn pedwar. Felly, mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ac Aelodau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi siomi Cymru.

O ran amaethyddiaeth, croesawn y cyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer Tir Gofal, ond credwn y dylai fod yn fwy. Dylid annog y cynllun hwn a gwyddom fod mwy o bobl nag a all wneud hynny yn dymuno ei fabwysiadu. Croesawn hefyd newyddion ar y cynllun newydd-ddyfodiaid, ond rhaid ei glymu wrth gynllun ymddeoliad cynnar. Nid oes pwynt cael un heb y llall. Dylai Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ddeall hynny. Cafwyd newydd-ddyfodiaid yn y Cabinet ac, o ganlyniad, gorfodwyd rhai Aelodau o'r Cabinet i ymddeol yn gynnar. Cydymdeimlodd rhai ohonom yn fwy gyda'r rheini a orfodwyd i ymddeol yn gynnar nag â'r newydd-ddyfodiaid newydd, ond stori arall yw honno. Mae angen i'r ddau gynllun hwnnw fynd law yn llaw. Dylid rhoi rhagor o arian i gynlluniau coedwigaeth hefyd. Caiff swm anferth o goed ei fewnforio ar hyn o bryd o'r tu allan i'r DU a Chymru.

Objective 1 has been a big, black hole in this budget—a conjuring trick done with mirrors to pretend that there is enough money to fund it. If it were running at its proper level, there would not be a sufficient amount of money. What little money there is has to be taken out of education and other areas. We know that this Government does not understand business. It is unable to work with business, which is why Objective 1 is on the ropes. It may receive advice from people who run successful businesses such as Bernie Ecclestone, Lord Sainsbury, Geoffrey Robinson, Mike German—[*Laughter.*] Overall, it is clear that this budget is not a successful one for Wales.

I turn to the serious issue of flood defences, which, in fairness to Edwina Hart, she discussed openly. England received £51 million while Wales received £3 million. That does not sound like a good deal to me, because our money is Barnettised. Although I agree that the Barnett formula should be dealt with separately, we must consider some matters, such as flood arrangements, on a needs basis.

On local government, it is clear that local authorities have been given a ballpark figure with which to work. They could not operate without that. How can they plan if they do not know what their settlement is? They do not know the precise figure, but they are certainly given ballpark figures. The Labour part of the pantomime horse at least recognises that, even if the Liberal Democrat part does not. We are concerned that, even in the settlement for local government, there will be large council tax rises well above the rate of inflation. The Government has hailed the fact that increases will be 3 per cent on average, and will never increase above 9 per cent, as a great success many times. That is not a great success. After last year's increases, for some local authorities to face increases of five times the rate of inflation is a great failure. Therefore, we will vote against this budget because it is not a good one. It is largely a Labour one, but is made worse by Liberal Democrat influence, and we will oppose it.

Bu Amcan 1 yn dwll du, mawr yn y gyllideb hon—tric consurio wedi'i wneud â drychau i esgus bod digon o arian i'w ariannu. Pe byddai'n rhedeg ar ei lefel gywir, ni fyddai swm digonol o arian. Rhaid tynnu'r ychydig arian sydd ar gael o faes addysg a meysydd eraill. Gwyddom nad yw'r Llywodraeth hon yn deall busnes. Ni all weithio gyda busnes, a dyma pam y mae Amcan 1 mewn sefyllfa anobeithiol. Gall dderbyn cyngor gan bobl sydd yn rhedeg busnesau llwyddiannus megis Bernie Ecclestone, Arglwydd Sainsbury, Geoffrey Robinson, Mike German—[*Chwerthin.*] Ar y cyfan, mae'n glir nad yw'r gyllideb hon yn llwyddiannus i Gymru.

Trof at fater difrifol, sef amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd, a drafododd Edwina Hart yn agored, a bod yn deg â hi. Derbyniodd Lloegr £51 miliwn tra derbyniodd Cymru £3 miliwn. Nid yw hynny'n swnio'n fargen dda i mi, am fod ein harian wedi'i Farnetteiddio. Er y cytunaf y dylid ymdrin â fformwla Barnett ar wahân rhaid inni ystyried rhai materion, megis trefniadau llifogydd, ar sail anghenion.

O ran llywodraeth leol, mae'n glir y rhoddwyd ffigur cyffredinol i awdurdodau lleol weithio gydag ef. Ni allent weithredu hebdo. Sut y gallent gynllunio os na wyddant beth yw eu setliad? Ni wyddant yr union ffigur, ond yn sicr cânt ffigurau cyffredinol. Mae rhan Llafur yn y ceffyl pantomeim yn cydnabod hynny o leiaf, hyd yn oed os nad ydyw rhan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Hyd yn oed yn y setliad llywodraeth leol, yr ydym yn bryderus y bydd codiadau treth cyngor mawr sydd yn uwch o lawer na chyfradd chwyddiant. Cyhoeddeodd y Llywodraeth y ffaith y bydd codiadau yn 3 y cant ar gyfartaledd, ac na fyddant yn codi'n uwch na 9 y cant, fel llwyddiant mawr ar sawl achlysur. Nid yw hynny'n llwyddiant mawr. Ar ôl codiadau y llynedd, mae'r ffaith bod rhai awdurdodau lleol yn wynebu codiadau sydd bum gwaith yn fwy na chyfradd chwyddiant yn gryn fethiant. Felly, pleidleisiwn yn erbyn y gyllideb hon am nad yw'n un dda. Cyllideb Lafur ydyw i raddau helaeth, ond fe'i gwaethygir gan ddylanwad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ac fe'i gwrthwynebwn.

10:25 a.m

## **Datganiad ar y Comisiynydd Plant** **Statement on the Children's Commissioner**

**The First Minister:** I thank the Deputy Presiding Officer for allowing me to interrupt the budget debate to make this statement, which should have been made before the budget debate. I also apologise profusely on behalf of the administration to the Assembly for not having been in a position to make the statement at the right time this morning. There was a breakdown in communication about which I will make inquiries. I will write to the party leaders and business managers when I have discovered what happened.

I am delighted to inform the Assembly of the selection of Peter Clarke for appointment as the first Children's Commissioner for Wales. Peter is currently Director of Childline Cymru and was formerly Director of the National Schizophrenia Fellowship in Wales.

The successful establishment of the commissioner's office is a major achievement and a first for Wales in the UK. Yesterday, the Queen's Speech announced that there will be a Children's Commissioner for Wales Bill in the next session of Parliament. We can now look forward to implementing fully the commitment, shared by all parties in the Assembly, to establish a children's commissioner with wide-ranging powers. Wales can truly be said to have a champion who will safeguard and promote the interests of its children and young people.

Full details of the selection process are set out in the report laid before the Assembly. I thank all those who took part in these innovative arrangements. In particular, I acknowledge the hard work of the 17 young people who interviewed the candidates in Cardiff on Sunday. I congratulate them on their contribution to this achievement. I also thank the Members from all parties who made this possible. The process began with an extensive consultation exercise on the proposal for a commissioner by the Health and Social Services Committee last autumn. Its report was endorsed in Plenary last June.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Diolchaf i'r Dirprwy Lywydd am ganiatáu imi dorri ar draws y drafodaeth ar y gyllideb i wneud y datganiad hwn, a ddylai fod wedi ei wneud cyn y ddadl ar y gyllideb. Hefyd ymddiheuraf yn llaes ar ran y weinyddiaeth i'r Cynulliad am beidio â bod mewn sefyllfa i wneud y datganiad ar yr adeg gywir fore heddiw. Cafwyd diffyg cyfathrebu a gwnaf ymholiadau ynglŷn â hyn. Ysgrifennaf at arweinwyr y pleidiau a'r rheolwyr busnes wedi i mi ganfod beth ddigwyddodd.

Yr wyf yn falch iawn o hysbysu'r Cynulliad y penodwyd Peter Clarke yn Gomisiynydd Plant cyntaf Cymru. Ar hyn o bryd Peter yw Cyfarwyddwr Childline Cymru a bu'n Gyfarwyddwr Cymdeithas Sgitsoffrenia Cenedlaethol Cymru.

Mae sicrhau sefydlu swyddfa'r comisiynydd yn gyflawniad mawr a Chymru yw'r cyntaf yn y DU i wneud hynny. Ddoe, datganodd Araith y Frenhines y cyflwynir Mesur Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn ystod sesiwn nesaf y Senedd. Gallwn edrych ymlaen yn awr i roi'r ymrwymiad ar waith yn llawn, sydd wedi'i rannu gan holl bleidiau'r Cynulliad, i sefydlu comisiynydd plant â phwerau eang. Gellir dweud yn wir bod gan Gymru gynrychiolydd a fydd yn diogelu ac yn hybu buddiannau ei phlant a'i phobl ifanc.

Nodir manylion llawn y broses ddethol yn yr adroddiad a gyflwynwyd gerbron y Cynulliad. Diolchaf i bawb a gymerodd ran yn y trefniadau newydd hyn. Yn arbennig, cydnabyddaf waith caled y 17 o bobl ifanc a gyfwelodd yr ymgeiswyr yng Nghaerdydd ddydd Sul. Llongyfarchaf hwy ar eu cyfraniad i'r cyflawniad hwn. Hefyd diolchaf i'r Aelodau o'r holl bleidiau a wnaeth hyn yn bosibl. Dechreuodd y broses gydag ymarfer ymgynghorol sylweddol ar y cynnig i gael comisiynydd gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ystod tymor yr hydref diwethaf. Cymeradwywyd ei

The whole sequence, up to and including selection, has been an example of open and inclusive policy-making, and all-party co-operation, of which we can all be justifiably proud.

Of course, this is just the beginning. After Peter Clarke is formally appointed and takes up his post in the spring of next year, he will begin work on setting up the commissioner's office, consulting with the range of interests that will inform his work, and recruiting the staff that he will need. Wales is taking the lead in the UK in placing the rights and needs of our children and young people centre stage. I am sure that you will all join me in wishing Peter Clarke every success in meeting this demanding new challenge.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Thank you, First Minister, for that statement. It is a good day for us all in the Assembly. In welcoming this excellent news, I am sure that you will agree that it is appropriate that we remember, for a moment, all those children and young people who suffered abuse while in our care, especially those who subsequently died. Sadly, it is their suffering and the Waterhouse report that arose from it, which finally made a case for a children's commissioner for Wales. It is important that we do not forget them.

Having said that, we are all delighted to have reached this point today. It has been a long haul and the campaign continued for many years. In this party, we are particularly proud that Elfyn Llwyd placed a Bill before the House of Commons seeking a children's commissioner for Wales back in 1993. That was just a step in a process that had been going on for much longer. We are particularly pleased to welcome the news that there will be fuller powers for the Children's Commissioner for Wales, and we look forward to working with the Government of Wales to ensure that that Bill meets all the requirements in the Health and Social Services Committee's report. I am grateful for the opportunity to be part of this process and I thank Dr Dai Lloyd for delegating his

adroddiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn fis Mehefin diwethaf. Bu'r holl broses, hyd at ac yn cynnwys y dethol, yn enghraifft o lunio polisi agored a chynhwysol, a chydweithrediad y pleidiau oll y gallwn, yn haeddiannol, ymfalchïo ynddi.

Wrth gwrs, megis dechrau yr ydym. Wedi penodi Peter Clarke yn ffurfiol ac wedi iddo ddechrau ar ei swydd yng ngwanwyn y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd yn dechrau ar y gwaith o sefydlu swyddfa'r comisiynydd, gan ymgynghori â'r ystod o fuddiannau fydd yn llywio ei waith, a recriwtio'r staff y bydd eu hangen. Bydd Cymru'n arwain y DU wrth roi sylw canolog i hawliau ac anghenion ein plant a'n pobl ifanc. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch oll yn ymuno â mi wrth ddyuno pob llwyddiant i Peter Clarke wrth fynd i'r afael â'r her newydd hon.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diolch, Brif Weinidog Cymru, am y datganiad hwnnw. Mae'n ddiwrnod da i bawb ohonom yn y Cynulliad. Wrth groesawu'r newyddion ardderchog hwn, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch oll yn cytuno ei bod yn briodol ein bod yn cofio, am ennyd, am yr holl blant a phobl ifanc a ddiodeffodd drwy gael eu cam-drin tra yr oeddent o dan ein gofal, yn enwedig y rhai hynny a fu farw o ganlyniad i hynny. Yn anffodus, eu dioddefaint hwy ac adroddiad Waterhouse a ddeilliodd ohono, a wnaeth achos o'r diwedd i gael comisiynydd plant i Gymru. Mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn anghofio amdanynt hwy.

Wedi dweud hynny, yr ydym oll yn falch iawn o fod wedi cyrraedd y pwynt hwn heddiw. Bu'n ymdrech hir a pharhaodd yr ymgyrch am sawl blwyddyn. Yn y blaidd hon, yr ydym yn arbennig o falch bod Elfyn Llwyd wedi cyflwyno Mesur gerbron Tŷ'r Cyffredin yn gofyn am gomisiynydd plant yng Nghymru yn ôl yn 1993. Un cam oedd hynny mewn proses a fu'n parhau am gyfnod llawer hwy. Yr ydym yn arbennig o falch o groesawu'r newyddion y rhoddir pwerau llawnach i Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru, ac edrychwn ymlaen at weithio gyda Llywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau y bydd y Mesur yn ateb holl ofynion adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i fod yn rhan o'r broses hon a diolchaf i

shadow ministerial responsibilities to me. We should all congratulate Jane Hutt on the process. As the First Minister said, it was truly inclusive. Jane faced challenges along the way. Many people were concerned about involving young people, but that worked well. I offer warm congratulations to Peter Clarke. His record on children's rights is well known and he will certainly rise to this huge challenge.

Will you join me in thanking everybody who campaigned for so long for the post of Children's Commissioner for Wales, in particular the organisation Voices from Care? Do you agree that this innovative process of involving service users in a public appointment is one from which the administration can learn in terms of other public appointments? We have certainly made that case. Will you finally commit the Executive to reviewing the commissioner's budget after the first year, particularly in light of the possible need for the commissioner to support test cases through the courts, which can be very expensive?

**The First Minister:** I thank you for the tone of your contribution. It reflected the cross-party alliance that has helped to create the good news of this appointment and yesterday's good news on the new Bill that will extend the Commissioner's powers beyond the care system. I commend Voices from Care's work. It sometimes seemed to campaign in the wilderness, but eventually it reached the successful outcome that we have witnessed today. That organisation, more than others in childcare, connects with children, particularly those who have been damaged by misdeeds in the care system.

You are right to draw our attention to the length of time taken to reach this point. The delays in the last years were inevitable because we could not move on this until the Waterhouse tribunal reported its results and until Paul Murphy announced them to Parliament last summer. However, as soon as the Waterhouse report outlined the position of the children's commissioner as its number one recommendation, it was possible to persuade the Government immediately to

Dr Dai Lloyd am ddirprwyo ei gyfrifoldebau gweinyddol cysgodol i mi. Dylem oll longyfarch Jane Hutt ar y broses. Fel y dywedodd Prif Weinidog Cymru, yr oedd yn gwbl hollgynhwysol. Wynebodd Jane sialensau ar hyd y ffordd. Yr oedd llawer o bobl yn pryderu am gynnwys pobl ifanc, ond gweithiodd hynny'n dda. Estynnaf longyfarchiadau cynnes i Peter Clarke. Mae ei enw da ar hawliau plant yn hysbys a bydd yn sicr yn cwrdd â'r sialens fawr hon.

A ymunwch â mi i ddiolch i bawb a ymgyrchodd cyhyd i gael y swydd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, yn arbennig y sefydliad Voices from Care? A gytunwch fod y broses arloesol hon o gynnwys defnyddwyr gwasanaethau mewn penodiad cyhoeddus yn un y gall y weinyddiaeth ddysgu oddi wrthi yn nhermau swyddi cyhoeddus eraill? Enillasom yr achos hwnnw yn bendant. A fyddwch yn y pen draw yn ymrwymo'r Weithrediaeth i adolygu cyllideb y comisiynydd ar ôl y flwyddyn gyntaf, yn enwedig o ystyried yr angen posibl am gomisiynydd i gefnogi achosion prawf drwy'r llysoedd, a all fod yn ddrud iawn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Diolchaf am naws eich cyfraniad. Adlewyrchodd y gynghrair drawsbleidiol a helpodd i greu'r newyddion da o ran y swydd hon a'r newyddion da ddoe ar y Mesur newydd a fydd yn ymestyn pwerau'r Comisiynydd y tu hwnt i'r system ofal. Cymeradwyaf waith Voices from Care. Weithiau ymddengys ei fod yn ymgyrchu yn y diffeithwch, ond o'r diwedd daeth i'r canlyniad llwyddiannus y buom yn dyst iddo heddiw. Mae'r sefydliad hwnnw, yn fwy na rhai eraill mewn gofal plant, yn cysylltu â phlant, yn enwedig y rhai hynny a niweidiwyd gan gamweddau yn y system ofal.

Yr ydych yn gywir i dynnu ein sylw at y cyfnod o amser a gymerwyd i gyrraedd y pwynt hwn. Yr oedd yr oedi yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf yn anochel oherwydd na allem symud ymlaen ar hyn nes i dribiwnlys Waterhouse gyflwyno adroddiad ar ei ganlyniadau a than i Paul Murphy eu datgan i'r Senedd yn ystod tymor yr haf diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, cyn gynted ag yr amlinellodd adroddiad Waterhouse y swydd comisiynydd plant fel ei brif argymhelliad, yr

introduce it as an amendment to the Care Standards Bill that was half way through the Houses of Parliament, but we had to restrict that to the care system. However, the new Bill announced yesterday allows us to go beyond that into health, education, the legal system and other areas, which relates to Helen Mary's other question on the need to review the Commissioner's budget. We will have to return to that on advice from the independent children's commissioner because he is like an ombudsman—an independent advocate and is not a civil servant, in the conventional sense of the word, therefore he will be able to report to the Assembly. If he considers his resources inadequate, I am sure that he will make a powerful case to which we will listen.

**Kirsty Williams:** On behalf of the Liberal Democrats, I congratulate Mr Clarke on his appointment to this unique post in the UK. I also welcome the news in the Queen's Speech that the Commissioner will be able to embrace fully every aspect of the job that this Assembly envisioned, looking after the interests of children, wherever they are in Wales and in whichever setting. I also congratulate the Minister for Health and Social Services and the Committee for the immense work that they undertook. I congratulate the young people who worked extremely hard over two days this weekend—for some it was even longer—and the innovative way in which they tested the candidates. Involving young people in the political process is an example that other parts of the UK will wish to follow. It is fantastic news that as a result of 'Lost in Care', we have been able to implement its first recommendation. However, can you assure me that following a report to the Health and Social Services Committee yesterday—highlighting areas in which we are not making such good progress in implementing our response to 'Lost in Care'—that you will do all that you can to ensure that we address those issues that remain unsolved following the terrible tragedy in north Wales and the continuing abuse of children in this country?

oedd yn bosibl perswadio'r Llywodraeth ar unwaith i'w gyflwyno fel gwelliant i'r Mesur Safonau Gofal a oedd hanner ffordd drwy'r Senedd, ond yr oedd yn rhaid inni gyfyngu hynny i'r system ofal. Fodd bynnag, galluoga'r Mesur newydd a gyflwynwyd ddoe inni fynd y tu hwnt i hynny i mewn i iechyd, addysg, y system gyfreithiol a meysydd eraill, sydd yn berthnasol i gwestiwn arall Helen Mary ar yr angen i adolygu cyllideb y Comisiynydd. Bydd rhaid inni ddychwelyd at hynny wedi cael cyngor gan y comisiynydd plant annibynnol oherwydd ei fod fel ombwdsman—eiriolwr annibynnol ac nid yw'n was sifil, yn ystyr confensiynol y gair, felly gall gyflwyno adroddiadau i'r Cynulliad. Os ystyria fod ei adnoddau'n annigonol, yr wyf yn siwr y bydd yn llunio achos pwerus y byddwn yn gwranddo arno.

**Kirsty Williams:** Ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, llongyfarchaf Mr Clarke ar ei benodiad i'r swydd unigryw hon yn y DU. Hefyd croesawaf y newyddion yn Araith y Frenhines y gall y Comisiynydd groesawu pob agwedd ar y swydd y rhagwelodd y Cynulliad yn llawn, gan ofalu am fuddiannau plant, pa un a ydynt yng Nghymru ai peidio a pha leoliad bynnag y byddant ynddo. Hefyd llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Pwyllgor am y gwaith anferthol a wnaethant. Llongyfarchaf y bobl ifanc a weithiodd yn hynod o galed dros ddau ddiwrnod y penwythnos hwn—i rai yr oedd hyd yn oed yn hwy—a'r ffordd arloesol y profasant yr ymgeiswyr. Mae cynnwys pobl ifanc yn y broses wleidyddol yn esiampl y bydd rhannau eraill o'r DU yn dymuno ei dilyn. Mae'n newyddion gwych ein bod wedi gallu gweithredu'r argymhelliad cyntaf hwn o ganlyniad i 'Ar Goll mewn Gofal'. Fodd bynnag, a allwch fy sicrhau yn dilyn adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddoe—a oedd yn amlinellu meysydd nad ydym yn gwneud cynnydd cystal ynddynt wrth weithredu ein hymateb i 'Ar Goll mewn Gofal'—y byddwch yn gwneud cymaint ag y gallwch i sicrhau ein bod yn ymdrin â'r materion hynny a erys heb eu datrys yn dilyn y drychineb ofnadwy yng ngogledd Cymru a cham-drin plant sydd yn parhau yn y wlad hon?

**The First Minister:** Lest it be thought that I forgot to endorse one aspect of Helen Mary's statement in praising Jane Hutt, it goes without saying that I praise her as well as the children for this innovative use of a user group in making an appointment. I am told that there was a remarkable unanimity of view between the children and adults and it blazes a path that we can choose for future health service appointments by using, for example, patient groups to assist in making appointments that would have been made conventionally. It has worked successfully across a generational divide, perhaps it can help to break down the 'them' and 'us' divide in other public appointments.

Kirsty is right that certain aspects of the response to the Waterhouse report's recommendations have not moved ahead as quickly. However, this morning we should confine ourselves to discussing the independent children's commissioner. We have had a children's commissioner a year sooner than we would have done had we waited for yesterday's Queen's Speech. We secured a children's commissioner quickly by using the Care Standards Bill half way through its Parliamentary process, as soon as Waterhouse reported last year. We acted as quickly as possible on that and we hope that, by the time the Children's Commissioner for Wales Bill becomes an Act in a few months' time, we will secure much wider powers for that post. That will provide a platform for solving many of the other problems to which Kirsty referred.

10:35 a.m.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** This is a short statement to announce the name of the successful candidate, so can we have shorter questions and answers please?

**Lorraine Barrett:** I was privileged, as a member of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, to take part in this process. I record that that Committee played a part, along with the Health and Social Services Committee. I was also privileged to be involved with the young people who

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Rhag ofn y credir i mi anghofio ategu un agwedd ar ddatganiad Helen Mary wrth ganmol Jane Hutt, mae'n bur amlwg fy mod yn ei chanmol hithau yn ogystal â'r plant am y defnydd arloesol hwn o grŵp defnyddwyr wrth benodi rhywun. Dywedir wrthyf bod unfrydedd barn anhygoel rhwng y plant a'r oedolion a dengys llwybr y gallwn ei ddewis ar gyfer penodiadau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn y dyfodol drwy ddefnyddio, er enghraifft, grwpiau cleifion i gynorthwyo wrth benodi a fyddai wedi cael ei wneud yn gonfensiynol. Gweithiodd yn llwyddiannus ar draws rhaniad mewn cenhedlaeth, efallai y gall ein helpu i ddileu'r rhaniad 'nhw' a 'ni' mewn penodiadau cyhoeddus eraill.

Mae Kirsty'n gywir i ddweud nad yw rhai agweddau ar yr ymateb i argymhellion adroddiad Waterhouse wedi symud ymlaen mor gyflym. Fodd bynnag, y bore yma dylem gyfyngu ein hunain i drafod y comisiynydd plant annibynnol. Cawsom gomisiynydd plant flwyddyn yn gynharach nag y byddem wedi ei gael pe byddem wedi aros am Araith y Frenhines ddoe. Sicrhawyd comisiynydd plant yn gyflym drwy ddefnyddio'r Mesur Safonau Gofal hanner ffordd drwy ei broses Seneddol, cyn gynted ag y cyflwynwyd adroddiad Waterhouse y llynedd. Gweithredwyd cyn gynted â phosibl ar hynny a gobeithio, erbyn y daw Mesur Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn Ddeddf mewn ychydig fisoedd, y byddwn yn sicrhau pwerau llawer ehangach ar gyfer y swydd honno. Bydd hynny'n darparu llwyfan ar gyfer datrys llawer o'r problemau eraill y cyfeiriodd Kirsty atynt.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Datganiad byr yw hwn i ddatgan enw'r ymgeisydd llwyddiannus, felly a allwn ni gael cwestiynau ac atebion byrrach os gwelwch yn dda?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr oedd yn ffraind i mi, fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, gymryd rhan yn y broses hon. Nodaf i'r Pwyllgor hwnnw gymryd rhan, ynghyd â'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Hefyd yr oedd yn ffraind i mi gymryd rhan gyda'r bobl ifanc a chwaraeodd



played an important role in this appointment. I had many concerns about involving young people in the process, from a confidentiality or legalistic viewpoint, but they conducted themselves with integrity and professionalism. We could learn many lessons from them. I thank those who matter: the children and young people to whom I referred and the other young people in Wales who will benefit from having a brilliant children's commissioner in Peter Clarke.

**The First Minister:** Although I was not present at the interviews, I understand that what was remarkable about the involvement of the children was not only the interviewing itself, but the role-playing of complaints that might be addressed to the independent children's commissioner. Finally, they elected two of their number to take part in the formal process of the final stage of interviews on Monday this week. That process was innovative but it has blazed a trail and we can use that method in other public sector appointments.

**David Melding:** This outcome is a great achievement for the Assembly but it is born of the abject failure to care safely and adequately for vulnerable children. That is the background to today's welcome news. Will you assure us that every effort will be made to fast-track the Bill that will be put before Parliament? It will receive all-party support and we do not want that Bill, which will extend the commissioner's powers, to be lost in the event of an early general election. I hope that you will take this up vigorously with the Secretary of State for Wales.

I congratulate all those involved in the appointment process. The young people's involvement was innovative and, for those of us who have been involved in public appointments, it was a refreshing change to see how effective such innovation can be. Reference has been made to all-party working. It was valuable, on an issue that raised such public concern and had such cross-party consensus, that the most open and accessible method was used to fill this important post. I add my congratulations to the Minister for Health and Social Services. It was her leadership throughout the process

ran bwysig yn y penodiad hwn. Yr oedd gennyf lawer o bryderon ynghylch cynnwys pobl ifanc yn y broses, o ran cyfrinachedd neu safbwynt cyfreithiol, ond yr oedd eu hymddygiad yn onest ac yn broffesiynol. Gallem ddysgu llawer o wersi ganddynt. Diolchaf i'r rheini sydd yn cyfrif: y plant a'r bobl ifanc y cyfeiriais atynt a'r bobl ifanc eraill yng Nghymru fydd yn elwa o gael Peter Clarke yn gomisiynydd plant ardderchog.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Er nad oeddwn yn bresennol yn y cyfweiliadau, deallaf nad y cyfweiliadau eu hunain yn unig oedd yn arbennig ynglŷn â chyfranogiad y plant, ond y chwarae rôl wrth gyflwyno cwynion y gellid eu cyfeirio at y comisiynydd plant annibynnol. Yn y pen draw, etholasant ddau o'u plith i gymryd rhan ym mhroses ffurfiol cam terfynol y cyfweiliadau ddydd Llun yr wythnos hon. Yr oedd y broses honno yn arloesol ond mae wedi nodi llwybr a gallwn ddefnyddio'r dull hwnnw mewn penodiadau sector cyhoeddus eraill.

**David Melding:** Mae'r canlyniad hwn yn gyflawniad mawr i'r Cynulliad ond deilliodd o'r methiant llwyr i ofalu yn ddiogel a digonol am blant diamddiffyn. Dyna'r cefndir i'r newyddion calonogol heddiw. A sicrhewch y gwneir pob ymdrech i ddefnyddio'r dull carlam ar gyfer y Mesur a gaiff ei roi gerbron y Senedd? Caiff gefnogaeth pob plaid ac nid ydym am i'r Mesur, a fydd yn ymestyn pwerau'r comisiynydd, fynd ar goll os cynhelir etholiad cyffredinol cynnar. Gobeithio y byddwch yn ymdrin â hyn yn fanwl gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru.

Llongyfarchaf bawb a gymerodd ran yn y broses benodi. Yr oedd cyfranogiad y bobl ifanc yn arloesol ac, ar gyfer y rheini ohonom sydd wedi cymryd rhan mewn penodiadau cyhoeddus, yr oedd yn newid braf i weld pa mor effeithiol y gall natur arloesol o'r fath fod. Cyfeiriwyd at yr holl bleidiau'n cydweithio. Yr oedd yn werthfawr, wrth ymdrin â mater a gododd cymaint o bryder cyhoeddus ac a oedd â chonsensws cwbl drawsbleidiol, mai'r dull mwyaf agored a hygyrch a ddefnyddiwyd i lenwi'r swydd bwysig hon. Ychwanegaf fy llongyfarchiadau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau

that achieved this result so quickly and soundly. We often attack the Executive but, today, I pay tribute to Jane Hutt.

To conclude, I warmly endorse Peter Clarke's appointment and I wish him every success for the future. However, his appointment does not solve the problem, it merely responds to it. There is a great body of work that he must deliver, to ensure that the public services that children receive are effective and safe.

**The First Minister:** I agree with every word that you said. You made two important points. First, in politics, parties are sometimes at each other's throats, with one against the other or with the opposition versus the Government in the Assembly, for example. There are other times, which are frequently sad, as with the decease of Donald Dewar, when we come together because we are all politicians. This situation is a strange mixture. It is sad because it is only because of the physical and sexual abuse in north Wales, in Gwynedd and Clwyd, over a 20-year period that Waterhouse was appointed. However, today is also a time for celebration. Our response to the sad events of those years means that we have come together across the parties, involving people outside the political process, to enable this appointment to be announced today. It has also enabled the announcement of the Bill, which, if it goes through, will extend the powers of the person appointed.

In a Parliamentary year that may last less than half a normal Parliamentary year there is a premium on short, sharp Bills that have full party support. I hope that those two aspects of the independent Children's Commissioner Bill—that it has support across the Assembly and that it has a small number of clauses—may enable it to rise like the cream rising to the top of the milk, and that it will get through, however short the Parliamentary year.

Finally I endorse the warm remarks made on Jane Hutt's leadership on this matter.

Cymdeithasol. Ei harweiniad hi drwy gydol y broses a gyflawnodd y canlyniad hwn mor gyflym a chadarn. Byddwn yn aml yn ymosod ar y Weithrediaeth ond, heddiw, talaf deyrnged i Jane Hutt.

I orffen, cymeradwyaf benodiad Peter Clarke yn gynnes a dymunaf bob llwyddiant iddo yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw ei benodiad yn datrys y broblem, dim ond ymateb iddi a wna. Rhaid iddo gyflawni corff mawr o waith, i sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus y mae plant yn eu derbyn yn effeithiol ac yn ddiogel.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf â phob gair a ddywedaso. Gwnaethoch ddau bwynt pwysig. Yn gyntaf, mewn gwleidyddiaeth, weithiau mae'r pleidiau yng ngyddfau'i gilydd, gydag un yn erbyn y llall neu gyda'r wrthblaid yn erbyn y Llywodraeth yn y Cynulliad, er enghraifft. Mae adegau eraill, sydd yn drist yn aml, fel gyda marwolaeth Donald Dewar, pan ddown ynghyd oherwydd ein bod i gyd yn wleidyddion. Mae'r sefyllfa yn gymysgedd od. Mae'n drist oherwydd dim ond o achos y cam-drin corfforol a rhywiol yng ngogledd Cymru, yng Ngwynedd a Chlwyd, dros gyfnod o 20 mlynedd, y cafodd Waterhouse ei benodi. Fodd bynnag, mae heddiw yn amser i ddathlu hefyd. Golyga ein hymateb i ddigwyddiadau trist y blynyddoedd hynny ein bod wedi dod ynghyd ar draws y pleidiau, i alluogi i'r penodiad hwn gael ei gyhoeddi heddiw. Mae hefyd wedi galluogi i'r Mesur gael ei gyhoeddi, a fydd, os caiff ei dderbyn, yn ymestyn pwerau'r person a benodwyd.

Mewn blwyddyn Seneddol a allai barhau am lai na hanner blwyddyn Seneddol arferol ceir premiwm ar Fesurau byr, bachog sydd â chefnogaeth pob plaid. Gobeithio y gall y ddwy agwedd hon ar Fesur y Comisiynydd Plant—y caiff ei gefnogi ar draws y Cynulliad a bod iddo nifer fechan o gymalau—alluogi iddo godi fel hufen i frig y llaeth, ac y bydd yn llwyddiannus, pa bynnag mor fyr yw'r flwyddyn Seneddol.

Yn olaf, cymeradwyaf y sylwadau cynnes a wnaethpwyd ar arweinyddiaeth Jane Hutt ar y mater hwn.

**Rod Richards:** It goes without saying that I also welcome the First Minister's statement today. I wish the new commissioner well. I want to bring some words of caution into the self-congratulations and remind Members that this is not the end of the road. This is the beginning, and hopefully the beginning of the end of child abuse in north Wales. I hope that all Members will watch what the commissioner does carefully. I am mindful of the appointment of a drugs tsar some two years ago. I cannot remember his name because I have not heard of him since. I hope that Members will pay close attention to what the children's commissioner does.

Finally, child abuse continues in some parts of Wales unabated. I must tell the Assembly that I am getting reports already of systematic child abuse occurring in Flintshire. Perhaps the newly-appointed Children's Commissioner for Wales would like to look first at what is happening in Flintshire.

**The First Minister:** You will obviously report those matters, or will have done so, to the statutory agencies that would deal with them—the police or the local authorities. However, the purpose of an independent children's commissioner is different to that of a drugs tsar. The drugs tsar is a civil servant. This commissioner is much more than a civil servant: he is part of the redress system and is there to respond independently to children's allegations of abuse or bullying, or any other aspect of lost rights of children that they cannot get through the normal procedure. It may be that the authorities themselves—as has occasionally happened—are perpetrating the abuse. Therefore there must be a way of getting around the authorities, if they are silent or participating in the abuse.

Any particular allegations of continuing child abuse—I am sure that we are not so naïve as to think that we can abolish it—must be brought before the proper quarters. It would not be right to expect Peter Clarke to deal with these allegations while he is serving out his notice with his present employer. If Rod supplies the details to the proper quarters,

**Rod Richards:** Mae'n amlwg fy mod innau hefyd yn croesawu datganiad Prif Weinidog Cymru heddiw. Dymunaf yn dda i'r comisiynydd newydd. Yr wyf am gynnwys rhai geiriau o bwyll i'r hunanlongyfarchiadau ac atgoffa'r Aelodau nad dyma'r diwedd. Megis dechrau yw hyn, a gobeithio y bydd yn ddechrau diwedd cam-drin plant yng ngogledd Cymru. Gobeithio y bydd yr holl Aelodau yn gwylio'r hyn a wna'r comisiynydd yn ofalus. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol i tsar cyffuriau gael ei benodi tua dwy flynedd yn ôl. Ni allaf gofio ei enw oherwydd nid wyf wedi clywed amdano ers hynny. Gobeithio y cymer yr Aelodau sylw manwl o'r hyn a wna'r comisiynydd plant.

Yn olaf, mae cam-drin plant yn parhau mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru yn ddi-baid. Rhaid i mi ddweud wrth y Cynulliad fy mod eisoes yn cael adroddiadau o gam-drin plant systematig yn digwydd yn Sir y Fflint. Efallai yr hoffai Comisiynydd Plant newydd Cymru edrych ar yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yn Sir y Fflint i ddechrau.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n amlwg y byddwch yn cyflwyno adroddiadau ar y materion hynny, neu y byddwch wedi gwneud hynny, i'r asiantaethau statudol a fyddai'n ymdrin â hwy—yr heddlu neu'r awdurdodau lleol. Fodd bynnag, mae pwrpas comisiynydd plant annibynnol yn wahanol i tsar cyffuriau. Mae'r tsar cyffuriau yn was sifil. Mae'r comisiynydd hwn yn llawer mwy na gwas sifil: mae'n rhan o'r system unioni ac mae yno i ymateb yn annibynnol i honiadau plant o gam-drin neu fwlio, neu unrhyw agwedd arall ar hawliau plant a gollwyd na allant ei chael drwy'r weithdrefn arferol. Efallai mai'r awdurdodau eu hunain—fel sydd wedi digwydd ar adegau—sydd yn gyfrifol am y cam-drin. Felly rhaid bod ffordd o fynd heibio i'r awdurdodau, os ydynt yn dawel neu'n cymryd rhan yn y cam-drin.

Rhaid rhoi unrhyw honiadau penodol o gam-drin plant sydd yn parhau—yr wyf yn siwr nad ydym mor ddiniwed â meddwl y gallwn ei ddileu—gerbron y manau cywir. Ni fyddai'n briodol disgwyl i Peter Clarke ymdrin â'r honiadau hyn tra'n gweithio hyd ddiwedd cyfnod ei rybudd gyda'i gyflogwr presennol. Os bydd Rod yn darparu'r

they will be dealt with in the proper way.

manyllion i'r manau cywir, cânt eu trin yn y ffordd gywir.

### **Derbyn Cyllideb y Cynulliad: Parhad o'r Ddadl Adoption of the Assembly's Budget: Continuation of the Debate**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We now return to the debate on the budget. I am to call a speaker from the Government, but none of those who indicated that they wished to speak on behalf of the Government are in the Chamber. Does any other Government supporter wish to speak at this stage? No. In that case, I call Phil Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dychwelwn yn awr at y dadl ar y gyllideb. Yr wyf i fod i alw ar lefarydd o'r Llywodraeth, ond nid oes un o'r rhai a nododd eu bod yn dymuno siarad ar ran y Llywodraeth yn y Siambr. A oes unrhyw un arall o gefnogwyr y Llywodraeth yn dymuno siarad ar yr adeg hon? Nac oes. Felly, galwaf ar Phil Williams.

**Phil Williams:** I only wish that I were a Government speaker.

**Phil Williams:** Trueni nad wyf yn un o lefarwyr y Llywodraeth.

In the latest issue of *Agenda*, Edwina referred to me, in the nicest possible way, as an anorak. It is true that when I cycle to the Assembly I wear an anorak. Other people call me a rocket scientist, which is true also, but—if I can speak up for rocket scientists—at least we get our sums right. Sometimes the sums matter. The sums in this budget tell us whether we will get proper treatment in hospital, whether the children of Wales will get a good education, and how much council tax we will pay.

Yn y rhifyn diweddaraf o *Agenda*, cyfeiriodd Edwina ataf, yn y ffordd fwyaf caredig fel anorac. Mae'n wir dweud fy mod yn gwisgo anorac wrth seiclo i'r Cynulliad. Fe'm gelwir gan bobl eraill yn wyddonydd roced, sydd hefyd yn wir, ond—os gallaf siarad o blaid gwyddonwyr—o leiaf cawn ein symiau yn gywir. Weithiau mae'r symiau yn cyfrif. Dywed y symiau yn y gyllideb hon wrthym a gawn y driniaeth briodol yn yr ysbyty, a gaiff plant Cymru addysg dda, a faint o'r dreth gyngor y byddwn yn ei thalu.

10:45 a.m.

There is more money in the budget now, and, after 21 years of Tory cuts, I celebrate that. However, I am old enough to remember the 1955 election, when the Tories boasted that there were more television sets than in 1951. On Waun Pound, I heard Aneurin Bevan's response, 'It would be very funny if there were fewer'. Following the pre-election spending review, we will have more money, but how much more? We should notice one issue, and if politicians fail to notice, the people of Wales will eventually notice it. If we subtract the European grants we expect to allocate and the public sector match funding from our budget, the rise in public expenditure in Wales will be at a slower rate than in England. As a result, the percentage increase in our health and education budgets will be at a lower rate. Ieuan referred in detail to the widening gap in education spending. I declare an interest as a part-time professor.

Mae mwy o arian yn y gyllideb yn awr, ac, ar ôl 21 mlynedd o doriadau gan y Torïaid, dathlaf y ffaith honno. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ddigon hen i gofio etholiad 1955, pan ymffrostiodd y Torïaid fod mwy o setiau teledu nag yr oedd yn 1951. Ar Waun Pound, clywais ymateb Aneurin Bevan, 'It would be very funny if there were fewer'. Yn dilyn yr adolygiad o wariant cyn yr etholiad, bydd gennym fwy o arian, ond faint yn fwy? Dylem sylwi ar un mater, ac os metha'r gwleidyddion â sylwi, bydd pobl Cymru yn sylwi yn y pen draw. Os tynnwn y grantiau Ewropeaidd y disgwyliwn eu dyrannu ac arian cyfatebol y sector cyhoeddus o'n cyllideb, bydd y cynnydd yn y gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ar gyfradd arafach na Lloegr. O ganlyniad, bydd y cynnydd canrannol yn ein cyllidebau iechyd ac addysg ar gyfradd is. Cyfeiriodd Ieuan yn fanwl at y bwlch sydd yn ehangu yn y gwariant ar

Yesterday morning, I visited the Cardiff University, and met other rocket scientists. They get their sums right. They told me that they have read these figures and seen that funding for universities in Wales, rising at less than 4 per cent per year—just over the level of inflation—will mean that spending on universities in Wales will fall further behind the level in England. So much for brave rhetoric about building our future on the knowledge economy.

I declare an interest as someone who pays council taxes in Cardiff and Ceredigion. We know that council tax in Monmouthshire, Blaenau Gwent, Merthyr Tydfil and Ceredigion will be increased by about 9 per cent next year. That is because Edwina will only allocate £3.9 million for the local government damping grant from the £233 million of underspend. We proposed a damping grant of £11 million. Compared with £233 million, that is very little. I want to concentrate on that £233 million underspend. Edwina tells us that the money has been allocated in part and the papers state how some of it has been allocated. However, we heard the same thing last year when the total was only £180 million. This seems to be from the *Mabinogi*. Edwina, do you have a magic money machine on the fifth floor? You start with £180 million, you allocate it, and then, at the end of the year, you have £233 million. Or could it be that the Treasury allows you to allocate this money as long as you do not actually spend it. I am not making a frivolous point because I am not the only suspicious person. Will Hutton made the same point in *The Observer* last weekend. The underspend is money that was designated to normal expenditure and could, and should have been used for health, education and local government.

I agree, and Edwina has said, that it is prudent to keep a reserve for contingencies such as the meningitis outbreak last year, but do we need £233 million? If we are keeping this money for a rainy day, someone should point out that it has hardly stopped raining for months, and some of the rain is coming through the school roof. We debated the

addysg. Datganaf fuddiant fel athro coleg rhan amser. Fore ddoe, ymwelais â Phrifysgol Caerdydd, gan gyfarfod â gwyddonwyr roced eraill. Cânt hwy eu symiau'n gywir. Dywedasant wrthyf eu bod wedi darllen y ffigurau hyn ac wedi gweld y bydd yr arian hwnnw ar gyfer prifysgolion yng Nghymru, sydd yn codi ar lai na 4 y cant y flwyddyn—ychydig dros lefel chwyddiant—yn golygu y bydd gwariant ar brifysgolion yng Nghymru yn syrthio'n is na'r lefel yn Lloegr. Wfft i rethreg ddewr am adeiladu ein dyfodol ar yr economi gwybodaeth.

Datganaf fuddiant fel rhywun sydd yn talu trethi cyngor yng Nghaerdydd a Cheredigion. Gwyddom y bydd y dreth gyngor yn Sir Fynwy, Blaenau Gwent, Merthyr Tudful a Cheredigion yn cynyddu tua 9 y cant y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae hynny oherwydd y bydd Edwina ond yn dyrannu £3.9 miliwn ar gyfer grant dampio llywodraeth leol o'r tanwariant o £233 miliwn. Cynigiasom grant dampio o £11 miliwn. O'i gymharu â £233 miliwn, swm bach yw hynny. Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar y £233 miliwn a danwariwyd. Dywed Edwina wrthym fod yr arian wedi ei ddyrannu yn rhannol a noda'r papurau sut y dyrannwyd peth ohono. Fodd bynnag, clywsom yr un peth y llynedd pan oedd y cyfanswm ond yn £180 miliwn. Ymddengys fod hyn yn deillio o'r *Mabinogi*. Edwina, a oes gennyhych beiriant arian hud ar y pumed llawr? Yr ydych yn dechrau gyda £180 miliwn, yn ei ddyrannu, ac yna, ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn, mae gennyhych £233 miliwn. Neu a yw'r Trysorlys yn caniatáu ichi ddyrannu'r arian hwn ar yr amod na chaiff ei wario mewn gwirionedd. Ni wnaf bwynt gwamal gan nad fi yw'r unig berson drwgdybus. Gwnaeth Will Hutton yr un pwynt yn *The Observer* y penwythnos diwethaf. Mae'r tanwario yn arian a neilltuwyd ar gyfer gwariant arferol a gallai, a dylai fod wedi cael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer iechyd, arian a llywodraeth leol.

Cytunaf, ac mae Edwina wedi dweud, ei fod yn ddoeth cadw arian wrth gefn ar gyfer treuliau annisgwyl megis yr achosion o lid yr ymennydd y llynedd, ond a oes angen £233 miliwn arnom? Os ydym yn cadw'r arian hwn ar gyfer diwrnod glawog, dylai rhywun nodi y bu'n glawio'n ddibaid bron ers misoedd, a daw peth o'r glaw i mewn drwy

private finance initiative on Tuesday. With £233 million in reserve, why do we need PFI? I ask a question and I will answer it. Mike German explained this in the Economic Development Committee and if one reads the small print, it is made clear. When the Economic Development Committee—and I think it was Ron Davies—asked how we would pay the grants for all worthwhile Objective 1 projects that went beyond the budget allocated in the spending review, Mike was honest and said that the grants would be paid out of reserve. This financial year—if you look at the papers—we will have about £65 million of the reserve allocated to economic development. That is because we are likely to spend almost £80 million this year on European grants. The Treasury will draw down every penny of that money from Europe, but Gordon Brown is only passing on £21 million via the Department for Education and Employment. The shortfall has been taken out of last year's underspend. There is a danger of oversimplifying this, but it can be compared with the £46 million underspend on health last year. We are taking money from normal budgets to bail out Objective 1.

If you look at the spreadsheets, you will see that over £60 million has been specifically allocated to match funding this year. All of that has been taken out of the normal budget. You can spin these figures as much as you like, but in the end, numbers are unforgiving. The same Labour Chancellor, Gordon Brown, who has pursued a monetary and fiscal policy that is destroying large sectors of Welsh manufacturing industry to meet the problems of the south of England, has given us a settlement, which in comparison with the UK as a whole, is disappointing. Edwina has done her best within that constraint, and I acknowledge that and the consultations that have taken place. However, I want to end with a point—and I have made it often—but I have to make it again. Unless we can get an assurance that all grants drawn down from Europe for projects in Wales—

**Huw Lewis:** Does Plaid Cymru believe in a magic money machine, in fact a *milch* cow, which is Britain? Do you not agree that this

do'r ysgol. Buom yn dadlau am y fenter cyllid preifat ddydd Mawrth. Gyda £233 miliwn wrth gefn, pam bod angen y fenter cyllid preifat arnom? Gofynnaf gwestiwn ac fe'i atebaf. Eglurodd Mike German hyn yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ac os darllenwch y print mân, daw yn eglur. Pan ofynnodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd—a chredaf mai Ron Davies ydoedd—sut y byddem yn talu'r grantiau am bob prosiect gwerth chweil Amcan 1 a âi y tu hwnt i'r gyllideb a ddyrannwyd yn yr adolygiad o wariant, yr oedd Mike yn onest a dywedodd y telid y grantiau o'r gronfa wrth gefn. Y flwyddyn ariannol hon—os edrychwch ar y papurau—bydd tua £65 miliwn o'r gronfa wrth gefn wedi ei ddyrannu i ddatblygu economaidd. Mae hynny am ein bod yn debygol o wario bron £80 miliwn eleni ar grantiau Ewropeaidd. Bydd y Trysorlys yn codi pob ceiniog o'r arian hwnnw o Ewrop, ond dim ond £21 miliwn y mae Gordon Brown yn ei drosglwyddo drwy'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth. Tynnwyd y diffyg o danwariant y llynedd. Mae perygl inni orsymleiddio hyn, ond gellir ei gymharu â'r £46 miliwn a danwariwyd ar iechyd y llynedd. Cymerwn arian o gyllidebau arferol i achub Amcan 1.

Os edrychwch ar y taenlenni, fe welwch fod dros £60 miliwn wedi ei ddyrannu'n benodol i arian cyfatebol eleni. Tynnwyd hynny i gyd o'r gyllideb arferol. Gallwch ddatblygu'r ffigurau hyn gymaint ag y dymunwch, ond yn y pen draw, mae'r rhifau'n anfaddeugar. Mae'r un Canghellor Llafur, Gordon Brown, a ddilynodd bolisi ariannol sydd yn dinistrio sectorau helaeth o ddiwydiant gweithgynhyrchu Cymru i ddatrys problemau de Lloegr, wedi rhoi setliad inni, sydd, o'i gymharu â'r DU yn gyffredinol, yn siomedig. Gwnaeth Edwina ei gorau o fewn y cyfyngiad hwnnw, a chydabyddaf hynny a'r ymgynghoriadau a gynhaliwyd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am orffen gyda phwynt—ac yr wyf wedi ei wneud yn aml—ond rhaid imi ei wneud eto. Os na allwn gael sicrwydd fod pob grant a ddaw o Ewrop a ddefnyddir ar gyfer prosiectau yng Nghymru—

**Huw Lewis:** A yw Plaid Cymru yn credu mewn peiriant arian hud, buwch odro mewn gwirionedd, sef Prydain? Oni chytunwch fod

budget, like previous years' budgets, represents a manifest of redistribution of wealth from other parts of the United Kingdom to Wales? When Wales leaves the United Kingdom, how will you fill the £5 billion funding gap, with which you will be faced?

**Phil Williams:** I enjoy Huw's interventions. I would not miss them for the world. The point is that the £5 billion gap was a total myth. There is a book on the Welsh budget written by a man named Phil Williams. I advise you to read it and discover from where that myth came. The fact remains, and it is never disputed, if you cover all elements of Government expenditure, Government expenditure per head in Wales is slightly below the UK average. That is the position. Unless the money from Europe is handed down 100 per cent, and unless we have the increase in public sector match funding, the disappointment will continue to grow until by 2003, it will be universal. I choose my date carefully. Tony Blair said that he would not let Wales down. This budget is his answer.

**Delyth Evans:** Phil mentioned rocket scientists. He is a rocket scientist in Aberystwyth. He also said that numbers are unforgiving. I am not a rocket scientist and numbers may be unforgiving, but they are also entirely open to interpretation. As someone who worked as a researcher for the Labour Party in opposition, I know how easy it is to juggle figures and back up a point of view that one wants to put forward. Let us not be too worried about the figures. I am not a rocket scientist, but I travel around the country and talk to people on the ground, as do others in this Chamber.

When I visit schools and hospitals and attend committees, such as the Mid Wales Regional Committee meeting in Bala last week with the Dyfed Powys Health Authority, I hear good news about the extra money that is being provided to fund public services in Wales. I have not visited any schools that have not said how pleased they are about the extra money that has been provided by the Labour Government and the Assembly. We can ask for more money, and everybody wants to see more money in every one of our

y gyllideb hon, fel cyllidebau blynyddoedd blaenorol, yn cynrychioli manifest o ailddosbarthu cyfoeth o rannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig i Gymru? Pan fydd Cymru'n gadael y Deyrnas Unedig, sut y byddwch yn llenwi'r bwlch ariannu o £5 biliwn, a fydd yn eich wynebu?

**Phil Williams:** Mwynhaf ymyriadau Huw. Ni fyddwn yn eu colli ar unrhyw gyfrif. Myth llwyr yw'r bwlch o £5 biliwn. Mae llyfr ar gael ar gyllideb Cymru a ysgrifennwyd gan ddyn o'r enw Phil Williams. Fe'ch cynghoraf i'w ddarllen a darganfod o ble y daeth y myth hwnnw. Erys y ffaith, ac ni fydd byth dadlau yn ei chylch, os cwmpaswch bob elfen o wariant y Llywodraeth, mae gwariant y Llywodraeth y pen yng Nghymru ychydig yn is na chyfartaledd y DU. Dyna'r sefyllfa. Oni throsglwyddir yr arian o Ewrop 100 y cant, ac oni chawn y cynnydd yn arian cyfatebol y sector cyhoeddus, bydd y siom yn parhau i gynyddu ac erbyn 2003, bydd yn siom i bawb. Dewisais fy nyddiad yn ofalus. Dywedodd Tony Blair na fyddai'n siomi Cymru. Y gyllideb hon yw ei ateb.

**Delyth Evans:** Soniodd Phil am wyddonwyr o fri. Mae ef yn wyddonydd roced yn Aberystwyth. Dywedodd hefyd fod y ffigurau yn anfaddeugar. Nid wyf yn wyddonydd roced ac efallai bod y ffigurau yn anfaddeugar, ond maent hefyd yn gyfan gwbl agored i ddehongliad. Fel rhywun sydd wedi gweithio fel ymchwilydd i'r Blaid Lafur yn yr wrthblaid, gwn pa mor hawdd yw jyglo ffigurau ac ategu safbwynt y mae rhywun am ei gyflwyno. Ni ddylem ofidio gormod am y ffigurau. Nid wyf yn wyddonydd roced, ond teithiaf o amgylch y wlad gan siarad â phobl ar lawr gwlad, fel y gwna eraill yn y Siambr hon.

Pan ymwelaf ag ysgolion ac ysbytai a mynychu pwyllgorau, megis cyfarfod Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Canolbarth yn y Bala yr wythnos diwethaf gydag Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys, clywaf newyddion da am yr arian ychwanegol a ddarperir i ariannu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae pob ysgol yr ymwelais â hi wedi dweud wrthyf pa mor falch ydynt bod arian ychwanegol wedi ei ddarparu gan Lywodraeth Lafur a'r Cynulliad. Gallwn ofyn am ragor o arian, ac mae pawb am weld mwy

public services. However, the truth is that there is more money going into the system. Anybody who was at the meeting in Bala last Friday will know about the positive feeling in the NHS in Wales—particularly in Dyfed Powys—that things are getting better as a result of the additional resources. We should be focusing on that, and not on whether more money should be going into forestry. Of course there should be more money going into forestry and every one of our public spending commitments. However, the reality is that there is a limit to the money available. The truth is that, overall, there is more money going into funding public services in Wales under this Labour Government, and everyone in this Chamber should welcome that improvement in the condition of the lives of people across Wales.

**David Davies:** On integrated transport, we heard a fine sermon from the Minister about the importance of putting more money back into an integrated transport scheme, the importance of the environment and so on. I was surprised when I looked at the budget that the amount of money that has been set aside for the freight facilities grant has been cut by huge amounts. That grant ensures that companies wishing to switch their freight deliveries from the roads to the railways are given adequate compensation. This excellent scheme promotes the use of the railways for freight deliveries, which is something that this Government claims to support. However, even though the Government has raised numerous taxes on motor cars, it has cut the money available for the move from road to rail. That is why the Minister should explain how much substance there is in her claim of supporting a greener environment.

10:55a.m.

On the health service, Delyth Evans admirably admitted how easy it is to fiddle and juggle figures if you are a Labour Party researcher. We hear that the health service will receive extra money. As Delyth knows perfectly well, every Government has invested extra money in the health service.

o arian ym mhob un o'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, y gwir yw bod mwy o arian yn mynd i mewn i'r system. Bydd unrhyw un a oedd yn y cyfarfod yn y Bala ddydd Gwener diwethaf yn ymwybodol o'r teimlad cadarnhaol sydd yn yr NHS yng Nghymru—yn arbennig yn Nyfed Powys—bod pethau'n gwella o ganlyniad i'r adnoddau ychwanegol. Dylem fod yn canolbwyntio ar hynny, ac nid ar pa un a ddylai rhagor o arian fod yn cael ei wario ar goedwigaeth. Wrth gwrs, dylai mwy o arian gael ei wario ar goedwigaeth ac ar bob un o'n hymrwymiaidau gwariant cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, y realiti yw bod terfyn i'r arian sydd ar gael. Y gwir yw, yn gyffredinol, y defnyddir mwy o arian i ariannu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru o dan y Llywodraeth Lafur hon, a dylai pawb yn y Siambr hon groesawu'r gwelliant hwnnw yng nghyflwr bywydau pobl ledled Cymru.

**David Davies:** Ar drafnidiaeth integredig, clywsom bregeth dda gan y Gweinidog ar bwysigrwydd rhoi mwy o arian yn ôl i mewn i gynllun trafndiaeth integredig, pwysigrwydd yr amgylchedd ac yn y blaen. Synnais pan edrychais ar y gyllideb fod swm yr arian a neilltuwyd ar gyfer y grant cyfleusterau cludo nwyddau wedi ei dorri'n sylweddol. Mae'r grant hwnnw yn sicrhau y caiff cwmnïau sydd yn dymuno newid o gludo nwyddau ar y ffyrdd i'w cludo ar y rheilffyrdd iawndal digonol. Mae'r cynllun rhagorol hwn yn hyrwyddo'r defnydd o'r rheilffyrdd ar gyfer cludo nwyddau, sydd yn rhywbeth yr honna'r Llywodraeth hon ei bod yn ei gefnogi. Fodd bynnag, er bod y Llywodraeth wedi codi trethi niferus ar geir modur, mae wedi torri'r arian sydd ar gael i symud o'r ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd. Dyna pam y dylai'r Gweinidog egluro faint o sylwedd sydd yn ei honiad ei bod yn cefnogi amgylchedd gwyrddach.

Ar y gwasanaeth iechyd, cyfaddefodd Delyth Evans yn rhyfeddol pa mor hawdd yw ffugio a jyglo ffigurau os ydych yn ymchwilydd i'r Blaid Lafur. Clywn y caiff y gwasanaeth iechyd arian ychwanegol. Fel y gŵyr Delyth yn iawn, mae pob Llywodraeth wedi buddsoddi arian ychwanegol yn y



The Conservative Party allocated extra money to the health service during every year of the last Government. Since Labour took office, it has invested more money, but waiting lists have increased because it has not reached patients. I hope that money will filter through to Monmouthshire to establish a flagship scheme to bring the local health service and social services under one roof to provide health care for people in this rural area. This is a flagship model that could be copied throughout Wales. It is a scheme that has great support, but it is being delayed because the health authority cannot meet the relatively small extra cost of its provision. Therefore, I hope that the Minister can assure us that any extra money for the health service will filter through, so that bodies such as Gwent Health Authority can implement such schemes.

I am concerned about the situation in rural areas. I hope that money will be available for an agricultural ombudsman to start working as soon as possible. I am dealing with the case of two farmers, Mr and Mrs Davies. Their farm was flooded a while ago and, during that time, they failed to fill in a form for a cow premium scheme correctly. As a result, the National Assembly's Agriculture Department fined them £10,000. That is an atrocity. I can think of very few words to describe the feeling of being faced with two people whose home was flooded and who were then fined £10,000 because they had ticked some boxes incorrectly. I hope that the money for rural areas in the budget will ensure that an ombudsman will be appointed to rectify such atrocities.

Finally, I endorse the comments of my colleague, Nicholas Bourne, about the disgraceful state of council tax, particularly in some areas. Monmouthshire has experienced one rise after another. It was raised by 20 per cent last year, and will be raised by 9 or 10 per cent this year, simply because the Assembly has not set aside money for local government. This cannot continue. If the Assembly cannot obtain more money from central Government, we should be making better use of what we have.

gwasanaeth iechyd. Dyrannodd y Blaid Geidwadol arian ychwanegol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd ym mhob un o flynyddoedd y Llywodraeth flaenorol. Ers i Lafur ddod i rym, buddsoddodd mwy o arian, ond cynyddodd y rhestrau aros gan nad yw wedi cyrraedd y cleifion. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr arian yn cyrraedd Sir Fynwy i sefydlu prif gynllun i ddwyn y gwasanaeth iechyd lleol a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ynghyd o dan un to i ddarparu gofal iechyd i bobl yn yr ardal wledig hon. Mae hwn yn brif fodel y gellid ei efelychu ledled Cymru. Mae'n gynllun a gefnogir yn fawr, ond mae oedi gan na all yr awdurdod iechyd dalu'r gost ychwanegol gymharol fach o'i ddarparu. Felly, gobeithiaf y gall y Gweinidog ein sicrhau y bydd unrhyw arian ychwanegol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd yn treiddio drwodd, fel y gall cyrff fel Awdurdod Iechyd Gwent weithredu cynlluniau o'r fath.

Pryderaf am y sefyllfa mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr arian hwnnw ar gael i alluogi ombwdsmon amaethyddol i ddechrau gweithio cyn gynted â phosibl. Yr wyf yn delio ag achos dau ffermwr, Mr a Mrs Davies. Dioddefodd eu fferm lifogydd beth amser yn ôl ac yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, ni wnaethant gwblhau'r ffurflen ar gyfer cynllun premiwm gwartheg yn gywir. O ganlyniad, cawsant ddirwy o £10,000 gan Adran Amaethyddol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae hynny'n warthus. Ni allaf feddwl am lawer o eiriau i ddisgrifio'r teimlad o ddod wyneb yn wyneb â dau berson a ddioddefodd lifogydd yn eu cartref ac a gafodd ddirwy wedyn o £10,000 am eu bod wedi ticio rhai blychau yn anghywir. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr arian ar gyfer ardaloedd gwledig yn y gyllideb yn sicrhau y penodir ombwdsmon i unioni erchyllterau o'r fath.

Yn olaf, ategaf sylwadau fy nghyd-Aelod, Nicholas Bourne, ynghylch cyflwr gwarthus y dreth gyngor, yn arbennig mewn rhai ardaloedd. Mae Sir Fynwy wedi profi un codiad ar ôl y llall. Fe'i codwyd 20 y cant y llynedd, ac fe'i codir 9 neu 10 y cant eleni, dim ond am nad yw'r Cynulliad wedi neilltuo arian ar gyfer llywodraeth leol. Ni all hyn barhau. Os na all y Cynulliad gael rhagor o arian gan Lywodraeth ganolog, dylem fod yn gwneud gwell defnydd o'r hyn sydd gennym.

**Brian Gibbons:** It was interesting that Ieuan Wyn Jones did not allow interventions during his contribution. He said that current expenditure is at the same level as when John Major left office. We must remember that part of the expenditure used by John Major was the expenditure of failure. That was at a time when we had massive levels of unemployment and public debt repayments. It is because the Labour Government in London has dealt with unemployment and the level of public debt that we are able to place more money in the hands of benefit claimants. Even though the overall level of public expenditure may not be significantly greater, our problem lies in distributing public expenditure on the basis of the policies of economic success, whereas the previous Government distributed money on the basis of the policies of economic failure. The Labour Government in London is providing more money for people who need extra help.

There has been general agreement that the 6.1 per cent increase in the comprehensive spending review has been one of the most dramatic increases in public expenditure in the history of the British state. However, it would be difficult to deduce that from the contributions of the opposition benches. One could be led to believe that public expenditure has not increased, but has rather decreased into negativity. It is interesting that Members of the opposition party are good at speaking in percentage figures. However, they are not prepared to consider the actual per capita increase. For example, following the comprehensive spending review, the per capita increase in Scotland is £234, whereas in Wales it is £241. Wales is, therefore, doing better on a per capita basis. People want to know how much extra money they will have in their pockets, not what the percentages are.

**Phil Williams:** Do you accept that those amounts include the allocation for European grant and match funding?

**Brian Gibbons:** Certainly, because your party said that we would not receive that money. You and your party have spent the best part of 18 months saying that this money would not be made available. You must now eat humble pie because the Labour Party

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr oedd yn ddiddorol na chaniataodd Ieuan Wyn Jones ymyriadau yn ystod ei gyfraniad. Dywedodd fod gwariant cyfredol ar yr un lefel ag yr oedd pan adawodd John Major ei swydd. Rhaid inni gofio mai gwariant methiant oedd rhan o'r gwariant a ddefnyddiwyd gan John Major. Yr oedd hynny ar adeg pan oedd gennym lefelau uchel iawn o ddiweithdra ac ad-daliadau dyledion cyhoeddus. Yr ydym yn gallu rhoi mwy o arian yn nwylo ceiswyr budd-daliadau am fod y Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain wedi delio â diweithdra a'r lefel o ddyledion cyhoeddus. Er nad yw lefel gyffredinol y gwariant cyhoeddus efallai yn sylweddol uwch, ein problem yw dosbarthu gwariant cyhoeddus ar sail polisïau llwyddiant economaidd, tra dosbarthodd y Llywodraeth flaenorol arian ar sail polisïau methiant economaidd. Mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain yn darparu rhagor o arian i bobl y mae angen cymorth ychwanegol arnynt.

Bu cytundeb cyffredinol y bu'r cynnydd o 6.1 y cant yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn un o'r codiadau mwyaf dramatig mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yn hanes Prydain. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n anodd casglu hynny o gyfraniadau meinciau'r gwrthbleidiau. Gallai hynny ein harwain i gredu nad yw gwariant cyhoeddus wedi cynyddu, ond yn hytrach wedi lleihau i negyddoldeb. Mae'n ddiddorol bod Aelodau'r wrthblaid yn dda am siarad mewn ffigurau canrannol. Fodd bynnag, nid ydynt yn barod i ystyried y cynnydd gwirioneddol y pen. Er enghraifft, yn dilyn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, y cynnydd y pen yn yr Alban yw £234, ond £241 ydyw yng Nghymru. Felly, mae Cymru yn gwneud yn well ar sail y pen. Mae pobl am wybod faint o arian ychwanegol fydd yn eu pocedi, nid beth yw'r canrannau.

**Phil Williams:** A dderbyniwch fod y symiau hynny yn cynnwys y dyraniad ar gyfer grantiau Ewropeaidd ac arian cyfatebol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn sicr, gan fod eich plaid wedi dweud na fyddem yn cael yr arian hwnnw. Treuliasoch chi a'ch plaid y rhan helaethaf o 18 mis yn dweud na fyddai'r arian hwn ar gael. Rhaid ichi yn awr lyncu'ch geiriau gan fod y Blaid Lafur wedi cyflawni

delivered for Wales, time in, time out.

Public expenditure figures per capita in the NHS in Wales have increased at a higher rate than in England or in Scotland. As far as members of the public are concerned, they can see that more money is being spent on public services per capita in Wales. We need some intellectual honesty in the way that these figures are presented. If we continue to talk of percentages, we will misrepresent the actual amount of extra public expenditure in Wales. In looking at the per capita figures, we will see that, following this budget, people in Wales will benefit.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Diolchaf i Edwina am ei datganiad ac am y modd y mae'n cyflwyno ffigurau yn ystod y broses o lunio'r gyllideb. Caniateir inni weld beth sydd yn digwydd, a gwerthfawrogaf y ffaith ei bod yn haws dilyn y broses gyllidebol yn y Cynulliad nag ydyw yn Llundain.

Fel y dywedodd Aelodau Llafur, mae'r gyllideb yn darparu swm ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf sydd yn fwy na'r hyn a gawsom yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, a chroesawn hynny. Fodd bynnag, pam y bu'n rhaid inni aros cyhyd yn ystod cyfnod y Llywodraeth Lafur hon cyn derbyn y cynnydd angenrheidiol hwn ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru?

**Huw Lewis** *rose*—

**Dafydd Wigley:** Cyfanswm y cynnydd yw £469 miliwn, ar ôl tynnu allan y newid yn y gyfundrefn cyfrifo. Mae'r cynnydd yn werthfawr, ond nid yw'n adlewyrchu'r ffigurau'n gywir, gan y bydd gwariant yn cynyddu o tua £8,000 miliwn i £9,600 miliwn. Dylid ystyried hynny.

**Huw Lewis:** It is difficult to know how many times the Government in this Chamber must repeat the fact that it spent the first two years in office slashing unemployment and public debt. Efforts were targeted at those areas, and it is only because of that effort that we have been presented with a budget that represents an almost 30 per cent increase in public expenditure from the Assembly alone. That does not include public expenditure that will be provided through other avenues to benefit

ei haddewidion i Gymru, dro ar ôl tro.

Cynyddodd ffigurau gwariant cyhoeddus y pen yn yr NHS yng Nghymru ar gyfradd uwch nag yn Lloegr neu'r Alban. O ran y cyhoedd, gallant weld y caiff mwy o arian ei wario ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus y pen yng Nghymru. Mae angen rhywfaint o onestrwydd deallusol arnom yn y ffordd y cyflwynir y ffigurau hyn. Os parhawn i siarad am ganrannau, byddwn yn camgynrychioli swm gwirioneddol y gwariant cyhoeddus ychwanegol yng Nghymru. Wrth edrych ar y ffigurau y pen, fe welwn, yn dilyn y gyllideb hon, y bydd pobl yng Nghymru ar eu hennill.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I thank Edwina for her statement and for the way in which she presents figures during the process of drawing up the budget. We are allowed to see what is happening, and I appreciate the fact that it is easier to follow the budgetary process in the Assembly than it is in London.

As Labour Members said, the budget provides an increase this year on that received during the past two years, which we welcome. However, why have we had to wait for so long during this Labour Government's term in office to receive this necessary increase for public services in Wales?

**Huw Lewis** *a gododd*—

**Dafydd Wigley:** The total increase amounts to £469 million, after subtracting the change in the accounting system. The increase is worthwhile, but the figures are not accurately reflected, because spending will increase from about £8,000 million to £9,600 million. That should be taken into consideration.

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'n anodd gwybod sawl gwaith mae'r Llywodraeth yn y Siambr hon wedi ailadrodd y ffaith iddi dreulio'r ddwy flynedd gyntaf mewn grym yn lleihau diweithdra a dyled gyhoeddus. Targedwyd ymdrechion tuag at y meysydd hynny, a dim ond oherwydd yr ymdrech honno y cawsom ein cyflwyno â chyllideb sydd yn cynrychioli cynnydd o bron 30 y cant mewn gwariant cyhoeddus o'r Cynulliad yn unig. Nid yw hynny'n cynnwys gwariant cyhoeddus a

the people of Wales. How on earth could a Plaid Cymru administration in a self-governing Wales have even hoped in its wildest dreams to have redistributed wealth and opportunity on this kind of scale?

ddarperir drwy ffyrdd eraill i fod o fudd i bobl Cymru. Sut ar wyneb y ddaear y gallai gweinyddiaeth Plaid Cymru mewn Cymru hunanlywodraethol erioed fod wedi gallu breuddwydio y byddai wedi ailddosbarthu cyfoeth a chyfle ar raddfa fel hon?

11:05 a.m.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Pe bai'r cynnydd yn 30 y cant, byddwn yn croesawu hynny. Fodd bynnag ni chawsom gynnydd o 30 y cant ar gyfer y flwyddyn dan sylw. Derbyniaf fod llywodraeth newydd, yn ystod ei blwyddyn gyntaf, yn gaeth i'r gyllideb a drosglwyddwyd o'r llywodraeth flaenorol. Fodd bynnag, erbyn dechrau'r flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, bydd y Llywodraeth Lafur wedi bod mewn grym am bedair blynedd, sef y cyfnod yr ydym wedi gorfod disgwyl i weld gweithredu. Yr wyf, wrth gwrs, yn croesawu'r gostyngiad yn nifer y di-waith, er bod rhai ardaloedd yng Nghymru yn dal i ddioddef diweithdra uchel a'r tlodi a ddaw yn sgîl hynny. Dyna, o bosibl, sydd yn fy mhoeni fwyaf am y gyllideb hon: a ydym yn gwneud digon o fewn ein gallu fel Cynulliad i ymosod ar dlodi? Mae tlodi eithafol yn rhai o'r hen gymoedd diwydiannol ac mewn ardaloedd yng nghefn gwlad, yn hen ardaloedd y chwareli llechi a'r ardaloedd glofaol, a rhaid inni ymosod arno. Yng nghyllideb Iwerddon, a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos hon, cynyddwyd y trothwy ar gyfer talu treth incwm i £7,000. Felly, ni fydd yn rhaid i 38 y cant o'r gweithlu dalu treth incwm. Hoffwn weld y Canghellor yn cyflwyno polisi o'r fath ym Mhrydain—gan nad yw hynny o fewn ein pwerau ni fel Cynulliad—er mwyn lleihau diweithdra a'r tlodi a ddioddefir gan bobl ag incwm isel.

**Dafydd Wigley:** If it were a 30 per cent increase, I would welcome it. However, we have not had a 30 per cent increase for the year in question. I accept that a new government, during its first year in office, is restricted by the budget transferred from the previous government. However, by the start of the next financial year, this Labour Government will have been in office for four years, which is the amount of time we have had to wait to see some action. Of course, I welcome the reduction in unemployment, even though there are still pockets of high unemployment in Wales, which suffer from poverty as a result. That is, possibly, what concerns me most about this budget: are we doing enough as an Assembly to eradicate poverty? There is extreme poverty in some of the former industrial valleys and in rural areas, in the former slate mining and coal mining areas, and we must attack it. In Ireland's budget, which was announced this week, the threshold for paying income tax has been increased to £7,000. Therefore, 38 per cent of the workforce will not have to pay income tax. I would like to see the Chancellor introduce a similar policy in Britain—as that is not within our powers as an Assembly—to combat unemployment and the poverty suffered by people on low incomes.

Mae'r hyn a ddywedodd Phil Williams a Ieuan Wyn Jones am gyllid Ewropeaidd yn wir. Rhaid inni neilltuo cyfran o'r gyllideb ar gyfer arian cyfatebol; cyfran y gellid, fel arall, ei wario ar raglenni addysg, iechyd neu dai. Os nad ydym yn onest ynglŷn â hyn, ni fydd athrawon a phrifathrawon yn deall beth sydd yn digwydd. Gwnaeth y Llywodraeth benderfyniad anodd i ddefnyddio'r arian hwn er mwyn galluogi rhaglenni Amcan 1 i fynd rhagddynt. Yr ydym am weld rhaglenni Amcan 1 ar waith, a derbyniasom £90 miliwn o gronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop yn

What Phil Williams and Ieuan Wyn Jones said about European funding is true. We are forced to allocate a portion of the budget for match funding; a portion that could, otherwise, be used for education, health or housing programmes. If we are not honest about this, teachers and headteachers will not understand what is happening. The Government made the difficult decision to use this money to enable Objective 1 programmes to proceed. We want to see Objective 1 programmes proceeding, and we have drawn down an extra £90 million of

ychwanegol at fformwla Barnett at y pwrpas hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, £360 miliwn yw'r cyfanswm sydd ei angen ar gyfer prif raglenni Amcan 1, ac nid ydym ond wedi derbyn £90 miliwn ychwanegol. Felly, rhaid inni fod yn onest ynglŷn â hyn, neu bydd athrawon a phrifathrawon yn teimlo inni eu siomi wrth iddynt ddioddef mwy o bwysau ariannol, gan weld ysgolion yn Lloegr yn derbyn mwy o arian.

Cyfyd hyn y cwestiwn o flaenoriaeth wrth ddosbarthu arian. Bydd yn rhaid, felly, ystyried fformwla Barnett. Mae amgylchiadau yng Nghymru wedi newid yn sylweddol ers llunio fformwla Barnett yn 1978. Mae'r diwydiannau glo, dur ac amaethyddiaeth wedi newid gymaint fel y bo'n rhaid inni gael fformwla sydd yn cyfateb i anghenion cymdeithasol ac economaidd heddiw. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad sicrhau bod ymchwil drylwyr yn cael ei gwneud er mwyn galluogi i hynny ddigwydd.

**David Davies:** A ydych yn cytuno, pe bai gennym Gymru annibynnol, y byddai'n amhosibl inni ddylanwadu ar sut y dylai fformwla Barnett weithio?

**Dafydd Wigley:** Mae'n hanfodol inni gael gwybodaeth drylwyr a manwl yn sail i unrhyw ddadansoddiad.

Croesawaf y ffaith fod David yn ddigon hyderus yn ei Gymraeg i'w defnyddio wrth ymyrryd. Daliwch ati.

Rhaid i'r fformwla adlewyrchu anghenion Cymru ac, o gofio cyflwr yr ardaloedd sydd yn dioddef tlodi eithafol, dylai osod pwyslais ar ddarparu adnoddau i fynd i'r afael â thlodi. Gobeithiaf y bydd modd i Edwina, a'i hadran, sicrhau bod gwaith ymchwil yn cael ei wneud yn y dyfodol agos, er mwyn inni gael y cryfder i ddadlau â'r Trysorlys y dylid newid fformwla Barnett i adlewyrchu ein hanghenion. Nid ydym yn gofyn am unrhyw beth nad oes gennym hawl i'w dderbyn. Yr ydym yn gofyn am adnoddau i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau dybryd mewn nifer o'n cymdogaethau.

Yr wyf hefyd yn bryderus am y cyllid a roddir i Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Nid yw'r WDA yn derbyn digon o arian i

European structural funds over and above the Barnett formula for that purpose. However, a total of £360 million is needed for the main Objective 1 programmes, but we have only received an additional £90 million. Therefore, we must be honest about this, otherwise teachers and headteachers will feel that we have let them down as they suffer further financial pressure, while seeing schools in England receiving more money.

This raises the question of prioritisation in the allocation of funds. We must, therefore, consider the Barnett formula. Circumstances in Wales have changed considerably since the Barnett formula was drawn up in 1978. The coal, steel and agriculture industries have changed to such an extent that we must have a formula that corresponds to the social and economic needs of today. The Assembly must ensure that painstaking research is carried out to enable that to happen.

**David Davies:** Do you agree that if we had an independent Wales, it would be impossible to influence how the Barnett formula should work?

**Dafydd Wigley:** It is essential that we have thorough and detailed information as the basis for any analysis.

I welcome the fact that David is confident enough in his Welsh to use it to intervene. Keep it up.

The formula must reflect the needs of Wales and, bearing in mind the condition of some of the areas suffering extreme poverty, it should place an emphasis on providing resources to tackle poverty. I hope that it will be possible for Edwina, and her department, to carry out research in the near future, so that we can present a strong argument to the Treasury that the Barnett formula should be adapted to reflect our needs. We are not asking for anything to which we are not entitled. We are asking for resources to tackle the serious problems faced by many of our communities

I am also concerned about the funding for the Welsh Development Agency. The WDA is not receiving sufficient funds to be able to

chwarae'r rhan lawn y gallai ei chwarae ar adeg o gyfleoedd economaidd niferus. Mae cyfle i sicrhau y daw swyddi a diwydiannau technolegol newydd i Gymru, ac i godi incwm y pen, sydd yn sialens fawr yn yr economi Gymreig. Byddai angen £30 miliwn i £40 miliwn y flwyddyn yn ychwanegol ar y WDA i'w alluogi i wneud hynny. Gobeithiaf y gall Edwina ystyried y pwynt hwnnw y flwyddyn nesaf.

Trafodaf yn fyr bwnc a godwyd gan siaradwyr eraill, sef cyfalaf. Mae angen arian ychwanegol yn y maes hwn. Os oes yn rhaid i ni ddefnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat, ac nid wyf yn hoffi'r system, a allwn gael datganiad bob tro y mae'n cael ei defnyddio? A allwn gael dadansoddiad o'r gost ychwanegol i'r pwrs cyhoeddus o ddefnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat, yn hytrach na dulliau eraill, dros 25 mlynedd?

Ar bwynt technegol, a oes newid yn yr ymdriniaeth â threth ar werth, y mae'r Cynulliad ar adegau yn gorfod ei hwynebu, yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf o'i chymharu â'r flwyddyn bresennol? Mae gennyf le i gredu ei bod wedi newid. Os felly, beth fydd yr effaith? Os nad yw'r arian yn cael ei wario, gobeithiaf y byddwn yn rhydd i'w wario ar ein blaenoriaethau Gobeithiaf na fydd y Trysorlys yn defnyddio'r arian fel esgus i'n rhwystro rhag mynd i'r gronfa wrth gefn os bydd angen. Rhaid gwarchod yr arian a glustnodwyd ar gyfer gwasanaethau a rhaid inni gael y rhyddid i ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw'n llawn.

**Alun Pugh:** This is an excellent budget. It is good news for pupils, patients and pensioners. It shows sustainable growth, not boom and bust. However, in Ruthin and many other communities in north Wales, the new year will not bring good news. Floodwater may have subsided, but the damage and the fear of flooding has not gone away. Therefore, Edwina's comments this morning are particularly welcome. We currently do not know the cost of a comprehensive programme of flood defences for north Wales—no-one does, but we will know early in the new year. Unfortunately, meteorological events and budget cycles do not always work in harmony.

fulfil its potential role at a time of numerous economic opportunities. There is an opportunity to ensure that new jobs and new technological industries come to Wales, and to raise the per capita income, which is a massive challenge in respect of the Welsh economy. The WDA would need an additional £30 million to £40 million to enable it to do that. I hope that Edwina will be able to consider that point next year.

I will briefly discuss the issue of capital, which was raised by other speakers. Additional funding is needed in this area. If we must use the private finance initiative, and I do not like the system, can we have a statement every time it is used? Can we have analysis of the additional cost to the public purse of using PFI, rather than alternative methods, over 25 years?

On a technical point, is there a change in the method of dealing with VAT, which the Assembly sometimes has to face, in the budget for next year as compared to the current year? I have reason to believe that it has changed. If so, what will the effect be? If the money is not being spent, I hope that we will have the freedom to spend it on our priorities. I hope that the Treasury will not use the money as an excuse to prevent us from dipping into the contingency reserve, if we need to. We need to safeguard the money that was earmarked for services and we must be free to use that money fully.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae hon yn gyllideb ragorol. Mae'n newyddion da i ddisgyblion, cleifion a phensiynwyr. Dengys dwf cynaliadwy, nid ffyniant a methiant. Fodd bynnag, yn Rhuthun a llawer o gymunedau eraill yng ngogledd Cymru, ni ddaw'r flwyddyn newydd â newyddion da. Efallai bod y llifddyfroedd wedi cilio, ond nid yw difrod ac ofn llifogydd wedi diflannu. Felly, mae croeso arbennig i sylwadau Edwina y bore yma. Ar hyn o bryd ni wyddom faint yw cost y rhaglen gynhwysfawr o amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd ar gyfer gogledd Cymru—ni w'yr neb, ond byddwn yn gwybod yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd. Yn anffodus, nid yw digwyddiadau meteorolegol a chylchoedd cyllidebau bob amser yn cydweithio.

No-one would advocate spending millions to protect one or two houses from a one in a hundred year flooding event. The funds would clearly be better deployed elsewhere. However, in Ruthin and many other towns, they are not in that position. Whole communities, key businesses and major communication links have been damaged grievously. I hope that, when the final cost of protection is known, the fear of regular flooding will be removed by a sympathetic response from this Assembly. Finally, I thank that Government of Wales for such a sympathetic response to the emergency costs of flooding. The 100 per cent support from the Bellwin scheme protected Denbighshire from financial meltdown, and council tax payers who were thumped with the Rhuddlan debt crisis have been spared a repeat performance from flooding emergency costs.

**Glyn Davies:** This first look at the Government's final budget for 2001-02 is an important occasion, although you would not think so judging from the lack of Liberal Democrat attendance. They have been absent for the entire debate, apart from the Minister for Economic Development. However, I am not surprised and I will return to that later.

It is difficult to be fired up about this debate. I feel more like a John Griffiths than a Peter Rogers today because it does not feel like a proper budget. I am not in favour of giving this Assembly tax raising powers, but without that sharp focus on the balance between demanding tax from the people and promising spending on people, there cannot be any fire and brimstone in the debate. It reminds me of a situation, many years ago, when I spent some years as a finance committee chairman of the Montgomeryshire district council. At first, the budget debate was the big annual set piece. Talk about tears. There were fists on one occasion and personal insults—the blood was up. There was real passion. Then, along came capping with central Government deciding how much councils should spend. I am not criticising that, but I point out that the sharp focus disappeared, and the passionate debate went

Ni fyddai neb o blaid gwario miliynau ar ddiogelu un neu ddau o dai rhag llifogydd sydd yn digwydd unwaith bob can mlynedd. Yn amlwg byddai'n well defnyddio'r arian ar gyfer rhywbeth arall. Fodd bynnag, yn Rhuthun a llawer o drefi eraill, nid ydynt yn y sefyllfa honno. Difrodwyd cymunedau cyfan, busnesau allweddol a phrif gysylltiadau cyfathrebu yn ddifrifol. Gobeithiaf, pan fydd y gost diogelu derfynol yn hysbys, y dileir ofn llifogydd rheolaidd drwy ymateb cydymdeimladol gan y Cynulliad hwn. Yn olaf, diolchaf i'r Llywodraeth Cymru honno am ymateb mor gydymdeimladol i gostau argyfwng llifogydd. Diogelwyd Sir Ddinbych rhag trychineb ariannol oherwydd cefnogaeth 100 y cant gan y cynllun Bellwin, ac ni fu'n rhaid i dalwyr y dreth gyngor a ddiodeffodd argyfwng dyledion Rhuddlan wynebu'r un peth gyda chostau argyfwng y llifogydd.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae'r olwg gyntaf hon ar gyllideb derfynol y Llywodraeth ar gyfer 2001-02 yn achlysur pwysig, er na fydddech yn meddwl hynny a barnu yn ôl diffyg presenoldeb y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Buont yn absennol am y ddadl gyfan, ar wahân i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn synnu a byddaf yn dychwelyd at hynny yn ddiweddarach.

Mae'n anodd ennyn brwdfrydedd ynglŷn â'r ddadl hon. Teimlaf yn fwy fel John Griffiths na Peter Rogers heddiw gan nad yw'n teimlo fel cyllideb briodol. Nid wyf o blaid rhoi pwerau codi trethi i'r Cynulliad hwn, ond heb y ffocws craff hwnnw ar y cydbwysedd rhwng hawlio treth gan y bobl ac addo gwario ar bobl, ni ellir cael unrhyw dân a brwmstan yn y ddadl. Mae'n fy atgoffa o sefyllfa, flynyddoedd lawer yn ôl, pan dreuliais rai blynyddoedd fel cadeirydd y pwyllgor cyllid yng nghyngor dosbarth Sir Fynwy. Ar y dechrau, y ddadl ar y gyllideb oedd y darn gosod blynyddol o bwys. Sôn am ddagrau. Codwyd dyrnau ar un achlysur a chlywyd sylwadau sarhaus personol—yr oedd eu gwaed yn berwi. Yr oedd gwir angerdd yno. Yna, daeth y capio gyda Llywodraeth ganolog yn penderfynu faint y dylai cynghorau ei wario. Nid wyf yn beirniadu hynny, ond nodaf i'r ffocws craff

with it. The whole council then turned on the Government for not giving it enough. Our budget in some ways is a little like that. I am not going to bash your budget. The budget is boring, uninspiring and a wasted opportunity. This year was your one chance to give the Assembly its USP: unique selling point. The extra cash that was delivered by the Barnett formula following Gordon Brown's spending spree, which was designed to bribe the British people into forgetting that the Labour Government at Westminster has acted like a gang of unprincipled charlatans. It now plans to win next May's general election—

ddiflannu, a'r ddadl ffyrnig gydag ef. Yna trôdd y cyngor cyfan ar y Llywodraeth am beidio â rhoi digon. Mae ein cyllideb ychydig yn debyg i hynny mewn rhai ffyrdd. Nid wyf yn ymosod ar eich cyllideb. Mae'r gyllideb yn ddiflas, yn ddi-flach ac yn gyfle a wastraffwyd. Eleni oedd eich unig gyfle i roi ei atyniad unigryw i'r Cynulliad. Mae'r arian ychwanegol a ddaeth yn sgîl fformwla Barnett yn dilyn sbri wario Gordon Brown, y bwriadwyd iddi lwgrwobrwyo pobl Prydain i anghofio bod y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan wedi gweithredu fel criw o dwyllwyr diegwyddor. Bellach mae'n bwriadu ennill etholiad cyffredinol fis Mai nesaf—

11:15 a.m.

**Alun Pugh:** Could Glyn tell me why the biggest programme of school building improvements that Wales has ever seen is boring?

**Alun Pugh:** A allai Glyn ddweud wrthyf pam bod y rhaglen fwyaf o welliannau i adeiladau ysgolion y mae Cymru erioed wedi ei gweld yn ddiflas?

**Glyn Davies:** I will if you listen to the rest of my speech.

**Glyn Davies:** Gwnaf os gwrandewch ar weddill fy araith.

**Brian Gibbons** *rose*—

**Brian Gibbons** *a gododd*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Glyn Davies must reply to the intervention by Alun Pugh before he can take another intervention.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid i Glyn Davies ateb yr ymyriad gan Alun Pugh cyn y gall gymryd ymyriad arall.

**Glyn Davies:** I dismissed the intervention rather than reply to it. I will not give way to Brian at the moment.

**Glyn Davies:** Diystyrais yr ymyriad yn hytrach na'i ateb. Nid ildiaf i Brian ar hyn o bryd.

I do not want to damage the career of a Government spokesperson that I admire, but I remember in the comprehensive spending review debate—it is a pity that Delyth has left the Chamber—listening to Delyth Evans speaking disconcertingly sensibly. Today she has spoken honestly again about concentrating the extra money in a unique selling point for the Assembly. At the time I called them impact measures—I am not sure what Delyth called them—but it was specific investment in one or two issues that would put the Assembly on the map. The budget does not do that. It is not what we have here. It is more like rolling out what they have in England, just a little bit less of everything because Tony let us down on match funding.

Nid wyf am wneud drwg i yrfa llefarydd y Llywodraeth yr wyf yn ei edmygu, ond cofiaf wrando yn y ddadl ar yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant—trueni bod Delyth wedi gadael y Siambr—ar Delyth Evans yn llefaru'r syfrdanol o synhwyrol. Heddiw siaradodd yn onest eto am ganolbwyntio'r arian ychwanegol ar atyniad unigryw i'r Cynulliad. Ar y pryd gelwais hwy yn fesurau effaith—nid wyf yn siwr beth y galwodd Delyth hwy—ond yr oedd yn fuddsoddiad penodol mewn un neu ddau o faterion a fyddai'n rhoi'r Cynulliad ar y map. Nid yw'r gyllideb yn gwneud hynny. Nid dyna beth sydd gennym yma. Mae'n debycach i'r hyn a gyflwynwyd yn Lloegr, ond ychydig yn llai o bopeth gan fod Tony wedi'n siomi o ran arian cyfatebol.



Minister, the reason that I cannot set about your budget with the venom that I would like is because I accept that you are not in a position to increase the size of the cake that you are dividing up. Tony dropped you in it with match funding. Now you are stuck with it. That is why it seems to me to be boring, uninspiring and a wasted opportunity.

**Huw Lewis:** A Tory Government would not be boring. According to your tax cut guarantee, my calculations on the back of an envelope show that £24 million in public expenditure would be cut from every Welsh constituency, adding up to a total of nearly £1 billion in cuts. Where would a future Tory administration fell the axe in this budget?

**Glyn Davies:** The budget we are talking about today would not be changed by an incoming Tory Government. The budget we are dealing with is next year's Assembly budget.

**Michael German:** You do not understand the Barnett formula.

**Glyn Davies:** I understand why the Minister for Economic Development is trying to make a noise, to make up for the absence of the rest of his colleagues. I see that Mick has arrived now.

I want to make two specific points. First, the sheer deceit of the Government's past promises on education. Yesterday, like Nick Bourne, I was hit by a tidal wave of e-mails and phone calls from headteachers all over Powys, panicking as they realised how badly their schools will lose out as a result of the budget. They will lose out compared to England to a large extent.

There were genuine fears that teachers would not be attracted to Wales. That is why what happens in England is relevant to what happens here today. Three weeks ago—I am pleased, Mick, that you have arrived—Mick Bates wrote to hundreds of people in Montgomeryshire making the fatuous claim that the Liberal Democrats had delivered a

Weinidog, y rheswm pam na allaf ymosod ar eich cyllideb mor hallt ag yr hoffwn yw am fy mod yn derbyn nad ydych mewn sefyllfa i gynyddu maint y gacen yr ydych yn ei rhannu. Gollyngodd Tony chi yn y cawl o ran arian cyfatebol. Yn awr ni allwn gael gwared ar hynny. Dyna pam y mae'n ymddangos yn ddiflas, yn ddi-fflach ac yn gyfle a wastraffwyd.

**Huw Lewis:** Ni fyddai Llywodraeth Doriäidd yn ddiflas. Yn ôl eich gwarant torri trethi, dengys fy nghyfrifiadau ar gefn amlen y byddai £24 miliwn mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yn cael ei dorri o bob etholaeth Gymreig, gan wneud cyfanswm o bron £1 biliwn mewn toriadau. Ble y byddai gweinyddiaeth Doriäidd yn y dyfodol yn cwtogi yn y gyllideb hon?

**Glyn Davies:** Ni chäi'r gyllideb yr ydym yn ei thrafod heddiw ei newid gan Lywodraeth Doriäidd olynol. Y gyllideb yr ymdriniwn ä hi yw cyllideb y Cynulliad ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf.

**Michael German:** Nid ydych yn deall fformwla Barnett.

**Glyn Davies:** Deallaf pam fod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn ceisio cadw sŵn, er mwyn gwneud iawn am absenoldeb gweddill ei gyd-Aelodau. Gwelaf fod Mick wedi cyrraedd yn awr.

Yr wyf am wneud dau bwynt penodol. Yn gyntaf, twyll llwyr addewidion y Llywodraeth yn y gorffennol ar addysg. Ddoe, fel Nick Bourne, fe'm trawyd gan don lanw o negeseuon e-bost a galwadau ffôn gan benaethiaid ysgolion ar hyd a lled Powys, yn mynd i banig wrth iddynt sylweddoli cymaint y bydd eu hysgolion ar eu colled o ganlyniad i'r gyllideb. Byddant ar eu colled i raddau helaeth o'u cymharu ä Lloegr.

Yr oedd pryderon gwirioneddol na chäi athrawon eu denu i Gymru. Dyna pam bod yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yn Lloegr mor berthnasol i'r hyn sydd yn digwydd yma heddiw. Dair wythnos yn ôl—yr wyf yn falch, Mick, eich bod wedi cyrraedd—ysgrifennodd Mick Bates at gannoedd o bobl yn Sir Drefaldwyn yn gwneud yr honiad

good local government settlement. Clearly, from her comments earlier today and her intervention, Kirsty Williams thinks that that was a premature claim. I hope that you did not pay for the stamps, Mick, because I have not met anybody who believed it. They all agreed with Kirsty Williams. I suggest that you write to all the headteachers in Powys claiming a new achievement for the Lib-Lab coalition here, and that is new priorities on education: education cuts, education cuts and education cuts delivered by the Liberal Democrats.

**Michael German:** What would be the consequentials for Wales of the announcement by William Hague, and his friend Mr Portillo, on the reduction in public expenditure in the UK budget? By how much would the budget for Wales be reduced?

**Glyn Davies:** I have not had an opportunity to study the detail but I know that we would have a good budget for Wales, with unique selling points. It would help us to put this Assembly on the map, in contrast to the boring stuff to which you usually subscribe.

**David Davies:** Has the Member seen the circular from the Labour Party to all its Assembly Members, which recommends that they go on a course in Glasgow between 16 and 18 February to highlight the threats posed by the Liberal Democrats? Would it be an idea for some of the Conservative Members to also go on this course, given the threats the Liberal Democrats have posed in Wales?

**Glyn Davies:** That is the best intervention that we have had today. I must not indulge myself too much in bashing the Liberal Democrats, even though I know that almost every Member in this Chamber enjoys it. I see that Tom Middlehurst and Alun Pugh are smiling now. Peter Law would be smiling if he were here. Val Feld would probably be the Minister for Economic Development and Alun Pugh might well be in the Cabinet also if it were not for the coalition. So, I understand why they enjoy bashing the Liberal Democrats. I will not do that.

gwirion fod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi cyflwyno setliad llywodraeth leol da. Yn amlwg, o'i sylwadau yn gynharach heddiw a'i hymyriad, cred Kirsty Williams fod hwnnw'n honiad cynamserol. Gobeithiaf na dalasoch am y stampiau, Mick, oherwydd ni chyfarfûm ag unrhyw un a oedd yn ei gredu. Cytunodd bob un ohonynt â Kirsty Williams. Awgrymaf eich bod yn ysgrifennu at bob pennaeth ym Mhowys yn honni cyflawniad newydd i glymblaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur yma, sef blaenoriaethau newydd ar addysg: toriadau addysg, toriadau addysg a thoriadau addysg wedi eu cyflwyno gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

**Michael German:** Beth fyddai'r canlyniadau i Gymru yn dilyn cyhoeddiad gan William Hague, a'i gyfaill Mr Portillo, ar y gostyngiad mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yng nghyllideb y DU? Beth fyddai'r gostyngiad yn y gyllideb i Gymru?

**Glyn Davies:** Ni chefais gyfle i astudio'r manylion ond gwn y byddai gennym gyllideb dda i Gymru, gydag atyniadau unigryw. Byddai'n ein helpu ni i roi'r Cynulliad hwn ar y map, yn wahanol i'r materion diflas yr ydych yn credu ynddynt fel arfer

**David Davies:** A yw'r Aelod wedi gweld y cylchlythyr gan y Blaid Lafur at bob un o'i Haelodau yn y Cynulliad, sydd yn argymhell eu bod yn mynd ar gwrs yn Glasgow rhwng 16 a 18 Chwefror i amlygu peryglon y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? Oni fyddai'n syniad i rai o Aelodau'r Blaid Geidwadol fynd ar y cwrs hwn hefyd, o gofio peryglon y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yng Nghymru?

**Glyn Davies:** Dyna'r ymyriad gorau a gawsom heddiw. Rhaid imi beidio â mwynhau fy hun ormod wrth feirniadu'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, er y gwn fod bron pob Aelod yn y Siambr hon yn mwynhau hynny. Gwelaf fod Tom Middlehurst ac Alun Pugh yn gwenu yn awr. Byddai Peter Law yn gwenu pe bai yma. Val Feld fyddai'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd siŵr o fod ac efallai y byddai Alun Pugh yn y Cabinet hefyd oni bai am y glymblaid. Felly, deallaf pam eu bod yn mwynhau lladd ar y Democratiaid

Rhyddfrydol. Ni wnaf hynny.

**Alison Halford:** I am feeling left out.

**Alison Halford:** Teimlaf yn unig.

**Glyn Davies:** I am also missing out other Members.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf yn hepgor Aelodau eraill hefyd.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You have had eight minutes. You need to wind up.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr ydych wedi cael wyth munud. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**Glyn Davies:** I have a final point. I do not want to damage the career of another Labour AM by speaking well of him, but I will refer to the Minister for Rural Affairs. We are both champions of a prosperous, successful countryside, but you, Carwyn, should fight the Cabinet corner for Tir Gofal, our agri-environment scheme. I know that there has been an increase in its funding, but I fear that it may not be enough to achieve the objective. Tir Gofal is the way ahead: it is built on a previous Government's pilot scheme; it has cross party support; it will revitalise the countryside and bring the rural and urban together. However, it will not work unless it has sufficient funding to create the critical mass that creates extra jobs off the farm.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae gennyf un pwynt terfynol. Nid wyf am wneud drwg i yrfa Aelod Llafur arall yn y Cynulliad drwy ei ganmol, ond cyfeiraf at y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig. Mae'r ddau ohonom yn gefnogwyr cefn gwlad ffyniannus, llwyddiannus, ond dylech chi, Carwyn, ymladd cornel y Cabinet dros Tir Gofal, ein cynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol. Gwn y bu cynnydd yn ei arian, ond ofnaf na fydd yn ddigon efallai i gyrraedd y nod. Tir Gofal yw'r ffordd ymlaen: fe'i hadeiladwyd ar gynllun peilot Llywodraeth flaenorol; mae cefnogaeth traws-bleidiol iddo; bydd yn adfywio cefn gwlad ac yn dwyn yr ardaloedd gwledig a threfol ynghyd. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd yn gweithio oni fydd ganddo ddigon o arian i greu'r màs critigol sydd yn creu swyddi ychwanegol i ffwrdd o'r fferm.

I therefore ask the Minister for Rural Affairs to take on Mrs Hart in the Cabinet. She is a formidable opponent but you are a powerful fellow. You are new to your post, so you are on a roll and should get in while the honeymoon period lasts. If you can secure a few more million pounds for Tir Gofal, I might even stop calling this budget boring, uninspiring and a wasted opportunity.

Felly, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig herio Mrs Hart yn y Cabinet. Mae'n wrthwynebydd aruthrol ond yr ydych yn ddyn pwerus. Yr ydych yn newydd i'ch swydd, ac ar i fyny felly, a dylech ymyrryd tra bod cyfnod y mis mêl yn parhau. Os gallwch sicrhau rhai miliynau o bunnoedd ychwanegol i Tir Gofal, efallai y gwnaf hyd yn oed roi'r gorau i alw'r gyllideb hon yn ddiflas, yn ddi-fflach ac yn gyfle a wastraffwyd.

**Mick Bates:** My aim in being elected to this Assembly was to improve quality of life for people in Wales. This budget is a step in that direction. It has been achieved, despite the cheap comments today, by a partnership Government that believes in improving quality of life for people in Wales. I will comment on rural areas. For many years I fought successive governments that brought decay and saw fit to reduce the fundamental hill livestock compensatory allowance payments to farmers by 25 per cent, to cap councils' budgets, to privatise and to squeeze

**Mick Bates:** Fy nod wrth gael fy ethol i'r Cynulliad hwn oedd gwella ansawdd bywyd pobl yng Nghymru. Mae'r gyllideb hon yn gam tua'r cyfeiriad hwnnw. Fe'i cyflawnwyd, er gwaethaf y sylwadau diwerth heddiw, gan Lywodraeth bartneriaeth sydd yn credu mewn gwella ansawdd bywyd i bobl Cymru. Byddaf yn rhoi sylwadau ar ardaloedd gwledig. Ers blynnyddoedd lawer brwydrais yn erbyn llywodraethau olynol a ddaeth â dirywiad ac a welodd yn dda i ostwng taliadau lwfans iawndal da byw ucheldir sylfaenol 25 y cant, i gapio

out the life blood of rural areas. Prosperity in rural areas was not killed overnight but over many years. BSE, for which no-one is totally responsible, also played a part in this. It added to the disaster in rural areas.

There is an additional £60 million for rural Wales in this budget. This will be one of the greatest events for sustainable development. Free school milk will be available for children at key stage 1. There will be free advice for farmers. Eventually, we will also have a package to assist young entrants. That is part of the partnership agreement. It is a true partnership. That relationship means that we will succeed on behalf of the people of Wales. Despite the quips and political comments that there is a weakness in the partnership, we know that it will succeed. There is a weakness at times and it is difficult to ensure that we achieve all our aims. However, if we are honest, we will see that extra money for rural areas will be well used. It will help to reverse the depression that has existed for so long.

11:25 a.m.

I agree with the previous speaker that Tir Gofal is the way forward. However, it is elitist and we must ensure that when it is reviewed, there will be a stand-alone environmental scheme that is accessible to all farmers, not just to the 200 or 300 per year that are accepted for the scheme. It is important to secure extra money for organic farming to ensure that the processing facilities exist in Wales so that our food is produced, processed and eaten in Wales. That would add value and keep our communities prosperous. This budget is the first step on that journey and I commend it to you. I hope that every party will realise that we believe that it will ensure prosperity. There is extra money in the partnership agreement and the budget to achieve that aim. If we have not implemented free school milk or introduced Farming Connect by next year, criticism will be justified. However—

cyllidebau cynghorau, preifateiddio a lladd enaid ardaloedd gwledig. Ni chafodd ffyniant mewn ardaloedd gwledig ei ladd dros nos ond yn hytrach dros nifer o flynyddoedd. Chwaraeodd BSE ran yn hyn ac nid oes neb yn llwyr gyfrifol amdano. Ychwanegodd at y drychineb mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Mae £60 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer Cymru wledig yn y gyllideb hon. Hwn fydd un o'r digwyddiadau mwyaf ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy. Bydd llaeth ysgol am ddim ar gael i blant yng nghyfnod allweddol 1. Bydd cyngor am ddim i ffermwyr. Yn y pen draw, bydd gennym becyn hefyd i helpu dechreuwyr newydd. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r cytundeb partneriaeth. Mae'n bartneriaeth wirioneddol. Golyga'r berthynas honno y byddwn yn llwyddo ar ran pobl Cymru. Er gwaetha'r cellweiriau a'r sylwadau gwleidyddol bod gwendid yn y bartneriaeth, gwyddom y bydd yn llwyddo. Mae gwendid ar adegau ac mae'n anodd sicrhau ein bod yn cyflawni pob un o'n nodau. Fodd bynnag, os ydym yn onest, fe welwn y caiff yr arian ychwanegol hwnnw ar gyfer ardaloedd gwledig ei ddefnyddio'n dda. Bydd yn helpu i wrthdroi'r dirwasgiad sydd wedi bodoli ers cyhyd.

Cytunaf â'r llefarydd blaenorol mai Tir Gofal yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, mae'n elitaidd a rhaid inni sicrhau pan gaiff ei adolygu, y bydd cynllun amgylcheddol unigol sydd yn hygyrch i bob ffermwr, nid dim ond i'r 200 neu'r 300 y flwyddyn a dderbynnir ar gyfer y cynllun. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau arian ychwanegol ar gyfer ffermio organig er mwyn sicrhau bod y cyfleusterau prosesu yn bodoli yng Nghymru fel y caiff ein bwyd ei gynhyrchu, ei brosesu a'i fwyta yng Nghymru. Byddai hynny'n ychwanegu gwerth ac yn sicrhau bod ein cymunedau yn ffynnu. Y gyllideb hon yw'r cam cyntaf ar y daith honno ac fe'i cymeradwyaf i chi. Gobeithiaf y bydd pob plaid yn sylweddoli y credwn y bydd yn sicrhau ffyniant. Mae arian ychwanegol yn y cytundeb partneriaeth a'r gyllideb i gyflawni'r nod honno. Os na fyddwn wedi gweithredu ar laeth ysgol am ddim neu heb gyflwyno Farming Connect erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd gennym achos cyfiawn dros gwyno. Fodd bynnag—

**Peter Rogers:** Will you also make people aware of rural people and hauliers' contribution to this additional money through their payment of inflated fuel tax?

**Mick Bates:** Fuel tax is beyond the power of this Assembly. Parts of Chancellor Brown's announcement were useful and I hope that they can be implemented to help many firms. In terms of transport, Peter, as I said, if more timber or food, for example, were processed in Wales and value added, it would reduce the need to haul goods out of Wales. The way to reduce costs is by implementing innovative programmes for liquefied petroleum gas and better fuels. That will also save our environment. The way forward is to reduce transport not to increase it.

I hope that we will all sign up to this package today despite misgivings in some areas that it cannot happen quickly enough, and Glyn's opinion that it does not have a unique selling point. It is unique. This is the first partnership Government in Wales and it will achieve for the people of Wales. That is what is unique about it. Join in or shut up.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ar bwynt olaf Mick, mae'n amlwg bod arian ychwanegol ar gael yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod. Yr ydym eisoes fel plaid wedi cwestiynu'r ffaith nad oedd arian ychwanegol yn y gorffennol a bod yn rhaid edrych ar y gyllideb yn y cyd-destun hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, bydd arian ychwanegol ar gael yn y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod.

Gofynnaf i Edwina am y gyllideb sydd ar gael ar gyfer diwylliant a chwaraeon yng Nghymru. Yng nghytundeb yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, addawyd cynnydd o 4.3 y cant ar gyfartaledd dros dair blynedd ar

**Peter Rogers:** A wnewch chi hysbysu pobl hefyd am gyfraniad pobl wledig a chlodwyr i'r arian ychwanegol hwn drwy dalu treth tanwydd afresymol?

**Mick Bates:** Mae treth tanwydd y tu hwnt i bŵer y Cynulliad hwn. Yr oedd rhannau o gyhoeddiad y Canghellor Brown yn ddefnyddiol a gobeithiaf y gellir eu gweithredu er mwyn helpu llawer o gwmnïau. Yn nhermau trafniadaeth, Peter, fel y dywedais, pe câi rhagor o bren neu fwyd, er enghraifft, eu prosesu yng Nghymru gyda gwerth wedi ei ychwanegu, byddai'n lleihau'r angen i gludo nwyddau allan o Gymru. Y ffordd o ostwng costau yw drwy weithredu rhaglenni arloesol ar gyfer nwy petrolewm hylif a thanwydd gwell. Bydd hynny'n achub ein hamgylchedd hefyd. Y ffordd ymlaen yw lleihau trafniadaeth ac nid ychwanegu ati.

Gobeithiaf y gwnawn oll gymeradwyo'r pecyn hwn heddiw er gwaethaf yr amheuon sydd gan rai na all ddigwydd yn ddigon cyflym, a barn Glyn nad oes ganddo atyniad unigryw. Mae yn unigryw. Dyma'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth gyntaf yng Nghymru, a bydd yn cyflawni ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Dyna beth sydd yn unigryw amdani. Ymunwch neu byddwch yn dawel.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** On Mick's last point, it is obvious that additional money is available in the budget for future years. We as a party have already questioned the fact that there was no additional funding in the past and that the budget must be viewed in that context. However, additional money will be available in future years.

I ask Edwina about the budget available for culture and sport in Wales. In the comprehensive spending review agreement, increases of 4.3 per cent on average were promised over three years for sport and

gyfer diwylliant a chwaraeon. Croesawaf yr ychwanegiad o £600,000 ar gyfer mynediad am ddim i blant ysgol i orielau ac amgueddfeydd. Fodd bynnag, os ydym yn cynnwys yr arian ar gyfer Canolfan y Mileniwm, mae'r ffigur o ychydig dros £55 miliwn ar gyfer diwylliant a chwaraeon yn 2000-01 yn codi i ychydig dros £56 miliwn yn 2001-02. Mae hwnnw yn gynydd o 1.75 y cant ac ar ôl caniatáu am chwyddiant nid yw ond 0.85 y cant. Yn 2002-03, mae'n codi i ychydig o dan £60 miliwn. Mae hwnnw yn gynydd o 3.6 y cant ar ôl chwyddiant. Yn 2003-04 bydd hyn ychydig o dan £63 milwn, sef codiad o 2.3 y cant. Ar gyfartaledd, mae hynny'n godiad o 1.7 y cant. Nid yw hynny'n cynnwys y £600,000, ond nid yw hynny'n gwneud llawer o wahaniaeth i'r cyfartaledd. Tybiaf mai ateb Edwina fydd bod angen diystyru arian Canolfan y Mileniwm. Ond hyd yn oed o wneud hynny, mae'r codiad yng Nghymru yn 3.6 y cant yn hytrach na 4.3 y cant.

Mae Edwina yn derbyn, fel yr oedd yn amlwg o'r cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant a Chwaraeon y bore yma, bod gwaith pwysig iawn i'w wneud yn y maes hwn. Mae angen ailstrwythuro ac ad-drefnu Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn ôl argymhellion adroddiad Wallace ac adroddiad PriceWaterhouse Coopers. Mae angen inni weithredu argymhellion adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, 'Diwylliant Cytûn'. Sut y mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid yn awgrymu ein bod yn gwneud hynny o fewn cyllideb â chodiadau mor fach? A yw hi am sicrhau bod arian ychwanegol ar gael i gyflawni'r argymhellion hynny? A yw hi hefyd yn derbyn—fel y dywedwyd sawl gwaith yn y Siambr hon gan Brif Weinidog Cymru—bod angen inni hybu delwedd Cymru o fewn Cymru ac yn rhyngwladol? A oes arian ar gael yn y gyllideb diwylliant a chwaraeon i wneud hynny? A yw hynny yn gyfrifoldeb yn y maes yma?

Soniodd Edwina am y modd yr ymatebodd hithau i sylwadau'r Pwyllgorau am y gyllideb. A yw hi'n ymwybodol fy mod innau, ar ran y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, wedi ysgrifennu at Jenny Randerson yn mynegi fy siom ynglŷn â'r codiadau annigonol hyn yn y gyllideb diwylliant a chwaraeon? Hyderaf fod Jenny Randerson wedi cyflwyno'r

culture. I welcome the additional £600,000 for free admission for school children to galleries and museums. However, if we include the money for the Millennium Centre, the figure of just over £55 million for culture and sport in 2000-01 increases to just over £56 million in 2001-02. That is an increase of 1.75 per cent and after allowing for inflation it is only 0.85 per cent. In 2002-03 it increases to just under £60 million. That is an increase of 3.6 per cent after inflation. In 2003-04 it will be slightly under £63 million, which is an increase of 2.3 per cent. On average, that is an increase of 1.7 per cent. That does not include the £600,000, but that does not make a great deal of difference to the average. I assume that Edwina's response will be that the Millennium Centre money should be discounted. However, even by doing that, the increase in Wales is 3.6 per cent rather than 4.3 per cent.

Edwina accepts, as was obvious from the questions to the Minister for Culture and Sport this morning, that there is important work to be done in this field. There is a need to restructure and reorganise the Arts Council for Wales according to the recommendations in the Wallace report and the PriceWaterhouse Coopers report. We need to implement the Post-16 Education and Training Committee's report, 'A Culture in Common'. How does the Minister for Finance suggest we do that within a budget that offers such small increases? Will she ensure that additional money is available to implement those recommendations? Does she also accept—as has been said a number of times in this Chamber by the First Minister—that we need to promote the image of Wales within Wales and internationally? Is there money available in the culture and sport budget to do that? Does that responsibility fall within this remit?

Edwina mentioned how she responded to the Committees' comments on the budget. Is she aware that I, on behalf of the Culture Committee, have written to Jenny Randerson expressing my disappointment at these inadequate increases in the culture and sport budget? I trust that Jenny Randerson has conveyed that view, on behalf of the

mynegiant hwnnw, ar ran y Pwyllgor, i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid. Sut yr ymatebodd i'r materion hynny pan gyflwynwyd hwy iddi?

**Edwina Hart:** First, Rhodri Glyn, I received the full details of the comments that came from the appropriate Committee regarding the Wales Millennium Centre and the concerns about the Arts Council and other issues. I confirm that, and I will deal with some of the other points later.

In response to Ieuan Wyn, my mother always said to me that if you cannot say anything good, do not say anything at all. That was a lesson well learnt in the case of your contribution today. I am not Santa Claus, but we have Santa Brown. When we consider the comprehensive spending review settlement this year and what we have received in Wales, including money over and above Barnett, we need to be commended on that.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Do you agree that the standard of living in Wales deteriorated seriously during the Tory years, but that despite that, the Welsh nationalist Members of Parliament, during one period of John Major's Government voted more often with the Tories than did some of their own back benchers? The party generally has always been, and remains, much more vociferous in its unjustified criticism of Labour than it has ever been of the devastation caused by the Tories.

**Edwina Hart:** I agree.

**Elin Jones:** Cyfeiriaf at y record bleidleisio yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Atgoffaf y Cynulliad fod Llafur wedi pleidleisio gyda'r Torïaid i gefnogi'r fenter cyllid preifat yr wythnos hon. Pwy yw'r sosialwyr yn y Cynulliad: Llafur newydd ynteu Plaid Cymru?

**Edwina Hart:** I am a socialist and there are a number of us in the Labour Party. The Tories voted with us because we are a much larger party than they are. Let us get a sense of perspective. PFI must be used if we are to regenerate parts of Wales. You have the luxury, in opposition, of making certain comments. I took Dafydd Wigley's measured contribution on PFI and his

Committee, to the Minister for Finance. How did she respond to those issues when they were presented to her?

**Edwina Hart:** Yn gyntaf, Rhodri Glyn, derbyniais y manylion llawn am y sylwadau a ddaeth gan y Pwyllgor priodol ynghylch Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru a'r pryderon ynghylch Cyngor y Celfyddydau a materion eraill. Cadarnhaf hynny, a byddaf yn ymdrin â rhai o'r pwyntiau eraill yn ddiweddarach.

Mewn ymateb i Ieuan Wyn, yr oedd fy mam yn arfer dweud wrthyf, os na allwch ddweud rhywbeth da, peidiwch â dweud dim byd. Yr oedd honno'n wers a ddysgwyd yn achos eich cyfraniad heddiw. Nid Siôn Corn ydwyf, ond mae gennym Siôn Brown. Pan ystyriwn setliad yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant eleni a beth a gawsom yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys arian yn ychwanegol at Barnett, mae angen ein canmol am hynny.

**Gwenda Thomas:** A gytunwch fod safon byw yng Nghymru wedi dirywio'n ddifrifol yn ystod blynyddoedd y Torïaid, ond er gwaethaf hynny, pleidleisiodd Aelodau Seneddol Plaid Cymru, yn ystod un cyfnod o Lywodraeth John Major, yn amlach gyda'r Torïaid nag y gwnaeth rhai o'u haelodau meinciau cefn? Mae'r blaid yn gyffredinol bob amser wedi bod, ac yn parhau i fod, yn llawer uwch eu cloch yn ei beirniadaeth anghyfiawn o'r blaid Lafur nag y bu erioed o'r llanast a achoswyd gan y Torïaid.

**Edwina Hart:** Cytunaf.

**Elin Jones:** I refer to the voting record in the National Assembly. I remind the Assembly that Labour voted with the Tories to support the private finance initiative this week. Who are the socialists in the Assembly: new Labour or Plaid Cymru?

**Edwina Hart:** Sosialydd ydwyf fi ac mae nifer ohonom yn y Blaid Lafur. Pleidleisiodd y Torïaid gyda ni am ein bod yn blaid fwy o lawer na hwy. Gadewch inni roi pethau mewn persbectif. Rhaid defnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat os ydym i adfywio rhannau o Gymru. Mae gennych y cysur, fel yr wrthblaid, o wneud rhai sylwadau penodol. Rhoddais ystyriaeth ddwys i gyfraniad

acknowledgement very much on board. I will respond to that as I go on.

11:35 a.m.

Ieuan referred to poverty. We are trying to tackle that. Many of the measures in this budget tackle poverty in many areas. You only have to look at the allocations to the Communities First programme and how we are trying to make money cross-cut to tackle poverty in Wales to see that. On education, I am surprised that you are looking towards England because I thought that you always looked towards Europe. We must make our own decisions on education. The decisions in this budget are good ones and I am happy to justify them. I am always asked why London is excluded. When we are negotiating, we are aware that issues such as London weighting affect the amounts allocated. All such issues must be considered. You cannot compare Cardiff with London in terms of capital provision. We must be realistic about the assessments that we make.

I will comment generally on the points made on education. The figures on spending relative to England are good. Expenditure per pupil in Wales for 1999-2000 stacks up well when compared to England, excluding London, and shows that there is extra funding. Funding for education is channelled through different mechanisms in Wales than in England. The Assembly works in partnership with local authorities in Wales to deliver within those areas. We are satisfied that we are on course in education to secure full compliance with the 30-pupil class size limit for infants by next September. Officials will follow up cases where it appears that reception and key stage 1 classes to which a limit already applies are non-compliant. The limit does not apply to year 2 classes until next September. We are on course on that.

Much has been made of Powys and the National Association of Headteachers'

pwylllog Dafydd Wigley ar y fenter cyllid preifat a'i gydnabyddiaeth. Byddaf yn ymateb i hynny wrth fynd ymlaen.

Cyfeiriodd Ieuan at dlodi. Ceisiwn fynd i'r afael â hynny. Mae llawer o'r mesurau yn y gyllideb hon yn mynd i'r afael â thlodi mewn sawl ardal. Nid oes raid inni ond edrych ar y dyraniadau i'r rhaglen Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf a sut y ceisiwn wneud i arian drawsbyncio er mwyn mynd i'r afael â thlodi yng Nghymru i weld hynny. O ran addysg, synnaf eich bod yn edrych tuag at Loegr oherwydd credais eich bod bob amser yn edrych tuag at Ewrop. Rhaid inni wneud ein penderfyniadau ein hunain ar addysg. Mae'r penderfyniadau yn y gyllideb hon yn rhai da ac yr wyf yn falch o'u cyfiawnhau. Gofynnir imi bob amser pam yr eithrir Llundain. Pan fyddwn yn negodi, yr ydym yn ymwybodol bod materion megis lwfans Llundain yn effeithio ar y symiau a ddyrennir. Rhaid ystyried pob mater o'r fath. Ni allwch gymharu Caerdydd â Llundain o ran darpariaeth cyfalaf. Rhaid inni fod yn realistig ynglŷn â'r asesiadau a wnawn.

Gwnaf sylwadau cyffredinol am y pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd ar addysg. Mae'r ffigurau ar wariant o'u cymharu â Lloegr yn dda. Mae gwariant fesul disgybl yng Nghymru ar gyfer 1999-2000 yn cymharu'n dda â Lloegr, ac eithrio Llundain, a dengys fod arian ychwanegol ar gael. Sianelir arian ar gyfer addysg drwy fecanweithiau yng Nghymru sydd yn wahanol i Loegr. Gweithia'r Cynulliad mewn partneriaeth ag awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i gyflawni o fewn yr ardaloedd hynny. Yr ydym yn fodlon ein bod ar y trywydd iawn o ran addysg i sicrhau cydymffurfiaid llawn â'r terfyn o 30 o ddisgyblion mewn dosbarthiadau babanod erbyn mis Medi nesaf. Bydd swyddogion yn dilyn achosion lle yr ymddengys nad yw dosbarthiadau derbyn a dosbarthiadau cyfnod allweddol 1 lle mae terfyn eisoes yn gymwys yn cydymffurfio. Nid yw'r terfyn yn gymwys i ddosbarthiadau blwyddyn 2 tan fis Medi nesaf. Yr ydym ar y trywydd iawn o ran hynny.

Rhoddyd llawer o sylw i honiadau Powys a Chymdeithas Genedlaethol y Penaethiaid.



allegations. The statement made by the Department for Education and Employment that the additional allocations in the Chancellor's budget were made directly to schools in England and Wales is not correct. The additional allocations are for one year only, namely 2000-01. The consequential £9.9 million for Wales is being made available for education. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning announced how that money would be used on 23 November. Therefore, we are making Welsh decisions in Wales about the allocations of money.

In terms of capital, this is about long-term investment. It is not about investment tomorrow or the day after. This is a long-term commitment that we have given through 'Betterwales.com' and have built on in the partnership document. We are determined to change things. Over three years, we will have applied investment of over £300 million into the capital area. That will see significant improvement in schools. I do not want to hear any more whingeing about PFI, which has a vital role in this. New schools are being delivered all over the place as a result of PFI. I am pleased that I will open one in Aberystwyth next week.

Let us tackle the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales. This settlement gives it an uplift of quite an extensive amount of money. We must recognise that higher education is a priority in Wales. I am aware of the concerns about higher education elsewhere. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning has already raised several points with me, which I have said will have to be taken into account in next year's budget round. I have given my commitment on that.

Ieuan mentioned housing. We are reversing the trend on that. I am not saying that this is a good starting base; it is not. However, we are starting to significantly reverse the trend. With the assistance of the Assembly, when we all, hopefully, move into a second term here, we can continue that trend. I thank you for your kind comments on sustainable development. That issue has general cross-party support.

Nid yw'r datganiad a wnaethpwyd gan yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth bod y dyraniadau ychwanegol yng nghyllideb y Canghellor wedi eu gwneud yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn gywir. Mae'r dyraniadau ychwanegol ar gyfer un flwyddyn yn unig, sef 2000-01. Bydd y £9.9 miliwn canlyniadol i Gymru ar gael ar gyfer addysg. Cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes sut y câi'r arian hwnnw ei ddefnyddio ar 23 Tachwedd. Felly, gwnawn benderfyniadau Cymreig yng Nghymru am y dyraniadau ariannol.

O ran cyfalaf, mae hyn yn ymwneud â buddsoddiad tymor hir. Nid yw'n ymwneud â buddsoddiad yfory na thrannoeth. Mae hyn yn ymrwymiad tymor hir a roddasom drwy 'Gwellcymru.com' ac yr ydym wedi adeiladu arno yn y ddogfen bartneriaeth. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o newid pethau. Dros dair blynedd, byddwn wedi buddsoddi dros £300 miliwn ym maes cyfalaf. Daw hynny â gwelliant sylweddol i ysgolion. Nid wyf am glywed rhagor o swnian am y fenter cyllid preifat, sydd â rôl holl bwysig yn hyn. Caiff ysgolion newydd eu sefydlu ym mhob man o ganlyniad i'r fenter cyllid preifat. Yr wyf yn falch fy mod yn agor un yn Aberystwyth yr wythnos nesaf.

Gadewch inni sôn am y Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch. Mae'r setliad hwn yn rhoi swm sylweddol o arian iddo. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod addysg uwch yn flaenoriaeth yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon am addysg uwch mewn mannau eraill. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes eisoes wedi codi nifer o bwyntiau gyda mi, ac yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud y gwnaf eu hystyried yng nghylch cyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i hynny.

Soniodd Ieuan am dai. Yr ydym yn gwrthdroi'r duedd ar hynny. Ni ddywedaf fod hyn yn fan cychwyn da; nid ydyw. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn dechrau gwrthdoi'r duedd yn sylweddol. Gyda chymorth y Cynulliad, pan fydd pob un ohonom, gobeithio, yn dechrau ar ail dymor yma, gallwn barhau â'r duedd honno. Diolchaf ichi am eich sylwadau caredig ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Mae cefnogaeth ar draws y

pleidiau i'r mater hwnnw.

Many points were raised about a fairer funding formula. Many people mentioned the Barnett formula. There is no doubt that Barnett plus was a significant move by the Chancellor in considering what was required in areas such as Wales. We must build on that. We must discuss that in this Chamber and elsewhere in Wales, but let us recognise the political realities of starting to unpick the Barnett formula. The Scots and the Northern English MPs have an interest and we must be careful before we embark on any such road. As we have had Barnett plus this time, there might be a case for looking for Barnett plus in the future.

Codwyd sawl pwynt ynglŷn â fformwla ariannu teg. Soniodd llawer o bobl am fformwla Barnett. Nid oes amheuaeth y bu arian ychwanegol Barnett yn gam arwyddocaol gan y Canghellor wrth ystyried yr hyn a oedd yn ofynnol mewn ardaloedd megis Cymru. Rhaid inni adeiladu ar hyn. Rhaid inni drafod hynny yn y Siambr hon ac mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru, ond gadewch inni gydnabod realiti gwleidyddol dechrau datod fformwla Barnett. Mae gan Aelodau Seneddol yr Alban a Gogledd Lloegr fuddiant a rhaid inni fod yn ofalus cyn inni gychwyn ar hyd ffordd o'r fath. Gan y cawsom arian ychwanegol Barnett y tro hwn, efallai fod achos dros edrych amdano yn y dyfodol.

I concur with many of Kirsty's points, particularly on local government. Local government has been working out figures on the basis of what I said in October and thinks that it knows where it is. However, the official position is that I will not have all the statistics for the individual authorities until 21 December. They will then have to be calculated and in January we will be in a position to consider the individual settlement figures. With an unhypothecated settlement, it is up to local government to prioritise what it wants to do. If you want me to return to the days of lecturing it on what to do, you must tell me, but nobody has so far. I must be fair. We have a partnership with Welsh local government, which I am prepared to honour. I have agreements with it to deliver the goods for us and that is how we will move forward.

Cytunaf â llawer o bwyntiau Kirsty, yn arbennig ar lywodraeth leol. Bu llywodraeth leol yn cyrraedd at ffigurau ar sail yr hyn a ddywedais ym mis Hydref ac mae'n credu ei bod yn ymwybodol o'i sefyllfa. Fodd bynnag, y sefyllfa swyddogol yw na fydd yr holl ystadegau ar gyfer yr awdurdodau unigol gennyf tan 21 Rhagfyr. Yna bydd yn rhaid eu cyfrifo ac ym mis Ionawr byddwn mewn sefyllfa i ystyried y ffigurau setlo unigol. Gyda setliad nas pridianwyd, cyfrifoldeb llywodraeth leol yw blaenoriaethu'r hyn y mae am ei wneud. Os ydych am imi ddychwelyd at y dyddiau o bregethu wrthi beth i'w wneud, rhaid ichi ddweud wrthyf, ond hyd yn hyn nid oes neb wedi gwneud hynny. Rhaid imi fod yn deg. Mae gennym bartneriaeth â llywodraeth leol Cymru, yr wyf yn barod i'w hanrhydeddu. Mae gennyf gytundebau â hi i gyflawni ei haddewidion inni a dyna sut y byddwn yn symud ymlaen.

We have started a good programme in health. It was Redwood who decimated the health capital budget and we have had to start it from scratch. Let us have a dose of reality on this, Nick. PFI, I agree, is part of our strategy there.

Yr ydym wedi dechrau rhaglen dda ym maes iechyd. Difethodd Redwood y gyllideb cyfalaf iechyd a bu'n rhaid inni ddechrau o'r dechrau. Gadewch inni gael dogn o realiti ar hyn, Nick. Mae'r fenter cyllid preifat, cytunaf, yn rhan o'n strategaeth yno.

On education, you gave us a very simple analysis, Nick, but I would not expect anything else from you. The average annual cash increase in the Assembly departmental expenditure limit over three years is 8.1 per cent compared with 8 per cent for the UK.

O ran addysg, rhoddasoch ddadansoddiad syml iawn inni, Nick, ond ni fyddwn yn disgwyl dim byd arall gennych. Y cynnydd ariannol blynyddol ar gyfartaledd yn nherfyn gwariant adrannol y Cynulliad dros dair blynedd yw 8.1 y cant o'i gymharu ag 8 y

Regarding the Assembly's allocation to education, the DfEE figures ignore the vast majority of education money, which go through the local government settlement. Next year's aggregate external finance to local authorities increases by 6 per cent in Wales compared with 5.2 per cent in England. These are valid statistics. Nick, it is not true that money is only being invested for one year. There are two elements; capital expenditure to increase classroom space, which was funded over a few years, plus additional ongoing revenue costs. The revenue costs have been transferred into the local government settlement and are ongoing.

On Objective 1, I do not feel that I am on the ropes; I think that you are, Nick. You cannot accept the fact that we have got the money out through the door in Wales. We are distributing the money quicker than any other region. At the end of the day, do you think that a Tory Government would have provided PES cover? We all know that the answer is 'no'. We must recognise that. I do not want to hear any more hypocrisy from the Tories about Objective 1 and structural funds. We have done the business. We have done the deal. It would have been nice to have received more money. We always want more. I would have liked to say 'Please, Gordon, more', but that was not the reality. We have received what we wanted in real terms and I do not accept that this has impacted on any other budget.

Flood defence is a serious issue. In my opening remarks, I alluded to the fact that Sue Essex, the First Minister and I will be considering various issues relating to this.

Let us tackle the local government settlement. It is a good settlement. I know that many councillors could whinge for Wales, Europe and the world, but it is a good settlement in terms of the cash that has been allocated to Welsh local government. We said that we are looking at average council tax increases of around 3 per cent. I know that there will be differentials, but that was

cant ar gyfer y DU. O ran dyraniad y Cynulliad i addysg, mae ffigurau'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn anwybyddu mwyafrif helaeth arian addysg, sydd yn mynd drwy'r setliad llywodraeth leol. Mae crynswth y cyllid allanol i awdurdodau lleol y flwyddyn nesaf yn cynyddu 6 y cant yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â 5.2 y cant yn Lloegr. Mae'r rhain yn ystadegau dilys. Nick, nid yw'n wir y caiff arian ei fuddsoddi am flwyddyn yn unig. Mae dwy elfen; gwariant cyfalaf i gynyddu lleoedd mewn dosbarthiadau, a ariannwyd dros ychydig o flynyddoedd, ynghyd â chostau refeniw parhaus ychwanegol. Trosglwyddwyd y costau refeniw i'r setliad llywodraeth lleol ac maent yn rhai parhaus.

O ran Amcan 1, ni theimlaf fy mod mewn sefyllfa wan; credaf mai chi sydd, Nick. Ni allwch dderbyn y ffaith y cawsom yr arian drwy'r drws yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn dosbarthu'r arian yn gyflymach nag unrhyw rhanbarth arall. Ar ddiwedd y dydd, a gredwch y byddai Llywodraeth Doriaidd wedi darparu arian o arolwg gwariant cyhoeddus? Gŵyr pob un ohonom mai 'na' yw'r ateb. Rhaid inni gydnabod hynny. Nid wyf am glywed rhagor o ragrith gan y Torïaid am Amcan 1 a chronfeydd strwythurol. Gwnaethom y gwaith. Daethom i gytundeb. Byddai wedi bod yn braf cael mwy o arian. Mae angen mwy arnom bob tro. Byddwn wedi hoffi gofyn 'Os gwelwch yn dda, Gordon, a gaf fi ragor?', ond nid dyna'r realiti. Cawsom yr hyn yr oeddem am ei gael mewn termau gwirioneddol ac ni dderbyniaf fod hyn wedi effeithio ar unrhyw gyllideb arall.

Mae amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd yn fater difrifol. Yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, cyfeiriais at y ffaith y bydd Sue Essex, y Prif Weinidog a minnau yn ystyried amryw o faterion sydd yn berthnasol i hyn.

Gadewch inni sôn am setliad llywodraeth leol. Mae'n setliad da. Gwn y gallai llawer o gynghorwyr swnian dros Gymru, Ewrop a'r byd, ond mae'n setliad da yn nhermau'r arian parod a ddyrannwyd i lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Dywedasom ein bod yn edrych ar gynnydd yn y dreth gyngor ar gyfartaledd o tua 3 y cant. Gwn y bydd gwahanrediaid, ond dyna oedd yr ymrwymiad. Arianasom

the commitment. We have funded local government's new burdens and put additional money into the system. That is important, because it will allow local government to maintain and improve services.

Members will have received the Welsh Local Government Association briefing via e-mail. Even it, to be fair, welcomed many aspects of the expenditure that we have allocated to local government. I turn to Phil's comments. I always refer to him in good terms, because we are friends, even though we have disagreements and discussions on figures. I appreciate the fact that he wants a debate based on the figures and that there is no personal animosity involved. It is purely about the figures. Phil referred to damping. I feel that I included adequate damping in terms of what I could afford at this time. It would have been nice if I had included more for damping, but it is sufficient for councils to be able to keep council tax increases to below double figures. On the underspend position, I do not regard the end of year flexibility scheme as a reserve. I wish I had a machine upstairs so that I could produce all this money. I will make a full statement on end of year flexibility on 12 December, which I hope will clarify many issues.

Delyth, I accept your words of wisdom on those issues. Unfortunately, you were followed by David Davies. I will comment briefly on one of David's points, which is of concern, namely the problem of his constituents. I know that my colleague, the Minister for Rural Affairs, will be delighted to receive correspondence from you on this issue, David, because if what you say is true, there are concerns there with which all of us with farms in our constituencies would sympathise.

You referred, as you always do, to council tax in Monmouthshire. We have to consider where Monmouthshire stacks up in terms of council tax. When you consider Monmouthshire's average council tax D band range and compare it with Merthyr or Blaenau Gwent, you can see that the formula needed to be changed and it was about

feichiau newydd llywodraeth leol gan roi arian ychwanegol yn y system. Mae hynny'n bwysig, gan y bydd yn caniatáu i lywodraeth leol gynnal a gwella gwasanaethau.

Bydd yr Aelodau wedi cael cyfarwyddyd gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru drwy e-bost. A bod yn deg, yr oedd hyn hyd yn oed yn croesawu sawl agwedd ar y gwariant a ddyrannwyd gennym i lywodraeth leol. Trof at sylwadau Phil. Cyfeiriaf yn dda ato bob amser, gan ein bod yn ffrindiau, er ein bod yn anghytuno ac yn trafod ffigurau. Gwerthfawrogaf y ffaith ei fod am gael dadl yn seiliedig ar y ffigurau ac nid oes unrhyw ddrwgdeimlad personol ynghlwm wrth hyn. Mae'n ymwneud â'r ffigurau yn unig. Cyfeiriodd Phil at ddampio. Teimlaf fy mod wedi cynnwys digon o ddampio o ran yr hyn y gallem ei fforddio ar yr adeg hon. Byddai wedi bod yn braf pe bawn wedi cynnwys mwy ar gyfer dampio, ond mae'n ddigon i'r cyngorau allu cadw cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor o dan ffigurau dwbl. O ran y tanwario, nid ystyriaf y cynllun hyblygrwydd diwedd y flwyddyn fel cronfa wrth gefn. Byddai'n braf pe bai gennyf beiriant i fyny'r grisiau fel y gallem gynhyrchu'r arian hwn i gyd. Gwnaf ddatganiad llawn ar hyblygrwydd diwedd y flwyddyn ar 12 Rhagfyr, a fydd gobeithiaf, yn egluro llawer o'r materion.

Delyth, derbynïaf eich geiriau doeth ar y materion hynny. Yn anffodus, fe'ch dilynwyd gan David Davies. Rhoddaf sylw byr ar un o bwyntiau David, sydd o bryder, sef problem ei etholwyr. Gwn y bydd fy nghyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, yn falch o gael gohebiaeth gennych ar y mater hwn, David, oherwydd os yw'r hyn a ddywedwch yn wir, mae pryderon y byddai pob un ohonom sydd â ffermydd yn ein hetholaethau yn cydymdeimlo â hwy.

Cyfeiriasoch, fel y gwnewch bob amser, at y dreth gyngor yn Sir Fynwy. Rhaid inni ystyried sut mae Sir Fynwy yn cymharu o ran y dreth gyngor. Pan ystyriwch ystod band D y dreth gyngor ar gyfartaledd yn Sir Fynwy a'i chymharu â Merthyr neu Flaenau Gwent, gallwch weld bod angen newid y fformwla ac yr oedd yn ymwneud ag ailddosbarthu arian

redistribution of money across Wales.

ledled Cymru.

I thank Brian Gibbons for his comments. I also thank Dafydd Wigley for his contribution and his kind words about the budget process. As a seasoned Parliamentarian, Dafydd, you recognise the difficulties of any budget process. I understand your concerns about Barnett and the issues surrounding that. Your points were well made and these are issues that, as I indicated before, we must return to in the context of what is happening in the rest of the UK.

Diolchaf i Brian Gibbons am ei sylwadau. Diolchaf hefyd i Dafydd Wigley am ei gyfraniad a'i eiriau caredig am broses y gyllideb. Fel hen law yn y Senedd, Dafydd, yr ydych yn cydnabod anawsterau unrhyw broses gyllidebol. Deallaf eich pryderon am Barnett a'r materion sydd yn ymwneud ag ef. Gwnaethoch bwyntiau da ac mae'r rhain yn faterion sydd, fel y nodais o'r blaen, yn rhai y mae'n rhaid inni ddychwelyd atynt yng nghyd-destun yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yng ngweddill y DU.

11:45 a.m.

There is good news regarding the funding pots that are available for the WDA to consider. However, your point about the WDA's budget in general is a matter that the Minister for Economic Development had already raised with me. I will return to that if there are any further allocations that could be made in-year as needs arise.

Mae newyddion da o ran yr arian sydd ar gael i'w ystyried gan y WDA. Fodd bynnag, mae eich pwynt ynglŷn â chyllideb y WDA yn gyffredinol yn fater y mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd eisoes wedi ei godi gyda mi. Dychwelaf at hynny os bydd unrhyw ddyraniadau pellach y gellid eu gwneud yn ystod y flwyddyn yn ôl yr angen.

I will certainly consider your points on PFI, which were valid. On the point about VAT, I believe that it is cost-neutral. However, I will look into it further, as you have raised it. I would be grateful if you have any information that could assist my officials. We will reply in full in due course.

Yn sicr ystyriaf eich pwyntiau am y Fenter Cyllid Preifat, a oedd yn rhai dilys. Ar fater TAW, credaf ei bod yn gost-niwtral. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn ystyried hyn ymhellach, gan eich bod wedi ei godi. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar am unrhyw wybodaeth sydd gennych a allai helpu fy swyddogion. Byddwn yn ateb yn llawn maes o law.

Alun Pugh alluded to my comments on flooding. As I said to Nick, this is an important concern, which we must address. I was relieved, Glyn, that you sounded more like John Griffiths today. I am sorry that you are not inspired by my budget, but I assure you that it was a Welsh budget and not an English one. I also assure you that the comprehensive spending review was a triumph for Wales in terms of the money that came in. I will not intervene in your spat with Mick Bates. As for Carwyn Jones, he is well able to fight his corner and I challenge him to take you and Mick Bates on together any day and win, because that is reflected in the budget settlement for agriculture and rural affairs.

Cyfeiriodd Alun Pugh at fy sylwadau ar lifogydd. Fel y dywedais wrth Nick, mae hwn o bryder mawr, ac mae'n rhaid inni ymdrin ag ef. Yr oeddwn yn falch, Glyn, eich bod yn swnio'n fwy fel John Griffiths heddiw. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf na chawsoch eich ysbrydoli gan fy nghyllideb, ond fe'ch sicrhaf mai cyllideb i Gymru ydoedd ac nid i Loegr. Fe'ch sicrhaf hefyd fod yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn fuddugoliaeth i Gymru o ran yr arian a ddaeth i mewn. Nid ymyrraf â'ch cweryl â Mick Bates. O ran Carwyn Jones, gall ymladd ei gornel ei hun a heriaf ef i'ch herio chi a Mick Bates gyda'ch gilydd unrhyw ddiwrnod ac ennill, oherwydd adlewyrchir hynny yn y setliad cyllideb ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth a materion gwledig.

Thank you for your comments on the CSR, Jenny, as Chair of the Culture Committee.

Diolch ichi am eich sylwadau ar yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, Jenny, fel Cadeirydd

You have done relatively well in terms of the settlement, but I know that there are further issues relating to your portfolio that you wish to raise with me. I will accept representations on those issues in-year.

Let us dispel the myths and look at the cash increases since 1997-98. In 1997-98, the cash increase was 1.3 per cent, and in 1998-99 it was 1.8 per cent. In 1999-2000, it was 6.2 per cent. In 2000-01, there will be a cash increase of 8.3 per cent. In 2001-02, it will be 8.6 per cent and in 2002-03, it will be 7.9 per cent. That is the reality. Budgets are never made in heaven. I only wish that they were. Budgets must be pragmatic. The partnership agreement has allowed us to use some imagination in this budget and has enabled us to deliver real policies for Wales.

Kirsty referred to Plaid Cymru's position last year regarding the budget process. I am happy to say that I was pleased with the approach taken by Dafydd Wigley and his party last year, which enabled me to have that budget approved. I am grateful this year that I am in a partnership agreement, which, I hope, will also allow me to have this budget approved. On that note, I thank the Assembly and I hope that you will support the motion.

y Pwyllgor Diwylliant. Gwnaethoch yn gymharol dda o ran y setliad, ond gwn fod materion pellach sydd yn ymwneud â'ch portffolio y dymunwch eu codi gyda mi. Derbyniaf sylwadau ar y materion hynny yn ystod y flwyddyn.

Gadewch inni chwalu'r mythau ac edrych ar y cynnydd mewn arian parod ers 1997-98. Yn 1997-98, y cynnydd arian parod oedd 1.3 y cant, ac yn 1998-99 yr oedd yn 1.8 y cant. Yn 1999-2000, yr oedd yn 6.2 y cant. Yn 2001-02, bydd cynnydd arian parod o 8.3 y cant. Yn 2001-02, bydd yn 8.6 y cant ac yn 2002-03 bydd yn 7.9 y cant. Dyna'r realiti. Ni wneir cyllidebau perffaith byth. Hoffwn yn fawr pe bai hynny'n wir. Rhaid i gyllidebau fod yn bragmatig. Caniataodd y cytundeb partneriaeth inni ddefnyddio rhywfaint o ddychymyg yn y gyllideb hon a chaniataodd inni gyflwyno polisiau gwirioneddol i Gymru.

Cyfeiriodd Kirsty at sefyllfa Plaid Cymru y llynedd o ran y broses gyllidebol. Mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud fy mod yn fodlon ar yr ymagwedd a gymerwyd gan Dafydd Wigley a'i blaid y llynedd, a'm galluogodd i gael y gyllideb honno wedi ei chymeradwyo. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar eleni fy mod mewn cytundeb partneriaeth, a fydd, gobeithio, yn caniataáu imi gael y gyllideb hon wedi ei chymeradwyo hefyd. Ar y nodyn hwnnw, diolchaf i'r Cynulliad a gobeithiaf y cefnogwch y cynnig.

*Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.*

*Motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 21.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion adopted.*

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Mynediad i Bawb Access for All**

**Richard Edwards:** In accordance with convention, I have agreed to requests from Janet Ryder, David Melding and Kirsty Williams to contribute before the Minister responds. Before I begin, let me reassure the disgruntled landowners among you—not that I am in the habit of appeasing disgruntled landowners—that the subject of this debate is not the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000. The fact that some of you thought it might be is in itself instructive.

It is a pleasure to welcome members from access groups in west Wales—from Pembrokeshire and Carmarthen—to the public gallery. I had the privilege of chairing the Carmarthen local access group for several years, and it is to be congratulated for its notable part in recently securing the employment by Carmarthenshire County Council of a dedicated access officer, after a long, hard-fought campaign.

Pembrokeshire was already one of only a handful of Welsh local authorities to employ a full-time designated access officer. Every local authority should employ one to give them the necessary focus for mainstreaming access issues into all aspects of policy and service delivery. The fact that so few do indicates the scale of the challenge still facing access campaigners. However, the onset of the Disability Rights Commission, and the appointment of our own Welsh

**Richard Edwards:** Yn unol â thraddodiad, cytunais i geisiadau gan Janet Ryder, David Melding a Kirsty Williams i gyfrannu cyn i'r Gweinidog ymateb. Cyn imi ddechrau, gadewch imi sicrhau'r tirseffidianswyr anffodlon yn eich plith—nid fy mod yn arfer tawelu tirseffidianswyr anffodlon—nad Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 yw pwnc y ddadl hon. Mae'r ffaith i rai ohonoch feddwl y gallai fod ynddo'i hun yn addysgiadol.

Mae'n bleser croesawu aelodau o grwpiau mynediad yng ngorllewin Cymru—o Sir Benfro a Chaerfyrddin—i'r oriel gyhoeddus. Cefais y fraint o gadeirio grŵp mynediad lleol Caerfyrddin am sawl blwyddyn, a dylid ei longyfarch am ei ran amlwg wrth sicrhau bod Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin yn cyflogi swyddog mynediad penodedig yn ddiweddar, yn dilyn ymgyrch hir, frwd.

Yr oedd Sir Benfro eisoes yn un o ychydig iawn o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i gyflogi swyddog mynediad penodedig llawn amser. Dylai pob awdurdod lleol gyflogi un i roi'r ffocws angenrheidiol iddynt i brif ffrydio materion mynediad ymhob agwedd ar bolisi a chyflwyno gwasanaeth. Mae'r ffaith bod cyn lleied yn gwneud hynny yn dangos maint yr her sydd yn wynebu ymgyrchwyr mynediad o hyd. Fodd bynnag, mae sefydlu'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, a phenodi ein

disability rights commissioner in Dr Kevin Fitzpatrick, not to mention the establishment of this Assembly with its standing Committee on Equality of Opportunity, offers a better chance than ever before to haul in access issues from the margins to the mainstream of Welsh society and to champion what should be a fundamental right—access for all. The United Nations General Assembly standard rules on the equalisation of opportunities for persons with disabilities state that a disabled person has the right to go to the same places everybody else does, and to have access to useful information.

The wide extent of access problems, and the prospect of addressing them with a political will, were demonstrated in the original designs of the new Assembly building, which was a good a place to start as any. Here we had the visible symbol of the new democracy—open, accessible and inclusive. Upon inspection by Assembly Members it turned out to be instead a monument to physical barriers, especially steps, effectively shutting out many in the new democracy, for whom it would have been totally inaccessible. What a disastrous signal that could have sent out about our much-vaunted new beginning. What a travesty it would have made of claims that we are providing new opportunities to engage in the political process and building an inclusive society. That was a legacy bequeathed to the Assembly by the old order and the old way of doing things, with access issues not integrated into the design and planning process, and disability groups evidently not consulted in any meaningful way. We had a closed, excluding Government machine, failing to reflect the needs of all the people it supposedly served.

Now an elected Assembly has been able to identify the problem and take measures to tackle it, armed with a Committee on Equality of Opportunity, consulting and involving disability groups in a public forum and enabling the people who matter to influence decisions before they are cast in tablets of stone, albeit at the price of escalating costs because of necessary design changes. That is not the Assembly's fault. A new Chamber that is not accessible is not

comisiynydd hawliau anabledd ein hunain yng Nghymru, Dr Kevin Fitzpatrick, heb sôn am sefydlu'r Cynulliad hwn gyda'i Bwyllgor sefydlog ar Gyfle Cyfartal, yn cynnig gwell cyfle nag erioed o'r blaen i dynnu materion mynediad o'r ymylon i brif ffrwd cymdeithas Cymru ac i bleidio achos yr hyn a ddylai fod yn hawl sylfaenol—mynediad i bawb. Noda rheolau safonol Cynulliad Cyffredinol y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar sicrhau cyfle cyfartal i bobl ag anableddau bod gan berson anabl yr hawl i fynd i'r un llefydd â phawb arall, ac i gael mynediad i wybodaeth ddefnyddiol.

Dangoswyd graddau helaeth problemau mynediad, a'r posibilrwydd o ymdrin â hwy gydag ewyllys wleidyddol, yng nghynlluniau gwreiddiol adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, a oedd cystal lle i ddechrau ag unrhyw le. Dyma symbol amlwg o'r ddemocratiaeth newydd—agored, hygyrch a chynhwysol. O'i archwilio gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad gwelwyd yn hytrach gofeb i rwystrau ffisegol, yn arbennig grisiau, gan gau allan llawer o bobl o'r ddemocratiaeth newydd, a fyddai wedi bod yn hollol anhygyrch iddynt. Gallai hynny fod wedi anfon neges drychinebus am ein dechreuad newydd amlwg. Byddai wedi mynd yn hollol groes i honiadau ein bod yn darparu cyfleoedd newydd i gymryd rhan yn y broses wleidyddol ac yn adeiladu cymdeithas gynhwysol. Gadawyd yr etifeddiaeth honno i'r Cynulliad gan yr hen gyfundrefn a'r hen ffordd o weithredu, lle nad oedd materion mynediad wedi eu hintegreiddio i'r broses ddylunio a chynllunio, a lle nad ymgynghorwyd yn amlwg mewn unrhyw ffordd ystyrlon â grwpiau anabledd. Yr oedd gennym beiriant Llywodraeth caeëdig, oedd yn allgáu pobl, na allai adlewyrchu eu hanghenion er ei bod yn honni eu gwasanaethu.

Yn awr, llwyddodd Cynulliad etholedig i nodi'r broblem ac i gymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â hi, gyda Phwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, gan ymgynghori â grwpiau anabledd a'u cynnwys mewn fforwm cyhoeddus a chan alluogi'r bobl berthnasol i ddylanwadu ar benderfyniadau cyn iddynt gael eu naddu mewn carreg, pa un ai a yw hynny ar draul costau cynyddol oherwydd newidiadau angenrheidiol o ran cynllun. Nid bai'r Cynulliad yw hynny. Nid yw Siambr newydd



worth building. Eight million people are disabled in the UK. Seventeen per cent, almost one in five, of the Welsh electorate are in some way disabled. Local access groups promote the provision of environments which are accessible to all, including people with physical, sensory and learning disabilities. Environments accessible to all are more convenient for everyone. If we look at the built environment, 'Access and Facilities for Disabled People', part M of the Building Regulations 1991—recently revamped to put more emphasis on access—aims to secure reasonable provision for disabled people to gain access to and use a building. The word 'reasonable', though, can embrace a multitude of sins.

Wider access issues are covered in planning policy guidance, currently being reviewed by the Assembly. At present, it states that proposals for development are an opportunity to secure a more accessible environment for everyone and that the needs of disabled people should be considered at an early stage in the design process. We know from bitter experience here in Cardiff Bay that that is not necessarily so.

Planners have a vital role in ensuring that access is incorporated into developments by, for example, tying in issues such as public transport, car parking and the design of the pedestrian environment, seeking to retain local services and reduce the need to travel and ensuring full public access by including the needs of disabled people before granting permission for alterations and change of use.

I will do something novel now for this Chamber and refer positively to the local council, or at least its local plan, which notes that environments that take account of the needs of disabled people cater better for everyone. It also highlights the need to design for disabled staff as well as visitors. Unfortunately, there seems to be a serious mismatch between theory and practice, as the Disability Rights Commission will testify from its exhaustive trawl for suitable office accommodation, even in new build premises, in the bay and elsewhere in the city.

11:55 a.m.

nad yw'n hygyrch yn werth ei hadeiladu. Mae 8 miliwn o bobl yn anabl yn y DU. Mae 17 y cant, bron un o bob pump, o etholwyr Cymru yn anabl mewn rhyw ffordd. Mae grwpiau mynediad lleol yn hyrwyddo darparu amgylcheddau sydd yn hygyrch i bawb, gan gynnwys pobl ag anabledau corfforol, synhwyrdd a dysgu. Mae amgylcheddau sydd yn hygyrch i bawb yn fwy cyfleus i bawb. O edrych ar yr amgylchedd adeiledig, mae 'Mynediad a Chyfleusterau i Bobl Anabl', rhan M o Reoliadau Adeiladu 1991—a ddiwygiwyd yn ddiweddar i roi mwy o bwyslais ar fynediad—yn anelu at sicrhau darpariaeth resymol i bobl anabl gael mynediad i adeilad a'i ddefnyddio. Ond, gall y gair 'rhesymol' amlygu lluo o bechodau.

Cwmmpesir materion mynediad ehangach mewn cyfarwyddyd polisi cynllunio, sydd yn cael ei adolygu ar hyn o bryd gan y Cynulliad. Ar hyn o bryd, noda fod y cynigion ar gyfer datblygu yn gyfle i sicrhau amgylchedd mwy hygyrch i bawb ac y dylid ystyried anghenion pobl anabl ar gam cynnar yn y broses gynllunio. Gwyddom o brofiad chwerw yma ym Mae Caerdydd nad yw hynny o reidrwydd yn wir.

Mae gan gynllunwyr rôl hanfodol wrth sicrhau yr ymgorfforir mynediad i ddatblygiadau, er enghraifft, drwy gynnwys materion fel trafniadaeth gyhoeddus, parcio ceir a chynllun ardaloedd i gerddwyr, ceisio cadw gwasanaethau lleol a lleihau'r angen i deithio a sicrhau mynediad cyhoeddus llawn drwy gynnwys anghenion pobl anabl cyn caniatáu addasiadau a newid defnydd.

Gwnaf rywbeth newydd yn awr yn y Siambr hon, sef cyfeirio yn gadarnhaol at y cyngor lleol, neu o leiaf ei gynllun lleol, sydd yn nodi bod amgylcheddau sydd yn ystyried anghenion pobl anabl yn darparu'n well ar gyfer pawb. Amlyga hefyd yr angen i gynllunio ar gyfer staff anabl yn ogystal ag ymwelwyr. Yn anffodus, ymddengys fod diffyg cyfatebiaeth difrifol rhwng damcaniaeth ac arfer, fel y gall y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabled dystio ar ôl iddo chwilio'n helaeth am adeiladau swyddfa addas, hyd yn oed mewn eiddo newydd ei adeiladu, yn y bae ac mewn mannau eraill yn y ddinas.

The Joint Mobility Unit Wales, in consultation with local access and disability groups, has developed model supplementary planning guidance on access to provide examples of best practice and encourage exchange of information and experience, including innovative schemes like electronic wayfinding for blind and partially sighted people in shopping centres.

On the subject of retail accessibility, we should compliment those local authorities and voluntary bodies who fund shopmobility schemes, providing wheelchairs and scooters to people with mobility problems, mostly free of charge, for use in town centres and leisure facilities.

There are many measures that can be taken to provide assistance to disabled customers without causing offence or being patronising, such as lower counters, induction loops, portable mini-loops, electric wheelchairs, better toilets, improved parking. There are also various measures that enable those with sight impairments to function without having to resort, as a matter of course, to sighted assistance. These include clearer signs, better use of colour in stores and tactile signs that are embossed with Braille lettering. Everyone welcomes making daily living easier, not only disabled people. Investment in making town centre shopping areas as pedestrian-friendly as possible benefits everyone.

Shopping is covered by part 3 of the Disability Discrimination Act 1995, which offers new rights of access to public services and commercial businesses including shops, banks, hotels, libraries and hospitals. Education is included, as are transport vehicles. However, transport infrastructures such as bus stations or airports are not included. Under the Act, a service provider must not treat the disabled person less favourably than those who are not disabled. For instance, a local shop with high shelves and narrow aisles discriminates against a wheelchair user. Narrow aisles also discriminate against a parent with a buggy. A bank statement in tiny print discriminates against a partially sighted person.

Mae Cyd Uned Symudedd Cymru, mewn ymgynghoriad â grwpiau mynediad ac anabledd lleol, wedi datblygu model o arweiniad cynllunio ategol ar fynediad i ddarparu enghreifftiau o arfer gorau ac i annog cyfnewid gwybodaeth a phrofiad, gan gynnwys cynlluniau arloesol fel system canfod llwybr electronig ar gyfer pobl ddall â rhannol ddall mewn canolfannau siopa. O ran hygyrchedd siopau, dylem ganmol yr awdurdodau lleol a'r cyrff gwirfoddol hynny sydd yn ariannu cynlluniau 'shopmobility', gan ddarparu cadeiriau olwynion a sgwteri i bobl â phroblemau symudedd, am ddim gan fwyaf, i'w defnyddio yng nghanol trefi ac mewn cyfleusterau hamdden.

Mae llawer o gamau y gellir eu cymryd i ddarparu cymorth i gwsmeriaid anabl heb dramgwyddo neu fod yn nawddoglyd, fel cownteri isel, dolenni anwytho, dolenni bach symudol, cadeiriau olwynion trydan, gwell toiledau, gwell cyfleusterau parcio. Mae amrywiol gamau hefyd sydd yn galluogi'r rheini â nam ar eu golwg i weithredu heb orfod dibynnu ar gymorth rhywun sydd yn gweld. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys arwyddion cliriach, gwell defnydd o liw mewn siopau ac arwyddion cyffyrddadwy â llythrennu Braille arnynt. Mae pawb yn croesawu gwneud bywyd bob dydd yn haws, nid dim ond pobl anabl. Mae buddsoddi i sicrhau bod ardaloedd siopa yng nghanol trefi mor gyfeillgar i gerddwyr â phosibl o fudd i bawb.

Daw siopa o dan ran 3 Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd 1995, sydd yn cynnig hawliau mynediad newydd i wasanaethau cyhoeddus a busnesau masnachol gan gynnwys siopau, banciau, gwestai, llyfrgelloedd ac ysbytai. Cynhwysir addysg, felly hefyd cerbydau trafndiaeth. Fodd bynnag, ni chynhwysir isadeileddau trafndiaeth, megis gorsafoedd bws neu feysydd awyr. O dan y Ddeddf, ni all darparwr gwasanaeth drin y person anabl yn llai ffafriol na'r rheini nad ydynt yn anabl. Er enghraifft, gwahaniaetha siop leol â silffoedd uchel ac eiliau cul yn erbyn defnyddwyr cadeiriau olwynion. Gwahaniaetha eiliau cul hefyd yn erbyn rhiant â bygi. Gwahaniaetha cyfriflen banc mewn print mân yn erbyn person rhannol ddall.

However, service providers do not have to make physical changes to their premises until 2004. The degree of change that the Act requires in the meantime is not entirely clear. Services must take reasonable steps to change practices, policies or procedures that militate against disabled persons. Although defining 'reasonable' will shower lawyers with yet more meal tickets, at least disabled people now have some recourse in the courts if they know that they have not been treated fairly.

However, the Act is deeply flawed. It sets out a code of practice offering examples of how services can get around a physical obstacle and find alternative ways of catering for disabled people. Being served outside a shop and holding a consultation in the car park of an inaccessible advice centre are both given as examples of reasonable—that word again—adjustments. That is not treating disabled people equally; it is treating them differently. It is grace and favour or special pleading. Disabled people want and are entitled to equal rights, not special dispensations. The Act does not go far enough in ensuring this. It fails to state categorically that services must be made accessible to disabled people, and is therefore open to interpretation.

However, we must remember its provenance. It was a lame attempt by the previous Westminster Government to salvage a vestige of respect after it sabotaged a far more radical Private Member's Bill, supported by all parties, through craven, unconscionable filibustering.

Another shortcoming concerns the Act's anti-discrimination code of practice for employers. It only applies to organisations employing more than 15 people, which rules out practically all Welsh businesses. However, access to workplace legislation in the US shows that only small, not massive, adaptations are needed to allow disabled people to participate more fully and function more effectively.

I do not have time to go into the nitty-gritty of every aspect of access, as it affects a long list of areas including health, education,

Fodd bynnag, nid oes rhaid i ddarparwyr gwasanaeth wneud newidiadau ffisegol i'w heiddo tan 2004. Nid yw'r graddau o newid sydd yn ofynnol dan y Ddeddf yn y cyfamser yn hollol glir. Rhaid i wasanaethau gymryd camau rhesymol i newid arferion, polisiau neu weithdrefnau sydd yn llesteirio pobl anabl. Er y bydd diffinio 'rhesymol' yn llenwi pocedi cyfreithwyr, o leiaf mae gan bobl anabl bellach ryw ffordd o weithredu drwy'r llysoedd os gwyddant na chawsant eu trin yn deg.

Fodd bynnag, mae diffygion mawr yn y Ddeddf. Noda god ymarfer sydd yn cynnig enghreifftiau o'r ffordd y gall gwasanaethau oresgyn rhwystr ffisegol a dod o hyd i ffyrdd amgen o ddarparu ar gyfer pobl anabl. Nodir gwasanaethu y tu allan i siop a chynnal ymgynghoriad ym maes parcio canolfan gynghori anhygyrch fel enghreifftiau o addasiadau rhesymol—y gair hwnnw eto. Nid yw hynny'n trin pobl anabl yn gyfartal; mae'n eu trin yn wahanol. Gras a ffafr neu bledio arbennig yw hynny. Mae pobl anabl am gael hawliau cyfartal, nid amodau arbennig, ac mae ganddynt hawl i hynny. Nid yw'r Ddeddf yn gwneud digon i sicrhau hyn. Mae'n methu â datgan yn bendant bod yn rhaid i wasanaethau fod yn hygyrch i bobl anabl, ac felly mae'n agored i'w ddehongli.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio ei tharddiad. Ymdrech ofer gan Lywodraeth flaenorol San Steffan i achub rhywfaint o barch ar ôl iddi danseilio Mesur Aelod Preifat llawer mwy radical, a gefnogwyd gan bob plaid, drwy herwddadlau llwfr diegwyddor.

Mae diffyg arall yn ymwneud â chod ymarfer gwrth-wahaniaethu'r Ddeddf i gyflogwyr. Dim ond i sefydliadau sydd yn cyflogi mwy na 15 o bobl y mae'n berthnasol, sydd yn diystyru ymron pob busnes yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, dengys deddfwriaeth mynediad i weithleoedd yn yr UD mai dim ond addasiadau bach, nid enfawr, sydd eu hangen i alluogi pobl anabl i gymryd rhan lawnach ac i weithredu'n fwy effeithiol.

Nid oes amser gennyf i drafod manylion pob agwedd ar fynediad, gan ei fod yn effeithio ar restr hir o feysydd gan gynnwys iechyd,

employment and leisure. Perhaps other speakers will take up some of those themes. However, I will mention public transport. The Environment, Planning and Transport Committee, which I chair, is currently reviewing public transport policy. There is a desperate need for a more integrated approach, especially if you are disabled and, to compound matters, live in a rural area such as Pembrokeshire. If you do not have a car or cannot drive, you can easily become housebound through a lack of adaptive public transport. The development of low-floor buses should be hastened. There are none in Pembrokeshire at present, and only one has been proposed for the entire county, running from Haverfordwest to Milford Haven.

There has been better progress in introducing hackney carriages and licensed vehicles specifically adapted to carry wheelchairs. In rural areas, in particular, there is a need for local authorities to manage concessionary taxi fare schemes with up to 50 per cent subsidy and a ceiling on usage or distance. We have the welcome concessionary bus scheme, but there are no buses that wheelchairs users can access in areas such as Pembrokeshire. The Disability Rights Commission needs to look at widening the terms of the Act to cover transport vehicles.

Access for all is about more than ramps, handrails, low floors and dropped kerbs. It is about an attitude of mind, because the barriers are not all physical. The able-bodied take so much for granted, not least that the world has been designed by them, exclusively for their use. They forget that, at some stage, there is a fair chance that they too will succumb to disability. That is when all their lazy, complacent preconceptions will surely rebound on them. What is required is a cultural shift, an imaginative leap, an opening of mind, an engagement of sympathy, and a challenge to the negative way in which society sees and responds to disability.

Disability equality training has a vital role to play. Even more crucial is education: early

addysg, cyflogaeth a hamdden. Efallai y bydd siaradwyr eraill am drafod rhai o'r themâu hynny. Fodd bynnag, soniaf am drafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Mae Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, yr wyf yn gadeirydd arno, wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn adolygu polisi trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Mae angen dybryd am ymagwedd fwy integredig, yn enwedig os ydych yn anabl ac, i ddwysáu'r broblem, yn byw mewn ardal wledig fel Sir Benfro. Os nad oes gennych gar neu os na allwch yrru, peth hawdd yw mynd yn gaeth i'r tŷ oherwydd diffyg trafndiaeth gyhoeddus ymaddasol. Dylid cyflymu'r broses o ddatblygu bysiau llawr isel. Nid oes unrhyw fysiau o'r fath yn Sir Benfro ar hyn o bryd, a dim ond un ohonynt a gynigiwyd i wasanaethu'r sir gyfan, yn rhedeg o Hwlfordd i Aberdaugleddau.

Gwnaethpwyd gwell cynnydd wrth gyflwyno tacsis a cherbydau trwyddedig wedi'u haddasu'n benodol i gludo cadeiriau olwynion. Mewn ardaloedd gwledig, yn benodol, mae angen i awdurdodau lleol reoli cynlluniau taliadau tacsî consesiynol gyda chymhorthdal o hyd at 50 y cant a therfyn ar y defnydd neu'r pellter. Croesewir y cynllun bysiau consesiynol, ond nid oes unrhyw fysiau y gall defnyddwyr cadeiriau olwynion eu defnyddio mewn ardaloedd fel Sir Benfro. Mae angen i'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anableded ystyried ehangu termau'r Ddeddf i gwmpasu cerbydau cludo.

Mae mynediad i bawb yn ymwneud â mwy na rampiau, rheiliau llaw, lloriau isel a gostwng ymylon palmentydd. Mae'n ymwneud â meddylfryd, gan nad yw'r holl rwystrau yn rhai ffisegol. Mae'r abl eu corff yn cymryd gymaint yn ganiataol, yn arbennig gan fod y byd wedi'i gynllunio ganddynt hwy, at eu defnydd hwy yn unig. Anghofiant, ar ryw adeg, bod siawns y byddant hwy hefyd yn dioddef rhyw anableded. Bryd hynny y bydd eu holl ragdybiaethau diog, hunanfodlon yn effeithio arnynt hwy. Mae angen symudiad diwylliannol, naid llawn dychymyg, agor meddyliau, dangos cydymdeimlad, a herio'r ffordd negyddol y mae cymdeithas yn ystyried anableded ac yn ymateb iddo.

Mae gan hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb anableded rôl hanfodol i'w chwarae. Mae addysg yn

years education in particular. We should not have to fire-fight after societal baggage has accumulated and shared prejudices have dug in. We need to change society at the roots. To effect the necessary cultural shift requires positive action at the earliest age, when budding adults are at their most receptive and impressionable and when respect and tolerance can be learnt most effectively. That applies to the entire equality agenda, not only disability. This may smack of indoctrination, but it is indoctrination that promotes an open, just, caring society where intolerance, disregard, violence and bullying are cast asunder. It is an indoctrination that celebrates differences and diversity all the more, to secure the ties that bind us together. The time is well due for that sort of indoctrination.

Let us be clear. The problem is society and culture, not people and the individual. The problem is the barriers that society creates. Disabled people do not want help to adapt themselves to those barriers and meekly accept the compromised quality of life. They do not want grace and favour and to be ghettoised. They want to remove the physical and attitudinal barriers. They want the freedom and dignity that flows from equal treatment and equal citizenship. They do not want special assistance, but independent access; not special needs, but specific requirements in an environment that caters for everyone. Full membership of the human race is what they want and have the right to expect.

Any strategy for removing the barriers that disabled people face must acknowledge that people have impairment that must be considered in the round. I suggest that what that implies is comprehensive anti-discrimination legislation, not the pale shadow that we have now, and a Bill of civil rights.

I deliberately did not call this debate 'disabled access', although that would have flagged the subject matter more clearly. This

fwy hanfodol byth: addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar yn arbennig. Ni ddylem orfod diffodd y tân ar ôl i feichiau cymdeithasol Gronni a rhagfarnau cyffredin ymsefydlu. Mae angen inni newid cymdeithas wrth ei gwreiddiau. I weithredu'r symudiad diwylliannol angenrheidiol mae angen gweithredu cadarnhaol ar yr oed ieuaf, pan fydd oedolion y dyfodol ar eu mwyaf derbyngar ac argraffadwy a phan ellir dysgu parch a goddefgarwch yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol. Mae hynny'n berthnasol i'r agenda cydraddoldeb gyflawn, nid dim ond i anabledd. Efallai bod gwthio syniadau yn amlwg yn hyn, ond gwthio syniadau sydd yn hyrwyddo cymdeithas agored, cyfiawn, gofalgar lle chwelir anoddefgarwch, diystyriaeth, trais a bwlio. Gwthio syniadau ydyw sydd yn dathlu gwahaniaethau ac amrywiaeth yn fwy byth, i glymu'r cysylltiadau sydd yn ein rhwymo ynghyd. Mae'n hen bryd inni gael y math hwnnw o wthio syniadau.

Gadewch inni fod yn glir. Cymdeithas a diwylliant yw'r broblem, nid pobl a'r unigolyn. Y broblem yw'r rhwystrau a grëir gan gymdeithas. Nid yw pobl anabl am gael help i ymaddasu i'r rhwystrau hynny a derbyn ansawdd bywyd cyfaddawdedig. Nid ydynt am gael gras a ffafr a chael eu rhoi mewn geto. Maent am gael gwared ar y rhwystrau ffisegol a'r rhwystrau o ran agwedd. Maent am gael y rhyddid a'r urddas sydd yn deillio o driniaeth gyfartal a dinasyddiaeth gyfartal. Nid ydynt am gael cymorth arbennig, ond yn hytrach mynediad annibynnol; nid anghenion arbennig, ond gofynion penodol mewn amgylchedd sydd yn darparu ar gyfer pawb. Maent am fwynhau aelodaeth lawn o'r hil ddynol ac mae ganddynt yr hawl i ddisgwyl hynny.

Mae'n rhaid i unrhyw strategaeth ar gyfer dymchwel y rhwystrau a wynebir gan bobl anabl gydnabod bod gan bobl namau y dylid eu hystyried yn gyffredinol. Awgrymaf fod hynny'n cyfleu deddfwriaeth gwrth-wahaniaethu gynhwysfawr, nid y cysgod gwelw sydd gennym yn awr, a Mesur o hawliau sifil.

Penderfynais yn fwriadol peidio â galw'r ddadl hon yn 'mynediad i'r anabl', er y byddai hynny wedi amlygu'r pwnc yn

is about all of us. Access for all benefits all of us and enriches all our lives. Access for all also implies war against discrimination and all the evils that flow from it. Abhorrence of discrimination because of who and what you are is what drives my political motor. In the midst of all the politicking and so much media dross, it is what keeps me on the road. Whoever we are, however we define ourselves, we all have an equal claim on humanity and we should be treated accordingly.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We have taken up almost 15 minutes of the debate, therefore I ask the three speakers to keep their comments to a minute each.

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank Richard for a moving speech and appreciate that he has got up from his sick bed because he wished so strongly to come in to give us the opportunity to discuss this important issue. I would like to talk about issues regarding access for all to democracy. A problem facing disabled people, and one that has been raised by access groups, is the difficulty many disabled people have in accessing polling stations to exercise their democratic right. Surveys have been undertaken about the inaccessibility of many polling stations throughout Wales.

Secondly, I raise the issue of accessing the National Assembly. There are already issues relating to this building, and Richard has explained issues relating to the proposed new building and how we hope to tackle them to improve access. In addition, there is the matter of accessing information and services from the Assembly. We often discuss information technology and we are proud of our use of IT, but does that extend to disabled people in Wales? The Scottish Parliament's website gives easy access to a text-only version of its information. This allows the text-only side to be in large, clear print, and it can be converted, with the appropriate software, into synthesised speech or Braille. I searched long and hard for a similar facility on the National Assembly for Wales's website. It may be there, but I have not found it yet.

gliriach. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â phob un ohonom. Mae mynediad i bawb o fudd i bawb ac yn cyfoethogi ein bywydau oll. Mae mynediad i bawb hefyd yn awgrymu rhyfel yn erbyn gwahaniaethu a'r holl ddrygioni sydd yn deillio ohono. Atgasedd tuag at wahaniaethu oherwydd pwy a beth ydych sydd yn llywio fy mrwdfrydedd gwleidyddol. Yng nghanol yr holl wleidydda a chymaint o sothach yn y cyfryngau, dyna sydd yn fy nghadw ar y llwybr cul. Waeth pwy ydym, waeth sut y diffiniwn ein hunain, mae gennym oll hawl cyfartal ar ddynoliaeth a dylem gael ein trin yn unol â hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr ydym wedi defnyddio ymron i 15 munud o'r ddadl, felly gofynnaf i'r tri siaradwr gyfyngu eu sylwadau i funud yr un.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch i Richard am araith deimladwy a gwerthfawrogaf y ffaith iddo godi o'i wely cystudd oherwydd cryfder ei ddymuniaid i ddod yma i roi'r cyfle inni drafod y mater pwysig hwn. Hoffwn sôn am faterion sydd yn ymwneud â mynediad i bawb i ddemocratiaeth. Un o'r problemau sydd yn wynebu pobl anabl, ac un a godwyd gan grwpiau mynediad, yw'r anhawster a gaiff llawer o bobl anabl wrth gael mynediad i orsafoedd pleidleisio i roi eu hawl ddemocrataidd ar waith. Cynhaliwyd arolygon o ddiffyg hygyrchedd llawer o orsafoedd pleidleisio ledled Cymru.

Yn ail, codaf y mater o gael mynediad i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae materion eisoes wedi codi o ran yr adeilad hwn, ac eglurodd Richard y materion sydd yn ymwneud â'r adeilad newydd arfaethedig a sut y gobeithiwn fynd i'r afael â hwy i wella hygyrchedd. Yn ogystal, dylid nodi'r mater o gael gafael ar wybodaeth a gwasanaethau o'r Cynulliad. Trafodwn dechnoleg gwybodaeth yn aml ac ymfalchïwn yn ein defnydd o dechnoleg gwybodaeth, ond a yw hynny'n ymestyn i bobl anabl yng Nghymru? Rhydd gwefan Senedd yr Alban fynediad hawdd i'w wybodaeth ar ffurf fersiwn testun yn unig. Caniatâ hyn i'r testun fod mewn print bras, clir, a gellir ei drawsnewid, gyda'r meddalwedd priodol, i leferydd wedi'i syntheseiddio neu Braille. Chwiliais yn ddyfal am gyfleuster tebyg ar wefan Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Efallai ei fod

yno, ond nid wyf wedi dod o hyd iddo hyd yn hyn.

12:05 a.m.

**David Melding:** I congratulate Richard. We heard a genuinely powerful and passionate speech from him. It was a speech of great quality, even in an Assembly such as this where we often hear our colleagues' speaking skills. As well as being a passionate speech, it was also lucid and succinct. It could be read as a summary of the main issues, but it was enlivened by an incredibly deep, personal commitment to these issues.

I will echo one aspect of Richard's speech, which is the social model of disability that society, during the last 10 years, has increasingly taken on. At any one time, about 18 per cent of us has a disability. We should not forget that most of us can probably expect to acquire some form of disability during our life. Society as a whole must take this issue seriously. It is for all of us. It is not a concession to those who are sometimes rather patronisingly thought of as deserving special treatment. These are equal rights, and if services reflected people's rights, there would be better services for us all. We would have better public buildings. Let us start, if this building is to be replaced, with a building of absolute world-beating standard for us all—access for all, literally.

**Janet Ryder:** I also congratulate Richard for raising this matter and for the eloquent way in which he addressed all the access issues that must put forward. On your point, Richard, about access officers and the need for every county to have one, it is often a post that is cut, yet the access officer is crucial if our counties will have local access groups to scrutinise planning applications as they come in. We must also consider how we build homes. The adoption of lifetime homes as a design, not only for social housing, but for private housing as well, is a step that Wales must take. That must come in. You talked clearly about the need to build a fully accessible physical environment. That brings us round full circle. Without access officers it

**David Melding:** Llongyfarchaf Richard. Clywsom araith wirioneddol bwerus ac angerddol ganddo. Yr oedd yn araith o safon, hyd yn oed mewn Cynulliad fel hwn lle y clywn sgiliau areithio ein cyd-Aelodau yn aml. Yn ogystal â bod yn araith angerddol, yr oedd hefyd yn glir ac yn gryno. Gellid ei darllen fel crynodeb o'r prif faterion, ond rhoddwyd bywyd ynddi drwy ymrwymiad dwfn a phersonol iawn i'r materion hyn.

Hoffwn adleisio un agwedd ar araith Richard, sef y model cymdeithasol o anabledd a fabwysiadwyd yn gynyddol gan gymdeithas, yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Ar unrhyw un adeg, mae gan tua 18 y cant ohonom anabledd. Dylem gofio y gall y rhan fwyaf ohonom fwy na thebyg ddisgwyl cael rhyw fath o anabledd yn ystod ein bywydau. Rhaid i gymdeithas yn gyffredinol gymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif. Mae'n fater i bob un ohonom. Nid yw'n gonsesiwn i'r rheini a ystyrir weithiau, mewn ffordd braidd yn nawddoglyd, fel rhai sydd yn haeddu triniaeth arbennig. Hawliau cyfartal ydynt, a phe bai gwasanaethau yn adlewyrchu hawliau pobl, gellid dareparu gwasanaethau gwell ar gyfer pawb ohonom. Byddai gennym well adeiladau cyhoeddus. Gadewch inni ddechrau, os yw'r adeilad hwn i gael ei ddisodli, gydag adeilad o safon heb ei hail inni i gyd—mynediad i bawb, yn llythrennol.

**Janet Ryder:** Llongyfarchaf innau Richard hefyd am godi'r mater hwn ac am y ffordd huawdl yr ymdriniodd â'r holl faterion mynediad y mae'n rhaid eu cyflwyno. O ran eich pwynt, Richard, am swyddogion mynediad a'r angen i gael un ymhob sir, mae'n aml yn swydd a dorrrir, eto mae'r swyddog mynediad yn hanfodol os bydd gan ein siroedd grwpiau mynediad lleol i archwilio ceisiadau cynllunio wrth iddynt ddod i law. Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried sut yr adeiladwn gartrefi. Mae mabwysiadu cartrefi am oes fel cynllun, nid yn unig ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol, ond ar gyfer tai preifat hefyd, yn gam y mae'n rhaid i Gymru ei gymryd. Rhaid cyflwyno hynny. Soniasoch yn glir am yr angen i adeiladu amgylchedd ffisegol gwbl

is hard to monitor how well counties are doing on that. Do you consider it appropriate for the Assembly's Committee on Equality of Opportunity, Planning Decision Committee or even Local Government and Housing Committee to review each county to assess whether they have access officers in place?

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I do not think that anybody in the Cabinet would have minded replying to this debate, as there is consensus about access for all. I am pleased that Richard chose to move the debate in the way that he did and that he focused on equality of treatment for everyone in society.

You mentioned some interesting points, Richard. I was pleased to attend the launch of the Disability Rights Commission in Swansea last week. People there mentioned some of the nation's key figures on disability. There are about 6.6 million disabled people across the UK. In Wales, we have some of the highest levels of disability. Disabled people are seven times as likely as non-disabled people to be out of work and claiming benefits. Disabled people are only about half as likely as non-disabled people to be in employment. We only have to consider the issues on employment, health and other areas to see whether inequality exists across the board.

Like Richard, I am pleased that we have the Disability Rights Commission, which is working hard to highlight issues. They do it against a background—with which I concur—of flawed legislation. I, and many other Members in this Chamber, would have wanted the legislation to have gone further. There should be recognition of what is going on in the United States and in other European countries about the reality of equality of treatment. The trouble is that it is always dressed up in pounds, shillings and pence. When you consider the reality of some of the figures and how little it costs for people to be able to access services, to access life in general, you must recognise that we must press for stronger and better legislation in this

hygyrch. Daw hynny â ni drwy gylch llawn. Heb swyddogion mynediad mae'n anodd monitro i ba raddau y llwydda siroedd i wneud hynny. A ystyriwch ei bod yn briodol i Bwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio neu hyd yn oed Bwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai y Cynulliad i adolygu pob sir i asesu a oes ganddynt swyddogion mynediad ai peidio?

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Ni chredaf y byddai gwahaniaeth gan unrhyw un yn y Cabinet i ateb i'r ddadl hon, gan fod cytundeb barn o ran mynediad i bawb. Yr wyf yn falch y dewisodd Richard ddatblygu'r ddadl yn y ffordd a wnaeth ac iddo ganolbwyntio ar driniaeth gyfartal i bawb o fewn cymdeithas.

Soniasoch am rai pwyntiau diddorol, Richard. Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf fynychu achlysur lansio'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd yn Abertawe yr wythnos diwethaf. Clywais bobl yno yn sôn am rai o ffigurau allweddol y wlad o ran anabledd. Mae tua 6.6 miliwn o bobl anabl yn y DU. Yng Nghymru, mae gennym rai o'r lefelau uchaf o anabledd. Mae pobl anabl saith gwaith yn fwy tebygol na phobl heb anabledd o fod yn ddi-waith ac yn hawlio budd-daliadau. Dim ond hanner mor debygol o fod mewn gwaith y mae pobl anabl o'u cymharu â phobl heb anabledd. Nid oes ond yn rhaid inni ystyried y materion ar gyflogaeth, iechyd a meysydd eraill i weld a oes anghydraddoldeb yn bodoli yn gyffredinol.

Fel Richard, yr wyf yn falch y sefydlwyd y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, sydd yn gweithio'n galed i amlygu materion. Gwnânt hynny yn erbyn cefndir—y cytunaf ag ef—o ddeddfwriaeth ddiffygiol. Fy nymuniad i, a sawl Aelod arall yn y Siambr hon, fyddai i'r ddeddfwriaeth fod wedi mynd ymhellach. Dylid cydnabod yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yn yr Unol Daleithiau ac yng ngwledydd eraill Ewrop o ran realiti triniaeth gyfartal. Y drafferth yw ei fod bob amser yn cael ei nodi mewn punnoedd, sylltau a cheiniogau. O ystyried realiti rhai o'r ffigurau a chyn lleied y mae'n ei gostio i bobl allu cael mynediad i wasanaethau, i gael mynediad i fywyd yn gyffredinol, rhaid cydnabod bod angen inni bwysu am ddeddfwriaeth gryfach a gwell yn



field.

Many of you—including David—also referred to the new building. This will be a symbol of what is good and what can be done. We will have the highest standards. I am pleased that we have been able to speak to disabled groups, and that we have a forum that advises us, so that we will get everything right. There tends to be an arrogance among the able-bodied, that they know what you want and what you like. It is important to consult and take those views on board. If those views cost, cost they must, because we must ensure that the new building has the necessary access for all.

We all share one area of concern: public transport. The extension of the bus pass to disabled people was welcome. There must be recognition that the service does not exist, in terms of the transport that is used, and what we must do with the highways. Highways must be a priority for us and our colleagues in Welsh local government to deal with these issues.

It is important that we recognise that this is an issue for us in the Assembly, as Kirsty illustrated. We only have to look at our own practices. I am pleased to say that I am working with officials to examine some of the issues that have been raised over the last few months in this Chamber: whether this concerns the size of print or how Assembly services are accessed. I hope that we will start to achieve real solutions to some of these issues in the first half of next year.

Janet addressed the important issue that local government also has a responsibility. I hope, in the new partnership that we are building with local government, that we will be able to raise these issues directly with local government, on behalf of access groups and disabled people, and work with them on equality of opportunity issues.

Finally, negative attitudes not only condemn disabled people, but all of us. We must celebrate diversity and recognise that this is a human rights issue. Nobody wants our

y maes hwn.

Cyfeiriodd llawer ohonoch hefyd—gan gynnwys David—at yr adeilad newydd. Bydd hwn yn symbol o beth sydd yn dda a beth y gellir ei wneud. Bydd y safonau uchaf gennym. Yr wyf yn falch inni allu siarad â grwpiau anabl, a bod gennym fforwm i'n cynghori, er mwyn sicrhau y cawn bopeth yn iawn. Tuedda pobl abl i fod yn drahaus, eu bod yn gwybod yr hyn yr ydych ei eisiau a'r hyn yr ydych yn ei hoffi. Mae'n bwysig ymgynghori ac ystyried y safbwyntiau hynny. Os oes pris ar y safbwyntiau hynny, rhaid talu amdanynt, oherwydd rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr adeilad newydd yn darparu'r mynediad sydd yn angenrheidiol i bawb.

Rhannwn oll yr un maes o bryder: trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Croesawyd ymestyn y tocyn bws am ddim i bobl anabl. Rhaid inni gydnabod nad yw'r gwasanaeth yn bodoli, yn nhermau'r drafnidiaeth a ddefnyddir, a'r hyn y mae'n rhaid inni ei wneud gyda'r priffyrdd. Rhaid i briffyrdd fod yn flaenoriaeth i ni a'n cydweithwyr mewn llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru er mwyn ymdrin â'r materion hyn.

Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod fod hwn yn fater i ni yn y Cynulliad, fel y dangosodd Kirsty. Dim ond ystyried ein harferion ei hunain sydd angen inni ei wneud. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud fy mod yn gweithio gyda swyddogion i archwilio rhai o'r materion a godwyd dros y misoedd diwethaf yn y Siambr hon: boed yn ymwneud â maint print neu'r ffordd y ceir mynediad i wasanaethau'r Cynulliad. Gobeithiaf y dechreuwn gynnig atebion gwirioneddol i rai o'r materion hyn yn ystod hanner cyntaf y flwyddyn nesaf.

Ymdriniodd Janet â'r mater pwysig fod gan llywodraeth leol hefyd gyfrifoldeb. Gobeithiaf, o fewn y bartneriaeth newydd yr ydym wrthi'n ei hadeiladu gyda llywodraeth leol, y gallwn godi'r materion hyn yn uniongyrchol gyda llywodraeth leol, ar ran grwpiau mynediad a phobl anabl, a chydweithio â hwy ar faterion sydd yn ymwneud â chydaddoldeb cyfle.

Yn olaf, mae agweddau negyddol nid yn unig yn condemnio pobl anabl, ond bob un ohonom. Rhaid inni ddathlu amrywiaeth a chydabod bod hwn yn fater o hawliau dynol.

sympathy; everybody requires our respect. If the National Assembly is to do anything on the issue of access for all, we must deliver self-respect for everyone.

Nid oes neb am gael ein cydymdeimlad; mae pawb am gael ein parch. Os yw'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol am wneud unrhyw beth ar y mater o fynediad i bawb, rhaid inni gyflwyno hunan-barch i bawb.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you. That brings our proceedings today to a close.

**Y Ddirwy Lywydd:** Diolch. Daw hynny â'n trafodion heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.10 p.m.  
The session ended at 12.10 p.m.*